

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Eighteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Colombo (Sri Lanka), 23 May – 3 June 2019

INTERNATIONAL WORKSHOP ON CITES AND LIVELIHOOD
(GUANGZHOU, CHINA, 6-8 NOVEMBER, 2018)

This document has been submitted by China in relation to agenda item 18.*

HIGHLIGHTS

1. Over 90 representatives from national CITES authorities around the world and experts from United Nations organizations and some leading conservation organizations met in Guangzhou, China from 6-8 November for the fourth international workshop on CITES and Livelihood.
2. Over 30 new case studies presented at this workshop serve as good examples of a successful linkage between livelihoods and wildlife conservation. It offers a long term solution that local communities benefit from wildlife through legal and well-regulated international trade in wildlife.
3. 10 of the 17 mega biodiversity countries attended at this workshop, including Peru (the biggest exporter of reptiles), South Africa (the biggest exporter of live birds), Indonesia (the biggest exporter of live coral), Malaysia (biggest exporter of live fish), Georgia (biggest exporter of live plants excluding cacti & orchids), and China (the biggest exporter of live mammals).
4. In reviewing the case studies, the workshop participants discussed best practices, lessons learned and various challenges as well as cross-cutting topics to improve conservation and enhance livelihood benefits in the CITES context.
5. The workshop concluded with a clear vision for the future. It aims at supporting a robust analysis of the crucial factors that enable these success stories, strengthening the exchange of experiences between countries and across regions, mapping out guidelines to establish, promote and develop successful models for the conservation and sustainable use of CITES-listed species.
6. The workshop has been the first CITES-related meeting since the restructuring of China CITES Management Authority. The Government of China provided funding to all sponsored delegates as well as the conference facilities and excellent logistical support.

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*



GROUP PHOTO OF THE PARTICIPANTS (PHOTOGRAPHED ON 6 NOV 2018)

IN FRONT OF THE WORKSHOP VENUE, GUANGZHOU CHIMELONG SAFARI PARK

ORGANIZERS AND SUPPORTERS

7. The workshop is convened by the CITES Secretariat and hosted by the Department of Wildlife Conservation (China CITES Management Authority) under State Forestry and Grassland Administration.
8. The workshop is supported by Guangzhou Branch of China CITES MA, China Wildlife Conservation Association (CWCA), China Association of Traditional Chinese Medicine (CATCM), China Aquatic Products Processing and Marketing Alliance (CAPPMA), Beijing Sino-tech United Information Academy (BSUIA), NRDC, and Guangzhou Chimelong Safari Park.
9. The workshop is covered in media at prime time by China Central Television (CCTV) through channels CCTV-news and CCTV-1.

PURPOSE OF THE WORKSHOP

10. The purpose of the workshop included:
 - (1) Showcase successful experiences, best practices and lessons learned,
 - (2) Review enabling environment for successful livelihoods,
 - (3) Recommendations for further actions,
 - (4) Preparing for CITES CoP18, and
 - (5) Communications about CITES and livelihoods.

LIVELIHOOD IN CITES

11. The Preamble of the CITES emphasizes that peoples and States are and should be the best protectors of their own wild fauna and flora.
12. Resolution Conf. 8.3 on *Recognition of the benefits of trade in wildlife*, among others, reads,
 - (1) NOTING that the majority of species of wild fauna and flora that CITES seeks to protect and enhance occur in the developing countries of the world;
 - (2) RECOGNIZING that the sustainable use of wild fauna and flora, whether consumptive or non-consumptive, provides an economically competitive land-use option;
 - (3) BEING AWARE that, unless conservation programs take into account the needs of local people and provide incentives for sustainable use of wild fauna and flora, conversion to alternative forms of land use may occur.
13. Resolution Conf. 16.6 on *CITES and livelihoods* recognizes the potential benefits of legal and sustainable trade to both the conservation of the species and the livelihoods of rural communities that live alongside with wildlife.
14. CoP17 Decision 17.36 encourages the conduct of new case studies on how legal and sustainable trade can generate economic incentives for the conservation of wildlife and improvement of livelihoods of indigenous and local communities
15. A CoP14 decision requested the Standing Committee to develop tools for the rapid assessment of the impacts of CITES listings and guidelines to mitigate the impacts. Livelihood working group was established and met in Peru and Colombia, and 2018 in Guangzhou, China.
16. Handbook on CITE & Livelihoods (as an information document for CoP16) guides how to rapidly assess and mitigate the effects of the application of CITES decisions on livelihoods in poor rural community.

