

**Interpretation and Implementation of the Convention  
Significant Trade in Appendix-II Species**

ANIMALS

This document has been prepared and submitted by the Secretariat.

1. Introduction

In Resolution Conf. 8.9, the Conference of the Parties directed the Animals Committee to make specific recommendations for all species listed in its report 'Review of Significant Trade in Species of Animals Included in CITES Appendix II 1983-1988' (document Doc. 8.30), and for other species identified as a result of its continuing review, with the aim of ensuring the implementation of Article IV, paragraphs 2(a) and 3. The Conference decided that the recommendations shall be categorized as primary or secondary. It also decided that the Parties to which recommendations were made should have 90 days to implement primary recommendations and one year to implement secondary recommendations.

The Conference gave the Secretariat the responsibility to decide on whether the recommendations of the Animals Committee had been implemented. In cases where the recommendation was not implemented, the Secretariat was instructed to make recommendations to the Standing Committee about action to be taken by all the Parties.

The Secretariat was also directed by the Conference of the Parties to monitor the implementation of Resolution Conf. 8.9, in consultation with the Animals Committee and the Standing Committee, and to report its findings and recommendations at each meeting of the Conference. The present paper is the Secretariat's submission in fulfilment of this direction.

In 1992, in Kyoto, immediately following the eighth meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the Animals Committee made a series of recommendations in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.9. A further set of recommendations was initiated at the ninth meeting of the Animals Committee, in Brussels, in September 1993. In the present report, the first of these sets of recommendations is referred to as phase 1, and the second set as phase 2.

2. Phase 1

In March 1992, on the basis of a report prepared for the Animals Committee by the World Conservation Monitoring Centre (WCMC) and IUCN, the Committee adopted a series of recommendations relating to 27 species. These are listed in Annex 1, which also shows to which States or bodies recommendations were directed. The recommendations were sent to the States concerned in June 1992. The majority of these were implemented.

The Secretariat reported to the Standing Committee at its 29th meeting on the primary recommendations that had not been implemented and at its 30th meeting on the secondary recommendations that had not been implemented. In making proposals for action to the Standing Committee, the Secretariat took into account any action that had been taken by the Party under consideration that would improve implementation of Article IV of the Convention with respect to the species of concern. The Secretariat noted that some of the recommendations were made to non-Parties.

In cases that the Standing Committee agreed were sufficiently serious, in accordance with Resolution Conf. 8.9 it recommended to the Parties that they should suspend imports of the specified species from the States concerned until appropriate action had been taken to implement the recommendation. The Secretariat has continued to monitor whether the necessary action has been taken. It has done this in consultation with the Chairman of the Animals Committee and has deleted countries from the list whenever appropriate.

Annex 2 lists the States that, at the time of writing (6 September 1994), are still subject to the Standing Committee's recommended suspension of trade in the species indicated.

3. Phase 2

In 1993, WCMC and IUCN were contracted by the Secretariat, on behalf of the Animals Committee, to conduct a review of 119 species and subspecies and three genera that might be subject to significant levels of trade. They were assisted by TRAFFIC. Their report was finished in June 1993 and provided the basis for the Animals Committee, at its ninth meeting, to draft a further series of primary and secondary recommendations. These were refined by correspondence after the meeting and the Secretariat sent them to the States concerned in January 1994.

Annex 3 lists the taxa with respect to which recommendations have been made in this second phase.

The Secretariat has been reviewing the implementation of these recommendations and is still in correspondence with a number of Parties about the minimum actions that should be taken. Some countries, however, have not responded at all to the recommendations of the Animals Committee.

At the time of writing, the Secretariat is in the process of formulating its recommendations to the Standing Committee about countries that have not implemented the primary recommendations that were directed to them.

