

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Eighteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Colombo (Sri Lanka), 23 May – 3 June 2019

Species specific matters

Rhinoceroses (Rhinocerotidae spp.)

REVISIONS TO RESOLUTION CONF. 9.14 (REV. COP17) ON
CONSERVATION OF AND TRADE IN AFRICAN AND ASIAN RHINOCEROSSES,
AND ASSOCIATED DECISIONS

1. This document has been submitted by Kenya.*

Background

2. The illegal killing of rhinoceros and trade in rhinoceros horn continues to be a major problem across Africa and Asia. The rate of killing, particularly in parts of Africa, has increased dramatically over the past decade, threatening the continued survival of rhinoceroses and negatively impacting the ecosystems in which they live.
3. The scale of the rhinoceros poaching epidemic poses a threat to the national security of rhinoceros range states, fuels conflict and unrest, destroys livelihoods, promotes corruption, and negatively impacts wildlife-based economies.
4. The poaching of rhinoceroses and illegal trade in their horns is organized and coordinated by transnational criminal syndicates that profit from the sale of rhinoceros horn and horn products to satisfy consumer demand, principally in Asia.

Domestic rhinoceros horn markets

5. Legal domestic markets for rhinoceros horn contribute to the poaching of rhinoceros and illegal trade in their parts and derivatives by confusing consumers, undermining demand reduction programmes, obfuscating enforcement efforts, and providing potential routes through which illegally obtained rhinoceros horn might be laundered.
6. Rhinoceros horn has been frequently documented as being offered for sale in retail establishments in Asia, especially in towns near the border with China in countries such as Laos PDR, Myanmar, and Viet Nam.
7. Domestic trade in rhinoceros horn weakens the international trade ban under CITES of rhinoceros and their parts and derivatives for commercial purposes.
8. Domestic rhinoceros horn markets undermine newly minted laws in source, transit, and destination countries.

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

9. On 1 January 2018, Viet Nam's revised Penal Code came into force, which criminalized possession of rhinoceros horn and increased fines and jail terms for illegal trade in rhinoceros horn. Maximum penalties for illegal trade or possession of rhinoceros horn in Viet Nam now consist of a fine of 2 billion VND or up to 15 years in prison.
10. On 11 May 2017 Mozambique's amended Conservation Law entered into force. Mozambique now boasts some of the toughest penalties for wildlife crimes, including rhinoceros poaching and illegal trade in rhinoceros horn, in all of Africa.
11. The Conference of the Parties has previously called upon CITES Parties to take measures to close domestic markets in products of species, including rhinoceros, or prohibit international or domestic commercial trade in products derived from captive breeding operations for certain species, that are under severe pressure from illegal trade in their parts and derivatives. For example:
 - a) Resolution Conf. 6.10, *Trade in rhinoceros products*, which urged "a complete prohibition on all sales and trade, internal and international, of rhinoceros parts and derivatives, especially horn..."
 - b) Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), *Trade in elephant specimens*, which recommends "that all Parties and non-Parties in whose jurisdiction there is a legal domestic market for ivory that is contributing to poaching or illegal trade, take all necessary legislative, regulatory and enforcement measures to close their domestic markets for commercial trade in raw and worked ivory as a matter of urgency;"
 - c) Resolution Conf. 11.8 (Rev. CoP17), *Conservation of and control of trade in the Tibetan antelope*, where the Conference of the Parties recommended that "all Parties and non-Parties, especially consumer and range States, adopt comprehensive legislation and enforcement controls as a matter of urgency, with the aim of eliminating commercial trade in Tibetan antelope parts and derivatives, especially shatoosh, in order to reduce demonstrably the illegal trade in Tibetan antelope products";
 - d) Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP17), *Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Asian big cat species*, where the Conference of the Parties urged "all Parties seeking to improve their legislation prohibiting international commercial trade in specimens of tiger and other Asian big cat species, and products labelled as, or claiming to contain, their parts and derivatives, to adopt such legislation, to include penalties adequate to deter illegal trade and to consider introducing national measures to facilitate implementation of CITES, such as voluntarily prohibiting internal trade in such parts, derivatives and products, as provided for in Resolution Conf. 9.6 (Rev. CoP16);". In addition, Decision 14.69 directs Parties with intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale to implement measures to restrict the captive population to a level supportive only to conserving wild tigers; tigers should not be bred for trade in their parts and derivatives; and
 - e) Resolution Conf. 11.20 (Rev. CoP17) encourages that any permit authorizing trade of live rhinoceroses or elephants under an 'appropriate and acceptable destinations' annotation contain a condition stating that the rhinoceros horn or elephant ivory from those animals and from their progeny may not enter commercial trade and be sport hunted outside of their historic range.
12. The current Resolution includes language urging Parties to adopt and implement comprehensive legislation and enforcement controls, *including internal trade restrictions and penalties*, aimed at reducing illegal trade.
13. The elimination of domestic rhinoceros horn markets will not affect trade in legally acquired trophies.

