

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Doha (Qatar), 13-25 March 2010

Summary record of the fifth plenary session

25 March 2010: 09h10-12h00

Chair: G. Abdulla Mohammad (Qatar)
Committee I Chair: J. Donaldson (South Africa)
Committee II Chair: W. Dovey (New Zealand)
Secretariat: W. Wijnstekers
J. Barzdo
D. Morgan
J. Sellar
Rapporteurs: L. Garrett
J. Jorgenson
C. Lippai
J. Robinson

46. Tibetan antelope

The Chair of Committee II reported that, following discussion, the Secretariat had withdrawn its two draft decisions in the Annex to document CoP15 Doc. 46, and the document had been noted. This was noted.

47. Saiga antelope

The Chair of Committee I reported that six draft new or revised decisions on *Saiga antelope* had been accepted by consensus, as found in document CoP15 Com. I. 3. These were adopted.

48. Snake trade and conservation management

The Chair of Committee I reported that four draft decisions on *Snake trade and conservation management* had been accepted by consensus, as found in document CoP15 Com. I. 20. These were adopted.

49. Tortoises and freshwater turtles

The Chair of Committee I reported that five draft decisions on *Tortoises and freshwater turtles* had been accepted by consensus. These were contained in document CoP15 Com. I. 16, with a minor correction recorded in summary record CoP15 Com. I Rec. 12, and were adopted.

50. Hawksbill turtle

The Chair of Committee I reported that a draft decision on *Hawksbill turtle*, as contained in document CoP15 Com. I. 6, had been accepted by consensus.

Saint Lucia requested an opening of the debate as they had been unable to participate in the discussions on this matter, but had important issues that they wished to bring to the attention of the Parties. Antigua and Barbuda supported their request. Spain, on behalf of the European Union and its

Member States, opposed the opening of the debate and the matter was put to a vote (see Annex 1). The results were 40 in favour, 59 against and 30 abstentions and, accordingly, the debate was opened.

The Dominican Republic raised a point of order regarding technical problems that had prevented them from casting their vote. The Chair noted that this would not have had any effect on the outcome of the vote.

Saint Lucia expressed concern that the report in document CoP15 Doc. 50 had not been circulated to workshop participants and relevant Parties prior to its presentation at the present meeting. They proposed for consideration the following draft decision directed to the Secretariat:

The Secretariat shall collaborate with the Inter-American Convention for the Protection and Conservation of Sea Turtles (IAC), the Convention for the Protection and Development of the Marine Environment of the Wider Caribbean region (Cartagena Convention) and its Protocol Concerning Specially Protected Areas and Wildlife (SPAW Protocol), and range States in the wider Caribbean and the Western Atlantic region to:

- a) finalize the report of the regional workshop, allowing for feedback from participants and their national turtle management agencies, as well as range States of the region; and
- b) explore opportunities for cooperation, including development of joint proposals to donors, considering the final report of the regional workshop on hawksbill turtles.

This draft decision was adopted.

51. Humphead wrasse: additional management measures needed to combat IUU fishing

The Chair of Committee II reported that, after revision of the proposals by a working group, a series of draft decisions had been accepted. The final text in document CoP15 Com. II. 40 was adopted.

52. Atlantic bluefin tuna

The Chair of Committee I reported that the document had been withdrawn and this was noted.

53. Conservation and management of sharks and stingrays

The Chair of Committee I reported that two draft decisions and a draft revision of Resolution Conf. 12.6 on *Conservation and management of sharks* had been rejected following a vote (52 in favour, 36 against and 11 abstentions).

Brazil, supported by Egypt, requested the opening of the debate on the draft decision directed to range States in document CoP15 Doc. 53. With no opposition from the floor, this was granted. The draft decision on freshwater stingrays elicited no discussion and was adopted.

New Zealand, supported by Australia, asked to open the debate on the draft amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.6 in document CoP15 Doc. 53. Chile and Gabon opposed the request, noting that there had already been extensive discussion on this issue and the matter proceeded to a vote (see Annex 2). The results were 55 in favour, 60 against and 29 abstentions and, accordingly, the debate was opened.

The representative of New Zealand, as former Chair of the Animals Committee Working Group on sharks, reported that document CoP15 Inf. 70 contained proposed additional changes to the Secretariat's proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.6. Norway requested additional time be given to Parties to examine the proposed text in document CoP15 Inf. 70 and the Chair agreed to defer further discussion until the next plenary session.

54. Conservation of and trade in Coralliidae species

The Chair of Committee I reported that the document had been withdrawn by the United States of America and this was noted.

55. Trade in epiphytic cacti (Cactaceae spp.)

The Chair of Committee I reported that the draft decision on *Assessment of trade in epiphytic cacti and review of listing of Cactaceae spp. in Appendix II*, in Annex 1 of document CoP15 Doc. 55 had been accepted by consensus. This was adopted.

56. *Euphorbia* spp.

The Chair of Committee I reported that a draft decision on *Euphorbia* spp. in the Annex of document CoP15 Doc. 56 had been accepted by consensus and this was adopted.

57. *Cedrela odorata*, *Dalbergia retusa*, *D. granadillo* and *D. stevensonii*

The Chair of Committee I reported that a draft revision of Decision 14.146 and its associated Action plan for *Cedrela odorata*, *Dalbergia retusa*, *Dalbergia granadillo* and *Dalbergia stevensonii* had been accepted by consensus. The final text in document CoP15 Com. I. 2, with a minor correction noted in summary record CoP15 Com. I Rec. 12, was adopted.

