#### CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Eighteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties Colombo (Sri Lanka), 23 May – 3 June 2019

#### Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

## STORAGE AND MANAGEMENT OF ILLEGAL TRADE DATA COLLECTED THROUGH THE PARTIES' ANNUAL ILLEGAL TRADE REPORTS

- 1. This document has been submitted by the Standing Committee.\*
- 2. At its 17th meeting (CoP17, Johannesburg, 2016), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decisions 17.121 and 17.122 on *Reporting requirements.*

#### Directed to the Secretariat

17.121 The Secretariat shall engage with appropriate bodies, such as, but not limited to, the United Nations Environment Programme-World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC) and/or the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), regarding the establishment of a sustainable global framework to store and manage illegal trade data collected through the Parties' annual illegal trade reports, including identifying the associated cost implications and how such costs could be met, and report to the Standing Committee with its findings and recommendations.

#### Directed to the Standing Committee

17.122 The Standing Committee shall review the findings and recommendations of the Secretariat reported under Decision 17.121 and prepare its own findings and recommendations for the consideration of the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### Storage and management of illegal trade data

3. The Secretariat reported to the Standing Committee at its 69th meeting (SC69, Geneva, November 2017), that, in accordance with Decision 17.121, it engaged and consulted with UNEP-WCMC and UNODC regarding the "sustainable global framework" to store and manage illegal trade data collected through the Parties' annual illegal trade reports. The Secretariat, based on its consultations, recommended that UNODC be engaged to establish a sustainable global framework to store and manage illegal trade data collected through annual illegal trade reports. A preliminary proposal prepared by UNODC was made available to the Committee, and in addition, the Secretariat prepared a document containing the requirements it believed should be met concerning the storage and management of illegal trade data collected through the CITES annual illegal trade report. The Committee noted the preliminary proposal prepared by UNODC and endorsed the requirements to be met concerning the storage and management of illegal trade data proposed by the Secretariat. It further requested the Secretariat take into account and incorporate input from Parties in further developing these requirements to ensure that the data are made available to support law

<sup>\*</sup> The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.

enforcement needs, and to ensure that data are ultimately available as non-aggregated individual records. The Committee requested the Secretariat to work with UNODC to prepare a detailed proposal for the development of a database to store and manage illegal trade data, incorporating the requirements endorsed, and including the budget breakdown, for consideration by the Committee at its 70th meeting (SC70, Sochi, October 2018).

- 4. The Committee at SC70, considered the detailed proposal prepared by the Secretariat and UNODC for the meeting. The proposal indicated that UNODC can, building upon its long-standing experience in collecting, processing and analysing data on illegal activities and trafficking, provide a long-term and sustainable framework to collect, process, store and disseminate data collected through the CITES annual illegal trade reports. The detailed proposal as presented in the Annex to document <u>SC70 Doc. 26.3</u> was approved by the Committee. For ease of reference, the detailed proposal is also attached to the present document as Annex 1.
- 5. The cost for the development of the data platform, and for the storage and maintenance of data collected through annual illegal trade reports is estimated to be approximately USD 202,212 for the first year, and USD 176,789 for the subsequent years. The Secretariat, at SC70, drew attention to the fact that the annual illegal trade report is mandatory, and emphasized that the importance attached to this reporting should be reflected in the budget. The Secretariat further stressed that, in order to guarantee the sustainability of the framework, subject to funding being available, it would be preferable for the costs to be built into the core budget of the Secretariat. Some Parties expressed the view that funding for the database should not come from the core budget, and suggested that, if this model is adopted, savings should be made in other areas of the core budget to ensure its overall size remains the same.
- 6. The Committee noted the Secretariat's intentions to include the cost associated with the storage and management of illegal trade data in its draft CITES Trust Fund (CTL) budget for the years 2020-2022, to be considered by the Conference of the Parties at the present meeting, and requested the Secretariat to take account of the comments made during the discussion.
- 7. The Committee also agreed to contract UNODC to establish, host and maintain a database as per the proposal presented in Annex 1 of the present document and to submit a draft decision in this regard for consideration by the Conference of the Parties.

