

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Eighteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
Geneva (Switzerland), 17-28 August 2019

Summary record of the eleventh session of Committee I

22 August 2019: 14h00 - 17h10

Chair: R. Hay (New Zealand)

Secretariat: I. Higuero  
T. De Meulenaer  
K. Gaynor

Rapporteurs: B. Austin  
J. Caldwell  
E. Jennings  
E. Vovk

**Proposals to amend the Appendices (cont.)**

**105. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II**

**Proposal CoP18 Prop. 5** (contd.) Botswana requested a secret ballot for the vote on its amendment to the proposal, i.e. to include *Giraffa camelopardalis* in Appendix II with an annotation excluding the populations of Botswana, Eswatini, Namibia, Mozambique, South Africa, the United Republic of Tanzania, Zimbabwe and Zambia. This was seconded by a sufficient number of Parties. The amended proposal was rejected, with 29 in favour, 96 opposed, and 6 abstentions. The United States of America and the European Union wished it to be on record that they had voted against this proposal.

A vote was then held on the original proposal. With a vote of 106 Parties in favour, 21 opposed, and 7 abstentions, the original proposal, to include *Giraffa camelopardalis* in Appendix II was accepted.

Nigeria indicated that it had voted in favour of the original proposal.

The United Republic of Tanzania wished it to be recorded that the Southern African Development Community (SADC) countries rejected the decision in its entirety and would take out reservations on the listing.

**Proposal CoP18 Prop. 10** to transfer the African elephant population of Zambia from Appendix I to Appendix II, subject to an annotation, was introduced by Zambia that emphasized that international trade was not a key concern for the Zambian population of African elephants and stressed the need to address human-wildlife conflict as a matter of urgency by allowing rural communities to benefit economically from elephants. It noted that the Secretariat agreed that the Zambian population did not meet the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I under Annex 1 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II*. In response to the Secretariat's concerns, Zambia also highlighted the precautionary measures outlined in addendum CoP18 Prop. 10 Add.

Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe fully supported the proposal, as they considered that the Zambian elephant population no longer met the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I. The proposal was opposed by Bangladesh, Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, the European Union, Gabon, Kenya, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal and the United States of America, many of them believing that reopening ivory trade would lead to an increase in poaching and illegal trade. The European Union felt that the focus should be on the African

Elephant Action Plan and was not convinced that the precautionary measures had been addressed. Mali suggested that after the transfer of the South African population from Appendix I to Appendix II following the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, levels of poaching increased dramatically. Raising a point of order, South Africa objected to the comment from Mali, and wished it to go on record that Mali's comments were not factually based.

Switzerland, as the Depository Government, also raised a point of order stating it had not been consulted with regard to section 4 g) of addendum CoP18 Prop. 10 Add.

Following comments from Parties, Zambia suggested the following amendments to the proposed annotation:

Transfer the population of Zambia from Appendix I to Appendix II subject to:

- ~~1. Trade in registered raw ivory (tusks and pieces) for commercial purposes only to CITES approved trading partners who will not re-export;~~
- ~~2.1. Trade in hunting trophies for non-commercial purposes;~~
- ~~3.2. Trade in hides and leather goods from elephants controlled as a result of human-elephant conflicts; and~~
- ~~4.3. All other specimens shall be deemed to be specimens of species in Appendix I and the trade in them shall be regulated accordingly.~~

Zambia requested a vote by secret ballot in accordance with Rule 27.2 of the Rules of Procedure. Seven Parties seconded the proposal. This being fewer than the ten called for in Rule 27.2, the Chair stated that normal voting procedures would apply.

Zambia then put forward a procedural motion to continue debate on its amended proposal in search of consensus. South Africa supported the motion, recalling the need to hear from countries which would face the burden of implementing any decision made.

In accordance with Rule 18.2 of the Rules of Procedure, the Chair invited interventions of two Parties against the motion prior to a vote on the motion. Kenya and Senegal supported the motion to proceed to a vote and close further discussions, as had been proposed by the Chair. The Chair then called for a procedural vote on whether to reopen the debate. With 23 Parties voting in favour, 102 against, and 13 abstaining; the motion to reopen the debate was therefore rejected. The Chair then invited the Parties to vote on proposal CoP18 Prop. 10, as amended by Zambia.

With a vote of 22 Parties in favour, 102 against, and 13 abstentions, proposal CoP18 Prop. 10 to transfer the African elephant population of Zambia from Appendix I to Appendix II, subject to an annotation, was therefore rejected.

