CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Seventy-first meeting of the Standing Committee
Colombo (Sri Lanka), 22 May 2019

Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

MALAGASY EBONIES (DIOSPYROS SPP.) AND
PALISANDERS AND ROSEWOODS (DALBERGIA SPP.):
REPORT OF MADAGASCAR

1. This document has been submitted by Madagascar*.

2. At the 17th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES, held in Johannesburg, South Africa, in 2016, the CITES Action Plan for Malagasy rosewoods, palisanders and ebonies was revised and is detailed in Decisions 17.203 to 17.208 “Malagasy ebonies (Diospyros spp.) and palisanders and rosewoods (Dalbergia spp.)”, which clarify responsibilities.

Madagascar has to implement the actions spelled out in Decision 17.204, which are grouped into three main areas:

a) Sustainable management of biodiversity and scientific research [Decision 17.204, paragraphs a) to d)]

b) Significant strengthening of enforcement measures against forestry infractions [Decision 17.204, paragraph e)]

c) Management of stockpiles of precious woods [Decision 17.204, paragraph f)]

3. At each meeting of the Standing Committee, Madagascar must submit a report on the recommendations and progress of the CITES Action Plan for precious woods addressing paragraphs e) and f) of Decision 17.204, as follows:

   e) for those species identified under paragraph a), significantly strengthen control and enforcement measures against illegal logging and export at the national level including seizures, investigations, arrests, prosecutions, and sanctions;

   f) submit regular updates on audited inventories of at least a third of the stockpiles of species of Dalbergia and Diospyros from Madagascar, and a use plan for consideration, approval and further guidance from the Standing Committee;

4. At the 70th meeting of the Standing Committee, Madagascar submitted the report on the implementation of the CITES Action Plan with an update on the progress made, which includes the creation of a Special Court for rosewood and ebony, the surveillance of the ports and coastal space of Madagascar, the sharing of information at a regional level, which allows neighbouring countries to monitor the movement of suspicious

* The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.
vessels, the review and update of legislation, the legal proceedings under way and the national inventory of stockpiles of *Dalbergia* spp. and *Diospyros* spp.

5. At its 70th meeting, the Standing Committee decided to maintain the current suspension of trade in specimens of *Dalbergia* spp. and *Diospyros* spp. from Madagascar and recommended the following:

   a) revise the Business Plan submitted by Madagascar to include:

      i) the creation of the function of an independent observer, to be funded from external sources, in order to ensure transparency and independent and effective oversight;

      ii) the reinforcement of the oversight mechanism for both the financing of the plan and the allocation of revenues;

      iii) the creation of a monitoring system to assess possible impacts of any sales on illegal logging and timber trafficking, with the support of relevant partners;

   b) implement the inventories described in steps 1 and 2 of Phase 1 and secure the funding required with the support of external donors;

   c) explore alternatives to the current proposed compensation schemes in consultation with relevant stakeholders and explore alternatives regarding the allocation of these revenues in order to make them more conservation friendly;

6. The present document is the report of Madagascar to the 71st meeting of the Standing Committee and addresses paragraphs e) and f) of Decision 17.204 mentioned above. A review of this report is planned before the 71st meeting of the Standing Committee takes place in Colombo, Sri Lanka.

   A. **Significant strengthening of enforcement measures against forestry infractions [Decision 17.204, paragraph e])**

1. Special Court to combat illegal trade of rosewood and/or ebony and punish offences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date/Status</th>
<th>Progress by Madagascar</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2018 - 2019 | **1. Functional status**  
After the installation of the magistrates and the appointment of the court clerks and assessors, the Special Court is functional and operational: the inquiries and investigations of the cases are under way and some are ready for trial. | The Special Court would be more effective if support was provided for:  
- the acquisition or rental of independent premises;  
- the acquisition of office and computer equipment; and  
- the acquisition of vehicles to conduct inquiries and the hearing of witnesses outside Antananarivo.  
In parallel, the effective creation of the mixed investigation brigade provided for by Organic Law No. 2015-056 of 3 February 2016 on the creation of the Special Chain to fight against trafficking of rosewood and/or ebony would accelerate the processing of current and potential new cases.  
Direct cooperation should be established between ICCWC, the Ministry of Justice and the Special Court. It would be wise to provide the contact details of the senior officials of this international body to the Malagasy authorities. |
|            | **2. Progress of cases**  
An inventory of the cases of infringements involving illegal trade of rosewood and/or ebony is in progress: letter No. 322- |

SC71 Doc. 14 (Rev. 1) – p. 2
Once the inventory is completed, all the cases of infringements involving illegal trade of rosewood and/or ebony will be referred to the Special Court.

