

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

---



Seventeenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
Johannesburg (South Africa), 24 September – 5 October 2016

Administrative and financial matters

Access to finance, including GEF funding

DRAFT TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE DONOR ADVISORY GROUP ON  
WILDLIFE AND FOREST CRIME

This document has been submitted by the World Bank, in relation to agenda item 7.5 on *Access to Finance, including GEF Funding*.

---

\* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*



# Terms of Reference

## A Portfolio Analysis of International Funding to Tackle Illicit Trafficking in Wildlife

---

### Background and context

1. Wildlife trade<sup>1</sup>, including poaching and illegal trade<sup>2</sup> for wildlife parts and meat, for domestic consumption worldwide has occurred for years, and certainly prior to 2008. Manageable levels of poaching for ivory trade in Africa and Asia have been reported throughout the post-CITES trade ban period (with the exception of Central Africa). However, in 2008, Africa witnessed an escalation in poaching, spurred by an unprecedented international demand for elephant ivory and rhino horn (CITES, 2013a and UNEP et al., 2013). The CITES MIKE program estimated that 22,000 elephants were poached in 2012 across Africa, and the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) Species Survival Commission (SSC) African Elephant Specialist Group estimates that the number of elephants decreased from 550,000 to 470,000 between 2006 and 2013<sup>3</sup>. Similarly, rhino poaching has reached a crisis point. In South Africa alone, which has the largest population of rhinos in the world, there were 1,215 rhinos poached in 2014.<sup>4</sup> This is an exponential increase from the 13 rhinos poached in 2007. In 2011, the IUCN declared the Western black rhino extinct, with the primary cause identified as poaching. Poaching is a major threat to the survival of some iconic species populations and a significant cause to declines of populations of various other important species. For example, populations of big cats, pangolins, gorillas, and many other keystone species are threatened due to poaching in Africa and Asia.

---

<sup>1</sup> *Wildlife trade is defined as any sale or exchange by people of wild animal and plant resources. This can involve live animals and plants for the pet and horticultural trades, or the trade in a diverse range of wild animal and plant products needed or prized by humans – including skins, medicinal ingredients, tourist curios, timber, fish and other food products (TRAFFIC, 2007). Wildlife trafficking is defined as the illegal cross-border trade in biological resources taken from the wild, including trade in timber and marine species (European Commission). For the purposes of this portfolio review analysis, fish and timber products that are not integrated into broader fauna-focused interventions are excluded from consideration in this study. Illicit trafficking in wildlife includes both poaching and illicit trade.*

<sup>2</sup> *Poaching is the illicit harvest of an animal, including taking, that is not the allowed species, size, age or sex; using illegal equipment to hunt or fish; failing to acquire a permit to hunt or fish; and harvesting outside of the allowed season or place. For this study, poaching is considered as part of the illegal wildlife trade (IWT). IWT is the illicit commerce in animals or their parts, usually intended to include production (harvest, transformation into a product), transport, and sale. (USAID, Measuring efforts to combat wildlife crime. A toolkit for improving action and accountability. October 2015).*

<sup>3</sup> [African Elephant Database \(AED\)](#); [IUCN](#). Accessed on October 17, 2015.

<sup>4</sup> [https://www.savetherhino.org/rhino\\_info/poaching\\_statistics](https://www.savetherhino.org/rhino_info/poaching_statistics). Accessed on October 17, 2015.

2. The upsurge in illegal killings of elephants, rhinos, and other iconic species over the past decade have led many donors to invest in anti-poaching, anti-trafficking, and demand reduction initiatives to combat illegal wildlife trade (IWT) at source, transit, and destination countries. This is evidenced by the number of strategies, programs, and projects international financial institutions, governments, non-government organizations (NGO), and foundations have recently launched to address IWT<sup>5</sup>. To enhance donor coordination and minimize potential duplication of project and program activities, it is essential to map the donor IWT investments, priority intervention areas, and align technical resources that are mobilized. This will facilitate co-financing and optimize benefits derived from funding to combat IWT in Asia and Africa.

