

Flora

Proposal number and Proponent	Species covered by the proposal	Comments received from	Page No.
<a href="#">Proposal 50</a> Mexico	<i>Beaucarnea</i> spp. (Ponytail palm, Elephant-foot tree)		
<a href="#">Proposal 51</a> Mexico	<i>Tillandsia mauryana</i> (Maury's tillandsia)		
<a href="#">Proposal 52</a> The United States of America	<i>Sclerocactus cloverae</i> (New Mexico fishhook cactus) <i>Sclerocactus sileri</i> (Siler's fishhook cactus) <i>Sclerocactus spinosior blainei</i> (Blaine's fishhook cactus)		
<a href="#">Proposal 53</a> Thailand	<i>Dalbergia cochinchinensis</i> (Siamese rosewood)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 54</a> Mexico	<i>Dalbergia calderonii</i> <i>Dalbergia calycina</i> <i>Dalbergia congestiflora</i> <i>Dalbergia cubilquitzensis</i> <i>Dalbergia glomerata</i> <i>Dalbergia longepedunculata</i> <i>Dalbergia luteola</i> <i>Dalbergia melanocardium</i> <i>Dalbergia modesta</i> <i>Dalbergia palo-escrito</i> <i>Dalbergia rhachiflexa</i> <i>Dalbergia ruddae</i> <i>Dalbergia tucurensis</i> (Rosewoods)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 55</a> Argentina, Brazil, Guatemala and Kenya	<i>Dalbergia</i> spp. (Rosewoods, Palisanders)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 56</a> The European Union and Gabon	<i>Guibourtia demeusei</i>	ITTO	

Proposal number and Proponent	Species covered by the proposal	Comments received from	Page No.
	<i>Guibourtia pellegriniana</i> <i>Guibourtia tessmannii</i> (Bubingas)	IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 57</a> Benin, Burkina Faso, Chad, Côte d'Ivoire, the European Union, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Mali, Nigeria, Senegal and Togo	<i>Pterocarpus erinaceus</i> (African rosewood, Kosso)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 58</a> Madagascar	<i>Adansonia grandidieri</i> (Grandidier's baobab)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 59</a> Algeria	<i>Abies numidica</i> (Algerian fir)	ITTO IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 60</a> The United States of America	<i>Aquilaria</i> spp., <i>Gyrinops</i> spp. (Agarwoods)	IUCN	
<a href="#">Proposal 61</a> South Africa	<i>Siphonochilus aethiopicus</i> (Natal ginger)		
<a href="#">Proposal 62</a> The United States of America	<i>Bulnesia sarmientoi</i> (Holy wood)	ITTO IUCN	

## Proposal 50

### Include genus *Beaucarnea* in Appendix II

**Proponent:** Mexico

#### Assessment by the Secretariat

##### *CITES background*

This genus has never been the subject of a listing proposal.

##### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proposal seeks to strengthen controls on harvesting and trade in species of the genus *Beaucarnea* and especially in the species *Beaucarnea recurvata*. All eleven species of this genus would benefit from stricter controls that could assist range States in their efforts to ensure these species are conserved in the wild in the long term.

##### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*Beaucarnea recurvata* is a slow-growing Mexican endemic species that in 2014 was nationally assessed and considered as 'endangered'. Evidence seems to indicate that there is a high demand in international trade for live plants that are mostly used for ornamental purposes and, that are made available on websites and in nurseries of 15 Parties worldwide. Many plants found in trade are artificially propagated but a considerable volume could be illegally harvested and illegally exported from Mexico. There is no up to date information on inventories of the populations of *Beaucarnea recurvata* in the wild but the proponent claims that it is indeed necessary to regulate the international trade in *Beaucarnea* species so their survival in the wild can be ensured in the long term.

*Beaucarnea recurvata* is the only endemic species of the genus *Beaucarnea*, the other 10 species of that genus are found from Mexico to Honduras and could occur in Nicaragua. Out of the eleven species, seven are considered Vulnerable and two Endangered. Seeds and seedlings of species of the genus are indistinguishable by the non-specialist. The same individuals do not reproduce every year. In the wild, the germination is immediate when adequate conditions exist; however, the number of plants established is low, mainly due to lack of water, herbivore grazing, mining and other causes. Wild populations of the species of this genus are small and have very slow growth rates, they are found in environmentally restricted areas. Few populations have been sampled, and the available data are not representative of the situation of the species throughout its entire range.

The proposal claims that the main threats to wild populations of *B. recurvata* are: a) loss of habitat; and b) illegal harvesting of wild plants for ornamental purposes that have a high demand in the international market. Despite the lack of recent demographic information, populations of these species in the wild would seem to be decreasing, data show that the eleven species can be grouped according to their commercial importance as follows: a) Group 1 (frequent trading). *B. inermis*, *B. recurvata*, *B. goldmanii*, *B. pliabilis* (syn *ameliae* *B.* and *B. petenensis*, *B. hiriartiae*, *B. guatemalensis*; b) Group 2 (not so common in trade): *B. gracilis*, *B. stricta*, *B. sanctomariana* (seeds, mainly); and c) Group 3 (no trade): *B. purpusii* and *B. compacta*. Information shows that the over-collection of wild specimens for ornamental purposes has a detrimental impact in the conservation of wild populations of *B. recurvata*. *Beaucarnea recurvata* would seem to play an important role in the ecosystem, being a dominant species in some localities, it serves to host numerous species of epiphytic plants.

The available evidence on trade in the species indicates that it has a high demand in international trade, and further suggests that most marketed specimens are of wild origin (and possibly illegal). The origin of the parent material of plants in nurseries offered outside of Mexico is not known. However, between 2004 and 2015 a total of 2,113 live plants have been seized in Mexico. Not being listed in the Appendices of CITES and therefore having no CITES trade records available, these levels of reported trade in the species could be an underestimation.

##### *Listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

At the 22nd meeting of the Plants Committee (PC22, Georgia, October 2015), the Committee noted document PC22 Doc. 22.2 on *Assessment of B. recurvata based on criteria of Res. Conf. 9.24 (Rev.CoP16) for amending Appendices I and II*, and supported the submission of its recommendations for consideration by the Conference of the Parties. In January 2016, the proponent had consulted with the Management and Scientific Authorities of

Belize, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras and Nicaragua, and these range States responded favorably to this proposal.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

There seems to be a high, and possibly increasing demand for live plants and seeds of the genus *Beaucarnea* for ornamental purposes, and particularly of *B. recurvata*, which is a widely cultivated endemic from Mexico. The genus has 11 species, of which six are reported to be frequent in trade. International trade seems to consist mostly of artificially propagated specimens, but also involve specimens of wild origin, some of which may be erroneously declared as cultivated. Mexico regulates the management, harvest and export of nine species of *Beaucarnea*. It reports numerous seizures of wild-collected live plants and seeds of *B. recurvata* for domestic trade and cultivation, but apparently also for overseas markets. *B. recurvata* is believed to be decreasing in the wild in Mexico. If international trade in some species of *Beaucarnea* needs to be regulated under CITES to prevent threats to wild populations from overharvesting, the listing of the other species in the genus would be justified for look-alike reasons.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *Beaucarnea recurvata* meets the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criterion B., for its inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a) of the Convention. All other species in the genus *Beaucarnea* meet the criteria in Annex 2 b, criterion A, for their inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (b) of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 51

### Delete *Tillandsia mauryana* from Appendix II

**Proponent:** Mexico

#### Assessment by the Secretariat

##### *CITES background*

*Tillandsia mauryana* was included in Appendix II in 1992 with annotation # 4. This endemic Mexican species was selected by the Plants Committee for its periodic review process in 2005. The Scientific Authority of Mexico (CONABIO) undertook this review between 2012 and 2013, and funded the project entitled "Assessment of the situation of *Tillandsia mauryana* in Appendix II of CITES, according to its conservation status and trade".

At its 21st meeting (PC21, Mexico, May, 2014), the Plants Committee agreed that *Tillandsia mauryana* does not meet the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16). There is no international trade in specimens of wild source and the species is found mostly in a protected area, where it is subject to specific conservation measures. The main threat to the species is from habitat loss. The range State (Mexico) should present a proposal to delete the species from the Appendices at CoP17, specifying that the proposal is made in the context of the periodic review and that it has the support of the Plants Committee.

##### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proposal seeks to remove *Tillandsia mauryana* from CITES controls.

##### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

The review undertaken by the Scientific Authority of Mexico concluded that a) *T. mauryana* is an endemic species of Mexico; b) populations of this species in the wild are decreasing; c) causes for decreasing of the populations in the wild are not related to trade in wild live plants of this species but rather to habitat loss [1) rock mining activities, 2) accessibility, 3) urban development, 4) livestock and 5) agriculture]; d) at the international level, there are some export records from other countries than Mexico, with source code 'A' (artificial reproduction) for ornamental purposes and collections. There are also websites that offer the species outside Mexico. Reported trade occurs mainly in live plants and seeds. No seizures of specimens of this species have taken place in Mexico. Until April 2016 to 10 sites that offer this species in the United States, Germany, Spain, France, Lithuania and the Czech Republic were found. The database of UNEP-WCMC has no export records from Mexico, so the origin of the plant parental stock or seeds from which these plants have been cultivated in these countries is unknown.

