

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Eighteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Colombo (Sri Lanka), 23 May – 3 June 2019

Interpretation and implementation matters

Regulation of trade

ENHANCEMENT OF QUOTAS FOR MARKHOR HUNTING TROPHIES

1. This document has been submitted by Pakistan.*

COMMENTS OF THE SECRETARIAT

- A. As required by Resolution Conf. 9.21 (Rev. CoP13) on *Interpretation and application of quotas for species included in Appendix I*, Pakistan has submitted a request for amending its quota in Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14) on *Establishment of quotas for markhor hunting trophies* by providing supporting information, including details of the scientific basis for the proposed increased, 150 days prior to the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
- B. Pakistan substantiates the proposed increase from an annual export quota of 12 hunting trophies of markhor, *Capra falconeri*, to 20 hunting trophies by providing information on the current distribution, population status, threats and conservation activities concerning markhor in Pakistan, and sharing the outcome of a status review by its CITES Management and Scientific Authorities. Since 1996, Pakistan's markhor population increased from 3,000-4,250 to 12,000 in 2017, and is reportedly stable or increasing in all the range provinces/territories in the country, especially where community-based trophy hunting programmes are being implemented. Pakistan attributes this positive evolution to the success of a community-based trophy hunting programme for the species, that created considerable socio-economic benefits for local communities, and therefore ownership and incentives for improved protection.
- C. Pakistan's community-based trophy hunting and management plans have been recognized in Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14) since 1997, when an annual export quota of 6 hunting trophies of markhor from Pakistan was approved at CoP10. The export quota was agreed to be increased to 12 trophies per calendar year at CoP12 in 2002. According to the supporting information, more local communities are willing to join the community-based trophy hunting programme, and to accommodate these new communities, the annual quota should be increased from 12 to 20 markhor hunting trophies. The proposal implies that the new quota is the result of the making of a non-detriment finding for trade in *Capra falconeri*, but does not provide further details.
- D. An examination of Pakistan's exports of hunting trophies of *Capra falconeri* since 2003, based on data in the CITES trade database analysed by the United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), suggests that Pakistan did not exceed its annual export quota of 12 trophies per year, with the potential exception of 2006 and 2009 [possibly 17 and 14 hunting trophies

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

recorded respectively]. For the period 2003-2017, Pakistan reported the export of a total of 130 hunting trophies (8.6 per annum) and importing countries a total of 155 trophies (10.3 per annum). The discrepancies can be explained by differences in which importing Parties recorded trophies and the terms they used for describing various parts of a trophy.

- E. Pakistan reports that community-based trophy hunting programmes resulted in the improved conservation status of markhor, socio-economic uplifting of local communities, better protection of wildlife by these communities, and changes in public attitude towards wildlife. Local communities get an 80% share of the revenue from trophy hunting activities, which is used for community-based conservation activities. The proposal thereby seems to support the implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.9 on *Trade in hunting trophies of species listed in Appendix I or II*, which in paragraph 4 “*FURTHER RECOMMENDS that trophy hunting activities relating to species listed in Appendix I should produce conservation benefits for the species concerned and thus may benefit from having a benefit sharing or incentive system in place to ensure that harvesting contributes to the offsetting of the cost of living with certain species, such as elephants;*”.
- F. The Secretariat recommends that the proposed annual export quota for Pakistan of 20 hunting trophies of markhor, *Capra falconeri*, be adopted in view of the enhanced conservation status and growing population of the species, and the information provided showing that the trophy hunting activities are in line with Resolution Conf. 17.9.
- G. If the proposal from Pakistan is approved by the Conference of the Parties as submitted in document CoP18 Doc. 47, it will necessitate an amendment to paragraph 1 of Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14) on *Establishment of quotas for markhor hunting trophies* to read: “APPROVES an export quota of ~~42~~ 20 hunting trophies of markhor *Capra falconeri* from Pakistan per calendar year (1 January to 31 December);”.

CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS FOR AMENDMENT OF APPENDICES I AND II

A. Proposal

Markhor (*Capra falconeri*) is national animal of Pakistan. It is protected under provincial/territorial wildlife laws of Pakistan. To address declining status of markhor and other ungulates, community-based trophy hunting of limited mature males was introduced in Pakistan. As Markhor was listed on CITES Appendix-I, CITES Conference of Parties (CoP10, Harare, Zimbabwe, 1997) was approached and an annual trophy hunting quota of six hunting trophies of markhor was allocated to Pakistan. In view of success of community based trophy hunting programme, trophy hunting quota of markhor was increased to twelve on request of Pakistan at CITES CoP12 held in Santiago, Chile: *Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14)*. Now the markhor populations in Pakistan have stable to increasing trend in Pakistan contributing towards overall improvement in its status from *Endangered* to *Near Threatened* as per IUCN Redlist. Successful implementation community based trophy hunting programme has not only improved protection to the species but also provided socio-economic uplift to the local communities receiving 80% share of the revenue generated through this programme. Now more communities are willing to join the community based trophy hunting programme, therefore annual quota of 12 markhor hunting trophies for Pakistan may be enhanced to 20 to accommodate new communities in the community based trophy hunting programme.

