

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Eleventh meeting of the Conference of the Parties  
Gigiri (Kenya), 10-20 April 2000

Strategic and administrative matters

Committee reports and recommendations

Animals Committee

REPORT OF THE CHAIRMAN

Introduction

1. This report covers the period from July 1997 to December 1999. During this period the Animals Committee met on two occasions (14th meeting, Caracas, Venezuela, 25-29 May 1998; 15th meeting, Antananarivo, Madagascar, 5-9 July 1999). The meetings were hosted by the Management Authorities of the countries concerned.
2. The composition of the Committee (tabulated below) was, after the 10th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Harare, June, 1997), increased by an additional representative and alternate representative for the European region, following accession to the Convention of new Parties in that region prior to the 10th meeting.

Region	Regional representative	Alternate
Africa	Mr Jean Ngog Nje (Cameroon)	Mr Essô Joseph Bowessidjaou (Togo)
	Prof Kim Howell (Tanzania)	Mr Edson Chidziya (Zimbabwe)
Asia	Mr Tonny Soehartono (Indonesia)	Mr P W Seneviratne (Sri Lanka)
	Mr Choo-Hoo Giam (Singapore)	Mr M Muzammel Hussain (Bangladesh)
Central & South America and the Caribbean	Licda. Mirna Quero De Peña (Venezuela)	Mr Roberto Ramos Tangarona (Cuba)
	Lic Oscar Francisco Lara (Guatemala)	Mr Sixto Inchaustegui (Dominican Republic)
Europe	Mr Marinus Hoogmoed (Netherlands)	Mr Tom Tew (United Kingdom) not replaced after 1998
	Ms Katalin Rodics (Hungary)	Mr Olof Bistrom (Finland)
North America	Ms Susan Lieberman (United States of America)	Mr Charles Dauphine (Canada)
Oceania	Mr Robert Jenkins (Australia)	Mr Rod Hay (New Zealand)

3. During the period since the 10th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, in addition to its regular responsibilities, the Committee also addressed all the tasks referred to it at that meeting. Issues were progressed at the two meetings of the Committee and inter-sessionally by working groups operating through correspondence.
4. The financial resources available to the Committee for its 14th meeting were insufficient for the meeting to be conducted in all three working languages of the Convention. In view of the location of the meeting and

the large number of Spanish-speaking delegates registered for the meeting, only simultaneous interpretation into English and Spanish was provided. Following the decision of the Standing Committee to allocate an additional CHF 21,000 from the Trust Fund for the provision of simultaneous interpretation services, the 15th meeting of the Committee was the first meeting of the Animals Committee at which it could conduct its work in the three working languages of the Convention.

5. The nature of the tasks that were referred to the Animals Committee in recent years, for more detailed consideration and advice, is such that large numbers of non-governmental observers interested in single issues are being attracted to meetings of the Committee. This has resulted in an imbalance between the numbers of Parties and non-governmental observers participating in the meetings, with the result that the former are greatly outnumbered by the latter. Although the participation of non-governmental organizations at meetings of the Committee has been beneficial overall, first and foremost the Animals Committee was established as a scientific advisory body to serve the Parties to the Convention. Furthermore, many of the issues being dealt with by the Animals Committee are either largely “non-scientific” or extremely sensitive politically, often making objective discussion very difficult. The Conference of the Parties to the Convention should address these important issues if the Animals Committee is to function as an effective advisory body on scientific matters relevant to implementation of the Convention.

### Activities of the Committee

#### General

6. In addition to the specific tasks entrusted to the Animals Committee by the Conference of the Parties, the ongoing activities of the Committee have focused on the following issues:
  - a) phase IV of the review of Appendix-II listed animal species subject to significant levels of international trade, pursuant to Resolution Conf 8.9;
  - b) the periodic review of animal species included in the appendices;
  - c) trade in invasive alien species;
  - d) trade in animal species used in traditional medicines.
7. Certain items, that have been the subject of deliberations by the Committee, have been the subject of work to develop draft resolutions whose preparation has been completed by the Secretariat for consideration at the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. Each of these draft resolutions is accompanied by an introductory explanation of the issue concerned and will, therefore, not be dealt with in the present report except in cases where they relate to broader issues considered by the Committee. The issues are the following:
  - a) universal tagging system for crocodylian skins;
  - b) marking of sturgeon specimens;
  - c) ranching and trade in ranched specimens;
  - d) registration of captive breeding operations;
  - e) use of coded-microchip implants;
  - f) revision of Resolution Conf 8.9 on trade in wild-caught specimens of Appendix-II species.
8. The above-mentioned draft resolutions represent the product of considerable consideration by the Animals Committee and, in some cases, extensive consultation with range States and/or affected Parties.

