

Consideration of Proposals for Amendment
of Appendices I and II

COMMENTS FROM THE PARTIES

I Comments from Liechtenstein and Switzerland

AUSTRALIA

Marine Invertebrates

Adoption of this proposal would result in severe implementation problems. International trade is not the only factor which threatens the species concerned, others may even be much more important. It is felt that protection of coral reefs in situ would be much more efficient and easier to handle than CITES listing.

BANGLADESH

Kachuga tecta tecta, Lissemys punctata punctata, Varanus flavescens and Varanus bengalensis

It has to be noted that the proposals are not documented as requested by the Berne criteria. In the case of the turtles, information on the population status consists of the simple statement "very common" only. In the case of the monitor lizards, some estimates are given, but positive scientific evidence that the species can withstand the removal of protection is missing. Therefore, the special criteria for the transfer of taxa from Appendix I to Appendix II, as proposed by TEC, should be applied, and the countries of origin should be invited to propose quotas for the years 1985, 1986 and, possibly, 1987.

BRAZIL

Appendix I-listing of a number of succulent plants, as decided by the Conference at the Gaborone meeting, has had a rather negative effect on the species concerned. These species became the target of both commercial and private collectors and, as implementation of the Convention on plants is still very poor, they suffered from an increased illegal trade. The same will most probably occur in the case of the orchid species proposed now for inclusion in Appendix I by Brazil. It should also be considered that in live orchids usually the vegetative stages only are traded. When not in flower, it is almost impossible to identify a Cattleya down to species level. There are 65 species of Cattleya and a large number of intra- and extrageneric hybrids.

CHINA

Pygathrix spp.

While the Chinese proposal considers brelichi a subspecies only, "Mammal Species of the World" deals with it as a full species. The Conference should specify which nomenclature should be adopted.

Selenarctos thibetanus

See our remarks on the proposals made by Bangladesh.

Felis bengalensis

See our remarks on the proposals made by Bangladesh.

Considering that the nomenclature of Felis bengalensis is all but clear, we would prefer to downgrade not only the Chinese population but the whole "subspecies". India could ensure complete protection of its populations (which also include the "subspecies" horsfieldi and trevelyani) by imposing a zero quota.

Camelus bactrianus

The species has been deleted from Appendix I by the Conference at the San José meeting on the grounds that, due to strict veterinary regulations of the potential importing countries and the remoteness of the distribution area, illegal trade in live specimens is very unlikely. In the case of skins, no difference can be made between the skin of a domestic and that of a wild camel. As a consequence a renewed inclusion is without purpose.

Currently, no wild camels are kept in zoos outside the People's Republic of China.

According to decisions taken by the Nomenclature Committee on the nomenclature of the African wild ass, the Przewalski's horse and other species of which wild and domestic forms exist, the name for the wild camel should be Camelus ferus, not Camelus bactrianus which designates the domestic form.

Cervus albirostris

Because there is no illegal trade in live specimens, only trade in antlers and other products could threaten the species. As the proponent admits, customs officers are unable to identify these products correctly. The listing of this species is, therefore, almost without purpose.

Muntiacus crinifrons

Considering that generally not all specimens hunted in a country are exported, but that always a certain portion is consumed within the country itself, considering also that the annual take by hunting can hardly exceed 25% of the total population, it seems almost impossible that the figures given for the population size (3'000 - 5'000) and for the legally exported skins (more than 1'000) are correct.

Budorcas taxicolor

The biological status is not documented as requested by the Berne criteria for inclusion in Appendix I (no data at all for two subspecies out of four). Considering Nepal's attempt to downgrade some species of mountain ungulates, it seems preferable to include the species in Appendix II rather than in Appendix I.

COSTA RICA

Ara ambigua and Ara macao

Costa Rica represents a small portion of the distribution area only, and the matter should be thoroughly discussed between the Latin-American Parties prior to the meeting.

Imports of both species to Switzerland have been low in recent years:

Ara ambigua (1981 - 1983): 0
Ara macao (1981 - 1983): 13.

In the 1970s, both species have been imported more frequently, mainly from Nicaragua.

FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY

Rana tigerina and Rana hexadactyla

Import of frozen frogs' legs to Switzerland (1984, 9 months only):

from India:	3,545 kgs
from Bangladesh:	19,228 kgs
from Indonesia:	42,087 kgs
from Europe:	44,255 kgs (includes Turkey, mainly <u>Rana ridibunda</u>).