The proponents claim that based on the analysis of the species to light the criteria of Resolution Conf 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), it is possible to conclude the following: *T. mauryana* is not subject to international trade, does not share similarities with other species currently listed in Appendix II, and does not meet any of the criteria listed in Appendix II of CITES. Mexico has adopted national measures to ensure the conservation of this endemic species in the wild and in the long term. Therefore, the proponent considers it appropriate to eliminate *T. mauryana* of CITES, taking into account that there are national conservation measures. *T. mauryana* will be included in the Official Mexican Standard under the category of Threatened, and in accordance with the provisions of the General Law on Wildlife (LGVS).

##### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

*T. mauryana* does not meet the criteria listed in Appendix II of CITES (detailed in Annexes 2a and 2b of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16)).

#### Conclusions and recommendation

This endemic Mexican species is not subject to international trade and does not have similarities with other *Tillandsia* species currently listed in Appendix II. Mexico has adopted national measures to ensure the long-term conservation of the species in the wild.

The proposal results from the Periodic Review of the Appendices, conducted by the Plants Committee in compliance with Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP16).

*Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *Tillandsia mauryana* does not meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) Annexes 2 a or 2 b for its inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a) or 2 (b) of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 52

**Transfer fishhook cacti *Sclerocactus spinosior* ssp. *blainei* (= *Sclerocactus blainei*), *Sclerocactus cloverae* (CITES-listed synonym of *Sclerocactus parviflorus*), and *Sclerocactus sileri* from Appendix II to Appendix I**

**Proponent:** The United States of America

### Assessment by the Secretariat

#### *CITES background*

The Cactaceae family was listed in the CITES Appendices when the Convention entered into force in July 1975. The genus *Sclerocactus* is comprised of slow-growing, short cylindrical, spiny succulent plants and the species covered under this proposal are endemic to the United States America.

The proposal to transfer *S. blainei*, *S. cloverae*, and *S. sileri* from Appendix II to Appendix I, and to recognize *S. brevispinus* and *S. wetlandicus* as distinct species and to retain the two species and *S. glaucus* in Appendix I, is based on the results of the Periodic Review of *Sclerocactus* species in the United States, conducted by its Scientific Authority. The results of the periodic review were presented at the 22nd meeting of the Plants Committee [PC22, Georgia, October 2015; see document PC22 Doc. 20.3.3 (Rev. 1)]. The Plants Committee adopted the recommendations in document PC22 Com. 2 to transfer *S. blainei*, *S. cloverae*, and *S. sileri* from Appendix II to Appendix I, and to recognize and retain *S. brevispinus*, *S. glaucus*, and *S. wetlandicus* as distinct species in Appendix I [PC22 Sum 5 (Rev. 1)].

Discussions on this proposal should focus on the transfer of fishhook cacti *Sclerocactus spinosior* ssp. *blainei* (= *Sclerocactus blainei*), *Sclerocactus cloverae* (CITES-listed synonym of *Sclerocactus parviflorus*), and *Sclerocactus sileri* from Appendix II to Appendix I.

#### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

*Sclerocactus spinosior* ssp. *blainei*, *Sclerocactus cloverae*, and *Sclerocactus sileri* are narrow endemics with small population sizes that are threatened by international trade, particularly in the seeds of these species. Trade in seeds of Appendix-II cacti, except cacti native to Mexico, are not regulated under CITES, whereas seeds of Appendix-I cacti are regulated under CITES. For example, from 2000 to 2014, the United States exported 368,568 seeds of Appendix-I *Sclerocactus* species under source code "D." With the transfer of the three species to Appendix I, trade in seeds will be regulated and monitored, which will increase the level of protection for species' populations.

Since the genus *Sclerocactus*, under the family listing of Cactaceae, has been listed in the CITES Appendices since 1975, the proponents do not anticipate significant trade or enforcement issues with the transfer of the three species to Appendix I.

#### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*S. spinosior* ssp. *blainei*, *S. cloverae* and *S. sileri* are endemic species to the United States of America and threatened by the harvest of seeds and plants for horticultural purposes. The three species are characterized by a high vulnerability to harvest due to their biological life history traits, habitat degradation, and predation, which are exacerbated by the effects of prolonged drought and climate change. The very narrow or restricted distributions and small population sizes of the three species coupled with the persistent threats are the primary justification for the transfer of the species to Appendix I.

Threats to *S. spinosior* ssp. *blainei*, *S. cloverae* and *S. sileri* include impacts from oil and gas exploration and extraction activities, recreational off-road vehicle (ORV) use, livestock trampling, collection of specimens, loss of habitat, and insect parasitism. Oil and gas development and ORV use facilitates access to plants by collectors. Prolonged drought has impacted seedling recruitment and adult survivorship of *Sclerocactus* taxa in the southwestern United States. These species are desirable for the international horticultural market, and are sought after by collectors. Populations are adversely affected by unauthorized and illegal harvest of plants and seeds. The seeds are particularly vulnerable to harvest, which are more often collected than live plants because they are easy to carry and transport, and are not regulated under the CITES Appendix-II listing annotation. The threats are exacerbated by the species' inherent vulnerability from stochastic events at any time because of their endemism, small numbers of individuals and populations, and restricted distributions.

The three species are uncommon and affected by the harvest of specimens for the horticulture trade. They are sought after by cacti collectors and hobbyists. The genus *Sclerocactus* is considered to be difficult to grow in cultivation. However, the proponents explain that the States' and the Navajo Nation's Natural Heritage Programs track and protect the location data of all *Sclerocactus* taxa tracked by the respective Programs. *S. spinosior* ssp. *blainei*, *S. cloverae* and *S. sileri* share morphological similarities with other species of the genus *Sclerocactus* but the three can be distinguished by their morphological features.

The CITES trade data for *Sclerocactus* spp. is almost all reported as seeds and artificially propagated live plants, with a small amount of wild exports reported.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The proposal results from the Periodic Review of the Appendices, conducted by the Plants Committee in compliance with Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP16).

The proposal refers to “the six species” of *Sclerocactus*. However, to date, the Parties have only recognized two of them: *Sclerocactus glaucus* (listed in Appendix I); and *Sclerocactus sileri* (listed in Appendix II). The question of whether: *Sclerocactus glaucus* can be split into *S. brevispinus*, *S. glaucus* and *S. wetlandicus*; and whether in addition to *Sclerocactus sileri*, two further species, *S. blainei* and *S. cloverae*, can be recognized under CITES, needs to be addressed before this proposal is considered. These matters will be discussed in document CoP17 Doc. 81.1 Annex 10 (Rev. 1).

The proposed revision of the taxonomy of *S. glaucus* does not relate to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) and therefore, the Secretariat provides comments only on the proposed transfer of *Sclerocactus sileri* and, if a new taxonomy is agreed, *S. blainei* and *S. cloverae*, from Appendix II to Appendix I. The Secretariat notes that the main threats to the conservation of *Sclerocactus blainei*, *S. cloverae*, and *S. sileri* seem to be loss of habitat and climate change. The supporting statement indicates that some trade occurs in seeds of these three species, which is of additional concern and seems to be the main reason why the proposal has been put forward.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, it is not possible to conclude that *Sclerocactus blainei*, *Sclerocactus cloverae* and *Sclerocactus sileri* meet the biological criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) Annex 1 for their inclusion in Appendix I.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **rejected**.

In order to ensure control of trade in seeds of these three species, the proponent could alternatively consider amending annotation #4, paragraph a) to read: “... The exemption does not apply to seeds from Cactaceae spp. exported from Mexico, ~~and~~ to seeds from *Beccariophoenix madagascariensis* and *Neodypsis decaryi* exported from Madagascar; and, to seeds from *Sclerocactus blainei*, *S. cloverae*, and *S. sileri* from the United States of America”. (Proposed text to be deleted is struck through, new proposed text is underlined). This amendment to annotation #4 would require that the Conference of the Parties agree to recognize *Sclerocactus blainei* and *S. cloverae*.

## Proposal 53

Amend the annotation to the listings of *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* as follow:

Delete the current annotation #5 Logs, sawn wood and veneer sheets. Replace it with annotation #4 that reads as follows:

**#4 All parts and derivatives, except:**

- a) **Seeds (including seedpods of Orchidaceae), spores and pollen (including pollinia). The exemption does not apply to seeds from Cactaceae spp. exported from Mexico, and to seeds from *Beccariophoenix madagascariensis* and *Neodypsis decaryi* exported from Madagascar**
- b) **Seedling or tissue cultures obtained in vitro, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers;**
- c) **Cut flowers of artificially propagated plants;**
- d) **Fruits, and parts and derivatives thereof, of naturalized or artificially propagated plants of the genus *Vanilla* (Orchidaceae) and of the family Cactaceae;**
- e) **Stems, flowers, and parts and derivatives thereof, of naturalized or artificially propagated plants of the genera *Opuntia* subgenus *Opuntia* and *Selenicereus* (Cactaceae); and**
- f) **Finished products of *Euphorbia antisyphilitica* packaged and ready for retail trade**

**Proponent:** Thailand

Assessment by the Secretariat

*CITES background*

*Dalbergia cochinchinensis* Pierre 1898 was the subject of the listing proposal CoP16 Prop. 60 adopted during the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP16, Bangkok, March 2013).

*Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proponents seek to replace with annotation #4, the current annotation #5 carried by the listing of *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* in Appendix II. If the proposal is adopted, international trade in all types of products of the species will be regulated in accordance with the provisions of Article IV of the Convention. If agreed, annotation #4 for this species will exempt CITES controls only for seeds, spores and pollen (including pollinia); seedling or tissue cultures obtained in vitro, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers; and cut flowers of artificially propagated plants.

*Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

Listings intend to cover products in trade that pose a conservation threat to the species in the wild. The supporting statement explains that a review of the trade in *D. cochinchinensis* shows that the trade of products of this species includes all parts of the tree, while parts and derivatives remain unregulated with the current listing that carries annotation #5 (logs, sawn wood and veneer sheets). An analysis of the exports of timber and timber products of *D. cochinchinensis* from range States and the imports reported by major importing Parties shows that a large portion of the trade in "rosewood" species is currently in the form of secondary processed products, particularly furniture. Range States of *D. cochinchinensis* are using the national legislation to implement measures that prohibit the harvest and export of this species. Despite these efforts, between October 2012 and September 2014, Thailand has reported 4386 cases of illegal trade of this species with a quantity of 2,974.6 cubic meters. These figures reflect the large scale of the illegal trade in *D. cochinchinensis*.

In July 2014, the Secretariat published Notification to the Parties No. 2014/032, requesting all Parties to assist Thailand in tackling illegal trade in *D. cochinchinensis*. Since then, a number of international meetings have been organized to support range States in tackling illegal trade in this timber species and have also expressed concern about the status of the situation of the species e.g. Thailand hosted the 1<sup>st</sup> Regional Dialogue on Preventing Illegal Logging and Trade of Siamese Rosewood in Bangkok, in December 2014; 11th meeting of the Association of the South-East Asian Nations (ASEAN) Experts Group on CITES (AEG on CITES) in Brunei (May 2015); at

the 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Plants Committee (PC22, Georgia, October 2015), the Committee noted document PC22 Doc. 22.3 and supported its submission for consideration by the Conference of the Parties; the 2<sup>nd</sup> Regional Dialogue on Preventing Illegal Logging and Trade of Siamese Rosewood , which built on the outcomes of the first meeting, was hosted by Thailand, in April 2016 (more information about the two meetings hosted by Thailand is reported in document [CoP17 Doc. 25](#) on *Enforcement matters*). During these meetings range States and international partners concerned with the status of conservation of *D. cochinchinensis*, agreed that a change in the annotation to the current listing of that species would assist in improving regulation of trade in this products of this species.

#### *Listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

On March 24, 2016, the Management Authority for Flora of Thailand sent consultation letters on this proposal to the CITES Authorities in Cambodia, Laos PDR and Viet Nam, as well as seven organizations. Thailand received supporting letters from the CITES Management Authority of Viet Nam (dated 4 April 2016)

#### Conclusions and recommendation

Annotation #5 for *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* in Appendix II does not cover the full range of products and derivatives of this species recorded in international trade, thereby posing threats to the conservation of the species in the wild. This can be effectively addressed by replacing annotation #5 with annotation #4. If the proposal is adopted, international trade in all specimens of *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* will become subject to the provisions of CITES, and regulated in accordance with Article IV of the Convention.

#### *Recommendation*

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**

## Proposal 54

Include 13 timber species of genus *Dalbergia* (native to Mexico and Central America) in Appendix II:

- 1) *Dalbergia calderonii*
- 2) *Dalbergia calycina*
- 3) *Dalbergia congestiflora*
- 4) *Dalbergia cubilquitzensis*
- 5) *Dalbergia glomerata*
- 6) *Dalbergia longepedunculata*
- 7) *Dalbergia luteola*
- 8) *Dalbergia melanocardium*
- 9) *Dalbergia modesta*
- 10) *Dalbergia palo-escrito*
- 11) *Dalbergia rhachiflexa*
- 12) *Dalbergia ruddae*
- 13) *Dalbergia tucurensis*

**Proponent:** Mexico

### Assessment by the Secretariat CITES background

At its 16th meeting (CoP16, Bangkok, 2013), the Conference of the Parties agreed to include in Appendix II *Dalbergia cochinchinensis*, *D. granadillo*, *D. retusa* and *D. stevensonii*, and, Madagascar populations of *Dalbergia* spp. These listings came into force on June 12, 2013.

At the 22nd meeting of the Plants Committee (PC22, Georgia, October, 2015), Mexico presented an evaluation of the situation of thirteen species of *Dalbergia* from Mexico, in document PC22 Doc 22.4, and as a result the Committee endorsed the recommendation to list those thirteen native *Dalbergia* timber species of Mexico and Central America in Appendix II. The Committee further invited other *Dalbergia* range States to identify other species of the genus that could benefit from CITES controls.

### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proposal asserts that it is necessary to regulate international trade in 13 *Dalbergia* species to prevent it from endangering the survival of the wild populations of *Dalbergia* in the long term. International trade has driven selective logging of *Dalbergia* timber species trees in Latin America, leading to a decrease in their populations. If the proposal is adopted, international trade in the 13 *Dalbergia* species, and all readily recognizable parts or derivatives thereof, will become regulated in accordance with Article IV.

### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*Dalbergia* is a pantropical genus of about 250 species, with centers of diversity in Central and South America, Africa, Madagascar and Asia. In Mexico there are 20 species of the genus *Dalbergia*, of which 15 are used for their timber (6 are endemic to Mexico, and 9 native to Mexico and Central America). The 13 *Dalbergia* species in the proposal are distributed from Mexico to Panama.

There seems little doubt that timber species of this genus are considered of high economic value for international trade. They have been traditionally been used for building furniture, musical instruments, handicrafts and various objects. The supporting statement asserts that there is great international demand for the timber of *Dalbergia*

species, mainly in China, and that the resulting growing illegal trade is decimating populations of species of this genus throughout its range, as large volumes of timber are taken from the wild.

The available Information is said to indicate that wild populations of the 13 *Dalbergia* species are threatened primarily by: a) legal and illegal selective logging of wild specimens for timber trade; b) habitat loss and fragmentation; and, c) intrinsic factors that make them vulnerable, such as their natural rarity, slow growth rates, low recruitment and seed predation by other species. Overall, the information available would indicate that due to intrinsic threats and extrinsic factors, populations of each of the 13 species of *Dalbergia* concerned tend to decrease. *Dalbergia* timber species are slow-growing, and the absence of certain size classes (70-100 cm diameter), coupled with low density populations negatively affect regeneration. The reproduction system of the genus *Dalbergia* is unknown, although it is known for at least for *D. retusa* that the seeds have a high viability. The supporting statement claims that the genus *Dalbergia* establishes symbiotic relationships with rhizobia for nitrogen fixation, and that this function has a very important role in ecosystems as it improves soil fertility.

According to the CITES trade database, most exports of specimens of *Dalbergia* during the last 15 years (2000-2015) are of wild origin or unknown origin. Specifically, during this period, 250,676.0652 m<sup>3</sup> of wood (possibly sawn) and 98,978 kg (possibly trunks) were exported. It is noteworthy that the CITES trade database is limited to records of species listed in Appendices, which represents a considerable underestimation of trade in all species of the genus *Dalbergia*. As for the exporting and importing countries the following were identified:

- a) Exporting countries (in some cases re-exporters) identified in 2000-2015 total 20 (Germany, Belize, Brazil, Cambodia, El Salvador, United Arab Emirates, Spain, Tarry States, France, Britain, Guatemala, Japan, Madagascar, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Laos, Sri Lanka, and Vietnam).
- b) Importing countries for the period in question total 22 (Germany, Australia, Canada, Chile, Korea, Ecuador, Spain, United States, France, Hong Kong SAR (China), Japan, Netherlands, Peru, Russia, Singapore, Switzerland , Switzerland, Taiwan, Ukraine, and Vietnam; cfr. Table 6 / Annex 3 of the proposal).

During 2013-15, Mexico exported 232,661 m<sup>3</sup> of *Dalbergia* to China, Cambodia, Taiwan (Province of China) and the United States of America.

The information provided shows that the main specimens (parts and derivatives) in international trade in species of *Dalbergia* are logs and sawn timber (with a significant presence in the illegal trade), and to a lesser extent luxury furniture and other manufactured goods such as -tables, doors, frames, planks and crafts.

Most international trade in *Dalbergia* is registered under the common name "rosewood", or under the genus name "*Dalbergia* spp.", and thus not reported at species level. According to the available information, illegal trade in species of *Dalbergia* has accelerated in recent years, and there are even signs that timber stocks are depleted, which has increased prices on the international market and therefore the interest of the illegal market. The proposal states that transnational organized smuggling networks and illegal logging have been reported in countries such as Madagascar, Democratic Republic of Laos, Guatemala and Brazil. There are concerns that timber imports by China, labeled "Rosewood", include species for which harvest or trade moratoria are in force. Particularly in the case of Central America, illegal logging of *Dalbergia* is said to be a constant problem. Timber seizures in Guatemala suggest that illegal trafficking networks are capable of exporting large quantities. In 2012, the Belizean government banned the use and export of these species in response to high rates of illegal logging. Nicaragua has established a military unit solely focused on the protection of natural resources. Panama commissioned in 2011 the development of inspections in different sites where timber of *Dalbergia* is stored for export. Mexico's Authority for Monitoring and Enforcement of CITES (PROFEPA) inspected 1,712.671 m<sup>3</sup> of *Dalbergia* spp., of which about 30% was seized for not being able to prove the legal origin of specimens concerned.

#### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

Mexico consulted the other range States of the species concerned (Belize, Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, authorities Honduras, Nicaragua and Panama). All agreed on the need to include the 13 species of the genus *Dalbergia* in Appendix II. The proponent further states that in April 2016, the CITES Authorities from Guatemala informed Mexico of its intention to list all species of the genus *Dalbergia* in Appendix II.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The proposal concerns thirteen tree species of the genus *Dalbergia* distributed from Mexico to Panama. The available evidence suggests that all are in decline and threatened to various degrees by legal and illegal logging for timber, loss of habitat and intrinsic biological characteristics making them vulnerable to exploitation. International trade in timber is putting increasing pressures on remaining wild populations of these thirteen, as well as many other *Dalbergia* species.

*Dalbergia glomerata* is considered Vulnerable in the IUCN Red List and may therefore meet the criterion B in Annex 2 a of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16).

Timber of the genus *Dalbergia* can be reliably distinguished from that of other genera, but cannot be identified at species-level. It is therefore not possible to differentiate timber of CITES-listed *Dalbergia* species from that of non-CITES listed *Dalbergia* species. For this reason, it would be very difficult for Parties to regulate trade in these thirteen species alone, particularly re-exportation. Parties may also wish to consider how best to address issues relating to *inter alia* identification, the making of non-detriment findings, and the issuance of CITES permits and certificates, as also mentioned in document CoP17 Doc. 62.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, the thirteen species of *Dalbergia* meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criterion B, for their inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a), of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 55

Include the genus *Dalbergia* in CITES Appendix II with exception to the species included in Appendix I

**Proponent:** Argentina, Brazil, Guatemala and Kenya

Assessment by the Secretariat CITES background

CITES regulates 61 species of *Dalbergia*: 1 species in Appendix I, 55 species in Appendix II and 5 species in Appendix III:

Species	Appendix		
	Appendix I	Appendix II	Appendix III
<i>D. nigra</i>	Brazil		
<i>D. cochichinensis</i>		Thailand #5	
<i>D. abrahamii, D. andapensis, D. aurea, D. baronii, D. bathiei, D. bojeri, D. brachystachya, D. bracteolata, D. campenonii, D. capuronii, D. catipenonii, D. chapelieri, D. chlorocarpa, D. davidii, D. delphinensis, D. emirnensis, D. erubescens, D. gautieri, D. glaberrima, D. glaucocarpa, D. greveana, D. hildebrandtii, D. hirticalyx, D. humbertii, D. hutibertii, D. lemurica, D. louvelii, D. madagascariensis, D. malacophylla, D. manongarivensis, D. maritima, D. masoalensis, D. mollis, D. monticola, D. neoperrieri, D. nigra, D. normandii, D. occulta, D. orientalis, D. peltieri, D. pervillei, D. pseudobaronii, D. pseudoviguieri, D. purpurascens, D. suaresensis, D. trichocarpa, D. tricolor, D. tsaratananensis, D. tsiandalana, D. urschii, D. viguieri, D. xerophila</i>		Madagascar #5	
<i>D. granadillo, D. retusa, D. stevensonii</i>		Belize, Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama #6	
<i>D. darienensis</i>			Panama #2
<i>D. calycina, D. cubilquitzensis, D. glomerata</i>			Guatemala #6
<i>D. tucurensis</i>			Nicaragua #6

Annotations: #2 All parts and derivatives except seeds and pollen and finished products packaged and ready for retail trade; #5 logs, sawn wood and veneer sheets; #6 logs, sawn wood, veneer sheets and plywood.

### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The supporting statement suggests that the genus *Dalbergia* meets the criteria for listing all species in the genus in CITES Appendix II in compliance with Article II, paragraph 2(a) of the Convention and Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) Annex 2 a, Criteria A and B, and Annex 2 b Criterion A, i.e. *it is established or it is possible to deduct that regulation of trade in the species of the genus is required to ensure that the harvest of their specimens from the wild is not reducing the populations to a level at which their survival might be threatened*. If the proposal is adopted, international trade in all the species of the genus *Dalbergia*, and readily recognizable parts or derivative thereof, will be regulated in accordance with Article IV.

### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

The genus *Dalbergia* includes 304 species of trees, shrubs and vines. The distribution of this genus is fragmented, and many species populations are in decline mainly due to selective logging and the loss of forest coverage by human-induced degradation and disturbances. The genus is distributed globally, and therefore, full inventories are not available to show the current conservation status of the different species in the wild. However, the supporting statement leaves little doubt that that *Dalbergia* species are in high demand in the international tropical hardwood trade, and that wild populations of several species have experienced major declines due to legal and illegal overexploitation. The cutting of exploitable individuals in the wild is the main cause of the absence of certain diameter classes and the low density of populations. Most trees found in forests are not exploitable. *Dalbergia* trees are slow growing. Information on the breeding system of the genus *Dalbergia* is not available; however, some aspects of the reproductive biology show common features: high levels of seed abortion and scarce natural regeneration.

The taxonomy of the genus is being revised. A preliminary, indicative list with species names seems to be available from the proponents. If the proposal is adopted, further work will be required to prepare a standard reference for *Dalbergia* spp. Paragraph 25 of document CoP17 Doc. 81.1 briefly describes the work undertaken on a standard reference for *Dalbergia* species from Madagascar, stating: *The major task for the coming period will be to review the requirements for the provision of new and/or updated standard references for taxa currently listed on the Appendices or for those listed at CoP17. Prime among these will be to move beyond preliminary checklists for ... Dalbergia spp. (populations of Madagascar).*

The wood of the genus *Dalbergia* has a texture and specific colours that makes it highly desirable, and the timber of *Dalbergia* spp. is used for producing a wide range of products worldwide. The trees that produce rosewood are also much alike. While some identification guides for a few *Dalbergia* species exist, distinction between and identification of individual species is very difficult for non-professionals, and sometimes impossible even for experts, making it a problem for enforcement and customs officers to comply correctly with inspection and identification of CITES listed *Dalbergia* tree and product shipments. However, *Dalbergia* species at genus level can be distinguished from other “rosewood” timber genera.

The genus *Dalbergia* is known to be in decline as a result in the extraction of the species for its valuable timber. Logs and sawn wood of *Dalbergia* timber tree species are the main products in the international trade, but finished products such as wooden furniture, firewood, tables and finished items manufactured (doors, frames, board) and handicrafts are also found in the national and international trade. *D. melanoxyton* is a favourite wood for musical instruments. Only the heartwood yields quality timber: it is very hard, heavy and strong. Wastage may be as much as 70 - 80% because only the finest straight grain logs are used.

The proposal shows that as a result of the ongoing demand in Asian markets, the most heavily traded *Dalbergia* spp. have become seriously endangered by logging and destruction of their habitat, which is leading to the decline of wild populations.

*Dalbergia* spp. is stated to play numerous important roles in the ecosystems where they occur. The protection of the species of this genus from further unsustainable logging would allow remaining trees to continue their ecological functions.

In general, the rate and extent of deforestation in the range States is very high and the main areas affected by deforestation for illegal logging include the range of *Dalbergia* spp. IUCN has classified 83 species out of 304 as: Critically Endangered (1 species); Endangered (29); Vulnerable (26); Near Threatened (3); Lower Risk/Near Threatened (5); Least Concern (12); Lower Risk/Least Concern (1); and Data Deficient (6).

Information on population and habitat trends indicates that in Central America, the habitat of *Dalbergia* spp. has been highly degraded and is under continuing pressure from increasing agriculture, cattle ranching, palm plantations, population growth and overexploitation. In eastern and southern Africa, *D. melanoxyton* is found in Miombo woodlands which have been highly deteriorated as a result of human use. The density in southern Tanzania corresponds well with the density found in the two forest types in which *D. melanoxyton* occurs in Mozambique with 3% and 5% respectively. In Thailand, it was estimated in 2011 that just 80,000-100,000 *D. cochinchinensis* trees (approximately 63,500 m<sup>3</sup>) were left in the forests. The population size of rosewood in Vietnam has been declining with about 50-60% during the past 5-10 years. *D. retusa* was widely distributed on the coastal planes in the South Pacific regions of Guatemala in 1946. However, only one population with just 48 trees currently remains, demonstrating the high levels of over-exploitation in the country.

The supporting statement notes that trade in timber products of *Dalbergia* has increased exponentially in the past few years, as shown by log exports to Asian markets for the Hongmu (Red Wood) trade, which is based on 33 species of tropical hardwoods, of which 16 species are *Dalbergia*. Far more *Dalbergia* species are presently traded than those CITES-listed. However, information on trade flows is not easily available. The proposal claims

that trade in Hongmu *Dalbergia* species has caused an increase in illegal trade of this timber. All Hongmu source countries in the Mekong region have strict log export bans, and trade in a number of the more threatened species is completely prohibited. Despite these provisions, illegal cross-border trade of logs and sawn timber is evident across the Mekong. The same occurs in West Africa, where most countries have adopted total bans on harvesting and export. In Latin America, despite several moratoriums on exports and recent CITES listings, the illegal trade in Hongmu species is still rampant.