- 8 cases have been referred by the Anti-Corruption Unit to the prosecutor’s office of the Special Court from 15 November 2018 following procès-verbal No. 023-MJ/DCN/PAC/PV.18:
  2 arrest warrants have been issued by the Investigatory Chamber and sent to the judicial police: one of them was executed on 13 February 2019.
- 6 cases were referred by the Court of First Instance of Maroantsetra in January and February 2019: they are currently under investigation by the Investigatory Chamber.
  - 1 case (the Lumina case) has been referred by the Court of Appeal and is ready for trial.
  - 1 case (the Singapore case) has been directly referred to the prosecutor’s office of the Special Court.
- By February 2019, 16 cases had been received and processed by the Special Court. This is their status:
  - 2 are being dealt with by the prosecutor’s office
  - 12 are being dealt with by the Investigatory Chamber
  - 2 are in the trial phase
- 120 defendants have been apprehended:
  - 57 have been placed under a detention order
  - 14 have been provisionally released.
  - The inquiries, investigations and summons for the hearings of the other defendants are under way.

The Special Court has exclusive powers regarding infringements related to illegal trade in rosewood and/or ebony.

In addition, under Article 25 of Organic Law No. 2015-056 of 3 February 2016, the powers of the Special Court extend to infringements that constitute an indivisible whole with the infringement persecuted, as well as any related ones provided that they have been prosecuted in the same proceeding.

Thus, the Special Court has powers to rule on other infringements apart from those related to illegal trade in rosewood and/or ebony as long as there is a connection between them.

The Special Court is awaiting the referral of cases involving infractions related to rosewood and/or ebony from the other courts of first instance and courts of appeal.

2. Follow-up of the the cases of environmental infractions identified (SC67 doc. 19.1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date/Status</th>
<th>Progress by Madagascar</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Follow-up of the 89 cases of forestry infractions identified (SC67 doc. 19.1): after coordinated work with the courts of first instance (i.e. lower courts), the number of cases amounts to 79 in 2017 - 60 cases have been judged with the following outcomes: 7 cases closed without further action 132 defendants tried, of which 111 convicted and 21 acquitted - 9 cases not registered at the public prosecutors’ offices - 10 cases being processed (Cf. Annex II)</td>
<td>It should be noted that these 79 cases of forestry infractions do not only concern illegal trade in rosewood and ebony but also cases of land clearing, bushfires, illegal trade of turtles…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>Of the 21 pending cases of 2018 that were still being processed (cf. Annex II): 26 defendants were placed under a detention order;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
15 cases were judged, of which 5 were appealed:
  • 17 defendants received immediate sentences,
  • 19 defendants were acquitted.
- 6 cases are being processed.