Rhinoceros horn stockpiles

14. Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) does not include an option for rhinoceros horn stockpile destruction despite destruction being a recognized stockpile management tool utilized by many CITES Parties for a multitude of CITES-listed species.
15. All stockpiles come with storage and security costs that create an added burden for often underfunded wildlife management agencies. A lack of resources to adequately secure stockpiles increases the inherent risk of theft and subsequent trade on the black market, which has occurred for wildlife products including ivory and rhinoceros horn.

16. The Conference of the Parties has previously provided avenues for stockpile destruction for specimens of species, including rhinoceros, that are under severe pressure from illegal trade in their parts and derivatives, such as:
 - f) Resolution Conf. 6.10, *Trade in rhinoceros products*, which urged “the destruction of all government and parastatal stocks of rhinoceros horn with supporting contributory funds from external aid sources to be used for rhino conservation in the state concerned;” and
 - g) Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP17), *Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Asian big cat species*, which urges “those Parties and non-Parties on whose territories there exist stocks of parts and derivatives of tiger and other Asian big cat species (such as tiger bone stocks), but not including pre-Convention specimens, to consolidate and ensure adequate control of such stocks, and where possible destroy the same, with the exception of those used for educational and scientific purposes;”
17. Stockpile destruction as a management tool has been endorsed by a number of CITES Parties. Several CITES Parties and non-Parties, including rhinoceros range states in both Africa and Asia, have engaged in public stockpile destruction events including: China, Czech Republic, India, Kenya, Mozambique, Nepal, Taiwan, United Arab Emirates, United States of America, and Viet Nam.
18. The Resolution currently urges all Parties that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat. However, no mention is made of the need to include privately held stockpiles in this inventory.

Recommendation

19. The Conference of the Parties is urged to adopt the proposed revisions to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) contained in Annex 1.
20. The Conference of the Parties is also urged to consider adopting the Decisions contained in Annex 2.

COMMENTS OF THE SECRETARIAT

- A. The present document primarily focuses on two matters, domestic rhinoceros horn markets and rhinoceros horn stockpiles. The Secretariat addresses these two matters accordingly in its comments below, i.e. the proposed revisions to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) on *Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses* and the proposed draft decisions.

Domestic rhinoceros horn markets

- B. The Secretariat notes that the matter of the closure of domestic rhinoceros horn markets is similar to the matter of the closure of domestic ivory markets raised in document CoP18 Doc. 69.5 on *Implementing aspects of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) on the closure of domestic ivory markets*. A similar document, document CoP17 Doc. 57.2 on the *Closure of domestic markets for elephant ivory*, was also submitted for consideration at the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP17, Johannesburg, 2016). Many of the observations provided by the Secretariat in its comments to documents CoP17 Doc. 57.2 and CoP18 Doc. 69.5 also apply to the present document.
- C. The Secretariat notes that national trade in legal specimens of CITES-listed species is a complex and sensitive issue, given that Article I of the Convention defines "trade" to mean export, re-export, import and introduction from the sea.
- D. The Secretariat also recalls Principle 2 of the *Rio Declaration on Environment and Development*, according to which “States have, in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations and the principles of international law, the sovereign right to exploit their own resources pursuant to their own environmental policies, and the responsibility to ensure that activities within their jurisdiction or control do not cause damage to the environment of other States or of areas beyond the limits of national jurisdiction.” It is further recalled that the preamble of the Convention recognizes “that Peoples and States are and should be the best protectors of their own wild fauna and flora”.