3. A Donor Roundtable on Wildlife and Forest Crime was organized by CITES, UNDP, UNEP, UNODC, and the World Bank and held at UNDP in New York City on July 7, 2015. This meeting was hosted by UNDP, moderated by CITES Secretary-General, John Scanlon, and attended by over 30 participants that included donor representatives, UN staff, and other development partners. At this meeting, WB agreed to take the lead on a study to address donor coordination. In a separate but related effort, the Bank, as the lead implementing agency for the GEF- Global Wildlife Program, will monitor project investments and co-financing under the Program. As part of collecting information and datasets for this monitoring activity, the Bank will coordinate among donors on IWT investments and activities in targeted areas.

4. The team, led by Valerie Hickey (World Bank Practice Manager) and Claudia Sobrevila (World Bank Global Wildlife Program Manager), will undertake a an analysis of funding that is going towards anti-poaching, anti-trafficking and demand reduction strategies by major donors. Various United Nations agencies (including UNEP, UNDP, UNODC, and CITES Secretariat) and other major donors are collaborating on this effort. These draft TORs received significant comments from donors and were discussed at a Donor Roundtable meeting in Geneva, on January 14, 2016. This version has incorporated the donors' comments.

#### **Nature of the activity**

5. The study will obtain, analyze, and present data on wildlife anti-poaching, anti-trafficking and demand reduction financial investment flows from major donors globally. The first phase will focus on range, transit, and end-use countries in Africa and Asia. The short-term efforts will include a portfolio review of all IWT funding based on interviews with donors and access to donor data on IWT related projects. In the long term, assessments of IWT needs at country-, regional-, and global-levels may be conducted. The focus will be on multilateral, bilateral, and other international funds used to finance wildlife conservation efforts directly addressing the IWT crisis. The study will look at investments committed from calendar year 2010-2015, including projects that may be implemented beyond this timeframe. It will use US dollars committed to programs/projects as the basis for data gathering and

---

<sup>5</sup> For example, see [United States National Strategy for Combatting Wildlife Trafficking, 2014](#).

analysis. The intent of the analysis is to complete a study of the major donors to provide a high-level understanding of general trends and thematic priorities. Due to the short timeline for this activity, it is not intended to serve as a comprehensive evaluation of all IWT funding activity. The results and recommendations of this study will help ensure coherence and coordination in scaling up financing.

6. To accomplish this activity, the steps below will be taken. Draft investment categories, definitions and key words to guide online research and database development are included in Annex A. Annex B contains a copy of the draft questionnaire. Annex C contains a detailed draft timeline for this assignment.

- a. Review current literature and assess previous studies that looked at this issue (i.e. EU strategic approach to wildlife conservation in Africa, USAID toolkit for monitoring effectiveness of anti-poaching and anti-trafficking strategies, etc.) and leverage the respective recommendations and findings in the design and delivery of this analysis.
- b. Develop an approach and detailed timeline to obtain information from key donors and a methodology for the taxonomy that will categorize the data and guide the analysis. The approach will include use of a questionnaire/survey, online research, and minutes of interviews with key donor representatives, and data validation activities (development of approach completed).
- c. Conduct interviews with key donors and other data gathering activities to obtain baseline information and data on financial investments and key programs/projects/initiatives.
- d. Present draft survey results following UNEA 2 in Kenya, in or shortly after May 2016.
- e. Incorporate feedback from donors.
- f. Develop a report to summarize methodology, results, and recommended next steps
  - i. Report to include an introduction, objectives, methodology, results, conclusions/actionable recommendations, and appendices to include the survey used and references sourced.
  - ii. Results will display graphical and table summaries of funding patterns/trends and allocations by region, country, and thematic areas.
- g. Present draft report at the CITES Cop 17 meeting in Johannesburg.

## **Annex A – Investment Categories, Definitions and Key Words to Guide Online Research and Database Development**

The following general categories and definitions can help guide assessment of the investments and interventions considered as part of this portfolio analysis. Investment categories that provide direct support to efforts, which prevent or reduce poaching, and/or illegal trade in wildlife, including terrestrial, freshwater, and marine species (i.e. elephants, rhinos, big cats, etc.) should be considered. Activities include, but are not limited to, efforts that tackle:

### **1. Policy and legislation (PL) development**

- a. Interventions to support implementation of legally binding agreements (i.e. CITES, UNCAC and UNTOC) focused on:
  - i. Inter-sectoral policies and regulatory frameworks that incorporate wildlife conservation and management considerations
  - ii. How to enforce/implement the regulations
- b. Investments to review and strengthen laws and regulations to facilitate prosecutions of illicit wildlife trafficking, corruption, and money laundering,
- c. Customs and trade facilitation processes that include enhanced policies and procedures to deter and reduce corrupt practices related to wildlife
- d. Activities intended to engage important political figures in the fight against IWT

### **2. Law enforcement (LE)**

- a. Investments in coordination mechanisms and establishment of operational units, information handling systems, development of intelligence-led operations, and transnational law enforcement coordination focused on organized wildlife crime and anti-corruption efforts
- b. Investments to support enhanced capacity of customs officials on wildlife crime prevention and information sharing
- c. Investments to strengthen transportation/supply chain stakeholder's ability to combat IWT
- d. Investments in new and existing (detection) technologies and intelligence techniques not only to support increased interceptions of illegal trafficking of wildlife products but also to disrupt illegal activities prior to poaching
- e. Investments to build government capacity to prosecute, convict, and ensure full sentences are completed for IWT criminals
- f. Interventions focused on reducing rates of poaching, trafficking, and demand by focusing on:
  - i. Combating poachers on the ground, as well as traffickers and other illegal market participants throughout the supply chain by making arrests, prosecutions, and convictions
  - ii. Operations that target higher level operatives that support trafficking and illicit markets to trade illegal wildlife products

- g. Public private partnerships or private sector investments to combat IWT and limit use of legal transportation, financing, and other resources to knowingly or unknowingly participate in the IWT supply chain
- 3. Protected areas (PA) management to prevent poaching**
    - a. Investments that support species management, including investments to protect the natural habitats for elephants, rhinos, and other specific species. This includes interventions that focus on increasing number of species at a project site or a particular focus on known threatened species
    - b. On-the-ground support to PAs to address poaching (i.e. rangers, equipment etc.)
    - c. Investments to increase community, private, and state reserves and areas surrounding protected forests under land-use policies that mitigate wildlife poaching and promote wildlife management best practices
  - 4. Communications and awareness (CA) to raise IWT awareness and reduce demand for illegal wildlife products**
    - a. Funding of organizations to conduct outreach and communications efforts to raise awareness and reduce demand across range, transit, and end-use countries
    - b. Demand reduction efforts and campaigns to increase awareness, change consumer behavior towards consumption of illegal wildlife products, and reduction in market participants in the illegal trade
  - 5. Promoting sustainable use and alternative livelihoods (SL) to increase community benefits and avoid human-wildlife conflict**
    - a. Interventions that focus on:
      - i. Increasing incentives for communities to live with, manage wildlife, and avoid human-wildlife conflict
      - ii. Income derived from wildlife management in support of sustainable development and integrated natural resource management practices
      - iii. Providing alternative legal livelihoods to those involved in the illegal supply chain
    - b. Investments that include training, capacity building, jobs, sustainable use of wildlife products, and sustainable tourism
  - 6. Research and assessment (RA)**
    - a. Investments in decisions support tools (i.e. geospatial, analytical, etc.) at global, regional, and national levels to track and share information on wildlife crime
    - b. Support for development and maintenance of databases and communications facilities, geospatial tools, and coordination tools and applications
    - c. Investments to enhance stakeholder coordination, donor co-financing of activities, knowledge management, and monitoring and evaluation efforts
    - d. Support for research and analysis of wildlife crime

The study will use the following key words and phrases for online research and related efforts:

1. Building and strengthening institutional capacity to effectively manage wildlife
2. CITES government units
3. Community-based wildlife management
4. Community-based wildlife anti-poaching
5. Community-based wildlife monitoring
6. Control and surveillance for IWT interventions
7. Demand reduction for wildlife products
8. Elephants, rhino, big cats, other species (i.e. pangolins)
9. Endangered species poaching
10. Environmental criminology
11. GIS analysis to guide protected area management to effectively manage wildlife
12. Human-wildlife conflict
13. Iconic species poaching
14. Illegal wildlife trade (IWT)
15. Improving livelihoods to manage wildlife
16. Institutional capacity building for managing wildlife
17. Instruments for combatting wildlife crime
18. Inter-agency cooperation on IWT
19. IWT awareness raising
20. IWT behavioral change
21. IWT communications
22. IWT institutional design and structure
23. IWT related environmental policies and institutions
24. Knowledge sharing and awareness of wildlife management best practices
25. Law enforcement responses to wildlife crimes
26. Monitoring and evaluations for IWT projects and programs
27. Ranger patrols
28. Implementation of compensation for communities to engage in wildlife conservation
29. Mitigation of conflicts around established protected areas
30. Situational wildlife crime prevention
31. Species surveys
32. Support to community based organizations to increase involvement in wildlife conservation
33. Technical assistance for IWT projects and programs
34. Training and dissemination for IWT projects and programs
35. Transnational environmental crime
36. Training law enforcement
37. Wildlife anti-money laundering
38. Wildlife crime
39. Wildlife customs modernization
40. Wildlife fraud and corruption
41. Wildlife law enforcement
42. Wildlife legal frameworks

- 43. Wildlife poaching
- 44. Wildlife tourism
- 45. Wildlife trade facilitation
- 46. Wildlife trafficking

Activities that contribute to combatting illicit trafficking in wildlife but do not meet the above general categories and definitions should not be reported in this analysis. These include, but are not limited to:

1. Investments/activities focused on PA management and planning, development of and support for implementing community conservation areas, and land/coastal management planning that do not include specific interventions to address illicit trade in wildlife
2. Investments/activities that consider illegal killing of wildlife as one of several threats addressed, but exclude specific anti-poaching or anti-trafficking interventions that are planned for and implemented

Efforts to stop the illegal harvest and trade in plants and trees are critical, yet investments/activities that only address flora should not be included in this analysis. Investments that focus on flora as part of broader fauna-focused interventions can be included under this analysis.

## Annex B – Portfolio Analysis of International Funding to Tackle Illicit Trafficking in Wildlife Questionnaire

Your participation in this questionnaire is completely voluntary. Any information you provide for this study, however, will be greatly appreciated since it will enhance the results of this analysis. If you prefer to keep any information that you provide confidential, please check the appropriate box at the end of this questionnaire and it will only be included in the aggregate analysis. A copy of the results of this study will be sent to you upon request.

Please answer specific questions in this questionnaire, and provide the detailed supporting data. For donors that have larger portfolios with multiple investments, please complete the spreadsheet shown in Annex E to provide the data on investments to fund projects, campaigns, and programs your organization has **committed in the African and Asian regions from calendar year 2010 to 2015, including projects that may be implemented beyond this timeframe**. Donors with fewer investments can use this questionnaire or Annex E. Investment categories, definitions and key words of activities under consideration are highlighted in Annex A and E. Donors unable to share more detailed information can use the table at the end of this questionnaire to provide summarized information on IWT funds, countries, and categories.

Please send the information to the address provided below by **February 26, 2016**. **Thank you for your cooperation!** *If you cannot fill out the questionnaire, kindly provide any raw data that contains information on the below questions. Please contact [ewright1@worldbank.org](mailto:ewright1@worldbank.org) with any questions.*

---

Funding organization: Click here to enter text.

Your name: Click here to enter text.

1. Project title(s): Click here to enter text.
2. Funding recipients: Click here to enter text.
3. Project dates: Click here to enter a date.
4. Project location (country, province, state and site if applicable): Click here to enter text.
5. Funds committed (total or per year): Click here to enter text.
6. Funding sources (if not own sources): Click here to enter text.
7. Other co-funders and amount funded (if known) Click here to enter text.
8. Brief project synopsis: Click here to enter text.
9. Is tackling illicit trafficking in wildlife the main objective of the project? YES  NO
10. Which illicit trafficking in wildlife-related activities do(es) the project(s) include?