3. Follow-up on the actions regarding the seizure of rosewood in Singapore

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date/Status</th>
<th>Progress by Madagascar</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2017-2018</td>
<td>Prosecution of accomplices in Madagascar:</td>
<td>For confidentiality reasons, no information is provided on current investigations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Launch of a nationwide investigation to identify and arrest accomplices in the illegal export of rosewood seized in Singapore following the complaint &quot;against persons unknown&quot;: preliminary inquiry made by the Independent Anti-Corruption Bureau (BIANCO) on the illegal export of rosewood to Singapore.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>12 February 2019: the accomplices were referred to the prosecutor’s office of the Special Court. The case was referred to the Investigatory Chamber and is under investigation. A close associate of the former Minister of the Environment has been placed under a detention order.</td>
<td>A former Minister of the Environment is charged in this case and can be tried before the High Court of Justice. The referral to the High Court of Justice will depend on the decision of the National Assembly, which will be re-elected, on whether or not to indict the former minister. If this is agreed, the General Prosecutor of the Supreme Court will initiate the proceedings.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Control measures against illegal exploitation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date/Status</th>
<th>Progress by Madagascar</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>October - December 2018</td>
<td>Arrest of the vessel “Flying”.</td>
<td>On 24 October 2018, the Malagasy maritime and coastal surveillance system reported the presence of the suspicious vessel “Flying” in Sainte Marie region (in the east). On 31 October 2018, the vessel moved from the entrance of Antongil Bay to about 30 nautical miles from Mananara-Nord, reaching the area of Ifaho, 3 nautical miles from Anjanozana, known as a high risk area for the illegal transshipment of rosewood. The prosecutor’s office of Toamasina has initiated legal proceedings for refusal to comply with the orders of the management authorities and other infractions and placed several crew members under a detention order. The Special Court has discovered some clues and there are plans to visit Toamasina to gather all the necessary evidence in order to possibly launch an inquiry into an attempted export of rosewood.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B. Management of stockpiles of precious woods [Decision 17.204, paragraph f)]

1. submit regular updates on audited inventories of at least a third of the stockpiles of species of Dalbergia and Diospyros from Madagascar, and a use plan for consideration, approval and further guidance from the Standing Committee;
a) Updates on audited inventories: Inventories of declared wood (cf. Annex III)

From November 2017 to February 2018, the Government of Madagascar decided in 2017 to allocate a budget of 750,000,000 ariary (about USD 234,000) to this task. The Executive Secretariat (ES) of the Interministerial Committee (COMINT) conducted the inventory of declared wood. The mission took place in the region that has a high concentration of stockpiles. Following the voluntary declarations made in 2011 (Ordinance 2011 – 001) by operators with stockpiles, physical inventories of timber were taken and compared with the declarations made. The mission was performed from November 2017 to January 2018.

i. Results (Cf. SC70 Doc. 27.05.01; CoP18 Doc. 30.1)

Number of declarers: 65
Number of sites visited: 64

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Total no. declared</th>
<th>Total no. observed</th>
<th>Volume (m³)</th>
<th>Weight (t)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Logs</td>
<td>53,852</td>
<td>33,737</td>
<td>2,976,477</td>
<td>3,690,831</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planks</td>
<td>45,424</td>
<td>17,336 + 4 BATCHES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4,856</td>
<td>4,313 + 4 BATCHES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ii. Observations

During the inventory taking, the team of the COMINT ES drew up reports of the facts and of the sequestration that will be sent to the Special Court as soon as the inventories are completed.

Rosewood specimens were marked, measured, sealed and sequestered (Cf. Doc. SC70–27–05–01–A3; p. 60, 61, 62).

The Special Court will clarify the status of the inventoried timber with regard to Ordinance 2011. Indeed, in accordance with Article 28 of the decree implementing the Special Chain, (No. 2016 – 801), the COMINT ES must cooperate with the Special Chain, particularly by sharing any intelligence, information and useful documents to determine what to do with the timber.

As a result of the implementation of the ordinances issued from 2011 onwards, the individual status of each stock will be determined by the Special Court based on the reports received by the COMINT ES as soon as the inventories are completed.

iii. Status of the timber seized by the Government of Madagascar

Seized rosewood specimens are goods associated with illegal activities seized by government officials. They belong to the State of Madagascar.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of regions investigated</th>
<th>Total no. of rosewood logs seized</th>
<th>Total no. of rosewood logs inventoried, marked and secured</th>
<th>Percentage of completion</th>
<th>Observations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11 regions</td>
<td>28,666</td>
<td>27,725</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>Rosewood specimens seized but not documented increased the percentage.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b) Update of the use plan following the recommendation of the Standing Committee (SC70)
Following the recommendation of the CITES Standing Committee and subject to the availability of resources, Madagascar, the World Bank and the ITTO are currently preparing a pilot project aimed at:

a) preparing the implementation of the use plan in consultation with the stakeholders;

b) aligning the inventory procedure with the CITES requirements through a prior analysis of the inventories already made in order to develop a protocol or manual and the methodology for inventory taking;

c) undertaking steps 1 and 2 of Phase 1 to demonstrate the efficiency of the proposed system and encourage the other stakeholders to participate.

