

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventieth meeting of the Standing Committee
Rosa Khutor, Sochi (Russian Federation), 1-5 October 2018

SUMMARY

FRIDAY 5 OCTOBER
AFTERNOON

4. Credentials

The Standing Committee noted that, at present, 17 of the 18 delegations of the members present at the Standing Committee had provided credentials.

11. Revision and replacement of the CITES Strategic Vision 2008-2020: Report of the working group

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following draft decision:

Directed to Parties

18.AA Parties' Management Authorities are encouraged to communicate with their national Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) focal points to seek to ensure CITES aims are reflected in the outcomes of their domestic processes to develop contributions to the post-2020 biodiversity framework anticipated to be adopted by the Parties to the CBD in 2020.

27. Compliance matters

27.4 National ivory action plans process: Report of the Secretariat

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the amendments to Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) in Annex 3 of document SC70 Doc. 27.4 with Step 5, paragraph b), amended as in document SC70 Com. 2.

27.3 Application of Article XIII

27.3.5 Application of Article XIII in Nigeria

The Standing Committee adopted the recommendations in paragraph 52 subparagraphs b), d), e), f), g), h), i), j), k), l), n), o) and q) in document SC70 Doc. 27.3.5 and the recommendations a), c), m) and p) in document SC70 Com. 6 as follows:

1. *Regarding management of trade in specimens of Pterocarpus erinaceus*

- a) Parties shall suspend commercial trade in specimens of the species *Pterocarpus erinaceus* from Nigeria until the Party makes scientifically based non-detriment findings for trade in the species in the country to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and the Chair of the Plants Committee.

- b) The Standing Committee encouraged all importing Parties to inform the Secretariat about the volumes of timber of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* imported from Nigeria since the entry into force of the Appendix II listing.
- c) The Standing Committee invited the importing Parties to share with the Secretariat the administrative, legislative and enforcement arrangements put in place to ensure that trade in specimens of this species only takes place when Parties are satisfied that it is in line with the requirements of the Convention, including any relevant stricter domestic measure to verify legality and ensure sustainability; and encouraged those Parties to consider inviting the Secretariat to conduct technical missions in order to strengthen cooperation between range States and importing countries and identify further recommendations to ensure that timber trade is conducted in accordance with the Convention.
- d) The Standing Committee requested the Plants Committee to consider the inclusion of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* from all range States in the Review of Significant Trade and report its findings and recommendations to the 73rd meeting of the Standing Committee (SC73).
- e) Nigeria shall strengthen the CITES Scientific Authorities by building capacity on forestry issues, and allocating sufficient modern resources to undertake population surveys of *Pterocarpus erinaceus* that can be used in the making of the non-detriment findings, on the setting of annual export quotas prior to authorizing trade in specimens of CITES-listed species, and on the enhancement of scientific capacities of the country.

2. *Regarding legislation and law enforcement*

- f) Nigeria shall strengthen the regulatory framework in relation to forestry management, including forestry legislation at the State level, notably to bridge the gaps and close the loopholes that may be generated by the distribution of competences between Federal and State levels.
- g) Nigeria shall consider developing and implementing a strategy to counter corruption linked to illegal wildlife trade at all levels, including anti-bribery policies, and intensify efforts to ensure full implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.6 on *Prohibiting, preventing, detecting and countering corruption, which facilitates activities conducted in violation of the Convention*. The strategy should include recommendations to protect officials responsible for the implementation and enforcement of CITES from undue pressure, obstruction and threats.
- h) Nigeria shall assess relevant authorities' law enforcement capacity, their mandates and needs to strengthen the control of trade in CITES-listed species and the fight against transnational organized wildlife crime. Based on the assessment, Nigeria shall build capacity among law enforcement agencies to strengthen CITES controls, using risk-based management approaches, in particular container controls at seaports, as well as control of mailed parcels and of air cargo; combat transnational organized wildlife crime by strengthening criminal intelligence, exchange of intelligence, controlled delivery, wildlife crime investigation and prosecution, and financial investigations linked to wildlife crime.
- i) Nigeria shall establish a national platform for enforcement cooperation and coordination between relevant authorities with the aim to strengthen the control of trade in CITES-listed species and to combat transnational organized wildlife crime, in line with paragraphs 9 a) and b) and Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP17) on *Compliance and enforcement*.
- j) Nigeria shall scale up efforts to conduct analyses of available information to map out organized crime groups active in the country and convene multi-disciplinary investigative teams involving all relevant authorities, to work in close collaboration with local authorities in key identified areas, and initiate intelligence-driven operations and investigations, with a particular focus on pangolins and ivory.