**Proposal CoP18 Prop. 11**, proposing an amendment to annotation 2 pertaining to the elephant populations of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe by removing paragraphs g) iv), g) v), g) vii) and h) of annotation 2, was introduced by Botswana. It reported that the proponents wished to amend the proposal, following comments from other Parties, to include precautionary trade safeguards by inserting the following two paragraphs g) iv) and g) v):

- iv) raw ivory pursuant to the conditional sale of registered government-owned ivory stocks as at the 28<sup>th</sup> February 2019, which are 100 000 kg (Botswana), 30 000 kg (Namibia), 57 517.05 kg (South Africa) and 120 889.88 kg (Zimbabwe) and verifiable by the Secretariat, in a single sale to verified trading partners under strict supervision of the Secretariat;
- v) no further proposals to allow trade in elephant ivory from populations of the four countries shall be submitted to the Conference of the Parties for the period from CoP18 and ending six years from the date of the single sale of ivory that is to take place;

Botswana reported that at the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the four Parties had agreed not to submit a proposal to sell their ivory for nine years. Since then, the decision-making mechanism for a process of trade in ivory requested by Decision 14.77 had not been put in place, and so the Parties considered that their patience and willingness to compromise had not been rewarded. The increase in

population across the region had resulted in an increased burden on adjacent communities and on fragile ecosystems, and it was becoming increasingly hard for governments to bear the burden of compensating affected communities. It noted the financial burdens faced in managing elephant populations; the competition with other land uses and the importance of rewarding management that works. This proposal had resulted from a strategic response promoting consultation with affected communities and would contribute to sustainable use of elephants for the benefit of these communities and ecosystems. Botswana argued that the suggestion by other Parties to end ivory sales and close markets would not adequately address the problems posed by poaching and illegal ivory trade.

Namibia and Zimbabwe echoed the comments made by Botswana. Namibia reiterated its opinion that the conservation efforts and achievements of the four Parties had not been recognised by the Convention. Zimbabwe expressed doubt that availability of regulated legal ivory fuelled wider demand, and recalled the high costs of managing ivory stockpiles, which have been accumulating over time. South Africa emphasized that the proceeds of the single sale would be ring-fenced for conservation and livelihood programmes.

Eswatini supported the proposal and noted for the record the statement that it had made during discussions on proposal CoP18 Prop. 5.

The European Union, Gabon, Kenya and Liberia opposed the proposal and the amendment to it, with Liberia urging the adoption of a precautionary approach, Gabon arguing that even controlled ivory trade had negative impacts on African elephant populations, and Kenya considering that the previous two one-off sales (in 1997 and 2008) had resulted in an increase in poaching and laundering of ivory.

Botswana expressed disappointment in the positions of opposing Parties and regretted the lack of understanding of the four concerned countries and the communities most affected.

Botswana requested a secret ballot on the proposal, as amended, and with more than ten Representatives seconding this motion, the Chair proceeded to a vote.

With a vote of 23 Parties in favour, 101 against, and 18 abstentions, proposal CoP18 Prop. 11, concerning an amendment to annotation 2 pertaining to the elephant populations of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe, was therefore rejected.

The following Parties made an explanation of their vote: the European Union and the United States voted against, and the Democratic Republic of the Congo voted for the amendment. Antigua and Barbuda wished to declare that it had also voted for the amendment proposal, and noted for the record that it believed its rejection was inconsistent, and might be construed as racist.

**Proposal CoP18 Prop. 12** to transfer the populations of African elephant of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe from Appendix II to Appendix I was introduced by Gabon, as co-proponent. It noted that as of 2015, a 68% decline in the African elephant population had been recorded over a three-generation period and argued that the population met the biological criteria for Appendix-I listing in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17). Gabon noted that the African elephant frequently crossed national borders and argued that populations should therefore not be listed at national levels. It expressed its concern regarding the ongoing threat of poaching to the African forest elephant population. It reiterated that all African elephant populations should be listed on Appendix I.

Benin, Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire and Togo expressed their support for the proposal, stating that split-listing had enabled poaching and trafficking in ivory.

Botswana, the European Union and South Africa opposed the proposal, noting that the African elephant populations of the four concerned range States did not meet the biological criteria for their inclusion in Appendix I, as set out in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17). South Africa stated that the combined population in Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe was nearly ten times the number present in Appendix-I countries. Botswana noted that if these populations were listed in Appendix I, it would exercise its right under Article XXIII of the Convention.

The Chair called for a vote on amendment proposal CoP18 Prop. 12. Fifty-one Parties voted for the amendment, 67 against, and 22 abstained. Having failed to achieve the two-thirds' majority in favour, proposal CoP18 Prop. 12 to transfer the populations of African elephant of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe from Appendix II to Appendix I was therefore rejected.