## Level of access to be provided to different users of the database

- 8. Should the Conference of the Parties agree to contract UNODC, one consideration to be addressed is the level of access to be provided to different users of the database. The different levels of user access that can be provided are described in the detailed proposal presented in Annex 1 to the present document. The Committee considered this matter at its 70th meeting and noted that the Conference of the Parties in paragraph 4 in Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev CoP17) on *National reports,* already provides a mandate for the data collected in the annual illegal trade reports to, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, be shared with members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) for use in ICCWC global research and analysis studies on wildlife and forest crime. This is also elaborated upon in the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of the CITES annual illegal trade report,*<sup>1</sup> paragraph 1 e), which states that each Party should indicate in its annual illegal trade report if the data provided in the report may be used in the ICCWC-supported global research and analysis on wildlife and forest crime, by ticking the appropriate box provided in the reporting format.
- 9. The Secretariat at SC70 suggested that it can add boxes in the format for reporting and, by ticking the appropriate box, the reporting Party can indicate if the data it provided can be made accessible to all other Parties that consult the database. In this manner, it will be easy for the Secretariat and UNODC to determine which data entered into the database must be accessible to the submitting Party only, and which can be accessible to all other Parties.
- 10. Where any regional body, such as EUROPOL or Wildlife Enforcement Networks, require data for the purpose of research and analysis on wildlife and forest crime as it affects the region, the Secretariat proposed that such a body inform its member States about the research it intends to conduct, and that the member States themselves on the basis of the information provided, each decide which of the data it submitted and included

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> <u>https://cites.org/sites/default/files/reports/E-Guidelines-IllegalTR.pdf</u>

in the illegal trade database, can be shared, and extract and provide such information to their regional bodies directly as deemed appropriate.

11. Taking into consideration the above, the Committee, at SC70, agreed to recommend that the Conference of the Parties amend paragraph 4 in Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP17) on *National reports*. In addition, the Committee agreed to propose the deletion of "commencing in 2017" in paragraph 3 of the Resolution, since this text is now redundant. The amendments proposed by the Committee are presented in paragraph 12. b) of the present document. Text proposed to be deleted is crossed out, and proposed new text is underlined.

## Recommendations:

- 12. The Conference of the Parties is invited to:
  - a) adopt draft decision 18.AA as follows:

## Directed to the Secretariat

- 18.AA The Secretariat shall contract UNODC to establish, host and maintain a database for the storage and management of illegal trade data collected through annual illegal trade reports, meeting the requirements outlined in the detailed proposal prepared by UNODC, as presented in the Annex to document SC70 Doc. 26.3 on *Annual illegal trade reports*.
- b) adopt the proposed amendments to paragraphs 3 and 4 in Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP17) on *National reports,* as follows:
  - 3. URGES all Parties, commencing in 2017, to submit an annual illegal trade report by 31 October each year covering actions in the preceding year and in accordance with the report format distributed by the Secretariat, as may be amended by the Secretariat from time to time with the concurrence of the Standing Committee;
  - 4. <u>DIRECTS the Secretariat AGREES that</u>, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, to share the data collected in the annual illegal trade report and included in the database should be made available to Parties for research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime as it affects them, and with to the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC), to allow data to be used in for ICCWC global research and analysis studies on wildlife and forest crime.
- c) delete Decisions 17.121 and 17.122.

## COMMENTS OF THE SECRETARIAT

- A. As noted in the present document, the Secretariat considers that UNODC is best placed to provide a sustainable solution for high quality management of CITES annual illegal trade data, so that it can become an accessible and powerful tool to inform the decision making of Parties and support the development of appropriate law enforcement responses to wildlife crime. Assuring a sustainable and solid infrastructure for the maintenance of illegal trade data is, as noted in Annex 2 to document SC69 Doc. 28.3 on Annual illegal trade reports, also key to the long-term production of the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) indicator 'Proportion of traded wildlife that was poached or trafficked' (Target 15.7), for which CITES and UNODC are the custodian agencies.<sup>2</sup>.
- B. The preparation of annual illegal trade reports could require significant investment and resources from Parties, considering that this data must often be collected from different national authorities and consolidated to compile the annual illegal trade report. The processing of such reports and recording of data in a user friendly, robust, secure and accessible format, equally presents a significant workload. To establish and maintain a database that meets the requirements outlined in the detailed proposal prepared by UNODC and agreed by the Standing Committee, as presented in the Annex to the present document, will be dependent upon a sustainable source of funding. If sustainably funded and the required capacity for the storage and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/files/Tier%20Classification%20of%20SDG%20Indicators\_27%20November%202018\_web.pdf</u>

management of CITES annual illegal trade data can be maintained, the efforts required from Parties in preparing and submitting annual illegal trade reports can be justified.