58. Bigleaf mahogany

The Chair of Committee I reported that three draft decisions regarding the *Working group on bigleaf mahogany and other neotropical timber species* had been accepted by consensus and could be found in document CoP15 Com. I. 14, with minor corrections recorded in summary record CoP15 Com. I Rec. 12. He reported further that, in the English and Spanish versions of document CoP15 Com. I Rec. 12, the words "of one month" had been omitted in error from the accepted amendment, but that this would be corrected in the final version of that summary record. The draft decisions were adopted.

59. *Taxus cuspidata*

The Chair of Committee I reported that draft amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP14) on *Regulation of trade in plants* had been accepted by consensus. The text in document CoP15 Com. I. 5 was adopted.

60. Agarwood-producing taxa

The Chair of Committee I reported that two draft decisions *Regarding agarwood-producing taxa* and an amendment to Resolution Conf. 10.13 (Rev. CoP14) on *Implementation of the Convention for timber* had been accepted by consensus and could be found in document CoP15 Com. I. 4. These were adopted.

61. Report of the Central Africa Bushmeat Working Group

The Chair of Committee II reported that, following discussion of this item, the document from the Secretariat had been noted. He added that it had already been decided, under agenda item 19, that the related Decisions 14.73 and 14.74 would remain in effect. This was noted.

62. Periodic Review of the Appendices

The Chair of Committee I reported that the recommendations in document CoP15 Doc. 62 had been rejected by consensus. This was confirmed.

63. Criteria for the inclusion of species in Appendices I and II

The Chair of Committee I reported that three draft decisions on this subject had been accepted by consensus, as found in document CoP15 Com. I. 13. These were adopted.

64. Cactaceae and Orchidaceae: review of annotations

The Chair of Committee II reported that the draft decisions in document CoP15 Doc. 64 Annex had been accepted by consensus and these were adopted.

65. Orchids: annotations for species included in Appendix II

The Chair of Committee II reported that the draft decisions in document CoP15 Doc. 65 Annex had been accepted and these were adopted.

66. Annotations for tree species included in Appendices II and III

The Chair of Committee II reported that the draft decisions in document CoP15 Doc. 66 Annex had been accepted and these were adopted.

67. Inconsistent implementation of Appendix-III timber listings annotated to include only the national populations of the listing countries

The Chair of Committee II reported that the draft revision of Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP14), as presented in document CoP15 Doc. 67, had been accepted with the amendments recorded in document CoP15 Com. II Rec.12. The final text in document CoP15 Com. II. 36 was adopted.

Argentina noted an error in the Spanish version of the paragraph preceding their declaration in summary record CoP15 Com. I Rec. 14 and firmly rejected the fourth paragraph of the declaration made by the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland as this had not been expressed orally during the session. To enable the text to be included, the Chair asked that the correct wording be provided by the United Kingdom in writing to the Secretariat. In response to the United Kingdom's request to read out the paragraph in question, the Chair asked that this also be provided in writing to the Secretariat, so that it could be included in summary record CoP15 Com. I Rec. 14.

68. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Proposal CoP15 Prop. 1 was adopted without discussion.

In agreement with the recommendations from Committee I, proposals CoP15 Prop. 2 and Prop. 3 were rejected.

The United Republic of Tanzania requested that the debate on proposal CoP15 Prop. 4 be opened to discuss the first part of the proposal only, as described in paragraph two on page three of summary record Com. I Rec. 11. This was supported by Uganda but opposed by the Gambia and Liberia. A vote was taken with 43 Parties in support, 55 against, and 42 abstentions (see Annex 3) and the debate was opened.

The United Republic of Tanzania expressed concern that consideration of their proposal had been influenced by a lack of clarity about whether the so-called "nine-year resting period" agreed on at CoP14 applied to all African elephant range States or only to those with populations in Appendix II. They proposed an amended proposal which would exclude paragraph b), a one-off sale of ivory stockpiles and would read as follows:

Transfer the population of the United Republic of Tanzania from Appendix I to Appendix II with an annotation to read:

"For the exclusive purpose of the following:

- a) trade in hunting trophies for non-commercial purposes;
- b) trade in raw hides;
- c) trade in live animals to appropriate and acceptable destinations, as defined in Resolution Conf. 11.20.

The Standing Committee can decide to cause the trade in a), b) and c) above to cease partially or completely in the event of non-compliance by exporting or importing countries or in the case of proven detrimental impacts of the trade on other elephant populations as may be proposed by the CITES Secretariat.

All other specimens shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix I and the trade in them shall be regulated accordingly."

The United Republic of Tanzania felt that this amended proposal was justified because of the steady increase of its wild elephant population by 3.5 % per annum to more than 110,000 individuals, surpassing their initial goal of 106,000 individuals, elephant populations were not restricted and covered more than 400,000 km² including 45 core protected areas, and, as per listing criteria a) and b), the populations qualified for an Appendix-II listing. They noted concerns raised by other Parties regarding the status of conservation practices in the United Republic of Tanzania, but felt that adequate explanation had been provided in Committee I, referencing information documents CoP15 Inf. 58 (Rev. 1) and CoP15 Inf. 59. They reiterated their strong commitment to conservation and stressed that enabling sustainable use of the species would increase the value of elephants to local communities. In addition, they referred to objectives of the African Elephant Action Plan (AEAP), one of which was to restock depleted elephant populations. They felt that populations within the United Republic of Tanzania were sufficient to restock other States' populations, but would require an Appendix-II listing to do so.

