

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventy-fourth meeting of the Standing Committee
Lyon (France), 7 - 11 March 2022

Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

Compliance matters

NATIONAL IVORY ACTION PLANS PROCESS:
REPORT OF THE SECRETARIAT

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat pursuant to the *Guidelines to the National Ivory Action Plan Process* contained in Annex 3 of [Resolution Conf. 10.10 \(Rev. CoP18\)](#) on *Trade in elephant specimens*.¹

New Parties identified for inclusion in the NIAP process

2. At its 71st meeting (SC71, Geneva, August 2019), the Standing Committee agreed recommendation c) regarding Turkey, contained in summary record [SC71 SR](#). The Committee agreed not to include Turkey in the National Ivory Action Plans (NIAP) process and requested the Party instead to submit to the Secretariat a report on progress made and the results achieved in addressing illegal trade in ivory as it relates to Turkey. On the basis of the report from Turkey and any recommendations from the Secretariat, the Committee further agreed to consider at its 73rd meeting (SC73, online, May 2021) if Turkey should be included in the NIAP process.
3. Pursuant to recommendation c), Turkey submitted its report to the Secretariat on 24 June 2020. As reported in the Secretariat's [update](#) to the Standing Committee in November 2020, the Secretariat assessed the report received and informally shared its assessment with Turkey. The Secretariat invited Turkey to update, if it so wished, its report for re-submission 90 days in advance of SC73, taking into account the observations made by the Secretariat in its assessment. Due to the challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic, the Committee was not able to address the NIAP process at SC73 and the matter is now scheduled to be discussed at the present meeting.
4. On 27 October 2021, Turkey clarified via email that it continues to implement the measures mentioned in its report of June 2020 and that it did not wish to update its report for the present meeting. Additional data requested from ETIS as outlined in the assessment conducted by the Secretariat shows that the Party increasingly effectively detects illegal ivory consignments, and that illegal ivory trade as it affects Turkey declined in recent years. The report submitted by Turkey in June 2020 is available as Annex 10 to the present document and the Secretariat's assessment of the report in Annex 1. The Secretariat considers that it will not be appropriate to include Turkey in the NIAP process at present, and proposes that the Committee request the Secretariat to continue monitoring, in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18), illegal trade in ivory as it affects Turkey and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

¹ Referred to as 'the Guidelines' throughout the present document.

Parties that are included in the NIAP process

5. There are currently 14 Parties and one territory participating in the NIAP process. Five Parties are in Category A: Malaysia, Mozambique, Nigeria, Togo and Viet Nam; these Parties require priority attention. One territory is in category B: Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's Republic of China. Finally, nine Parties are in Category C: Angola, Cambodia, Cameroon, Congo, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Ethiopia, Gabon, Lao People's Democratic Republic (PDR), and Qatar.
6. In accordance with the timeframe set in Step 4, paragraph a) of the *Guidelines*, Parties should submit their reports on progress with NIAP implementation to the Secretariat 90 days in advance of each regular Standing Committee meeting.
7. As reported in the Secretariat's update to the Standing Committee in November 2020, six Parties submitted progress reports to the Secretariat within the deadline initially scheduled for the SC73. These Parties were Cambodia, Congo, Gabon, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Qatar and Viet Nam. The Secretariat prepared preliminary assessments of the reports received and informally shared them with the Parties concerned. The Secretariat invited these Parties to update, if they so wished, their progress reports for re-submission 90 days in advance of a rescheduled SC73, taking into account the observations made by the Secretariat in its assessments. As mentioned in paragraph 3) above, the Committee was not able to address this progress with NIAP implementation at SC73 and the matter is now being discussed at the present meeting.
8. For consideration at the present meeting, Malaysia and the Democratic Republic of the Congo submitted their first reports on progress with NIAP implementation since SC70, and Cambodia, Congo, Gabon, the Lao People's Democratic Republic and Viet Nam submitted updates of their reports originally submitted to SC73 as described in paragraph 7) above. Qatar submitted its report in time for SC73 as described in paragraph 7) above and did not submit an updated report for the present meeting.
9. The Secretariat evaluated the reports received in accordance with Step 4, paragraphs c) and d), of the *Guidelines*. The findings and observations of the Secretariat are presented in Annex 1 to the present document. To facilitate the understanding of the Committee regarding the status of Parties' implementation of their NIAPs, the Secretariat prepared Table 1 in Annex 1 to the present document, showing the self-assessment ratings of Parties for SC70 and SC74, as well as the assessment ratings of the Secretariat where they diverged from a Party's self-assessment.
10. The Secretariat further notes that, at the time of writing Mozambique, Nigeria and Togo as Category A Parties, and Angola, Cameroon, and Ethiopia as Category C Parties did not submit progress reports for the present meeting, as required by Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*. The observations of the Secretariat on these Parties are also presented in Annex 1 to the present document.