- C. Should a database be established in accordance with draft decision 18.AA using external funding, and later should this database be discontinued during periods when such funding is not available, it will likely not be practical or feasible to re-establish the capacity required when funding again becomes available. Also, if not operational for certain periods of time, significant data gaps could occur. This would undermine the effort and investment required from Parties to gather the data and compile the reports, impede the ability of the Secretariat to implement the provisions of paragraph 14 in Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP17) on *Compliance and enforcement*, and prevent the data from becoming the valuable tool it is intended to be. The Secretariat therefore believes that in the absence of sustainable and reliable funding, the framework will be difficult to sustain, and the implementation of draft decision 18.AA as proposed by the Standing Committee will not be feasible.
- D. The Secretariat will convey its views on the budgetary implications of the Standing Committee's proposal in the context of the discussions on the *Budget and work programme for 2020 to 2022*, at the present meeting for consideration by the Conference of the Parties.
- E. Considering that the detailed proposal presented in the Annex to document. 26.3 on *Annual illegal trade reports*, as approved by the Committee at SC70, is attached as an Annex to the present document for ease of reference, the Secretariat proposes that, should the Conference of the Parties adopt draft decision 18.AA, an editorial change be made to the draft decision, as proposed below. Text proposed to be deleted is crossed out, and proposed new text is underlined:
  - 18.AA The Secretariat shall contract UNODC to establish, host and maintain a database for the storage and management of illegal trade data collected through annual illegal trade reports, meeting the requirements outlined in the detailed proposal prepared by UNODC, as presented in the Annex 1 to document SC70 Doc. 26.3 CoP18 Doc. 30 on Annual illegal trade reports. Storage and management of illegal trade data collected through the Parties annual illegal trade reports.



CoP18 Doc. 36 Annex 1 (English only/Seulement en anglais/Únicamente en inglés)

## PROPOSAL

## A sustainable framework for the storage, management and dissemination of data collected through CITES Annual Illegal Trade Reports

# (26 July 2018)

# **Executive Summary**

This proposal was prepared in close collaboration with the Secretariat of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES), to implement Decision 17.121 on Reporting requirements.<sup>3</sup> It incorporates the matters outlined in the provisions of Recommendations c) and d) on *Annual illegal trade reports*, as presented in document SC69 Sum. 2 (Rev. 1),<sup>4</sup> agreed by the CITES Standing Committee at its 69th meeting (SC69, Geneva, 2017).

As described in this proposal, UNODC can provide a long-term and sustainable framework to collect, process, store and disseminate data collected through CITES annual illegal trade reports. The proposal builds upon the long-standing experience of UNODC in collecting, processing and analysing data on illegal activities and trafficking, and it has three specific objectives:

- To ensure the regular collection, processing and validation of annual illegal trade reports, secure storage of data collected, and processing this data to make it suitable for the production of analytical reports;

- To develop a data dissemination platform that will allow password-protected direct access to selected users, including the CITES Secretariat, CITES Parties and the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) partner agencies; and

-To gradually improve the quality of CITES annual illegal trade report data and to increase the response rate by CITES Parties.

The proposal also describes outputs, deliverables and activities to be undertaken by UNODC to assure the regular maintenance of the database and how these would fit the requirements set by CITES Conference of the Parties.

It is believed that UNODC's expertise, role and mandate will offer a sustainable solution for high quality management and user-friendly dissemination of CITES annual illegal trade data, so that this data can become an accessible and valuable tool to inform decision making, and support of the development of appropriate law enforcement responses to wildlife crime.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Decision 17.121 adopted by the 17th meeting of the CITES Conference of the Parties

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/69/sum/E-SC69-Sum-02-R1.pdf



# 1. Background

UNODC has long-standing experience in establishing and maintaining a wide range of data on illicit drugs, criminal activities and criminal justice response at global level, including data on trafficking in illicit goods. The UNODC Research and Trend Analysis Branch (RAB) manages the following datasets:

- Country-level aggregated data:
  - Comprehensive datasets on all aspects of the drug problem (demand, supply, production/ cultivation, mortality, drug-related offences) from UNODC's Annual Reports Questionnaire (ARQ);
  - The Crime Trends Survey database (UN-CTS), which covers data from a comprehensive questionnaire on criminal offences and criminal justice statistics (collected since 1970);
  - The homicide database, which integrates homicide data collected through the UN-CTS with data from external national and international sources from criminal justice and public health.
  - A Global Report on Trafficking in Persons database (GLOTIP) on detected victims and perpetrators of human trafficking, collected through an annual data collection from Member States;
  - Data on trafficking in firearms, their parts and components and ammunition, collected though the United Nations Illicit Arms Flows Questionnaire (UN-IAFQ)
  - The UNODC early Warning Advisory on New Psychoactive Substances (NPS) database and platform, collecting and sharing information on the emergence of NPS and toxicological data related to these substances, with information on legislative responses and technical information to assist forensic laboratories in the identification of NPS.
- Datasets of individual seizure events, as provided by Member States:
  - The Individual Drug Seizures (IDS) database, which includes significant illicit drug seizures reported by Member States biannually;
  - A database on significant arms seizures, with information collected annually through the UN-IAFQ;
  - A global multi-source wildlife seizure database (World WISE) on seizures of species from wild fauna and flora, covering the years 1999-2014;
  - The CITES annual illegal trade report database, which includes 2016 data on seizures of CITES listed specimens, submitted to the CITES Secretariat by Parties to the Convention.