- E. The Secretariat notes that Parties on rare occasions have addressed domestic markets in instances when there was a sufficiently clear nexus between domestic and international illegal trade undermining compliance with the Convention. In such cases, the Parties agreed to more effectively regulate and control domestic markets or to, as is the case in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) on *Trade in elephant specimens*, recommend the closure of domestic ivory markets that are contributing to poaching or illegal trade, rather than to recommend the complete closure of all markets.
- F. The present document makes reference to the provisions of Resolution Conf. 6.10 on *Trade in rhinoceros products*, but this was repealed by Resolution Conf. 9.14 which includes sufficient provisions to enable Parties, where deemed appropriate, to implement internal trade restrictions and other measures as may be needed. Such provisions can for example be found in paragraphs 1 a) i), 1 h), 1 i) and 6 of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17).
- G. The Secretariat further reminds Parties that they have the right to take stricter domestic measures under Article XIV of the Convention.
- H. Based on these considerations, the Secretariat considers that urging all Parties to close their domestic rhinoceros horn markets goes beyond the scope of the Convention. The authors have not provided evidence that all domestic rhinoceros horn markets contribute to the poaching of rhinoceroses and rhinoceros horns trafficking.
- I. Therefore, the Secretariat does not recommend that the Conference of the Parties adopts any of the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) relating to domestic rhinoceros horn markets.

Rhinoceros horn stockpiles

- J. The document addresses two matters concerning rhinoceros horn stockpiles, the destruction of rhinoceros horn stockpiles and the declaration of privately held rhinoceros horn stocks.
- K. Regarding the destruction of rhinoceros horn stockpiles the document states that stockpile destruction as a management tool has been endorsed by a number of Parties, and in this regard proposes amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17).
- L. The Secretariat notes that the matter of the destruction of rhinoceros horn stockpiles is similar to the matter of the destruction of ivory stockpiles as raised in document CoP17 Doc. 57.3 on *Ivory stockpiles: Proposed revision of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP16) on Trade in elephant specimens* discussed at CoP17. Many of the observations provided by the Secretariat in its comments to document CoP17 Doc. 57.3 also apply to the present document.
- M. The Secretariat notes that Resolution Conf. 17.8 on *Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species* already provides detailed guidance to Parties on the disposal of seized and/or confiscated specimens. Considering this, it seems unnecessary to include reference to one specific disposal option in Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) as proposed. The Secretariat considers that the available guidance is adequate, and that it is for each Party to decide how it wishes to deal with rhinoceros horn stockpiles.
- N. The Secretariat further notes that the impact of stockpile destructions on the dynamics of illegal trade in wildlife continues to be a matter of ongoing debate.
- O. The Secretariat therefore does not recommend the adoption of the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) relating to the destruction of rhinoceros horn stockpiles.
- P. Regarding the declaration of privately held rhinoceros horn, the authors note that Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) urges all Parties that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year, but that no mention is made of the need to include privately held stocks in this inventory.
- Q. The Secretariat notes that some Parties have included information on privately held stockpiles in their reporting on this matter, but that obligatory reporting of such privately held stocks may be burdensome and legally challenging for Parties. The Secretariat suggests that there should be a balance between the benefit that could be derived from such data, and the effort that may be required from Parties to collect it where legally possible.

R. Considering that where data on privately held stockpiles was available, some Parties included it in their reporting in accordance with paragraph 2 a) of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17), the Secretariat considers that the current provisions of the Resolution are sufficient. The Secretariat, therefore, does not recommend the adoption of the new paragraph 2 b) in Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17), as proposed in Annex 1 to the present document. However, should the Conference of the Parties consider that some action is warranted, the Secretariat recommends that it be included as a sub-paragraph to paragraph 2 a) in Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17), as follows:

2. a) all Parties:

i) that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat; and

bii) all Parties to make every effort to, where possible, collate information on privately-held stockpiles of rhinoceros horn within their territory, and to include such information in their annual declarations;

S. In summary, the Secretariat does not recommend that the proposed changes to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) in Annex 1 to the present document be adopted.

Proposed draft decisions

T. The present document provides little background to, and justification for, the draft decisions proposed in Annex 2. The Secretariat notes that the content of draft decision 18.AA largely repeats the provisions of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) and some of the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP17) on *Compliance and enforcement*. Draft decision 18.CC seems to duplicate draft decision 18.FF proposed by the Standing Committee in Annex 1 to document CoP18 Doc. 83.1.