3. *Regarding issuance of export permits and information systems*

- k) Nigeria shall establish an efficient information system, preferably an electronic system resources permitting, to facilitate the issuance of permits and certificates and the verification of the legal acquisition of specimens in trade (verification of legal acquisition), while making the manipulation of CITES permits and certificates after issuance more difficult.
- l) Nigeria shall facilitate liaison and integration with other permitting/certification systems relating to the harvest of and trade in CITES-listed resources, e.g. timber concession authorizations, phytosanitary/veterinary documentation, or customs declarations.
- m) Nigeria shall ensure that export permits and re-export certificates be endorsed, with quantity, signature and stamp, by an inspecting official, such as wood grading and inspectorate unit, instead of the CITES Management Authority, in the export endorsement block of the document.

4. *Handling and disposal of seized stockpiles*

- n) Nigeria shall ensure that adequate control measures are put in place to secure storage facilities for seized stocks of CITES-listed species, notably pangolins and ivory, and reduce the risk of leakage. In order to ensure strict application of these measures, Nigeria shall develop a uniform protocol for the marking, recording, handling, storage and disposal of seized and confiscated specimens.
- o) Nigeria shall maintain an inventory of all seized stocks of CITES listed species and ensure strict implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.8 on *Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species*.
- p) The Standing Committee recommended that Nigeria report to the Secretariat on progress made on the implementation of recommendations e) through o) by 31 December 2019, in order for the Secretariat to convey this report and its comments, as well as recommended follow-up measures in case of continued non-compliance, to the 73rd meeting of the Standing Committee.
- q) The Standing Committee invited Parties, ICCWC partners and donors to provide financial, technical and logistical support to Nigeria to support the implementations of the above recommendations of the Standing Committee.

27.5 Malagasy ebonies (*Diospyros* spp.) and palisanders and rosewoods (*Dalbergia* spp.)

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 14 with the deletion of the text in square brackets for paragraph f) of Decision 18.BB as follows:

Regarding the business plan

- a) The Standing Committee recognized that the revised Business Plan submitted by Madagascar in Annex 3 of document SC70 Doc. 27.5.2 presents substantial improvements. While the plan in its current form needs further strengthening and revision and thus cannot be approved at this stage, Madagascar is encouraged to implement steps 1 and 2 of phase 1 of the business plan and proceed with the inventory of declared stockpiles.
- b) Regarding the *Governance Structure of the Stockpile Audit Mechanism and Business Plan*, and in order to ensure transparency, and effective and independent oversight, the Standing Committee recommended Madagascar to:
 - i) consider the function of an independent observer, to be funded from external sources;
 - ii) strengthen the oversight mechanism for both the financing of the plan and the allocation of revenues; and

- iii) establish a monitoring system to assess possible impacts of any sales on illegal logging and timber trafficking, with the support of relevant partners.
- c) Regarding Phase 1, the Standing Committee recommended that:
- i) For Steps 1 and 2: Madagascar is encouraged to implement the inventory and secure the funding required with the support of external donors; and
 - ii) For Steps 3 and 4: Madagascar, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, should explore alternatives to the current proposed compensation schemes to take official control of the wood, in compliance with national legislation and relevant legal procedures in place, and ensure that there will be no financial benefit to those involved in illegal activity. The relevant sections of the use plan should be amended accordingly.
- d) Regarding Phase 2, the Standing Committee recommended that:
- Concerning the allocation of potential revenues, Madagascar be encouraged to explore alternatives regarding the allocation of these revenues in order to make them more conservation friendly. This could include establishing an independent trust fund (pending approval by the Ministry of Finance and Budget).
- e) Taking into consideration the above, Madagascar is encouraged to ensure that the new version of the business plan reflects the proposed comments and advice, and be edited for clarity and consistency, with support of partners and the Secretariat.