Parties that 'achieved' their NIAPs

11. The Standing Committee at its 70th meeting (SC70, Sochi, October 2018) agreed recommendation t) directed to Hong Kong SAR, contained in summary record [SC70 SR](#). The Committee commended Hong Kong SAR for implementing its NIAP, the additional measures and activities implemented to address illegal trade in ivory, and the firm commitment demonstrated to build upon the progress made to date. The Committee also encouraged Hong Kong SAR to submit a comprehensive report to SC73 on:
 - a) any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal trade in ivory;
 - b) progress with the implementation of Hong Kong SAR's three-step plan to phase out trade in elephant ivory;
 - c) any measures and activities implemented to prevent the displacement of illegal trade in ivory to Hong Kong SAR that may result from the closure of domestic ivory markets in mainland China; and
 - d) measures implemented to deter and detect worked ivory products moving out of Africa to Hong Kong SAR, and to penalize offenders involved.

The Committee agreed that it will consider at SC73 whether Hong Kong SAR should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5 of the *Guidelines*.

12. As reported in the Secretariat's update to the Standing Committee in November 2020, pursuant to the Committee's recommendation, Hong Kong SAR submitted its report to the Secretariat on 30 June 2020. The Secretariat assessed the report received and informally shared its assessment with Hong Kong SAR. The Secretariat invited Hong Kong SAR to update, if it so wished, its report for re-submission 90 days in advance of SC73, taking into account the observations made by the Secretariat in its assessment.
13. Following the Secretariat's suggestion, Hong Kong SAR submitted an updated report on 30 November 2021. The report is available as Annex 6 to the present document and the Secretariat's assessment of the report in Annex 1. Based on its assessment, the Secretariat considers that further activities can be pursued by Hong Kong SAR outside the NIAP process and the Secretariat recommends that the Party exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5 paragraphs b) and c) of the *Guidelines*.

Parties that have recently revised and updated their NIAPs

14. The Standing Committee at SC70 agreed recommendation g) directed to the Lao People's Democratic Republic. If the Lao People's Democratic Republic decided to revise and update its NIAP, as indicated in its progress report to SC70, the Committee requested that it be submitted to the Secretariat for assessment in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines*. Pursuant to the Committee's request, the Lao People's Democratic Republic submitted a revised and updated NIAP to the Secretariat on 9 July 2020. The Secretariat has assessed the revised and updated NIAP as adequate, in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines*, and informed the Lao People's Democratic Republic accordingly.
15. The Standing Committee at SC71 agreed recommendations f) directed to Nigeria and j) directed to Mozambique. The Committee requested Nigeria to revise and update its NIAP and Mozambique to revise and update its National Ivory and Rhinoceros Action Plan (NIRAP). Pursuant to the Committee's request, Nigeria submitted its revised and updated NIAP to the Secretariat on 5 May 2020, and Mozambique submitted its revised and updated NIRAP on 11 September 2020. The Secretariat has assessed the revised and updated NIAP and NIRAP as adequate, in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines*, and informed the two Parties accordingly.

The status of ivory stockpiles in Burundi

16. The Standing Committee at SC71 agreed recommendation a) directed to Burundi. The Committee agreed not to include Burundi in the NIAP process but requested the Party to report on the status of its ivory stockpiles. The Standing Committee also asked to include information on any activities conducted and findings made following the May 2015 letter of the Secretariat concerning ivory from the Burundi stockpile that allegedly made its way into illegal trade. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to make the report from Burundi available to the Committee at SC73.
17. The Secretariat wrote to Burundi on 13 November 2019 recalling its letter of May 2015 and requesting the Party to provide the Secretariat with a comprehensive report on the status of its ivory stockpiles, but no reply was received. In November 2021, the Secretariat sought the assistance of the United Nations Resident Coordinator in Burundi in order to try and obtain a response. The Secretariat will report orally at the present meeting, under agenda item 60 on *Stocks and stockpiles (elephant ivory)*, on the outcome of this demarche and any consequent recommendations that it has for the Standing Committee.