Considering the change of government resulting from the presidential election in 2018, Madagascar is busy organizing the work and pursuing the efforts already undertaken to follow and implement the recommendations of CITES. As a result, the update of the use plan and the continuation of inventories will take place during this year 2019.

**CONCLUSION**

Madagascar remains committed to implementing the CITES Action Plan following the recommendations arising from the meetings of the Committees. To this end, for the next stages, the following priority actions will be implemented in view of the next meeting of the Standing Committee, among others:

a) Implementation of steps 1 and 2 of Phase 1 (i.e., reverification of seized stockpiles, inventory of non-controlled declared timber).

b) Request for the assistance of ICCWC to conduct the inquiries and for the cooperation of countries having seized significant shipments of specimens of rosewood, palisander or ebony from Madagascar, to share information supporting investigations and prosecutions by Madagascar;

c) Review of the “use plan” document (i.e., the form, the idea of compensation, the role of an independent observer, the use of funds);

d) Review of the reallocation of the proceeds from the sale of timber and the creation of an independent trust fund (pending approval by the Ministry of Finance and Budget);

e) Establishment of the governance structure of the use plan;

f) Risk analysis of the options for use identified and/or assessment of the potential effects of the sales on illegal logging and timber trafficking.
Decisions 17.203 to 17.208: Malagasy ebonies (*Diospyros* spp.) and palisanders and rosewoods (*Dalbergia* spp.)

**Directed to source, transit and destinations Parties for Malagasy Diospyros spp. and Dalbergia spp.**

17.203 Source, transit and destination Parties for specimens of species of the genera *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* occurring in Madagascar are urged to:

a) enforce all the measures that are recommended by the CITES Standing Committee concerning commercial trade in specimens of these species from Madagascar, including suspensions of such trade;

b) develop action plans to effectively manage timber stockpiles of *Dalbergia* spp. and *Diospyros* spp. from Madagascar; and

c) provide written reports describing progress made with implementation of paragraphs a) and b) of this Decision to the Standing Committee.

**Directed to Madagascar**

17.204 Madagascar:

a) continue to develop an inclusive process to identify the main commercially valuable species in these genera from Madagascar, in cooperation with transit and destination Parties, the CITES Secretariat and relevant partners, such as the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO), the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC), the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and other intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations concerned with trade in timber of rosewood, ebonies and palisanders;

b) for those species identified under paragraph a) establish, in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, a precautionary export quota based upon a scientifically robust non-detriment finding;

c) subject to the availability of funds, organize workshops in support of the implementation of paragraphs a) and b) of this Decision, and to strengthen the national capacity to formulate non-detriment findings, and identify and agree on monitoring mechanisms that include appropriate technology (e.g. timber tracking);

d) continue the production of identification materials for identifying timber and timber products of species of the genera *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar;

e) for those species identified under paragraph a), significantly strengthen control and enforcement measures against illegal logging and export at the national level including seizures, investigations, arrests, prosecutions, and sanctions;

f) submit regular updates on audited inventories of at least a third of the stockpiles of species of *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar, and a use plan for consideration, approval and further guidance from the Standing Committee; and

g) provide written reports on progress with the implementation of paragraphs a) to d) of this Decision to each meeting of the Plants Committee; on progress with the implementation of paragraphs e) and f) of this Decision to the Standing Committee; and on progress with the implementation of this Decision to the Conference of the Parties at its 18th meeting.
Directed to Parties

17.205 Parties and relevant partners indicated in Decision 17.204 paragraph a) are invited to:

   a) provide technical and financial assistance to support the implementation of Decisions 17.203 to 17.208;

   b) provide technical and financial assistance in support of conducting audited inventories of Dalbergia spp. and Diospyros spp. from Madagascar; and

   c) provide reports to the Standing Committee, including information received from relevant partner organizations, concerning progress with the implementation of paragraphs a) and b) of this Decision.

