

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventeenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Johannesburg (South Africa), 24 September – 5 October 2016

Summary record of the fourteenth session of Committee I

03 October 2016: 14h00 - 20h00

Chair: K. Gaynor (Ireland)

Secretariat: J. Scanlon
T. De Meulenaer
D. Kachelriess
J-C. Vasquez

Rapporteurs: B. Price
J. Caldwell
P. Cremona
F. Davis
J. Gray
M. Jenkins
E. King
J. McAlpine
C. Rutherford

Amendment of the Appendices

88. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

The Chair called for a vote on **proposal CoP17 Prop. 16** to transfer the populations of *Loxodonta africana* in Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe from Appendix II to Appendix I.

After the vote, the European Union drew attention to an apparent anomaly with its voting equipment. The Secretary-General confirmed there had initially been a problem with the record of its vote on Proposal CoP17 Prop. 16. Qatar, supported by the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Zambia, suggested that other voting records could have been affected and called for ballots on all issues that had previously been put to a vote to be recast. The Chair reassured the Committee that technicians had been instructed to check all prior votes and that any irregularities would be reported to the Parties. Qatar wished it to be placed on record that they maintained that previous votes should be rerun.

For all votes on amendment proposals in this session, the Parties agreed that the European Union would use a paper ballot representing 28 votes and all other Parties would use the electronic voting system.

At the end of the session, the Secretariat clarified that the vote had been 62 Parties in favour, 71 against and 12 abstentions (see Annex 1). Proposal CoP17 Prop. 16 to transfer the populations of the African elephant *Loxodonta africana* in Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe from Appendix II to Appendix I was rejected.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 7 to alter the annotation of the Appendix-II listing of Swaziland's Southern white rhinoceros (*Ceratotherium simum simum*) population so as to permit a limited and regulated trade in rhinoceros horn was introduced by Swaziland.

The Democratic Republic of the Congo, Japan, Namibia, South Africa, Zimbabwe and Wildlife Ranching South Africa supported the proposal citing variously: the low incidence of rhinoceros poaching in Swaziland; Swaziland's need for funds to enhance their rhinoceros conservation efforts; the proposal's accord with accepted principles of sustainable use; and a belief that the current CITES listing for rhinoceroses had not proved successful and that it would be timely to try a new approach.

Japan emphasized that poaching was still a challenge despite the decades-long ban on trade in rhino horn, and believed that Swaziland's proposal could contribute to long-term conservation of the white rhinoceros.

Bhutan, the European Union and its member States, India, Indonesia, Israel, Kenya, Nepal, the United States of America and Born Free Foundation did not support the proposal, citing variously: the greater pressures on enforcement efforts they believed would ensue, including as a result of challenges in identifying legal from laundered specimens; the potential undermining of current conservation efforts, notably "demand reduction" approaches; the likelihood that quantities of horn supplied from Swaziland would be insufficient to meet global demand and so stimulate the market; the risk that rhinoceros populations outside Swaziland would be adversely affected, an observation noted especially by Asian rhinoceros range States; and the difficulty of predicting the market response to any legalizing of trade in rhino horn.

Seeing no consensus, the Chair called for a vote. Swaziland asked that the vote be by secret ballot and received the support of more than ten Parties; this motion was therefore carried. There were 26 votes in favour of the proposal, 100 against and 17 abstentions. Proposal CoP17 Prop. 7 to alter the annotation of the Appendix-II listing of Swaziland's Southern white rhinoceros *Ceratotherium simum simum* population so as to permit a limited and regulated trade in rhinoceros horn was rejected.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 42 to include Silky shark *Carcharhinus falciformis* in Appendix II was introduced by the Bahamas and the Dominican Republic, the Maldives and Sri Lanka as co-proponents. They proposed amending the proposal so that entry into effect of the inclusion of *Carcharhinus falciformis* in Appendix II would be delayed by 12 months,

Argentina, Australia, Chile, Bahrain, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Ethiopia, Jamaica, Mexico, New Zealand, the Secretariat of the Pacific Regional Environment Programme (SPREP), and the Turtle Island Restoration Network speaking on behalf of a number of other non-governmental organisations, supported the proposal. They variously referred to the cultural importance of the species in some range States and the need to build on existing national and regional management measures such as those implemented under Regional Fisheries Management Organizations (RFMOs) to ensure the sustainability of international trade. Ethiopia noted that capacity-building tools and events relating to the sharks and rays included in the Appendices at the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties were already underway, which would help to support implementation. New Zealand queried certain aspects of the data in the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) Expert Panel Summary in Annex 5 of document CoP17 Doc. 88.3, and stated that, on the basis of their own analyses, they had concluded that the species did meet the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II.