#### Major issues

##### Edible-nest swiftlets (Resolution Conf 9.15)

9. Paragraph b) of Resolution Conf 9.15, on Conservation of edible-nest swiftlets of the Genus *Collocalia*, directs the Animals Committee to provide scientific guidance for implementation of the resolution.

10. The conclusions of a technical workshop, hosted by the CITES Management Authority of Indonesia and held in Surabaya, Indonesia, in November 1996, can be summarized as follows:
  - a) edible-nest swiftlets are widespread and abundant with no immediate conservation risk;
  - b) management of swiftlets should incorporate local social, environmental, legal and economic considerations; and
  - c) management should ensure that harvesting of nests is sustainable and should ensure conservation of the resource.
11. In accordance with a recommendation of this same workshop, ASEAN formed a Steering Committee (the ASEAN Task Force for the Conservation of Edible-nest swiftlets). The first meeting of the ASEAN Task Force was held in Singapore in October 1997.
12. A second meeting of this Task Force, held in Bangkok, Thailand, on 11-18 February 1999, reviewed current research and agreed to compile a list of published and unpublished reports of research and received summaries of present ASEAN laws on harvest of and trade in swiftlet nests.
13. The workshop also encouraged countries to ensure that management and trade controls for swiftlet nests are the responsibilities of the CITES Management Authorities, and agreed to compile existing data on trade in swiftlet nests.
14. The third meeting of the Task Force is scheduled to be held in Sarawak, Malaysia in the year 2000.
15. The 15th meeting of the Animals Committee reviewed the situation regarding the conservation and management of trade in *Collocalia* spp. in South East Asia. On the basis of a report by the Asian representative on the above activities, and subsequent discussion, it became apparent that the range States and consumer countries are committed to the conservation of these birds and that significant improvements are under way towards controlling trade in nests in the region. Accordingly, the Committee recorded its congratulations to the countries concerned and concluded that Resolution Conf. 9.15 had achieved its desired effect in drawing attention to the need to sustainably manage the *Collocalia* resources.
16. Acknowledging that the described activities above represent an excellent example of a potential resource management problem that has been successfully addressed by the principal range States and consumer countries, and encouraging continued efforts by the ASEAN Task Force to promote conservation of the species in the wild, the Animals Committee agreed to recommend that Resolution Conf. 9.15 should be repealed. A recommendation to that effect has been included in paragraph 48 of this document.

#### Transport of live animals (Resolution Conf. 10.21)

17. The Conference of the Parties at its 10th meeting adopted Resolution Conf. 10.21 which mandated the Animals Committee to deal with matters related to the transport of live animals. Annex 2 of Resolution Conf. 9.1 was amended accordingly to reflect this decision. The Committee established a working group, under the chairmanship of Germany, to collaborate with the Secretariat in implementing the tasks contained in Resolution Conf. 10.21. Resolution Conf. 10.21 directs the Secretariat to monitor implementation of the recommendations contained therein and report to the Conference of the Parties. A summary of the activities and progress of the working group is included in document Doc. 11.54.

#### International trade in sharks (Resolution Conf. 9.17)

18. In accordance with the provisions of Decision 10.73, the Chairman was invited to participate in a technical working group, hosted by the Government of Japan in April 1998, to formulate the basic elements of a shark action plan. The document produced by this working group was subsequently used by the FAO Committee on Fisheries (COFI) for the development of a draft Action Plan for Sharks. In July 1998, FAO/COFI convened a preparatory meeting to refine the draft Plan before its discussion in the consultative meeting of Member States in Rome, in October 1998. The Secretariat and the chairman of the Animals Committee attended this consultative meeting, which reviewed the draft plan and prepared a document to be presented to Member States at the February 1999 meeting of COFI.
19. At its 15th meeting, the Animals Committee noted the activities that had been pursued by FAO/COFI and the adoption in February 1999 of *the International Plan of Action for the Conservation and Management of*

*Sharks'* (IPOA-SHARKS). However, notwithstanding the significant progress that had been made, some concerns persist that insufficient emphasis has been placed on the need to establish more effective mechanisms for the recording and reporting of trade in sharks and shark parts and derivatives. Furthermore, it was noted that, although FAO Member States had adopted the IPOA-SHARKS, its implementation by Member States remained voluntary.