Directed to the Plants Committee

17.206 The Plants Committee shall:

   a) review and assess reports from Madagascar on its implementation of Decisions 17.204 paragraphs a) to d), and from the Secretariat on the implementation of Decision 17.208, and provide recommendations to Madagascar and the Standing Committee and other bodies as appropriate;

   b) continue supporting the preparation of a standard reference for the names of species of the genera Diospyros and Dalbergia occurring in Madagascar, to be adopted, if appropriate, at the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and

   c) assist Madagascar in the identification of technical resources in support of the implementation of Decisions 17.204 paragraphs a) to d), and if needed, make recommendations to Madagascar, Standing Committee and other relevant organizations.

Directed to the Standing Committee

17.207 The Standing Committee shall review and assess reports from Madagascar on the implementation of Decision 17.204 paragraph e) and f), and from the Secretariat on the implementation of Decision 17.208, and make recommendations, which may include appropriate compliance measures and an assessment as to whether the conditions for a partial sale of audited stocks are in place, in accordance with the criteria established in Decision 17.204, paragraphs e) and f).

Directed to the Secretariat

17.208 The Secretariat shall:

   a) assist Madagascar, relevant Parties, and the Standing and Plants Committees in the implementation of Decisions 17.203 to 17.207;

   b) subject to available funding, assist with relevant capacity-building activities in Madagascar and transit and destination countries concerned by the trade in specimens of Diospyros spp. and Dalbergia spp. from Madagascar, including through international capacity building workshops; and

   d) provide written reports on progress with the implementation of this Decision to the Plants Committee and the Standing Committee, as appropriate.
### Annex II. STATUS OF THE 21 PENDING CASES OF THE 43 NEW CASES OF 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>No. of cases</th>
<th>No. of people brought before the courts</th>
<th>No. of defendants with a detention order</th>
<th>No. of people provisionally released</th>
<th>No. of cases judged</th>
<th>No. of defendants convicted</th>
<th>No. of defendants acquitted</th>
<th>No. of cases ongoing</th>
<th>No. of cases committed to trial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANALAMANGA</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAKINAKARATRA</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOENY</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VATOVAVY FITOVINANY</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENABE</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATSIMO ANDREFANA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOFIA</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Report on the stockpile inventory (DOC by the Executive Secretariat of the Interministerial Committee)

**WORK CONDUCTED BY THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT BETWEEN COP17 AND COP18**

**I. MISSION OF THE EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT**

Decree No. 2014-906 of 24 June 2014 on the creation of the Executive Secretariat (ES) in charge of reforming the rosewood and ebony sector marked a pivotal moment in the political will of the Government of Madagascar to solve the problem of reforming this sector. In order to have a single command while conducting the field mission, the twelve ministries concerned, brought together in the Interministerial Committee (COMINT), mandate the ES, which is their executive arm to coordinate this reform according to the government’s policy.

**II. STARTING POINTS**

The initial data on the sector were tables listing the name of offenders, the locations of offences and stockpiled timber and especially the number of logs per person, cited both regarding seized timber and declared timber.

**OFFICIAL DATA**

The status of the rosewood (RW) and ebony (EB) included in the national catalogue of the *Direction Générale des Forêts* (DGF) provides the following numbers:

- Seized RW and EB: 28,666 logs
- Declared RW and EB: 294,936 RW logs + 6 containers
- 6,717 EB logs
- 450,409 EB planks + 1,774 kg of EB
- 138,935 RW planks + 4 containers

**III. WORK ON SEIZED ROSEWOOD AND EBONY**

**MISSION:** to inventory, mark and secure 28,666 rosewood specimens seized by government officials.

**A. LOCATION:** the map showing the stockpile sites and the number of logs to inventory is displayed in Annex I.

**B. METHODOLOGY USED:** decisions in the field were made in a collegiate manner way with the expanded *Organe Mixte de Conception* (OMC, the regional law enforcement body in charge of making decisions regarding public order) and the ES. Importantly, transparency was ensured thanks to the presence to civil society entities, BIANCO and decentralized authorities. Security was provided by officers of the national gendarmerie, the national police and the Malagasy army. The rosewood was inventoried, counted and marked by forestry officials of the DGF under the supervision of forestry engineers.