U. Consequently, the Secretariat believes that the objectives of the draft decisions proposed in Annex 2 to the present document can be achieved by the implementation of the draft decisions proposed in the Annex 1 to document CoP18 Doc. 83.1. The Secretariat therefore recommends that the draft decisions as proposed in Annex 2 to the present document not be adopted.

DRAFT RESOLUTION OF THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES

Proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17~~18~~) on *Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses* – new text is underlined, deleted text is ~~struck through~~.

CONCERNED that the continued existence of legal regulated domestic markets for rhinoceros horn in some countries confuses consumers, undermines demand reduction programmes, obfuscates enforcement efforts, and provides a potential route through which illegally obtained rhinoceros horn might be laundered;

CONCERNED that some rhinoceros populations have continued to decline drastically and that four of the five species are threatened with extinction;

RECALLING that the Conference of the Parties included all species of rhinoceroses in Appendix I of the Convention in 1977, and that the South African and Swaziland populations of *Ceratotherium simum simum* were transferred to Appendix II with an annotation in 1994 and 2004 respectively;

RECALLING further Resolution Conf. 3.11 and Resolution Conf. 6.10, adopted by the Conference of the Parties at its third and sixth meetings respectively (New Delhi, 1981; Ottawa, 1997), and Decision 10.45, adopted at its 10th meeting (Harare, 1997), all relating to the conservation of and trade in rhinoceroses;

COMMENDING the successful management and protection of rhinoceroses in some African and Asian range States, often under difficult circumstances;

COMMENDING further the measures taken by Parties to control and reduce use of rhinoceros horn, especially Parties where use is part of a cultural tradition extending back many centuries;

CONCLUDING that the above measures have yet not arrested the decline of most rhinoceros populations;

RECOGNIZING that the illegal trade in rhinoceros horn is known to be a global law enforcement problem, extending beyond range States and traditional consuming countries, but that emphasis solely on law enforcement has failed to remove the threat to rhinoceroses;

NOTING the importance of well targeted strategies or programmes to reduce demand for illegally obtained rhinoceros specimens, and the importance of implementing strategies or programmes to enhance community awareness of the economic, social and environmental impacts of illegal killing of rhinoceroses;

RECOGNIZING the need to deploy the same tools and techniques as those used against other domestic and transnational organized crimes, provided for in the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the United Nations Convention Against Corruption, against the criminal groups involved in the illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the trafficking of rhinoceros horns, and in particular against those individuals managing and organizing these illegal activities;

NOTING the importance of using forensic science to the fullest extent possible in order to combat wildlife crime, and in particular rhinoceros poaching and illicit rhinoceros horn trafficking;

WELCOMING the strategies and proposed actions developed by the CITES Rhinoceros Enforcement Task Force at its meeting in Nairobi, in 2013 as made available through Notification to Parties No. 2014/006 of 23 January 2014;

WELCOMING the establishment of and support provided by the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC);

AWARE of the important role of ICCWC in bringing coordinated support to the national wildlife law enforcement agencies and to the subregional and regional networks that, on a daily basis, act in defence of natural resources;

ENCOURAGING ICCWC to further increase its support to Parties;

RECOGNIZING that some international measures may have unintended consequences, for example, on trade;

RECOGNIZING that there is a diversity of opinion as to the most effective approaches to the conservation of rhinoceroses;

CONCERNED that threats to rhinoceros populations and demand for rhinoceros horns and other parts and derivatives still exist, and that the cost of ensuring adequate security for rhinoceroses and rhinoceros horn stocks is increasing and cannot easily be met by many range States;

CONCERNED that demand for rhinoceros horns is increasing and that the severe and persistent threat of poaching continues to affect rhinoceros populations and in some cases threatens their very existence;

CONSIDERING that domestic markets for rhinoceros horn increase the risk to rhinoceros populations and local communities, by confusing consumers, increasing demand, undermining demand reduction programmes obfuscating enforcement efforts, and providing potential routes through which illegally obtained rhinoceros horn might be laundered;

Also CONCERNED that Parties have in the past made statements outside of COP or Standing Committee meetings that go against the spirit of the existing CITES rules relating to trade in rhinoceros species which could be detrimental to the conservation of rhinoceros populations and create additional burdens on Range State enforcement authorities;