The amended proposal was supported by Botswana, Senegal, South Africa and Uganda. Botswana, Senegal and South Africa believed that elephant populations in the United Republic of Tanzania no longer met the biological criteria for an Appendix-I listing. Senegal stated that they placed great importance on elephant conservation. They also felt that it was important to encourage Parties that exercised good conservation management and involved local communities. Botswana also felt that Parties should stick to the principles of the Convention rather than emotive arguments. Uganda noted that the scope of the proposal had now been reduced. They recognized that the United Republic of Tanzania had the second largest elephant population in Africa and that this population was now at carrying capacity. In addition, they felt that transfer of the African elephant from Appendix I to Appendix II would assist in addressing this issue. They also requested clarification from the Secretariat regarding the nine-year resting period proposed in CoP14.

The Gambia, Ghana, Kenya and Rwanda opposed the amended proposal. Ghana noted that, as a member of the African Elephant Coalition (AEC), they did not think that the United Republic of Tanzania was acting in the best interests of the AEC and believed that decisions should be made based on science rather than on the politics and policies of trade. They felt that that the proposal addressed wider economic and social matters and that discussion in Committee I had put trade ahead of species conservation. They urged increased cooperation with the AEAP and greater unity amongst African countries, but not at the expense of elephant conservation. The Gambia believed that the elephant population of the United Republic of Tanzania was relatively insignificant, considering all African range States, in terms of area and that the carrying capacity of elephants in Africa as a whole had not yet been reached.

Rwanda felt that most Parties were now tired of discussions on elephant proposals and were concerned that a transfer of populations from Appendix I to Appendix II would have negative repercussions on other elephant populations, increasing the threat of poaching and illegal trade. They believed that Parties had a duty to act on the precautionary principle integrated in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP14) and to support species conservation over trade. Kenya drew attention to the report from the panel of experts which, they felt, had been very clear. They noted that, whilst it recognized that elephant populations in the United Republic of Tanzania were now the second largest in Africa, the criteria to transfer populations from Appendix I to Appendix II could not be based on biological criteria alone, and also required that issues of trade regulation be addressed. They believed that the nine-year resting period arising from CoP14 was not limited to four range States with populations in Appendix II and urged Parties to focus on the AEAP.

At the request of the United Republic of Tanzania, a secret vote was held. With 55 Parties in favour, 55 against and 34 abstentions, the amended proposal CoP15 Prop. 4 was rejected.

Zambia, requested that the debate on proposal CoP15 Prop. 5, as amended in Committee I, be opened, citing that confusion over the nine-year resting period from CoP14 had since been clarified by the Secretariat to only cover the four range States with populations in Appendix II, namely Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe. The request was supported by Uganda and Zimbabwe, but opposed by Chad and Rwanda. A vote was taken with 49 Parties in favour, 47 opposed and 46 abstaining (see Annex 4) and the debate was therefore opened.

Zambia felt that the clarification over which populations were included in the nine-year moratorium from CoP14 justified their proposal. In addition they believed that their elephant populations did not meet the biological criteria for Appendix-I listing in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP14), as noted by the Panel of Experts' report. They stated that this report had also highlighted enforcement and illegal trade control measures in place in Zambia, in addition to indicating that the management of ivory stock suggested that a level of off-take was sustainable. Zambia stated that more than USD 6,000,000 had been expended to

enhance the conservation status of their African elephant populations, as well as to promote community development in areas occupied by the species.

Malawi, Japan and Uganda supported the proposal. Uganda requested further clarification from the Secretariat regarding the decision to implement a nine-year moratorium from CoP14. The Secretariat confirmed that it had clearly stated that the moratorium on further proposals to trade ivory only applied to the four populations already in Appendix II. Japan believed that a transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II would contribute to sustainable use, improve the welfare of local communities in addition to supporting species conservation. Malawi felt that Zambia had clearly demonstrated effective management of wildlife populations, evident in increased population, good law enforcement, community involvement and the distribution of revenue from wildlife to local communities. They maintained that a transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II was important to enable benefits to be invested in local conservation programmes in addition to allowing populations to be used to restock other depleted African elephant populations.

The Congo, Rwanda and Sierra Leone, opposed the proposal. As a member of the AEC, Sierra Leone felt that, if Zambia had no intention of trading in ivory, then a transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II was unnecessary. The Congo was concerned that discussions over economic factors were taking over the environmental aspects of CITES which should be focusing on ensuring survival of species. Rwanda felt that Zambia's elephant population should remain on Appendix I and referred to the report of the panel of experts, which had suggested that population estimates varied considerably, that poaching had increased by 250 % between 2002 and 2007, and that recent seizures of ivory were reported to have originated in Zambia.

Zambia requested a vote by secret ballot. With 59 Parties in favour, 47 against, and 38 abstaining, proposal CoP15 Prop. 5 was rejected.

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.