**C. OBSERVED RESULTS:** the following table summarizes the results; details can be consulted in Annex I of the present report:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of regions investigated</th>
<th>Total no. of RW logs seized</th>
<th>Total no. of RW logs inventoried, marked and secured</th>
<th>Percentage of completion</th>
<th>Observations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11 regions</td>
<td>28,666</td>
<td>27,725</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>RW specimens seized but not documented increased the percentage</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
D. DIFFICULTIES ENCOUNTERED IN THE FIELD

Transporting RW specimens to secure them is too expensive and thus limits the possibility of securing them in one single location. Sometimes the OMC is reluctant to attend meetings due to its many obligations.

IV. WORK DONE ON THE DECLARED TIMBER

A. MISSION: to inventory, mark and seal declared timber in accordance with CITES requests and requirements.

B. LOCATION

The 7 regions with declared RW are recorded and marked on the map (in Annex II).

C. METHODOLOGY USED

- Training of forestry officials to apply the new criteria for qualification and classification of RW and EB required by CITES, under the coordination of the COMINT ES.

- Four heads of operations assisted by 5 or 6 officials conducted the fieldwork (i.e., inventorying, counting, marking, sealing).

- Strategy adopted: approach the inventory of the declared RW in a totally peaceful atmosphere in order to detect concealed or undeclared RW.

- Memorandum of collaboration between authorities in the field (enlarged OMC), operators and the COMINT ES.

D. OBSERVED RESULTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DESIGNATION</th>
<th>TOTAL NO. DECLARED</th>
<th>TOTAL NO. OBSERVED</th>
<th>VOLUME (M3)</th>
<th>WEIGHT (T)</th>
<th>OBSERV.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LOGS</td>
<td>53,852</td>
<td>33,737</td>
<td>2,976.477</td>
<td>3,690.831</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANKS</td>
<td>45,424</td>
<td>17,336 + 4 BATCHES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHER</td>
<td>4,856</td>
<td>4,313 + 4 BATCHES</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During 61 days of work, the teams of the COMINT ES managed to inventory, mark and seal 33,737 RW logs, with a volume of 2,976.477 m3 and a weight of 3,690.831 tonnes in 64 locations, as well as 17,336 planks + 4 batches and an additional 4,313 + 4 batches.

CURRENT SITUATION REGARDING THE CITES RECOMMENDATIONS:

A. Reverified inventory required by CITES:
   i) Officials trained
   ii) Inventories made in authorized sites
   iii) RW secured by designating the declarers as sequestration guardians

B. Measures taken to strengthen controls and the fight against illegal exploitation and export on a national level:
   i) Full surveillance by local forest officials and the gendarmerie of sensitive RW areas (i.e. protected areas and coastal areas)
   ii) Memorandum of collaboration between operators and the COMINT ES
iii) Protocol for real-time alert on suspicious vessels with CFIM, the Regional Centre for Maritime Information Fusion

iv) Protocol of surveillance of vessel movements in ports with APMF (the Maritime and River Port Agency, the authority responsible for traffic regulation)

v) Memorandum of collaboration between BIANCO and the COMINT ES to avoid any wrongdoing

vi) Achievements of the COMINT ES = 1/6 of RW verified, marked, sealed and secured

vii) Due to a lack of funding, the issue of the traceability of products after the inventory has not been resolved.

V. DIFFICULTIES ENCOUNTERED IN THE FIELD

The transport and maintenance expenses of RW are too high and limit the transfer of the timber to locations secured by the Government.

CURRENT STATUS OF THE ROSEWOOD: State of preservation

- **Seized RW: 27,725 logs**
  - 5% are indoors in closed premises and are therefore in good condition. Their commercial value is maintained.
  - 95% are outdoors, exposed to the elements and therefore in poor state of preservation. Radial cracks are increasing and the market value of the products is decreasing over time.

- **Declared RW:**
  - 45% are indoors in closed premises and 40% are underground or buried in rivers. Their market value is maintained.
  - 15% are outdoors; their market value will decrease over time because of the increase of radial cracks and the wood rot due to exposure to the elements.