The meeting was adjourned at 17h10.



Motion Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana [22.08.2019 2:1

Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 23.20%

1	Afghanistan	Voted
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	Voted
4	Angola	Voted
5	Antigua and Barbuda	Not Present
6	Argentina	Voted
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	Voted
9	Austria	Voted (eu)
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	Voted
12	Bahrain	Voted
13	Bangladesh	Voted
14	Barbados	Not Present
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	Voted (eu)
17	Belize	Voted
18	Benin	Voted
19	Bhutan	Not Present
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	Voted
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	Voted
23	Brazil	Voted
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	Voted (eu)
26	Burkina Faso	Voted
27	Burundi	Voted
28	Cabo Verde	Voted
29	Cambodia	Voted
30	Cameroon	Voted
31	Canada	Voted
32	Central African Republic	Voted
33	Chad	Voted
34	Chile	Voted
35	China	Voted
36	Colombia	Voted
37	Comoros	Voted
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	Voted
40	Côte d'Ivoire	Voted
41	Croatia	Voted (eu)
42	Cuba	Voted
43	Cyprus	Voted (eu)
44	Czech Republic	Voted (eu)
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	Voted
46	Denmark	Voted (eu)
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	Voted



Motion Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana [22.08.2019 2:1

Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana

50	Ecuador	Voted
51	Egypt	Voted
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	Not Present
55	Estonia	Voted (eu)
56	Eswatini	Voted
57	Ethiopia	Voted
58	European Union	Voted
59	Fiji	Not Present
60	Finland	Voted (eu)
61	France	Voted (eu)
62	Gabon	Voted
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	Voted
65	Germany	Voted (eu)
66	Ghana	Voted
67	Greece	Voted (eu)
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	Voted
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	Voted
73	Honduras	Present
74	Hungary	Voted (eu)
75	Iceland	Voted
76	India	Not Present
77	Indonesia	Voted
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	Voted (eu)
81	Israel	Voted
82	Italy	Voted (eu)
83	Jamaica	Voted
84	Japan	Voted
85	Jordan	Voted
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	Voted
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	Voted
91	Latvia	Voted (eu)
92	Lebanon	Voted
93	Lesotho	Voted
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	Voted
97	Lithuania	Voted (eu)
98	Luxembourg	Voted (eu)
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	Voted
101	Malaysia	Voted
102	Maldives	Voted



Motion Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana [22.08.2019 2:1

Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana

103	Mali	Voted
104	Malta	Voted (eu)
105	Mauritania	Voted
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	Voted
108	Monaco	Voted
109	Mongolia	Voted
110	Montenegro	Voted
111	Morocco	Voted
112	Mozambique	Voted
113	Myanmar	Voted
114	Namibia	Voted
115	Nepal	Voted
116	Netherlands	Voted (eu)
117	New Zealand	Voted
118	Nicaragua	Voted
119	Niger	Voted
120	Nigeria	Voted
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	Voted
123	Oman	Voted
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	Voted
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	Voted
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	Voted
130	Philippines	Voted
131	Poland	Voted (eu)
132	Portugal	Voted (eu)
133	Qatar	Voted
134	Republic of Korea	Voted
135	Republic of Moldova	Voted
136	Romania	Voted (eu)
137	Russian Federation	Voted
138	Rwanda	Present
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	Not Present
140	Saint Lucia	Not Present
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	Not Present
142	Samoa	Voted
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	Voted
146	Senegal	Voted
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	Voted
149	Sierra Leone	Voted
150	Singapore	Voted
151	Slovakia	Voted (eu)
152	Slovenia	Voted (eu)
153	Solomon Islands	Not Present
154	Somalia	Present
155	South Africa	Voted



Motion Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana [22.08.2019 2:1

Proposal 5 as amended by Botswana

156	Spain	Voted (eu)
157	Sri Lanka	Voted
158	Sudan	Voted
159	Suriname	Voted
160	Sweden	Voted (eu)
161	Switzerland	Voted
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Voted
164	Thailand	Voted
165	Togo	Voted
166	Tonga	Voted
167	Trinidad and Tobago	Voted
168	Tunisia	Voted
169	Turkey	Not Present
170	Uganda	Voted
171	Ukraine	Voted
172	United Arab Emirates	Present
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	Voted (eu)
174	United Republic of Tanzania	Voted
175	United States of America	Voted
176	Uruguay	Present
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	Present
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	Voted
180	Viet Nam	Voted
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	Voted
183	Zimbabwe	Voted





