

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fourteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
The Hague (Netherlands), 3-15 June 2007

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation issues

SEA CUCUMBERS

1. This document has been prepared by the Animals Committee.
2. The Conference of the Parties adopted at its 13th meeting (Bangkok, 2004) the following two Decisions concerning sea cucumbers, directed to the Animals Committee and the Secretariat respectively:
  - 13.48 *The Animals Committee shall:*
    - a) *review the proceedings of the International technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae (March 2004, Kuala Lumpur), as well as those of the forum on Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management (ASCAM) convened by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (October 2003, Dalian); and*
    - b) *prepare, for consideration at the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, a discussion paper on the biological and trade status of sea cucumbers in the above families to provide scientific guidance on the actions needed to secure their conservation status.*
  - 13.49 *The Secretariat shall assist in obtaining funds to support the preparation of the Animals Committee discussion paper on the biological and trade status of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae.*
3. At its 21st meeting (Geneva, May 2005), the Animals Committee agreed that a draft of the discussion paper called for in Decision 13.48 should be prepared by a consultant for consideration by the Committee at its following meeting. It developed terms of reference for the consultant's work, a format for the discussion paper, and advised on the scope of the recommendations that it should contain [see document AC21 WG5 Doc. 1 (Rev. 1)]. The Chairman pointed out that only one species of sea cucumber was CITES-listed and therefore only a limited amount of time could be spent on these taxa.
4. Having secured the necessary financial support thanks to a grant from the United States of America, the Secretariat, as requested by the Committee, contracted an expert, Ms Verónica Toral-Granda of the Charles Darwin Foundation for the Galapagos Islands, to produce a draft discussion paper on the biological and trade status of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae.
5. At its 22nd meeting (Lima, July 2006), the Animals Committee reviewed the draft discussion paper (see document AC22 Doc. 16). The Committee requested the author to finalize the draft, taking account of various comments and observations that were formulated at the meeting (see AC22 Summary Record). The final version of the discussion paper is presented in Annex 1 to this document in English only.

6. On the basis of the findings and recommendations presented in the discussion paper, the Animals Committee proposes that the Conference of the Parties adopt the draft decisions in Annex 2 concerning the conservation of and trade in sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae.

#### COMMENTS FROM THE SECRETARIAT

- A. The Secretariat recognizes that it is important to evaluate trade and biological information on currently unlisted species subject to significant international trade to determine whether they qualify for and would benefit from CITES listing. This has been and could remain the main focus for CITES efforts concerning sea cucumbers. The Secretariat notes however that the programme of work laid out in the draft decisions directed to the Parties relates mostly to the management of non-CITES listed species, while there are already insufficient resources for activities associated with the management and conservation of species included in the CITES Appendices. It also remains challenging for CITES authorities to comply with decisions concerning non-CITES listed taxa, and monitoring progress with the implementation of such decisions is often difficult.
- B. The recommendations in the Animals Committee's discussion paper *Biological and trade status of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae* are sensible and would considerably improve the conservation and management of sea cucumbers if implemented. The Secretariat notes that the draft decisions proposed by the Animals Committee do not reflect all the recommendations mentioned in the discussion paper. Missing are for example: calls to train Customs officers, managers and fishermen in identifying sea cucumbers; proposals to undertake a socio-economic evaluation of the fisheries, especially in developing countries where most of the sea cucumbers are harvested; suggestions that the CITES Secretariat and FAO should help raise funds to implement certain activities; and recommendations that range States involved in sea cucumbers fishing should consider the inclusion of their species in the CITES Appendices. The discussion paper contains examples of good practices regarding sustainable harvesting of wild populations of sea cucumbers, which could be better documented, shared amongst range States and replicated. It might also be appropriate to make reference to the need for mariculture to be linked to and to contribute to the conservation and sustainable use of wild resources. Therefore, the Parties are invited to consider whether the proposed decisions need to be amended.
- C. The draft decision directed to the Secretariat is currently worded in terms not specific to sea cucumbers and duplicates the content of the Memorandum of Understanding signed between CITES and FAO (see document CoP14 Doc 18.1). Unless the Animals Committee and the Parties provide more targeted guidance to the Secretariat concerning activities relevant to the conservation and management of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae and the listing of relevant species in the Appendices, the Secretariat proposes that it be deleted.
- D. The financial implications for adopting the draft decisions proposed in Annex 2 to the document would mostly have to be borne by the Parties. The adoption of the draft decision directed to the Secretariat to promote capacity building in collaboration with FAO is budgeted at USD 80,000, and the one directed to the Animals Committee at USD 15,000, if experts are to be involved as was the case for implementing Decision 13.48. These costs are currently not contained in the budget proposed in document CoP14 Doc. 7.3.

**BIOLOGICAL AND TRADE STATUS OF SEA CUCUMBERS  
IN THE FAMILIES HOLOTHURIIDAE AND STICHOPODIDAE**

by Verónica Toral-Granda,  
Charles Darwin Foundation, Galapagos Islands  
(Email: [vtoral@fcdarwin.org.ec](mailto:vtoral@fcdarwin.org.ec))

## 1. Background

### 1.1 Sea cucumbers and CITES

At the 12th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP12; Santiago, November 2002), the Parties discussed trade in sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae (see document CoP12 Doc. 45) and adopted Decisions 12.60 and 12.61 on these taxa. The CITES Secretariat was directed to obtain funds for and convene a technical workshop on this issue, and the Animals Committee (AC) was to review the outcomes of the workshop and prepare for consideration at the 13th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP13) a discussion document on the biological and trade status of these sea cucumbers to provide scientific guidance on the actions needed to secure their conservation status.

The CITES Secretariat held an international technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, from 1 to 3 March 2004. However, the AC Chairman reported at CoP13 that principally due to time constraints, the Committee had been unable to compile a discussion paper (see document CoP13 Doc 37.1). The Parties therefore adopted Decisions 13.48 and 13.49 to (i) extend the deadline for completing the AC discussion paper until the 14th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP14); and (ii) call on the Secretariat to assist in obtaining funds to support the drafting of the discussion paper (see document CoP13 Doc. 37.2).

Decision 13.48 also instructs the AC to review the proceedings of the international technical workshop organized by the CITES Secretariat and those of the forum on Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management (ASCAM) convened by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) (October 2003; Dalian). A comparison of the main recommendations from both workshops is presented in Annex 1. Further details on the objectives and results of the two workshops can be found in information document AC22 Inf. 1 for the 22nd meeting of the Animals Committee (AC22).

This draft discussion paper generally follows the guidelines and terms of reference provided by the AC [see document AC21 WG5 Doc. 1 (Rev. 1)], and represents the work funded by the CITES Secretariat in accordance with Decision 13.49.

## 2. Biological and trade status

### 2.1 Natural history and population status of sea cucumbers

#### 2.1.1 Taxonomy

Holothurians (sea cucumbers) are one of the five extant classes of echinoderms. There are about 1,500 species distributed in six orders and 25 families. The six orders are divided by the presence or absence of tube feet or podia (ambulacral system), the shape of the mouth, the presence or absence of oral retractor muscles, respiratory trees and cuvierian tubules (Conand, 1990). According to Conand (2005a) and Bruckner (2005b), there are about 42 species of sea cucumbers that are commercially important; however, this number is very likely going to increase in the near future due to ongoing taxonomic reviews. Most commercially harvested species belong to the Aspidochirota (families Stichopodidae and Holothuriidae), with a few commercially important species belonging to the order Dendrochirota (Family Cucumariidae) (e.g. *Cucumaria frondosa*). Many taxonomic uncertainties occur within the commercial species, and a study to revise the taxonomy has been identified as a priority (Uthicke and Benzie, 2003; Lovatelli *et al*, 2004; Uthicke *et al.*, 2005).

### 2.1.2 Reproductive behaviour

Most sea cucumbers are broadcast spawners, releasing their gametes into the water column. The success of reproduction depends directly on the density of adults to ensure high enough concentrations of sperms and eggs that they may come into contact. Water currents play an important role as they carry the released gametes, helping in the reproduction; however, no information is available on whether water currents *per se* induce reproduction. To the author's knowledge, no information is available on the role of food availability on reproductive behaviour. Reproductive events of some species may be correlated with sea temperature. Sea cucumber species may have an annual reproductive cycle (Conand, 1993; Hamel and Mercier, 1996; Herrero-Perezrul *et al.*, 1999; Shiell and Uthicke, 2005), bi-annual (Harriot, 1985) or even some without a reproductive pattern (Harriot, 1985). Although most holothurians are dioecious (i.e. separate sexes, males and females) there are a few species in which individuals have both sexes (hermaphroditism) with a few species reproducing asexually by fission. Fertilized eggs develop into a pelagic larvae found as plankton that after 10 to 90 days settle on the sea bottom. Larvae may settle in specific habitats, with smaller individuals migrating into a different habitat later in life.

### 2.1.3 Distribution, ecosystem importance and ecology

Sea cucumbers can be found throughout the marine environment, from the intertidal and shallow seas to abyssal depths. They can be demersal or pelagic (mostly abyssal forms) with the highest species diversity in the Indian and western Pacific Oceans. Holothurians are slow-moving invertebrates that can live on sand, mud, rock and reef flats, often related with seaweeds, coral and sea grasses whilst some others live buried in the sand with their oral tentacles exposed. Many sea cucumber larvae exhibit diurnal behaviour to make them less accessible to predators (e.g. burrowing in the sand). Adult sea cucumbers may be either diurnal or nocturnal with diurnal sea cucumbers showing higher patterns of activity during the day, and burrowing in sand or seeking crevices to spend the night. Nocturnal species may hide or burrow during the day, to be active at night.

Most commercial sea cucumbers are detritivores, a key role within the marine ecosystem as they conduct functions including nutrient recycling and bioturbation (Bakus, 1973; Barnes, 1977; Uthicke and Klumpp, 1998; Uthicke, 1999; Uthicke, 2001). Like earthworms, sea cucumbers consume and grind sediment and organic matter into finer compounds, turning over the top layers in the sea bottoms, allowing oxygen to enter the sediment. This prevents the accumulation of organic matter and may help controlling pathogens. Adult sea cucumbers have few predators: sea stars, certain fishes and crustaceans (Francour, 1998). Juveniles and larvae are predated by fishes such as those in the families Balistidae, Labridae, Lethrinidae and Nemipteridae (Dance *et al.*, 2003). As a defence mechanism, adult sea cucumbers can eviscerate parts of their internal organs, which regenerate later, to fend off predators. Such behaviour has not been observed in juveniles. Additionally, holothurians have toxic chemicals that protect them. Several species have unique symbionts, including molluscs and fish such as pearl fishes that may disappear once a species is overexploited (Bruckner, 2003). The consequences of sea cucumbers becoming locally ecologically extinct are not fully understood, but cascade effects may be expected such as the ecological or biological extinction of other benthic species. This area of research has also been identified as a priority (Lovatelli *et al.*, 2004; Bruckner, 2005b).

### 2.1.4 Population and fishery status

Sea cucumbers, known as 'beche-de-mer' or 'trepang'<sup>1</sup>, are generally consumed in Asia, where it is regarded as traditional medicine, a delicacy and an aphrodisiac. The rising demand in these markets prompted declines of many holothurian populations worldwide. Tropical sea cucumber fisheries in traditional fishing grounds of the Indo-Pacific are multispecific, with several species targeted in the same fishing grounds. In other tropical fisheries such as in the Indian Ocean, eastern Pacific and Caribbean, the fishery generally focuses on a few species that seldom occur in the same fishing area. Temperate fisheries are monospecific (Conand, 2004, 2005b; Bruckner, 2005b). The stocks of many tropical and temperate species are reportedly over-harvested (Lovatelli *et al.*, 2004; Bruckner, 2005b; Uthicke and Conand, 2005; and references therein) (see Annex 2).

---

<sup>1</sup> Also known as 'Hai-som' by the Chinese and 'Iriko' by the Japanese.

Since the 1980s, sea cucumber harvesting has followed a 'boom-and-bust' cycle, with an increase of producing countries and species in trade to attempt to supply the increasing demand in Asian markets. The 'boom' part of the cycle usually reduced the resource to such low levels that there was little capacity for natural recovery and replenishment. It often took three to four decades before sea cucumbers stocks recovered again to profitable commercial levels, mainly due to the fact that sea cucumbers can be harvested to low levels, beyond those needed for natural replenishment of the populations (Battaglene and Bell, 2004). The fishery in Solomon Islands provides a good example of this case, with peak catches in 1878 followed by overfishing and a rapid depletion of the resource. This low level of exploitation was maintained for much of the 20th century, with higher catches in the 1980s, peaking again in 1992. The catches then declined again by 1996 (Battaglene and Bell, 2004). Additionally, Richmond (1997) refers to the sea cucumber fishery in Chuuk (Truk) where there was no observed recovery 50 years after overexploitation. In Papua New Guinea, population surveys undertaken several years after the closure of the fishing indicate little recovery, with both adults and recruits absent (D'Silva, 2001).

The over-exploitation of traditional fishing grounds in the Pacific and Indian Oceans prompted fishers to migrate to new locations or to target less valuable species (Uthicke *et al.*, 2004), which could be a good indicator of resource over-exploitation (Uthicke, 2004). Based on the available literature, many sea cucumber fisheries, whether tropical or temperate, appear to be in different stages of overexploitation (Annex 2). For example, the Torres Strait fishery for *Holothuria scabra* was closed in the mid 1990s and the current biomass is still very low (Skewes *et al.*, 2000). Bi-annual population surveys of *Isostichopus fuscus* conducted since 1999 in fished sites of the Galápagos Islands (Ecuador) identified smaller breeding populations each time, and only one recruitment event (i.e. massive presence of juveniles) was recorded in 2000-2001 (Toral-Granda, 2005a) probably due to low adult densities. In Papua New Guinea, catches of *Holothuria nobilis* peaked in the early 1990s. However, these declined few years later prompting migration to newer fishing grounds in and outside Papua New Guinea or targeting less valuable species (Kinch, 2002, 2005).

Conand (2004) identified 42 species under population stress as a result of international trade to satisfy the beche-de-mer market and later, Bruckner (2005b) refined such list and identified them as priority species for international conservation and protection (Annex 3). At the CITES workshop (Bruckner, 2005), each species was categorized according to different levels of conservation concern. Five species were identified as being of high concern (i.e. *Holothuria fuscogilva*, *Holothuria nobilis*, *Holothuria scabra*, *Isostichopus fuscus* and *Thelenota ananas*), seven of concern in certain countries of its range (e.g. *Actinopyga echinites*, *Actinopyga Mauritania*, *Stichopus horrens*), four of potential for future concern as harvest increases (e.g. *Cucumaria frondosa*, *Isostichopus badionotus*, *Parastichopus californicus*), 15 of no concern (e.g. *Apostichopus japonicus*, *Holothuria edulis*, *Parastichopus parvimensis*) and 6 as being minor species of little commercial importance (e.g. *Holothuria impatiens*, *Stichopus mollis*). The following seven criteria were used to designate these categories: (i) commercial value; (ii) vulnerability to harvest and environmental fluctuations; (iii) geographic distribution; (iv) historical and present status of the different populations; (v) importance in world trade; (vi) concern raised by several countries; and (vii) knowledge of particular biological features (i.e. slow growth) or genetic information (i.e. isolated populations).