UNODC has the statistical expertise, capacity, organisational framework and global mandate to host, manage and disseminate statistical data on criminal events/practices and on seizures of illicit goods. In particular, UNODC has significant experience in maintaining data collected across the years, ensuring the production of consistent time series and consolidated national data into regional and global aggregates with appropriate statistical procedures. Considerable experience also exists in managing official and technical communication with Member States throughout the phases of collection, processing and validation of data so to ensure the highest possible quality of data and a transparent link with national data producers.



Thanks to a long record of global reports on several topics, UNODC has developed a solid expertise on the analysis of data on criminal activities and illicit trafficking, which always need to be interpreted in conjunction with existing legal frameworks, law enforcement/criminal justice practices, national recording systems rules and possible capacity constraints at country level.

# 2. Current partnership on wildlife crime data

The CITES Secretariat and UNODC are partners in ICCWC, and both agencies share a commitment to an evidence-based approach to the global wildlife crime problem. UNODC has been an active member of the CITES Working Group on Special Reporting Requirements during the development of the CITES annual illegal trade report, and supported the design of the format for reporting.

In preparation of the 2016 World Wildlife Crime Report, UNODC created a global database of wildlife seizures, dubbed "World WISE". It contains data on 164,000 seizures from 120 countries over a 15-year period, and it was compiled from a variety of sources, including data from CITES, the World Customs Organisation, the European Union's Wildlife Enforcement Group, the LEMIS system of the United States, ASEAN's Wildlife Enforcement Network, and many others. This database, while comprehensive in its contents, is currently being upgraded to bring it in line with IT standards in terms of security, storage capacity, sustainability and ease of use.

In this partnership framework, CITES has recently shared annual illegal trade reports (AITR) for 2016 and UNODC is currently processing, harmonizing and validating available AITRs, and it has developed a secure database for storage and analysis of such data. Thanks to such activities and to regular consultation with UN Environment-WCMC and CITES Secretariat, UNODC has developed and tested a protocol to systematically and efficiently collect, process and validate these data, and to store them in a secure manner.

# 3. Proposed new partnership to manage the CITES Illegal Trade Data

## 3.1 Objectives

As indicated by Decision 17.121 adopted by the CITES Conference of the Parties, and the *Requirements* outlined in Annex 3 to document SC 69 Doc. 28.3, the main objectives of this new partnership would be:

- To maintain the current CITES-AITR *production* database, ensure the regular collection, processing and validation of AITR data, secure storage of data collected, and processing this data to make it suitable for the production of analytical reports;
- To develop a data dissemination platform that will allow password-protected direct access to the CITES Secretariat, CITES Parties, ICCWC partner agencies, and any other authorised potential user. This dissemination platform, that will integrate the *dissemination* database, will provide a user-friendly interface to selected contents of AITR data and built in a way that different levels of data access can be provided to different data users, as per indications by CITES Parties and CITES Secretariat;
- To contribute to improve the quality of CITES annual illegal trade report data, as well as to increase the response rate through communication with CITES Parties and CITES Management Authorities, in consultation with CITES Secretariat.



Assuring a sustainable and solid infrastructure for the maintenance of illegal trade data, as well as robust and consolidated time-series, is also key to assure the long-term production of the SDG Indicator 15.7.1 *'Proportion of traded wildlife that was poached or illicitly trafficked*', for which UNODC and CITES are custodian agencies<sup>5</sup>.

# 3.2 Outputs

- An integrated, validated and comprehensive set of data on wildlife seizures for analytical purposes, with data sourced from CITES annual illegal trade report.
- A password-protected data dissemination platform, directly accessible by ICCWC partner agencies and CITES Parties, containing CITES annual illegal trade reports data for which the CITES Parties agreed the sharing with ICCWC partner agencies.

