CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Seventeenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Johannesburg (South Africa), 24 September – 5 October 2016

INTERNATIONAL CONSORTIUM ON COMBATING WILDLIFE CRIME (ICCWC) SIDE EVENT: ENHANCING RESPONSES TO COMBAT WILDLIFE CRIME

This document has been submitted by the Secretariat at the request of Parties and participants of the side event organized by the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) on 26 September 2016 on Enhancing Responses to Combat Wildlife Crime. It is submitted by the Secretariat on behalf of ICCWC and in relation to agenda item 14.2 on the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime.

* The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.
The ICCWC response

The CITES Secretariat

INTERPOL

UN Office on Drugs and Crime

World Bank

World Customs Organization
The ICCWC response

- Complementary mandates
- Unique pool of knowledge and expertise
- Extensive national and regional networks

Joining forces as ICCWC
ICCWC Global Network

ICCWC Partner Organization Headquarters

The ICCWC Senior Experts Group coordinates all ICCWC activities with their respective regional offices.

Regional Hubs

All regional offices of ICCWC partner organizations.

In addition to the regional hubs identified above, CITES has Management Authorities in 101 countries, INTERPOL has National Central Bureaus in 190 countries, UNODC operates in more than 150 countries through its network of field offices, the World Bank has country offices in over 100 countries and the WCO has Customs Administrations in 160 countries.
Coordinated Law Enforcement Support

Switzerland

United Kingdom
- Operational meeting (2015, 2016)
- Controlled delivery workshop (2015)

Czech Republic
- Controlled delivery workshop (2015)

Bosnia and Herzegovina
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

United Arab Emirates
- WIST deployment (2015)

Nepal
- Toolkit implementation (2014)

Bangladesh
- Workshop on fundamentals of CITES (2015)
- Training on special investigative techniques (2015)
- Toolkit implementation (2013)

Republic of Korea
- Workshop to combat smuggling of timber from Madagascar to Asia (2014)

France
- Preoperational training, Operation Cobra III (2014)

Bahamas
- Regional meeting on wildlife law enforcement in the Caribbean (2016)
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Mexico
- Toolkit implementation (2016)

Colombia
- Toolkit implementation (2016-2017)*

Guyana
- Toolkit implementation (2016-2017)*

Peru
- Toolkit implementation (2014)

Democratic Republic of the Congo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Gabon
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Togo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*
- WIST deployment (2014)

Congo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Angola
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

South Africa
- 2nd Global Meeting of WEN’s (2016)*
- Global Partnerships Coordination Forum hosted by ICCWC (2016)*
- 1st International rhinoceros DNA sampling training workshop (2013)

Botswana
- Toolkit implementation (2015)

Mozambique
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Democratic Republic of the Congo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Madagascar
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*
- WIST deployment (2015)
- Complimentary Customs mission (2015)

United Republic of Tanzania
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*
- COBRA III post operational review training workshop (2015)

Republic of Korea
- Workshop to combat smuggling of timber from Madagascar to Asia (2014)

China
- Controlled delivery workshop (2011)

Viet Nam
- Toolkit implementation (2016)
- Workshop on illegal timber trade in South-East Asia (2013)

Lao People’s Democratic Republic
- Assessment of law enforcement capacity needs (2013)

Thailand
- Controlled delivery workshop (2015)
- Ministerial roundtable on combating transnational organized wildlife & forest crime (2013)
- Specialized training on combating wildlife crime (2013)
- 1st Global Meeting of WEN’s (2013)

Singapore
- Reptiles Regional Investigative and Analytical Case Meeting (RIACM, 2016)

Kenya
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*
- Rhinozeros Enforcement Task Force meeting (2013)
- Workshop for wildlife law enforcement officers from Africa & Asia (2013)
- Operation COBRA II operational planning meeting (2013)

Botswana
- Toolkit implementation (2015)

Mozambique
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Democratic Republic of the Congo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

South Africa
- 2nd Global Meeting of WEN’s (2016)*
- Global Partnerships Coordination Forum hosted by ICCWC (2016)*
- 1st International rhinoceros DNA sampling training workshop (2013)