20. It was recognized that the activities prescribed by Resolution Conf. 9.17 have been completed and do not extend beyond the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. As a consequence, and in the light of the present policy of removing redundant or obsolete resolutions, there does not appear to be any compelling purpose for the continued retention of this resolution. Nevertheless, there remain certain outstanding issues that, in the spirit in which Resolution Conf. 9.17 was adopted, warrant further follow-up action. However, it would be more appropriate to replace Resolution Conf. 9.17 with decisions directed to the Chairman of the Animals Committee and the Secretariat.
21. The two draft decisions have accordingly been prepared and are presented in the Annex to this document.

Trade in alien species (implementation of Decisions 10.75 and 10.76)

22. The Animals Committee has maintained liaison with IUCN on progress; the publication of *the IUCN Guidelines for the Prevention of Biodiversity Loss Due to Biological Invasion*. The Guidelines, which have undergone several iterations, are scheduled to be submitted to the IUCN Governing Council for adoption in 2000.
23. Alien invasive species have been identified as one of the principal causal factors in loss of biodiversity, together with habitat fragmentation and destruction. The decisions taken at the 10th meeting of the Conference of the Parties coincided with a similar initiative underway within the framework of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD), whose fourth meeting of the Conference of the Parties has identified invasive species as a priority theme for the programme of work of the Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice (SBSTTA.)
24. The Global Invasive Species Program (GISP), in which also the IUCN/SSC Invasive Species Specialist Group participates, is taking a leading role in providing technical advice to the SBSTTA on invasive species. Through the Chairman of the Animals Committee, who attended the fourth meeting of the SBSTTA (Montreal, June 1999) and participated in discussions on invasive species in that forum, the Animals Committee has been informed of the scope of activities currently being undertaken by GISP.
25. One of the components of GISP involves documenting the historical movement patterns of species that are known to have become invasive in new environments. Clearly, the issue of problems associated with alien species is an area where there is considerable potential for synergy to be developed between CITES and the CBD. The human-assisted movement of CITES-listed species, known to have become established and invasive, is an area that can and should be addressed by the CITES Parties. The control of international trade in specimens of appendix-listed species that are identified by the Animals Committee and the IUCN Specialist Group as being potentially invasive in particular environments has the potential to contribute positively to the objectives of the CBD initiative. It should, however, be noted that CITES currently has no specific mechanisms in place to control such trade other than through stricter domestic measures.

Captive breeding issues (Resolution Conf. 10.16 and implementation of Decision 10.77)

26. The manner in which the Parties have interpreted and implemented the provisions of Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5, regarding specimens of animal species included in Appendix-I that are bred in captivity for commercial purposes has, over the years, proven to be particularly problematic.
27. At its 10th meeting, the Conference of the Parties adopted Resolution Conf. 10.16 on Specimens of animal species bred in captivity. Paragraph b) ii) C 2 a) of that resolution decides that the Animals Committee compile and submit for consideration by the Standing Committee, in consultation with range States and experts in captive breeding, a list of species "commonly bred in captivity to second or subsequent generation".
28. At the same meeting the Conference adopted Decision 10.77 regarding Specimens of animal species bred in captivity, requiring the Animals Committee to:

- a) examine the effectiveness of and the need for the existing registration system for operations breeding specimens of Appendix-I species in captivity for commercial purposes;
  - b) provide advice at the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties on the need for any changes; and
  - c) consider the proposed definition of “bred in captivity for commercial purposes” in document Doc. 10.67.
29. At its 14th meeting, the Committee established a working group to consider the issues mentioned in paragraphs 27 and 28. In the course of discussions, it became apparent that these tasks, although derived independently, are closely related. The manner in which one task is treated will influence the approach to the other.
30. The report of the Committee in response to Decision 10.77 is the subject of a specific item on the agenda (see document Doc. 11.48) and will not therefore be dealt with substantively here. However, the issues involved have proven extremely complex and problematic. The views of range States and consumer countries on many critical issues are widely disparate.
31. The working group established by the Animals Committee at its 14th meeting agreed to criteria for inclusion of species in the list of species “commonly bred in captivity”. These criteria and accompanying explanatory guidelines were circulated by the Secretariat in Notification to Parties No.1998/49 with a request for Parties to nominate species that satisfied the criteria as candidates for inclusion on the list.
32. Responses were received from the Management Authorities of Belgium, Canada, China, Germany, South Africa, the United Kingdom and the United States of America, nominating many hundreds of species of mammals, birds, reptiles and amphibians as suitable candidates for inclusion in the list.
33. Although from discussion on this subject at previous meetings of the Conference of the Parties and the Animals Committee it was clear that many Parties are interested in this subject, the Animals Committee is disappointed at the small number of responses received to this Notification.
34. The Animals Committee, at its 15th meeting, established an *ad hoc* working group to consider again the task of compiling a list of species commonly bred in captivity in light of the many hundreds of nominations received for inclusion on the list. During the course of discussions within the working group and subsequently by the Committee, it became apparent that the construction of a list would prove to be problematic. In an effort to progress this matter further, an inter-sessional *ad hoc* working group, chaired by Chile, was established.
35. No substantial progress has been made on this matter since the 10th meeting of the Conference of the Parties. Under the circumstances and in light of the difficulties experienced by the Animals Committee in reaching consensus on appropriate criteria for determining the eligibility of a species for inclusion on a list of species commonly bred in captivity, the overall utility of such a list must be seriously questioned. An alternative reverse approach, that lists species of critical conservation concern and species that are known to be difficult to keep or breed in captivity, would have more relevance to global conservation efforts and would be more productive in advancing this issue in the long-term. Under the circumstances therefore, it would be appropriate to delete paragraph b) ii) C 2 a) of Resolution Conf. 10.16 in favour of adopting the alternative approach.
36. This approach would focus on developing a list comprising Appendix-I species (or geographically distinct populations thereof) that are:
- a) critically endangered in the wild; and/or
  - b) known to be difficult to breed or keep in captivity.
37. The Animals Committee could be directed to collaborate with range States and relevant experts in co-ordinating the development of such a list. An appropriate recommendation has been included in paragraph 48 of this document.

#### Review of significant trade (Resolution Conf. 8.9)

38. Following the 10th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the Animals Committee initiated Phase IV of the review of trade in Appendix-II animal species, pursuant to Resolution Conf. 8.9. The procedure followed was as prescribed in Decision 10.79. The Committee, at its 14th meeting, reviewed WCMC summaries of available trade records for the period 1992-1996. Candidate taxa were selected on the basis of reported levels of exports for the period. The list was refined and reduced to the species listed in document Doc. 11.41.1. With the exception of *Vicuna vicuna*, *Moschus* spp. and *Naja* spp. (for which alternative arrangements were agreed), IUCN, WCMC and TRAFFIC International were subsequently contracted by the Secretariat to undertake desk-based reviews. The Committee, at its 15th meeting, assessed these reviews and determined whether, on the basis of the information presented, any further action under Resolution Conf. 8.9 was warranted.
39. In addition to the species covered in the Phase IV review, the Committee is currently pursuing action (e.g. formulation of recommendations) in relation to several species that were the subject of previous review cycles. Determination of whether recommendations on these species is warranted, or, if so, the nature of the recommendations, has been deferred pending receipt and evaluation by the Committee of field reports.
40. Several members of the Committee and the Secretariat visited the United Republic of Tanzania in December 1998 to attend a workshop on management controls for the commercial breeding and export of certain species of reptiles (i.e. *Malacochersus tornieri*, *Geochelone pardalis* and *Eryx colubrinus*). These species had been the subject of previous primary recommendations pursuant to Resolution Conf. 8.9. A number of new procedures were agreed upon, as well as procedures for future exports. Some remaining captive-born stock could be exported and 2000, size limits were set for the export of captive-born specimens. A copy of the report of this workshop can be obtained from the Secretariat.
41. During its 15th meeting, the Animals Committee also undertook an assessment of the process in Resolution Conf. 8.9 and the extent to which it is achieving its purpose of improving implementation of the requirements of Article IV, in particular those related to the trade not being detrimental to the survival of the species concerned. This exercise was facilitated by an analysis, by the Africa Resources Trust, of the procedure and the precision (and hence efficacy) of past recommendations.
42. The Africa Resources Trust also prepared a guide on the implementation of Resolution Conf. 8.9, under contract to the CITES Secretariat. The Animals Committee welcomed and approved this guide and requested that it be distributed to all Parties. (See also document Doc. 11.41.1.)
43. The Chairman of the Animals Committee attended the ninth meeting of the CITES Plants Committee (Darwin, June 1999) which agreed upon some amendments to Resolution Conf. 8.9 to extend its application to Appendix-II listed species of plants. The analysis of Resolution Conf. 8.9 and the review procedures prescribed by Decision 10.79 conducted by the Animals Committee at its 15th meeting provided a sound foundation, based on practical implementation experiences, to incorporate additional elements into the draft revision of Resolution Conf. 8.9. As a result of the evaluation, the Committee also proposed amendments to the procedures contained in Decision 10.79, to provide for more consultation with range States and greater overall transparency of the process. The product of this analysis, together with the input of the Plants Committee, is a draft resolution and accompanying revision of Decision 10.79 (see document Doc. 11.41.2).