Motion Proposal 5 - Original [22.08.2019 2:14:26 PM]

Proposal 5 - Original

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 83.46%

1	Afghanistan	NO
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	YES
4	Angola	YES
5	Antigua and Barbuda	Not Present
6	Argentina	YES
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	YES
9	Austria	YES (eu)
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	YES
12	Bahrain	YES
13	Bangladesh	YES
14	Barbados	Not Present
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	YES (eu)
17	Belize	YES
18	Benin	YES
19	Bhutan	Not Present
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	YES
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	NO
23	Brazil	YES
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	YES (eu)
26	Burkina Faso	YES
27	Burundi	YES
28	Cabo Verde	YES
29	Cambodia	YES
30	Cameroon	YES
31	Canada	YES
32	Central African Republic	YES
33	Chad	YES
34	Chile	YES
35	China	NO
36	Colombia	YES
37	Comoros	YES
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	YES
40	Côte d'Ivoire	YES
41	Croatia	YES (eu)
42	Cuba	NO
43	Cyprus	YES (eu)
44	Czech Republic	YES (eu)
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	YES
46	Denmark	YES (eu)
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	YES



Motion Proposal 5 - Original [22.08.2019 2:14:26 PM]

Proposal 5 - Original

50	Ecuador	YES
51	Egypt	YES
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	Not Present
55	Estonia	YES (eu)
56	Eswatini	NO
57	Ethiopia	YES
58	European Union	Voted
59	Fiji	Not Present
60	Finland	YES (eu)
61	France	YES (eu)
62	Gabon	YES
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	YES
65	Germany	YES (eu)
66	Ghana	YES
67	Greece	YES (eu)
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	YES
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	ABST
73	Honduras	YES
74	Hungary	YES (eu)
75	Iceland	NO
76	India	Not Present
77	Indonesia	YES
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	YES (eu)
81	Israel	YES
82	Italy	YES (eu)
83	Jamaica	YES
84	Japan	NO
85	Jordan	YES
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	YES
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	NO
91	Latvia	YES (eu)
92	Lebanon	YES
93	Lesotho	NO
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	NO
97	Lithuania	YES (eu)
98	Luxembourg	YES (eu)
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	ABST
101	Malaysia	NO
102	Maldives	YES



Motion Proposal 5 - Original [22.08.2019 2:14:26 PM]

Proposal 5 - Original

103	Mali	YES
104	Malta	YES (eu)
105	Mauritania	YES
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	ABST
108	Monaco	YES
109	Mongolia	YES
110	Montenegro	YES
111	Morocco	YES
112	Mozambique	NO
113	Myanmar	YES
114	Namibia	NO
115	Nepal	YES
116	Netherlands	YES (eu)
117	New Zealand	YES
118	Nicaragua	YES
119	Niger	YES
120	Nigeria	Present
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	NO
123	Oman	YES
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	YES
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	YES
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	YES
130	Philippines	YES
131	Poland	YES (eu)
132	Portugal	YES (eu)
133	Qatar	YES
134	Republic of Korea	YES
135	Republic of Moldova	YES
136	Romania	YES (eu)
137	Russian Federation	YES
138	Rwanda	YES
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	Not Present
140	Saint Lucia	Not Present
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	Not Present
142	Samoa	YES
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	YES
146	Senegal	YES
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	YES
149	Sierra Leone	YES
150	Singapore	NO
151	Slovakia	YES (eu)
152	Slovenia	YES (eu)
153	Solomon Islands	Not Present
154	Somalia	YES
155	South Africa	NO



Motion Proposal 5 - Original [22.08.2019 2:14:26 PM]

Proposal 5 - Original

156	Spain	YES (eu)
157	Sri Lanka	YES
158	Sudan	YES
159	Suriname	ABST
160	Sweden	YES (eu)
161	Switzerland	NO
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Present
164	Thailand	YES
165	Togo	YES
166	Tonga	YES
167	Trinidad and Tobago	ABST
168	Tunisia	YES
169	Turkey	Not Present
170	Uganda	NO
171	Ukraine	ABST
172	United Arab Emirates	YES
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	YES (eu)
174	United Republic of Tanzania	NO
175	United States of America	YES
176	Uruguay	YES
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	Present
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	ABST
180	Viet Nam	YES
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	NO
183	Zimbabwe	NO