Recommendations

Turkey

- a) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) not include Turkey in the NIAP process at present;
 - ii) encourage Turkey to continue to be vigilant in the implementation of measures to prevent the transit of illegal ivory through Turkey; and
 - iii) request the Secretariat, in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18), to continue to monitor illegal trade in ivory as it affects Turkey and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

Parties that continue with NIAP implementation

Angola, Cameroon, Ethiopia

- b) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee, regarding Angola, Cameroon, and Ethiopia as Category C Parties:
 - i) note that these Parties did not submit reports on progress with NIAP implementation; and
 - ii) consider any progress reports submitted by these Parties ahead of SC74, and any oral updates provided by these Parties at the present meeting, and make any further recommendations as appropriate.
- c) In the absence of any report or oral update on progress with NIAP implementation to SC74 by any of the Parties referred to in recommendation b) above, the Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee request the Secretariat in accordance with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process*, on behalf of the Committee to issue a warning, requesting the Party concerned to submit its NIAP progress reports to the Secretariat within 60 days of the conclusion of SC74.

Cambodia

- d) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee note the progress made by Cambodia in implementing its NIAP and agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Cambodia, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process*.

Congo

- e) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) note the limited progress made by the Congo in implementing its NIAP and encourage the Party to step up efforts to progress implementation of its NIAP;
 - ii) request the Congo, in its future NIAP implementation progress reports, to report on all progress made in the implementation of each NIAP action since the NIAP was approved in 2015, and to allocate a rating to each NIAP action based on the overall progress made in implementing the action since 2015;
 - iii) request the Congo if it wishes to revise and update its NIAP found to be adequate in 2015, to do so using the template for NIAP development available on the NIAP webpage and, if applicable, to provide justification for the removal of, or the reduction of the scope of, any actions which have not yet been achieved or substantially achieved in the NIAP originally found to be adequate;
 - iv) encourage the Congo to commence the implementation of actions 4.1, 5.2 and 6.1 of its NIAP;
 - v) agree an overall rating of 'limited progress' for the Congo, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process*; and
 - vi) encourage Parties, governmental, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations and others to provide, where possible, financial and technical assistance to the Congo to support the implementation of its NIAP.

Democratic Republic of the Congo

- f) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) note that the Democratic Republic of the Congo did not use the template for reporting on progress, as required by Step 4, paragraph b), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process* and as requested by the Standing Committee at its 70th meeting;
 - ii) note that the Democratic Republic of the Congo did not report on five of the 28 actions included in its NIAP, and that as a result the Secretariat was not able to fully evaluate the progress made by the Democratic Republic of the Congo;

- iii) request the Democratic Republic of the Congo, if it wishes to revise and update its NIAP found to be adequate in 2018, to do so using the template for NIAP development available on the NIAP webpage and, if applicable, to provide justification for the removal of any actions which have not yet been achieved or substantially achieved in the NIAP found to be adequate in 2018;
 - iv) note the concerns regarding the escalation of illegal trade in ivory from the DRC, as detailed in paragraph 43 of Annex 1 to document SC74 Doc. 28.4; and
 - v) consider any revised progress report submitted by the DRC ahead of SC74, and any oral updates provided by the DRC at the present meeting and make any further recommendations as appropriate.
- g) In the absence of any updated progress report or oral update on progress with NIAP implementation to SC74 by the DRC, request the Secretariat in accordance with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines*, to issue a warning on behalf of the Committee, requesting the DRC to submit a revised NIAP progress report to the Secretariat, using the template for reporting on progress available on the NIAP webpage, and including information on the implementation of actions C.1, C.2., C.3., E.1 and E.2 of its NIAP, within 60 days of the conclusion of SC74.