Combating Illicit Trafficking in Wildlife Category	Importance of activity for project (% of total Funding)					
	0%	<15%	30%	50%	70%	>85%
1. Policy and legislation (PL) development	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2. Law enforcement (LE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3. Protected areas (PA) management to prevent poaching	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4. Communications and awareness (CA) to raise IWT awareness and reduce demand for illegal wildlife products	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5. Promoting sustainable use and alternative livelihoods (SL) to increase community benefits and avoid human-wildlife conflict	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6. Research and assessment (RA)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

11. From the list above, what are the main IWT interventions your organization will focus on over the next few years?

[Click here to enter text.](#)

12. What are the geographical priority areas?

[Click here to enter text.](#)

13. Do you wish to keep this information confidential? YES  NO

Broad IWT Categories	List of Countries, Programs, and/or Projects Across Key IWT Challenges (2010-2015)							Comments
	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Total	
1. Policy and legislation (PL) development								
2. Law enforcement (LE)								
3. Protected areas (PA) management								
4. Communications and awareness								
5. Promoting sustainable use and alternative livelihoods (SL)								
6. Research and assessment (RA)								
<b>Total - # of IWT Projects</b>								
<b>Total – Committed IWT Amount (USD \$ in Thousands)</b>								

### Annex C – Detailed Tasks, Timeline, Input Required, and Deliverables

Task #	Task Description	Timeline	Input from WB Leadership	Input from Donors	Deliverable
1	Develop an approach to obtain information from key donors and a methodology for the taxonomy that will categorize the data and guide the analysis. The approach should include use of a questionnaire/survey, online research, interviews with key donor representatives, and data validation activities	01/07/2016	Kick-off meeting to review the TOR; validate the timeline and proposed approach to complete assignment	N/A	Draft Approach, methodology, and taxonomy in word/PowerPoint/excel formats (completed)
2	Present proposed approach and methodology to key donors. Special consideration is required to document how double-counting will be avoided, and to ensure investments are targeted to anti-poaching initiatives rather than broader investments	01/15/2016	Review meeting to provide feedback on proposed analysis approach/methodology	Participate in Donor Side Event during SC66 in Geneva; identify point of contact	PowerPoint presentation (completed)
3	Update approach and methodology, as needed	01/29/2016	Review updated approach and methodology	N/A	Update Task 1 deliverables
4	Conduct literature review. Create the data gathering/analytical templates and tools; obtain approval to use them	02/05/2016	Review/approve use of tools to obtain donor data	N/A	Literature review summary; data collection templates/tools
5	Update protocol, list of donor, contacts, and timeline for data gathering activities	02/05/2016	Review meeting to approve contact list, timeline, and protocol to collect information. WB to seek additional input from representative donors, ICCWC, and/or PSC	A representative donor may be asked to provide input/feedback on the templates/tools before rolling it to all donors	Protocol, POCs, and scheduled meetings with donors to obtain required data
6	Obtain data from donors (02/26/2016); conduct interviews with donors and other data gathering activities to assess data	03/07/2016-04/29/2016	Email to donors to inform them of the upcoming activities and request their active participation/support; follow-up with individual donors to facilitate data exchange (as needed)	Participate in an hour long interview and submit data to WB	Literature review summary used to guide interviews (i.e. prior efforts EC, USAID, etc. have engaged in; meeting minutes)
7	Analyze data obtained to highlight results	06/10/2016	Review draft data analysis; provide comments and additional direction to project team. WB to seek input from ICCWC and PSC	N/A	Draft analysis of information obtained from donors

Task #	Task Description	Timeline	Input from WB Leadership	Input from Donors	Deliverable
8	Present draft summary results following UNEA 2	06/15/2016	Open session on portfolio analysis with donors	Participate in portfolio analysis meeting; provide feedback on draft results	Presentation and supporting information for the donor meeting
9	Incorporate feedback from donors	07/15/2016	N/A	N/A	Updated draft analysis
10	Develop a draft report to address donor comments on data analysis and summarize methodology, results, and recommended next steps	08/31/2016	Review draft report (V0); provide comments and additional direction to project team. WB to seek input from ICCWC and PSC	Provide feedback on draft report	Draft report (V0) and updated database
11	Present draft report (V1) at CITES CoP 17, South Africa for final feedback	09/25/2016	N/A	Participate in donor meeting to provide feedback on draft report (V1)	Draft report (V1)
12	Collaboration with reports production team to publish report	10/30/2016	Review final report; provide comments and additional direction to project team	N/A	Final report and updated database
13	Present final report at IWT Summit in Vietnam, in November 2016	11/25/2016	Open session on portfolio analysis with donors	Participate in portfolio analysis meeting; support communications and dissemination efforts	Presentation and supporting information for the donor meeting