Seizures of illegally trafficked timber in Guatemala suggest that an organized smuggling ring is capable of exporting large quantities. The demand for *D. retusa* from the Darien Region of Panama has been described as “out of control” with “hundreds of settlers looting” the species. During 2011-14, 38 shipments and vehicles, with a total amount of 906,244 m<sup>3</sup> of *Dalbergia* timber (mainly trunks, fitches and tables) of *D. stevensonii*, *D. retusa* and *Dalbergia* spp. (reported as rosul) of illegal origin were confiscated in Guatemala (almost two times the CITES timber reported as legally exported for the same period). With the exception of two shipments destined for Honduras and El Salvador, all other shipments were destined to Asia. In Mexico, the seizures of *D. granadillo* sawn wood destined for the Asian market increased twofold from 318,077 m<sup>3</sup> in 2012 to 727,703 m<sup>3</sup> in 2014. There are estimates of 100-200 trees being felled daily with a collective value of up to 460,000 USD/day. Most of the rosewood being extracted is destined for Asian markets for luxury furniture. Illegal precious wood trade appears to have accelerated during the last few years, particularly for rosewood species

The supporting statement shows that shifting from one specie to another is a common practice, as species become commercially extinct. For instance, with the commercial extinction of *D. odorifera* in China and *Pterocarpus santalinus* in India, the trade in *D. cochinchinensis* grew rapidly and it became the most sought-after Hongmu species globally. As *D. cochinchinensis* was overexploited, the main species now dominating the Hongmu trade in South-East Asia are *D. oliveri*, *D. bariensis*, *Pterocarpus macrocarpus* and *P. pedatus*. More and more species of *Dalbergia* are entering the trade worldwide as stocks of once abundant species are being depleted. Although status information for all *Dalbergia* species in the wild is insufficient, it seems clear that the impact of current demand leads to levels of international trade that are unsustainable, which can deplete entire populations and have a domino effect if stricter controls are not rapidly developed worldwide.

Hongmu trade is also linked to, and drives violence in source and transit countries. In West Africa, Hongmu species are known as “blood timbers” due to connections between illegal Hongmu trade and rebel group uprisings (for example in the Senegalese Casamance, in Côte d’Ivoire and in northern Nigeria in territories controlled by the Muslim extremist group Boko Haram). In Thailand, more than 150 forest rangers, police, soldiers and illegal loggers have been killed in gunfights during rosewood enforcement operations in recent years. Traffickers exploit any legal loophole to smuggle illegal timber. Traffickers have repeatedly taken advantage of the current gaps in the CITES listings, miss declaring *D. retusa* as the unregulated and similar-looking *D. bariensis* in violation of national moratoriums and CITES listings.

Finally, the supporting statement asserts that non-endangered *Dalbergia* species would be subject to increased controls, which may increase the bureaucratic burden to the trade in legally harvested timber and timber products. But this would be a minor inconvenience compared to the benefits resulting from the listing of the whole genus *Dalbergia*. In any case, identification of these timber species possess important challenges to the implementation of CITES for the currently listed *Dalbergia* species.

These and other problems have been discussed by several experts and working groups, including discussions at the last Plants Committee meeting in Tbilisi, Georgia. The Committee noted document PC22 Doc. 17.6 on the implementation of the Convention for *Dalbergia* spp., presented by the representatives from the European region. The Committee also noted document PC22 Doc. 22.4 and supported its submission for consideration by the Conference of the Parties, including to consider the listing of other timber species of *Dalbergia* that might be suitable for being look-alike species (in accordance with Article II, para. 2b. of the Convention). During the discussion of these documents a large number of participants supported the need to list the whole genus *Dalbergia* in Appendix II to safeguard many of the *Dalbergia* species which are now in trade and have yet to be listed as well as to simplify the work of enforcement and customs authorities when facing shipments of *Dalbergia* products.

#### *Listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

The genus *Dalbergia* would have a global range and it is found in 105 range States and extra-maritime territories, which were consulted by the proponents. The responses received from 20 Parties are shown in section 10.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The proposal shows growing trade in *Dalbergia* species in response to demand for 'rosewood' in Asia, with an increasing number of species being logged, twenty-nine of which are now considered Critically Endangered or Endangered by IUCN, and these species meet criterion B in Annex 2 a of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16). Many species populations are in decline due to habitat loss and overharvesting, combined with low regeneration rates. Illegal harvest and trade seem a general problem.

The implementation of CITES for the species of *Dalbergia* already included in CITES is challenging. It is presently not possible to reliably identify timbers of *Dalbergia* at the species-level, or tell timbers of CITES-listed *Dalbergia* species apart from non-listed *Dalbergia* species (many shipments in international trade only refer to *Dalbergia* spp. or to 'rosewood'). Including the genus *Dalbergia* in Appendix II would facilitate the regulation of international trade in specimens of these species in accordance with the provisions of the Convention. By virtue of the precautionary approach, it is in the best interest of the conservation of the species concerned to include the genus *Dalbergia* in Appendix II. These measures are proportionate to the anticipated risks to the species. Parties may also wish to consider how best to address issues relating to *inter alia* identification, the making of non-detriment findings, and the issuance of CITES permits and certificates, as also mentioned in document CoP17 Doc. 62.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, the species in the genus *Dalbergia* meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criteria A and B, or Annex 2 b criterion A, for their inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a) of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 56

### Include *Guibourtia tessmannii*, *Guibourtia pellegriniana* and *Guibourtia demeusei* in Appendix II

**Proponent:** The European Union and Gabon

#### Assessment by the Secretariat CITES background

The species have not been the subject of a listing proposal.

#### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proposal seeks to strengthen controls on harvesting and trade in species of the species *Guibourtia tessmannii*, *G. pellegriniana* and *G. demeusei*. All three species would benefit from stricter controls to assist range States in their efforts to ensure their long term conservation in the wild. If this proposal is adopted, international trade in *Guibourtia tessmannii*, *G. demeusei* and *G. pellegriniana*, and all readily recognizable part or derivative thereof, will be regulated in accordance with Article IV.

#### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

The name Bubinga concerns three distinct species of the same African genus *Guibourtia*: *G. tessmannii*, *G. pellegriniana* and *G. demeusei*. Of the three species, *G. tessmannii* and *G. pellegriniana* are characterized by remarkable morphological similarities that complicate the differentiation of trees and timber of both species. Their populations are scattered in relatively low densities in narrow ranges overlapping through three Central African countries: Gabon, Cameroon and Equatorial Guinea. The proposal shows that *G. demeusei* has a larger range and extends to the Congo Basin. Although the tree and its timber have specific characteristics that allow further identification, the timber is confused with that of *G. pellegriniana* and *G. tessmannii* on international markets for tropical timber, where it is also commonly referred to as Bubinga. Information available indicates that the timber of these species is much appreciated for its aesthetic qualities, and that it has been marketed internationally since the first half of the 20th century. The proposal claims that log exports, which reached annually close to 90,000 m<sup>3</sup> in Gabon (2000) and around 15,000 m<sup>3</sup> in Cameroon (1998), have significantly reduced the populations of these species in their respective range.

The proposal states that over the past four years, the value of timber of Bubinga species has strongly increased on international markets due to the increased demand in China. The prices of these precious timbers, which were already among the highest, have experienced further exponential increases in the order of 300 to 500%, depending on the qualities and specifications. The proposal claims that Bubinga is now by far the most expensive wood from tropical Central African rain forests, which has led to the development of networks of illegal harvest and illegal exports in all range States. The supporting statement claims that by not respecting the forestry codes for sustainable forest management that are in force in those countries, these sectors further weaken the populations of the species and may quickly lead to disappearances at the local level.

Regarding the species role in their ecosystem, *G. pellegriniana* and *G. tessmannii* seem to play a very important role in the ecology of the forest, particularly in the spatial structure of plant communities by the attraction of predators that allow their dispersion and regeneration.

Population trends of *G. tessmannii* and *G. pellegriniana* are difficult to ascertain. This is partly due to the incomplete knowledge on stand dynamics, phenology and dispersal patterns of these species. However, it is assumed that their regeneration potential is limited, regardless of their use for the production of timber, especially because of their low densities and changing populations dispersers of seeds. Increasing demand seems to be the cause for increasing levels of illegal logging and illegal exports. The supporting statement indicates that demand in international markets has become a clear threat for the survival of these two species in the wild. Over the past five years, the expansion of the "demand for Hongmu" to supply Chinese markets has led to an unprecedented level of harvest of this timber in the main producing countries of its range, Gabon and Cameroon in particular. Over the past four years, the official volume of sawnwood exports (in Round Wood Equivalent) varied between 50,000 and 100,000 m<sup>3</sup> in Gabon, and between 5,000 and 10,000 m<sup>3</sup> in Cameroon. The main types of products in international trade would be lumber and logs.

Industrial logging companies operating sustainably are unable to meet the current demand for timber of Bubinga species. This has led to a quick development of informal and illegal circuit for the supply of illegal exports to China. The proponent claims that it is mainly in 2015 that the scale of the problem was revealed, with the strengthening of several illegal networks involving officials of the forestry administration of some range States.

The supporting statement further explains that administrations in charge of forest management in Cameroon (2011) and Gabon (2014), adopted restrictive measures to more strictly control the exploitation and trade in species of Bubinga. However, the proponent claims that these measures had only had a limited effect on controlling the current levels of illegal activities involving these species.

#### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

Gabon states to be aware that its concerns and willingness to sustainably manage its forest resources are shared by neighboring authorities on which extend the range of the species *G. tessmannii*, *G. pellegriniana* and *G. demeusei*. In April 2015, Cameroon, Congo, Equatorial Guinea and the Democratic Republic of the Congo were consulted on this proposal, but no responses has been received at the time of submission.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The proposal contains little information on population status and trends of the three species, which are in international trade for their timber. The supporting statement indicates that unregulated trade and demand in international markets has become a clear threat for the long-term survival of *Guibourtia tessmannii* and *G. pellegriniana* in the wild, and that *G. demeusei* requires regulation of its trade in timber for look-alike reasons.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *G. tessmannii* and *G. pellegriniana* meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criterion B, and *G. demeusei* those in Annex 2 b criterion A, for their inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraphs 2 (a) and 2 (b) of the Convention.

he Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 57

### Include *Pterocarpus erinaceus* in Appendix II, without annotation

**Proponent:** Benin, Burkina Faso, Chad, Côte d'Ivoire, the European Union, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Mali, Nigeria, Senegal and Togo

#### Assessment by the Secretariat

##### *CITES background*

Senegal listed *Pterocarpus erinaceus* on Appendix III of CITES (see Notification of the Parties No. 2016/008), which came into force from May 9, 2016.

The Plants Committee encouraged Senegal, at its 22nd meeting (PC22, Georgia, October, 2015), to submit the present proposal for consideration at CoP17. The proponents seek to include *Pterocarpus erinaceus* in Appendix II without annotation. Consequently, if the proposal is adopted, any readily recognizable part or derivative thereof, will be traded in accordance with Article IV.

##### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proposal states that up-listing will raise the profile of the species and generate increased resources and attention for controlling its trade. It is expected that the up-listing will allow importing countries to assist range States by stopping shipments of illegally harvested and traded timber, and make it easier to distinguish legal from illegal wood. The proposal claims that past experiences have demonstrated that an Appendix III listing might not be sufficient to prevent the commercial extinction of rosewood species when international, well-organized trading networks are actively involved in illegal activities. Though most illegal and unsustainable international trade is currently of logs and sawn timber, experience with CITES listings of other rosewood species has demonstrated that other annotations can be easily circumvented.

The proposal explains that by helping tackle illegal harvesting and trade, the proposed Appendix II listing should result in increased prices for legal supplies. In doing so, it can be expected to result in a significant reduction in illegal trade.

##### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*P. erinaceus* is a rosewood species native to the semi-arid Sudan-Guinea savanna forests of West Africa. The supporting statement asserts that the last few years have seen a dramatic increase in trade of *P. erinaceus* timber in response to rising demand in Asia for rosewood furniture and increasing scarcity of other officially recognized 'rosewood' species (several of which are listed on the CITES Appendices). It is estimated that imports of logs of the species by China have risen more than 2,000-fold between the third quarter 2009 and the third quarter 2015, from 70 cubic meter to approximately 149,000 cubic meter. In 2014, China alone imported approximately 750,000 cubic meters of West African rosewood. Given a typical yield of 0.8 cubic meters for a relatively large tree, such a volume would have required the harvesting of more than 1 million trees.

Widespread illegal and unsustainable harvesting of the species across its range has led many range States to enact total bans on harvesting and trade of the species in recent years in an attempt to prevent commercial extinction, yet illegal trade continues. *P. erinaceus* is a multi-use species in West Africa. Unless rapidly addressed, unsustainable exploitation of the species for international trade is therefore likely to have serious negative impacts on the environment and the human population of the West African savanna.

All harvesting of this species appears to be from the wild. *P. erinaceus* is a slow-growing deciduous tree species. Natural regeneration is often abundant and the species may be quite invasive if protected from grazing for some years. *P. erinaceus* is an important legume species within its habitat: the species fixes atmospheric nitrogen through a symbiotic relationship with Rhizobium soil bacteria. The species is one of the main components within its wooded savannah habitat. By helping reduce the current unsustainable and illegal exploitation of the species for international trade, an Appendix II listing will help protect the unique habitats of *P. erinaceus* by protecting this important keystone species.

Information available suggest that over 65 per cent of the original wildlife habitat in Africa's dry forests and woodlands has been lost as a result of agricultural expansion, deforestation, and overgrazing, which have been fuelled by rapid human population growth and poverty. *P. erinaceus* is a keystone species has been classified as

having Critical/Endangered status. Given the difficulties of modelling deforestation and degradation of tropical open woodlands, very little consolidated data is available on how much the habitat has changed. Given that *P. erinaceus*' range includes areas of significant and rapidly rising human population, with associated demands for agricultural land, grazing, firewood and charcoal, it can be expected that anthropogenic degradation is extensive.

There is no information on population structure. However, given that the largest specimens are disproportionately targeted for timber production, it can be expected that the recent boom in illegal and unsustainable harvesting will be leading to a skewing of the population structure towards immature specimens. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the species is already commercially extinct in many areas, and that illegal harvesting is proving damaging to the fragile semi-arid environments in which the species grows. Niger already classified the species as endangered before 2006, while in Senegal it has been given special protection since 1993. Many other countries have prohibited all harvesting of the species in recent years resulting of concerns regarding rapidly declining populations.

The proponents claim that the main threat in recent years to the survival of *P. erinaceus* in the wild, is the uncontrolled and illegal harvesting and trade of the species for its valuable timber. The tree is also used as firewood and charcoal, for its gum/resin (which is blood-red in colour and used in dyeing cotton), for furniture production, crafts, traditional musical instruments, and finally, as an important source of traditional medicine.

The supporting statement shows that in 2015, Africa was the first source region of "Hongmu" species in logs for China. West Africa alone accounted, the same year, for 84% of Chinese import of "Hongmu" from Africa, in volume, becoming the principal source sub-region in the world. Between the third quarter 2009 and the third quarter 2015, Chinese imports of Hongmu logs from West Africa increased by more than 2,000 times in volume. In 2015, China alone imported more than 387 million cubic meters of "Hongmu" logs from West Africa, for a total of approximately 269 million US dollars. The annual result of the previous year were even more impressive: in 2014 China alone imported more than 830 million cubic meter of Hongmu logs from West Africa, for a total of approximately 496 million US dollars. Though relevant Chinese trade data also captures small volumes of African ebonies (*Dalbergia melanoxylon* and *Dalbergia crassiflora*), nearly all of this increase is believed to be made up of *P. erinaceus*.

Information from a number of range states suggests that a large percentage of the *P. erinaceus* timber being exported to China and elsewhere is illegally harvested and/or illegally exported. The recent seizure of more than \$216 million US dollars in illegally harvested rosewood principally *P. erinaceus*, and other timber species, which took place in nine West African countries (Benin, Burkina Faso, Cote d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Mali, Mauritania, Senegal and Togo) demonstrates the regional scale of the issue. Stockpile of *P. erinaceus* seized logs management and disposal is recognized as a major and pressing issue at the West African scale. The operation, led by Interpol, resulted in the arrest of 44 individuals involved in national or regional timber traffic, especially *P. erinaceus*.

The species is subject to general legislation and regulations governing land tenure, forestry and timber trade in the relevant range states. This includes prohibitions on cutting of trees. The failure of these general forestry regulations to halt illegal and unsustainable harvesting and trade of African rosewood, and subsequent threats to the species' future, has led many range States to enact additional regulations specific to rosewood. General management measures in range States are defined by relevant Forestry legislation (including minimum diameter cutting limits), though it does not appear that any legal harvesting of the species takes place in specific zones managed under sustainable forest management plans. Specific management measures for the species take the form of blanket prohibitions on harvesting and trade, and are in place in a number of countries.

#### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

Following Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev. CoP16), the proponent claims that consistent efforts have been deployed in order to ensure a high level of consultation with the range States and with CITES Parties.

The proposal was presented by Senegal at a workshop on the "Development of Subregional Wildlife Enforcement Collaboration" held in Dakar in March 2016. The supporting statement claims that answers received demonstrated an important level of support for the proposal among range States. A regional workshop was held in Bissau in March 2016, entitled "Understanding International Trade, Reforming International Trade: The Case of the Timber Species *Pterocarpus erinaceus*". At the end of that workshop, the representatives unanimously decided to support the proposal. Finally, following Resolution Conf. 10.13 (Rev. CoP15), four different organizations listed in the section a) of the resolution were formally consulted by Senegal, namely the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO), the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), TRAFFIC, and the World Wildlife Fund (WWF).

The proposal states that the broad consultation process has guaranteed a strong sense of regional ownership and consensus about the importance of the inclusion of *P. erinaceus* in Appendix II. 7 range States, namely Benin, Burkina Faso, Guinea-Bissau, Guinea-Conakry, Mali, Nigeria, and Togo, as well as 1 non-range State, namely Chad, have decided to co-sponsor the proposal presented by Senegal.

#### *Conclusions and recommendation*

#### Conclusions and recommendation

Increasing international demand for, and trade in timber of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* has reduced populations in the wild across its range, to the extent that some populations are considered commercially extinct. In 2015, the species was included in Appendix III for Senegal. The supporting statement shows that *P. erinaceus* was the most heavily traded species of “Hongmu” (“red wood”) in 2015. Unsustainable and illegal exploitation of this species for international trade is likely to have long-term negative impacts on the species populations in the wild, on the ecology of the West African dry forests and on the human populations who depend on them.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *Pterocarpus erinaceus* meets the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criteria A and B, for its inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a), of the Convention. If the species is not listed in Appendix II, it could meet criterion C ii) of Annex 1 in the near future.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 58

**Include *Adansonia grandidieri* in Appendix II only for seeds, fruits, oil and live plants and annotate the listing to this effect**

**Proponent:** Madagascar

### Assessment by the Secretariat

#### *CITES background*

This species has never been the subject of a listing proposal.

#### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The proponent seeks to include *Adansonia grandidieri* in Appendix II to apply CITES controls in compliance with Article IV of the Convention for trade in seeds, fruits, oils and live plants, and in order to ensure the conservation in the wild and the suitable use of the species in the long term.

#### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*A. grandidieri* is an endemic species of Madagascar categorized as Endangered by IUCN (2013). The supporting statement asserts that the species is subject to massive exploitation and that its products are marketed domestically and internationally. However, little evidence is available to support the statement.

Fruits and seeds seem to be the most traded part of the tree. The proponent asserts that growth in market demand has resulted and continues to result on the species being seriously endangered by the overharvest along with the destruction of its habitat. In addition to this pressure caused by high demand and overharvest, the proponent explains that *A. grandidieri* has a very limited or localized distribution and that it is found only in two areas of southwest Madagascar. The majority of the populations would be located in anthropic formations following deforestation near the villages and fields. Individuals of *A. grandidieri* do not flower all at the same time from one year to another and, the supporting statement asserts that the natural regeneration is increasingly difficult and, that this situation is aggravated by anthropogenic pressures causing a deficit of recruited young plants. The habitat of the species would also be threatened by the progression of the agricultural lands. The intensive use of bark fibers leads to a decrease in the density and the age of the population due to the frequent logging. The proponent asserts that the exploitation of trees of this species could lead to its extinction and predicts future decline of the species by 80% in its range.

The supporting statement summarizes the main threats affecting the population of *A. grandidieri* as follows:

- \* Collection and massive exploitation of its fruit and seeds,
- \* Logging of trees to harvest the bark, and
- \* Modification and continuous destruction of its natural habitat because of slash and burn agriculture, the search for arable land and pasture for livestock.

Information on the role of the species in the ecosystem seems to indicate that the tree trunk of *A. grandidieri* serves as host to plants and as refuge for animals such as bats and small nocturnal lemurs. Their disappearance could result in the disappearance of these pollinators in the species' range. Information available further shows that the flowers of this species are pollinated by Malagasy endemic fruit bats and that the floral biology and phenology of this species plays a fundamental role in the attraction and behavior of these pollinators. The extinction or depletion of animals dispersing its seeds can reduce the success of the species survival. Multiplying trials and vegetative propagation have been recorded in the CIRAD and the University of Antananarivo although these showed a very slow growth of the seedlings.

#### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

Overharvesting, national and international trade in *A. grandidieri* are considered the main threats to and cause of reduction of the wild populations of this Malagasy endemic species. The proponents claim that the species meet the criteria in Annex 2 a paragraph B of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP15) because "*It is known, or can be inferred or projected, that regulation of trade in the species is required to ensure that the harvest of specimens*

*from the wild is not reducing the wild population to a level at which its survival might be threatened by continued harvesting or other influences".*

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The supporting statement indicates that seeds and fruits of *Adansonia grandidieri* are mostly harvested for internal consumption in Madagascar. Exports are noted to involve live plants, fruits, seeds and seed oil. *A. grandidieri* has a very restricted distribution in southwest Madagascar. It appears from the available information that the current levels of exploitation could lead to its extinction in the near future in line with criterion A in Annex 2 a of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16).

The proposed annotation limits CITES controls to trade in seeds, fruits, oils and live plants. However, the proponent asserts that there is also an intensive use of bark fibers that is leading to frequent logging, and that fibers and products made thereof appear in international trade. It would require a new proposal to regulate such trade under CITES.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *Adansonia grandidieri* meets criterion B in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, for its inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (a), of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 59

### Include *Abies numidica* in Appendix I

**Proponent:** Algeria

#### Assessment by the Secretariat

##### *CITES background*

This species has not been the subject of a listing proposal.

##### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

If adopted, *Abies numidica* would be included in Appendix I, and international trade in all specimens would be regulated in accordance with Article III.

##### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

*Abies numidica* is an endemic species in Algeria. Categorized in 2011 as Critically Endangered by the IUCN, the populations of the species are found in restricted areas. The proponent claims that the species is undergoing a very slow but certain regression in its range. Main causes of this regression are quoted to be the harsh climate and especially the abundant snow that covers the ground for seven months of the year, and the heat of the summer sun, that are all harmful factors to seedlings development. Other recognized threats are domestic collection for use as firewood, and animal grazing.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) resolves that proposals to amend Appendices I and II should be based on the best information available and, when appropriate, presented in the format in Annex 6 of this Resolution. The supporting statement concerning *Abies numidica* does not follow the recommended format, and much of the information required is absent (morphological characteristics; role of the species in the ecosystem; habitat and geographic trends; population structure; national utilization; legal and illegal trade; parts and derivatives in trade; actual and potential trade impacts; national and international legislation; management and control measures; population monitoring; propagation; habitat conservation; safeguards; and information on similar species).

The Secretariat notes that the concerns for the conservation of this species in the wild seem unrelated to international trade (known, inferred or projected).

##### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, *Abies numidica* does not meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) for its inclusion in Appendix I in accordance with Article II, paragraph 1.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **rejected**.

## Proposal 60

Amend the listings of *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp. in Appendix II:

Amend Annotation #14 with the underlined text:

“All parts and derivatives except:

- a) seeds and pollen;
- b) seedling or tissue cultures obtained in vitro, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers;
- c) fruits;
- d) leaves;
- e) exhausted agarwood powder, including compressed powder in all shapes; and
- f) finished products packaged and ready for retail trade, this exemption does not apply to wood chips, beads, prayer beads and carvings.”

**Proponent:** The United States of America

Assessment by the Secretariat

*CITES background*

At the 9th meeting of the Conference of Parties (CoP9, Fort Lauderdale 1994), a proposal submitted by India to include *Aquilaria malaccensis* in CITES Appendix II was adopted (CoP9 Prop.115). At the 13th meeting of the Conference of Parties (CoP13, Bangkok 2004), Indonesia submitted a proposal to include *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp. in CITES Appendix II (CoP13 Prop. 49), that proposal was adopted carrying at the time annotation #1. At the 15th meeting of the Conference of Parties (CoP15, Qatar 2010), the Conference of the Parties adopted proposal CoP15 Prop. 25 to delete annotations #1 and #4 and replace them both with a new annotation #4.

At the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP16, Bangkok, 2013), China, Indonesia, and Kuwait, submitted a proposal to replace the annotation to the listings of *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp. in Appendix II. Following extensive discussion at that meeting, the Conference of the Parties adopted current annotation #14 that reads:

**#14** All parts and derivatives except:

- a) seeds and pollen;
- b) seedling or tissue cultures obtained in vitro, in solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers;
- c) fruits;
- d) leaves;
- e) exhausted agarwood powder, including compressed powder in all shapes; and
- f) finished products packaged and ready for retail trade, this exemption does not apply to beads, prayer beads and carvings

*Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The intent of this proposal is to revise the current Annotation #14 to the listing of *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp. in Appendix II, to ensure that CITES controls apply to woodchips of agarwood-producing species even when they are traded as finished products packaged and ready for retail trade.

*Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

At CoP14 (The Hague, Netherlands 2007), the Conference of the Parties adopted numerous Decisions concerning agarwood (14.137, 14.138 (Rev. CoP15), 14.140, 14.144 (Rev. CoP15) and 15.95. In accordance with those Decisions two workshops on implementation of CITES for Agarwood-producing species were held in Kuwait and Indonesia in 2011 (see documents PC20 Inf.1, PC20 Doc. 15.1 and PC20 Doc. 17.2.1). More than 20 Parties from Asia, and the Regional Representatives to the Plants Committee from Asia (China, Indonesia, and Kuwait) and Oceania (Australia) participated the workshops. Among other numerous matters, the workshops discussed which products should be exempted from the CITES controls and discussions continued at the 20th meeting (PC20, Dublin 2012) of the Plants Committee (see document PC20 WG6 Doc.1 that was adopted by the Plants Committee with some amendments). Evidence suggests that woodchips are one of the main agarwood products traded internationally. Also at PC20, the Plants Committee engaged in extensive discussions concerning a possible amendment to reflect this in an annotation for agarwood-producing species, based on Annotation #4.

In line with the above, the proponent asserts that based on consultations within the Standing Committee Annotations Working Group, it appears that woodchips constitute a significant portion of the international trade in agarwood-producing taxa.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The United States of America has submitted this proposal in its role of Chair of the working group on annotations called for by the Standing Committee.

It is not clear from the supporting statement if the range States of *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp were consulted about the proposed amendment to annotation #14 in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev. CoP16). The guidance in Resolution Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP16) on *Use of annotations in Appendices I and II* provides that any revision of the annotations is intended to ensure that CITES controls cover those commodities that first appear in international trade as exports from range States and include those commodities that dominate the trade and the demand for the wild resource. In line with the guidance in Resolution Conf. 5.20 (Rev. CoP16), the Secretariat also considers that the proposed change to the annotation is appropriate with regard to those specimens that dominate the trade and the demand for the wild resource and foresees no potential problems in its implementation. As this annotation is specific to *Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp., there are no issues in relation to the harmonization with existing annotations.