Additionally, during the CITES workshop (Bruckner, 2005) participants also identified geographical hotspots for sea cucumber diversity, which included the east coast of Africa (Egypt, Kenya, Mozambique, Somalia, the Sudan, the United Republic of Tanzania and Yemen), West Indian Ocean island countries (including the Comoros, Madagascar and Seychelles), the western Pacific (Fiji, New Caledonia (France), Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Vanuatu), Asia (China, Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, Thailand, Viet Nam) and the central and north western parts of South America (Costa Rica, Ecuador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico).

#### 2.1.5 Harvesting techniques

Fishers may operate from the shore, hand collecting sea cucumber in shallow waters by means of reef flat gleaning at low tide or wading, or use small wooden or fibreglass boats equipped with outboard or stationary engines to access populations offshore or in deeper waters. When diving, fishers may use hookah (air supplied by means of a compressor on mother boat) or SCUBA gear. Few traditional fishers still use free diving to reach populations in calm seas. Small trawl boats (roller pulling nets, beam trawl

nets, scallop-drag gear) are also used in soft bottom habitats. Divers may use spears, hooks, scoop nets or their hands to collect sea cucumbers.

## 2.2 Utilization of sea cucumbers

### 2.2.1 Characteristics of main species in trade

Beche-de-Mer species can be ranked as of high, medium or low commercial importance based on abundance, appearance, odour, colour, thickness of the body wall, main market demand and value. Once processed and according to the dish and the occasion during which it will be served, beche-de-mer obtains different prices according to moisture content, exterior appearance, size, flesh thickness and species type (Lo 2005). Once caught, sea cucumbers are gutted, boiled and/or dried or roasted. Beche-de-mer is then preserved through drying, smoking, canning or freezing (Bruckner, 2005c). Currently the highest value species are *Holothuria scabra*, *Holothuria fuscogilva*, and *Holothuria nobilis* which are worth USD 15-40/kg. Species of medium value include *Actinopyga echinites*, *Actinopyga miliaris* and *Thelenota ananas*, worth USD 10-12/kg. Low value species include *Bohadschia marmorata*, *Holothuria atra*, *Holothuria fuscopunctata*, *Stichopus chloronotus* and *Stichopus variegatus*, fetching USD 2-10/kg (Bruckner, 2005b). The quoted prices are those on final markets.

### 2.2.2 Levels and types of utilisation

Trade in beche-de-mer is very widespread and one of the oldest form of commerce in the Pacific Islands, (Conand and Byrne, 1993) mostly to satisfy oriental markets for luxury food. Major consumers are China PR, Hong Kong SAR, Taiwan Province of China, Singapore, the Republic of Korea and Malaysia (Ferdouse, 2004). A few species are also used for medicinal purposes (e.g. *Stichopus horrens* in Malaysia) and for display in aquaria (sea apples, *Pseudocolochirus* spp., *Holothuria atra*, *Holothuria edulis*, *Holothuria impatiens*). The visceral organs, such as fermented intestines (konowata) and dried gonad (kuchiko) of commercially important species are marketed in Japan, the Republic of Korea and China (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). Sea cucumber meat is believed to contain beneficial chemicals that possess antibacterial and antifungal properties (Hamel and Mercier, 1997) and even considered an aphrodisiac in China (Uthicke and Klumpp, 1996).

In China, sea cucumbers are regarded as a folk remedy and a medicine, and their utilization has been recorded since the Ming Dynasty (1368-1644 BC) (Chen, 2004). Sea cucumbers are considered a health tonic, normally used to treat weakness, impotence, debility of the aged, constipation and frequent urination, and as a food item in China where Chinese cooks have revered sea cucumbers since ancient times. This has led to long lasting traditions especially in coastal communities where its consumption has become part of local cultures and customs (Chen, 2004). Sea cucumber presents a high nutritional value due to its high protein, low fat content, aminoacid profile and presence of trace elements, which makes them a valuable food item (Chen, 2004). As a medicinal item, sea cucumbers have a variety of chemical compounds used to treat anaemia, inhibit some cancers, enforce immune function and reduce arthritic pain (Chen, 2004).

The main use for sea cucumbers as food is for the consumption of the body wall, mostly as: (i) dried product (known as trepang, beche-de-mer, hai-som) of which Chinese are the main consumers; (ii) boiled or salted; (iii) raw, for which Japan is the main market; and (iv) as traditional food cooked in coconut milk (Conand, 1990). There is a local fishery for *Stichopus variegatus* in the Cook Islands, Palau, Pohnpei (Federated States of Micronesia), Samoa and other countries which by means of a puncture on the dorsal area harvest only the intestines. The animals are later returned to the sea where they regenerate their organs. In some East Asian countries, sea cucumbers are also used as medicine. In Malaysia (Baine and Poh-Sze, 1999a,b; Poh-Sze, 2004) the use of species of the genus *Stichopus* (locally known as 'gamat') is reported for their medicinal properties in a variety of circumstances such as the treatment of wounds, stomach ulcers and as a painkiller. Their chemical composition has been found to be useful in reducing arthritis pain and arthralgia, and the saponins in sea cucumbers have anti-inflammatory and anticancer properties (Awaluddin, 2001). Additionally, gamat oil and by products are found in a variety of products such as liniment oil, toothpaste, body lotion, soaps (Poh-Sze, 2004; Conand, 2005b). In Japan, there is a patent for sea cucumber chondroitin sulphate in HIV therapy (Conand, 2005b).

Sea cucumbers have been used in the aquarium trade since the early 1970s, but it was not until the end of the 1980s that they became common. Initially, the colourful plankton-feeding species of the family

Cucumariidae were the ones that attained the most interest, but gradually the market shifted in favour of deposit-feeding species. Such species are kept primarily because of their ecological role as substratum sifters, detritus feeders and decomposers. Many aquarists use them as important biological stabilisers in the aquarium system. Currently there are over 30 species of sea cucumbers used in the aquarium trade, out of which, 20 belong to the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae. Aquarium trade accounts for very little when compared to the beche-de-mer total export value (kg), with values ranging from 8.33 to 0.44 % of the dried sea cucumber market (S. Fosså, Ornamental Fish International, pers. com).

### 2.2.3 Threats

Over-exploitation to satisfy demand for beche-de-mer is the main threat to sea cucumber populations. Additionally, the mechanization of fishing techniques, like the use of hookah or SCUBA diving, are rendering otherwise unexploitable populations suitable for fishing (i.e. inhabiting deeper zones). Despite the commercial importance of sea cucumbers, their biology, ecology and population dynamics remain poorly understood. Current information on growth rates, larval ecology, recruitment processes, habitat use, ecological role, maximum sustainable yields, minimum stock size and threshold value for reproductive success, amongst others, is scant and in cases available for only a few species. An indirect threat is the lack of scientific information to produce comprehensive management plans that could ensure the conservation of these species and sustainable harvest regimes. However, in the case of *Isostichopus fuscus* in the Galápagos Islands, which has a moderate array of information to sustain a fishery under sustainability indicators (Toral-Granda and Martínez, 2004), interested parties exerted socio-economical and political pressures so as to forego scientific information and open the fishery under clearly non sustainable management practices (Toral-Granda and Martínez, 2004, Altamirano *et al.*, 2004, Toral-Granda, 2005a). When a fishery is no longer economically viable, the activity would probably be directed towards another species of sea cucumber with less commercial value (i.e. *Stichopus horrens* in the Galápagos Islands) for which no or far less biological or ecological information is available. This example from the Galápagos Island shows how sea cucumber fisheries can spiral into overexploitation and eventual collapse, and a gap of scientific information that cannot be retrieved.

Another threat to sea cucumbers is habitat degradation and loss. Many commercial sea cucumbers are found in coral reefs and coral beds which are being degraded due to climate oscillations (e.g. El Niño), environmental disasters (e.g. tsunamis), and many human-induced causes, including unsustainable fishing practices (e.g. blasting and poisoning) and coastal pollution and sedimentation. Although poorly documented, but still a threat, some species have been scientifically over-exploited (e.g. samples for scientific studies), such as *Holothuria fuscogilva* in New Caledonia (Conand, 2005a) and *Isostichopus fuscus* in an islet off Santa Cruz island, Galápagos Islands (V. Toral-Granda, pers. obs.).

Live sea cucumbers are transported in water, and only some 5% by weight of freight containing sea cucumbers is actual body mass. In case of trade for aquarium markets, it is very important for the survivability of the live animal that the utmost attention be given to collection, handling and transport, as well as careful acclimatisation at all stages. Animals are supposed to be kept in tanks and under adequate conditions (S. Fosså, Ornamental Fish International, pers. com); hence aquarium trade handling and shipping *per se*, should in normal circumstances not be considered a threat to sea cucumber populations.

## 2.3 Production methods and volumes

### 2.3.1 Capture fishery (targeted, bycatch)

Tropical fisheries in the Indo-Pacific Ocean target multiple species, whereas temperate fisheries are monospecific (Conand, 2004, 2005a,b). In countries ranging from temperate to tropical regions occur about 42 commercially important sea cucumber species (Conand, 2005a) that yield mostly food. Traditional artisanal fisheries in the western Pacific and Indian Ocean export dry sea cucumbers. Temperate countries generally produce fresh or frozen products (Conand, 2005b). The global beche-de-mer market is basically ruled by Chinese traders, who have been searching for and buying sea cucumbers for over 1000 years in areas as varied as India, Indonesia, the Philippines, Australia (Conand and Byrne, 1993) and later, upon depletion in some of these, moved westwards to new fishing grounds such as Africa and the Americas.

World sea cucumber capture fisheries drastically increased from 4,300 tonnes in 1950 to a peak of 23,400 tonnes in 2000, decreasing to 18,900 tonnes in 2001 (fresh or chilled, frozen, dried, salted or in

brine, canned) (Vannuccini, 2004). The recorded increase is probably due to a combination of more countries producing sea cucumbers, a greater number of species harvested, the increase of fishing effort by targeting deepwater stocks and the gradual expansion of fishing areas (Bruckner, 2005b). Certain countries (i.e. United States of America, Bruckner, 2005c; Ecuador, Toral-Granda, 2005a) have documented drastic decreases in their landings due to overexploitation of wild populations. For all species except *Apostichopus japonicus*, Indonesia is the world's largest producer followed by the Philippines with over 1,000 tonnes (Gamboa *et al.*, 2004), followed by the United States, which probably includes Canadian catches, and Papua New Guinea (Conand 2005b). Japan is the largest producer of *Apostichopus japonicus* with over 7,000 tonnes, followed by the Republic of Korea (900 tonnes) and China (over 350 tonnes) (Conand, 2005b).

*Holothuria scabra* is a species with a broad distribution and probably the most valuable and most widely harvested in tropical regions (Conand, 2005a). Many other *Holothuria* species have relatively low value but are still collected, particularly once that higher value species have become scarce. The populations of the most profitable species, *Holothuria scabra* and *Holothuria nobilis*, have collapsed in various locations throughout their range (e.g. Torres Strait, Australia) and new species are now being collected, adding to the number of commercial species. In the eastern Pacific, the most important sea cucumber fishery is in Mexico and the Galápagos Islands for *Isostichopus fuscus* (Toral-Granda, 2005a), with incipient activities in Peru and Chile (Guisado, 2005) focusing on *Pattalus mollis* and *Athyonidium chilensis* (Cucumariidae).

In most tropical countries where there is traditional sea cucumber fishery, harvesting is done by hand, wading at low tide, or by snorkelling or SCUBA. These targeted methods produce little bycatch of sea cucumbers. However sea cucumbers may become the bycatch from other fishing operations, particularly when dredging or trawling [e.g. *Holothuria scabra* in prawn nets in Madagascar (Rasolofonirina *et al.*, 2004)]. In Quebec and New Foundland (Canada) *Cucumaria frondosa* is a bycatch of scallop fishing and although they are returned to the sea, most die (Hamel and Mercier, 1999). Sea cucumber can also be targeted to supplement other fishing operations in other commercial taxa. For example, fishers for geoduck (the saltwater clam *Panope abrupta*) and sea urchins (*Strongylocentrotus* spp.) in British Columbia (Canada) (Bruckner, 2005a) collect sea cucumbers. In tropical reef areas, sea cucumber fishery may be a more or less important component of multi-taxon fisheries targeting reef fishes, corals and other invertebrates. In Mozambique, some sea cucumbers are caught in trawl and gillnets. Low amounts of sea cucumbers are taken as bycatch in trawl fisheries around Australia (i.e. northern prawn fishery and Torres Strait prawn fishery), noting that it is not permitted to keep any sea cucumbers caught as a result of bycatch within those fisheries.

### 2.3.2 Aquaculture

Despite growing concerns about the impact of aquaculture on biodiversity and the environment (Naylor *et al.*, 2000) this is one of the fastest-growing food production systems in the world, particularly in developing countries. Aquaculture is expected to continue its contribution to food security and poverty alleviation (Williams *et al.*, 2000). According to the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) (2004b), the part of aquaculture in the global fisheries production has increased from 3.9 % in 1970 to 29.9 % in 2002, with an average growth of 8.9 % per year in comparison to 1.2 % for capture fisheries. Of the total world production (51.4 tonnes worth USD 60 billion), China produces 54.7 % of the total value of aquaculture production (FAO, 2004b). However, most of this production concerns finfish, molluscs, aquatic plants and crustaceans (FAO, 2004b), with holothurian production still regarded in its infancy.

In the early 1980s, Chinese living standards improved considerably, stimulating the consumption of sea cucumbers despite higher prices (Xilin, 2004). This, along with the reduction of wild sea cucumber populations (see Annex 2), created a bottleneck in supply that prompted the development of sea cucumber hatcheries of *Apostichopus japonicus* (Family Stichopodidae). Research and development of sea cucumber seed production, farming and stock enhancement has become a priority since the early 1980s when pond farming, pen culture and sea ranching methods were developed (Chen, 2004). The successful propagation and rearing of sea cucumbers (*Apostichopus japonicus*) was first reported in Japan in 1950.