# 3.3 Annual deliverables

- A yearly official data release of validated and reviewed CITES annual illegal trade reports (individual data) made available through the dissemination platform.
- A set of standard statistical tables based on CITES annual illegal trade reports aimed to monitor global and regional trends/patterns of trafficking in wildlife.
- A yearly data quality assessment report, with indications of data quality and coverage issues at global/regional level. Whenever relevant, amendments to the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of the CITES annual illegal trade reports* will be proposed to facilitate data preparation and submission by CITES Parties and improve data quality standards.

# 3.4 Activities

# First year:

- 1. Based on on-going experience, review and update the current CITES annual illegal trade report database
- 2. Collect and store *all* data received by CITES Secretariat
- 3. Translate CITES annual illegal trade report when reporting language is different than English
- 4. Process and validate data systematically
- 5. Review nomenclature and data standards based on consultation with UNEP-WCMC
- 6. Integrate data in the CITES annual illegal trade report database
- 7. Share annual illegal trade report data of the previous reporting year with CITES Parties for their technical review
- 8. Integrate CITES Parties' reviews and further inputs
- 9. Maintain documentation on data, metadata, national sources and validation process
- 10. Maintain and update data processing application
- 11. Maintain regular communication with CITES Parties and the CITES Secretariat

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Indicator has been re-classified as Tier II because of the lack of sufficient data coverage (IAEG-SDG 3rd meeting).



- 12. Respond to specific data requests, in agreement with the CITES Secretariat
- 13. Build consolidated data series for analytical purposes, inclusive of metadata
- 14. Release a data quality assessment report
- 15. Perform regular database backups and recovery tests on both production and dissemination databases
- 16. Design, test and launch a password-protected data platform for data dissemination, directly accessible by the CITES Secretariat, CITES Parties and ICCWC partner agencies.

## Second and subsequent years:

- 1. Conduct activities 1. to 15. (see above) for data collection, processing, validation and dissemination
- 2. Based on first year experience, review and update the dissemination platform.

## 3.5 Requirements

Main costs are summarised below (more detailed in the budget table).

- 1. A statistical assistant (G5) to implement activities 1. to 14. (see above)
- 2. Statistical expert (P3) to maintain supervision of the entire process
- 3. Contractual services for development of new data platform (Consultant, 4 months first year only)
- 4. Standard costs for the storage and maintenance of the production database, and for set up and maintain the data dissemination platform (including technical support for database backup and recovery).

## 3.6 Budget

The associated cost implications for the overall data management, the supervision of the entire process, development of the data platform and costs for storage and maintenance of data are planned to amount to USD 202,212 for the first year and to USD 176,789 for the second and subsequent years:

*N.B.* The indicated costs are intended as fixed charges for all activities to process all CITES annual illegal trade reports, regardless of the number of reports received.

The costs include:



	C 1			
Table I – Detailed c	osts of the a	<i>ictivities (in</i>	United States Dollars)	

Description	Year 1 (2020)	Year 2 (2021) and subsequent years
One-time costs		
Contractual services for development of new data platform (consultant) (4 months).	24,000	-
Sub-total	24,000	-
Recurrent costs		·
Statistical Assistant for overall data management (see detailed list of tasks in Annex 1 to this proposal).	111,2006	113,8004
Statistical expert to maintain supervision of the entire process (2 months).	27,783 <sup>4</sup>	28,383 <sup>4</sup>
Standard costs for data storage, maintenance and dissemination, including support costs for database backup and recovery.	12,500	9,540
Support cost to UN Environment-WCMC to help ensure that nomenclature reference and data standards are applied as for the annual trade report and to be compatible with the CITES legal trade database.	9,500	9,500
Annual meeting with CITES Secretariat, covering two-day mission of three staff members from Vienna to Geneva (or viceversa).	4,000	4,000
Sub-total	164,983	165,223
Project Net Total	188,983	165,223
PSC (7.0%)	13,229	11,566
TOTAL	202,212	176,789

Total for the first two years: USD 379,001

# 4. Requirements concerning the storage and the management of illegal trade data collected through the CITES annual illegal trade report

Document SC69 Doc. 28.3, Annex 3, states that: "In Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP17), paragraph 3, the Conference of the Parties URGES all Parties, commencing in 2017, to submit an annual illegal trade report by 31 October each year covering actions in the preceding year and in accordance with the report format distributed by the Secretariat, as may be amended by the Secretariat from time to time with the concurrence of the Standing Committee. Data obtained from these reports stored and managed on behalf of the CITES Secretariat, should be dealt with in accordance with the following requirements (...)".