Motion Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate [22

Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate

Quorum: Yes > 50.00%

EU-Vote: individual

YES: 18.40%

1	Afghanistan	Present
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	NO
4	Angola	NO
5	Antigua and Barbuda	YES
6	Argentina	NO
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	NO
9	Austria	Present
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	NO
12	Bahrain	NO
13	Bangladesh	NO
14	Barbados	YES
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	NO
17	Belize	NO
18	Benin	NO
19	Bhutan	NO
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	NO
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	YES
23	Brazil	ABST
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	NO
26	Burkina Faso	NO
27	Burundi	NO
28	Cabo Verde	ABST
29	Cambodia	YES
30	Cameroon	NO
31	Canada	YES
32	Central African Republic	NO
33	Chad	NO
34	Chile	NO
35	China	YES
36	Colombia	NO
37	Comoros	NO
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	NO
40	Côte d'Ivoire	NO
41	Croatia	NO
42	Cuba	YES
43	Cyprus	NO
44	Czech Republic	NO
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	YES
46	Denmark	NO
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	NO



Motion Motion for Zambia's proposal to reopen the debate [22

Motion for Zambia's proposal to reopen the debate

50	Ecuador	NO
51	Egypt	ABST
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	NO
55	Estonia	NO
56	Eswatini	YES
57	Ethiopia	NO
58	European Union	Present
59	Fiji	NO
60	Finland	NO
61	France	NO
62	Gabon	NO
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	NO
65	Germany	NO
66	Ghana	NO
67	Greece	NO
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	NO
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	YES
73	Honduras	NO
74	Hungary	NO
75	Iceland	NO
76	India	NO
77	Indonesia	YES
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	NO
81	Israel	NO
82	Italy	NO
83	Jamaica	NO
84	Japan	YES
85	Jordan	NO
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	NO
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	NO
91	Latvia	NO
92	Lebanon	NO
93	Lesotho	NO
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	YES
97	Lithuania	NO
98	Luxembourg	NO
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	ABST
101	Malaysia	NO
102	Maldives	NO



Motion Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate [22

Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate

103	Mali	NO
104	Malta	NO
105	Mauritania	NO
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	YES
108	Monaco	NO
109	Mongolia	NO
110	Montenegro	ABST
111	Morocco	NO
112	Mozambique	YES
113	Myanmar	YES
114	Namibia	YES
115	Nepal	NO
116	Netherlands	NO
117	New Zealand	NO
118	Nicaragua	NO
119	Niger	NO
120	Nigeria	NO
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	NO
123	Oman	Not Present
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	Not Present
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	NO
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	YES
130	Philippines	NO
131	Poland	NO
132	Portugal	NO
133	Qatar	NO
134	Republic of Korea	NO
135	Republic of Moldova	ABST
136	Romania	NO
137	Russian Federation	ABST
138	Rwanda	NO
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	Not Present
140	Saint Lucia	ABST
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	ABST
142	Samoa	NO
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	ABST
146	Senegal	NO
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	NO
149	Sierra Leone	NO
150	Singapore	ABST
151	Slovakia	NO
152	Slovenia	NO
153	Solomon Islands	NO
154	Somalia	Not Present
155	South Africa	YES



Motion Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate [22

Motion for Zambias proposal to reopen the debate

156	Spain	NO
157	Sri Lanka	NO
158	Sudan	NO
159	Suriname	NO
160	Sweden	NO
161	Switzerland	YES
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Present
164	Thailand	NO
165	Togo	NO
166	Tonga	Not Present
167	Trinidad and Tobago	Not Present
168	Tunisia	NO
169	Turkey	NO
170	Uganda	NO
171	Ukraine	NO
172	United Arab Emirates	NO
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	NO
174	United Republic of Tanzania	Present
175	United States of America	NO
176	Uruguay	NO
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	ABST
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	YES
180	Viet Nam	ABST
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	YES
183	Zimbabwe	YES





Motion Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia [22.08.2019 3:48

Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 17.74%

1	Afghanistan	Present
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	NO
4	Angola	NO
5	Antigua and Barbuda	YES
6	Argentina	NO
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	NO
9	Austria	NO (eu)
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	NO
12	Bahrain	NO
13	Bangladesh	NO
14	Barbados	NO
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	NO (eu)
17	Belize	YES
18	Benin	NO
19	Bhutan	NO
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	NO
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	YES
23	Brazil	ABST
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	NO (eu)
26	Burkina Faso	NO
27	Burundi	NO
28	Cabo Verde	NO
29	Cambodia	YES
30	Cameroon	NO
31	Canada	YES
32	Central African Republic	NO
33	Chad	NO
34	Chile	NO
35	China	ABST
36	Colombia	NO
37	Comoros	NO
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	ABST
40	Côte d'Ivoire	NO
41	Croatia	NO (eu)
42	Cuba	YES
43	Cyprus	NO (eu)
44	Czech Republic	NO (eu)
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	YES
46	Denmark	NO (eu)
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	NO