Botswana
- Toolkit implementation (2015)

Mozambique
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

Democratic Republic of the Congo
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*

South Africa
- 2nd Global Meeting of WEN’s (2016)*
- Global Partnerships Coordination Forum hosted by ICCWC (2016)*
- 1st International rhinoceros DNA sampling training workshop (2013)

WEN's (2013)
- Assessment of law enforcement capacity needs (2013)

Singapore
- Reptiles Regional Investigative and Analytical Case Meeting (RIACM, 2016)

Kenya
- Toolkit implementation (2016)*
- Rhinozeros Enforcement Task Force meeting (2013)
- Workshop for wildlife law enforcement officers from Africa & Asia (2013)
- Operation COBRA II operational planning meeting (2013)
Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit

INTERNATIONAL CONSORTIUM ON COMBATING WILDLIFE CRIME

ICWCE Indicator Framework for Combating Wildlife and Forest Crime
A self-assessment framework for national use

ASSESSMENT GUIDELINES
ASSESSMENT TEMPLATE

UNODC
United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime

World Wildlife Crime Report
Trafficking in protected species

2016
ICCWC Strategic Programme 2016-2020

ICCWC’s comprehensive strategy outlining the types of activities to be pursued by ICCWC up to 2020 based on funding availability and donor support.
The ICCWC Strategic Mission 2014-2016 identifies focus areas in which ICCWC is uniquely-placed to make a significant contribution. Building on the Strategic Mission, the ICCWC Strategic Programme outlines types of activities to be pursued by ICCWC up to 2020. Implementation will be based on funding availability and donor support.

**REDUCED POACHING AND TRAFFICKING IN WILDLIFE AND FOREST PRODUCTS**

1. Provide institutional support and strengthen cooperation and coordination
2. Facilitate analysis of national capacity to strengthen law enforcement responses and help guide investment
3. Develop or enhance criminal justice and preventive capacity across institutions
4. Increase awareness and support for measures to combat wildlife and forest crime
5. Expand the use of knowledge, technology and innovation
6 (Cross-cutting): Ensure the effective operation, coordination and evaluation of ICCWC

5 activities and 15 sub-activities identified
3 activities and 6 sub-activities identified
6 activities and 15 sub-activities identified
2 activities and 4 sub-activities identified
3 activities and 9 sub-activities identified
2 activities and 8 sub-activities identified

**EXPECTED OUTCOMES**

- Effective interagency cooperation and coordination
- Wildlife crimes effectively prevented, detected, investigated and suppressed
- Increased use of innovative tools and techniques
- Increased law enforcement and prosecutorial interventions
- Increased prosecutions and convictions of organized criminal groups
- Increased understanding of trends, flows and patterns of illicit trafficking in wildlife
- Limitations identified and addressed through targeted strategies and responses
- Increased political support and recognition of wildlife crime as a serious crime
- Effective support for the operation and coordination of activities provided by ICCWC
- Strengthened national legislation
- Targeted and effective mobilization of resources
- Responses to wildlife crime that match international commitments and obligations
The International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime Presents

ICCCWB World Wildlife Crime Report

Jorge Rios, Chief, UNODC Global Programme for Combating Wildlife and Forest Crime
Map 1: Total number of seizures reported by country, 2004-2015

Number of seizures

Source: World WISE
Together, just a few types of wildlife can account for 90% of the total.
Illegal Wildlife Trade: A series of related but distinct markets

Table 1: Wildlife trade sectors, case study species-products, and other markets discussed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FURNITURE</th>
<th>ART, DÉCOR, JEWELRY (INVESTMENT)</th>
<th>FASHION</th>
<th>COSMETICS AND PERFUME</th>
<th>FOOD, MEDICINE, TONICS</th>
<th>PETS, ZOOS, BREEDING</th>
<th>SEAFOOD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rosewood</td>
<td>Ivory</td>
<td>Reptile skins</td>
<td>Agarwood</td>
<td>Pangolin</td>
<td>Parrots</td>
<td>Caviar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Big cat skins</td>
<td></td>
<td>Rhino horn</td>
<td>Freshwater turtles and tortoises</td>
<td>Marine turtles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bear bile</td>
<td>Great apes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Vulnerable Markets