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following draft decisions to replace Decisions 17.203 to 17.208:

Directed to Parties and other relevant partners

- 18.AA Parties and relevant partners, such as the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO), the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and other intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, are invited to:
- a) enforce all measures that are recommended by the CITES Standing Committee concerning commercial trade in specimens of Malagasy *Diospyros* spp. and *Dalbergia* spp. from Madagascar;
 - b) as appropriate, collaborate with Madagascar in the implementation of the agreed parts (inventories, i.e. steps 1 and 2 of Phase 1) of the use plan to manage timber stockpiles of specimens of these species from Madagascar; and
 - c) provide technical and financial assistance to support the implementation of Decisions 18.BB to 18.EE.

Directed to Madagascar

- 18.BB Madagascar shall:
- a) continue to identify the main commercially valuable species in the genera *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar, in cooperation with the Secretariat and relevant partners, such as the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO), the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and other intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations;
 - b) continue to make progress in the development of non-detriment findings for commercially valuable species in the genera *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros*, including implementation of appropriate monitoring mechanisms, and report on progress to future meetings of the Plants Committee;

- c) for those species identified under paragraph a) establish, in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, a precautionary export quota based upon a scientifically robust non-detriment finding;
- d) continue the production of identification materials for timber and timber products of species of the genera *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar;
- e) for those species identified under paragraph a), strengthen control and enforcement measures against illegal logging and export at the national level including seizures, investigations, arrests, prosecutions, and sanctions;
- ~~f) implement the use plan for managing stockpiles of species of *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar in Annex 3 of document SC70 Doc. 27.5.1; and~~
- f) submit regular updates on audited inventories of at least a third of the stockpiles of species of *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* from Madagascar, and submit a modified use plan for consideration, approval and further guidance from the Standing Committee; and
- g) provide reports on progress with the implementation of paragraphs a) to d) of this Decision to the Plants Committee; and on progress with the implementation of paragraphs e) and f) of this Decision to the Standing Committee.

Directed to the Plants Committee

18.CC The Plants Committee shall:

- a) review reports from Madagascar and the Secretariat as appropriate on the implementation of Decisions 18.BB and 18.EE, and provide recommendations to the Standing Committee and the Secretariat; and
- b) provide assistance to Madagascar with the implementation of paragraphs a) to d) of Decision 18.BB.

Directed to the Standing Committee

18.DD The Standing Committee shall review reports from Madagascar and the Secretariat on the implementation of Decisions 18.BB and 18.EE, and make recommendations to Madagascar, relevant Parties and the Secretariat as appropriate, and take compliance measures in accordance with Resolution Conf. 14.3 on CITES compliance procedures if Madagascar fails to satisfactorily implement the actions directed to it in Decision 18.BB.

Directed to the Secretariat

18.EE The Secretariat shall:

- a) assist Madagascar, relevant Parties, and the Standing and Plants Committees in the implementation of Decisions 18.AA to 18.DD;
- b) subject to external funding, assist with relevant capacity-building activities in Madagascar and transit and destination countries concerned by the trade in specimens of *Diospyros* spp. and *Dalbergia* spp. from Madagascar, including activities related to ~~the implementation of the use plan to manage timber stockpiles of specimens of these species from Madagascar in Annex 3 of document SC70 Doc. 27.5.1; Decision 18.AA;~~ and
- c) provide reports on progress with the implementation of this Decision to the Plants Committee and the Standing Committee, as appropriate.

27.1 Guidance for verifying the legal acquisition of CITES specimens to be exported

The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the Conference of the Parties the draft resolution on *Verification of legal acquisition of specimens* in document SC70 Com. 16 with the following amendments

to paragraph 4 and paragraph 2 b) in Annex 1, noting that the Secretariat, in consultation with the Chair of the Standing Committee, would review the text of the draft resolution for editorial issues.