CONCERNED that the use of medicines and products containing parts and derivatives from rhinoceros species continues in many countries around the world;

CONCERNED that messaging that appears to promote or legitimise the value and use of rhinoceros horn can confuse consumers, undermine demand reduction efforts, and increase the burden on enforcement authorities;

ACKNOWLEDGING that rhinoceros range States have called upon transit and consumer States to assist their efforts to protect their rhinoceros populations by closing their domestic markets for rhinoceros horn, parts and derivatives;

ACKNOWLEDGING that many range and consumer States have taken, are taking, or intend to take legislative and regulatory steps to close their domestic markets for rhinoceros horn, parts and derivatives;

NOTING the Order announced in May 2018 by the Prime Minister of the Lao People's Democratic Republic to tighten regulations against trade of protected wildlife, including instructing the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry with investigating and stopping all businesses trading in wildlife parts including rhinoceros horns; and

NOTING the Prime Ministerial Decision issued in 2013 by the Prime Minister of Viet Nam to ban the import, export, purchase and sale of the specimens from and products made of white and black rhinoceros;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

1. URGES all Parties to:

- a) take all necessary legislative, regulatory and enforcement measures to close all existing domestic markets for trade in raw and worked rhinoceros horn or other rhinoceros parts and derivatives as a matter of urgency;
- b) inform the Secretariat of the status of their domestic markets for rhinoceros products and efforts to implement the provision in subparagraph (a);
- a)c) adopt and implement comprehensive legislation and enforcement controls, including internal trade restrictions and penalties:
 - i) aimed at reducing illegal trade in rhinoceros parts and derivatives, including any specimen that appears from an accompanying document, the packaging, a mark or label, or from any other circumstances, to be a rhinoceros part or derivative;
 - ii) incorporating specific provisions that apply to CITES-related offences, including the possession of rhinoceros specimens acquired in violation of the Convention, and to engage with the Secretariat

as may be needed, for legal assistance in the development of legislative measures aimed at tackling illegal trade in rhinoceros specimens and to ensure effective domestic enforcement and prosecution of offenders; and

- iii) that make provision for strong penalties, including custodial sentences, to deter illegal killing of rhinoceroses and illegal possession of and trade in rhinoceros horn;
- bd) adopt legislation or draw upon existing legislation to facilitate the use of specialized investigation techniques such as controlled deliveries and covert investigations, where appropriate, in support of conventional investigation techniques, in particular for offences related to the illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the trafficking of rhinoceros horns;
- ee) maximize the impact of enforcement actions to combat illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the trafficking of rhinoceros horns, by using other tools and regulations, such as anti-money laundering and asset forfeiture legislation, in support of wildlife legislation;
- ef) prosecute members of organized crime groups implicated in rhinoceros-related crimes under a combination of relevant laws which carry appropriate penalties that will act as effective deterrents, whenever possible;
- eg) immediately bring the seizure of illegal rhinoceros specimens made within their territories:
 - i) to the attention of authorities in countries of origin, transit and destination, as applicable, providing information associated with the seizure, for example on modus operandi, accompanying documentation, any identification marks on the seized specimens, where appropriate the details of the offenders involved, and any other information that could assist the initiation of investigations as appropriate, in countries of origin, transit and destination; or
 - ii) to the attention of the CITES Secretariat in cases where sufficient information is not available to identify the countries of origin, transit and destination of the seized rhinoceros specimens, including information describing the circumstances of the seizure;
- fh) collect samples from rhinoceros horn seized within their territories for forensic analysis, to link such horns to crime scenes and implicated suspects, and to promote successful prosecution;
- gi) use the *Form for collection and sharing of data on rhinoceros horn seizures and on samples for forensic analysis* provided in the Annex to this Resolution, as a standard format to collect and share information about seizures of rhinoceros specimens, and for the collection of relevant data to accompany samples collected from seized rhinoceros specimens for forensic analyses, in support of the implementation of paragraphs e) i) and ii) and f) above;
- hj) prior to issuing permits or certificates, including pre-Convention certificates, authorizing the movement of specimens of rhinoceroses, consult with the country of destination, so that the trade may be confirmed and monitored; and
- ik) consider introducing stricter domestic measures to regulate the re-export of rhinoceros horn specimens from any source;