China, Iceland, Indonesia, Japan, Qatar, Saint Kitts and Nevis and the Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center (SEAFDEC) opposed the proposal. Among their concerns were their belief that the species did not meet the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II; that the international component of the trade had declined due to reduced demand for fins in Asia; that Appendix II listing of this species does not contribute to the conservation of the species, since the meat is consumed locally and only fins are exported; that management could be achieved through national and regional management measures such as those already implemented under RFMOs; that there would be difficulties regarding implementation, particularly species identification and non-detriment finding (NDF); and that the effectiveness of implementation of the Appendix-II listings for shark and ray species adopted at the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties should be assessed prior to adopting any further similar proposals. Japan noted that the CITES Shark Portal was of limited use in supporting implementation since only they and two other Parties had submitted NDF guidelines, and they could not make NDFs on sharks and rays due to insufficient data. In addition, Japan considered those submitted by Australia and the United States to be too detailed and complicated to be of use to many Parties. Japan further noted that Appendix II listing of this species would cause a serious implementation problem, because many silky sharks are incidentally caught by purse seine fishing vessels, and brought back to ports with other fish as it is almost impossible to separate these sharks from hundreds of tons of other fish on board.

FAO gave additional detail regarding its Expert Panel Summary on the species. They noted that, while they had concluded that the species did not meet the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II, an Appendix-II listing could complement existing management measures, if properly implemented.

The Chair called for a vote on the amended proposal. Japan requested that the voting be by secret ballot, which was supported by more than ten additional Parties; this motion was therefore carried. One hundred and eleven Parties voted in favour, 30 against, and five abstained. Proposal CoP17 Prop. 42 to include Silky shark *Carcharhinus falciformis* in Appendix II amended to delay entry into effect by 12 months was accepted.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 43 to include Thresher sharks *Alopias* spp. in Appendix II was introduced by the European Union, supported by Panama, Senegal and Sri Lanka as co-proponents. They proposed amending the proposal so that entry into effect of the inclusion of *Alopias* spp. in Appendix II would be delayed by 12 months.

Argentina, Chile, Colombia, India, Peru, the Philippines, the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, SPREP, and Humane Society International also speaking on behalf of a number of other non-governmental organizations supported the proposal.

Iceland, Japan, Qatar, IWMC World Conservation Trust and the Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center (SEAFDEC) opposed the proposal, reiterating the concerns that were voiced in relation to proposal CoP17 Prop. 42.

The FAO summarized the conclusions of the Expert Panel that the species in the genus did not meet the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix II. IWMC World Conservation Trust believed that the proposal overemphasized the demand from the international shark fin market as the primary threat to these species.

The Chair called for a vote on the amended proposal. Japan requested that the voting be by secret ballot, which was supported by more than ten additional Parties; this motion was therefore carried. One hundred and eight Parties voted in favour, 29 against, and five abstained. Proposal CoP17 Prop. 43 to include Thresher sharks *Alopias* spp. in Appendix II amended to delay entry into effect by 12 months was accepted.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 44 to include the genus *Mobula* in Appendix II was introduced by Fiji, supported by Costa Rica and Ecuador, also on behalf of 20 other co-proponents, proposing an amendment to delay entry into effect of the inclusion of *Mobula* spp. in Appendix II by six months.

Cabo Verde, Canada, Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, New Zealand, and Shark Advocacy International, who spoke also on behalf of a number of other non-governmental organizations, supported the proposal, with Canada and Costa Rica emphasising their belief that the species in the genus met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II. The FAO observed that although data were sparse, there was evidence of population declines and noted that the FAO Expert Panel had also concluded that the species in the genus met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II. The Convention on Migratory Species (CMS) noted that the Parties to CMS, the great majority of whom were also CITES Parties, had included *Mobula* spp. in Appendix I of CMS in 2014. China noted it was neutral and flexible on the proposal.