Recommendations of the CITES Animals Committee - Phase 1 Species about which Recommendations were Made and the Object of the Recommendations

<b>Species</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Object of recommendation</b>
<i>Tarsius syrichta</i>	Primary	Philippines
<i>Felis bengalensis</i>	Primary and Secondary	China
<i>Felis lynx</i>	Primary	China, Russian Federation, other range States of the former USSR
<i>Lama guanicoe</i>	Primary	Argentina
	Secondary	Argentina and Chile
<i>Manis crassicaudata</i>		
<i>Manis javanica</i>		
<i>Manis pentadactyla</i>	Primary	Secretariat
	Secondary	China, Malaysia, Singapore, Secretariat
<i>Agapornis canus</i>	Primary and Secondary	Madagascar
<i>Agapornis fischeri</i>	Primary and Secondary	United Republic of Tanzania
<i>Amazona aestiva</i>	Primary	Argentina
<i>Amazona oratrix</i>	Secondary	all Parties, Secretariat
<i>Amazona viridigenalis</i>	Primary	Secretariat
<i>Aratinga erythrogenys</i>	Primary and Secondary	Peru
<i>Brotozeris pyrrhopterus</i>	Primary and Secondary	Peru
<i>Cacatua alba</i>	Primary and Secondary	Indonesia
<i>Cacatua goffini</i>	Primary [nullified by transfer to Appendix I]	Indonesia
<i>Cacatua haematuropygia</i>	Secondary [nullified by transfer to Appendix I]	Philippines
<i>Cacatua sulphurea</i>	Primary and Secondary	Indonesia
<i>Eos reticulata</i>	Primary and Secondary	Indonesia
<i>Psittacus erithacus</i>	Primary	Ghana, Guinea, Liberia, Togo
	Secondary	Cameroon, Ghana, Guinea, Liberia, Togo
<i>Malacochersus tornieri</i>	Primary and Secondary	United Republic of Tanzania
<i>Testudo horsfieldii</i>	Secondary	Secretariat
<i>Eunectes notaeus</i>	Secondary	Argentina and importing Parties in Europe and North America
<i>Python regius</i>	Secondary	Ghana and Togo
<i>Ptyas mucosus</i>	Secondary	Bangladesh, China, Indonesia, Thailand and the major importing countries (UK, Italy, Spain) and all Parties
<i>Rana tigrina</i>		
<i>Rana hexadactyla</i>	Secondary	Bangladesh, India and all Parties

States Subject to a Recommended Suspension of Trade in the Species Indicated and the Recommendations Remaining to be Implemented

**Argentina*****Lama guanicoe***

Primary recommendation: the Management Authority of Argentina should advise the Secretariat of the biological basis for its management programme and of its procedures for controlling exports.

**Azerbaijan*****Felis lynx***

Primary recommendation: States that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.

## China

### *Felis bengalensis*

Primary recommendations: the Management Authority of China should:

- advise the Secretariat of the scientific basis of management of the species and the mechanisms to control wild harvests and exports;
- inventory stockpiles of skins currently held by exporting companies in China and inform the Secretariat of the results.

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of China should initiate, with the assistance of the Secretariat, a system to mark all skins that enter trade, in order to facilitate future management of harvests and exports.

### *Ptyas mucosus*

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of China should advise the Secretariat of the scientific basis for its management programme for this species.

## Indonesia

### *Cacatua sulphurea*

Primary recommendation: the Management Authority of Indonesia should institute a moratorium on exports until island surveys have been carried out, particularly in Sumba and eastern Nusa Tenggara.

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of Indonesia should initiate population surveys of the species.

### *Ptyas mucosus*

Secondary recommendations: the Management Authority of Indonesia should advise the Secretariat of the scientific basis for its harvest quotas and should introduce a system to ensure that the number of skins permitted for export does not exceed these quotas.

## Latvia

### *Felis lynx*

Primary recommendation: States that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.

## Lithuania

### *Felis lynx*

Primary recommendation: States that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.

## Peru

### *Aratinga erythrogenys*

Primary recommendation: the Management Authority of Peru should establish an annual export quota consistent with the sustainable offtake, and notify the Secretariat of this quota for the information of Parties each year.

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of Peru should advise the Secretariat of the scientific basis of its management programme.

## Republic of Moldova

### *Felis lynx*

Primary recommendation: States that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.