4. *RECOMMENDS that ~~cooperation between~~ Management Authorities of Parties be guided by the recommendations in Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP 17) on Compliance and enforcement paragraph 2 e), including with respect to specimens of Appendix-I species, and Resolution 12.3 (Rev. CoP17) on Permits and certificates paragraph 5 i) and paragraph 22 k) to m), following principles:*

Annex 1

- b) *~~Where a Management Authority is required to~~ To verify legal acquisition, if the Management Authority ~~first~~ should first review all the documentary and other evidence presented by the applicant. The ~~evidence and~~ documentation should, to the extent practicable, provide information on the entire chain of custody back to the source of the specimen. Such information may include records demonstrating that the specimen or parental stock was removed from the wild in accordance with relevant laws (licenses, collections permits, etc.) records identifying the specific specimen (band numbers or other marks, etc.) and documenting the history of transfers of ownership (sales, receipts, invoices, etc.), and records showing that the specimen was reared at a particular facility, for example. Where a Management Authority considers that the evidence is incomplete, it should provide the applicant with an opportunity to produce additional information evidence.*

45. European eels (*Anguilla anguilla*)

The Standing Committee adopted the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 1 amended as follows:

1. Range States, along with aquaculture, transit and consumer Parties are encouraged to build on the successes of existing enforcement efforts through cross-border as well as cross-agency collaboration and sharing of intelligence.
2. All range States' management, scientific and enforcement authorities are encouraged to participate in ongoing and future *Anguilla anguilla* initiatives and/or anti-smuggling operations, as appropriate.
3. Law enforcement agencies in range States, along with aquaculture, transit and consumer Parties should strengthen regional initiatives with a view to planning targeted operations focusing on anguillid eels.
4. Parties are encouraged to monitor aquaculture facilities and points of sales to ensure illegally traded European eels are not being mis-represented as legal.
5. Parties should inform the countries of origin, transit and/or destination of all seizures of *Anguilla anguilla* in a timely manner.
6. Parties should include seizure data for *Anguilla anguilla* in their CITES annual illegal trade reports.
7. Law enforcement agencies are encouraged to report all *Anguilla anguilla* seizures using the INTERPOL Ecomessage system.
8. Law enforcement authorities should provide Management Authorities as many details as possible such as the life stage (i.e. fingerling, adult), meat, gross / net weight, and other pertinent information for CITES reporting purposes, including the CITES annual illegal trade reports.
9. When disposing of seized live eels, Parties are encouraged to consider the potential risks and benefits before returning any specimens to the wild.
10. Parties are encouraged to carry out appropriate sampling (DNA or other) for seizures of suspected *Anguilla anguilla* – live or dead – to an acceptable standard for use in prosecution.
11. Parties and other stakeholders (academia, industry, NGOs etc.) are encouraged to develop new rapid identification processes that are accurate, credible and inexpensive.

12. Range States, along with aquaculture, transit and consumer Parties are encouraged to explore the development of a standard reporting system throughout the value chain from the point of catch to the final point of sale, in order to track legal trade for European eel.

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following draft decisions:

Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall consider information relating to illegal trade in European eel at its 73rd and 74th meetings, including the UNODC case study on European eel trafficking as part of the 2nd Wildlife Crime Report, and make recommendations as appropriate.

Directed to the Animals Committee

The Animals Committee at its 31st and 32nd meetings shall review available information relating to the potential risks and benefits of reintroducing seized, live eels to the wild and if appropriate provide advice on suitable protocols taking into account existing guidance and practices, for consideration at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

32. Disposal of confiscated specimens

The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the Conference of the Parties the draft decisions in document SC70 Com. 3 as follows:

Draft decision 18.AA directed to the Secretariat

The Secretariat shall collect information on existing networks and resources on the management of seized and confiscated live animals and make it available to Parties.

Draft decision 18.BB directed to Parties

Parties are encouraged to make use of the information collected by the Secretariat under Decision AA, including in capacity-building activities.

35. Purpose codes on CITES permits and certificates

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP17) and the renewal of Decision 14.54 (Rev. CoP17) as amended in document SC70 Com. 4.