Additionally, China has established conservation zones to help maintain the original stock of *Apostichopus japonicus*. Mariculture and sea ranching of sea cucumbers have become a vigorous sector

in Chinese mariculture (Chen, 2004) with this activity gradually expanding within China (i.e. Fujian, Guangdong and Hainan Provinces) where vast quantities of sea cucumber are produced. Similar cultivation or propagation ventures have expanded to other countries such as Viet Nam, Indonesia, Japan, the Marshall Islands and New Zealand. These countries are producing sea cucumbers in captivity and releasing juveniles to enhance the existing wild stocks (Purcell, 2004), or produce sea cucumbers as an alternative to harvesting wild populations (Azari *et al.*, 2005).

The sandfish *Holothuria scabra* has been identified as one of the most promising sea cucumber species for aquaculture (Stutterd and Williams, 2003; Pitt and Dinh Quang Duy, 2004) with breeding experiments in Australia, India and Viet Nam. There are other species currently being used experimentally in aquaculture ventures with unsuccessful results to date [i.e. *Holothuria atra* (Ramofafia *et al.*, 1995), *Holothuria nobilis* (Preston, 1990) *Actinopyga echinities* (Chen and Chian, 1990), *Actinopyga mauritiana* (Preston, 1990) and *Actinopyga miliaris* (Battaglene, 1999), *Stichopus horrens* (Sarver, 1995) and *Holothuria fuscogilva* (Battaglene, 1999)].

Currently, no aquaculture production of sea cucumbers has been reported to FAO by member countries (Vannuccini, 2004) but with current production trends, it can be assumed that sea cucumbers from aquaculture ventures constitute a large portion of total world production (Vannuccini, 2004).

In 2002, China's production of sea cucumber reached 6,335 tonnes, 5,865 tonnes of which were produced in aquaculture ventures (Chen, 2004). In 2004, however, Chinese sea cucumber farming entered a new age with a total production for the Shandong province alone reaching over 100,000 tons (fresh weight), with further increases in 2005 (Jianxin Chen, pers comm.). Sea ranching<sup>2</sup> accounts for over 75 % of the total aquaculture production (Chen 2004). Total aquaculture production may be higher than official Chinese statistics report because many producers sell their product directly in live or semi-processed forms to local consumers. However, the production cannot meet the current demand and China continues to import processed sea cucumbers from other countries, with the main trading port being Hong Kong SAR where over 5,000 tonnes of sea cucumbers (dried, salted or in brine) were imported in 2004 (Hong Kong Census and Statistics Department, pers. com.).

### 2.3.3 Regulatory controls and protective measures

Historically, sea cucumber fisheries have been managed under tenurial systems held by local communities, especially in traditional fishing grounds. However, with the expansion of this activity to non-traditional grounds, the loss of long-established cultures and higher demand for the product, commercial fisheries have often been poorly managed, leading to the implementation of management once the stocks began diminishing. In most developing countries, new fisheries start as open access fisheries, and management plans or regulations such as banning (e.g. area closures), or harvesting seasons are put in place after problems arise in an attempt to mitigate the decline of the resource.

Most fisheries in temperate regions have had their catches monitored and management plans set into place when problems have arisen (e.g. west coast of Canada and the United States) (Conand, 2005b). In tropical regions, fisheries are on a small scale but of great socio-economic importance (Conand, 2004, 2005a,b). Management measures have been taken in certain tropical countries (Toral-Granda and Martínez; 2004, Altamirano *et al.*, 2004) but these generally remain little enforced, probably due to the lack of human and other resources, weak capacities to implement and control regulations, the absence of effective scientific monitoring mechanisms and inadequate management responses that take into consideration scientific information (Bruckner, 2005a).

**No Take Zones:** Worldwide, No Take Zones (NTZs) have been recognized for their benefit to exploited species (Ward *et al.*, 2001, Gell and Roberts, 2003). A few examples exist for sea cucumbers. In Egypt, NTZs had higher diversity and densities of commercial sea cucumber species (Lawrence *et al.*, 2004). In Australia, *Holothuria nobilis* (black teatfish) densities were 75 % higher in NTZs than in fished areas (Uthicke and Benzie, 2000; Uthicke, 2004). Negative relationships have been found between increased harvesting effort and sea cucumber densities, typifying unsustainable harvest rates (e.g. *Parastichopus californicus* in Washington; Tuya *et al.*, 2000). In contrast, Schroeter *et al.* (2001) found no significant

---

<sup>2</sup> Sea ranching defined as "...at first, the crop is reared in restricted areas, then its juveniles are released into the natural environment and finally its adults are fished from this natural environment" (Jia and Chen, 2001)

changes in the abundance of *Parastichopus parvimensis* in two NTZs in California. In the Galápagos Marine Reserve (GMR), Toral-Granda *et al.* (2003) found no positive impact of NTZs in the GMR on *Isostichopus fuscus* with declining abundances in all management zones, whilst Edgar *et al.* (2004) found higher densities of *Isostichopus fuscus* outside NTZ in the GMR. Further evaluation of the impact of NTZs in the GMR is needed to identify if findings may be biased by socio-political processes that may accompany selection of sites for NTZ (i.e. Edgar *et al.*, 2004) or the lack of control and enforcement of the protected areas. Spatial closure areas should be developed using the best available information on current flows (so as to address source and sink populations), sea cucumber biology and areas of special interest to local communities in order to develop a sense of ownership and stewardship (Bruckner, 2005b).

NTZs can benefit both commercial and non-commercial species, especially when they have been developed and approved jointly with stakeholders such as fishers. However, their success greatly depends on the continuous support from fishery communities, effective policing and enforcement, and demonstrable benefits to local stakeholders. The Provisional Zoning Scheme of the Galápagos Marine Reserve (GMR) was designed with the input from the five main stakeholders, but its benefits to sea cucumber populations remain to be demonstrated because fishers ignore the NTZ and funds are lacking to effectively patrol the vast area (ca. 138,000 km<sup>2</sup>). Selection criteria for NTZs should consider the habitat type, size, shape and number and characteristics of other NTZs (Bruckner, 2005a). Terrestrial reserve design theory may provide some guidance for other selection criteria; nonetheless, this has been identified as a priority area of research (Lovatelli *et al.*, 2004; Bruckner, 2005).

**Complete closure of the fishery:** In Mexico, the government imposed from 1994 to 2001 a total closure on all fishing activities for *Isostichopus fuscus* (Aguilar-Ibarra and Ramirez-Soberón, 2002) by listing the species as “Endangered” in the domestic threatened species list (NOM-059-ECOL-1994). However, this management strategy did not benefit the species as fishers did not comply with the measures while controls and monitoring of the catches were non-existent (Aguilar-Ibarra and Ramirez-Soberón, 2002). No significant recovery of the population was registered despite measures being formally in place regarding fishing bans, minimum landing size, and restriction of collection only to scientific purposes. This may be a result of continued illegal harvesting. Alternatively, the population may have been driven to such low levels that it may take decades to recover. In March 2002, the species was downlisted as “Subject to special protection” (in the updated NOM-059-SEMARNAT-2001, a category equivalent to those of least conservation concern according to IUCN), thus reflecting its current conservation status. This category allows for the use of the species under restricted conditions. Within this frame, a regional management plan was established in 2005 for the Baja California Peninsula (on the Northeast Mexican coast). The management plan, based on the principles of adaptive management, was developed with the participation of local and Federal Governments (including CITES Authorities), scientists and fishermen associations, and includes provisions for the allocation of harvest quotas, catch reports and population monitoring to assess the effects of harvest. The management plan is programmed to be reviewed on a yearly basis, and adapted according to the results of the ongoing monitoring and new information obtained. The first review was carried out in September 2006 (E. García, SEMARNAT, pers.com.).

For *Parastichopus parvimensis*, the other Mexican species entering international trade, there are separate management provisions (as for any other fishery in Mexico) since this species is not included in the domestic threatened species list.

After the 1994 experimental fishery in the Galápagos Islands, the Ecuadorian Government declared a total ban on sea cucumber fishing activities until further notice (Carranza and Andrade, 1996). In spite of the closure, illegal activities were rampant (Toral-Granda, 2005a) and population densities of *Isostichopus fuscus* declined (see e.g. Toral-Granda and Martínez, 2004). In waters of mainland Ecuador, all fishing activities were banned for *Isostichopus fuscus*, but no recent information is available to ascertain whether populations have recovered to pre-fishing levels. In India, in 2001, all commercial sea cucumbers were added to Schedule I of the Wildlife Protection Act, which closed all fishing activities. This was aimed to help recovery in overexploited populations, however, illegal fishing continues and most stocks are or remain seriously depleted (Nithyanandan, 2003).

Despite the possible benefits to wild populations, a complete closure of a sea cucumber fishery has major social and economic consequences and has not been effective in practice. When the fishers are prohibited to perform such activity, and unless alternatives are provided, a major source of their income is

lost and they will probably turn to illegal fishing which can be even more detrimental to wild sea cucumbers and is negative for humans because no biological thresholds can be enforced nor fair prices paid.

**Limited entry:** Limited entry generally means some sort of licensing or permitting system whereby the numbers of fishers or vessels partaking in the fishery are restricted. This management tool can reduce scramble competition amongst fishers and help maintain a fishery in a sustainable way. It also improves compliance with management measures and can help ensuring that the economical gains stay with the local community. Moreover, assigning territorial rights to fishing cooperatives may help manage open-access fisheries. This management method seems to be effective in developed countries where there are other alternatives for displaced sea cucumber fishers (i.e. in Australia, Canada and the United States). In the Washington State Fishery in the United States, logbooks with daily reporting of catch have helped to avoid exceeding the quotas (Bruckner, 2005a). However, in traditional systems the procedure can be difficult as all fishers have equal rights to exploit 'their' resources, and the process itself can be straining to fishery management authorities or eventually lead to social unrest and conflicts. Fisheries cooperatives should be organized so as to ensure that licenses are given to those whose main source of income is sea cucumber fishing, rather than to give them away to any member of the cooperative. In Fiji (Stutterd and Williams, 2003) and in the Galápagos Islands (Toral-Granda, 2005a) sea cucumber fishing activities are restricted to native fishers.

**Quotas:** Quotas or Total Allowable Catch (TAC) are the maximum amount of individuals or biomass that can be harvested annually, during a fishing season, per fisher or fishing trip, within certain areas, etc. Generally TACs should be established in such a way that the maximum sustainable yield (MSY) is not affected. To ensure its effectiveness there should be continuous monitoring and enough enforcement capacity to close the fishery when the quota or TAC has been attained. Quotas can be set outside MSY levels and just reflect a ceiling with no biological or ecological background, while mostly aiming to satisfy the fisher needs (i.e. Galápagos Islands). Management by TACs can cause problems due to the patchy spatial component of the fishery and holothurian populations (Bruckner, 2005a). This management strategy can be an effective tool to control fishing but it may require significant and frequent monitoring to ensure its compliance (Bruckner, 2005b). When TACs are used to manage sea cucumber fisheries, it needs to be re-evaluated frequently as new scientific information becomes available, so as to prevent overexploitation (Bruckner, 2005b). In multispecies fisheries, a TAC should be set for each fished species to avoid serial depletion. This may represent a handicap as many fisheries are not managed at the species level. Another problem with TACs is that a relatively large amount of scientific information is needed to establish the quota (Bruckner, 2005b). In Australia's East coast sea cucumber fishery, a TAC for the white teatfish (*Holothuria fuscogilva*) was introduced after the collapse of the black teatfish fishery (*Holothuria nobilis*) in 1999. The TAC for *Holothuria fuscogilva* is reviewed annually whilst *Holothuria nobilis* is still banned (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). In the Australian Northern Territory, a TAC of 127° mt has been set for the white teatfish (Bruckner, 2005a). In Alaska, a quota is set for each fisher and each fishery management unit (Bruckner, 2005a). In Papua New Guinea, a quota is set for each province, however is often exceeded (D'Silva 2001).

**Minimum sizes:** Minimum sizes are based on the Size of Maturity (SOM) so as to ensure that the stock reproduces at least once before entering the fishery. This can help avoiding a population collapse due to recruitment failure. Additionally, this management tool helps target bigger individuals which fetch higher market prices. However, sea cucumber size and weight are highly dependent on the water content of live and processed individuals, making enforcement difficult in some cases. However, for many commercial species, biological information on which to base minimum harvest size is lacking. As an example of this regulatory approach, the Galápagos sea cucumber fishery has a minimum landing size of 20 cm for fresh animals and 7 cm for dry ones. This management tool is also used in Australia, Papua New Guinea, Fiji and Tonga in conjunction with other regulatory approaches such as quotas. Nonetheless, the sizes vary amongst countries, regions and species. For instance in Australia's east coast, all commercial species have a minimum landing size of 15 cm whilst in Australia's western region the minimum size depends on each species harvested (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). As an addition to minimum landing length, in some cases a minimum landing fresh weight could be implemented, especially when the animal is still alive hence small individuals in good conditions could be returned to the sea. An advantage of this management strategy is that controls can be performed at the landing and market levels, and since the beche-de-mer price is highly dependent on size, better control can be exerted. However, discarded individuals are already dead and represent a loss to the reproductive capacity and overall health of the

population. It is important to improve the training of fishers to avoid collection of sub-sized individuals. Rejected sub-standard sea cucumbers can also be sold on the black market at much reduced prices (e.g. in the Galápagos Islands).

**Fishing season:** Fishing seasons are aimed at protecting the population during critically important periods in their biological cycle, such as during reproductive events, or to maximize the quality of the product. This management option provides an indirect fishing ban during which natural processes such as growth and reproduction can take place and ensures that a higher number of animals are available for harvesting. It should however be noted that this approach could negatively affect the spawning stock if no other options (i.e. TAC, minimum landing size) are put in place so as to leave sufficient reproductive biomass for the following seasons. Closed seasons during spawning are in place in Japan for *Apostichopus japonicus* (Uthicke and Klumpp, 1996), the Cook Islands for *Actinopyga mauritania* (Bruckner, 2005a) and in the Galápagos islands for *Isostichopus fuscus* (Toral-Granda 2005a). In multispecific fisheries, this may represent a handicap as there is asynchrony of spawning seasons between species (Bruckner 2005b)

**Gear restrictions:** Gear restrictions mean that some fishing techniques are banned, or restricted to certain fishers or specific fishing zones. The most common gear restriction is the prohibition to use underwater air supplies (Hookah or SCUBA gear) and to only allow free diving collection, intertidal wading or reef flat gleaning. This would limit the time underwater, optimize the capture to bigger individuals (hence higher value) and leave some individuals hidden to ensure natural reproduction. Gear restrictions can be easily achieved with limited enforcing capacity. In New Caledonia, black and grey morphos of sandfish are found in deeper waters, which can act as buffer and a source of new recruits in fished shallow zones (Uthicke and Benzie, 2000). Gear restrictions may protect critical portions of the population of a few species with wide depth distributions, but other species with a shallow distribution are unlikely to benefit from this measure (Lokani *et al.*, 1996).