Where there is no international regulation

Uncontrolled wild sourcing

Laundering through farms, captive breeding operations

Use of fraudulent paperwork
Implications for Policy

- Mutual recognition
- Victim assistance
- Capacity building
- Establish trade standards
- Address corruption
The International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime Presents

Anti-Money Laundering Training Programme for Wildlife Crime

Simon Robertson, Senior Governance Specialist, World Bank
AML Training - Objectives

• Enhance the capacity and cooperation among
  – Wildlife law enforcement officials
  – Prosecutors
  – Judges
  – Financial intelligence units
  – Anti-corruption agencies
  – Other relevant stakeholders (customs, tax authorities, etc.)
  – Private sector actors - banks, money remitters, lawyers, accountants, notaries, etc.
  – Civil society

• To bring wildlife crimes and money laundering actions in court
• Develop financial investigations in wildlife crime cases
Structure of Training Course

• 4-day Class Room Setting
• Mix of power point presentations based on the modules, additional exercises and work on the case Simulation Exercise (including role playing component)
• Training adaptable to a country's own legal and operational framework to serve future training needs
• Participant and Moderator Guidance – “in-house training course”
AML Training – Core Components

• Set of 5 modules
  – Concepts and Practical Applications
  – Role of the Financial Intelligence Unit
  – Inter-agency Domestic and International Cooperation
  – Planning Investigations
  – Confiscation Processes and Avenues for Asset Recovery

• A “real-life” case simulation
Module 1: Concepts and Practical Applications

– This Module:
– advocates a “follow the money” approach to wildlife crime investigations as a means of dismantling criminal networks by going after the proceeds generated by wildlife crimes;
– illustrates the nexus between wildlife crime and money laundering, based on interviews with key stakeholders, typologies and other reports on wildlife crimes and money laundering;
– draws upon cases of money laundering related to other forms of transnational organized criminal activity, noting the parallelisms with wildlife crime and frequent overlap.
Module 2: Role of the Financial Intelligence Unit

– To receive financial intelligence information,
– Analyze this information – where it can become intelligence and
– Disseminate to relevant authorities, and
– Where this information can eventually form evidence in a case.
Module 3: Inter-agency Domestic and International Cooperation

– This module
– covers issues related to cooperation between various agencies that are responsible – directly or indirectly - for fighting, investigating and prosecuting wildlife crime and money laundering and highlights practical ways in which cooperation can be enhanced.
– identifies ways in which information/intelligence can be shared in a multi-agency manner to effectively address wildlife crimes using all available tools at the disposal of multiple agencies
– briefly touches on the issue of international cooperation by specifically looking at the pre-mutual legal assistance agency-to-agency cooperation, or administrative cooperation.
Module 4: Planning Investigations

– This module
– looks at the practical aspects of the planning and management of investigations that follow the illicit gains relating to illegal wildlife trade.
– It addresses the initiation of money laundering investigations linked to illegal wildlife trade and relevant corrupt practices.
– explores the sources of information to facilitate an investigation;
– the use of specific investigative techniques;
– tracing assets and managing of evidence;
– case management and division of responsibilities.
Module 5: Confiscation Processes and Avenues for Asset Recovery

- This module looks at how to improve understanding of the requirements and strategies of successful asset recovery. It has as its premise the notion that one of the most effective ways to combat wildlife crime is to take the profit out of the crime. There is no better way of doing this than to freeze, seize and confiscate the proceeds of any crime related to wildlife.