33. Specimens produced from synthetic or cultured DNA

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in paragraph 4 of document SC70 Com. 5 amended as follows:

Specimens produced through biotechnology

Directed to the Parties

18.AA Parties are invited to provide information to the Secretariat regarding:

- a) cases where they have issued, or received requests to issue, CITES permits and certificates for specimens produced through biotechnology;
- b) other situations when they have applied the interpretation of Resolution Conf. 9.6 (Rev. CoP16) on Trade in readily recognizable parts and derivatives to fauna and flora products produced through biotechnology; and
- c) technological developments and applications taking place, particularly in their jurisdiction, that may result in the manufacture of specimens produced through biotechnology that may have impact on the interpretation and implementation of the Convention.

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

18.BB The Animals and Plants Committees shall:

- a) review the complete study on “Wildlife products produced from synthetic or cultured DNA”, and make recommendations for consideration by the Standing Committee, including appropriate revisions to existing resolutions; and
- b) provide any relevant scientific advice and guidance on matters relevant to international trade in specimens produced through biotechnology and communicate it to the Standing Committee, as appropriate.

Directed to the Standing Committee

18.CC The Standing Committees shall:

- a) discuss how to apply the term “readily recognizable part or derivative” to trade in products of biotechnology, which might potentially affect international trade in CITES-listed specimens in a way that would threaten their survival;
- b) communicate to the Animals and Plants Committees any matters that may require scientific advice and guidance, as appropriate; and
- c) make recommendations for consideration at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, including appropriate revisions to existing resolutions or the development of a new resolution on trade in specimens produced from biotechnology.

Directed to the Secretariat

18.DD The Secretariat shall:

- a) present the study on “Wildlife products produced from synthetic or cultured DNA”, along with the Secretariat’s findings and recommendations, to the Animals and Plants Committees;
- b) collate information received from Parties in relation to Decision 18.AA, as well as any other information received from Parties, governmental, intergovernmental and nongovernmental organizations and other entities related to the issue of specimens produced through biotechnology;
- c) communicate with the Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD), the United Nations Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO), the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) and other relevant organizations as appropriate, to keep abreast of the discussions taking place on other fora on issues that may be relevant to specimens produced through biotechnology; and
- d) report progress to the Animals and Plants Committees, and the Standing Committee, as appropriate.

51. Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 7 as follows:

The Standing Committee noted the report in Annex 4 of document SC70 Doc. 51, and:

- i) invited Parties that did not yet provide input to the report, to provide such input to the Secretariat;
- ii) invited Parties to point out any inaccuracies in the report for correction by the Secretariat;
- iii) invited Parties to submit any new relevant information to the Secretariat;
- iv) requested all Parties to provide the information requested in a) i) to iii) above to the Secretariat by 16 November 2018; and

- iv) requested the Secretariat, to present the updated and revised report to CoP18, and on the basis of the report and any additional information, to prepare draft decisions for consideration by CoP18.

The Standing Committee encouraged all Parties, in particular Parties affected by illegal trade in Asian big cat specimens, to draw upon the best practices and challenges contained in the review on the implementation of Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP17), presented in Annex 4 to document SC70 Doc. 51, and any future updated and revised iteration of the report, to:

- i) inform their decision-making when they develop appropriate law enforcement responses to address illegal trade in Asian big cat specimens, in particular taking note of the information concerning crime trends and illegal trade routes in the review; and
- ii) take note of the best practices highlighted in the review and consider how these may be applied to their own circumstances to further strengthen measures and activities implemented to address illegal trade in Asian big cats;

The Standing Committee requested Parties to take note of the concerns regarding illegal trade in leopard parts and derivatives as outlined in Annex 4 to document SC70 Doc. 51, as well as any future updated and revised iteration of the report, and any additional information, and to take this into account when developing work programmes and undertaking law enforcement operations.

10. Arrangements for the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP18)

10.4 Review of the Rules of Procedure of the Conference of the Parties

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 8 as follows:

The Standing Committee reviewed the Rules of Procedure of the Conference of the Parties pursuant to Decision 17.1 and, after discussion, could not agree on any amendments to the Rules as adopted by the Conference of the Parties at its 17th meeting.