2. URGES

- a) all Parties that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat;
- b) all Parties to make every effort to collate information on privately-held stockpiles of rhinoceros horn within their territory, and to include such information in their annual declarations;
- c) all Parties to consider the destruction of stockpiles of rhinoceros horns as a management option, in order to offset the risks and costs of securing such stockpiles;

- bd) the Secretariat and other appropriate bodies, where possible, to assist those Parties with inadequate legislation, enforcement, or control of stocks, by providing them technical advice and relevant information;
 - ee) range States to be vigilant in their law enforcement efforts, including the prevention of illegal hunting, the early detection of potential offenders and the application of appropriate penalties to act as effective deterrents;
 - df) that law enforcement cooperation between and among range and implicated States be increased through the existing international, regional and national law enforcement mechanisms and, where necessary, for example, through the establishment of treaties on extradition and Mutual Legal Assistance in criminal matters, in order to curtail rhinoceros poaching and illegal trade in rhinoceros horn; and
 - eg) the Parties that are affected by illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the trafficking of rhinoceros horns, either as range or implicated States, to:
 - i) as a matter of priority work with all user groups and industries to develop and implement well targeted strategies for reducing the use and consumption of rhinoceros parts and derivatives, with the aim of achieving measurable change in consumer behaviour;
 - ii) develop and implement strategies or programmes to enhance community awareness of the economic, social and environmental impacts of illegal wildlife trade, and to encourage the general public to report activities related to the illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the trafficking of rhinoceros horns to appropriate authorities for further investigation; and
 - iii) provide information on the effectiveness of strategies or programmes referred to in subparagraphs e) i) and ii) above, to the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC, to assist in identifying best practices and challenges experienced, and for inclusion into the joint IUCN/TRAFFIC report;
3. DIRECTS the Standing Committee to continue to pursue actions aimed at ending rhinoceros poaching and illegal trade in rhinoceros parts and derivatives, ensuring that:
 - a) all such actions are accompanied by evaluations of their effectiveness and appropriate recommendations; and
 - b) the policies that guide interventions are responsive and adaptive to the outcome of the evaluations;
 4. RECOMMENDS that those range States without a budgeted conservation and management plan for rhinoceroses should develop and implement one as expeditiously as possible, utilizing all available relevant expertise and resources;
 5. RECOMMENDS further that those range States with an existing, budgeted plan for rhinoceroses should endeavour to implement the plan as expeditiously as possible, and should undertake a review of the effectiveness of enforcement and trade control measures therein;
 6. RECOMMENDS that, where appropriate, national level measures are in place for the management of imported rhinoceros horn trophies, including addressing the issue of alteration and transfer of such trophies, to ensure that rhinoceros horns acquired as legal hunting trophies remain in lawful possession;
 7. DIRECTS the Secretariat, prior to each meeting of the Conference of the Parties, and pending external funding, to commission the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC to submit a report to the Secretariat on:
 - a) the national and continental conservation status of African and Asian rhinoceros species;
 - b) trade in specimens of rhinoceros;
 - c) stocks of specimens of rhinoceros and stock management;

- d) the status of domestic markets for rhinoceros horn, and efforts to close those markets in accordance with paragraph 1(a);
- ~~de~~) incidents of illegal killing of rhinoceroses;
- ~~ef~~) enforcement issues;
- ~~fg~~) conservation actions and management strategies with an evaluation of their effectiveness; and
- ~~gh~~) measures implemented by implicated States to end the illegal use and consumption of rhinoceros parts and derivatives;
8. REQUESTS the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC to engage with range and implicated States as appropriate, as well as with the UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre, when producing the report, and to reflect the outcomes of these consultations in their reporting pursuant to this Resolution;
9. DIRECTS the Secretariat to:
- a) make an aggregated summary of the rhinoceros horn stock declarations of Parties available to the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC for analysis and inclusion in their reporting to the Secretariat pursuant to the Resolution;
- b) make the report of the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC available at each meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and
- c) on the basis of the report, formulate draft decisions for consideration by the Conference of the Parties as appropriate;
10. FURTHER DIRECTS the Secretariat to:
- a) Prior to each regular meeting of the Standing Committee, issue a Notification to the Parties requesting information concerning the status of their domestic rhino horn markets and efforts to close these markets;
- b) Make the information available to the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC; and
- c) On the basis of this information, report its findings and recommendations to each regular meeting of the Standing Committee, which may consider recommendations to support the implementation of the present Resolution, as well as other appropriate measures in accordance with Resolution Conf. 14.3 on CITES compliance procedures;
101. ENCOURAGES the Parties to support the Secretariat financially, to enable it to commission a report from the IUCN African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC for each meeting of the Conference of the Parties;
142. URGES range States of African and Asian rhinoceroses, implicated States, other Parties and other stakeholders to cooperate with the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC in collecting information and producing the report called for in this Resolution;
123. CALLS upon all governments and intergovernmental organizations, international aid agencies and non-governmental organizations to provide funds to implement rhinoceros conservation activities and the present Resolution to prevent the illegal killing of rhinoceroses and the illegal trade in rhinoceros horn;
134. CALLS for constructive engagement amongst all Parties to the Convention and synergy between the Convention and the IUCN/SSC Rhino Specialist Groups to achieve the aims of this Resolution.

