

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

---

Eighth Meeting of the Conference of the Parties

Kyoto (Japan), 2 to 13 March 1992

Interpretation and Implementation of the Convention

Proposals to Register the First Commercial Captive-Breeding Operation  
for an Appendix-I Animal Species

Format and Criteria

GUIDELINES FOR A PROCEDURE TO REGISTER AND MONITOR OPERATIONS  
BREEDING APPENDIX-I ANIMAL SPECIES FOR COMMERCIAL PURPOSES

This document is submitted by Canada, on behalf of the Animals Committee.

CITES recognizes that the breeding of Appendix-I species in captivity may provide conservation benefits by lessening or removing commercial demand for wild specimens. Accordingly, Article VII, paragraph 4, seeks to facilitate trade in captive-bred specimens of Appendix-I species by easing permit requirements. However, because captive breeding can also provide a cover for the capture of and trade in specimens obtained illegally, CITES has created guidelines to protect wild populations. These guidelines have been developed in a series of four Resolutions (Resolutions Conf. 2.12, 4.15, 6.21 and 7.10).

The main features of these guidelines can be summarized as follows:

- The breeding stock held in commercial captive-breeding operations must be obtained without detriment to the wild population and maintained over the long term with minimal addition of wild specimens;
- The names of captive-breeding operations that qualify are to be placed on a register maintained by the Secretariat, and Parties are to restrict commercial imports to those operations only;
- The first operation wishing to become registered to breed an Appendix-I species not included among the species which had already been placed on the Secretariat's Register prior to 25 July 1987, must be approved by a two-thirds majority vote of the Conference of the Parties;
- Breeding operations that fail to comply with the guidelines may be removed from the Secretariat's Register by a two-thirds majority vote of the Conference of the Parties;
- Specimens (or their products) produced by registered breeding operations must be marked so as to be readily distinguishable from wild-taken specimens;
- Proposals to add operations breeding species new to the Secretariat's Register must be submitted at least 150 days prior to a meeting of the Conference of the Parties and must meet certain criteria and follow a specific format.

Many of the above guidelines have proven workable. As of October 1991, 13 species have been approved for commercial captive breeding (though all before 25 July 1987), and over 60 captive-breeding operations have been registered. A vote to remove a non-complying operation has not been necessary. However, the procedure is not seen to be without problems. It has become complicated and bureaucratic, perhaps to the extent that it hinders the legitimate addition of new species to the Register. Some of its biological criteria are more appropriate for birds and mammals than for fish and reptiles with their different reproductive strategies. Furthermore, the process is unbalanced because it places far more scrutiny on the first operation to apply for registration of a new species than on subsequent applicants for that species. And finally, it says

nothing to encourage the routing of some of the profits from commercial captive breeding to benefit wild populations. Consequently, when they adopted the last Resolution on the subject (Resolution Conf. 7.10), the Parties included a clause h) that called for a comprehensive review of that Resolution (and the whole subject) at the eighth meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

The Animals Committee subsequently conducted such a review at its fourth (Darwin, 1990) and fifth (Vancouver, 1991) meetings, and prepared the proposed draft resolution attached.

Highlights of the proposed draft resolution are that it:

1. Consolidates in one resolution most of the features of the four previous Resolutions (Conf. 2.12, 4.15, 6.21 and 7.10) and repeals all but the first (Conf. 2.12);
2. Organizes the procedure into a more convenient format by separately describing the roles and responsibilities of the four parties involved, namely: the breeding operation; the Management Authority; the Secretariat; and the Conference of the Parties;
3. Returns the major responsibility for approving new breeding operations to the Management Authority, who must still provide information to the Secretariat but need not seek approval through a vote of the Conference of the Parties;
4. Increases the role of the Secretariat in accepting the addition of new species to the Register by requesting that it seek the review of proposals by independent experts and alert the Parties well in advance of acceptance;
5. Retains the ability of Parties to seek the removal of non-complying operations from the Register by vote;
6. Allows for the establishment of more stringent criteria for the registration of operations breeding species known to have special biological characteristics, difficult breeding requirements, or special enforcement problems.

In summary, the Animals Committee believes that the proposed draft resolution on commercial captive-animal breeding retains the essential features of earlier Resolutions, recognizes the special needs of certain species, strengthens safeguards for wild populations, and describes the procedure in such a way that it will be easier to understand and work with.