In the course of its discussions, the Standing Committee recognized that further discussion of Rule 25 would be merited and therefore agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following draft decision:

Directed to the Standing Committee

- 18.AA With the support of the Secretariat, the Standing Committee shall review Rule 25 of the Rules of Procedure of the Conference of the Parties and propose amendments, as appropriate, to the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties with the view to ensuring the effective conduct of meetings.

12. Review of Resolution Conf. 11.1 (Rev. CoP17)

The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the Conference of the Parties the draft decisions and the draft new resolution on *Establishment of Committees* in document SC70 Com. 9 and requested the Secretariat, in consultation with the Chair of the Standing Committee, to review the text of the draft resolution for editorial issues.

56. Rhinoceroses (Rhinocerotidae spp.)

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 10 as follows:

- a) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat in its formulation of draft decisions for consideration at the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties in accordance with paragraph 9 c) of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17), to take into consideration the summary of the working group on *Rhinoceros* as presented in document SC70 Doc. 56.
- b) The Standing Committee encouraged Parties concerned to submit additional information, if any, on the matters outlined in the summary of the working group on *Rhinoceros* in document SC70 Doc. 56 to the Secretariat by 30 November 2018 so that such information can be included in the report from the Secretariat to the Conference of the Parties as appropriate.

- c) The Standing Committee urged Parties to:
- i) pursue strengthening their implementation of the provisions of paragraph 1 e), f) and g) of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17), and to actively pursue use of the *Form for collection and sharing of data on rhinoceros horn seizures and on samples for forensic analysis* provided in the Annex to Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17); and
 - ii) bring to the attention of the Secretariat any difficulties that may be experienced in sharing information and/or samples or in the use of the form, to facilitate consideration of any changes that may be needed to further enhance the gathering and sharing of these.
- d) The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties at its 18th meeting the following draft decision:

Directed to the Secretariat

- 18.AA The Secretariat shall, in consultation with interested Parties and the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC, explore options to reflect on challenges and best practices to assist in addressing rhinoceros poaching and rhinoceros horn trafficking in the Group's report prepared for the Conference of the Parties in accordance with paragraph 7 of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) and prepare recommendations for consideration by the Standing Committee.

Directed to the Standing Committee

- 18.BB The Standing Committee shall review the recommendations of the Secretariat reported under Decision 18.AA, and prepare proposals for consideration of the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

The Standing Committee further agreed the following recommendations in paragraphs 93 through 96 of document SC70 Doc. 56:

Directed to Parties:

- a) Parties are encouraged to make every effort to effectively implement Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP17) in particular to implement national strategies and proposed actions effectively to increase the effectiveness of the law-enforcement response to rhinoceros poaching and rhinoceros horn trafficking.
- b) Parties are encouraged to report any seizures of rhinoceros horn and related information in their annual illegal trade reports mandated under Resolution Conf. 11.17 (rev CoP17).
- c) Parties are encouraged to work with enforcers, prosecutors and judiciaries in their own countries to raise awareness of the impacts of illegal wildlife trade and the effects this can have on ecosystems and livelihoods so that penalties for offences are issued at a level which reflects the severity of the crime.

Directed to Parties identified as or recommended to be included as Countries for Priority Attention in CoP17 Doc.68 Annex 5, '*African and Asian Rhinoceroses – Status, Conservation and Trade*':

- a) Parties are encouraged to prioritize investigations into the transnational criminal syndicates driving the illegal rhinoceros horn trade over seizures and arrests of low-level criminals.
- b) Parties are encouraged to continue to collaborate and share information that could aid in successful prosecutions, including providing samples of seized rhinoceros horn to source countries for forensic analysis where applicable.

Directed to rhinoceros range states:

- Parties which are rhinoceros range states are encouraged to continuously review poaching and trafficking trends, to ensure that the measures they implement to prevent and combat rhinoceros poaching and rhinoceros horn trafficking remain effective and responsive to any newly identified

trends. Records should be kept so that they can be used to inform progress against implementation of the Resolution (Decision 17.134 refers).

Directed to Parties where illegal markets for rhino horn exist:

- Parties in which illegal markets for rhinoceros horn exist are encouraged to develop demand reduction programmes targeted at key identified audiences, taking into consideration the provisions within Resolution. Conf. 17.4, and taking advantage of the experience and expertise developed in other jurisdictions and by other organisations.