MOTION: CoP15 Doc. 50

Reopen debate on the hawksbill turtle

VOTE TOTALS:

Yes : 40
 No : 59
 Abstain : 30

VOTE BREAKDOWN

	GROUP DETAILS		RESULTS OF VOTE			
	NAME	SIZE	Yes	No	Abstain	
	Africa	42	12	12	10	34
	Europe	41	5	29	4	38
	Asia	32	6	16	8	30
C/S	America & Carib,	26	16	1	2	19
	Oceania	6	1	1	3	5
	N America,	3	0	0	3	3

THE INDIVIDUAL RESULTS WERE AS FOLLOWS

MIC CARD DELEGATE INFORMATION

VOTE

1	1	AF Afghanistan	No
3	3	DZ Algeria	Abstain
4	4	AG Antigua and Barbuda,	Yes
5	5	AR Argentina	Abstain
6	6	AM Armenia	No
7	7	AU Australia	Abstain
8	8	AT Austria	No
9	9	AZ Azerbaijan	No
10	10	BS Bahamas	Yes
11	11	BD Bangladesh	No
14	14	BE Belgium	No
16	16	BJ Benin	No
17	17	BT Bhutan	Abstain
18	18	BO Bolivia (Plurinational State of),	No
20	20	BW Botswana	Yes
21	21	BR Brazil	
22	22	BN Brunei Darussalam,	No
23	23	BG Bulgaria	No
24	24	BF Burkina Faso,	Abstain
25	25	BI Burundi	
26	26	KH Cambodia	No
27	27	CM Cameroon	No
28	28	CA Canada	Abstain
30	30	CF Central African Republic,	Abstain
32	32	CL Chile	Yes
33	33	CN China	Yes
34	34	CO Colombia	Yes
36	36	CG Congo	No
37	37	CR Costa Rica,	Yes
39	39	HR Croatia	Abstain
40	901	CU Cuba	Yes
41	41	CY Cyprus	No
42	42	CZ Czech Republic,	No
43	43	CD Democratic Republic of the Congo,	No
44	44	DK Denmark	No
46	46	DM Dominica	Yes

47	47	DO Dominican Republic,	
48	48	EC Ecuador	Yes
49	49	EG Egypt	No
50	50	SV El Salvador,	
51	902	GQ Equatorial Guinea,	No
52	52	ER Eritrea	Abstain
53	53	EE Estonia	No
54	54	ET Ethiopia	
55	907	FJ Fiji	
56	56	FI Finland	No
57	57	FR France	No
58	58	GA Gabon	No
59	59	GM Gambia	Abstain
60	60	GE Georgia	No
61	61	DE Germany	No
62	62	GH Ghana	Abstain
63	63	GR Greece	No
64	64	GD Grenada	Yes
65	65	GT Guatemala	Yes
66	66	GN Guinea	Yes
67	67	GW Guinea-Bissau	No
68	68	GY Guyana	Yes
69	69	HN Honduras	Abstain
70	70	HU Hungary	No
71	71	IS Iceland	Yes
72	72	IN India	No
73	73	ID Indonesia	No
74	74	IR Iran (Islamic Republic of),	No
75	75	IE Ireland	No
76	76	IL Israel	
77	77	IT Italy	No
78	78	JM Jamaica	Yes
79	79	JP Japan	Yes
80	80	JO Jordan	Yes
82	82	KE Kenya	Abstain
83	83	KW Kuwait	Yes
84	84	KG Kyrgyzstan	Abstain
85	85	LA Lao People's Democratic Republic,	Abstain
86	86	LV Latvia	No
88	88	LR Liberia	Yes
89	89	LY Libyan Arab Jamahiriya,	
90	90	LI Liechtenstein	Yes
92	92	LU Luxembourg	
93	93	MG Madagascar	Yes
94	94	MW Malawi	Yes
95	95	MY Malaysia	No
96	96	ML Mali	No
97	97	MT Malta	No
98	98	MR Mauritania	
99	99	MU Mauritius	Abstain
100	100	MX Mexico	Abstain
101	101	MC Monaco	Yes
102	102	MN Mongolia	No
103	103	ME Montenegro	
104	104	MA Morocco	No
105	105	MZ Mozambique	Abstain
106	106	MM Myanmar	No
107	107	NA Namibia	Yes
108	108	NP Nepal	Abstain
109	109	NL Netherlands	No
110	110	NZ New Zealand,	No
111	111	NI Nicaragua	
112	112	NE Niger	Abstain
113	113	NG Nigeria	No

114	114	NO Norway	Abstain
115	115	OM Oman	Abstain
116	116	PK Pakistan	Abstain
117	117	PW Palau	Abstain
118	118	PA Panama	
121	121	PE Peru	Yes
122	122	PH Philippines	No
123	123	PL Poland	No
124	124	PT Portugal	No
125	125	QA Qatar	No
126	126	KR Republic of Korea,	Yes
127	127	MD Republic of Moldova,	
128	128	RO Romania	No
129	129	RU Russian Federation,	Yes
131	131	KN Saint Kitts and Nevis,	Yes
132	132	LC Saint Lucia,	Yes
133	133	VC Saint Vincent and the Grenadines,	
134	134	WS Samoa	Abstain
137	137	SA Saudi Arabia,	Yes
138	138	SN Senegal	Yes
139	139	RS Serbia	Abstain
141	141	SL Sierra Leone,	
142	142	SG Singapore	Abstain
143	143	SK Slovakia	No
144	144	SI Slovenia	No
147	147	ZA South Africa,	Yes
148	148	ES Spain	No
149	149	LK Sri Lanka,	No
150	150	SD Sudan	
151	151	SR Suriname	
152	152	SZ Swaziland	
153	153	SE Sweden	No
154	154	CH Switzerland	Abstain
155	155	SY Syrian Arab Republic,	No
156	156	TH Thailand	No
158	158	TG Togo	
160	160	TN Tunisia	No
161	161	TR Turkey	No
162	162	UG Uganda	Yes
163	163	UA Ukraine	Yes
164	164	AE United Arab Emirates,	
165	165	GB United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland,	No
166	166	TZ United Republic of Tanzania,	Yes
167	167	US United States of America,	Abstain
168	168	UY Uruguay	Yes
170	170	VU Vanuatu	Yes
172	172	VN Viet Nam,	No
173	173	YE Yemen	Abstain
174	906	ZM Zambia	Yes
175	175	ZW Zimbabwe	Yes