The import of frogs' legs is subject to veterinary regulations which allow monitoring even if the species are not included in Appendix II.

INDIA

Presbytis entellus, Kachuga tecta tecta, Trionyx gangeticus, Trionyx hurum and Saussurea lappa

See our remarks on the proposals made by Bangladesh.

Loris tardigradus, Presbytis phayrei, Equus kiang and Falco jugger

The biological status is not or only poorly documented. Information also from neighbouring countries is required.

Equus kiang

This proposal has already been submitted at the San José meeting, but was not adopted.

Captive population, according to International Zoo Yearbook Vol. 23: 12 stallions and 20 mares, most are presumed captive bred.

Currently, the taxon is not listed as Equus kiang in CITES Appendix II, but apparently the Parties have considered it a subspecies of Equus hemionus. This can be concluded from the decision of the Nomenclature Committee, not to adopt the taxonomy of the Asiatic wild ass proposed by "Mammal Species of the World" (see Proceedings of the Fourth Meeting of the Conference of the Parties, p. 202).

INDONESIA

Chelonia mydas and Eretmochelys imbricata

See our remarks on the proposals made by Bangladesh.

National protection in Indonesia is apparently not sufficient to allow re-opening of international trade.

MALAWI, MOZAMBIQUE

Crocodylus niloticus

See our remarks on the proposals made by Bangladesh.

There is a discrepancy between the two proposals as far as the population from Mozambique is concerned: the Malawi proposal states that there are 150'000 crocodiles in Mozambique, while the Mozambique proposal gives an estimate of 46'250 to 95'550 specimens only.

Total river frontage and frontage of protected rivers is about the same in Congo and Mozambique, but the quota requested by Congo is 10 times as high as the quota requested by Mozambique.

Congo should also be requested to specify what measures will be taken in order to prevent the export of skins of crocodiles illegally hunted in Gabon and Zaire.

TUNISIA

Fennecus zerda

Legal imports to Switzerland (1977 - 1983): 18 live specimens.

Detected illegal imports (same period): 4 live specimens.

Main country of origin: Algeria.

UNITED KINGDOM

Gruidae

Import of non-listed crane species to Switzerland (1975 - 1979):

<u>Balearica pavonina</u> :	61 live specimens
<u>Grus antigone</u> :	5 live specimens
<u>Grus grus lilfordi</u> :	3 live specimens.

II Comments from Nepal

Nepal supports the People's Republic of China's proposal to transfer Ursus thibetanus from Appendix I to II. Similarly, Nepal supports India's proposal to transfer Presbytis entellus from Appendix I to II.

III Comments from Pakistan

BANGLADESH

Kachuga tecta tecta, Lissemys punctata punctata: Transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II

The status of the above two species is endangered in Pakistan and they are therefore protected, although not subjected to trade in Pakistan.

Varanus flavescens, Varanus bengalensis: Transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II

Distribution of Varanus flavescens, V. bengalensis as well as V. griseus extends to Pakistan. These three species are endangered in Pakistan and are protected. Inclusion of Varanus species in Appendix I has given us support to curb trapping, killing and export. Pakistan also faces a problem similar to the one in India and Bangladesh. It is however felt that fresh skinnings and exports would take place in the garb of disposal of old stocks.

CHINA

Selenarctos thibetanus: Transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II

The subspecies Selenarctos thibetanus gedrosianus is endangered in Pakistan. Pakistan would, therefore, like to retain it in Appendix I.

INDIA

Equus kiang: Transfer from Appendix II to Appendix I

Pakistan supports the proposal of transfer of this species from Appendix II to Appendix I due to the endangered status of this peripheral species.

IV Comments from Venezuela

- With regard to species which do not occur in our country (Ara ambigua, Bufo periglenes and Alouatta palliata), the arguments put forward by the proponent (Costa Rica) either for inclusion (Ara ambigua) or for exclusion (Bufo periglenes, Alouatta palliata) are deemed valuable.
- The species which do occur in Venezuela (Jabiru mycteria and Ara macao) are not classified as game species and are fully protected by law. However, we do not have population studies which allow us to make comments on the relevant proposals. Therefore, Venezuela suggests that only the populations of Jabiru mycteria and Ara macao of the countries in which those species are rare or in trade be included in Appendix I.