Motion Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia [22.08.2019 3:48]

Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia

50	Ecuador	NO
51	Egypt	NO
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	NO
55	Estonia	NO (eu)
56	Eswatini	YES
57	Ethiopia	NO
58	European Union	Voted
59	Fiji	NO
60	Finland	NO (eu)
61	France	NO (eu)
62	Gabon	NO
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	NO
65	Germany	NO (eu)
66	Ghana	NO
67	Greece	NO (eu)
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	ABST
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	YES
73	Honduras	NO
74	Hungary	NO (eu)
75	Iceland	NO
76	India	NO
77	Indonesia	Present
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	NO (eu)
81	Israel	NO
82	Italy	NO (eu)
83	Jamaica	YES
84	Japan	YES
85	Jordan	NO
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	NO
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	NO
91	Latvia	NO (eu)
92	Lebanon	NO
93	Lesotho	YES
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	YES
97	Lithuania	NO (eu)
98	Luxembourg	NO (eu)
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	ABST
101	Malaysia	NO
102	Maldives	NO



Motion Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia [22.08.2019 3:48

Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia

103	Mali	NO
104	Malta	NO (eu)
105	Mauritania	NO
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	NO
108	Monaco	NO
109	Mongolia	NO
110	Montenegro	NO
111	Morocco	NO
112	Mozambique	YES
113	Myanmar	ABST
114	Namibia	YES
115	Nepal	NO
116	Netherlands	NO (eu)
117	New Zealand	NO
118	Nicaragua	NO
119	Niger	NO
120	Nigeria	Present
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	NO
123	Oman	Not Present
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	Not Present
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	NO
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	NO
130	Philippines	NO
131	Poland	NO (eu)
132	Portugal	NO (eu)
133	Qatar	NO
134	Republic of Korea	NO
135	Republic of Moldova	NO
136	Romania	NO (eu)
137	Russian Federation	ABST
138	Rwanda	NO
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	Not Present
140	Saint Lucia	ABST
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	ABST
142	Samoa	NO
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	ABST
146	Senegal	NO
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	NO
149	Sierra Leone	NO
150	Singapore	ABST
151	Slovakia	NO (eu)
152	Slovenia	NO (eu)
153	Solomon Islands	YES
154	Somalia	Not Present
155	South Africa	YES



Motion Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia [22.08.2019 3:48]

Proposal 10 as amended by Zambia

156	Spain	NO (eu)
157	Sri Lanka	NO
158	Sudan	NO
159	Suriname	ABST
160	Sweden	NO (eu)
161	Switzerland	YES
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Present
164	Thailand	NO
165	Togo	NO
166	Tonga	Not Present
167	Trinidad and Tobago	Not Present
168	Tunisia	NO
169	Turkey	NO
170	Uganda	NO
171	Ukraine	NO
172	United Arab Emirates	NO
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	NO (eu)
174	United Republic of Tanzania	Present
175	United States of America	NO
176	Uruguay	NO
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	YES
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	YES
180	Viet Nam	ABST
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	YES
183	Zimbabwe	YES



Motion Proposal 11 [22.08.2019 4:37:28 PM]

Proposal 11

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 18.55%

1	Afghanistan	Voted
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	Voted
4	Angola	Voted
5	Antigua and Barbuda	Voted
6	Argentina	Voted
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	Voted
9	Austria	Voted (eu)
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	Voted
12	Bahrain	Voted
13	Bangladesh	Voted
14	Barbados	Voted
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	Voted (eu)
17	Belize	Voted
18	Benin	Voted
19	Bhutan	Voted
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	Voted
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	Voted
23	Brazil	Voted
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	Voted (eu)
26	Burkina Faso	Voted
27	Burundi	Voted
28	Cabo Verde	Voted
29	Cambodia	Voted
30	Cameroon	Voted
31	Canada	Voted
32	Central African Republic	Voted
33	Chad	Voted
34	Chile	Voted
35	China	Voted
36	Colombia	Voted
37	Comoros	Voted
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	Voted
40	Côte d'Ivoire	Voted
41	Croatia	Voted (eu)
42	Cuba	Voted
43	Cyprus	Voted (eu)
44	Czech Republic	Voted (eu)
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	Voted
46	Denmark	Voted (eu)
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	Voted



Motion Proposal 11 [22.08.2019 4:37:28 PM]