MOTION: CoP15 Doc. 53

Reopen debate on *Conservation and management of sharks and stingrays*

Regarding sharks only (12.6)

VOTE TOTALS:

Yes : 55
No : 60
Abstain : 29

VOTE BREAKDOWN

	GROUP DETAILS		RESULTS OF VOTE			
	NAME	SIZE	Yes	No	Abstain	
	Africa	42	6	23	9	38
	Europe	41	31	6	3	40
	Asia	32	8	12	12	32
C/S	America & Carib,	26	6	16	3	25
	Oceania	6	4	1	1	6
	N America,	3	0	2	1	3

THE INDIVIDUAL RESULTS WERE AS FOLLOWS

MIC CARD DELEGATE INFORMATION

VOTE

1	1	AF Afghanistan	Abstain
3	3	DZ Algeria	Abstain
4	4	AG Antigua and Barbuda,	No
5	5	AR Argentina	No
6	6	AM Armenia	Yes
7	7	AU Australia	Yes
8	8	AT Austria	Yes
9	9	AZ Azerbaijan	Yes
10	10	BS Bahamas	Yes
11	11	BD Bangladesh	Yes
14	14	BE Belgium	Yes
16	16	BJ Benin	No
17	17	BT Bhutan	Abstain
18	18	BO Bolivia (Plurinational State of),	No
20	20	BW Botswana	No
21	21	BR Brazil	Yes
22	22	BN Brunei Darussalam,	No
23	23	BG Bulgaria	Yes
24	24	BF Burkina Faso,	Abstain
25	25	BI Burundi	No
26	26	KH Cambodia	No
27	27	CM Cameroon	No
28	28	CA Canada	No
30	30	CF Central African Republic,	No
32	32	CL Chile	No
33	33	CN China	Abstain
34	34	CO Colombia	Yes
36	36	CG Congo	No
37	37	CR Costa Rica,	No
39	39	HR Croatia	Yes
40	901	CU Cuba	No
41	41	CY Cyprus	Yes
42	42	CZ Czech Republic,	Yes
43	43	CD Democratic Republic of the Congo,	Abstain
44	44	DK Denmark	Yes

46	46	DM	Dominica	No
47	47	DO	Dominican Republic,	No
48	48	EC	Ecuador	Yes
49	49	EG	Egypt	Yes
50	50	SV	El Salvador,	No
51	902	GQ	Equatorial Guinea,	No
52	52	ER	Eritrea	Abstain
53	53	EE	Estonia	Yes
54	54	ET	Ethiopia	Abstain
55	907	FJ	Fiji	Yes
56	56	FI	Finland	Yes
57	57	FR	France	Yes
58	58	GA	Gabon	No
59	59	GM	Gambia	
60	60	GE	Georgia	Yes
61	61	DE	Germany	Yes
62	62	GH	Ghana	No
63	63	GR	Greece	Yes
64	64	GD	Grenada	No
65	65	GT	Guatemala	No
66	66	GN	Guinea	No
67	67	GW	Guinea-Bissau	No
68	68	GY	Guyana	No
69	69	HN	Honduras	Yes
70	70	HU	Hungary	Yes
71	71	IS	Iceland	No
72	72	IN	India	Abstain
73	73	ID	Indonesia	No
74	74	IR	Iran (Islamic Republic of),	No
75	75	IE	Ireland	Yes
76	76	IL	Israel	Yes
77	77	IT	Italy	Yes
78	78	JM	Jamaica	Yes
79	79	JP	Japan	Yes
80	80	JO	Jordan	Yes
82	82	KE	Kenya	Yes
83	83	KW	Kuwait	No
84	84	KG	Kyrgyzstan	No
85	85	LA	Lao People's Democratic Republic,	Yes
86	86	LV	Latvia	Yes
88	88	LR	Liberia	No
89	89	LY	Libyan Arab Jamahiriya,	Abstain
90	90	LI	Liechtenstein	No
92	92	LU	Luxembourg	
93	93	MG	Madagascar	Yes
94	94	MW	Malawi	No
95	95	MY	Malaysia	No
96	96	ML	Mali	No
97	97	MT	Malta	Yes
98	98	MR	Mauritania	Yes
99	99	MU	Mauritius	
100	100	MX	Mexico	Abstain
101	101	MC	Monaco	Yes
102	102	MN	Mongolia	No
103	103	ME	Montenegro	No
104	104	MA	Morocco	No
105	105	MZ	Mozambique	Abstain
106	106	MM	Myanmar	Abstain
107	107	NA	Namibia	No
108	108	NP	Nepal	Yes
109	109	NL	Netherlands	Yes
110	110	NZ	New Zealand,	Yes
111	111	NI	Nicaragua	Abstain
112	112	NE	Niger	No

