

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventy-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee
Lyon (France), 7 - 11 March 2022

Interpretation and implementation matters

Exemptions and special trade provisions

ADDENDUM TO THE REVIEW OF TRADE IN ANIMAL SPECIMENS
REPORTED AS PRODUCED IN CAPTIVITY

1. This document has been submitted by the Animals Committee.*
2. The Animals Committee has assessed the responses received from the Parties selected under the process defined by Resolution Conf. 17.7 on Captive Breeding. This assessment is presented below case by case:

1. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Benin

According to the most up to date information, *C. sulcata* does not occur in Benin. Therefore, it can be concluded that the breeding stock must be composed of imported specimens. The CITES Trade Database lists various imports from Mali, Niger, Switzerland, Ghana and Tchad up until 2008 and then between 2014 and 2018 several more. Due to the possible age of the founder stock and the breeding biology of the species, holding facilities might be in a position to produce F2 specimens by now, however only with a small number of specimens. In the response received by Benin no evidence of legal acquisition in the form of CITES permits or the capacity of the breeding facilities to actually produce F2 offspring in the form of stud books or other documentation are provided. The agreement of Benin to restrict the size of exported specimens to 15cm is currently not reflected in the published export quotas for *C. sulcata* from Benin.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Benin:

- a) provide documentation for the justification of the legal origin of the founder stock;
- b) provide documentation and evidence in the form of stud books, pictures or other documentation that allows the assessment of the ability of the breeding facilities to produce F2 offspring in the reported numbers;
- c) advise the CITES Secretariat to amend the published quota to include only specimens with a maximum carapace length of 15 cm; and
- d) provide information on the implementation of the recommendations that so far have not been addressed.

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

In order for Benin to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.

2. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Ghana

As no response has been received from Ghana, all questions are still pending a response. It should be noted in this respect that Ghana is not a range State of the species and therefore all founder stock must be originating from imported animals.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Ghana provide answers to the questions asked by the Committee.

In order for Ghana to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.

3. *Varanus exanthematicus* from Ghana

As no response has been received from Ghana, all questions are still pending a response.

The Animals Committee therefore recommend that Ghana provide answers to the questions asked by the Committee.

In order for Ghana to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.

4. *Cacatua alba* from Indonesia

Indonesia provided information in relation to the two breeding facilities, of which Facility 1 is still active and Facility 2 does not at the time of inspection produce offspring. In Facility 1, the Indonesian authorities concluded that it was satisfied that the capacity of production of F2 offspring in the numbers exported were given. They indicated that some breeding pairs were capable of producing offspring up to 8 times per year while some did not produce any. The Animals Committee has some concerns with the submitted data on production of *C. alba* offspring at the two facilities. First the claimed possibility of breeding pairs to produce up to eight clutches per year contradicts current data in the literature. Furthermore, assuming the claimed maximum productivity were possible, the majority of the 6 productive pairs would likely lay far fewer clutches than 8 each year. Clutch size is reported to be usually 2 eggs (AC30 Doc 13.1 says clutch size is 2, occasionally 1) rather than 2-3 eggs as claimed, so if the 6 productive pairs laid an average five clutches of 2 eggs per year and hatching success was 90% (twice as high as reported in AC 30 Doc 13.1 Annex 3), and there was 0% chick/juvenile/subadult mortality (which seems very unlikely) then about 54 chicks could theoretically be raised for export per year.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Indonesia:

- a) provides information on how the breeding facility can produce up to 8 clutches per year as well as why this appears to be possible for some pairs whilst others do not produce any clutches; and
- b) provides evidence in the form of stud books/pedigrees or other documentation that the breeding facilities are able to produce F2 generations and specimens in the numbers claimed.

In order for Indonesia to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.

5. *Ornithoptera croesus* from Indonesia

Indonesia has provided the information that since 2017 no exports of the species have taken place, a statement which is confirmed through the CITES Trade Database.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that:

- a)- the species/country combination can be removed from the process;

- b) should Indonesia want to resume trade in the species, an appropriate NDF for the eventual founder stock of a captive breeding facility or a facility producing specimens with source code R are provided to the Secretariat, for review by the Secretariat and by the Animals Committee.

6. *Varanus timorensis* from Indonesia

The information provided by Indonesia was discussed within the Animals Committee. The majority of members were of the view that Indonesia has met the recommendations and therefore are of the view that this country/species combination can be removed from the process.

7. *Geochelone elegans* from Jordan

The species is not native to Jordan. Jordan in its response could not provide any documentation of legal origin of the founder stock of the species. The founder stock is said to originate from imports from Lebanon (at that time not party to CITES) and the United States. However, no documents could be provided to corroborate this claim. Furthermore, the documentation provided of the breeding facility, and in particular the photos, show a different species (*Testudo graeca* instead of *G. elegans*).

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Jordan:

- a) clarify the species identity of the specimens held at the breeding facility;
- b) continues to make every effort to provide documentation of legal origin of the founder stock; and
- c) provide more details of the facility's capacity to effectively produce the numbers claimed.

In order for Jordan to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.

8. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Mali

Mali provided information on six breeding facilities operating and exporting specimens with source code R. However, no evidence of legal acquisition of the founder stock nor an NDF for the extraction of the needed specimens as breeding stock were provided. In addition, no explanation was provided why the source code R is used. There is also no explanation how the numbers produced by the facilities are documented in the form of stud books or other documentation.