**Restocking and stock enhancement:** Recent advances in aquaculture provide the potential to greatly reduce the time required to re-establish depleted stocks through the release of cultured juveniles or to restore spawning biomass to a more productive level (restocking), and may also increase productivity of operational fisheries by overcoming recruitment limitation by maintaining populations closer to the carrying capacity of the habitat (stock enhancement) (Dance *et al.*, 2003; Bell and Nash, 2004).

Much attention has been given to the possibility of using aquaculture and stock enhancement as a way to reverse the overexploitation trends. These measures have become more prominent as the methodology for spawning and for larval and juvenile rearing has been developed for a small number of commercially important species (Lovatelli *et al.*, 2004). However, the access to technology for producing juveniles alone is not enough to proceed with restocking and stock enhancement programmes.

For populations where stock assessments reveal that the spawning biomass is at chronically low levels, it can be assumed that by the release of hatchery-reared juveniles, the number of spawners could be restored (Bell and Nash, 2004). However, for such restocking to be effective (i.e. to achieve the desired outcome of restoring fishery productivity), the juveniles that are released into the wild and the remnant wild sea cucumber need to be protected from fishing. Moreover, the protected area should be closed for long enough time to allow the progeny of the released sea cucumbers to replenish the population to the desired spawning biomass. If this is the case, managers need to verify whether a moratorium on fishing for the remnant wild population alone would be sufficient to achieve replenishment (Purcell S., pers. com.).

Additional scientific information should be available before attempting stock enhancement or re-stocking, such as:

- Genetic delineation of stocks: The release of hatchery-produced animals can reduce genetic diversity which can lead to long-lasting effects (i.e. loss of adaptability to natural conditions, inbreeding depression, genetic bottleneck) that are detrimental to native stocks (Uthicke and Purcell, 2004). The number of spawners must be carefully chosen to avoid reduction in the genetic pool (Ryman *et al.*, 1995) which can lead to losses of genetic variation through decreased heterozygosity or the loss of rare alleles (Utter, 1998). In case restocking is attempted with hatchery-reared juveniles, the animals should ensure that no effect will be caused to the natural genetic diversity of the species (Bell and

Nash, 2004; Purcell, 2004), which could be achieved by using the same genetic stock for the restocking project (Bell and Nash, 2004).

- Juvenile habitat: Recruitment of larvae may occur in specific habitats, with small individuals migrating into adult habitat later in life (Purcell, 2004). Adult habitat may be less sheltered and have higher risk of predation or may not have suitable habitat for larval settlement (Purcell, 2004). Identifying adequate habitats and its key features before releasing juveniles is therefore critical (Purcell, 2004), particularly because cultured juveniles cannot be released effectively into all habitats where adults occur (Dance *et al.*, 2003). As in other marine taxa, there is higher survival when hatchery-produced sea cucumbers are released at a larger size. However, time and space is a major constraint in land based cultures, as most of them have to ensure economical benefits within a short period of time and limited space (Purcell, 2004) (i.e. rearing ponds, grow out tanks) that are constantly in demand for new generations, specially as holothurians cannot be reared in the water column as they must be associated with the substratum (Battaglione and Bell, 2004). For example, a restocking programme willing to release 2 million juveniles would need over 13 ha of grow-out ponds (Battaglione and Bell, 2004). The benefits and costs to produce large juveniles have to be compared with a higher survival rate. To evaluate the optimal-size-at-release requires knowledge of survival rates and production costs for juveniles of various sizes (Purcell, 2004), which may be costly and time demanding.
- Optimal release conditions: Not only the size but also the optimal density, time of the day and season to carry out the release have to be investigated. Many sea cucumber larvae have a diurnal behaviour such as burrowing in the sand to make them less accessible to predators (Purcell, 2004). But a night release might also provide better results as most predators are less abundant (Dance *et al.*, 2003). Purcell (2004) recommends that release should be in the natural season for recruitment.
- Diseases: Another consideration before releasing hatchery-produced juveniles into the wild is that they should be checked for diseases and parasites to avoid introduction of harmful diseases into the wild (Purcell, 2004). Much research is still needed in this field, but the diseases can arise from bacterial, fungal and viral infections, and *a priori* limits should be set for acceptable levels of diseases, parasites and infections of juveniles to be released (Purcell, 2004). Mercier *et al.* (2004) found it impossible to grow *Isostichopus fuscus* without the presence of a deadly parasite, and stated that if the disease is not contained in the earliest phase, the whole culture may crash. The impact of this parasite on the wild populations is unknown.
- Costs: To date, much of the research needed for the hatchery production of sea cucumber juveniles and their release into the wild has been undertaken by national research agencies, universities and regional and international organizations (Bell and Nash, 2004). There is growing concern and awareness that such programmes can no longer be funded by the government alone but that beneficiaries should contribute as well (Bell and Nash, 2004). A decision to engage in stock enhancement or restocking programmes by the private sector or fisheries cooperatives would be possible when fishers are granted access or property rights (Bell and Nash, 2004). It is important to have a general assessment that will guarantee that the costs of restoration of natural populations should not exceed the value of the additional production in the long term, which would not be available until all the scientific research is completed (Battaglione and Bell, 2004).

Mercier *et al.* (2004) found that *Isostichopus fuscus* can grow and survive in abandoned shrimp ponds available in mainland Ecuador, whilst in China a polyculture of shrimp and sea cucumbers has begun with good results (Yaqing *et al.*, 2004). However, Purcell *et al.* (2006) state some negative impacts of the co-culture to *Holothuria scabra* (i.e. slower growth due to ammonia excreted by the shrimp). In Japan, a beneficial co-culture between the charm abalone and *Apostichopus japonicus* has yielded good results for both species, suggesting that this co-culture can reduce levels of inorganic nitrogen and enhance abalone growth (Kang *et al.*, 2003). Polyculture is a possible way to defraying costs as it will save costs of constructing and managing rearing ponds (Battaglione and Bell, 2004).

Above all, a precautionary approach should be encouraged in light of the current scientific knowledge for most commercially fished species. This approach should encourage the application of prudent foresight by taking into account uncertainties so as to avoid undesirable situations which could affect fisheries systems (FAO 1996). For most commercial sea cucumber species, the basic biological and ecological information is lacking that could be used to develop adequate management plans, while the majority of

such species is currently exploited with no protective or management measures in place. It should be taken into account that fisheries are only slowly reversible (FAO 1996), with very few positive examples involving sea cucumber fisheries.

## 2.4 Trade

Trade in beche-de-mer is very widespread and one of the oldest form of commerce in the Pacific islands, (Conand and Byrne, 1993) mostly to satisfy oriental markets for luxury food. Major consumers are China, Hong Kong SAR, the Republic of Korea, Malaysia, Singapore and Taiwan province of China (Ferdouse, 2004).

Sea cucumber in the aquarium trade account for little when compared to the amount in the food industry. There are few reliable official statistics on the volume of sea cucumbers in the aquarium trade. From information supplied by stakeholders in the trade, (Fosså S. Ornamental Fish International, Pers. Com., 2006) estimated the global trade in live sea cucumbers (both deposit- and plankton-feeding species) to be between 200,000 and 300,000 specimens per year. Species of the families Stichopodidae and Holothuridae probably account for 70 % of this trade. The holothurian biomass entering the aquarium trade represents a mere 0.008 % of that estimated by Bruckner *et al.* (2003) in the beche-de-mer industry (Fosså S. Ornamental Fish International, pers. com).

Legal trade in sea cucumbers accounts for important revenue in many developing and developed countries (Conand, 2005a) and one of the oldest forms of commerce in the Pacific islands (Conand and Byrne, 1993), with catches aimed at satisfying oriental markets such as China, Hong Kong SAR, the Republic of Korea, Malaysia, Singapore and Taiwan province of China (Ferdouse, 2004), where it is mainly consumed as a delicacy (Conand, 2005 a, b). Most sea cucumber catches are imported into Asia mostly via Hong Kong SAR, Singapore and Taipei, from where they are re-exported to other countries (Ferdouse, 2004; Conand 2004a,b). The market is mostly for dried tropical sea cucumbers of all varieties, and a small amount of skinless and air-freight chilled sea cucumbers (Ferdouse, 2004). In the Pacific region, the leading suppliers are Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands, Fiji and Australia (Ferdouse, 2004) whilst in South Asia, the main producing and/or exporting countries are Sri Lanka, Maldives and India. Their production is however relatively small in comparison with Southeast Asia and the Pacific (Ferdouse, 2004).

Import statistics from Hong Kong SAR show an increase in the number of countries exporting dried, salted or in brine sea cucumbers: 25 countries in 1989, 49 in 2001 and 78 in 2005 (HKG C&S, 2005). In 2005, eight countries exported over 1,000 tonnes each to Hong Kong SAR, six countries between 500 and 1,000 tons, 10 countries between 150 and 500 tonnes and the remaining 54 countries with catches less than 150 tonnes (HKG C&S, 2005). The main exporters to Hong Kong SAR are Indonesia, the Philippines, Papua New Guinea, Singapore and Fiji (HKG C&S, 2005).

Hong Kong SAR is the main port for Chinese sea cucumber imports, totalling over 29,200 tonnes from 1999 to September 2005 and over 5,000 tonnes in 2004 alone (HKG C&S, 2005). Hong Kong SAR does not produce beche-de-mer itself, and typically re-exports the products, primarily to mainland China (64.1 %), Viet Nam (24.5 %) and Taiwan province of China (4.7 %) (HKG C&S, 2005). The overall value of beche-de-mer imports and re-exports into and from Hong Kong SAR from 1999 to 2005 was USD 453 million, gradually increasing from USD 33 million in 1999 to USD 79 million during the first 9 months of 2005 (HKG C&S, 2005) (Annex 4).

Trade values registered as import statistics from Hong Kong SAR show an increase in the number of countries exporting dried, salted or in brine sea cucumbers from 25 countries in 1989 to 78 in 2005 (HKG C&S, 2005). In 2005 alone, eight countries exported over 1,000 tonnes each to Hong Kong SAR with the main exporters to Hong Kong SAR being Indonesia, the Philippines, Papua New Guinea, Singapore and Fiji (HKG C&S, 2005) and gross annual incomes ranging from USD 33 in 1999 to 99 million in 2004 (Annex 4).

However, available trade figures are thought to be an underestimation of the total global commerce, as trade routes are complicated, export data are incomplete and individual species are rarely differentiated in trade statistics (Bruckner 2003; Ferdouse 2004). FAO trade figures on global exports are low due to lack of published data from exporting countries (Ferdouse, 2004), and perhaps the use of harmonized reporting codes could help in identifying the value and amount that is imported and exported. These

codes should use standard units (i.e. kg of dry product) so as to ensure that they would be easy to interpret and track. Another useful tool is thoroughly analyzing the country reports on fishing of sea cucumbers provided to FAO. This would be extremely useful, especially if harmonized reporting codes were to be achieved.

The second most important sea cucumber import market is Singapore. Its imports declined from 820 tonnes in 1997 to 629 tonnes in 2000, mostly due to an economic recession (Ferdouse, 2004). The main exporters to Singapore are Hong Kong SAR, India, Yemen, the United States and South Pacific Island Nations. Most of the imports were lower quality sea cucumber, with the best-quality products imported from Australia and other Pacific sources (Ferdouse, 2004).

Sea cucumber poaching has a long history. In the 1700s, the Macassans from what is now Sulawesi (Indonesia) travelled across the Timor Sea to fish in what is now the Northern Territory in Australia (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). Currently, illegal fishing still occurs in Australian waters (Torres Strait) with both day and night poaching irrespective of the fishing closure since 1993 (Stutterd and Williams, 2003). Another problem to sea cucumber populations is poaching by foreign vessels. In May 2001, 110 Malagasy fishermen were arrested for illegal fishing in the Seychelles, and several metric tones of sea cucumbers were confiscated (Rasolofonirina *et al.*, 2004). In Venezuela, over 900 kg of illegally caught sea cucumber were impounded from Asian fishermen in 1991 and 1992 (Bruckner, 2005a). In the Galápagos Islands, local fishermen harvest both *Isostichopus fuscus* and *Stichopus horrens* and later deliver their catch to foreign vessels anchored just outside the Galápagos Marine Reserve (Toral-Granda pers. com.). Philippine boats fish illegally in Malaysian waters and Indonesian fishers in Australian waters (Bruckner, 2005a). Due to its very nature, it is difficult to establish the volume and value of the illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) trade.

Sea cucumber fishery arrived to the Galápagos Islands in 1991 and was unregulated until 1994 when the first legal fishery started in October for three months. The fishery was closed prior to the closing date, and illegal activities persisted until its reopening in 1999 (Toral-Granda, 2005a). In early years, *Isostichopus fuscus* was the sole target of illegal activities. However, as its population declined, large quantities of *Stichopus horrens* were caught which were later traded at much reduced prices or on the black market (Toral-Granda, 2005b). Since the re-opening of the fishery in 1999, under a participatory and adaptive scheme, Ecuadorian export statistics do not reflect the total catch in the Galápagos Islands, with at least 112 tonnes that were not recorded (Altamirano, in prep). Additionally *Isostichopus fuscus* has been exported to Peru from where it was re-exported under Peruvian flag. Since 1999, Hong Kong SAR reports a total of 61 tonnes imported from Peru (Conand, 2005b).

Most illegal activities are fuelled by international buyers exerting pressure to local fishers and offering high prices for sea cucumbers. Generally, fishers get into a loan-debt cycle that fuels illegal activities (i.e. prohibited species, undersize animals or out of season). Illegal sea cucumber fishing can spiral into overexploitation of valuable species. Legal beche-de-mer trade is a lucrative market but illegal national and international trade can cause major problems in certain areas and help should be sought from countries worldwide to halt this practice and help conservation of sea cucumbers.

Ecuador announced at the 12th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP12; Santiago, 2002) the inclusion of *Isostichopus fuscus* in Appendix III, which came into effect in October 2003. Since the Ecuadorian Government included *Isostichopus fuscus* in Appendix III, less unreported catches have been registered, and there exists now a clearer trading route which in due time could be used by Ecuadorian authorities to protect native stocks. *Isostichopus fuscus* is the only species of sea cucumber currently included in the CITES Appendices.

#### 2.4.1 CITES implementation and identification issues

The effectiveness of a CITES listing depends amongst other things on the ability of enforcement personnel, such as Customs officials, to identify correctly a listed species and the products thereof, for instance to prevent the laundering of illegally obtained specimens under different names, or fraudulent labelling (FAO, 2004a). For beche-de-mer, this was recognized in the two technical workshops as a major problem and good identification was found to be essential for managing international trade (Sant, 2005). Problems arising from labelling and identification may cause the clearance of shipments to be delayed or prohibited, with possible economical consequences. For example, in Malaysia, sea cucumber by-products

are used in toothpaste and lotions. Improved labelling can help address concerns relating to identification of such products in trade, and currently there are many documentation and labelling laws and schemes aiming at controlling or identifying the source of fishery products in trade (FAO, 2004a). The ultimate goal would be to have an international standard for traceability of fishery products which would provide all information relevant to the product itself (FAO, 2004a). Additionally, Parties should consider implementing a minimum size of sea cucumbers to be exported, and if possible a ban on exports of broken sea cucumbers.