113	113	NG Nigeria	No
114	114	NO Norway	No
115	115	OM Oman	Abstain
116	116	PK Pakistan	Abstain
117	117	PW Palau	Abstain
118	118	PA Panama	Abstain
121	121	PE Peru	No
122	122	PH Philippines	Yes
123	123	PL Poland	Yes
124	124	PT Portugal	Yes
125	125	QA Qatar	No
126	126	KR Republic of Korea,	Yes
127	127	MD Republic of Moldova,	Abstain
128	128	RO Romania	Yes
129	129	RU Russian Federation,	No
131	131	KN Saint Kitts and Nevis,	No
132	132	LC Saint Lucia,	No
133	133	VC Saint Vincent and the Grenadines,	Abstain
134	134	WS Samoa	Yes
137	137	SA Saudi Arabia,	Abstain
138	138	SN Senegal	No
139	139	RS Serbia	Yes
141	141	SL Sierra Leone,	No
142	142	SG Singapore	No
143	143	SK Slovakia	Yes
144	144	SI Slovenia	Yes
147	147	ZA South Africa,	Yes
148	148	ES Spain	Yes
149	149	LK Sri Lanka,	No
150	150	SD Sudan	Yes
151	151	SR Suriname	
152	152	SZ Swaziland	
153	153	SE Sweden	Yes
154	154	CH Switzerland	Abstain
155	155	SY Syrian Arab Republic,	Abstain
156	156	TH Thailand	No
158	158	TG Togo	
160	160	TN Tunisia	No
161	161	TR Turkey	No
162	162	UG Uganda	Abstain
163	163	UA Ukraine	Abstain
164	164	AE United Arab Emirates,	Abstain
165	165	GB United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland,	Yes
166	166	TZ United Republic of Tanzania,	Abstain
167	167	US United States of America,	No
168	168	UY Uruguay	No
170	170	VU Vanuatu	No
172	172	VN Viet Nam,	Abstain
173	173	YE Yemen	Abstain
174	906	ZM Zambia	No
175	175	ZW Zimbabwe	No

(English only / Únicamente en inglés / Seulement en anglais)

MOTION: CoP15 Doc. 68

Reopen debate on amendment proposal 4 on *Loxodonta africana*

Transfer to Appendix II

VOTE TOTALS:

Yes : 43
 No : 55
 Abstain : 42

VOTE BREAKDOWN

	GROUP DETAILS		RESULTS OF VOTE			
	NAME	SIZE	Yes	No	Abstain	
	Africa	42	14	21	6	41
	Europe	41	5	7	27	39
	Asia	32	14	14	3	31
C/S	America & Carib,	26	10	8	3	21
	Oceania	6	0	3	2	5
	N America,	3	0	2	1	3

THE INDIVIDUAL RESULTS WERE AS FOLLOWS

MIC CARD DELEGATE INFORMATION

VOTE

1	1	AF Afghanistan	
3	3	DZ Algeria	No
4	4	AG Antigua and Barbuda,	Yes
5	5	AR Argentina	Abstain
6	6	AM Armenia	No
7	7	AU Australia	No
8	8	AT Austria	Abstain
9	9	AZ Azerbaijan	No
10	10	BS Bahamas	No
11	11	BD Bangladesh	Abstain
14	14	BE Belgium	Abstain
16	16	BJ Benin	No
17	17	BT Bhutan	Abstain
18	18	BO Bolivia (Plurinational State of),	Yes
20	20	BW Botswana	Yes
21	21	BR Brazil	Abstain
22	22	BN Brunei Darussalam,	No
23	23	BG Bulgaria	Abstain
24	24	BF Burkina Faso,	No
25	25	BI Burundi	Yes
26	26	KH Cambodia	No
27	27	CM Cameroon	Yes
28	28	CA Canada	No
30	30	CF Central African Republic,	No
32	32	CL Chile	No
33	33	CN China	Yes
34	34	CO Colombia	Abstain
36	36	CG Congo	No
37	37	CR Costa Rica,	No
39	39	HR Croatia	No
40	901	CU Cuba	
41	41	CY Cyprus	Abstain
42	42	CZ Czech Republic,	Abstain
43	43	CD Democratic Republic of the Congo,	Abstain
44	44	DK Denmark	Abstain

