

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fourteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
The Hague (Netherlands), 3-15 June 2007

Summary record of the 12th session of Committee I

12 June 2007: 14h10-16h25

Chairman: G. Leach (Australia)

Secretariat: W. Wijnstekers
T De Meulenaer
D. Morgan
M. Schmidt
J. Sellar
J. Vasquez

Rapporteurs: J. Gray
J. Hepp
T. Inskipp
W. Jackson

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation issues

64. Bigleaf Mahogany: report of the Working Group

The Chairman of the Bigleaf Mahogany Working Group announced proposed changes to the draft action plan in Annex XX of document CoP14 Doc. 64 (Rev. 1), consideration of which had been deferred from the Committee's morning session. These were to replace ~~multi-institutional~~ in paragraph 1 a) with inter-institutional; to replace ~~ordenamiento territorial regional~~ with manejo forestal in the Spanish version of paragraph 1 c); to add in forest management plans for after "technical standards" in paragraph 1 d); and, in paragraph 1 e) i), to make ~~forest management plans at a the national and local levels~~ read forest management plans at the national and/or local level and to replace ~~ordenamiento~~ with manejo in the Spanish version.

Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States, supported the action plan with these amendments.

The Chairwoman of the Plants Committee referred the Committee to Annex 2 of document CoP14 Doc. 64 (Rev. 1) containing draft decisions. Consideration of these had also been deferred pending exploration of possibilities for harmonizing these with a draft decision on non-detriment findings for tree species already agreed by the Committee under agenda item 8.3. She suggested that consolidated text for this last-mentioned decision and those in Annex 2 of document CoP14 Doc. 64 (Rev. 1) could be achieved by replacing ~~Before the 15th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the Plants Committee shall: a) draft guidelines for making non detriment findings for tree species; and;~~ with a) The Plants Committee shall develop principles, criteria and indicators on the formulation

of non-detriment findings for those taxa of high priority as timber species, *Prunus africana* and other medicinal species and in the first draft decision directed to the Plants Committee and by deleting the before “guidelines” and replacing mentioned in Decision 14.XX after “guidelines” with on writing non-detriment findings for tree species in the wild in the first draft decision to the Secretariat in Annex 2 of document CoP14 Doc. 64 (Rev. 1).

Document CoP14 Doc. 64 (Rev. 1), so amended, was agreed by consensus.

53. Elephants

53.2. Monitoring of illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens

The Chairman reopened discussion from the previous session on document CoP14 Doc. 53.2 concerning the most recent ETIS assessment.

The Democratic Republic of the Congo emphasized that the assessment covered a period of intense internal conflict in their country when there had been little ability to control trade in ivory. They informed the Committee of their current efforts to protect elephant populations and stop illegal trafficking in ivory now that they were in a more stable period. The United Arab Emirates noted concerns about the ETIS assessment, especially the fact they had been placed in a cluster of countries that was considered to have poor law enforcement effort. They stated that they had undergone many changes recently, that their legislation was classed as Category 1 by the National Legislation Project, and that they had seized many pieces of ivory in transit.

China sought clarification from the ETIS Coordinator regarding the assertion that China was the single driving force behind illegal ivory trade, even though Chinese seizures accounted for less than 1/10th of seizures globally. China also disagreed with the findings of an International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW) report submitted at the 54th meeting of the Standing Committee and similarly did not agree with the findings of Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) reports on this issue. IFAW clarified that they provided accurate data to the Chinese Government and to the Conference of the Parties, and that they sought to assist Parties with enhanced enforcement. EIA remarked that the MIKE programme had yet to show causality between seizures of ivory and elephant poaching and urged China to take a stronger role in ensuring stricter regulation of their domestic ivory trade, as they believed China posed a big threat to African elephants.

Kenya supported Botswana’s previous remarks concerning the impact of governance on curtailing ivory trade and offered to work cooperatively to improve governance in elephant range States. Côte d'Ivoire raised the need to analyse the relationship between regulated markets and illegal ivory trade.

TRAFFIC addressed the queries and concerns of Parties and observers regarding the ETIS assessment, noting that they verified all submissions to ETIS, and that each Party was sent a country report with a summary of each relevant seizure to ensure transparency and provide a feedback mechanism. They noted that the Secretariat’s comments regarding the link to the National Legislation Project should allay Thailand’s concerns expressed earlier on this matter. They referred to Table 3 on page 6 of the document and highlighted the *measure of scale* and *measure of activity of period* as factors that weighed heavily in determining China’s role in illegal trade of ivory. They confirmed the assessment did refer to the ranking of domestic markets, both regulated and unregulated. TRAFFIC stated they were willing to meet with any Parties that wished to discuss the ETIS assessment.

The Committee noted the assessment.