145. REPEALS the Resolutions listed hereunder:

- a) Resolution Conf. 3.11 (New Delhi, 1981) – *Trade in Rhinoceros Horn*; and
- b) Resolution Conf. 6.10 (Ottawa, 1987) – *Trade in Rhinoceros Products*.

DRAFT DECISIONS 18.AA-18.DD ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
RESOLUTION CONF. 9.14 (REV. COP18)

18.AA ***Directed to Parties***

- a) All Parties shall review their implementation of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) on *Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses*, to achieve good implementation of the Resolution and the strategies and proposed actions, and to increase the effectiveness of the law-enforcement response to rhinoceros poaching and rhinoceros horn trafficking. Parties should ensure that their legislation provides sufficient protection against illegal trade in and possession of and all rhinoceros species and specimens, that rhinoceros trafficking is considered a serious crime, that enforcement authorities are sufficiently resourced and equipped to intercept, investigate and enable successful prosecution of perpetrators of rhinoceros-related crime, including illegal online trade, and that legal provisions facilitate the use of all mechanisms available to enable the dismantling of criminal networks involved in rhinoceros trafficking.
- b) Parties identified as key source, transit and/or destination points for illegal trade in rhino horn by IUCN/Traffic in their regular report to CoP, should develop and regularly review their action plans on rhinoceros protection, in order to ensure they remain up-to-date and fit for purpose.
- c) All Parties shall make every effort to collaborate with each other, and with relevant transnational agencies including ICCWC, to exchange information and build capacity, in order to facilitate and improve enforcement response and relevant prosecutorial and judicial processes in relation to illegal trade in rhinoceros horn and other products.
- d) Parties shall report on their implementation of Decisions 18.AA a)-c) to the Secretariat, in advance of the document deadline for the 73rd and 74th meetings of the Standing Committee.

18.BB ***Directed to the Secretariat***

The Secretariat shall collate the information submitted by Parties in compliance with Decision 18.AA and submit a report to the 73rd and 74th meetings of the Standing Committee.

18.CC ***Directed to the Standing Committee***

- a) At its 73rd and 74th meetings, utilising the information collated under Decision 18.BB, Standing Committee shall establish the impacts that the work of Parties is having on slowing the rate of poaching and trafficking of rhinoceros horn, and any gaps in the provisions implemented by parties, in fulfilment of Paragraph 3 of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP18). This should include consideration of legislative measures, enforcement actions, seizures, successful and unsuccessful prosecutions, convictions and penalties, reasons for successes and failures, and any priority actions needed.
- b) At its 74th meeting, Standing Committee should provide a report with recommendations to the 19th Conference of the Parties.

TENTATIVE BUDGET AND SOURCE OF FUNDING
FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DRAFT RESOLUTIONS OR DECISIONS

According to Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP16) on *Submission of draft resolutions, draft decisions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties*, the Conference of the Parties decided that any draft resolutions or decisions submitted for consideration at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties that have budgetary and workload implications for the Secretariat or permanent committees must contain or be accompanied by a budget for the work involved and an indication of the source of funding. The authors of this document propose the following tentative budget and source of funding.

The authors of this document propose that no additional budget or funding is necessary.