Iceland, Japan and Myanmar opposed the proposal, believing that it was unclear whether the criteria for inclusion in Appendix II were met, that use was mainly confined to domestic consumption of meat, and that any international trade in gill plates was small and likely to have been overestimated. Japan felt that it was important to evaluate the conservation benefits of previous listings of other sharks and rays before making any new such listings and believed that there might be other ways forward, noting for example the positive effect that changing net mesh size had on reducing incidental catch.

The Chair called for a vote on the amended proposal. Iceland requested a secret ballot and received the support of more than ten Parties; this motion was therefore carried. One hundred and ten Parties voted in favour of the proposal, 20 against and three abstained. Proposal CoP17 Prop.44 to include the genus *Mobula* in Appendix II, amended to include a six-month delay in entry into effect, was accepted.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 45 to include Ocellate River Stingray *Potamotrygon motoro* in Appendix II was withdrawn by the Plurinational State of Bolivia.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 46 to include *Pterapogon kauderni* in Appendix II was introduced by the European Union. The proponents offered to provide assistance to Indonesia to support implementation of CITES in relation to this species and to include an annotation to delay entry into effect by 18 months.

The Lao People's Democratic Republic opposed the proposal.

Indonesia, supported by Kuwait, opposed the proposal, noting the management measures that had been undertaken, including the Banggai Cardinal Fish (BCF) Action Plan, and indicating that they sought assistance in further implementation of the Action Plan.

The United States of America considered that conservation measures to date had not been effective, noting that the FAO Expert Panel had identified local extinctions and population declines.

In response to Indonesia's concerns, the European Union proposed draft decisions as follows:

Directed to Indonesia:

17.X1 Indonesia should implement conservation and management measures to ensure the sustainability of International trade in *Pterapogon kauderni*, and report progress on these measures to the Animals Committee at its 30th meeting.

Directed to the Secretariat:

17.X2 Subject to external funding, the Secretariat shall commission a study to assess the impact of international trade on the conservation status of *Pterapogon kauderni* and to advise on suitable conservation and management measures, as appropriate.

17.X3 The Secretariat shall share the results of the study as referred to under decision 17.X2 with the Animals Committee at its 30th meeting.

Directed to the Animals Committee:

17.X4 The Animals Committee shall, at its 30th meeting, review the progress report submitted by Indonesia as referred to under decision 17.X1, as well as the results of the study as referred to under decision 17.X2, and make its recommendations to the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

Directed to donor Parties and other relevant organizations:

17.X5 Donor Parties and other relevant organizations, including FAO, are invited and encouraged to provide support to Indonesia and to the Secretariat for the purpose of implementing decisions 17.X1 to 17.X3.

Indonesia agreed to the draft decisions and, in response the European Union, agreed to withdraw the proposal. Brazil noted that they were uncomfortable accepting draft decisions at such short notice, but that they would not block consensus.

The Committee accepted the draft decisions proposed by the European Union. Proposal CoP17 Prop. 47 to include *Pterapogon kauderni* in Appendix II was withdrawn.

In the interest of time, the Chair of Committee I proposed to limit discussion of the remaining species proposals, by announcing each proposal and opening the floor only to objections so that further discussion would occur only where there was no consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 47 to include *Holacanthus clarionensis* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee.

Viet Nam, supported by Japan, concurred with the Secretariat's recommendation to reject the proposal and recommended instead that Mexico list the species in Appendix III. Mexico wished to pursue their proposal. The Chair called for a vote. The result was 69 in favour and 21 against, with 15 abstentions (see Annex 2). Proposal CoP17 Prop. 47 to include *Holacanthus clarionensis* in Appendix II was agreed.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 48 to include the family Nautilidae in Appendix II was presented to the Committee.