DRAFT RESOLUTION OF THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES

Guidelines for a Procedure to Register and Monitor Operations  
Breeding Appendix-I Animal Species for Commercial Purposes

RECOGNIZING that Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention provides that specimens of Appendix-I animal species bred in captivity for commercial purposes shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix II;

NOTING that import of wild-caught Appendix-I specimens for purposes of establishing a commercial captive-breeding operation is precluded by Article III, paragraph 3(c), of the Convention, as explained further in Resolution Conf. 5.10 adopted at the fifth meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Buenos Aires, 1985);

RECALLING that Resolution Conf. 2.12, adopted at the second meeting of the Conference of the Parties (San José, 1979), establishes the definition of "bred in captivity" and specifies that the parental breeding stock must be 1) established in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild; 2) maintained without augmentation from the wild, except for the occasional addition of animals, eggs or gametes from wild populations to prevent deleterious inbreeding; and 3) managed in a manner designed to maintain the breeding stock indefinitely;

RECALLING that subsequent Resolutions requested the Secretariat to create and maintain a register of operations breeding specimens of Appendix-I species for commercial purposes (Resolution Conf. 4.15 adopted at the fourth meeting of the Conference of the Parties [Gaborone, 1983]) and recommended that the Parties provide the Secretariat with "any appropriate information" on these operations (Resolution Conf. 4.15); that breeding operations use a uniform marking system for captive-bred specimens, with seamless metal rings for birds (Resolution Conf. 6.21 adopted at the sixth meeting of the Conference of the Parties [Ottawa, 1987]); that the first commercial captive-breeding operation for an Appendix-I species be included in the Secretariat's Register only by a two-thirds majority vote of the Parties (Resolution Conf. 6.21); and that proposals submitted by a Party to register the first commercial operation to breed an Appendix-I species follow a specific format (Resolution Conf. 7.10 adopted at the seventh meeting of the Conference of the Parties [Lausanne, 1989]);

AWARE that as of 1 October 1991 the Secretariat had notified the Parties of the registration of approximately 60 commercial operations breeding 13 species for commercial purposes;

NOTING that the demand for captive breeding for both commercial and conservation purposes is growing, that the art and science of captive breeding are becoming increasingly complex, and that the Parties have not yet instituted standardized procedures for the registration and subsequent monitoring of captive-breeding operations for Appendix-I species for commercial purposes;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

AGREES to describe a clear and comprehensive procedure for qualifying, registering and monitoring commercial captive-breeding operations;

RESOLVES

- a) that the principles set forth in Resolution Conf. 2.12 remain the basis of this procedure;
- b) that the first and major responsibility for approving captive-breeding operations under Article VII, paragraph 4, will rest with the Management Authority of each Party, in consultation with that Party's Scientific Authority;
- c) that the sponsoring Party's Management Authority will provide the Secretariat with appropriate information to obtain, and to maintain, the registration of each captive-breeding operation;
- d) that the Secretariat will admit new captive-breeding operations to its Register only after it is satisfied that the operation meets the requirements set forth in Resolution Conf. 2.12;
- e) that the captive-breeding operations included in the Secretariat's Register on 13 March 1992 be regarded as accepted without further justification required;

- f) that Parties continue to restrict commercial imports of captive-bred specimens of Appendix-I species to those specimens produced by operations included in the Secretariat's Register;
- g) that registered captive-breeding operations continue to use a uniform marking system for their specimens in trade, ensuring that birds are marked where appropriate with closed, seamless metal bands;
- h) that any Party aware of and able to demonstrate a failure to comply satisfactorily with the requirements for a registered captive-breeding operation may, after consultation with the Secretariat and the Party concerned, propose that the Conference of the Parties delete the operation from the Register by a two-thirds vote of the Parties as described by Article XV of the Convention; and that, once deleted, such an operation can only be reinstated in the Register by satisfying the procedure outlined in d) above;
- i) that any Party within whose jurisdiction an operation is registered pursuant to Resolution Conf. 4.15, may unilaterally request the removal of that operation from the Register without reference to other Parties by so notifying the Secretariat;
- j) that where the establishment of a captive-breeding operation involves the removal of animals from the wild, that operation should demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Management Authority and Secretariat that the removal of such specimens is not detrimental to the conservation of the species in the wild;
- k) that where the conservation needs of the species warrant, the Management Authority satisfy itself that the captive-breeding operation will make a continuing meaningful contribution to the conservation of the species in the wild and/or its habitat; and
- l) that the Parties and Secretariat may establish special criteria for the registration of operations intending to breed species known to be very difficult to breed in captivity, or to have very specific requirements for successful breeding in captivity, or known to be very difficult to distinguish from wild-taken specimens when in trade; and