The proposal does not elaborate on the current status of conservation of these species in their range, the current levels of harvest and demand for woodchips, or the potential impact that the proposed change if it were to be adopted. The Secretariat notes however that at several international meetings dedicated to agarwood that were held in recent years, range States have confirmed that woodchips are a commodity that represents an important part of agarwood products in international trade.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, the Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 61

**Include *Siphonochilus aethiopicus* in Appendix II** (populations of Mozambique, South Africa, Swaziland and Zimbabwe)

**Proponent:** South Africa

### Assessment by the Secretariat

#### *CITES background*

This species has never been the subject of a listing proposal.

#### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The supporting statement claims that despite its wide distribution from tropical Africa to southern Africa, *Siphonochilus aethiopicus* is under threat due to over-harvest pressure for domestic trade purposes. Listing the *S. aethiopicus* populations of South Africa, Swaziland, Mozambique and Zimbabwe on CITES Appendix II would help regulate the herbal medicines trade in those countries.

The proponent says that Kenya proposed the inclusion of all populations across the species range, but due to lack of data relating to international trade, the proposal is restricted to the populations of Mozambique, South Africa, Swaziland and Zimbabwe.

#### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

Information on the status of conservation of populations of *Siphonochilus aethiopicus* would indicate that these declined significantly in South Africa and Swaziland due to international trade. The species is extinct over much of its former South African range and the occurrence has declined by more than 90% over the last 100 years. The supporting statement asserts that the conservation status of wild populations of this species in South Africa is of particular concern, as this species is one of the top ten most popular traditional medicines in the traditional medicine trade. In Mozambique, the species populations would be healthy in parts of the species range in that country and, decreasing in some other areas where it is found.

Due to its scarcity in some countries, cross-border trade in this species from neighbouring countries to supply demand is increasing. This is accompanied by rising prices for *S. aethiopicus* rhizomes in South Africa coupled to high levels of poverty in these neighbouring countries. The proposing statement claims that the influence of habitat destruction on the conservation status of wild ginger is relatively small compared to the threat of ongoing harvesting for the *muthi* trade.

The proponent asserts that the total population size of *S. aethiopicus* is unknown. The species occurs over a large area and densities can vary between range States with local extinctions and concerns about critically low populations depending on the areas considered. No studies are known on the population structure. Little seems to be known about population trends for *S. aethiopicus* in West Africa.

The status of this species outside South Africa is unknown. Although sold at a high price, the plant is popular amongst buyers and, according to traders the plants are sourced from outside South Africa. The supporting statement asserts that although habitat loss is a factor, large-scale commercial exploitation of *S. aethiopicus* from wild populations to supply the herbal medicine trade in southern Africa is the most significant threat. There seems little doubt that the cross-border trade in *S. aethiopicus* rhizomes from some range States to others will contribute to continued population declines in those countries.

Some drastic declines in the remaining populations seem to have been observed at least in two of the four countries (in South Africa and in Swaziland). The demand for the species appears to be such that cultivated sources cannot supply the urban demand and commercial cultivation has been attempted only at a small scale.

#### *Compliance with listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

The proponent consulted other range States in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev.CoP16) on *Consultation with range States on proposals to amend Appendices I and II*. Positive responses were received from Botswana, Ghana, Kenya, Mozambique, Malawi, Nigeria, Swaziland, Tanzania, Zambia as well as

Zimbabwe. The proposal was also discussed at a SADC Regional Workshop to prepare for the 17th Conference of Parties to CITES. No objections were received.

#### Conclusions and recommendation

The supporting statement shows that international trade in *Siphonochilus aethiopicus* concerns mostly cleaned, fresh, unprocessed rhizomes and leaves. There is concern about the impact of international trade on wild populations of *S. aethiopicus* in South Africa and the neighbouring range States that are the subject of the proposal such that the criterion B in Annex 2 a of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16) is met..

The adoption of the proposal would result in a split-listing. Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), in Annex 3, provides that split-listings that place some populations of a species in the Appendices, and the rest outside the Appendices, should normally not be permitted. But it also points out that “when split-listing does occur, this should generally be on the basis of national or regional populations, rather than subspecies”. The latter is the case for the present proposal. It would however be appropriate for the proponent to explain how the anticipated enforcement challenges will be addressed.

#### *Recommendation*

Based on the information available at the time of writing, that populations of *S. aethiopicus* of South Africa and Swaziland, and possibly of Mozambique and Zimbabwe, meet the criteria in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP16), Annex 2 a, criterion B, for inclusion in Appendix II in accordance with Article II, paragraph 2 (A), of the Convention.

The Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.

## Proposal 62

### Amend the listing of *Bulnesia sarmientoi* in Appendix II

#### Amend Annotation #11 with the underlined text:

**Logs, sawn wood, veneer sheets, plywood, powder and extracts. Finished products containing such extracts as ingredients, including fragrances, are not considered to be covered by this annotation.**

**Proponent:** The United States of America

#### Assessment by the Secretariat

##### *CITES background*

At the 15th meeting of the Conference of Parties (CoP15, Qatar 2010), the Conference of the Parties adopted proposal CoP15 Prop. 42 to include *Bulnesia sarmientoi* in Appendix II with Annotation #11, as follows:

**#11** Logs, sawn wood, veneer sheets, plywood, powder and extracts.

##### *Purpose and impact of the proposal*

The supporting statement shows that the purpose of this proposal is to harmonize the language in annotation #11 as mentioned above with, annotation #12 that accompanies the listing of the species *Aniba rosaeodora* in Appendix II as adopted at CoP15.

##### *Main points made in the supporting statement and general comments*

The proponents claim that *Bulnesia sarmientoi* is routinely traded in the same form as *Aniba rosaeodora*, namely as an extract, and that this derivative is often exported from the range States of the species. Also at CoP16, the Conference of the Parties adopted a proposal submitted by Brazil (proposal CoP16 Prop. 59) to revise Annotation #12, as follows:

**#12** Logs, sawn wood, veneer sheets, plywood and extracts. Finished products containing such extracts as ingredients, including fragrances, are not considered to be covered by this annotation.

Paragraph f) of Decision 16.162 on *Annotations* directs the working group to review outstanding implementation challenges resulting from the listings of *Aniba rosaeodora* and *Bulnesia sarmientoi* in the Appendices, and propose appropriate solutions at the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. In Document SC66 Doc. 25, the working group noted that *Aniba rosaeodora* and *Bulnesia sarmientoi* are often traded in the same form (i.e., extract). Consequently, the working group agreed that the phrase “finished products containing such extracts as ingredients, including fragrances, are not considered to be covered by this annotation” should be added to Annotation #11.

The Secretariat has prepared document CoP17 Doc. 83.1 on Annotations, a Report of the Standing Committee. In that document, a new set of draft decisions is presented in Annex 5, for consideration and adoption at CoP17, paragraph e) draft decision 16.162 (Rev. CoP17) reads: ... e) *to review outstanding implementation challenges resulting from the listings of Aniba rosaeodora and Bulnesia sarmientoi in the Appendices, particularly concerning trade in extracts, and propose appropriate solutions;*

##### *Listing criteria and other CoP recommendations*

Noting the lack of consultations between the proponents and the range States of the species *Bulnesia sarmientoi*, the Secretariat emphasizes the need to have the views of Argentina, the Plurinational Republic of Bolivia, Brazil and Paraguay, regarding this proposal.

The United States of America has submitted this proposal in its role of Chair of the working group on Annotations called for by the Standing Committee.

The proponent does not seem to have consulted range States in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev.CoP16) on *Consultation with range States on proposals to amend Appendices I and II*.

## Conclusions and recommendation

The United States of America has submitted this proposal in its role of Chair of the working group on annotations called for by the Standing Committee.

It is not clear from the supporting statement if the range States of *Bulnesia sarmientoi* were consulted in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev. CoP16). The guidance in Resolution Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP16) on *Use of annotations in Appendices I and II* provides that any revision of the annotations is intended to ensure that CITES controls cover those commodities that first appear in international trade as exports from range States and include those commodities that dominate the trade and the demand for the wild resource. In line with the guidance in Resolution Conf. 5.20 (Rev. CoP16), the Secretariat also considers that the proposed change to the annotation is appropriate with regard to those specimens that dominate the trade and the demand for the wild resource and foresees no potential problems in its implementation. Adoption of this proposal would result in the harmonization of the annotation for this species with that for *Aniba rosaeodora* making control of the similar trade involving these taxa easier for enforcement officials.

It appears that range States do export extracts as a main commodity for international trade in this species, but there is no clear evidence that finished products containing these extracts are also exported.

The proposal does not elaborate on the conservation status of the species, current levels of harvest and demand for its products, or the potential impact of the proposed change on trade. The work with range States “to review outstanding implementation challenges resulting from the listings of *Aniba rosaeodora* and *Bulnesia sarmientoi* in the Appendices, particularly concerning trade in extracts, and propose appropriate solutions”, is proposed to continue, as per paragraph e) of draft decision 16.162 (Rev. CoP17) in Annex 5 of document CoP17 Doc. 83.1.

### *Recommendation*

Based on the available information at the time of writing, the Secretariat recommends that this proposal be **adopted**.