Cambodia opposed the proposal, noting its potential impact on livelihoods. Noting the lack of consensus the Chair called a vote. The results were 84 in favour, nine against and 10 abstentions (see Annex 3). Proposal CoP17 Prop. 48 to include the family Nautilidae in Appendix II was accepted.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 49 to include the genus *Polymita* in Appendix I was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 34 to include *Atheris desaixi* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 35 to include *Bitis worthingtoni* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 36 to include *Cyclanorbis elegans*, *Cyclanorbis senegalensis*, *Cycloderma aubryi*, *Cycloderma frenatum*, *Trionyx triunguis* and *Rafetus euphraticus* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 37 to transfer *Dyscophus antongilii* from Appendix I to Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 38 to include *Dyscophus guineti* and *D. insularis* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 39 to include *Scaphiophryne marmorata*, *S. boribory* and *S. spinosa* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee. Japan expressed doubts that the species met the criteria for listing in Appendix II, and sought clarification from Madagascar. Madagascar responded that the three species were difficult to distinguish and had overlapping ranges. Following this, the proposal was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 40 to include *Telmatobius coleus* in Appendix I was presented to the Committee. Japan suggested that inclusion in Appendix II might be more appropriate and questioned whether the species met the criteria for inclusion in Appendix I. Peru, as a co-proponent, indicated that 80% declines in recent years had been reported. The Plurinational State of Bolivia, also a co-proponent, aligned themselves with Peru and noted that this species was unique to Lake Titicaca. Following this, the proposal was accepted by consensus.

Proposal CoP17 Prop. 41 to include *Paramesotriton hongkongensis* in Appendix II was presented to the Committee and was accepted by consensus.

The Secretariat reported back on efforts to confirm the accuracy of previous votes in Committee I. All votes held prior to 3 October were believed to have accurately reflected the European Union as 28 votes. However, three votes held on 3 October, namely on proposals CoP17 Props 14 and 15 at the Committee's thirteenth session and on proposal CoP17 Prop. 16 at the start of the present session were believed to have recorded the European Union as one vote rather than 28 votes. The Secretariat confirmed that under the secret ballot for proposals CoP17 Props 14 and 15 the European Union had voted to oppose the proposals and as such the error had had no impact on the outcome of the votes. Under proposal CoP17 Prop. 14, the amended count of votes opposing the proposal (to include the 28 votes of the European Union) was 100. For proposal CoP17 Prop. 15, the amended count of votes opposing the proposal (to include the 28 votes of the European Union) was 107. They noted that the correct results would be included in the summary record and expressed their gratitude to the Committee for their understanding and patience.

The meeting was closed at 20h00.

Voting report sorted by nameConference Name **Com 1 Session 14**Customer field 1 PM
Customer field 2 Track 17**Subject Title**

Prop 16

Long description

Short description

Chairman CHAIR
 Chairman Panel 01
 Chairman Panel 02
 Chairman Panel 03
 Chairman Panel 05
 Chairman Panel 06
 Chairman Panel 07

Total Vote Result

Voting start time 10/3/2016 2:38:49 PM
 Voting stop time 10/3/2016 2:39:21 PM
 Voting Configuration EU SUBSTANTIVE (2/3)
 Voting mode Open
 Vote Result rejected

YES 62
 ABSTAIN 12
 NO 44

Group Voting Result

Group	Present	Absent	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted
Nations	147	3	62	12	44	29
Total Results	147	3	62	12	44	29