B. Proponent

Pakistan*

C. Supporting statement

1. Taxonomy

- | | |
|--------------|------------------------|
| 1.1 Class: | Mammalia |
| 1.2 Order: | Artiodactyla |
| 1.3 Family: | Bovidae |
| 1.4 Genus: | <i>Capra</i> |
| 1.5 Species: | <i>Capra falconeri</i> |

There are currently two subspecies of markhor recognized (Schaller and Khan, 1975; Hess *et al.*, 1997): flare-horned markhor (*Capra falconeri falconeri*) which includes the Kashmir and Astor forms earlier described by Roberts (1977), and straight-horned markhor (*C.f. megaceros*) which includes the Kabul and Suleiman forms.

2. Distribution

Most of the world's population of markhor lives in Pakistan (Hess *et al.*, 1997) where the species is associated with dry, steep slopes at lower elevations that provide adequate escape terrain and shallow snow cover in winter. According to Schaller and Khan (1975), bordering the Indus basin to as high as 4,000m during summer in Chitral and Gilgit where their distribution may seasonally overlap with that of the Himalayan ibex (*Capra ibex sibirica*). Flare-horned markhor is mainly confined to small, scattered populations along the Indus and its tributaries in the Northern Areas (Gilgit-Baltistan), the Kohistan District of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Former NWFP) and as well as along the Kunar (Chitral) river and its tributaries in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. According to Hess *et al.* (1997), the distribution map for flare-horned markhor given by

* The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.

Schaller and Khan (1975) was still valid although the large, continuous range along the Indus has probably been fragmented into smaller isolated patches of distribution. While Schaller and Khan (1975) showed a huge recent past range for straight-horned markhor, Hess *et al.* (1997) restricted the present range to small isolated areas in Baluchistan, a small area in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and one unconfirmed occurrence in Punjab.

3. Population status

As per available population estimates population of species has shown positive trend and may be considered as stable to increasing in its habitats across Pakistan. Below is given year-wise available population estimates of species in its range provinces/territories:

Population estimates of Markhor in Pakistan

Year	Flare-horned Markhor	Straight-horned Markhor	Total
1996	2000-3000	1000-1250	3000-4250
2011	4500	3500	8000
2017	8000	4000	12000

4. Threats

Main threats to the species include:

- i) Habitat degradation and fragmentation
- ii) Illegal hunting (limited)
- iii) Competition with livestock
- iv) Disease transmission from livestock grazing in habitat
- v) Climate Change

5. Conservation activities for Markhor in Pakistan

Provincial/territorial wildlife departments undertake various activities for conservation and protection of markhor in Pakistan. In these efforts, there is active collaboration and support from NGOs; Snow Leopard Foundation Pakistan, WWF Pakistan, Wildlife Conservation Society, Himalayan Wildlife Foundation and IUCN-Pakistan.

Conservation activities include:

- 5.1 **Legal Protection:** Markhor is "Protected" under respective provincial/territorial wildlife legislation and its hunting, killing (except special permit) and capturing has been completely banned. Any violation is punishable with imprisonment or a fine or with both.
- 5.2 **Establishment of Protected Areas:** For conservation and preservation of the species a system of protected areas has been established in the country covering the key habitat areas which provide safe habitat.
- 5.3 **Watch and Ward:** To control illegal hunting of the species, provincial/territorial wildlife authorities and local communities ensure strict enforcement through watch and ward in and around the protected areas.
- 5.4 **Livestock Vaccination:** To control transmission of disease from livestock to wildlife and vice versa, livestock vaccination is carried out in the species habitats.

5.5 Awareness Raising: Awareness raising activities are undertaken to increase awareness about wildlife species by highlighting their importance and role in ecosystem. Local communities, students and other stakeholders are involved in these campaigns.

5.6 Community-based Trophy Hunting Programme:

5.6.1 Introduction: Trophy hunting of Markhor is being successfully implemented in Pakistan and is globally recognized. The local communities get 80% shares of the revenue generated, which is used for community-based conservation of species. This programme has resulted in improvement in population status of markhor in addition to socio-economic uplift of local communities. In return the communities protect wildlife with a sense of ownership. This programme has great potential in changing public attitude toward wildlife.

5.6.2 Background: In early 90s community-based trophy hunting of ungulates started in Pakistan. In Torghar area of Balochistan, Society for Torghar Environmental Protection (STEP) started community-based trophy hunting and the revenue generated was used to hire wildlife guards from local communities to stop poaching. A similar programme was initiated by WWF-Pakistan in Bar Valley of Gilgit-Balistan. The idea was to conserve wildlife by involving local communities through incentive mechanism so that communities develop a sense of ownership to protect wildlife. In 1992 Markhor (*Capra falconeri*) was transferred to CITES Appendix I by Resolution Conf. 8.21 which resulted in complete halt of its hunting. Accordingly 10th meeting of CITES Conference of Parties was approached in 1997 for allocation of annual quota of Markhor for trophy hunting. In view of active community-based management of wildlife, annual quota of six Markhor was allocated to Pakistan (Resolution Conf. 10.15). Subsequently on the request of Pakistan the quota was increased to twelve on request of Pakistan at CITES CoP12 vide [Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14)].