CASES STUDIED

17. Cases from countries in Africa, Asia, Europe, Oceania, North America and South America, including small island developing States such as the Solomon Islands are studied.
18. These cases well broadened the scope of the database of CITES and livelihood, including:
 - (1) lagarto (*Caiman yacare*) and vicuña (*Vicugna Vicugna*) in the Plurinational State of Bolivia,
 - (2) pirarucu (*Arapaima gigas*) in the Amazonas State in Brazil,
 - (3) yellow-spotted river turtle and orchids in Peru,
 - (4) Morelet's crocodile and Bighorn Sheep in Mexico,
 - (5) Kuth (*Saussurea costus*) in Indian Himalaya,
 - (6) medicinal plants in Vietnam and in Nepal,
 - (7) markhor hunting in Tajikistan,
 - (8) *Dendrobium officinale* in China,
 - (9) coastal species conservation in Indonesia,
 - (10) fishery-based livelihoods in Sabah, Malaysia,
 - (11) *Galanthus woronowii* in western Georgia,

- (12) coral, orchid, and turtle in Solomon Islands,
- (13) Nile Crocodiles in the Communities of Tana River County, Kenya,
- (14) African cherry (*Prunus Africana*) in Democratic Republic of the Congo and in Uganda,
- (15) *Aloe ferox* in South Africa,
- (16) Crocodylians and Reptiles in various areas.

BENEFITS RECOGNIZED

- 19. Livelihood benefits directly and indirectly from trade in CITES species are very significant, including but not limited to: food security, health, income, resilience to climate change, capacity, skills etc.
- 20. Because of aforementioned livelihood benefits, in return, legal trade from the wild in CITES species can support and be beneficial for conservation through:
 - (1) reducing poaching and illegal trade,
 - (2) promoting more positive attitudes toward conservation and conservation agencies,
 - (3) reducing deforestation,
 - (4) reducing incentives to hunt other species,
 - (5) conserving habitat of the “used” species, and
 - (6) reducing reliance on more damaging livelihood.
- 21. However, trade in CITES species could be as beneficial as it could be detrimental without it.

PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED

- 22. Trade regulation decisions that do not carefully consider how they affect livelihoods along the trade chain can have unintended negative conservation impacts.
- 23. Alternative livelihood, switching away people from reliance on wildlife use, is a popular terminology but it often adds to rather than substitute for the livelihoods detrimental to conservation.
- 24. Ex-situ production could be created through trade regulations, inside or outside the range state, and it gives further disincentives to livelihoods of people living with the species.
- 25. CITES Appendix listing without consideration of livelihood would encourage pressures to close the market in the end of the trade chain, hampering both the sustainable trade and the consumers’ recognition of the role played by the livelihoods in the range states, as well as that by the themselves in the market.
- 26. There is little evidence of livelihood being dutifully implemented in CITES decision makings due to a lack of implementable mechanism.

BEST PRACTICES

- 27. Some best practices are extracted from the cases presented in the workshop, including:
 - (1) Inclusion of local communities as key stakeholders with strong voice in decision-making processes,

- (2) Assignment of clear, long term wildlife management rights and responsibilities to legally defined user groups for specific areas/populations,
 - (3) Recognizing and respecting traditional knowledge of community,
 - (4) Having clear, fair and transparent benefit-sharing,
 - (5) Capacity building and training for communities to be fully involved in protection and management,
 - (6) Organization of harvester communities into entities that can represent their interests at national level Independent, robust monitoring, and
 - (7) Increasing local benefits through value-adding by communities.
28. An implementable mechanism could be established by amending Section Section C. *Supporting Statement* in Annex 6. *Format for proposals to amend the Appendices* of Res Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II* by adding several critical analyses of livelihood:

ACTIVITIES

29. Participants during the workshop visited Foshan Agricultural Demonstration Site and had a tour in the Chimelong Safari Park.
30. China Aquatic Products Processing and Marketing Alliance (CAPPMA) and Beijing Sino-tech United Infomtion Academy (BSUIA) held a side event showing the video of successful sturgeon captive-breeding in China and introducing a new agriculture technology respectively.
31. Annex A to this document contains a list of participants in the CITES and Livelihood Workshop 2018.