DECIDES that the Resolutions listed hereunder be repealed:

- a) Resolution Conf. 4.15 (Gaborone, 1983) - Control of Captive-Breeding Operations in Appendix-I Species;
- b) Resolution Conf. 6.21 (Ottawa, 1987) - Control Procedures for Commercial Captive-Breeding Operations; and
- c) Resolution Conf. 7.10 (Lausanne, 1989) - Format and Criteria for Proposals to Register the First Commercial Captive-Breeding Operation for an Appendix-I Animal Species.

Role of the Commercial Captive-Breeding Operation

REALIZING that the captive-breeding process begins with the breeder becoming interested in a species, developing expertise in husbandry, acquiring specimens, building facilities to house specimens, and successfully breeding the species;

ACKNOWLEDGING that commercial opportunity with Appendix-I species may provide incentive for developing better techniques for husbandry and captive breeding and for creating a source of specimens to relieve pressure on wild populations;

RECOGNIZING that the success of commercial captive breeding as an activity beneficial or at least neutral to conservation interests largely depends on the skill, concern and integrity of the operator;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

RESOLVES that the owner/manager of any commercial captive-breeding operation seeking inclusion in the Secretariat's Register shall be responsible for providing to the Management Authority of the country in which it is located the following information, where appropriate for the species concerned:

1. Name and address of the owner(s) and manager of captive-breeding operation.
2. Date of establishment.
3. Species bred (Appendix I only).
4. Description of parental breeding stock including the following information where appropriate:
  - a) age and identification (band or tag numbers, transponders, distinguishing marks, etc.) of each male and each female;
  - b) evidence of legal acquisition of each male and female (e.g. receipts, import permits, capture permits, etc.); and
  - c) the known or likely genetic relationship within and between breeding pairs.
5. Current stock (number by sex and age of specimens held in addition to parental breeding stock above).
6. Annual production of young.
7. Documentation showing that the species has been bred to the second generation (F2) at the facility and a description of the method used; or, if the operation has not bred the species to the second generation, a description of the methods that have been used to do so successfully elsewhere.
8. Description of the operation's strategy to avoid deleterious inbreeding and to identify and correct it should it occur.
9. Description of the facilities being used to house and care for the current and expected captive stock.
10. Description of the security measures provided to safeguard against escape of the captive stock into the wild and contingency measures for the safe disposal of captive stock in the event that the operation is closed.
11. Description of the management of breeding stock and offspring, specifically:
  - a) expected future production of offspring;
  - b) description of strategy to add offspring to the captive-breeding population as future replacement stock and/or expand the breeding population; and

- c) description of breeding performance of each generation produced in captivity, including records that describe the percentage of the breeding-age portion of the operation's specimens that have bred and produced viable offspring.
- 12. Assessment of any perceived need for augmentation of breeding stock with specimens from captive-bred or wild source.
- 13. Type of product exported (e.g. live specimens, skins, hides, other body parts).
- 14. Description of the marking methods to be used for breeding stock and offspring, and for specimens furnished for export.
- 15. Once the captive-breeding operation in question has been registered, the operation should provide annually to the Management Authority information on any changes made concerning items 4, 5, 6, 9, 10, 11, and 13 above during the preceding year.

Role of the Management Authority

RECOGNIZING that each Party's Management Authority is responsible for deciding if a captive- breeding operation is legitimate and meets the conditions established for registration, and for seeking its registration with the Secretariat;

AWARE that each Management Authority must establish and enforce a policy and procedure for managing and inspecting registered captive-breeding operations within its jurisdiction;

RECOGNIZING that the Management Authority is responsible for providing sufficient information to the Secretariat to support the captive-breeding operation's acceptance on the Secretariat's Register;

RECOGNIZING that the Management Authority is responsible for ensuring that registered captive-breeding operations continue to meet the requirements after they become registered;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

RESOLVES that each Management Authority, if it approves the application of a captive-breeding operation (Annex 1) on the basis of criteria established in Resolution Conf. 2.12, shall then apply to the Secretariat for the registration of the operation and provide the following information:

A. For species for which no commercial captive-breeding operation has yet been registered:

1. Biological data on species to be registered:

a) Taxonomy:

- class;
- order;
- family;
- genus, species, and subspecies, when applicable, including author and year;
- common name(s), when applicable;
- code number (e.g. ISIS), when applicable.

b) Status in the Wild:

- distribution (current and historical);
- population size, trend, and degree of endangerment.

c) Status in Captivity:

- description of founder stock in that country (including source and likely genetic relationship);
- general breeding performance in captivity;
- general breeding techniques successfully used.

