

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventy-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee
Lyon (France), 7 - 11 March 2022

REPORT OF THE MIKE AND ETIS SUBGROUP (MESG)

SC74 Doc 12 Review of the ETIS programme: Further amendments to Annex 3, 4 and 5
Global Members to be appointed to the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG)
Clarification relating to seizure data aggregates

1. SC74 Doc. 12: Review of the ETIS programme

The MIKE and ETIS Subgroup considered the proposed amendments to Annex 3, 4 and 5 and document SC74 Doc. 12 referred to it by the Standing Committee and propose the following for consideration by the Standing Committee:

Annex 3

Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) – paragraph 27 g) to be amended as follows:

27. g) summaries and aggregates of data provided to MIKE and ETIS, and the analyses of such data, constitute information that will be considered to be in the public domain once they are published on the CITES website, or otherwise publicly distributed; the detailed data on individual seizure cases, elephant mortalities and law enforcement submitted to MIKE or ETIS are owned by the respective data providers, which in most case are the CITES Parties; any such data relating to a CITES Party will be accessible to that Party, and the members of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group for information and review purposes, and the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) for global research and analysis, **unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, in accordance with paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports**, but will not be released to any third party without the consent of the Party concerned; data may also be released to contractors (e.g. statisticians) or other researchers (e.g. MIKE ETIS Subgroup approved research collaborations) under appropriate nondisclosure agreements; and

Annex 4, section 2

2. Data scope

ETIS is a comprehensive and global information system whose central feature is a database holding the details of law enforcement records for seizures or confiscations of elephant ivory and other elephant specimens which have been reported to occur since 1989. ~~ETIS also maintains a series of subsidiary information on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors~~

The following data relating to seizures of elephant specimens will be collected by Parties and consolidated and analyzed by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, and the MIKE-ETIS TAG:

Irrespective of whether the seizure was made at an international border, or at domestic level for example during the search of a private or business property or during inspections at domestic markets, the following

data on all seizures for violations involving ivory and other elephant specimens are collected by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat:

a) Minimum information ~~relating to each seizure that must be submitted~~ to allow a record to be included in the trend analysis (information required to enable data entry of a seizure case into ETIS):

- i. source of information
- ii. date of seizure
- iii. agency responsible for seizure
- iv. country of seizure
- v. type of ivory and quantity
- vi. type and/or quantity of non-ivory elephant products

b) Additional **trade route information, if available, that informs the modelling (optional information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of the trade routes and means of transport used, methods of detection as well as the origin and destination of ivory and other elephant specimens):**

- i. country of origin
- ii. country of export
- iii. country of transit
- iv. country of destination/import

c) Optional information that is used contextually to understand illegal activity (information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of type of illegal activity, transport used, methods of detection and nationality of those involved in illegal trade of ivory and other elephant specimens):

- i. type of transaction
- ii. mode of transport
- iii. ~~modus operandi~~ method of detection
- iv. nationality of suspects

In addition to the seizure data, ~~ETIS-TRAFFIC~~ also maintains a series of subsidiary information, including on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors to enable and inform the statistical analysis and its interpretation. Upon consultation with the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG), the subsidiary data required for analysis and interpretation may be revised and updated, in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, as necessary to improve the analysis and the resulting output and interpretation. Parties will be informed about the additional data elements to be added and its rationale through a Notification and on CITES website.

Parties should validate seizure data relating to their country through ETIS Online or in response to a Notification to be issued by the Secretariat on an annual basis prior to the analysis of the data. TRAFFIC will include seizure data relating to their country in the analysis unless the Party indicates through ETIS Online or within the timeframe as specified in the Notification that the data should not be included.

Annex 4, section 5

5. Information, data analysis and interpretation

Information generated by ETIS is hereby defined as the outcomes and outputs of ETIS data analysis, including summaries and aggregates in different forms, trends and other analytical presentations, and the relationships and factors which comprise underlying trade dynamics.

Data is hereby defined as the facts gathered through ETIS processes on individual seizures, including those collected using the CITES 'Ivory and elephant product data collection form' or other mechanisms used for obtaining elephant product seizure data. It also includes data that is part of the subsidiary databases within ETIS, and any other data that have been primarily collected under ETIS auspices to facilitate ETIS analyses.

The analysis and interpretation of data will be coordinated by TRAFFIC in association with the CITES Secretariat and MIKE (see Annex 2), and in consultation with the relevant Parties and the TAG. The statistical methodology, underlying code and supporting documentation, including how data is processed, bias-adjusted and then used in the ETIS analysis, will be made available to all Parties. The statistical modelling and techniques will be reviewed and refined as deemed necessary by the TAG, TRAFFIC and the CITES Secretariat, and submitted to the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup of the Standing Committee for consideration.

Annex 5

Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) – paragraph 4. to be amended as follows:

4. AGREES that, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, data collected in the annual illegal trade report and included in the database should be made available to Parties for research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime as it affects them, ~~and~~ to the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) for ICWC global research and analysis studies on wildlife and forest crime, and any data related to seizures of ~~an~~ elephant specimens seized (as prepared by the Secretariat) to ETIS to support the monitoring the illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens as provided for in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18);

With regards to the deadline for submission of ETIS data (SC74 Doc. 12 Annex 4, section 4), the majority of the members of the MSG supported: 31 October. TRAFFIC raised concerns about the implications relating to delays in carrying out the analysis.

2. Global Members to be appointed to the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG)

The MIKE and ETIS Subgroup recommends that the Standing Committee:

- a) approve the nomination of Ms Lucy Vigne and Mr Steven Broad as new global members of the MIKE and ETIS TAG, and
- b) note that Dr Jennifer Mailley will be co-opted as a technical expert.

3. Clarification relating to seizure data aggregates

The MIKE and ETIS Subgroup of the Standing Committee considered the request from TRAFFIC to provide clarification relating to the data aggregates that appear on the ETIS page of the CITES website and recommends that the Standing Committee:

- a) request TRAFFIC and the Secretariat to clarify the data aggregates that appear as zero on the ETIS page on the CITES website to distinguish between a country that reported to ETIS that no seizures of elephant specimens occurred and a country that did not report to ETIS.