At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed Recommendations c) and d) on *Annual illegal trade reports*, presented in document SC69 Sum. 2 (Rev. 1), as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Standard UNODC Revised Standard Salary costs (2018-2021) for Staff Members positions based in Vienna funded by extra-budgetary sources.



- c) The Standing Committee endorsed the requirements to be met concerning the storage and management of illegal trade data collected through the annual illegal trade reports, as prepared by the Secretariat and presented in Annex 3 of document SC69 Doc. 28.3, and taking into account the advice provided by the Standing Committee at its 69th meeting to incorporate input from Parties in further developing these requirements, to ensure that the data are made available to support law enforcement needs, and to ensure that data are ultimately available as non-aggregated individual records.
- d) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to work with UNODC to prepare a detailed proposal for the development of a database to store and manage illegal trade data collected through CITES annual illegal trade reports, engaging with partners of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) as appropriate, incorporating the requirements referred to in recommendation c) above and including the budget breakdown, for consideration by the Committee at its 70th meeting, and subsequent submission to the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties for consideration.

The table below lists the requirements outlined in Annex 3 to document SC69 Doc. 28.3, and how UNODC proposes to meet those requirements.



Table 2 - UNODC proposed solutions to the requirements to be met concerning the storage and the management of illegal trade data through the CITES annual illegal trade report

Requirement	Proposed solution
1) The ownership of the data stored in the illegal trade database and managed on behalf of the CITES Secretariat remains with the Party that reported the data to the CITES Secretariat.	1) UNODC will host and manage the data on behalf of the CITES Secretariat. The data will not be disseminated without prior approval by the CITES Secretariat. Standard validation procedures will be conducted by UNODC before dissemination to improve data consistency and accuracy. Both production and dissemination databases, related processing tools and the dissemination platform will be designed by making use of standard IT tools and software; if needed, this would facilitate data migration to different IT infrastructures in the future.
2) The data must be stored on a secure platform and managed in a secure manner.	2) CITES annual illegal trade report data will be hosted in a secure and protected database- similarly to all other data collections managed by UNODC. The production database will be accessible only to UNODC and will be physically located at UNODC Headquarters. To guarantee the highest data dissemination security standards, the dissemination database will fulfil the security standards of the Office of Information and Communications Technology (OICT) of the UN Secretariat. All ICT infrastructures and applications used for data validation, storage, maintenance and dissemination will allow to keep track of all processes associated with the production database and to monitor the access to the dissemination platform. Logs of all these activities will be stored and maintained over the years.
3) The host of the database must ensure that data, which can be shared with members of ICCWC to be used in ICCWC global research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime, can be easily separated from data that cannot be shared with ICCWC in accordance with the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP17), paragraph 4. The database must allow separate download of these datasets, to be used by ICCWC in accordance with the necessary data sharing protocol, to conduct analyses and research to identify patterns and flows of illicit trafficking (e.g. identification of high risk	3) UNODC keeps track of the authorisation to share CITES annual illegal trade report data with other ICCWC partners, as indicated by the reporting parties in the checkbox of the reports received. The dissemination platform will exclude all data from reports with explicit indication that " <i>information provided () may not be used in the ICCWC-supported global research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime</i> ".



geographic areas / routes / transport methods / species / allocation of enforcement resources).	
4) The database must be directly and fully accessible to the CITES Secretariat.	4) The CITES Secretariat will have full access to the data dissemination platform (for security reasons, the production database will be accessible only to UNODC staff). The dissemination database will be a replication of the production database and it will be fully available to the CITES Secretariat. Data will be made available on the dissemination database according to a predetermined schedule agreed upon between UNODC and CITES Secretariat.
5) Direct access to the database containing data for which Parties agreed that this data can be shared with members of ICCWC for research and analysis will be granted by UNODC to any ICCWC partner agency, subject to approval by the CITES Secretariat. This will facilitate the coherent use of data and enable the Secretariat to, as appropriate, keep track of and manage such use. Such access will be granted for the period needed by the requesting ICCWC partner agency to conduct the agreed research and analyses, and will be restricted to identified users as agreed with the ICCWC partner agency requesting access.	5) The data platform will be protected with a password to guarantee access restricted only to CITES Secretariat, CITES Parties and ICCWC partner agencies. Different levels/permissions of access can be assigned to different users of the dissemination platform, according to the indication of the CITES Secretariat before the sharing, dissemination and publication of any data. The data dissemination platform infrastructure will allow for flexibility in the permission levels, from the access to limited fields of selected reports to full access to all fields of all reports received and validated by UNODC. Access to data can also be offered for a limited time interval.
6) The system must provide a user interface that presents, sorts and aggregates data in a meaningful manner.	6) The data dissemination platform will be designed to allow filtering, sorting and aggregating options of CITES annual illegal trade report data. Features of data dissemination interface will be described in a technical note that will be agreed with CITES Secretariat.
7) To facilitate analyses of annual illegal trade data, the illegal trade database must enable searches to be made using different parameters, e.g. Party, Appendices, species, specimen, etc.	7) The annual illegal trade report data tables available in the data dissemination platform will include the name of reporting Party, the CITES Appendices, and all relevant fields included in the reporting format template of the CITES annual illegal trade report. The specific contents of annual illegal trade reports made available on the dissemination platform will be detailed in a technical note to be agreed with CITES Secretariat.