Proposal 11

50	Ecuador	Voted
51	Egypt	Voted
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	Voted
55	Estonia	Voted (eu)
56	Eswatini	Voted
57	Ethiopia	Voted
58	European Union	Voted
59	Fiji	Voted
60	Finland	Voted (eu)
61	France	Voted (eu)
62	Gabon	Voted
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	Voted
65	Germany	Voted (eu)
66	Ghana	Voted
67	Greece	Voted (eu)
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	Voted
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	Voted
73	Honduras	Voted
74	Hungary	Voted (eu)
75	Iceland	Voted
76	India	Voted
77	Indonesia	Present
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	Voted (eu)
81	Israel	Voted
82	Italy	Voted (eu)
83	Jamaica	Voted
84	Japan	Voted
85	Jordan	Voted
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	Voted
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	Voted
91	Latvia	Voted (eu)
92	Lebanon	Voted
93	Lesotho	Voted
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	Voted
97	Lithuania	Voted (eu)
98	Luxembourg	Voted (eu)
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	Voted
101	Malaysia	Voted
102	Maldives	Voted



Motion Proposal 11 [22.08.2019 4:37:28 PM]

Proposal 11

103	Mali	Voted
104	Malta	Voted (eu)
105	Mauritania	Voted
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	Voted
108	Monaco	Voted
109	Mongolia	Voted
110	Montenegro	Voted
111	Morocco	Voted
112	Mozambique	Voted
113	Myanmar	Voted
114	Namibia	Voted
115	Nepal	Voted
116	Netherlands	Voted (eu)
117	New Zealand	Voted
118	Nicaragua	Voted
119	Niger	Voted
120	Nigeria	Voted
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	Voted
123	Oman	Not Present
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	Not Present
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	Voted
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	Voted
130	Philippines	Voted
131	Poland	Voted (eu)
132	Portugal	Voted (eu)
133	Qatar	Voted
134	Republic of Korea	Voted
135	Republic of Moldova	Voted
136	Romania	Voted (eu)
137	Russian Federation	Voted
138	Rwanda	Voted
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	Voted
140	Saint Lucia	Voted
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	Voted
142	Samoa	Voted
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	Voted
146	Senegal	Voted
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	Voted
149	Sierra Leone	Voted
150	Singapore	Voted
151	Slovakia	Voted (eu)
152	Slovenia	Voted (eu)
153	Solomon Islands	Voted
154	Somalia	Voted
155	South Africa	Voted



Motion Proposal 11 [22.08.2019 4:37:28 PM]

Proposal 11

156	Spain	Voted (eu)
157	Sri Lanka	Voted
158	Sudan	Voted
159	Suriname	Voted
160	Sweden	Voted (eu)
161	Switzerland	Voted
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Present
164	Thailand	Voted
165	Togo	Voted
166	Tonga	Not Present
167	Trinidad and Tobago	Not Present
168	Tunisia	Voted
169	Turkey	Voted
170	Uganda	Voted
171	Ukraine	Voted
172	United Arab Emirates	Voted
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	Voted (eu)
174	United Republic of Tanzania	Voted
175	United States of America	Voted
176	Uruguay	Voted
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	Voted
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	Voted
180	Viet Nam	Voted
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	Voted
183	Zimbabwe	Voted





Motion Proposal 12 [22.08.2019 5:03:22 PM]

Proposal 12

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 43.22%

1	Afghanistan	NO
2	Albania	Not Allowed
3	Algeria	YES
4	Angola	YES
5	Antigua and Barbuda	NO
6	Argentina	ABST
7	Armenia	Not Present
8	Australia	YES
9	Austria	NO (eu)
10	Azerbaijan	Not Allowed
11	Bahamas	NO
12	Bahrain	Not Present
13	Bangladesh	YES
14	Barbados	NO
15	Belarus	Not Allowed
16	Belgium	NO (eu)
17	Belize	YES
18	Benin	YES
19	Bhutan	ABST
20	Bolivia (Plurinational State of)	ABST
21	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Not Allowed
22	Botswana	NO
23	Brazil	ABST
24	Brunei Darussalam	Not Allowed
25	Bulgaria	NO (eu)
26	Burkina Faso	YES
27	Burundi	YES
28	Cabo Verde	ABST
29	Cambodia	NO
30	Cameroon	YES
31	Canada	NO
32	Central African Republic	YES
33	Chad	YES
34	Chile	ABST
35	China	YES
36	Colombia	YES
37	Comoros	YES
38	Congo	Not Allowed
39	Costa Rica	YES
40	Côte d'Ivoire	YES
41	Croatia	NO (eu)
42	Cuba	NO
43	Cyprus	NO (eu)
44	Czech Republic	NO (eu)
45	Democratic Republic of the Congo	NO
46	Denmark	NO (eu)
47	Djibouti	Not Allowed
48	Dominica	Not Allowed
49	Dominican Republic	YES