## Togo

### *Python regius*

Secondary recommendations: the Management Authority of Togo should advise the Secretariat of its measures to control exports of this species; continued exports of the species from Togo should be on the basis of a scientifically based sustainable-use management programme.

## Ukraine

### *Felis lynx*

Primary recommendation: States that formerly constituted the USSR should establish export quotas for the species and inform the Secretariat of the level of these quotas.

## United Republic of Tanzania

### *Agapornis fischeri*

Primary recommendation: the Management Authority of the United Republic of Tanzania should establish a moratorium on exports until a population survey has been carried out and the results analyzed.

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of the United Republic of Tanzania should undertake a population survey of the species.

### *Malacochersus tornieri*

Primary recommendation: the Management Authority of the United Republic of Tanzania should introduce a moratorium on trade, pending evaluation of the results of a population survey and establishment of a sustainable-use management programme.

Secondary recommendation: the Management Authority of the United Republic of Tanzania should initiate a population survey of the species and develop a sustainable-use management programme.



Malaysia (cont.)	<i>Psittacula longicauda</i> <i>Psittinus cyanurus</i> <i>Indotestudo elongata</i> <i>Manouria emys</i> <i>Python molurus bivittatus</i> <i>Trogonoptera brookiana</i>	<i>Indotestudo elongata</i> <i>Manouria emys</i>
Mali	<i>Varanus niloticus</i>	<i>Varanus niloticus</i> <i>Python sebae</i>
Mauritius	<i>Crocodylus niloticus</i>	
Mexico		<i>Tupinambis</i> spp.
Mozambique	<i>Agapornis lilianae</i> <i>Poicephalus cryptoxanthus</i> <i>Poicephalus meyeri</i>	
Nicaragua	<i>Pionus senilis</i>	<i>Amazona auropalliata</i>
Papua New Guinea	<i>Ornithoptera urvillianus</i> <i>Ornithoptera victoriae</i>	
Peru	<i>Tayassu pecari</i> <i>Tayassu tajacu</i> <i>Brotogeris versicolorus</i>	
Philippines	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i> <i>Loriculus philippensis</i>	<i>Loriculus philippensis</i>
Russian Federation	<i>Moschus</i> spp.	
Senegal	<i>Poicephalus senegalus</i>	<i>Poicephalus senegalus</i>
Solomon Islands	<i>Ornithoptera urvillianus</i> <i>Ornithoptera victoriae</i>	
Sudan	<i>Varanus niloticus</i>	
Suriname		<i>Ara ararauna</i> <i>Ara chloroptera</i>
Thailand	<i>Python molurus bivittatus</i>	
Togo	<i>Chamaeleo senegalensis</i>	<i>Kinixys belliana</i> <i>Kinixys erosa</i> <i>Kinixys homeana</i> <i>Chamaeleo senegalensis</i> <i>Python sebae</i>
Turkey		<i>Testudo graeca</i>
United Republic of Tanzania	<i>Poicephalus cryptoxanthus</i> <i>Poicephalus meyeri</i> <i>Poicephalus rufiventris</i> <i>Tauraco fischeri</i> <i>Geochelone pardalis</i> <i>Eryx colubrinus</i>	
United States of America	<i>Tupinambis</i> spp.	
Viet Nam	<i>Psittacula roseata</i>	
Zambia	<i>Agapornis lilianae</i>	

**Interpretation and Implementation of the Convention**  
**Significant Trade in Appendix-II Species**

PLANTS

This document has been prepared at the request of the Plants Committee by the CITES Secretariat and the Plants Committee's Co-ordinator for studies of significant trade in plants.

Introduction

At its eighth meeting, the Conference of the Parties endorsed the recommendations contained in document Doc. 8.31 (Review of Significant Trade in Species of Plants Included in Appendix II of CITES; 1983–1989), thus completing the first phase of this review. The recommendations from this review with non-substantive corrections are attached as an Annex to this document.

In its meetings following that meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the Plants Committee has regularly discussed the issues related to these recommendations in order to establish a programme for the next phase. Several projects have been developed, each dealing with specific recommendations.