8) The data shall be stored and be made available using data fields and data elements that correspond to the codes and formats set out in the <i>Guidelines for the preparation and submission of the CITES annual illegal trade report</i> agreed by the Standing Committee, and the <i>Guide to using the CITES Trade Database</i> . Updates must be made as necessary to the database, to incorporate changes to the Guidelines or the Guide.	8) The data from CITES annual illegal trade reports will be stored using as reference the <i>Guidelines for the preparation and submission of the</i> <i>CITES annual illegal trade report</i> and the data processing protocols prescribed in the <i>Guide to using the CITES Trade Database</i> . Specific contents of the data dissemination platform will be described in a technical note. In case of changes to the Guidelines and/or the guide, necessary updates to the data storage and dissemination will be discussed by UNODC and CITES Secretariat, and implemented taking into account possible resource implications.
9) The latest nomenclature references adopted by the CITES Conference of the Parties must be used.	9) At the moment of database establishment, the latest nomenclature adopted by the CITES Conference of Parties will be used (UNODC is already collaborating with UN Environment-WCMC to guarantee alignment). Updates to the nomenclature that need to be reflected in the data storage and dissemination will be discussed by UNODC and CITES Secretariat, and implemented taking into account possible resource implications.
10) The data will be processed and validated according to procedures to be agreed to ensure the highest possible quality of data.	10) UNODC has long-standing experience in processing and validating seizures data for statistical purposes. The prescription of the <i>Guidelines</i> for the preparation and submission of the CITES annual illegal trade report and the data processing protocols prescribed in the <i>Guide to using</i> the CITES Trade Database will be used as reference for data processing. Data processing and validation will be conducted according to a transparent procedure, which will be discussed and reviewed with CITES Secretariat. UNODC will regularly produce a report on data quality with the aim of giving indications to Member States on improving data quality at the source.
11) The database must be able to clearly differentiate between data originating from the CITES annual illegal trade reports and data from other sources, and allow a separate download of the dataset from the CITES annual illegal trade reports.	<ul><li>11) Each data element will be stored with clear specification of its data source; accordingly, it will be possible to implement each operation (aggregation, visualisation, and download) according to the data source. The selection - for download or visualisation - of data sourced from CITES annual illegal trade reports will be a simple operation.</li></ul>



12) The host of the database must engage with UNEP-WCMC to help ensure that the database will apply the same nomenclature references and data standards as for the annual trade report, and be compatible with the CITES Trade database.	12) UNODC is already cooperating with UN Environment-WCMC to ensure alignment of processing protocols prescribed in the <i>Guide to using</i> <i>the CITES Trade Database</i> . UNODC follows strictly the <i>Guidelines for</i> <i>the preparation and submission of the CITES annual illegal trade report</i> as validation rule. The collaboration with UN Environment-WCMC will continue and it will be formalised.
13) Roles and responsibilities for staff of the host of the database on the management and use of the data will be developed through consultation between the host of the database and the CITES Secretariat, and agreed prior to the start of the project.	13) The agreement between CITES Secretariat and UNODC will identify activities, outputs and the timeline for their implementation. The agreement will also identify the organisational unit responsible for its implementation, the resource requirements and the Focal Points responsible for communication between CITES Secretariat and UNODC. Regular consultation will be held between staff of CITES Secretariat and UNODC to ensure coordination and smooth operations of the project. Further details on the responsibilities of the full time statistical assistant working on the CITES illegal trade report data are available in the Annex I of this proposal.