Amendment of the Appendices

68. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Namibia introduced proposal CoP14 Prop. 4. South Africa, at their behest, then read in the record document CoP14 Inf. 53 which contained amendments related to a potential compromise between the divergent views in proposals CoP14 Prop. 4, 5 and 6.

Namibia stated their original proposal provided benefits to conservation and sustainable livelihoods and supported the amended proposal in document CoP14 Inf. 53, noting that this was more likely to be agreed than their original proposal. They stated their opinion that the populations of elephants in the four range States concerned should be considered like other species listed in Appendix II, noting that the biological criteria for Appendix-I listing in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP13) were clearly not met and that the precautionary measures in Annex 4, paragraph b) and c) of the same Resolution were. They stated that the six-year no-trade period, as outlined in the amendment by South Africa, was offered in the spirit of cooperation. They called attention to the need to establish a decision-making process regarding trade in specimens of these Appendix-II species as the current process was lengthy, expensive and to the detriment of other issues. They noted the Standing Committee was well placed to decide on these issues.

Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States, felt recent discussions on elephants had reached a point where consensus had almost been reached and, because of this, their proposed amendment in document CoP14 Inf. 54 and the amendments tabled by other Parties necessitated further discussions to reach the desired compromise.

Echoing Germany, Kenya noted there were several proposed amendments under consideration, including their document CoP14 Inf. 55, and therefore it was confusing for Parties to understand the range of options. They requested the discussion be adjourned so further consultations could be held and Chile seconded this request. At the request of Namibia, the Chairman clarified the discussion would be adjourned so that proposals CoP14 Prop. 4, Prop. 5 and Prop. 6 and documents CoP14 Inf. 53, Inf. 54 and Inf. 55 could be considered further by interested Parties. Chile, as Chairman of the Standing Committee, agreed to lead these consultations. Further discussion on these documents was deferred.

The Secretary-General announced that the Solomon Islands would become a Party to CITES on 22 June 2007, and that the Kyrgyz Republic had deposited their instrument of accession on 4 June 2007, which would make them the 171st and 172nd Parties, respectively. The Chairman, as the representative for Oceania on the Plants Committee, expressed particular delight at the accession of the Solomon Islands.

68. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Chile, as Chairman of the Working Group on *Cedrela odorata*, *Dalbergia retusa*, *Dalbergia granadillo* and *Dalbergia stevensonii*, introduced document CoP14 Com. I. 10, thanking all participants and noting that agreement was reached on the draft decision. He explained that paragraph 4b) directed to the Secretariat should read range States, and not "Parties".

Peru expressed full support for the document. Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States, made various editorial comments: in the first paragraph, "these Decisions" should be replaced by this Decision; in paragraph 4b), the wording "management of" should read results of the efforts to identify; and changing the word "products" in paragraphs 1d), 2a) and 2b) to parts and products. These amendments were endorsed by Mexico.

Norway observed that the decision seemed to be an instruction to establish a timber working group in the Plants Committee, and supported having one group for timber species as opposed to various separate ones. Brazil and the United States expressed concern with this proposal, and Norway withdrew it. The Chairman of the Plants Committee suggested that one possible approach was to expand the remit of the bigleaf mahogany working group to include other important timber species.

The Environmental Investigation Agency noted that two other *Cedrela* species had been included in the original proposals and, citing potential look-alike issues with *Cedrela odorata*, requested that the

genus *Cedrela* should be included in the decision, because it would not create a burden in terms of data collection.

The decision, as amended by Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States, was approved by consensus.

Species trade and conservation issues

58. Hawksbill turtle

Mexico, as Chairman of the Working Group on hawksbill turtle, introduced document CoP14 Com. I. 11. He said the general approach was for CITES to continue its work on these issues, in particular on illegal trade, and to work with other specialized organizations, such as the Inter-American Convention for the Protection and Conservation of Sea Turtles (IAC) and the Convention for the Protection and Development of the Marine Environment of the Wider Caribbean Region (Cartagena Convention), which were organizing a regional meeting on hawksbill turtle, in which the Secretariat should request its participation as an observer, promote participation as an observer, promote participation of CITES Parties, and to present a report of the results to the CoP15.

Delegates approved the draft decision by consensus.

The Committee then reviewed summary records from earlier sessions. The Chairman introduced Summary Record CoP14 Com. I Rep. 9, noting that all references to "*Pristidae microdon*" should be changed to read *Pristis microdon*. He noted that technicians had checked and there had been no problems with the voting equipment of Antigua and Barbuda, as suggested in the report.

Austria pointed out that the total for "Yes" votes in the Annex should read 67 instead of "65" and the percentage should be correspondingly corrected.

The Chairman noted that these amendments would be recorded and Summary Report CoP14 Com. I Rep. 9 was approved.

After some housekeeping announcements the meeting was closed at 16h25.