Individual Voting Result

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
613	Albania ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
615	Angola ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
616	Antigua and Barbuda ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
617	Argentina ()	X		X			2:39:04 PM
619	Australia ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
620	Austria ()	X				X	
622	Bahamas ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
701	Bahrain ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
702	Bangladesh ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
704	Belarus ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
705	Belgium ()	X				X	
706	Belize ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM
707	Benin ()	X	X				2:38:55 PM
708	Bhutan ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
	Bolivia ()						
711	Botswana ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
712	Brazil ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
714	Bulgaria ()	X				X	
715	Burkina Faso ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
717	Cabo Verde ()	X		X			2:38:52 PM
718	Cambodia ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
719	Cameroon ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
720	Canada ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
721	Central African Republic ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
722	Chad ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
801	Chile ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
802	China ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
803	Colombia ()	X		X			2:38:51 PM
804	Comoros ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
805	Congo ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
806	Costa Rica ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
807	Côte d'Ivoire ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
808	Croatia ()	X				X	
809	Cuba ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
810	Cyprus ()	X				X	
811	Czech Republic ()	X				X	
812	D R Congo ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
813	Denmark ()	X				X	
816	Dominican Republic ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
817	Ecuador ()	X		X			2:38:51 PM
818	Egypt ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
822	Estonia ()	X				X	
903	Ethiopia ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
904	European Union ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
905	Fiji ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
906	Finland ()	X				X	
907	France ()	X				X	
908	Gabon ()	X	X				2:38:56 PM
909	Gambia ()	X			X		2:39:09 PM
	Georgia ()						
911	Germany ()	X				X	
912	Ghana ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
913	Greece ()	X				X	
914	Grenada ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
915	Guatemala ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
916	Guinea ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
918	Guyana ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
919	Honduras ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
920	Hungary ()	X				X	
106	Iceland ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
107	India ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
108	Indonesia ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
109	Iran ()	X	X				2:38:55 PM
111	Ireland ()	X				X	
112	Israel ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
113	Italy ()	X				X	
114	Jamaica ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
115	Japan ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
116	Jordan ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
201	Kenya ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
202	Kuwait ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
204	Lao PDR ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
205	Latvia ()	X				X	
206	Lebanon ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
208	Liberia ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
210	Liechtenstein ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
211	Lithuania ()	X				X	
212	Luxembourg ()	X				X	
213	Madagascar ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
214	Malawi ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
215	Malaysia ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
216	Maldives ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
217	Mali ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
218	Malta ()	X				X	
219	Mauritania ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
220	Mauritius ()	X	X				2:38:58 PM
221	Mexico ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
222	Monaco ()	X		X			2:38:59 PM
302	Montenegro ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
303	Morocco ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
304	Mozambique ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM
305	Myanmar ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
306	Namibia ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM
307	Nepal ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
308	Netherlands ()	X				X	
309	New Zealand ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
310	Nicaragua ()	X	X				2:38:55 PM
311	Niger ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
312	Nigeria ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
313	Norway ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
314	Oman ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
315	Pakistan ()	X		X			2:38:52 PM
317	Panama ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
320	Peru ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
321	Philippines ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
322	Poland ()	X				X	
401	Portugal ()	X				X	
402	Qatar ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
403	Rep of Korea ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM
404	Republic of Moldova ()	X			X		2:38:58 PM
405	Romania ()	X				X	
406	Russian Federation ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
407	Rwanda ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
408	Saint Kitts and Nevis ()	X				X	
409	Saint Lucia ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
411	Samoa ()	X		X			2:38:52 PM
414	Saudi Arabia ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
415	Senegal ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
417	Seychelles ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
418	Sierra Leone ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
419	Singapore ()	X		X			2:38:52 PM
420	Slovakia ()	X				X	
421	Slovenia ()	X				X	
501	Somalia ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
503	South Africa ()	X			X		2:38:58 PM
504	Spain ()	X				X	
505	Sri Lanka ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
410	St. Vincent & Grenadines ()	X			X		2:38:57 PM
506	Sudan ()	X		X			2:38:59 PM
508	Swaziland ()	X			X		2:38:53 PM
509	Sweden ()	X				X	
510	Switzerland ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
511	Syrian Arab Republic ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
512	Tajikistan ()	X			X		2:38:55 PM
602	Tanzania ()	X			X		2:38:55 PM
513	Thailand ()	X		X			2:38:55 PM
515	Togo ()	X	X				2:38:53 PM
517	Trinidad and Tobago ()	X	X				2:38:54 PM
518	Tunisia ()	X	X				2:38:51 PM
519	Turkey ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
522	UAE ()	X		X			2:38:57 PM
520	Uganda ()	X	X				2:38:52 PM
	Ukraine ()						

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
601	United Kingdom ()	X				X	
604	Uruguay ()	X			X		2:38:55 PM
603	USA ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM
607	Venezuela ()	X		X			2:38:53 PM
608	Vietnam ()	X			X		2:38:52 PM
610	Zambia ()	X			X		2:38:51 PM
611	Zimbabwe ()	X			X		2:38:54 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name **Com 1 Session 14**