Gabon

- h) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) request Gabon to take note of the observations of the Secretariat in its assessment regarding actions B.2, C.2 E.4 and E.9 of the NIAP, and invite Gabon to elaborate in more detail in its future reports on the activities implemented to achieve these actions; and
 - ii) agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Gabon, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Lao People's Democratic Republic

- i) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) note the revised and updated NIAP of the Lao People's Democratic Republic; and
 - ii) agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for the Lao People's Democratic Republic, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Malaysia

- j) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) commend Malaysia for achieving its NIAP;
 - ii) encourage Malaysia to submit a report to the Secretariat, 90 days before the deadline for submission of documents to the 77th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC77), on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, so that the Secretariat can make the report available to the Standing Committee at SC77; and
 - iii) request the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18), and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
- k) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee agree that it will consider at SC77 whether Malaysia should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5 of the *Guidelines*.

Mozambique

- l) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) note the revised and updated NIAP of Mozambique;

- ii) note that Mozambique did not submit its report on progress with NIAP implementation; and
 - iii) note any progress report submitted by Mozambique ahead of SC74, and any oral updates provided by Mozambique at the present meeting; and make any further recommendations as appropriate.
- m) In the absence of any report or oral update on progress with NIAP implementation to SC74 by Mozambique, the Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee request the Secretariat, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines*, to issue a warning on behalf of the Committee requesting Mozambique to submit its NIAP progress report within 60 days of the conclusion of SC74 to the Secretariat.

Nigeria

- n) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
- i) note the revised and updated NIAP of Nigeria;
 - ii) note that Nigeria did not submit its reports on progress with NIAP implementation in time for its progress to be assessed and reflected in the documents on NIAPs prepared by the Secretariat for SC66, SC67, SC69, SC70 and SC74;
 - iii) note any progress report submitted by Nigeria ahead of SC74, and any oral updates provided by Nigeria at the present meeting;
 - iv) note the concerns regarding the escalation of illegal trade in ivory and other wildlife specimens from Nigeria, as detailed in paragraph 82 of Annex 1 to document SC74 Doc. 28.4; and
 - v) note that persistent compliance challenges have been identified concerning Nigeria, as described in document SC74 Doc. 28.2.4 on the application of Article XIII in Nigeria, and request the Secretariat, on behalf of the Committee and in accordance with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process* and Resolution Conf. 14.3 (Rev. CoP18) on *CITES compliance procedures*, to issue a consolidated Notification to the Parties recommending all Parties to suspend commercial trade in all CITES-listed species with Nigeria, until Nigeria complies with the Standing Committee's recommendations under the Article XIII process and the provisions of Step 4, paragraphs a) and b), of the *Guidelines*.

Qatar

- o) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
- i) agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Qatar, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*; and
 - ii) request Qatar to continue to progress the implementation of its NIAP between SC74 and SC77.

Togo

- p) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
- i) note that Togo did not submit its reports on progress with NIAP implementation in time for its progress to be assessed and reflected in the documents on NIAPs prepared by the Secretariat for SC70 and SC74; and
 - ii) note any progress report submitted by Togo ahead of SC74, and any oral updates provided by Togo at the present meeting;
- q) In the absence of any report or oral update on progress with NIAP implementation to SC74 by Togo, the Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee request the Secretariat, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines*, to issue a warning on behalf of the Committee requesting Togo to submit its NIAP progress report within 60 days of the conclusion of SC74 to the Secretariat.

Viet Nam

- r) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) note the progress made by Viet Nam in implementing its NIRAP;
 - ii) agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Viet Nam, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines to the NIAP process*;
 - iii) request Viet Nam to continue to progress the implementation of its NIRAP between SC74 and SC77;
 - iv) encourage Viet Nam to continue to implement activities specifically targeting key locations known to be associated with illegal wildlife trade, both at its borders and in domestic markets; and
 - v) encourage Viet Nam to build upon the findings made through the survey conducted in accordance with action 2.5 in the NIRAP, regarding illegal online wildlife trade, and to respond to the findings of the survey through the implementation of appropriate measures and activities.

Parties that achieved their NIAPs

Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of China

- s) The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - i) commend Hong Kong SAR of China for achieving its NIAP and for the further measures taken to address illegal trade in ivory;
 - ii) agree that Hong Kong SAR of China exit the NIAP process in accordance with Step 5 of the *Guidelines*; and
 - iii) request the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18), and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.