VI. CONCLUSIONS

- For the inventory work to continue, it is necessary first to buy materials to ensure the traceability of the inventoried RW;
- It is expensive to maintain RW. Solutions must be found to ensure that the security of inventoried products is not jeopardized;
- Seized rosewood logs will soon have spent 10 years outdoors in the rainy area of Madagascar. It is therefore urgent to address this issue.
Annexe I : carte localisation BDR saisis

Carte générale des BDR et BE saisis par région :

BDR saisis : 28666 rondins

BDR inventoriés, marqués et sécurisés : 27725 rondins

Pourcentage de réalisation : 97 %
Tableau de réalisation des inventaires, comptage et marquage des BDR saisis par région

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGIONS</th>
<th>OBJECTIFS EN RONDINS</th>
<th>RONDINS SECURISES</th>
<th>POURCENTAGE</th>
<th>observations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ANALANJIRFOFO</td>
<td>2837</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>arrêt des opérations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIANA</td>
<td>4642</td>
<td>3097</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>disparition et remplacement BDR par bonara non comptabilisé</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOENY</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>après IDENTIFICATION REDUCTION NBR BDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAVA</td>
<td>11128</td>
<td>10640</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATSINANANA</td>
<td>518</td>
<td>2448</td>
<td>473%</td>
<td>BDR Analanjirofo transférés à 2/2RMG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANALAMANGA</td>
<td>3238</td>
<td>2336</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>Iavoloha non comptabilisé</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENABE</td>
<td>572</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>Lieux non sécurisés</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANOSY</td>
<td>2698</td>
<td>2898</td>
<td>107%</td>
<td>Extension BDR saisi non répertorié non établi dans TDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATSIMO ANDREFANA</td>
<td>805</td>
<td>1199</td>
<td>149%</td>
<td>Extension BDR saisis non répertories non établis dans TDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vatovavy Fito Vinany</td>
<td>950</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>après identification non BDR mais palissandre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atsimo Atsinanana</td>
<td>1162</td>
<td>1847</td>
<td>159%</td>
<td>Extension BDR saisis non répertories non établis dans TDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAUX</td>
<td>28666</td>
<td>27725</td>
<td>97%</td>
<td>BDR saisis non répertoriés ont augmenté le pourcentage</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEXE II :

SITUATION DES BOIS DECLARES
Janvier 2015

BOIS DE ROSE :
- Rondins : 294 936 et 6 Containers
- Plaquettes : 138 935 et 4 Containers

BOIS D’YRÉNE :
- Rondins : 6 717
- Plaquettes : 450 409 et 1 774 Kg
RESULTATS SUR LES BOIS DECLARES :

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHEFS OPERATION</th>
<th>RONDINS</th>
<th>PLAQUETTES</th>
<th>AUTRES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DECLARES</td>
<td>CONSTATES</td>
<td>(+)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO1</td>
<td>13491</td>
<td>10810</td>
<td>4109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO2</td>
<td>8473</td>
<td>7709</td>
<td>764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO3</td>
<td>5549</td>
<td>7235</td>
<td>1686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO4</td>
<td>26339</td>
<td>7983</td>
<td>18356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>53852</td>
<td>33737</td>
<td>1686</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CO 1 = chef d’opération n°1
CO 2 = chef d’opération n°2
CO 3 = chef d’opération n°3
CO 4 = chef d’opération n°4

ANNEE III : PLAN DE TRAVAIL REVISE

I / Objectif : Inventaires vérifiés BDR Déclarés
Lors de la mission en, novembre / décembre 2017, 53852 rondins déclarés – 33737 seulement ont été constatés.
Il reste donc à faire 241 084 sur les 294 936 déclarés ; repartis dans les régions suivantes : SAVA, ANALANJIOFO, ATSIMO AT SINANANA, ANALAMANGA, VATOVAVY FITOVINANY, ANOSY

II/ Durée : 100 jours

III/ Zone d’intervention :
SAVA : 189 949 rondins de BDR et 6528 rondins de BE seront à constater.
ANALANJIOFO : 38 835 BDR et 116 BE
ATSINANANA : 12 116 BDR
ANALAMANGA : 162 BDR et 10 BE
ATSIMO AT SINANANA : 262 BE
VATOVAVY FITOVINANNY : 22 BDR et 63 BE
ANOSY :
Les plaquettes en BDR et BE feront partie intégrante des travaux d’investigation et de comptage.
Bref, 6 containers de BDR + 138 935 plaquettes + 4 containers + 450 409 plaquettes de BE sont à inventorier.