10/3/2016

Customer field 1 PM
Customer field 2 Track 17

Subject Title

Prop 47

Long description

Short description

Chairman CHAIR
 Chairman Panel 01
 Chairman Panel 02
 Chairman Panel 03
 Chairman Panel 05
 Chairman Panel 06
 Chairman Panel 07

Total Vote Result

Voting start time 10/3/2016 7:37:04 PM
 Voting stop time 10/3/2016 7:37:35 PM
 Voting Configuration EU SUBSTANTIVE (2/3)
 Voting mode Open
 Vote Result rejected

YES 41
 ABSTAIN 15
 NO 21

Group Voting Result

Group	Present	Absent	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted
Nations	107	43	41	15	21	30
Total Results	107	43	41	15	21	30

Individual Voting Result

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
613	Albania ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
615	Angola ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
	Antigua and Barbuda ()						
617	Argentina ()	X	X				7:37:10 PM
619	Australia ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
620	Austria ()	X				X	
622	Bahamas ()	X	X				7:37:05 PM
	Bahrain ()						
	Bangladesh ()						
	Belarus ()						
705	Belgium ()	X				X	
706	Belize ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
	Benin ()						
	Bhutan ()						
709	Bolivia ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
711	Botswana ()	X			X		7:37:07 PM
712	Brazil ()	X		X			7:37:05 PM
714	Bulgaria ()	X				X	
715	Burkina Faso ()	X		X			7:37:06 PM
717	Cabo Verde ()	X	X				7:37:14 PM
718	Cambodia ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
719	Cameroon ()	X		X			7:37:09 PM
720	Canada ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM
	Central African Republic ()						
	Chad ()						
801	Chile ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
802	China ()	X		X			7:37:07 PM
803	Colombia ()	X	X				7:37:05 PM
	Comoros ()						
	Congo ()						
806	Costa Rica ()	X	X				7:37:09 PM
	Côte d'Ivoire ()						
808	Croatia ()	X				X	
809	Cuba ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
810	Cyprus ()	X				X	
811	Czech Republic ()	X				X	
	D R Congo ()						
813	Denmark ()	X				X	
816	Dominican Republic ()	X	X				7:37:10 PM
817	Ecuador ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
818	Egypt ()	X	X				7:37:05 PM
822	Estonia ()	X				X	
	Ethiopia ()						
904	European Union ()	X				X	
905	Fiji ()	X	X				7:37:05 PM
906	Finland ()	X				X	
907	France ()	X				X	
908	Gabon ()	X		X			7:37:15 PM
	Gambia ()						
	Georgia ()						
911	Germany ()	X				X	
912	Ghana ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
913	Greece ()	X				X	
	Grenada ()						
915	Guatemala ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
	Guinea ()						
918	Guyana ()	X		X			7:37:06 PM
919	Honduras ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
920	Hungary ()	X				X	
106	Iceland ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM
107	India ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
108	Indonesia ()	X			X		7:37:10 PM
109	Iran ()	X		X			7:37:11 PM
111	Ireland ()	X				X	
112	Israel ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
113	Italy ()	X				X	
114	Jamaica ()	X	X				7:37:08 PM
115	Japan ()	X			X		7:37:05 PM
116	Jordan ()	X	X				7:37:08 PM
201	Kenya ()	X	X				7:37:12 PM
202	Kuwait ()	X		X			7:37:07 PM
204	Lao PDR ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM
205	Latvia ()	X				X	
206	Lebanon ()	X		X			7:37:05 PM
	Liberia ()						
	Liechtenstein ()						
	Lithuania ()						
212	Luxembourg ()	X				X	
213	Madagascar ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
	Malawi ()						
215	Malaysia ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM
216	Maldives ()	X	X				7:37:08 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
	Mali ()						
218	Malta ()	X				X	
	Mauritania ()						
	Mauritius ()						
221	Mexico ()	X	X				7:37:08 PM
222	Monaco ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
	Montenegro ()						
	Morocco ()						
	Mozambique ()						
305	Myanmar ()	X			X		7:37:06 PM
	Namibia ()						
	Nepal ()						
308	Netherlands ()	X				X	
309	New Zealand ()	X			X		7:37:07 PM
310	Nicaragua ()	X	X				7:37:09 PM
	Niger ()						
312	Nigeria ()	X	X				7:37:31 PM
313	Norway ()	X			X		7:37:11 PM
314	Oman ()	X		X			7:37:13 PM
315	Pakistan ()	X		X			7:37:06 PM
317	Panama ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
320	Peru ()	X	X				7:37:05 PM
321	Philippines ()	X			X		7:37:08 PM
322	Poland ()	X				X	
401	Portugal ()	X				X	
402	Qatar ()	X		X			7:37:17 PM
403	Rep of Korea ()	X			X		7:37:12 PM
	Republic of Moldova ()						
405	Romania ()	X				X	
406	Russian Federation ()	X		X			7:37:08 PM
	Rwanda ()						
	Saint Kitts and Nevis ()						
409	Saint Lucia ()	X	X				7:37:09 PM
	Samoa ()						
414	Saudi Arabia ()	X	X				7:37:11 PM
415	Senegal ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
417	Seychelles ()	X				X	
	Sierra Leone ()						
419	Singapore ()	X			X		7:37:08 PM
420	Slovakia ()	X				X	
421	Slovenia ()	X				X	
	Somalia ()						
503	South Africa ()	X			X		7:37:07 PM
504	Spain ()	X				X	
505	Sri Lanka ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
410	St. Vincent & Grenadines ()	X			X		7:37:07 PM
506	Sudan ()	X		X			7:37:07 PM
	Swaziland ()						
509	Sweden ()	X				X	
510	Switzerland ()	X			X		7:37:05 PM
	Syrian Arab Republic ()						
	Tajikistan ()						
602	Tanzania ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
513	Thailand ()	X			X		7:37:05 PM
515	Togo ()	X			X		7:37:07 PM
	Trinidad and Tobago ()						
	Tunisia ()						
519	Turkey ()	X			X		7:37:19 PM
522	UAE ()	X		X			7:37:15 PM
	Uganda ()						
	Ukraine ()						