Motion Proposal 12 [22.08.2019 5:03:22 PM]

Proposal 12

50	Ecuador	YES
51	Egypt	YES
52	El Salvador	Not Allowed
53	Equatorial Guinea	Not Allowed
54	Eritrea	YES
55	Estonia	NO (eu)
56	Eswatini	NO
57	Ethiopia	YES
58	European Union	Voted
59	Fiji	YES
60	Finland	NO (eu)
61	France	NO (eu)
62	Gabon	YES
63	Gambia	Not Allowed
64	Georgia	ABST
65	Germany	NO (eu)
66	Ghana	YES
67	Greece	NO (eu)
68	Grenada	Not Allowed
69	Guatemala	ABST
70	Guinea	Not Allowed
71	Guinea-Bissau	Not Allowed
72	Guyana	NO
73	Honduras	YES
74	Hungary	NO (eu)
75	Iceland	NO
76	India	ABST
77	Indonesia	YES
78	Iran (Islamic Republic of)	Not Allowed
79	Iraq	Not Allowed
80	Ireland	NO (eu)
81	Israel	YES
82	Italy	NO (eu)
83	Jamaica	NO
84	Japan	NO
85	Jordan	ABST
86	Kazakhstan	Not Allowed
87	Kenya	YES
88	Kuwait	Not Present
89	Kyrgyzstan	Not Present
90	Lao People's Democratic Republic	NO
91	Latvia	NO (eu)
92	Lebanon	YES
93	Lesotho	NO
94	Liberia	Not Allowed
95	Libya	Not Allowed
96	Liechtenstein	NO
97	Lithuania	NO (eu)
98	Luxembourg	NO (eu)
99	Madagascar	Not Present
100	Malawi	NO
101	Malaysia	YES
102	Maldives	NO



Motion Proposal 12 [22.08.2019 5:03:22 PM]

Proposal 12

103	Mali	YES
104	Malta	NO (eu)
105	Mauritania	YES
106	Mauritius	Not Allowed
107	Mexico	YES
108	Monaco	ABST
109	Mongolia	NO
110	Montenegro	NO
111	Morocco	YES
112	Mozambique	NO
113	Myanmar	NO
114	Namibia	NO
115	Nepal	YES
116	Netherlands	NO (eu)
117	New Zealand	YES
118	Nicaragua	NO
119	Niger	YES
120	Nigeria	YES
121	North Macedonia	Not Allowed
122	Norway	NO
123	Oman	Not Present
124	Pakistan	Not Allowed
125	Palau	Not Present
126	Panama	Not Allowed
127	Papua New Guinea	ABST
128	Paraguay	Not Allowed
129	Peru	NO
130	Philippines	YES
131	Poland	NO (eu)
132	Portugal	NO (eu)
133	Qatar	YES
134	Republic of Korea	NO
135	Republic of Moldova	ABST
136	Romania	NO (eu)
137	Russian Federation	NO
138	Rwanda	YES
139	Saint Kitts and Nevis	NO
140	Saint Lucia	ABST
141	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	ABST
142	Samoa	YES
143	San Marino	Not Allowed
144	Sao Tome and Principe	Not Allowed
145	Saudi Arabia	YES
146	Senegal	YES
147	Serbia	Not Allowed
148	Seychelles	ABST
149	Sierra Leone	YES
150	Singapore	ABST
151	Slovakia	NO (eu)
152	Slovenia	NO (eu)
153	Solomon Islands	NO
154	Somalia	Not Present
155	South Africa	NO



Motion Proposal 12 [22.08.2019 5:03:22 PM]

Proposal 12

156	Spain	NO (eu)
157	Sri Lanka	ABST
158	Sudan	YES
159	Suriname	NO
160	Sweden	NO (eu)
161	Switzerland	NO
162	Syrian Arab Republic	Not Allowed
163	Tajikistan	Present
164	Thailand	ABST
165	Togo	YES
166	Tonga	Not Present
167	Trinidad and Tobago	Not Present
168	Tunisia	YES
169	Turkey	YES
170	Uganda	NO
171	Ukraine	ABST
172	United Arab Emirates	ABST
173	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	NO (eu)
174	United Republic of Tanzania	Present
175	United States of America	NO
176	Uruguay	YES
177	Uzbekistan	Not Allowed
178	Vanuatu	YES
179	Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)	ABST
180	Viet Nam	NO
181	Yemen	Not Allowed
182	Zambia	NO
183	Zimbabwe	NO