Currently, further research is being undertaken on the subject. FAO has hired an expert to develop an identification guide for commercial sea cucumber species. The guide will include photos of the live commercial sea cucumber and processed beche-de-mer, and whenever possible a picture of the espicules taken from the dorsal body wall. Moreover, upon completion the intended FAO guide should provide biological, ecological, trade and price information for most commercial sea cucumber species, aiming to help identify priority areas or species that need further conservation efforts.

If considering the inclusion of sea cucumbers in Appendix II and using the 'look-alike' provision<sup>3</sup>, most of the commercial species of beche-de-mer (42 species, Conand 2005a) might have to be included, hence most of the international trade would become regulated under the provisions of the Convention. The 'look-alike' provisions are important for sea cucumbers as these are often traded in different processing forms (i.e. brine, frozen, dried) making some species difficult to identify and distinguish (Sant, 2005). Additional identification tools or mechanisms should include proper documentation and labels so that the product would be 'readily recognizable', especially in the case of by-products used in cosmetic and health products, for instance *Stichopus horrens* in Malaysia.

If one or more species of sea cucumbers were to be included in Appendix II, international trade in specimens of these species would require CITES documents. Important pre-conditions for issuing CITES export permits are that the CITES Management Authority of the exporting country should have established that the sea cucumbers to be exported were obtained legally, and the Scientific Authority should have advised that the exportation will not be detrimental to wild populations of the species (i.e. is sustainable). For many sea cucumber species, fishery, biological and ecological information is scarce, with some tropical fisheries still trying to identify the species in trade. For such cases, establishing safe levels of exportation would require a more cautious approach than for species for which these parameters are well understood. However, the fishery management tools outlined in section 2.3.3 can avoid unsustainable harvest and trade. Nonetheless, there are countries with lax or inadequate fishery regulations that are poorly enforced. Making adequate legal findings that the specimen to be exported was not obtained in infringement of national laws could therefore be difficult but CITES-listings could actually offer incentives and the rationale for improving these.

Although that the taxonomic recognition up to the family level is generally easy, identification of sea cucumbers at the species level is still regarded as problematic. Due to the taxonomic uncertainties in many species, it is very probable that some varieties will have to be classified as full, separate species in future. Some of the commercially important species are still under taxonomic review as live specimens (including *Holothuria scabra*, Uthicke and Purcell, 2004; *Holothuria nobilis*, Conand, 2005, Uthicke *et al.*, 2004; *Holothuria fuscogilva*, Uthicke *et al.*, 2004). Once on the international markets, the processed forms of some species of sea cucumber can be almost impossible to distinguish from others even to the trained eye (Conand 2004), hence the need to develop an identification guide that allows clear guidance on the identification of commercial sea cucumbers (Sant, 2005).

Live sea cucumber taxonomy is based on anatomical features, such as the oral tentacles, podia and the shapes and combination of microscopic spicules (the skeletal components in the body wall of all sea cucumbers). These spicules can take widely different shapes such as be rosettes, C-shaped rods, buttons, and plates (Hickman, 1998) and are present in larvae (Massin *et al.*, 2000; Rasolofonirina and Jangoux, 2005) and adults (Hickman, 1998; Conand, 2005b). Additional work on the molecular phylogeny (Uthicke and Benzie, 2003; Uthicke *et al.*, 2004), morphology (Cherbonnier, 1980), and visual (Conand, 1990) and skeletal features (Cherbonnier, 1980; Conand, 1990; Uthicke, *et al.* 2004) has also

---

<sup>3</sup> "...the specimens of the species in the form in which they are traded resemble specimens of a species included in Appendix II under the provisions of Article II, paragraph 2 (a), or in Appendix I, such that enforcement officers who encounter specimens of CITES-listed species, are unlikely to be able to distinguish between them;" [Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP13)]

been undertaken. However most of these technologies are costly, need to be performed by trained personnel and yield results in longer time. Places such as Hong Kong SAR or Singapore, which deal with most of the international beche-de-mer imports, need timely and precise methodologies so as to identify which species is being marketed and help in international conservation efforts and trade management.

Toral-Granda (2005b) identified the use of the calcareous spicules as a cost-effective and handy methodology for identifying *Isostichopus fuscus* and *Stichopus horrens* in different levels of processing (fresh, in brine or dried). The proposed methodology targets dried specimens that are already in the international market and it enables quick and easy identification, it is cost-effective and can be performed by biologically untrained personnel. However, care must be exerted when using this methodology on all species as the composition of the body wall spicules has not yield positive results in all species analysed (Uthicke *et al.*, 2004, 2005). A catalogue identifying the key external characters as well as the spicules present in the body of the commercially important species has been identified as a priority work by FAO and work is currently underway.

#### 2.4.2 Social and economic aspects

Tropical beche-de-mer fisheries are traditionally artisanal with many species being harvested whilst temperate ones are more mechanized and involving one or few species. Beche-de-mer fisheries are one of the most important sources of revenue for local fisher communities in several developing countries, such as Ecuador (Galápagos Islands) (Toral-Granda, 2005a), Madagascar (Rasolofonirina *et al.*, 2004), Papua New Guinea (Kinch, 2002, 2005) and Solomon Islands (Richards *et al.*, 1994). Coastal communities in Pacific Island Nations (PINs) often have few other options to derive any income (Battaglione and Bell, 2004). In Papua New Guinea, this fishery has a direct impact on the social and economic well-being of the fishing communities as it allows more participation than other fisheries (Kinch, 2005), as well as income in isolated rural communities where other sources of income are rare or not available (Kinch, 2005).

The easiness to collect sea cucumbers and the simple, low technology needed for beche-de-mer processing make it an ideal resource for untrained people (i.e. non-fishers, women and children) to rely on as their source of income. For example, in the Galápagos Islands, when *Isostichopus fuscus* was still quite abundant it was common to have school children and housewives wading and snorkelling in the shallow areas in search of sea cucumbers. These will be later processed and sold in the local market with the revenue used for every-day living expenses and commodities. Additionally, as beche-de-mer can be stored for long periods without deterioration it is possible to launder beche-de-mer in the black market and provide a permanent income to fisherfolk with direct consequences to both natural sea cucumber and human populations.

In temperate regions, any concerns about conflicts between subsistence and commercial harvesters have been addressed by means of a fishery management plan or the identification of subsistence areas that would be closed to commercial harvesting (Bruckner, 2005c). In the United States, most beche-de-mer fisheries have been managed by licenses (Bruckner, 2005c), hence limiting the number of people that rely on this activity, and maximizing their profits and revenues.

Current trends of overexploitation in many countries (Annex 2) have however led the active beche-de-mer fishers to target less valuable species or undersize individuals so as to keep a source of income. Buyers may exert pressure on local fishers to bring beche-de-mer by providing cash-advances and then buying the product at low prices, creating a loan-debt cycle that is difficult to break. This cycle is very detrimental to both sea cucumber species and local communities.

### 3. Management and conservation strategies

#### (i) Management to reduce impacts on wild populations

The lack or the inadequacy of management plans at both the national and regional levels have prompted the overexploitation of many sea cucumber populations (Bruckner, 2005b). Such management plans should be developed at the national level with assistance from Regional Fisheries Management Organizations (RFMOs) or international organizations (e.g. FAO), and should include strategies both at the local/community and the national level. It is highly recommended that relevant national, regional and international institutions cooperate with each other so as to prepare comprehensive management plans

(Bruckner 2005b). Another key point affecting trade directly is the identification of the catch. A clear guide of commercially important species should be developed per locality, country and region, plus clear labelling on the species in trade so as to facilitate import and (re-) export and the enforcement of regulations governing international trade.

Joint use of management tools between RFMOs and countries can be the way forward for sea cucumber management and conservation, and they should, if deemed appropriate, be identified with the direct users and stakeholders of the resource. Management regimes could vary from sophisticated stock assessment models that rely on catch and fishery data to relatively simple measures such as minimum size limit to minimum landing size (FAO, 2004a). Additionally, the CITES Secretariat should draw the attention of the national fishery agencies to the vulnerability of sea cucumber populations, especially when dealing with those subject to trade (cfr. the species in commercial trade indicated in Annex 3).

For transboundary species, regional management should be encouraged in order to preserve as much of the original stock as possible. These require bilateral and international agreements to preserve both the stock itself and its habitat (Bruckner, 2005a). Due to the life history of sea cucumbers, much care must be exerted when dealing with source and sink<sup>4</sup> populations, especially because adult individuals are sedentary whilst fertilized eggs and larvae are pelagic. Proactive measures such as a clear understanding of the biological and ecological parameters of possibly exploitable populations should be encouraged. If a sea cucumber fishery already exists, identification of other possible commercial sea cucumber species should be a high priority to ensure scientific data gathering that will allow a management regime based on scientific information. This is due to the very nature of sea cucumber fisheries, i.e. that once a highly valuable commercial species is depleted, fishing interest will be geared towards less valuable species. If scientific information is available on the latter, then management for such species would include current and up-to-date information that will allow a better planning aimed towards its sustainable use. Information such as growth, ecological role and population dynamics should be obtained from virgin populations so as to ensure no bias due to fishing impact.

No-Take Zones should be encouraged as an umbrella option because they provide shelter for commercial and non-commercial species. Despite the little information on the effectiveness of this management tool for sea cucumber populations, its benefits for other commercial marine species and whole ecosystems are well known (Ward *et al.*, 2001; Gell and Roberts, 2003). In addition to NTZs, total allowable catches should be incorporated in traditional management schemes, ensuring that the fishery has a limited entry. A fishing season would allow the natural populations to reproduce and recover, and should be implemented in all cases.

Minimum size is a management tool that can be hard to enforce due to sea cucumber plasticity, both alive and processed. However, if used jointly with a TAC it could encourage responsible fishing activities as small individuals will still count for the TAC, and hopefully fishers will prefer legal-sized individuals that have achieved sexual maturity, hence benefited the natural population. If possible, minimum size limits should be placed on dry individuals as it is not practical for other processed forms due to variable water content and therefore different degrees of shrinkage (Bruckner, 2005b). However TACs can be set outside the Maximum Sustainable Yield or without any scientific basis, thus being a social or political management tool. Gear restrictions, such as trawl nets, should be enforced, mostly to deter incidental bycatch of sea cucumbers and other marine organisms. A ban of scuba diving or hookah can also help maintain deepwater stocks which could help through reproduction.

However, all these management tools must be enforced effectively to be beneficial. Many countries do not have the staff or funds to monitor fishing activities and ensure that regulations are respected. In some tropical countries, beche-de-mer fishing is performed beyond any management scope, and any attempts to set regulations may cause social unrest when large parts of the fisherfolk population rely on this resource for survival and may not be willing to forfeit a free-for-all activity. Nonetheless, a RFMO for sea cucumbers could gather positive experiences in different countries so as to help implement those in other countries with management and scientific information problems. National experiences such as the one in the Galápagos Islands could be beneficial if shared, especially to other developing countries, as it may help overcome problems more easily and address possible problems as they happen.

---

<sup>4</sup> *Source populations are those that provide other populations with larvae or juveniles, whilst sink populations are those that receive the juvenile production for other populations, and their own juveniles do not stay within the population boundaries.*

*(ii) Relationship between aquaculture, capture fisheries and conservation of wild populations*

Sea cucumber aquaculture production has increased drastically in recent years, yielding a sustainable and profitable option to capture fisheries hence benefiting sea cucumber conservation efforts. However, much care should be exerted when attempting restocking and stock enhancement without proper scientific information so as to minimize unnecessary risks such as introduction of diseases and genetic mixing.

Sea cucumber capture fishery catches have declined worldwide due to overexploitation, which in turn could make other less valuable sea cucumber species desirable for capture, increasing the threat to holothurian populations. Currently, mostly *Apostichopus japonicus* is under aquaculture exploitation; however other species such as *Holothuria atra* (Ramofafia *et al.*, 1995), *Holothuria nobilis* (Preston, 1990) *Actinopyga echinites* (Chen and Chian, 1990), *Actinopyga mauritiana* (Preston, 1990) and *Actinopyga millaris* (Battaglione, 1999), *Stichopus horrens* (Sarver, 1995) and *Holothuria fuscogilva* (Battaglione, 1999), have been included in aquaculture ventures with unsuccessful results (Sttuterd and Williams, 2003).

If attempts are made to manage the overexploitation of sea cucumbers worldwide through aquaculture or restocking because stocks are overfished, then similar measures would also be expected for other species with depleted stocks. Any stock enhancement or restocking programme could increase 'paternalism' toward the fishing sector, and would reinforce the idea that stocks can be overfished because they will later recover following changed management practices.

Aquaculture can provide food security and it can also promote communities to stop relying on capture fisheries to satisfy their economical needs; however, much care should be exerted when new aquaculture ventures for sea cucumbers could destroy natural habitats, for instance mangroves, or exert additional pressure to populations in critical lows (i.e. collection of spawners or broodstock). Wild populations may benefit from such ventures if a complete moratorium is set in place as it will allow natural recovery rates within the population. Additionally, further environmental education and communication with the local community should, in time, allow a change from the current 'boom-and-bust' approach to one that better reflects long-term sustainability.

*(iii) Implementation and enforcement of national and international measures (roles for and relationship between CITES and FAO)*

A CITES listing could benefit sea cucumber species by (i) curtailing illegal international trade and associated harvest; (ii) enhancing sustainable exploitation of wild stocks that are harvested for international trade through the making of non-detriment findings (for Appendix-II listings); (iii) contributing to a reduction of over-harvests; (iv) increasing awareness amongst stakeholders and decision-makers for the need to manage and conserve sea cucumbers; (v) providing better opportunities for technical assistance, targeted research and capacity building; (vi) helping to address FAO's concerns about overexploitation; (vii) assisting conservation and management for the long-term socio-economic benefit of fishers (Appendix II and III listings); (viii) promoting regulatory measures to comply with CITES provisions; (ix) installing standardized and comprehensive trade reporting amongst countries, and centralized data gathering and analysis on trade; and, (x) encouraging the development of RFMOs for sea cucumbers (Bruckner 2005b). A CITES listing can also offer Parties international tools to avoid that sea cucumber species become seriously endangered due to international trade, and promote the development of management strategies both at the national and regional levels.