The results of the actions taken by the Plants Committee are summarized below, and a programme of activities is presented for approval by the Conference of the Parties.

a) Recommendations Regarding Reporting on Plant Trade, Use of Statistics and Other Information on Appendix-II Plants

- *Review of national reporting procedures for trade in plants listed in the CITES appendices.* This should also include an analysis of the annual reports over the years 1989–1991 in order to determine critical areas that need improvement. This project has been given a high priority by the Plants Committee.
- *Trade in tree-ferns.* At present the recorded CITES trade data for tree-ferns are of little value in monitoring the trade and, in particular, relating levels in trade of tree-fern products to the status of the species in the wild. Currently a study is being carried out by WCMC with the following objectives: (1) review of the trade data in the annual reports and, where possible, comparison with updated information on the conservation status of the species concerned; (2) assessment of the value of the listing and recommendations to the Plants Committee with regard to actions and/or possible proposals to amend the appendices.

b) Taxon-specific Recommendations

- The Standing Committee has approved a number of projects presented by the Plants Committee and the CITES Secretariat.
  - *Population studies of Malagasy succulents.* Externally funded. This project, in two phases, has been completed, and resulted in a number of amendment proposals being presented by Madagascar for consideration at the ninth meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
  - *Population study of rare Mexican cacti.* Externally funded. This three-year project started in May 1994.
  - *Survey of the orchid trade in Thailand* No funding available. Estimated costs (USD 48,900) are higher than the annual amount

allocated in the CITES budget for studies of significant trade in plants. It requires external funding but, for reasons explained, is included in the 1994–1997 work programme presented below.

- *Review of the international trade in the orchid genus Dendrobium*  
This project will run concurrently with the preparation of a checklist for *Dendrobium* species. No external funding is available, but this might be funded from the CITES budget for studies of significant trade in plants. It is included in the work programme for 1994–1997.
- *Investigation of the international trade in northern temperate orchids*  
No funding available. Estimated costs: USD 36,100.

c) Other Decisions of the Plants Committee

- In order to ensure smooth progress of the review of significant trade in plants, the Plants Committee has decided to appoint the Scientific Authority of the United Kingdom as co-ordinator for this review.
- The Plants Committee has also decided to develop Guidelines for Significant Trade Field Projects for Plants, analogous to those developed for animals (cf. Notification to the Parties No. 763).

Work Programme

Taking into account the priority decisions made by the Plants Committee at its fourth and fifth meetings, the following work programme is proposed, based on funding available in the CITES budget for studies on significant trade in plants, as proposed to the Conference of the Parties (Doc. 9.9 and Doc. 9.10). This work programme may be amended or extended to include any of the projects mentioned above, depending on the availability of additional external funding. Consultants have not been contracted, but WCMC will be strongly involved.

- 1994 Completion of the study on tree-ferns.  
Start of the review of national reporting procedures for trade in plants.
- 1995 Completion of the review of national reporting procedures for trade in plants. The Plants Committee should provide the Parties with recommendations regarding improvement of the reporting on plants in the annual reports through a Notification to the Parties.

Start of the review of the international trade in *Dendrobium* species. This study is proposed on the assumption that the preparation of a checklist of this genus will also be initiated in 1995.

The Scientific Authority of the United Kingdom (Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew), in close co-operation with the Management Authority of Thailand for Plants, intends to start preparatory work (in particular analysis of the trade data) for the project on the survey of orchid trade in Thailand. Completion and time frame will depend on the availability of additional funds, part of which might be provided by the Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew.

1996 Completion of the review of international trade in *Dendrobium* species.

Start of the update of the Review of Significant Trade in Species of Plants Included in Appendix II of CITES (1990–1994). This most probably will require additional funding from external sources.

Update of analysis of annual reports (1992–1994).

Start of a study on the international trade in medicinal plants.

1997 Completion of the updates of the Review of Significant Trade in Species of Plants Included in Appendix II of CITES and analysis of annual reports, both started in 1996.