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
601	United Kingdom ()	X				X	
604	Uruguay ()	X	X				7:37:07 PM
603	USA ()	X	X				7:37:06 PM
607	Venezuela ()	X	X				7:37:08 PM
608	Vietnam ()	X			X		7:37:05 PM
610	Zambia ()	X	X				7:37:15 PM
611	Zimbabwe ()	X				X	

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name **Com 1 Session 14**

10/3/2016

Customer field 1 PM
Customer field 2 Track 17

Subject Title

Prop 48

Long description

Short description

Chairman CHAIR
 Chairman Panel 01
 Chairman Panel 02
 Chairman Panel 03
 Chairman Panel 05
 Chairman Panel 06
 Chairman Panel 07

Total Vote Result

Voting start time 10/3/2016 7:42:53 PM
 Voting stop time 10/3/2016 7:43:25 PM
 Voting Configuration EU SUBSTANTIVE (2/3)
 Voting mode Open
 Vote Result Accepted

YES 56
 ABSTAIN 10
 NO 9

Group Voting Result

Group	Present	Absent	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted
Nations	107	43	56	10	9	32
Total Results	107	43	56	10	9	32

Individual Voting Result

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
613	Albania ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
615	Angola ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
	Antigua and Barbuda ()						
617	Argentina ()	X	X				7:42:58 PM
619	Australia ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
620	Austria ()	X				X	
622	Bahamas ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Bahrain ()						
	Bangladesh ()						
	Belarus ()						
705	Belgium ()	X				X	
706	Belize ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Benin ()						
	Bhutan ()						
709	Bolivia ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
711	Botswana ()	X	X				7:43:05 PM
712	Brazil ()	X	X				7:43:05 PM
714	Bulgaria ()	X				X	
715	Burkina Faso ()	X		X			7:42:56 PM
717	Cabo Verde ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
718	Cambodia ()	X			X		7:42:55 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
719	Cameroon ()	X		X			7:42:59 PM
720	Canada ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Central African Republic ()						
	Chad ()						
801	Chile ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
802	China ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
803	Colombia ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Comoros ()						
	Congo ()						
806	Costa Rica ()	X	X				7:43:02 PM
	Côte d'Ivoire ()						
808	Croatia ()	X				X	
809	Cuba ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
810	Cyprus ()	X				X	
811	Czech Republic ()	X				X	
	D R Congo ()						
813	Denmark ()	X				X	
816	Dominican Republic ()	X	X				7:42:59 PM
817	Ecuador ()	X	X				7:43:07 PM
818	Egypt ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
822	Estonia ()	X				X	
	Ethiopia ()						
904	European Union ()	X				X	
905	Fiji ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
906	Finland ()	X				X	
907	France ()	X				X	
908	Gabon ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Gambia ()						
	Georgia ()						
911	Germany ()	X				X	
912	Ghana ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
913	Greece ()	X				X	
	Grenada ()						
915	Guatemala ()	X	X				7:43:03 PM
	Guinea ()						
918	Guyana ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
919	Honduras ()	X	X				7:42:58 PM
920	Hungary ()	X				X	
106	Iceland ()	X		X			7:42:58 PM
107	India ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