Bruckner (2005b) also identified problems with including sea cucumbers in the CITES Appendices, which are: (i) burdens on both range and importing countries to comply with permitting requirements, undertake research, eventually develop new legislation, train stakeholders in new trade provisions and specimen identification, promulgate regulatory measures to comply with CITES provisions, etc.; (ii) short-term socio-economic impacts by the reduction of fishery income, tax revenue and disruption of local fishing communities; and (iii) potential diminished cooperation in market surveys and IUU trade investigations.

At the national level, most financial implications of a CITES listing would depend on the involvement of the country in the international trade of listed species as an exporter, re-exporter or importer. Such cost would relate to listings in Appendices II and III as trade in Appendix I would be extremely limited. However, illegal trade may require the application of additional or new enforcement and surveillance (FAO 2004a). Costs of implementation would normally be absorbed by the Party within its resource

management and enforcement budget through the CITES Management Authority. These should be separated as start-up and recurring costs. These costs may in some cases be minimal as enforcing mechanisms may already be in place to deal with other CITES-listed species or fisheries resources. Most costs would be carried by the trade and by border controls at the importing Party.

Start-up costs may include (i) training and capacity building for government officials so as to identify the new species listed; (ii) education and awareness-raising of the fishery and aquaculture sectors about the requirements for trade in CITES-listed sea cucumbers; and (iii) production of tools to assist the identification of sea cucumber species in trade. Recurring costs may include: (i) scientific research upon which to base non-detrimental findings for Appendix-II sea cucumbers, noting however that if the budget constrains this procedure, a NDF could be based on the best available information to the Scientific Authority; (ii) gathering assurances that the specimen was not obtained in contravention of the laws of that State; (iii) processing of permits, compilations and submission of annual reports to the CITES Secretariat; (iv) inspection of imports and exports; and (v) detection and prosecution of illegal trade (FAO 2004a). Funds for both start-up and recurring costs are hard to obtain, especially for developing countries where the government has other priorities.

A CITES listing can be seen as a useful international measure for enhancing conservation of species threatened by trade, but others believe that aquatic species which provide food security should be conserved by means of regional or national regulations and fishing management plans. However, there are few measures that could be implemented by countries alone, whether or not a CITES Party or FAO Member, which could help improve conservation efforts of commercially important aquatic species such as the sea cucumber. On the one hand, FAO could help national agencies to develop comprehensive management plans in order to avoid overexploitation, provide training in fishing and post-handling techniques to maximise the economical gain, and develop easy-to-follow manuals explaining these issues. On the other hand CITES could create the international regulatory conditions to ensure that trade is conducted sustainably and legally, while curtailing illegal international trade and creating awareness of how unregulated trade is negatively impacting on the conservation status of these species. CITES listings could enhance opportunities for research, training and capacity building, hence helping at the national level. A significant problem identified by both workshops is the lack of a standardized methodology for reporting exports (including species in trade, processing forms and units used), and although it should be implemented at the national level, this could be an area in which joint work between CITES and FAO could be greatly beneficial.

#### **4. Conclusions and recommendations**

Sea cucumbers are prone to overexploitation due to their limited mobility as adults, late sexual maturity, a density-dependent reproduction, habitat preferences and low rates of recruitment. Moreover, they can be easily exploited because adults are large, often diurnal, easy to detect and collect, and do not require sophisticated fishing or processing techniques. Increasing consumption trends in Asia markets are threatening sea cucumber populations worldwide as new species are being targeted upon depletion of higher value species. Many sea cucumber populations are currently overexploited; and the current demand for such species in the Asian markets, are demanding new fishing grounds, higher catches and an increasing aquaculture production.

Worldwide, some 42 species are known to be widely used for commercial purposes, which could help focus management efforts at the national and international levels. Most of these species are threatened by trade. The sustainability of these fisheries is influenced by the vulnerable nature of the species, difficulties in gathering critical biological and management information, and the challenges in implementing management plans to overcome unsustainable harvests. Out of these, species of 'high concern' and of 'concern in certain countries of its range' have been identified in this document, which should prompt the implementation of adaptive national and regional management plans. These management plans should be based on the best-available information available and promote the use of the precautionary approach. By implementing this approach, Parties may to avoid undesirable outcomes. The lack of scientific information on which to base sound management plans should not be a hindrance when applying management measures. For example, in the case of species already recognised as of 'high concern' or 'concern in certain countries of its range' without management plans in place, a precautionary approach would be to close fishery altogether, or implement management tools such as minimum harvest size, No-Take zones and/or total allowable catch.

Additional work on species of 'concern' should include developing of scientific information on the biology, ecology, distribution, population genetics, so as to help develop such plans and promote sustainable use of this resource. The main areas of interest would be on stock assessment, ecology and biology. These, teamed up with an IUCN categorization could be valuable as it can clearly pinpoint research needs and help prioritize species of conservation concern. Sea cucumber fisheries are an important source of income in many developing countries, and if their populations are to be maintained or restored, funds should be devoted to develop better science, regulations and management strategies irrespective of their inclusion in the CITES Appendices.

Additional measures such as developing and disseminating identification guides for live and processed sea cucumber could assist the monitoring of international trade. The guides should aim their information to all levels of the trade chain, including fishers, traders, custom officers, border control agents, managers, scientist and politicians. Along these lines, capacity building for custom officers, managers and fishers should be implemented to enable them to correctly identify sea cucumbers in all forms of processing. This should be prioritised for developing countries where most of the beche-de-mer comes from.

A socioeconomic evaluation of the fisheries should be conducted, especially in developing countries, to clearly identify the importance and role of beche-de-mer fishing in the livelihoods of coastal fishing communities. This may help to identify viable alternatives to a beche-de-mer fishery.

A viable option, that should be considered by Parties involved in beche-de-mer fishery is the inclusion of their species in any CITES Appendices. Special consideration should be given to those species (i.e. 'high concern') already highlighted as in need of conservation and management actions. Additionally, the current Appendix III listing of *Isostichopus fuscus* by Ecuador should be assessed, with a report including current benefits of such listing, problems and needs. This could be used as an example for other Parties wishing to take similar action. So as to achieve this, greater cooperation between fisheries and CITES authorities should be encouraged, specifically in the areas of capacity building, training, and reporting. Additional work on capacity building should be address by FAO and CITES.

Appendix-II listings would additionally result in requirements to make non-detrimental findings and determine legal acquisitions for specimens to be exported, as well as in more detailed trade data. This would benefit the national management of exploited stocks and help pinpoint areas requiring further research or development, as well as possible conflicts or problem areas. A CITES listing would give such species priority for conservation actions, design of management tools, and taxonomic identification.

Provided the administrative and scientific capacity exists or can be developed to adequately implement a CITES listing, the inclusion of one or more species of sea cucumbers of the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae in CITES Appendix II may benefit their long-term conservation and survival by ensuring sustainable levels of off take and export, combined with strong controlling mechanisms to verify the legality of exports. Cooperation amongst range States would need to be enhanced in order to improve the effectiveness of a listing. Nonetheless, a more beneficial cooperation treaty would be between major range States and major consumer nations to ensure that CITES-listings work effectively. Additionally, regional and international organizations could cooperate by developing regional management plans for shared stocks, whilst scientific organizations should draw funds and attention to obtain basic biological, ecological and fishery information on sea cucumber species, with special attention to critically overexploited species, for which information is deemed vital.

Most sea cucumber species lack important biological, ecological and fishery information and the making of robust non-detrimental findings, as required with Appendix-II listings, might therefore be difficult in some circumstances. It should however be noted that such a determination can be based on extensive scientific research but also simply on the best information available to the Scientific Authority. Nonetheless, some species do not seem to have sufficient biological, conservation status, fishery and trade information to decide on their inclusion in Appendix II, and it is encouraged that such research takes place. Scientific research should be encouraged and funded, with the main emphasis on basic biological and ecological investigations as well as stock assessment for priority species. Governments should record catches up to species level, focusing on hotspots, both for biodiversity and social implications. Data on capture fisheries, aquaculture and/or sea ranching should be recorded independently, as this would allow to clearly identify the major origins of sea cucumbers entering international trade. Countries should improve reporting at the national and international level by including units (i.e. kg, tonnes), state of the

catch (i.e. fresh, frozen, in brine, dry) allowing an estimation of the total biomass removed from the wild. At the national level, each Party should clearly identify where the product comes from, the scientific name(s), locations, habitat, weight, size, total number of individuals, annotate regulations pertaining the fishery, if any, and distinguish if the product reported originates from capture fisheries or aquaculture/sea ranching. All these information should be centralized in one government agency. Information like this would allow comprehensive in-country analysis that will yield information that could help establish its exploitation level and facilitate regional reviews and analysis. At the international level (i.e. FAO) Parties should provide timely reports which should include information where the product originates from (capture fisheries or aquaculture), the state of the catch, scientific name, export value in USD. FAO and all Parties involved in beche-de-mer trading should work together to develop standardized codes for reporting international trade. These codes should be made available to main trading ports worldwide (i.e. Hong Kong SAR, Singapore, China) and strict adherence should be encouraged.

Mariculture and sea ranching of sea cucumber species has proved successful with few species in different regions as good examples, with China the forefront of these ventures. Best practices should be identified in China and other regions (i.e. Australia, New Caledonia) currently working on developing this alternative to capture fisheries. The FAO ASCAM proceedings provide a good summary of the methodologies used in China.

Lastly, FAO will be having a workshop to develop the "Technical guidelines for sustainable management of sea cucumber fisheries" in November 2007 with scientists and managers still to be decided. The outputs from this workshop should be evaluated by the Animals Committee, and recommend appropriate follow-up actions to support this initiative. Additionally, within a year of CoP14, the CITES Secretariat, FAO and other relevant partners should convene a technical evaluation in order to draft recommendations, identify and discuss progress in exporting countries, identify key needs in producing countries with the greatest number of species under trade, and develop pilot programs specific to individual countries of fisheries. The CITES Secretariat and FAO should help raise the funds to carry out this activity.

## 5. References

- Aguilar-Ibarra A and G Ramírez-Soberón 2002. Economic reasons, ecological actions and social consequences in the Mexican sea cucumber fishery. SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 17: 33-26.
- Altamirano M, Toral-Granda MV and Cruz E 2004. The application of the adaptive principle to the management and conservation of *Isostichopus fuscus* in the Galápagos Marine Reserve. Pp. 247–258 In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Aumeeruddy R and R Payet 2004. Management of the Seychelles sea cucumber fishery: status and prospects. Pp. 239-246. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Awaluddin A 2001. Pharmaceuticals. P. 118-119. In: The Encyclopaedia of Malaysia: The Seas. Ong JE and WK Gong (Eds). Editions Didier Millet, Kuala Lumpur.
- Azari D, Giraspy B and G Ivy 2005. Australia's first commercial sea cucumber culture and sea ranching project in Hervey Bay, Queensland, Australia. SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 21: 29-31
- Baine M and C Poh-Sze 1999. Sea cucumber fisheries and trade in Malaysia. P. 49-63. In: The conservation of sea cucumbers in Malaysia – their taxonomy, ecology and trade: proceedings of an international conference. Department of Agriculture, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. February 1999. Heriot-Watt University.
- Bakus JG 1973. The biology and ecology of tropical holothurians. In: OA Jones and R Edeans (eds.) Biology and Geology of Coral Reefs Vol. II, Academic Press, New York, pp. 326–367.
- Barnes RD 1977. Zoología de los Invertebrados. Editorial Interamericana. México.
- Battaglione SC 1999. Culture of Tropical Sea Cucumbers for Stock Restoration and Enhancement. Naga, The ICLARM Quarterly 22(4): 4-11.
- Battaglione SC and JD Bell 2004. The restocking of sea cucumbers in the Pacific Islands. Pp: 109-132. In: Marine ranching. Bartley DM and KM Leber (eds). FAO Fishery Technical Paper No. 429. FAO. Rome. 222 pp.
- Bell J and W Nash 2004. When should restocking and stock enhancement be used to manage sea cucumber fisheries? Pp. 173-179. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.

- Bruckner A (editor) 2005b. The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Bruckner A 2005a. Doc. 4 Management and Conservation strategies and practices for sea cucumber. In: Bruckner A (editor) The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Bruckner AW 2003. Conservation strategies for sea cucumbers: Can a CITES Appendix II listing promote sustainable international trade? SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 18: 24-33.
- Bruckner AW 2005c. The recent status of sea cucumber fisheries in the continental United States of America. SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 22: 39-46.
- Carranza C and M Andrade 1996. Retrospectiva de la pesca del pepino de mar a nivel continental. Fundación Charles Darwin para las Islas Galápagos/ORSTOM. Quito. 54 pp.
- Chen CP and CS Chian 1990. Larval development of the sea cucumber *Actinopyga echinites* (Echinodermata: Holothuroidea). Bull. Inst. Zool. Acad. Sin. 29:127-133.
- Chen J 2004. Present status and prospects of sea cucumber industry in China. Pp 25-38. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Cherbonnier G 1980. Holothurians de Nouvelle-Caledonie. Bulletin du Museum National d'Historie Naturelles de Belgique 44: 1-50.
- Conand C 1990. The fishery resources of Pacific Island Countries. Part 2: Holothurians. FAO Fisheries Technical Paper 272(2):143p. Rome.
- Conand C 2004. Present status of world sea cucumber resources and utilization: an international overview. Pp. 13-24. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Conand C 2005a. Sea cucumber biology, taxonomy, distribution, biology, conservation status. In: Bruckner A (editor) The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Conand C 2005b. Harvest and trade: Utilization of sea cucumbers; sea cucumbers fisheries trade; current international trade, illegal, unreported and unregulated trade; bycatch, socio-economic characteristics of the trade in sea cucumbers. In: Bruckner A (editor) The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Conand C and M Byrne 1993. A review of recent developments in the world sea cucumber fisheries. Marine Fisheries Review 55: 1-13.
- Conand CL 1993. Reproductive Biology of the holothurians from the major communities of the New Caledonian Lagoon. Marine Biology 116: 439-450.
- D'Silva D 2001. The Torres Strait beche-de-mer (sea cucumber) fishery. Beche-De-Mer Information Bulletin, SPC 15: 2-4.
- Dance SK, Lane I and JD Bell 2003. Variation in short-term survival of cultured sandfish (*Holothuria scabra*) released in mangrove-seagrass and coral reef flat habitats in Solomon Islands. Aquaculture 220: 495-505.
- Edgar GJ, Bustamante RH, Fariña JM, Calvopiña M, Martínez C and MV Toral-Granda 2004. Bias in evaluating the effects of marine protected areas: the importance of baseline data for the Galápagos Marine Reserve. Environmental Conservation 31(3):1-7.
- FAO 1996. Precautionary approach to capture fisheries and species introductions. Elaborated by the Technical Consultation on the Precautionary Approach to Capture Fisheries (Including Species Introductions). Lysekil, Sweden, 6-13 June 1995. FAO Technical Guidelines for Responsible Fisheries. No. 2. Rome, FAO. 1996. 54p.
- FAO 2004a. Report of the "Expert consultation on implementation issues associated with listing commercially-exploited aquatic species on CITES Appendices". Rome, 25-28 May 2004. FAO Fisheries Report No. 741. 24 pp.
- FAO 2004b. The state of world fisheries and aquaculture. FAO Fisheries Department. Rome, Italy. 153 pp.
- Ferdouse F 2004. World markets and trade flows of sea cucumber/beche-de-mer. Pp. 101-118. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Francour P1998. Predation in holothurians: a literature review. Invertebrate Ecology 116: 52-80.