Preparation of recommendations and/or draft resolutions for consideration at the tenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

Doc. 9.34 (Rev.) Annex

General Recommendations Resulting from the Review of Significant Trade in Species of Plants Included in Appendix II of CITES; 1983–1989, as Endorsed at the Eighth Meeting of the Conference of the Parties

1. The CITES trade statistics for 1983–1989 show the continuing poor quality of reporting for the Appendix–II plant trade. Attention should be drawn to this at the eighth meeting of the Conference of the Parties. All countries should be urged to report trade at species level and to prevent delays in reporting. Parties that do not report the plant trade at all should be encouraged to do so through the provision of technical and financial assistance to set up reporting systems.
2. Parties should commit themselves to carrying out routine checks of CITES plant material in trade in order to improve enforcement, should avoid exporting wild plants misreported as artificially propagated and should also improve the accuracy of information in annual reports.
3. Information on levels of trade, based on annual reports and other data, should be prepared and circulated on a regular basis at intervals corresponding to the meetings of the Conference of the Parties. Data should be compiled on annual levels of trade in each taxon for the current year and the previous five years with information on levels of trade in propagated specimens also reported. An overview document should also be prepared. This recommendation is in accordance with Resolution Conf. 3.10 on the Review and Harmonization of Annual Reports.
4. The information already compiled on levels of trade in particular plant groups should be made available for review by the SSC Plant Specialist Groups. Review of the data on a routine basis should be considered.
5. Information on nurseries involved in the CITES export trade in the major source countries should be compiled and a directory published. Management Authorities should supply this information to the CITES Secretariat in order to facilitate implementation of CITES for plants.
6. Information on the distribution and conservation status of heavily traded CITES Appendix–II plants should be assembled into a readily accessible database linked to the WCMC trade database.
  - a) Steps are already being taken to ensure that the cacti recorded in CITES trade from 1983–1989 are included in the CITES cactus checklist of standard names which includes distribution and conservation data.
  - b) The need to develop a standard nomenclature for orchids for CITES purposes has been acknowledged. The most commonly traded genera of orchids, as revealed by the Significant Plant Trade Study, and those likely to be adversely affected by trade should be treated first in preparing the standard nomenclature. Priority genera for attention are:

*Aerangis, Angraecum, Ascocentrum, Bletilla, Brassovola, Calanthe, Catasetum, Cattleya,*

*Coelogyne, Comporetia, Cymbidium, Cyripedium, Dendrobium, Disa, Dracula, Encyclia, Epidendrum, Laelia, Lycaste, Masdevallia, Miltonia, Miltoniopsis, Odontoglossum, Oncidium, Paphiopedilum, Paraphalaenopsis, Phalaenopsis, Phragmipedium, Renanthera, Rhynchosstylis, Rossioglossum, Sophronotis, Vanda and Vandopsis.*

- c) The development of appropriate checklists for other Appendix–II plant groups is also necessary and their preparation should be co–ordinated, by the CITES Secretariat, with other international initiatives such as the IUBS World Checklist of Vascular Plants.

Country–specific Recommendations

The data on plant trade for 1983–1989 highlight major source countries where certain aspects of the trade warrant concern. Specific recommendations are given for action.

7. Japan is the second major source country for the CITES Appendix–II plant trade. Although detailed information on imports is provided within annual reports, insufficient detail is provided within CITES statistics on the plants exported. Japan should be urged to improve its reporting of the plant trade. A more detailed analysis of the existing trade data should also be carried out. This should include a review of levels of trade in indigenous plants, in particular orchid species, and a review of the extent to which these are commercially propagated, together with a closer look at Japan's role in the re–export of wild–collected plants.
8. A survey of the Thai orchid trade should be carried out. This should include a review of the species reported in trade, their distribution and, as far as possible, conservation status. The survey should also investigate existing trade patterns and trading operations in Thailand. In the light of the general trade ban with Thailand, recommended by the CITES Standing Committee, the Thai Government should be urged to develop measures to implement the Convention for plants. Assistance should be provided to develop measures to protect native orchids, develop a nursery registration system, regulate internal trade, control imports from neighbouring countries, and regulate exports at appropriate levels.
9. More information is needed on high–volume trade in CITES species of plant trade from the Province of Taiwan. An analysis of the reported trade, paying particular attention to trading partners, should be carried out.
10. Brazil is the leading exporter of CITES plants in South America and certain aspects of the trade continue to cause concern. Brazil should ensure that its national legislation is fully and effectively implemented.