- provides case examples of asset recovery and the management of seized and forfeited assets from other types of crime that may serve as a template for fighting wildlife crime.
Simulation Exercise

• Wildlife crime scenario using a sanitized wildlife crime case/based on a “real-life” case;
• Aimed at helping trainees follow the main steps of a ML investigation and prosecution;
• Role-playing environment using teams of government officials with diverse backgrounds (e.g. law enforcement, prosecutors, customs officials, anti-corruption experts, financial analysts) who collaborate together to solve the case.
Course created by:

Marilyne Goncalves
Senior Financial Sector Specialist
Finance and Markets Department
World Bank
Phone: +1 202 473 9319
Email: mgoncalves2@worldbank.org
Simon Robertson
Senior Governance Officer
Environment and Natural Resources Global Practice
World Bank
Washington DC, USA
Phone: +1 202 458 0525
Mobile: +1 2020 250 1552
Email: srtobertson@worldbank.org
ICCWC indicator framework for combating wildlife and forest crime

Barend Janse van Rensburg, Chief, Enforcement Support, CITES Secretariat
ICCWC Indicator Framework for Combating Wildlife and Forest Crime

A self-assessment framework for national use

ASSESSMENT GUIDELINES
ASSESSMENT TEMPLATE
A practical tool for national use

- A comprehensive set of 50 indicators arranged against eight desired outcomes of effective law enforcement to combat wildlife crime.
- Ease-of-use (data availability, avoid reporting burden).
- Complement ICCWC Toolkit
Assessment guidelines

• Part 1 – overview of ICCWC Indicator Framework.
• Part 2 - lists practical guidance.
• Part 3 - discusses the analysis of results.

* Other tools are available for site-based assessment, e.g. MIKE site-level law enforcement capacity assessment benchmarks
The framework – 8 outcomes

1. Proactive enforcement is deterring wildlife crime
2. Wildlife crime can be detected by law enforcement agencies
3. Wildlife crime is thoroughly investigated using an intelligence-led approach
4. Specialized investigation techniques are used to combat wildlife crime as required
5. There is a strong legal basis to combat wildlife crime
6. Wildlife crime is prosecuted in accordance with the severity of the crime
7. Wildlife crime offenders are appropriately penalized
8. A holistic approach is deployed to combat wildlife crime
The framework – 50 indicators

1. Proactive enforcement is deterring wildlife crime
   - Enforcement priority
   - Strategy
   - Cooperation
   - Risk mgmt
   - Proactive investigations
   - Staffing
   - Training

2. Wildlife crime can be detected by law enforcement agencies
   - Enforcement presence
   - Operations
   - Border controls
   - Seizure powers
   - Disposal
   - Seizures

3. Wildlife crime is thoroughly investigated using an intelligence-led approach
   - Investigative capacity
   - Info. mgt
   - Intelligence analysis
   - Investigations
   - Reporting of transnational crime

4. Specialized investigation techniques are used to combat wildlife crime as required
   - Legal authority to use
   - Actual use
   - Forensic technology
   - Financial investigations
The framework – 50 indicators

5. There is a strong legal basis to combat wildlife crime
   - Domestic WLC legislation
   - CITES NLP assessment
   - International cooperation
   - Corruption
   - Org. crime

6. Wildlife crime is prosecuted in accordance with the severity of the crime
   - Case file prep.
   - Clearance rate
   - Administrative penalties
   - Prosecutorial capacity
   - Conviction rate

7. Wildlife crime offenders are appropriately penalized
   - Available penalties
   - Sentencing guidelines
   - Judicial awareness
   - Asset forfeiture

8. A holistic approach is deployed to combat wildlife crime
   - Drivers of WLC
   - Demand reduction
   - Community engagement
   - Livelihoods
   - Public awareness
Three types of indicators

Expert-based assessment

e.g. extent of cooperation, capacity, resources
Three types of indicators

Process or document-based assessment

* e.g. presence of legislative provisions, policy
Three types of indicators

Data-based assessment

e.g. # of seizures, prosecution rate, conviction rate
Phase One: Planning

1. Identify the lead agency and establish project team

2. Identify the relevant agencies to be involved in the national assessment

3. Identify and secure any resourcing needs

4. Determine whether an agency or sub-national assessment will also be completed
Phase Two: Data Collection

5. Identify data needs

6. Request access to data (DA indicators)

7. Set time and location for collaborative expert assessment (EA indicators)

8. Gather and review documentation (PA indicators)

9. Conduct expert workshop to complete expert-based assessment
Phase Three: Analysis & Recording

10. Collate and review indicator ratings

11. Analyse results

12. Identify areas for follow-up exploration and action
Phase Four: Review

13. Identify process improvements

14. Define timeframe for repeat assessment
Assessment guidelines

• Takes you step by step through the process, outlines and explains all outcomes and indicators.