- Gell FR and CM Roberts 2003. Benefits beyond boundaries: the fishery effects of marine reserves. *TREE* 18(9): 448-455.
- Guisado C 2005. CONICYT Project: Development of the cultivation technology of the sea cucumber *Athyonidium chilensis*, in the Chilean South Central Region. Correspondence from Professor Chita Guisado. SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 21: 34.
- Hamel JF and A Mercier 1996. Studies on the reproductive biology of the Atlantic sea cucumber *Cucumaria frondosa*. SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin 8: 22-33.
- Hamel JF and A Mercier 1997. Sea Cucumbers: Current Fishery and Prospects for Aquaculture. *Aquaculture Magazine* 23(1): 42-53, Feb 1997.
- Harriot VJ 1985. Reproductive biology of three congeneric sea cucumber species, *Holothuria atra*, *H. impatiens* and *H. edulis*, at Heron Reef, Great Barrier Reef. *Australian Journal of Marine and Freshwater Research* 36: 51-7.
- Herrero-Pérezrul MD, Reyes Bonilla H, García-Domínguez F and CE Cintra-Buenrostro 1999. Reproduction and growth of *Isostichopus fuscus* (Echinodermata: Holothuroidea) in the southern Gulf of California, México. *Marine Biology* 135: 521-532.
- Hickman CJ 1998. A field guide to sea stars and other echinoderms of Galápagos. Sugar Spring Press, Lexington, VA, USA. 83 pp.
- Jia J and J Chen 2001. Sea farming and sea ranching in China. FAO FISHERIES TECHNICAL PAPER 418. Rome, Italy.
- Kang KH, Kwon JY and KM Yong 2003. A beneficial coculture: charm abalone *Haliotis discus hannai* and sea cucumber *Stichopus japonicus*. *Aquaculture* 216: 87–93
- Kinch J 2002. Overview of the beche-de-mer fishery in Milne Bay Province, Papua New Guinea. SPC Beche-de-mer Information Bulletin 17:2-16.
- Kinch J 2005. National Report – Papua New Guinea. In: Bruckner A (editor) The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Lawrence AJ, Ahmed M, Hanafy M, Gabr H, Ibrahim A and A.A-F.A. Gab-Alla 2004. Status of the sea cucumber fishery in the Red Sea – the Egyptian experience. Pp. 79-90. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463. 425 pp.
- Li X 2004. Fishery and resource management of tropical sea cucumbers in the islands of the South China sea. Pp. 261-265. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463. 425 pp.
- Lo TH 2005. Valuation of sea cucumber attributes through laddering. SPC Beche-de-mer 20: 34-37.
- Lokani , Polon P and R Lari 1996. Management of bêche-de-mer fisheries in the western province of Papua New Guinea. South Pacific Commission Bêche-de-mer Information Bulletin 8: 7-11.
- Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds) 2004. *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Massin C, Mercier A and JF Hamel 2000. Ossicle change in *Holothuria scabra* with a discussion of ossicle evolution within the Holothuriidae (Echinodermata). *Acta Zoologica (Stockholm)* 81:77–91.
- Naylor RL, Goldberg RJ, Primavera JH, Kautsky N, Beveridge MCM, Clay J, Folke C, Lubchenco J, Mooney H and M Troell 2000. Effect of aquaculture on world fish supplies. *Nature* 405: 1017-1024.
- Nithyanandan N 2003. Sea cucumbers: A resource in peril. Indiscriminate fishing of sea cucumber in Indian Seas has led to their overexploitation. *Samudra* November: 24-26.
- Pitt R and N Dinh Quang Duy 2004. Breeding and rearing of the sea cucumber *Holothuria scabra* in VietNam. Pp. 333-346. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Poh-Sze C 2004. Fisheries, trade and utilization of sea cucumbers in Malaysia. Pp. 57-68. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Preston GL 1990. Bêche-de-mer resource management studies in Guam. South Pacific Commission Bêche-de-mer Information Bulletin 1: 8-9
- Purcell S 2004. Criteria for release strategies and evaluating the restocking of sea cucumbers. Pp. 181-191. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.

- Purcell SW, Patrois J and N Fraisse 2006. Experimental evaluation of co-culture of juvenile sea cucumbers, *Holothuria scabra* (Jaeger), with juvenile blue shrimp, *Litopenaeus stylirostris* (Stimpson). *Aquaculture Research* 37: 515-522
- Ramofafia C, Gervis M and JD Bell 1995. Spawning and early larval rearing of *Holothuria atra*. *South Pacific Commission Bêche-de-mer Information Bulletin* 7: 2-6.
- Rasolofonirina R and M Jangoux 2005. Appearance and development of skeletal structures in *Holothuria scabra* larvae and epibiont juveniles. *SPC Beche-de-mer Information Bulletin* 22: 6-10.
- Rasolofonirina Rm Mara E and M Jangoux 2004. Sea cucumber fishery and mariculture in Madagascar, a case study of Toliara, southwest Madagascar. Pp. 133-149. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Richards AH, Bell LJ and JD Bell 1994. Inshore fisheries resources of Solomon Islands. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 29: 90-98.
- Richmond R 1997. Reproduction and recruitment in corals: critical links in the persistence of reefs. Pp. 175-196. In: Birkeland C (ed) *Life and death of coral reefs*. New York, Chapman and Hall.
- Ryman N, Jorde PE and AL Lairke 1995. Supportive breeding and variance effective population size. *Conservation Biology* 9: 1619-1628.
- Samyn Y, VandenSpiegel D and C Massin 2005. Sea cucumbers of the Comoros Archipelago. *SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin* 22: 14-18.
- Sant G 2005. Cites and sea cucumbers. In: Bruckner A (editor) *The Proceedings of the Technical workshop on the conservation of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuridae and Stichopodidae*. NOAA Technical Memorandum NMFS-OPR 44, Silver Spring, MD 239 pp.
- Sarver D 1995. Update on the work at the Royal Hawaiian Sea Farms. *South Pacific Commission Bêche-de-mer Information Bulletin* 7: 25.
- Schroeter SC, Reed DC, Kushner DJ, Estes JA and DS Ono 2001. The use of marine reserves in evaluating the dive fishery for the warty sea cucumber (*Parastichopus parvimensis*) in California, USA. *Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* 58: 1773-1781.
- Shiell GR and S Uthicke 2005. Reproduction of the commercial sea cucumber *Holothuria whitmaie* (*Holothuria: Aspidochirotida*) in the Indian and Pacific Ocean regions of Australia. *Marine Biology* on line.
- Skewes TD, Dennis DM and CM Burridge 2000. Survey of *Holothuria scabra* (sandfish) on Warrior Reef, Torres Strait. January 2000 report to Queensland Fisheries Management Authority. CSIRO Division of Marine Research final report. April 2000. 26 pp.
- Stutterd E and G Williams 2003. The future of bêche-de-mer and trochus fisheries and aquaculture in Australia. Final report to the Fisheries Resources Research Fund. February 2003.
- Toral-Granda MV 2005a. Requiem for the Galápagos sea cucumber fishery? *SPC Beche-de-Mer Information Bulletin* 21:5-8.
- Toral-Granda MV 2005b. The use of calcareous spicules for the identification of the Galápagos sea cucumber *Isostichopus fuscus* in the international market. *SPC Beche-de-mer* 22: 3-5.
- Toral-Granda MV and PC Martínez 2004. Population density and fishery impacts on the sea cucumber *Isostichopus fuscus* in the Galápagos Marine Reserve. Pp. 91-100. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463. 425 pp.
- Toral-Granda MV, Vega S and M Altamirano 2003. Análisis, comparaciones y proyecciones del estado poblacional de *Isostichopus fuscus* en la Reserva Marina de Galápagos. Informe Anual. Fundación Charles Darwin / Parque Nacional Galápagos. 38 pp.
- Tuwo A 2004. Status of sea cucumber fisheries and farming in Indonesia. Pp. 49-56. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Tuya FC, Soboil ML and J Kido 2000. An assessment of the effectiveness of Marine Protected Areas in the San Juan Islands, Washington, USA. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 57: 1218-1226.
- Uthicke S 1999. Sediment bioturbation and impact of feeding activity of *Holothuria* (*Halodeima*) *atra* and *Stichopus chloronotus*, two sediment feeding holothurians, at Lizard Island, Great Barrier Reef. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 64: 129-141.
- Uthicke S 2001. Nutrient regeneration by abundant coral reef holothurians. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 265: 153-170.

- Uthicke S 2004. Overfishing of holothurians: lessons from the Great Barrier Reef. Pp. 163-171. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Uthicke S and C Conand 2005. Local examples of beche-de-mer overfishing: An initial summary and request for information. *SPC Beche-de-mer Information Bulletin* 21: 9-14.
- Uthicke S and D Klumpp 1996. *Bêche-de-mer: A Literature Review on Holothurian Fishery and Ecology*. Prepared for the Cape York Land Council. Australian Institute of Marine Science, Townsville.
- Uthicke S and DW Klump 1998. Microbenthos community production in sediments of a near shore coral reef: seasonal variation and response to ammonium recycled by holothurians. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 169:1-11.
- Uthicke S and JAH Benzie 2000. Effect of beche-de-mer fishing on densities and size structure of *Holothuria nobilis* (Echinodermata, Holothuroidea) populations on the Great Barrier Reef. *Coral Reefs* 19: 271-276.
- Uthicke S and JAH Benzie 2003. Gene flow and population history in high dispersal marine invertebrates: mitochondrial DNA analysis of *Holothuria nobilis* (Echinodermata: Holothuroidea) populations from the Indo-Pacific. *Molecular Ecology* 12: 2635-2648.
- Uthicke S and S Purcell 2004. Preservation of genetic diversity in restocking of the sea cucumber *Holothuria scabra* investigated by allozyme electrophoresis. *Canadian Journal of Fish and Aquatic Sciences* 61: 519–528.
- Uthicke S, O'Hara TD and M Byrne 2004. Species composition and molecular phylogeny of the Indo-Pacific teatfish (Echinodermata:Holothuroidea) bêche-de-mer fishery. *Marine and Freshwater Research* 55: 837-848.
- Uthicke S, Purcell S and B Blockmans 2005. Natural hybridisation does not dissolve species boundaries in commercially important species. *Biological Journal of the Linnaen Society* 85: 261-270.
- Utter F 1998. Genetic problems of hatchery-reared progeny released into the wild, and how to deal with them. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 65: 623-640.
- Vannuccini S 2004. Sea cucumbers: a compendium of fishery statistics. Pp. 399–412. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463: 425 p.
- Ward TJ, Heinemann D and N Evans 2001. *The Role of Marine Reserves as Fisheries Management Tools: a review of concepts, evidence and international experience*. Bureau of Rural Sciences, Canberra, Australia. 192 pp.
- Williams MJ, Bell JD, Gupta MV, Dey M, Ahmed M, Prein M, Child S, Gardiner PR, Brummett R and D Jamu 2000. Responsible aquaculture can aid food problems. *Nature* 406, 673.
- Xilin S 2004. The progress and prospects studies on artificial propagation and culture of the sea cucumber *A. japonicus*. Pp. 273-276. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463. 425 pp.
- Yaqing C, Changqing Y and S Xing 2004. Pond culture of sea cucumbers, *Apostichopus japonicus*, in Dalian. Pp.269-272. In: Lovatelli A, Conand C, Purcell S, Uthicke S, Hamel J-F and Mercier A (eds). *Advances in Sea Cucumber Aquaculture and Management*. FAO, Rome, Fisheries Technical Paper No. 463. 425 pp.

## ANNEX 1

### Comparison of activities and measures recommended by the CITES and FAO workshops and organizations involved in each activity

Activity/measure	FAO Dalian Workshop	CITES KL Workshop	Organizations involved
Establish and implement management plans for sea cucumber populations	√	√	FAO, research agencies
Implementation of management tools adapted to the situation in the different producing countries	√	√	FAO, research agencies
Need to have a stronger community participation in the designing, developing and implementation of management plans	√	√	FAO
Stock assessment and scientific information gathering before engaging in commercial fishery	√	√	FAO, universities, research agencies
Need for information on catches, processing and exports at the national level in a standardized form	√	√	FAO, CITES
Improve harvesting and post-harvesting methods as a conservation measure. Elaboration of manuals.	√	√	FAO
International intervention needed to assist in the conservation and management of sea cucumbers; training of Customs, clearance and border officers	√	√	CITES
Critical research needs including: parameters for fishery models, minimum stock size for successful reproduction, general ecological and biological studies, effectiveness of Marine Protected Areas, taxonomy.	√	√	Research agencies, universities
Research to promote development of aquaculture, restocking and stock enhancement	√	√	Research agencies, FAO
Need to develop trade bulletins		√	National agencies
Communication and awareness		√	CITES
Identification of trade routes	√	√	CITES

## ANNEX 2

### Worldwide population status of sea cucumbers

Country or territory	Species	Status	Reference
Australia	<i>10 species</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke, 2004
China	<i>18 species</i>	Declining	Li, 2004
Comoros	<i>&gt; 4 species</i>	Overexploited	Samyn <i>et al.</i> , 2005
Cuba	<i>Isostichopus badionotus</i>	Stable	Alfonso <i>et al.</i> , 2004
Ecuador (continental)	<i>Isostichopus fuscus</i>	Overexploited	Carranza and Andrade, 1996
Ecuador (Galápagos)	<i>Isostichopus fuscus</i>	Overexploited	Toral-Granda, 2005
Egypt	<i>22 species</i>	Overexploited	Lawrence <i>et al.</i> , 2004
Fiji	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke and Conand, 2005
India	<i>&gt; 3 species</i>	Overexploited	Bruckner, 2005a
Indonesia	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke and Conand, 2005
Japan	<i>Apostichopus japonicus</i>	Declining	Bruckner, 2005a
Kenya	<i>14 species</i>	Declining	Bruckner, 2005a
Madagascar	<i>28 species</i>	Overexploited	Rasolofonirina <i>et al.</i> , 2004
Malaysia	<i>Stichopus hermani</i>	Close to extinction	Poh-Sze, 2004
Malaysia	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Overexploited	Poh-Sze, 2004
Mexico	<i>Isostichopus fuscus</i>	Overexploited	Aguilar-Ibarra and Ramírez-Soberón, 2002
Mozambique	<i>11 species</i>	Overexploited	Bruckner, 2005a
New Caledonia (France)	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke and Conand, 2005
New Caledonia (France)	<i>Holothuria fuscogilva</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke and Conand, 2005
Panama	<i>3 species</i>	Overexploited	Bruckner, 2005a
Papua New Guinea	<i>21 species</i>	Declining	Polon, 2004
Philippines	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Declining	Gamboa <i>et al.</i> , 2004
Seychelles	<i>6 species</i>	Overexploited	Aumeeruddy and Payet, 2004
Solomon Islands	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Overexploited	Uthicke and Conand, 2005
Sri Lanka	<i>3 species</i>	Overexploited	Terney Pradeep Kumara <i>et al.</i> , 2005
Thailand	<i>&gt; 3 species</i>	Overexploited	Bruckner, 2005a
United Republic of Tanzania	<i>10 species</i>	Overexploited	Mmbaga and Mgaya, 2004
United States	<i>3 species</i>	Overexploited (in some areas)	Bruckner, 2005c