46	46	DM	Dominica	
47	47	DO	Dominican Republic,	
48	48	EC	Ecuador	Yes
49	49	EG	Egypt	Abstain
50	50	SV	El Salvador,	No
51	902	GQ	Equatorial Guinea,	Abstain
52	52	ER	Eritrea	No
53	53	EE	Estonia	Abstain
54	54	ET	Ethiopia	No
55	907	FJ	Fiji	No
56	56	FI	Finland	Abstain
57	57	FR	France	Abstain
58	58	GA	Gabon	No
59	59	GM	Gambia	No
60	60	GE	Georgia	Yes
61	61	DE	Germany	Abstain
62	62	GH	Ghana	No
63	63	GR	Greece	Abstain
64	64	GD	Grenada	Yes
65	65	GT	Guatemala	No
66	66	GN	Guinea	No
67	67	GW	Guinea-Bissau	No
68	68	GY	Guyana	Yes
69	69	HN	Honduras	No
70	70	HU	Hungary	Abstain
71	71	IS	Iceland	Yes
72	72	IN	India	No
73	73	ID	Indonesia	No
74	74	IR	Iran (Islamic Republic of),	Abstain
75	75	IE	Ireland	Abstain
76	76	IL	Israel	No
77	77	IT	Italy	Abstain
78	78	JM	Jamaica	No
79	79	JP	Japan	Yes
80	80	JO	Jordan	No
82	82	KE	Kenya	No
83	83	KW	Kuwait	Yes
84	84	KG	Kyrgyzstan	Yes
85	85	LA	Lao People's Democratic Republic,	Yes
86	86	LV	Latvia	Abstain
88	88	LR	Liberia	No
89	89	LY	Libyan Arab Jamahiriya,	Abstain
90	90	LI	Liechtenstein	Yes
92	92	LU	Luxembourg	
93	93	MG	Madagascar	Yes
94	94	MW	Malawi	Yes
95	95	MY	Malaysia	Yes
96	96	ML	Mali	No
97	97	MT	Malta	Abstain
98	98	MR	Mauritania	No
99	99	MU	Mauritius	Abstain
100	100	MX	Mexico	Abstain
101	101	MC	Monaco	No
102	102	MN	Mongolia	Yes
103	103	ME	Montenegro	
104	104	MA	Morocco	No
105	105	MZ	Mozambique	Yes
106	106	MM	Myanmar	No
107	107	NA	Namibia	Yes
108	108	NP	Nepal	No
109	109	NL	Netherlands	Abstain
110	110	NZ	New Zealand,	No
111	111	NI	Nicaragua	Yes
112	112	NE	Niger	No

113	113	NG Nigeria	No
114	114	NO Norway	Yes
115	115	OM Oman	Yes
116	116	PK Pakistan	Yes
117	117	PW Palau	Abstain
118	118	PA Panama	Yes
121	121	PE Peru	Yes
122	122	PH Philippines	Yes
123	123	PL Poland	Abstain
124	124	PT Portugal	Abstain
125	125	QA Qatar	Yes
126	126	KR Republic of Korea,	No
127	127	MD Republic of Moldova,	Yes
128	128	RO Romania	Abstain
129	129	RU Russian Federation,	No
131	131	KN Saint Kitts and Nevis,	Yes
132	132	LC Saint Lucia,	
133	133	VC Saint Vincent and the Grenadines,	
134	134	WS Samoa	Abstain
137	137	SA Saudi Arabia,	Yes
138	138	SN Senegal	Yes
139	139	RS Serbia	No
141	141	SL Sierra Leone,	No
142	142	SG Singapore	Yes
143	143	SK Slovakia	Abstain
144	144	SI Slovenia	Abstain
147	147	ZA South Africa,	Yes
148	148	ES Spain	Abstain
149	149	LK Sri Lanka,	No
150	150	SD Sudan	Abstain
151	151	SR Suriname	Yes
152	152	SZ Swaziland	Yes
153	153	SE Sweden	Abstain
154	154	CH Switzerland	Abstain
155	155	SY Syrian Arab Republic,	No
156	156	TH Thailand	No
158	158	TG Togo	
160	160	TN Tunisia	No
161	161	TR Turkey	No
162	162	UG Uganda	Yes
163	163	UA Ukraine	Abstain
164	164	AE United Arab Emirates,	No
165	165	GB United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland,	Abstain
166	166	TZ United Republic of Tanzania,	Yes
167	167	US United States of America,	No
168	168	UY Uruguay	No
170	170	VU Vanuatu	
172	172	VN Viet Nam,	Yes
173	173	YE Yemen	No
174	906	ZM Zambia	Yes
175	175	ZW Zimbabwe	Yes

MOTION: CoP15 Doc. 68

Reopen debate on amendment proposal 5 on *Loxodonta africana*

Transfer to Appendix II

VOTE TOTALS:

Yes : 49
No : 47
Abstain : 46

VOTE BREAKDOWN

	GROUP DETAILS		RESULTS OF VOTE			
	NAME	SIZE	Yes	No	Abstain	
	Africa	42	17	19	3	39
	Europe	41	5	6	28	39
	Asia	32	12	14	5	31
C/S	America & Carib,	26	13	5	7	25
	Oceania	6	1	2	2	5
	N America,	3	1	1	1	3

THE INDIVIDUAL RESULTS WERE AS FOLLOWS

MIC CARD DELEGATE INFORMATION

VOTE

			VOTE
1	1	AF Afghanistan	Abstain
3	3	DZ Algeria	No
4	4	AG Antigua and Barbuda,	Yes
5	5	AR Argentina	Abstain
6	6	AM Armenia	No
7	7	AU Australia	No
8	8	AT Austria	Abstain
9	9	AZ Azerbaijan	
10	10	BS Bahamas	Yes
11	11	BD Bangladesh	Yes
14	14	BE Belgium	Abstain
16	16	BJ Benin	No
17	17	BT Bhutan	Abstain
18	18	BO Bolivia (Plurinational State of),	Yes
20	20	BW Botswana	Yes
21	21	BR Brazil	Abstain
22	22	BN Brunei Darussalam,	No
23	23	BG Bulgaria	Abstain
24	24	BF Burkina Faso,	No
25	25	BI Burundi	
26	26	KH Cambodia	Abstain
27	27	CM Cameroon	Yes
28	28	CA Canada	No
30	30	CF Central African Republic,	No
32	32	CL Chile	No
33	33	CN China	Yes
34	34	CO Colombia	Abstain
36	36	CG Congo	No
37	37	CR Costa Rica,	Abstain
39	39	HR Croatia	No
40	901	CU Cuba	Yes
41	41	CY Cyprus	Abstain
42	42	CZ Czech Republic,	Abstain
43	43	CD Democratic Republic of the Congo,	Abstain
44	44	DK Denmark	Abstain