CoP18 Inf. XXX
Annex A

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
1	China	Wu Zhimin	Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Director General
2	China	Guan Jinmin	Guangzhou Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Director
3	China	Li Guochen	Inner-Mongolia Autonomous Region Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Director

4	China	Liu Dewang	Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Deputy-Director General
5	China	Han Xu	Bureau of Fisheries, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs	Deputy Minister
6	China	Liu Yi	Guangzhou Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Associate Counsel
7	China	Guo Rui	Bureau of Fisheries, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Affairs	Division Director
8	China	Zhu Yong	Department of Treaty and Law, Ministry of Foreign Affairs	First Secretary
9	China	Yang Liuying	Anti-smuggling Bureau, General Administration of Customs	Division Director
10	China	Tang Hongying	Department of Science and Technology, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Division Director
11	China	Yu Guanghong	Anti-smuggling Bureau, Guangdong Sub-Administration of Custom	Division Director
12	China	He Jinxing	Department of International Cooperation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Principal Staff Member
	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
13	China	Dong Zhibin	Criminal Investigation Corps, Beijing Forestry Police Bureau	Head
14	China	Zeng Yan	CITES China Science Authority	Associate Director
15	Hong Kong, China	Liang Ziyin	Conservation Division, Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, the Government of Hong Kong S.A.R.	Director
16	Hong Kong, China	Li Jianwei	Conservation Division, Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department, the	First Inspector

			Government of Hong Kong S.A.R.	
17	Macao, China	Wu Ziwei	Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation Department, Economic Bureau, the Government of Macao S.A.R.	Senior Technician
18	China	Wu Zhongze	CITES Implementation and Enforcement Coordination Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Division Director
19	China	Yuan Liangchen	Plant Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Vice-Division Director
20	China	Wen Zhanqiang	Animal Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Consultant
21	China	Shi Ronghong	CITES Implementation and Enforcement Coordination Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Consultant
22	China	Shi Dongmei	CITES Implementation and Enforcement Coordination Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Consultant
23	China	Su Rui	CITES Implementation and Enforcement Coordination Division, Department of Wildlife Conservation, State Forestry and Grassland Administration	Staff Member
24	China	Wang Yanzhong	Guangzhou Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Division Director
	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title

25	China	Zeng Fengbo	Guangzhou Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Section Chief
26	China	Ai Kexin	Inner-Mongolia Autonomous Region Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Division Director
27	China	Lin Miao	Fuzhou Branch, CITES China Management Authority	Division Director
28	China	Pan Jinjun	The Forestry Bureau of Alashan league, Inner Mongolia Autonomous Region	Deputy-Director
29	China	Luo Yibo	Institute of Botany, the Chinese Academy of Sciences	Researcher
30	China	Ming Xingjia	Chong Traditional Chinese Medicine Research Institute	Vice-Researcher
31	Hong Kong, China	She Guohao	Blue Ocean Association (Hong Kong)	Director of Ocean Program
32	China	Peng Cong	IFAW(Beijing)	Program Officer
33	China	Xu Ling	WWF	Executive Director
34	China	Cao Dafan	IFAW(Kunming)	
35	China	Wu Weiling	CI	Program Manager
36	China	Zhang Cheng	IUCN	
37	China	Li Yanliang	National Aquatic Wildlife Conservation Association (NAWCA)	Chief
38	China	Zhou Xiaohua	National Aquatic Wildlife Conservation Association (NAWCA)	Secretary
39	China	Fan Mengyuan	China Wildlife Conservation Association(CWCA)	Program Officer
40	China	Li Yue	China Wild Plant Conservation Association(CWPCA)	Vice-Division Director

	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
41	China	Wang Ying	China Association of Traditional Chinese Medicine (CATCM)	Executive Deputy-Chief
42	China	Wang Yue	China Aquatic Products Processing and Marketing Alliance (CAPPMA)	Deputy-Secretary
43	China	Li Dezhen	China Aquatic Products Processing and Marketing Alliance (CAPPMA)	Director
44	China	Li Lishu	WCS	Program Director
45	China	Hua Ning	NRDC	Program Director
46	China	Wang Juan	NRDC	Wildlife Policy Analyst
47	China	Zhang Wenting	WILDAID	Program Manager
48	China	Ma Jiangnan	WILDAID	Program Officer
49	China	Ji Wei	Independent Expert	
50	China	Wang Haibin	Independent Expert	
51	Bolivia	Maria Del Pilar Becerra Cardona	the Ecoregional Management and Conservation Unit of the Amazon, Yungas, Chiquitanía and Pantanal	Head,
			Biodiversity and Protected Areas Ministry of Environment and Water	General Directorate
52	Brazil	Sara Quizia Correa Mota	Brazilian Institute of the Environment and Renewable Natural Resources –IBAMA	Environmental Analyst