# 5. Complementarity of CITES AITR and other wildlife trade data and use of CITES AITR to feed the new World Wildlife Seizure (WISE) Database

UNODC is fully engaged to provide the international community with the best available global information on wildlife crime. For such purpose, UNODC intends to maintain the World Wildlife Seizure (WISE) Database, incorporating CITES annual illegal trade reports to other compatible seizure data sources (including data from previous CITES reports), for analytical purposes. The World Wildlife Seizure Database will also contain seizures of non-CITES listed species of wild fauna and flora, to cover additional seizures orders under national and international legislations (e.g. the Council Regulation (EC) No 338/97).

Maintaining a global dataset that integrates data on illegal trade of CITES protected wild fauna and flora species with other illegal trade data sources collected by UNODC, can have a positive impact on CITES annual illegal trade reports for the following reasons:

- It provides a benchmark to validate and harmonise CITES annual trade report data, available for cross-country comparability and for aggregation for regional and global analysis.
- Allows for compatibility of CITES annual trade report data with other data sources (including CITES illegal trade information from past years) to build consistent time series and allow for robust time trends analysis.
- Allows to combine information of CITES annual illegal trade reports with information from other sources, to create a centralised information database on global wildlife seizures of CITES and non-CITES listed species (the updated WISE database).

Subject to willingness to information sharing by agencies providing the data, the centralised global wildlife seizures database could be shared with CITES Secretariat, ICCWC partners and law enforcement agencies for global research and trend analysis on illegal wildlife trade.

*N.B.* Costs to manage the World Wildlife Seizure (WISE Database) are borne by UNODC and therefore not included in the present proposal.



## Annex I

# Statistical assistant's list of tasks

The Statistical Assistant will contribute to the management and maintenance of the database on CITES annual illegal trade reports data on worldwide wildlife seizures.

In particular, she/he will be responsible for the following duties:

- Continue the compilation and processing of the CITES annual illegal trade reports database on worldwide wildlife seizures information provided by CITES Parties and received through CITES Secretariat;
- Review, store, file and maintain the information provided by CITES Parties and CITES Secretariat;
- Translate reports when reporting language is different than English;
- Standardize and validate collected data to ensure consistency and comprehensiveness; interpret and adjust anomalous data using standard statistical procedures and techniques, under the guidance of supervisors;
- Design, maintain and update internal tools, applications and protocols for the processing of data and for making data available to analysts;
- Devise and implement quality guidelines and standard procedures to provide a solid foundation for the accuracy of the data and ensuing analysis;
- Maintain documentation on data and on data processing standards;
- Monitor quality and consistency of final datasets;
- Draft an annual data quality assessment report;
- Prepare and arrange the data for the publication ensuring high quality of disseminated data and metadata;
- Contribute to the design, establishment and launch of the data platform for the dissemination of CITES illegal trade data;
- Apply statistical techniques and IT skills to assist in the preparation of national, regional and global estimates of relevant indicators;
- Contribute to the production of SDG Indicator 15.7.1.
- Contribute to methodological discussions on data standards and conversion factors, in coordination with CITES Secretariat and UN Environment-WCMC;
- Prepare data sets upon request, respond to queries/requests and maintain/update web pages;
- Provide data support for the production of relevant reports;
- Update statistical series in established formats;
- Maintain regular communication with CITES Secretariat;
- Ensure coordination with UN Environment-WCMC, to update nomenclatures adopted by the CITES Conference of the Parties and ensure alignment with trade term standards and codes;
- Support CITES in the improvement of the quality and the coverage of the data, through communication with CITES Parties and/or Reporting Authorities;
- Contribute to regular database backups and recovery tests on both production and dissemination databases, to prevent data losses or to restore lost data.

#### TENTATIVE BUDGET AND SOURCE OF FUNDING FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DRAFT RESOLUTIONS OR DECISIONS

According to Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP16) on *Submission of draft resolutions, draft decisions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties*, the Conference of the Parties decided that any draft resolutions or decisions submitted for consideration at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties that have budgetary and workload implications for the Secretariat or permanent committees must contain or be accompanied by a budget for the work involved and an indication of the source of funding. The Secretariat proposes the following tentative budget and source of funding.

#### Implementation of draft decision 18.AA

The funding required for the hosting and maintaining of a database for the storage and management of data collected through annual illegal trade reports amounts to approximately USD 202,212 for the first year, and USD 176,789 for the subsequent years. The detailed costs of the proposal can be found in the budget breakdown in Table 1 in Annex 1 to the present document.

The Secretariat will convey for consideration by the Conference of the Parties its views on the budgetary implications of the Standing Committee's proposal in the present document, in the context of the discussions on the *Budget and work programme for 2020 to 2022*, at the present meeting.