46	46	DM	Dominica	Yes
47	47	DO	Dominican Republic,	Abstain
48	48	EC	Ecuador	Yes
49	49	EG	Egypt	Yes
50	50	SV	El Salvador,	No
51	902	GQ	Equatorial Guinea,	Abstain
52	52	ER	Eritrea	No
53	53	EE	Estonia	Abstain
54	54	ET	Ethiopia	No
55	907	FJ	Fiji	
56	56	FI	Finland	Abstain
57	57	FR	France	Abstain
58	58	GA	Gabon	No
59	59	GM	Gambia	Yes
60	60	GE	Georgia	No
61	61	DE	Germany	Abstain
62	62	GH	Ghana	No
63	63	GR	Greece	Abstain
64	64	GD	Grenada	Yes
65	65	GT	Guatemala	No
66	66	GN	Guinea	No
67	67	GW	Guinea-Bissau	Yes
68	68	GY	Guyana	Yes
69	69	HN	Honduras	Abstain
70	70	HU	Hungary	Abstain
71	71	IS	Iceland	Yes
72	72	IN	India	No
73	73	ID	Indonesia	No
74	74	IR	Iran (Islamic Republic of),	Abstain
75	75	IE	Ireland	Abstain
76	76	IL	Israel	No
77	77	IT	Italy	Abstain
78	78	JM	Jamaica	No
79	79	JP	Japan	Yes
80	80	JO	Jordan	No
82	82	KE	Kenya	No
83	83	KW	Kuwait	Yes
84	84	KG	Kyrgyzstan	Yes
85	85	LA	Lao People's Democratic Republic,	Yes
86	86	LV	Latvia	Abstain
88	88	LR	Liberia	No
89	89	LY	Libyan Arab Jamahiriya,	Yes
90	90	LI	Liechtenstein	Abstain
92	92	LU	Luxembourg	
93	93	MG	Madagascar	Yes
94	94	MW	Malawi	Yes
95	95	MY	Malaysia	Yes
96	96	ML	Mali	No
97	97	MT	Malta	Abstain
98	98	MR	Mauritania	No
99	99	MU	Mauritius	Abstain
100	100	MX	Mexico	Abstain
101	101	MC	Monaco	No
102	102	MN	Mongolia	No
103	103	ME	Montenegro	Yes
104	104	MA	Morocco	No
105	105	MZ	Mozambique	Yes
106	106	MM	Myanmar	No
107	107	NA	Namibia	Yes
108	108	NP	Nepal	No
109	109	NL	Netherlands	Abstain
110	110	NZ	New Zealand,	No
111	111	NI	Nicaragua	Yes
112	112	NE	Niger	No

113	113	NG Nigeria	No
114	114	NO Norway	Yes
115	115	OM Oman	Yes
116	116	PK Pakistan	Yes
117	117	PW Palau	Abstain
118	118	PA Panama	Yes
121	121	PE Peru	Abstain
122	122	PH Philippines	Yes
123	123	PL Poland	Abstain
124	124	PT Portugal	Abstain
125	125	QA Qatar	Yes
126	126	KR Republic of Korea,	No
127	127	MD Republic of Moldova,	Yes
128	128	RO Romania	Abstain
129	129	RU Russian Federation,	Yes
131	131	KN Saint Kitts and Nevis,	Yes
132	132	LC Saint Lucia,	Yes
133	133	VC Saint Vincent and the Grenadines,	Yes
134	134	WS Samoa	Abstain
137	137	SA Saudi Arabia,	No
138	138	SN Senegal	Yes
139	139	RS Serbia	No
141	141	SL Sierra Leone,	No
142	142	SG Singapore	Abstain
143	143	SK Slovakia	Abstain
144	144	SI Slovenia	Abstain
147	147	ZA South Africa,	Yes
148	148	ES Spain	Abstain
149	149	LK Sri Lanka,	No
150	150	SD Sudan	
151	151	SR Suriname	
152	152	SZ Swaziland	Yes
153	153	SE Sweden	Abstain
154	154	CH Switzerland	Abstain
155	155	SY Syrian Arab Republic,	No
156	156	TH Thailand	Yes
158	158	TG Togo	
160	160	TN Tunisia	No
161	161	TR Turkey	No
162	162	UG Uganda	Yes
163	163	UA Ukraine	Abstain
164	164	AE United Arab Emirates,	No
165	165	GB United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland,	Abstain
166	166	TZ United Republic of Tanzania,	Yes
167	167	US United States of America,	Yes
168	168	UY Uruguay	No
170	170	VU Vanuatu	Yes
172	172	VN Viet Nam,	
173	173	YE Yemen	No
174	906	ZM Zambia	Yes
175	175	ZW Zimbabwe	Yes