• Detailed guidance on how the Assessment Template should be used.
Assessment Tools

- Assessment template
4. National cooperation (EA)

The extent of inter-agency cooperation among national law enforcement agencies to combat wildlife crime.

**Question:** Are there mechanism(s) in place to facilitate national inter-agency cooperation to combat wildlife crime?

**Measurement:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation among agencies:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rarely or never occurs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sometimes occurs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Usually takes place on an ad-hoc basis</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is not supported by any formal collaboration mechanism(s)*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Routinely occurs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is sometimes supported by formal collaboration mechanism(s)*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is sometimes challenged by a lack of engagement or willingness to collaborate</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is rarely challenged by a lack of engagement or willingness to collaborate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is usually considered to be meeting the desired collaboration objectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Examples of formal mechanisms for inter-agency cooperation include a national inter-agency enforcement committee bringing together agencies with a responsibility for combating wildlife crime (e.g. wildlife agencies, Customs, police) and/or Memoranda of Understanding (MoU) between relevant law enforcement agencies.

**Comments:**

Recording comments provides useful contextual information when reviewing results.
ICCWC Indicator Framework

- Available in English, French and Spanish through dedicated ICCWC portal on the CITES website:
  https://cites.org/eng/prog/iccwc.php/Tools
Operational Support

Davyth Stewart, Coordinator - Natural Resources, INTERPOL
Background to INTERPOL

- World’s largest international police organization established in 1923
- Represents all law enforcement agencies
- 190 member countries
- Facilitates cross-border police co-operation to combat crime
- No interventions of a military, political, religious and/or racial character.
Specialised Crime areas
Environmental Security Programme

• Wildlife poaching and trade

• Natural resource theft

• Illegal waste trafficking and dumping
National Central Bureaus (NCBs)

• Designated contact point for the General Secretariat, regional offices and other member countries.

• Effective and quick sharing of intelligence to fight transnational crimes.

• Access to INTERPOL’s databases and I-24/7.
INTERPOL training on jungle survival skills and satellite monitoring – Amazon rainforest, Manaus, Brazil
Wildlife Incident Support teams

Specialized officers to provide real-time assistance for environmental crimes and/or financial investigations
Wildlife Incident Support teams
INFRA TERRA
Fugitives wanted for Environmental Crime

INFRA Terra
– 139 Cases
– 23 Arrests
– 27 Positive Locations
INFRA TERRA
Fugitives wanted for Environmental Crime

Feisal Mohamed Ali
Intelligence-led enforcement

• Proactive vs reactive
• Anticipating events before they happen
• Making the best use of limited resources
  – Prioritising:
    • Information collection
    • Lines of enquiry
    • Offenders and criminal groups
  – Maintaining operational focus
Collate data and information → Analysis

Further investigation and evidence gathering → Identify targets and plan operations

Enforcement action →
Available intelligence

• Telephone call data, contact details and SIM card information
• Email communications and contact lists
• Bank and credit card details and related financial transactions
• Ballistics
• Trading ledgers, receipts and invoices
INTERPOL Ballistics Information Network

• The IBIN network enables international ballistic data sharing between the law enforcement agencies across INTERPOL’s 190 member countries
INTERPOL’s analytical team

• A dedicated criminal intelligence analytical team has been assigned to the environmental security unit

• The team has extensive operational experience in the fields of organised crime, wildlife and timber trafficking, anti-corruption, public order and terrorism
Network Analysis - Criminal Groups
Network Analysis - Criminal Groups
Network Analysis - Criminal Groups
International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime

THANK YOU