2. Specific biological and other data on captive-breeding operation to be registered:

- include all of the information received from the operation in Annex 1.

3. A description of the inspection procedures to be used by the CITES Management Authority to confirm the identity of breeding stock and offspring and to detect the presence of unauthorized specimens held at the operation or provided for export.

B. For species for which registered captive-breeding operations already appear in the Secretariat's Register:

- the information described in Nos. A.2. and A.3. above.

C. After a captive-breeding operation is registered, the Management Authority will continue to monitor the performance of the operation by inspection and by examining information provided in annual reports from the operation.

- D. If a captive-breeding operation no longer wishes to remain registered, or the Management Authority receives information which leads it to believe that the operation no longer qualifies for registration, then the Management Authority within whose jurisdiction an operation is registered may unilaterally request the removal of that operation from the Register without reference to other Parties by so notifying the Secretariat.



Role of the Secretariat

RECOGNIZING that the Secretariat maintains a Register of Commercial Captive-Breeding Operations, and will admit new operations to its Register only after it is satisfied that these operations meet the requirements set forth in Resolution Conf. 2.12;

AGREEING further that the Secretariat should have a stronger "oversight" role in screening applications from Management Authorities for the registration of captive-breeding operations, and that it may reject applications that it believes do not meet the criteria of Resolution Conf. 2.12 concerning conservation needs of the particular species involved;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

RESOLVES that the Secretariat shall perform the following functions:

- a) receive and review applications for registration from Management Authorities;
- b) for applications involving species not yet on the Secretariat's Register:
  - i) refer such applications to appropriate experts for advice on their suitability; and
  - ii) notify the Parties of the application, supply copies to Parties who enquire about them, and receive comments from Parties within a 90-days period;
- c) for applications involving species already on the Secretariat's Register, refer such applications to appropriate experts for advice on their suitability only in cases where there are significant new aspects or other reasons for concern;
- d) when satisfied that applications meet all requirements in Annexes 1 and 2, publish the names and other particulars of acceptable operations in its Register, following the format described in Annex 1;
- e) for operations not accepted, provide the relevant Management Authority with a full explanation of the reasons for rejection and indicate the specific conditions that must be met before it can be accepted;
- f) delete the names of breeding operation from its Register when requested to do so in writing by the responsible Management Authority; and
- g) receive from any person information on the lack of performance of any breeding facility and, if convinced such information is valid, make it available to the relevant Management Authority. If a registered operation no longer appears to meet the required criteria the Secretariat may recommend its deletion from the Register to the Management Authority and to the Conference of the Parties.

Role of the Conference of the Parties

RECOGNIZING that a registration system for commercial captive-breeding operations cannot function successfully without the co-operation and scrutiny of all Parties;

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

RESOLVES

- a) that Parties strictly implement the provisions of Article IV of the Convention with respect to specimens of species included in Appendix I originating from operations which breed such specimens in captivity for commercial purposes;
- b) that Parties reject any document granted under Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention, if the specimens concerned do not originate from an operation duly registered by the Secretariat;
- c) that comparable documentation granted under Article VII, paragraph 4, of the Convention by States which are not Parties to the Convention not be accepted by the Parties without consultation with the Secretariat;
- d) that Parties continue to develop suitable measures to ensure that already registered captive-breeding operations, and the processors and manufacturers of products, adopt a marking system for products of the operation that meets as a minimum the requirements of the "uniform marking system" described in Resolution Conf. 5.16 concerning Trade in Ranched Specimens, adopted at the fifth meeting of the Conference of the Parties (Buenos Aires, 1985), and that they inform the Secretariat thereof;
- e) that where any Party becomes aware of and can demonstrate a failure to comply satisfactorily with the requirements for a registered captive-breeding operation, it may, after consultation with the Secretariat and the Party concerned, propose that the Conference of the Parties delete the operation from the Register by a two-thirds vote of the Parties at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties or by postal voting procedures prescribed by Article XV of the Convention; and
- f) that once deleted, such an operation can only be reinstated in the Register by satisfying Resolution Conf. 2.12 and the procedure outlined in Annexes 1, 2 and 3 above.