5.6.3 Implementation Mechanism: Annual quota of 12 Markhor is equally distributed to the three range province/territories of Pakistan; four each for Balochistan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Gilgit-Balistan and is based primarily on existing population. Allocation of quota is made at federal level by CITES Management Authority at the federal level. The allocation is made on the basis of advice from Scientific Authority. Provincial/territorial wildlife authorities have designated community managed conservation areas in key habitat of the species. The role of local communities is clearly defined through recognized community organizations in the allocated areas. After allocation of annual quota, marketing of trophies is done at provincial/territorial level through open auctions. Hunting of trophies is arranged by registered trophy hunting outfitters, the process is monitored by provincial/territorial wildlife departments in collaboration with local communities. Local communities get 80% of the revenue generated which is used on community based conservation activities by the local communities. Monitoring of species including surveys and watch and ward to control poaching is done by provincial/territorial wildlife departments in collaboration with local communities. There is active presence of NGOs like; WWF-Pakistan, IUCN-Pakistan, Wildlife Conservation Society, Snow Leopard Foundation of Pakistan and others which support government and local communities in conservation activities. After successful hunting, CITES Management authority of Pakistan allows export of hunting trophies in accordance with the provisions of CITES (Resolution Conf. 10.15 (Rev. CoP14)).

6. Status Review by the CITES Scientific and Management Authority of Pakistan

In view of the CITES Resolution Conf. 17.9 (*Trade in hunting trophies of species listed in Appendix I or II*) matter of non-detriment findings on trophy hunting of Markhor (*Capra falconeri*) in Pakistan was discussed in detail by CITES Management Authority of Pakistan. All the range provinces/territories of Markhor have reported that the population of Markhor (*Capra falconeri*) is stable and increasing in its habitats, especially where community-based trophy hunting programme is being implemented. Office of Conservator Wildlife, Ministry of Climate Change as CITES Scientific Authority of Pakistan endorses the recent status of Markhor (*Capra falconeri*) in Pakistan as stable to increasing.

7. References

- Arshad, M. and Khan, M. S. H. 2008.** Winter survey of Suleiman markhor (*Capra falconerijerdoni*) and Afghan urial (*Ovisorientaliscyclocerus*) population in Torghar conservancy, KillaSaifullah, Balochistan. Society for Torghar Environmental Protection, Quetta, Pakistan.
- Frisina, M. R. 2000.** Suleiman markhor (*Capra falconerijerdoni*) and Afghan urial (*Ovisorientaliscyclocerus*) population status in the Torghar hills, Balochistan Province, Pakistan. A report to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service and Society for Torghar Environmental Protection, Quetta, Pakistan.
- Frisina, M. R., Rasheed, T. 2012.** Status of Suleiman Markhor and Afghan Urial on the Torghar Conservation Project: An Interim Progress Report to Society for Torghar Environmental Protection, Quetta, Pakistan.
- Hess, R., Bollmann, K., Rasool, G., Chaudry, A.A., Virk, A.T., and A. Ahmad. 1997.** Pakistan. Pp.239-260, in: D.M. Shackleton (ed.) & IUCN Caprinae Specialist Group, Wild Sheep and Goats, and their Relatives: Status Survey and Conservation Plan for Caprine. IUCN, Gland, Switzerland & Cambridge, UK.
- Michel, S. & Rosen Michel, T. 2015.** *Capra falconeri* (errata version published in 2016). *The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species* 2015: e.T3787A97218336. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2305/IUCN.UK.2015-4.RLTS.T3787A82028427.en>. Downloaded on 20 December 2018.
- Roberts.T.J. 1977.** The mammals of Pakistan. Ernest Benn Limited, London.
- Shafique, C. M. 2006.** Status of Suleiman markhor (*Capra falconerijerdoni*) and Afghan urial (*Ovisvigneicyclocerus*) with relation to community-based trophy hunting in Torghar conservancy, Balochistan Province, Pakistan. Society for Torghar Environmental Protection, Quetta, Pakistan.
- Schallar, G. B. and Khan, S. A. 1975.** Distribution and status of Markhor (*Capra falconeri*). *Biological Conservation*, 7:185-198.

TENTATIVE BUDGET AND SOURCE OF FUNDING
FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DRAFT RESOLUTIONS OR DECISIONS

According to Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP16) on *Submission of draft resolutions, draft decisions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties*, the Conference of the Parties decided that any draft resolutions or decisions submitted for consideration at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties that have budgetary and workload implications for the Secretariat or permanent committees must contain or be accompanied by a budget for the work involved and an indication of the source of funding.

WITHDRAWN