### ANNEX 3

#### Main commercial species with their commercial value, conservation concern, common name and distribution

#	Species * taxonomy to be revised	Family	Commercial value	Conservation concern	Common name	Distribution
1	<i>Holothuria fuscogilva</i> *	Holothuriidae	High	1	White teatfish	SP
2	<i>Holothuria nobilis</i> *	Holothuriidae	Medium	1	Black teatfish	SP
3	<i>Holothuria scabra</i>	Holothuriidae	High	1	Sandfish	SP, SEA
4	<i>Isostichopus fuscus</i>	Stichopodidae	Medium	1	Brown sea cucumber	EP
5	<i>Thelenota ananas</i>	Stichopodidae	High	1	Prickly redfish	SP
6	<i>Actinopyga echinites</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	2	Deep water redfish	SP
7	<i>Actinopyga miliaris</i> *	Holothuriidae	Medium	2	Blackfish	SP
8	<i>Actinopyga mauritania</i>	Holothuriidae	Medium	2	Surf Redfish	SP
9	<i>Holothuria scabra versicolor</i> *	Holothuriidae	High	2	Sandfish	IO, SP, SEA
10	<i>Stichopus chloronotus</i>	Stichopodidae	Medium	2	Greenfish	SP
11	<i>Stichopus horrens</i>	Stichopodidae	Medium	2	Warty sea cucumber	SP, EP
12	<i>Stichopus hermanii (S. variegatus)</i> *	Stichopodidae	Medium	2	Curry fish	SP, SEA
13	<i>Actinopyga lecanora</i>	Holothuriidae	Medium	3	Stone fish	SP
14	<i>Holothuria fuscopunctata</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	3	Elephant trunkfish	SP
15	<i>Bohadschia argus</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	3		SP
16	<i>Isostichopus badionotus</i>	Stichopodidae		3		
17	<i>Parastichopus californicus</i>	Stichopodidae		3	Giant red sea cucumber	EP-Canada
18	<i>Thelenota anax</i>	Stichopodidae	Medium	3	Amberfish	SP
19	<i>Cucumaria frondosa</i>	Cucumariidae		3	Pumpkins, Orange footed cucumber	WA
20	<i>Athyonidium chilensis</i>	Cucumariidae		3	Pepino de mar	EP-Chile
21	<i>Athyonidium palauensis</i>	Holothuriidae	Medium	4		SP
22	<i>Athyonidium agassizi</i>	Holothuriidae		4		
23	<i>Holothuria (Halodeima) atra</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4	Lollyfish	SP
24	<i>Holothuria leucospilota</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4		SP

25	<i>Holothuria edulis</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4	Pinkfish	SP
26	<i>Holothuria coluber</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4		SP
27	<i>Holothuria mexicana</i>	Holothuriidae		4	Donkey dung	VZ
28	<i>Bohadschia vitiensis*</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4		SP, IO
29	<i>Bohadschia marmorata vitiensis*</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4		
30	<i>Bohadschia similes</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4		SP
31	<i>Pearshonothuria graeffei</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	4	Flowerfish	
32	<i>Stichopus (Apostichopus) japonicus</i>	Stichopodidae	High	4		PNW
33	<i>Parastichopus parvimensis</i>	Stichopodidae		4	Warty sea cucumber	EP-Mexico
34	<i>Thelenota rubralineata</i>	Stichopodidae	Low	4		
35	<i>Astichopus multifidus</i>	Stichopodidae		4		
36	<i>Holothuria arenicola</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	5		SP
37	<i>Holothuria impatiens</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	5		SP, MX
38	<i>Holothuria cinerascens</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	5		SP
39	<i>Bohadschia atra</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	5		SP
40	<i>Bohadschia subrubra</i>	Holothuriidae	Low	5		SP
41	<i>Stichopus mollis</i>	Stichopodidae		5		NZ
42	<i>Pattalus mollis</i>	Cucumariidae			Pepino de mar	EP-Peru
43	<i>Pseudocolochirus axiologus</i>	Cucumariidae	Aquaria		Sea apple	SEA-Indonesia
44	<i>Pseudocolochirus violaceus</i>	Cucumariidae	Aquaria		Sea apple	SP-Australia

### Keys

#### Geographical areas

CS	Caribbean Sea
EP	Eastern Pacific
IO	Indian Ocean
MX	Mexico
NZ	New Zealand
PNW	Pacific North West
SEA	South East Asia
SP	South Pacific
VZ	Venezuela
WA	Western Atlantic

#### Conservation concern (modified from Bruckner, 2005b))

1	high concern
2	concern in certain countries of its range
3	potential for future concern as harvest increases
4	no concern
5	minor species of little commercial importance,

## ANNEX 4

### Hong Kong SAR imports of beche-de-mer (dried, salted or in brine; in kg) 1999 – September 2005 and annual gross income (in USD)

Source: Census and Statistics Department, Hong Kong SAR, China 2005

Year	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	
Country / Territory of origin	Quantity (kg)	Total						
Indonesia	762,707	1,041,559	1,068,768	1,010,698	977,893	859,486	498,332	6,219,443
Philippines	591,092	1,070,154	737,232	802,023	666,841	593,512	469,093	4,929,947
Papua N Guinea	350,321	524,101	54,122	380,595	447,632	518,296	412,755	2,687,822
Singapore R	165,911	284,804	249,278	284,657	409,315	486,299	174,180	2,054,444
Fiji	168,264	364,369	291,093	235,503	264,253	272,276	223,565	1,819,323
Madagascar	166,364	178,392	194,129	193,551	216,354	175,671	140,890	1,265,351
Solomon Is	49,737	149,115	259,727	248,751	222,763	153,255	103,640	1,186,988
Japan	58,343	75,528	110,558	137,999	206,359	259,120	209,098	1,057,005
Australia	125,289	146,524	185,952	124,665	118,827	128,075	95,018	924,350
Yemen R	3,287	0	4,848	102,414	134,919	478,744	196,856	921,068
USA	112,283	170,423	88,816	154,837	113,119	93,189	157,523	890,190
Malaysia	19,854	67,975	73,158	144,754	147,523	96,653	59,539	609,456
Thailand	60,331	133,858	101,020	78,528	69,207	95,197	35,924	574,065
Tanzania	41,352	118,166	56,382	91,672	67,555	94,509	50,598	520,234
Sri Lanka	21,381	53,867	33,288	54,523	64,972	106,858	75,711	410,600
Taiwan	40,958	37,830	40,143	40,800	34,570	88,971	28,943	312,215
Canada	4,883	13,837	58,541	17,861	60,506	51,580	12,516	219,724
Maldives R	4,170	53,915	27,928	37,829	49,013	21,347	2,812	197,014
U A Emirates	140	9,100	256	17,141	4,508	140,281	14,213	185,639
South Africa R	10,149	27,876	30,178	53,792	37,800	14,945	4,778	179,518
Aust & Oceania Nes	32,294	24,227	37,574	22,558	21,256	27,000	13,377	178,286
Kenya	1,707	51,580	39,444	20,429	22,658	21,809	17,345	174,972
Mozambique	500	109	853	37,000	63,363	41,900	24,021	167,746
The Mainland of China	25,020	14,946	4,031	37,400	30,657	47,226	1,783	161,063
Djibouti	0	0	1	4,133	134,999	8,660	0	147,793
Seychelles	0	7,121	15,678	5,662	13,028	18,413	23,189	83,091
Vanuatu	7,966	28,467	16,647	8,363	9,001	5,305	5,622	81,371
Ecuador	24,567	15,285	991	10,130	3,026	11,322	12,123	77,444
US Oceania	11,528	17,623	40,622	0	0	0	0	69,773
Peru	4,170	7,331	3,881	1,828	8,354	19,906	15,760	61,230
Cuba	2,920	19,023	13,941	3,800	7,648	5,080	8,641	61,053
Kiribati R	6,523	9,073	22,774	8,561	5,528	1,932	3,155	57,546
Egypt Arab R	0	677	0	6,510	17,220	17,813	13,102	55,322
Vietnam	34,093	600	3,274	756	5,415	2,735	6,576	53,449
India	6,610	1,906	9,810	2,391	5,655	21,029	2,523	49,924
African Nes	0	0	0	2,340	19,977	18,993	0	41,310
Micronesia FS & Palau	0	0	0	6,368	2,252	17,798	14,680	41,098
Chile	0	22,318	7,599	2,906	527	4,485	2,934	40,769
Ethiopia	0	0	0	0	0	12,000	12,200	24,200
Morocco	0	0	7,438	1,932	0	5,124	4,890	19,384
New Zealand	530	7,583	317	1,440	3,471	1,668	1,450	16,459
Mexico	0	150	1,818	3,302	1,270	4,294	2,378	13,212
Saudi Arabia	782	0		30	0	8,973	3,350	13,135

Year	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	
Country / Territory of origin	Quantity (kg)	Total						
Mauritius	300	3,185	0	667	3,682	3,793	0	11,627
Tunisia	0	0	0	0	11,300	0	0	11,300
Haiti	0	0	0	1,000	9,680	0	0	10,680
Oman	180	960	490	507	0	3,842	4,015	9,994
Korea R	0	0	0	651	510	796	4,159	6,116
W Samoa	5,718	0	0	0	0	0	0	5,718
Mauritania	0	0	0	1,860	0	1,930	862	4,652
Russian Federation	0	0	0	0	0	3,259	1,314	4,573
Turkey	0	0	0	1,290	1,995	1,280	0	4,565
Somali Dem R	0	0	0	3,835	0	0	0	3,835
Nicaragua	0	0	0	0	252	0	2,959	3,211
Senegal	0	0	0	3,000	0	0	0	3,000
Marshall Islands	0	0	0	0	2,739	0	0	2,739
Dominican R	0	0	0	2,562	45	0	0	2,607
Colombia	0	0	540	0	0	0	1,646	2,186
Comoros	0	600	0	0	0	700	300	1,600
Tonga	0	0	0	0	296	1,130	94	1,520
Puerto Rico	0	0	0	1,300	0	0	0	1,300
Costa Rica	108	664	325	0	7	164	0	1,268
Macao	0	0	1,200	0	0	0	0	1,200
Spain	0	1,000	0	0	0	81	0	1,081
Hong Kong SAR	0	0	0	0	874	0	0	874
C & S American Nes	0	0	0	0	0	645	0	645
Brazil	0	0	444	50	0	0	0	494
Sudan	0	0	0	0	0	0	490	490
Venezuela	0	0	0	0	0	0	456	456
Panama	0	0	0	0	0	281	138	419
Swaziland	0	354	0	0	0	0	0	354
Korea Dem P R	0	0	0	0	284	0	0	284
Sao Tome And Principe	0	0	0	0	202	0	0	202
Yugoslavia F R	0	0	0	200	0	0	0	200
Myanmar	0	0	0	0	0	195	0	195
France	0	0	155	0	0	0	0	155
Asian Nes	0	0	0	0	96	0	0	96
Netherlands	0	0	8	0	0	0	42	50
Total (kg)	2,922,332	4,758,719	4,382,272	4,417,354	4,655,496	5,069,825	3,171,558	29,377,556
Total HKD (in millions)	260,422	432,666	393,292	439,628	602,212	777,579	621,532	3,527,331
Average Exchange rate USD to HKD <sup>o</sup>	7.76	7.79	7.8	7.8	7.79	7.79	7.78	
USD (in millions)	33,559.54	55,541.21	50,422.05	56,362.56	77,305.78	99,817.59	79,888.43	452,897.15

<sup>o</sup> Source: <http://www.oanda.com/convert/fxhistory>, consulted on 12 December 2005.

DRAFT DECISIONS OF THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES

Decisions proposed by the Animals Committee to the Conference of the Parties regarding the conservation of and trade in sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae

***Directed to the Parties***

- 14.xx Range States of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae are encouraged to:
- a) develop and implement national adaptive management plans for species of high conservation concern, such as those identified as of 'high concern' and 'concern in certain countries of its range' in Annex 3 of the discussion paper on *Biological and trade status of sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae* presented in document CoP14 Doc. 62, including minimum harvest size and total allowable catch, and apply where appropriate a precautionary approach, such as restrictive fisheries measures;
  - b) develop regional management strategies to manage the resource;
  - c) develop a standardized approach for the collection and reporting of fisheries and trade data, including species collected, locations, habitat, weight, size and number of individuals;
  - d) encourage greater communications and cooperation between fisheries and CITES authorities at the national level for the management of and trade in specimens of these species.
  - e) increase significantly basic biological and ecological research and stock assessments, particularly for species of high conservation concern, such as those identified as of 'high concern' and 'concern in certain countries of its range' in the discussion paper referred to in paragraph a) above;
  - f) enhance their enforcement capacity to reduce illegal fishing, transshipment and landings, as well as their capacity to implement the current Appendix-III listing;
  - g) explore the potential of mariculture in promoting the sustainable use of the resource, with experience from China, and identify best practices; and
  - h) consider the merits of inclusion of their species of conservation concern in Appendix III, where appropriate.
- 14.xx Parties that are engaged in trade in sea cucumbers in the families Holothuriidae and Stichopodidae are encouraged to:
- a) support the development of harmonized codes for reporting international trade in sea cucumber products; and
  - b) develop and distribute identification guides that clearly distinguish sea cucumbers subject to international trade.

***Directed to the Secretariat***

- 14.xx The Secretariat shall promote greater cooperation between CITES and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), particularly in the area of capacity building.

***Directed to the Animals Committee***

- 14.xx The Animals Committee shall evaluate the outcomes of an FAO Workshop on Sustainable Use and Management of Sea Cucumbers fisheries, to be conducted in 2007, and recommend appropriate follow-up actions at the 15th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to support this initiative and progress the recommendations made to Parties in Decision 14.xx.