The Animals Committee therefore recommend that Mali:

- a) provide documentation for the justification of the legal origin of the founder stock;
- b) provide a NDF for the founder stock;
- c) provide documentation and evidence in the form of stud books, pictures or other documentation that allows the assessment of the ability of the breeding facilities to produce F2 offspring in the reported numbers;
- d) advise the CITES Secretariat to amend the published quota to include only specimens with a maximum carapace length of 15 cm; and
- e) provide information on the implementation of the additional recommendations that so far have not been addressed.

In order for Mali to do this, a deadline for response should be set to a date with time for the Animals Committee to consider the response before SC75.

9. *Oophaga pumilo* from Nicaragua

Nicaragua has provided the information requested by the Standing Committee.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that the species/country combination can be removed from the process.

10. *Oophaga pumilo* from Panama

Panama has provided the information that no more exports of the species have taken place since 2017, which is confirmed by the CITES Trade Database.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends:

- a) that the species/country combination can be removed from the process; and
- b) should Panama want to resume trade in the species, an appropriate NDF for the eventual founder stock of a captive breeding facility or a facility producing specimens with source code R are provided to the Secretariat, for review by the Secretariat and by the Animals Committee.

11. *Vulpes zerda* from Sudan

Sudan has provided a response according to which the specimens of *V. zerda* exported in the period that was analysed at AC29 and led to the selection of the species/country combination were erroneously labelled as being captive bred (source code C). According to the information provided by Sudan they all should have been labelled as wild-taken (source code W). There has been a breeding facility established under the control of the Sudanese CITES Management Authority. However, no indication is made for what purpose this facility has been set up. In addition, the AC considers that if the numbers of exported specimens have been taken from the wild, this situation may be considered at the next meeting of the Animals Committee under the Review of Significant Trade process.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends:

- a) that Sudan provide information on the purpose of the breeding facility set up by the CITES Management Authority. If that purpose should be commercial for international trade, then a NDF for the offtake of the founder stock would need to be provided.
- b) that if no international trade is conducted, then Sudan can be released from the process; and
- c) that the species/country combination may be considered at the next Meeting of the Animals Committee under the process of Review of Significant Trade.

12. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Sudan

Sudan has provided a response according to which the specimens of *C. sulcata* exported in the period that was analysed at AC29 and led to the selection of the species/country combination were erroneously labelled as being captive bred (source code C). According to the information provided by Sudan they all should have been labelled as wild-taken (source code W). There has been a breeding facility established under the control of the Sudanese CITES Management Authority. However, no indication is made for what purpose this facility has been set up. In addition, the AC considers that if the numbers of exported specimens have been taken from the wild, this situation may be considered at the next meeting of the Animals Committee under the process of significant trade.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends:

- a) that Sudan provide information on the purpose of the breeding facility set up by the CITES Management Authority. If that purpose should be commercial for international trade, then a NDF for the offtake of the founder stock would need to be provided.
- b) that if no international trade is conducted, then Sudan can be released from the process; and
- c) that the species/country combination may be considered at the next Meeting of the Animals Committee under the process of Review of Significant Trade.

13. *Testudo hermanni* from North Macedonia (previously the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia)

North Macedonia has provided a response to the questions asked by the Animals Committee. The analysis of the response has provided the AC information on the breeding stock, the evolution of the mentioned breeding facilities, the control processes in place as well as the evolution of numbers in these facilities. For a more detailed assessment of the figures some more detailed information would have been helpful. The AC can provide these more detailed questions to the North Macedonian authorities directly for the purpose of supporting the control

scheme already in place. One issue that might be clarified more clearly is the origin of the founder stock. In its response North Macedonia stated that four facilities were already in place before the accession of North Macedonia to the CITES Convention and that these animals were then subsequently used to supplement the other breeding facilities. This would make the original founder stock being composed of pre-Convention specimens. A confirmation of this situation might clarify the origin of the founder stock.

On the whole, the majority of the Animals Committee therefore recommends that:

- a) the species/country combination can be removed from the process; and
- b) that North Macedonia might consider clarifying the origin of the founder stock as detailed above.

14. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Togo

According to the most up to date information, *C. sulcata* does not occur in Togo. Therefore, it can be concluded that the breeding stock must be composed of imported specimens. In the response received by Togo no evidence of legal acquisition in the form of CITES permits or the capacity of the breeding facilities to actually produce F2 offspring in the form of stud books or other documentation are provided. The agreement of Togo to restrict the size of exported specimens to 15cm is currently not reflected in the published export quotas for *C. sulcata* from Togo.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Togo:

- a) provide documentation for the justification of the legal origin of the founder stock;
- b) provide documentation and evidence in the form of stud books, pictures or other documentation that allows the assessment of the ability of the breeding facilities to produce F2 offspring in the reported numbers;
- c) advise the CITES Secretariat to amend the published quota to include only specimens with a maximum carapace length of 15 cm; and
- d) provide information on the implementation of the recommendations that so far have not been addressed.

In order for Togo to do this, a deadline for response should be set to a date with time for the Animals Committee to consider the response before SC75.

15. *Hippocampus comes* from Viet Nam

As no response has been received from Viet Nam, all questions are still pending a response.

The Animals Committee therefore recommends that Viet Nam provide answers to the questions asked by the Committee.

In order for Vietnam to do this, a deadline for response should be set so that the Animals Committee can consider the responses before SC75.