A study of the Brazilian cactus trade should be commissioned in the context of a broader study of South American cactus trade. It is apparent that other South American countries are under-reporting the trade.

A study of the conservation status, levels of collection, artificial propagation and trade in the Brazilian species of the orchid genera *Cattleya*, *Laelia* and *Sophranotis* should also be carried out.

11. The Dominican Republic appears from the CITES trade statistics for 1983–89 to be one of the leading source countries for CITES Appendix-II plants. Very little information is available on nursery production of CITES plants within the country. It is necessary as a matter of priority to establish the veracity of reported trade. The role of the Dominican Republic in the re-export of Appendix-II plants, legally and illegally acquired in source countries, should also be investigated.
12. Further attention needs to be paid to the levels of exports of wild-collected Malagasy succulents. Information on the conservation status in the wild of traded species needs to be collected through field surveys, and the impact of commercial collection assessed. The feasibility of establishing reserves with controlled harvesting should be investigated. Appendix-I listing for additional species such as *Ceropegia armandii* appears to be necessary.
13. The high-volume export of wild-collected cacti, cycads, and orchids from Mexico is a major cause for concern. Further information should be sought on the current situation and the Mexican Authorities encouraged to control the export of wild plants. United States enforcement agencies should provide full assistance.
14. There have been instances when wild-collected succulents have been exported from South Africa with incorrect documentation. South Africa should be urged to ensure that plant consignments are inspected prior to export to prevent abuse of documents for artificially propagated plants.

#### Taxon-specific Recommendations

15. A field survey of the conservation status of *Notocactus* (*Parodia* subgenus *Notocactus*) should be commissioned.
16. A survey of the genus *Ferocactus* in trade should be carried out drawing together information from the range States, i.e. Mexico and the United States and the major importing countries of Europe and Japan.

17. *Dendrobium* is the most heavily traded genus of orchid and a significant number of plants in trade are wild-collected. A review of trade in the genus should be carried out. Preparation of a checklist of species names with distributions and conservation categories should have high priority.

18. A survey of the trade in *Pleione* would be of interest. It is unclear whether all plants exported by Japan are propagated. Clarification should be sought from the CITES Authorities. Nursery inspections in China (including Taiwan) and Japan would be desirable. At the same time other aspects of the trade in temperate orchids could be investigated.

19. There is concern about the continuing trade in *Cypripedium* collected from the wild. Monitoring of the trade is essential and information should be sought on the impact of commercial collection on wild populations. There is uncertainty about levels of propagation in Europe, the United States and Japan and this should be clarified. Parties should be urged to control exports at sustainable levels and fully implement national conservation legislation where appropriate.

20. Information on levels of trade in the Cycad genus *Dioon*, which has a number of species of conservation concern, suggests that Appendix-I listing for this genus is appropriate. There are apparently illegal exports from Mexico, laundered through other countries.

21. A review of the levels of trade in Appendix-I cycads in the family Zamiaceae, i.e. the genera *Ceratozamia*, *Encephalartos* and *Microcycas*, should be carried out.

22. At present the recorded CITES trade data for tree-ferns are of little value in monitoring the trade and, in particular, relating levels of trade in tree-fern products to the status of species in the wild. The value of the current listings of Cyatheaceae and Dicksoniaceae in Appendix II of CITES should be subject to an expert review, in order to establish whether the method in which trade is currently reported is useful. In particular the units used for reporting trade in tree-fern products should be considered with a view to standardization.

23. An investigation of the international trade in *Aloe* products should be carried out including an assessment of the impact on wild populations and methods of improving trade controls.

24. An investigation of the international trade in *Salep* should be carried out.