IV/ - REPARTITION EQUIPES :
Les missionnaires se répartissent comme suit :
SE membre permanent :
- Le Secrétaire Exécutif
- L’Assistant technique Forestier
- Le Gestionnaire Administratif et Comptable

SE non permanent :
- Secrétaire administratif
- Chauffeur
- Garde de corps

Equipe opérationnelle :
- Equipe du SE COMINT
- Equipe de la Direction du Contrôle Forestier (DCF)
- Equipe du Comité de gestion du stock à recruter sur place :
  - Mètreur
  - Opérateur de saisie
  - Agrafeur
  - Etiqueteur

Equipe procédurale comprenant les entités suivantes :
- BIANCO
- Sécurité
- Autorité locale (Fokontany)
- Société civile
- Membres OMC
- Journalistes

Trois (3) équipes dirigées respectivement par les ingénieurs RAZAFIMAHATRATRA Mahefason (Chef opération 1 = CO1), RAKOTO-PARSON Ranto (Chef opération 2 = CO2), et Madame NOEMIE (Chef opération 3 = CO3) seront basées à Antalaha et, SAMBAVA et Vohémar.

Deux (2) équipes dirigées par Monsieur HUGUES Said Azihar (Chef opération 4 = CO4) et RAMILISON Claude (Chef opération 5 = CO5) seront cantonnées à Analanjirofo (Fénérive-Est ; Mananara Nord et Maroantsetra).

La dernière équipe dirigée par Monsieur RAKOTOSON Henri (Chef opération 6 = CO6) sera basée à Toamasina.
L’équipe SAVA reste sur place pendant 75 jours et descendront vers Vatovavy Fitovinany Anosy sur les 25 jours restants.
Les équipes d’Analanjirofo et Atsinanana resteront sur place pendant 100 jours pour terminer leur mission.

V/ - FORMATION
Les formations des agents régionaux au niveau de chaque chef-lieu de région dureront deux (2) jours. Elles comprennent la méthodologie de mensuration, la méthodologie de remplissage de PV, la méthodologie de scellage et d’étiquetage et l’envoi périodique des rapports au centre de coordination des données (rapport verbal tous les jours et rapport des travaux hebdomadaires tous les samedis après-midi par voie électronique).

V/ - COMMUNICATION
Il s’agit de faire des contacts précisant la mission de l’équipe SE COMINT aux entités suivantes :

- Autorité administrative
- Autorité sécurité (OMC)
- Opérateurs en BDR
- Le mass-média régional et national
- Société civile.

Les thèmes suivants seront à développer :

- La mission ne dure que 100 jours
- Après cet inventaire, et ces marquages, tous les BDR non déclarés et non inventoriés seront saisis au profit de l’État
- L’inventaire se fera dans un climat total d’apaisement socio-économique nécessitant des autorisations d’accès de la part des opérateurs.
- Les recommandations de la CITES identifiées dans le business plan
- Pour pouvoir vendre partiellement les BDR, la condition sine-qua-non est la réalisation des inventaires
- Seul, l’État peut accéder à la vente des BDR et BE inventoriés.

VII/ - REPARTITION MATERIELS :
Pour que la mission se déroule convenablement, les matériels ci-après sont à préconiser :

- Moyen locomotion (voiture, bateau, avion)
- Matériels techniques (compas, galva, peinture, GPS, étiquette)
- Matériels informatiques (ordinateur, panneau solaire, caméra, tablette performante)
- Matériels communication (modem, téléphone)

### VIII/ - CALENDRIER DES ACTIVITÉS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGIONS</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>70</th>
<th>80</th>
<th>100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TRAJECT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAVA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(CO1+CO2+CO3)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FORMATI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTIVIT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGIONS</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>70</th>
<th>80</th>
<th>100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TRAJECT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATS/ANLJ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(CO4+CO5+CO6)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FORMATI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTIVIT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGIONS</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>20</th>
<th>40</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>70</th>
<th>80</th>
<th>100</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TRAJECT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTV7FV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANOSY</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(CO1+CO2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTIVIT</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>