#### Strategic plan and action plan for the Convention

44. The Chairman has participated in the activities of a working group of the Standing Committee, involved in development of a draft Strategic Plan and a draft Action Plan for the Convention (and consecutively for the Animals Committee) for the five-year period 2000 – 2005. A first draft was discussed at the 15th meeting of the Animals Committee. Consideration of the final draft document, which has gone through several iterations resulting from an extensive consultative process, represents a specific item on the Agenda for the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Agenda item 11.12).

#### Review of the criteria

45. On the instruction of the Standing Committee, the Chairman of Animals Committee has collaborated with the Chairman of Plants Committee to formulate proposed terms of reference for the review of the criteria for the amendment of Appendices I and II. The result of these deliberations is contained in document Doc. 11.25.

## Acknowledgements

46. The assistance of the Secretariat and my fellow members of the Animals Committee is gratefully acknowledged. The co-operation and friendship that has been established with representatives of the Management and Scientific Authorities, along with the numerous non-governmental organizations with which I have collaborated, has greatly assisted the Committee fulfilling its tasks.
47. Finally, but by no means least, I would like to acknowledge the considerable financial support provided by the Australian Government, through Environment Australia, that has enabled me to function as Chairman of the Animals Committee.

## Recommendations of the Animals Committee

48. The Conference of the Parties is requested to adopt the following recommendations:

a) Regarding edible nest swiftlets of the genus *Collocalia*

- i) To repeal Resolution Conf. 9.15 (Fort Lauderdale, 1997) – Conservation of edible-nest swiftlets of the genus *Collocalia*;

b) Regarding international trade in sharks

- i) To repeal Resolution Conf. 9.17 (Fort Lauderdale) – Status of international trade in shark species; and
- ii) To adopt the draft decisions referred to in paragraphs 1a) and 2 in the Annex to this document;

c) Regarding Resolution Conf. 10.16 on specimens of animals species bred in captivity

- i) To delete paragraph b) ii) C 2 a) from Resolution Conf. 10.16; and
- ii) To adopt the draft decisions contained in paragraph 1b) in the Annex to this document.

Draft recommendations for adoption by the Conference of the Parties

The Animals Committee recommends that the Conference of the Parties adopt the following draft decisions.

1. Directed to the Animals Committee

- a) The Chairman of the Animals Committee shall maintain liaison with the Secretary of the Committee on Fisheries of the UN Food and Agriculture Organization to monitor the implementation of the International Plan of Action for the Conservation and Management of Sharks, and to report back at the 12th meeting of the Conference of the Parties on progress made with this.
- b) The Animals Committee, in co-operation with range States and, where appropriate, with experts in captive breeding, shall develop for consideration at the 12th meeting of the Conference of the Parties a list comprising Appendix-I species (or geographically distinct populations thereof) that are:
  - i) critically endangered in the wild; and/or
  - ii) known to be difficult to breed or keep in captivity.

2. Directed to the Secretariat

The Secretariat shall continue to liaise with the World Customs Organization to promote the establishment and use of specific headings within the standard tariff classifications of the Harmonized System to discriminate between shark meat, fins, leather, cartilage and other products.