53	Brazil	Cristina Isis Buck Silva	Brazilian Institute of Environment and Renewable Natural Resources – IBAMA (CITES MA)	Professor
	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
54	DR Congo	Crispin MAHAMBAMATHE	The CITES Management Authority and Focal Point Livelihood	Assistant
55	Georgia	TeonaKarchava	The Biodiversity Division Biodiversity and Forestry Department Ministry of Environment Protection and Agriculture of Georgia	Senior Specialist
56	India	Gopal Singh Rawat	Wildlife Institute of India Chandrabani, Dehradun Uttarakhand	Scientist - G and Dean
57	Indonesia	NikenWuriHandayani	Directorate of Biodiversity Conservation, Directorate General of Natural Resources and Ecosystem Conservation, Ministry of Environment and Forestry	Ecosystem specialist
58	Germany	Uwe Schippmann	CITES Scientific Authority	Director
59	Kenya	Fridah Dermillah Obare	Kenya Wildlife Service	Officer
60	Laos	Bounthan Sounyvong	Wildlife and Aquatic Management Division, Department of Forestry Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Lao PDR	Technical Official
61	Malaysia	Lawrence Kissol JR	Marine Resource Management Office Department of Fisheries Sabah MALAYSIA	Director
62	Mexico	Paola Mosig	CITES Science Authority	Coordinator

63	Peru	Jessica Maria Gálvez-Durand Besnard	Dirección de Gestión Sostenible del Patrimonio de Fauna Silvestre (CITES MA)	Director
64	Soloman Islands	Rose TakuleBabaua	Environment and Conservation Division, Ministry of Environment, Climate Change, Disaster Management and Meteorology(CITES MA)	Chief Conservation Officer (Species Management)
65	South Africa	Olga Kumalo	Threatened or Protected Species and CITES Department, Environmental Affairs	Director
	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
66	South Africa	Malepo Phoshoko	Department of Environmental Affairs	Biodiversity Control Officer
67	South Africa	Prince Ramafalo	Department of Environmental Affairs	Biodiversity Production Officer
68	Tajikistan	Khalil Karimov	Institute of Zoology and Parasitology of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Tajikistan	Chair of IUCN SULi Central Asia
69	Uganda	George Owoyesigire	Community Conservation Uganda Wildlife Authority	Deputy Director
70	Vietnam	Nguyen Manh Ha	Central Institute for Natural Resources and Environmental Studies	CITES Scientific Specialist
71	UNCTAD	Lorena Jaramillo	UNCTAD	Economic Affairs Officer
72	UNCTAD	Lika Sasaki	UNCTAD	BioTrade Initiative Team
73	IUCN Crocodile Specialist Group	Grahame Webb	IUCN Crocodile Specialist Group	Chair
74	IUCN SULi	Cooney Mary Rose	IUCN CEESP/SSC SULi Sustainable Use and Livelihoods Specialist Group	Group Chair

75	IUCN-Boa and Python Specialist Group	Daniel Natusch	IUCN-Boa and Python Specialist Group	Director, Resource Development Limited
76	TRAFFIC	Anastasiya Timoshyna	TRAFFIC	Programme Leader – Medicinal Plants
				IUCN SSC/Medicinal Plant Specialist Group (Co-Chair)
77	TRAFFIC	Sarah Baker Ferguson	TRAFFIC - Office Vietnam	Director
78	Livelihood International	Gil Theriault	Livelihood International	President & Executive Director
	Country/ Organization	Name	Department	Title
79	IWMC	Eugène Lapointe	IWMC World Conservation Trust	President
80	PIJAC	Robert Anthony Likins III	Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council	Vice President of Government Affairs
81	UNEP	BIANCA NOTARBARTOLO DI SCIARA (F)	UN Environment Program	Official
82	Indonesia	MASHUR BIN MOHAMMAD ALIAS (M)	Indonesia Agarwood Association	Chief
83	UN CITES Secretariat	LIU Yuan	CITES Secretariat	Programme and Communications Officer
84	UN CITES Secretariat	Martin Otto Hitziger	CITES Secretariat	Plant Species Officer (JPO)