108	Indonesia ()	X			X		7:42:55 PM
109	Iran ()	X		X			7:42:57 PM
111	Ireland ()	X				X	
112	Israel ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
113	Italy ()	X				X	
114	Jamaica ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
115	Japan ()	X		X			7:42:57 PM
116	Jordan ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
201	Kenya ()	X	X				7:42:59 PM
202	Kuwait ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
204	Lao PDR ()	X				X	
205	Latvia ()	X				X	
206	Lebanon ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Liberia ()						
	Liechtenstein ()						
	Lithuania ()						
212	Luxembourg ()	X				X	
213	Madagascar ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
	Malawi ()						
215	Malaysia ()	X			X		7:42:55 PM
216	Maldives ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
	Mali ()						
218	Malta ()	X				X	
	Mauritania ()						
	Mauritius ()						
221	Mexico ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
222	Monaco ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
	Montenegro ()						
	Morocco ()						
	Mozambique ()						
305	Myanmar ()	X			X		7:42:55 PM
	Namibia ()						
	Nepal ()						
308	Netherlands ()	X				X	
309	New Zealand ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
310	Nicaragua ()	X				X	
	Niger ()						
312	Nigeria ()	X	X				7:43:08 PM
313	Norway ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
314	Oman ()	X			X		7:42:55 PM
315	Pakistan ()	X		X			7:42:56 PM
317	Panama ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
320	Peru ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
321	Philippines ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
322	Poland ()	X				X	
401	Portugal ()	X				X	
402	Qatar ()	X		X			7:42:57 PM
403	Rep of Korea ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
	Republic of Moldova ()						
405	Romania ()	X				X	
406	Russian Federation ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
	Rwanda ()						
	Saint Kitts and Nevis ()						
409	Saint Lucia ()	X	X				7:43:01 PM
	Samoa ()						
414	Saudi Arabia ()	X		X			7:42:55 PM
415	Senegal ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
417	Seychelles ()	X				X	
	Sierra Leone ()						
419	Singapore ()	X			X		7:42:57 PM
420	Slovakia ()	X				X	
421	Slovenia ()	X				X	
	Somalia ()						
503	South Africa ()	X	X				7:42:58 PM
504	Spain ()	X				X	
505	Sri Lanka ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
410	St. Vincent & Grenadines ()	X			X		7:42:56 PM
506	Sudan ()	X		X			7:42:56 PM
	Swaziland ()						
509	Sweden ()	X				X	
510	Switzerland ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
	Syrian Arab Republic ()						
	Tajikistan ()						
602	Tanzania ()	X	X				7:43:05 PM
513	Thailand ()	X			X		7:42:59 PM
515	Togo ()	X			X		7:42:57 PM
	Trinidad and Tobago ()						
	Tunisia ()						
519	Turkey ()	X	X				7:43:13 PM
522	UAE ()	X		X			7:42:56 PM
	Uganda ()						
	Ukraine ()						

Voting report sorted by name

Conference Name

Com 1 Session 14

10/3/2016

Seat Number	Name	Present	YES	ABSTAIN	NO	Not voted	Time
601	United Kingdom ()	X				X	
604	Uruguay ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
603	USA ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
607	Venezuela ()	X	X				7:42:55 PM
608	Vietnam ()	X	X				7:42:56 PM
610	Zambia ()	X	X				7:42:57 PM
611	Zimbabwe ()	X				X	