15. Engagement of rural communities in the CITES processes

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 11 as follows:

The Standing Committee noted the report of the intersessional working group on rural communities established by the Standing Committee as instructed in Decision 17.28 (document SC70 Doc. 15), in particular the lack of consensus on the recommendations. The Conference of the Parties, at its 18th meeting, may consider whether to extend the mandate of the working group on how to engage rural communities in CITES processes and report to the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting.

31. Trade in specimens bred in captivity or artificially propagated

31.1 Review of ambiguities and inconsistencies in the application of Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5, and related resolutions

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 12 as follows:

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties at its 18th meeting the draft decisions below in order to advance the work reflected in document SC70 Doc. 31.1. The Standing Committee agreed to consider establishing at its 72nd meeting an intersessional working group to carry out the draft decision directed to the Standing Committee, if adopted, so that work may begin as soon as possible following CoP18. As stated in document SC70 Doc. 31.1, the Secretariat will update the review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source, in Annex 7 to document SC70 Doc. 31.1, for consideration by Parties at CoP18.

18.AA Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

The Animals Committee, at AC31, and the Plants Committee, at PC25, shall consider the Secretariat's update of the review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source in Annex 7 of document SC70 Doc. 31.1, identify the key scientific issues and challenges in the application of the Convention to non-wild specimens, and provide their recommendations to address these issues and challenges to the Standing Committee in time for SC73.

18.BB Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall:

- a) consider at SC73 the Secretariat's update of the review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source in Annex 7 of document SC70 Doc. 31.1; the underlying CITES policy assumptions that may have contributed to the uneven application of Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5; the Secretariat's recommendations in the Annexes to SC70 Doc. 31.1; and the recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees under Decision 18.AA; and
- b) review the key issues and challenges in the application of the Convention to non-wild specimens and make appropriate recommendations, including amendments to existing Resolutions or development of a new Resolution or Decisions, to address these issues and challenges for consideration at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

Report of the Finance and Budget Subcommittee (FBSC)

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 13 amended as follows:

Agenda item 6: Financial matters

- a) The Standing Committee approved the reports on the costed programme of work for the full year of 2017 and for 2018 for the period up to 30 June 2018.
- b) The Standing Committee noted the projected overspending in 2017 and 2018 related to conference logistics and security costs at governing and scientific body meetings organized in Geneva, which should be offset with appropriate budget saving efforts by the Secretariat.
- c) The Standing Committee approved the amended Terms of Reference for the Finance and Budget Subcommittee as presented in Annex 9 to document SC70 Doc. 6.
- d) The Standing Committee noted the accumulating unpaid contributions by Parties listed in Annex 5 of document SC70 Doc. 6 which hinders effective execution of the budget by the Secretariat, and requested these Parties to resolve any outstanding unpaid contributions as soon as possible, taking into account the reminders sent by the Secretariat.

Agenda item 7: Report on proposed budget scenarios for 2020-2022

- a) The Standing Committee noted the report in document SC70 Doc. 7.
- b) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to take into account feedback received and outcomes from the 70th meeting of the Standing Committee in preparation of the proposed budget scenarios for the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

Agenda item 9.1: Administrative matters including host country arrangements for the Secretariat

- a) The Standing Committee noted document SC70 Doc. 9.1.
- b) The Standing Committee welcomed the Convention Support contribution from the Government of Switzerland announced at the 70th meeting at Standing Committee for the years 2019-2022 in the total amount of CHF 4 million and requested the Secretariat to ensure that the additional funds are available to be used for the implementation of the programme of work based on Parties priorities and to report on the usage of the funds to the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, subsequent meetings of the Standing Committee, and the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
- b) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to work with the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) to get clarity on the programme support cost allocations and UNEP's recently introduced Secretariat Services to Multilateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs), and determine whether this is consistent and in full compliance with the existing Memorandum of Understanding between the CITES Standing Committee and the Executive Director of UNEP and, if inconsistencies are found, to suggest possible solutions in consultation with UNEP and the Chair of the Standing Committee for consideration by the Conference of the Parties.
- c) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to get clarity from UNEP regarding the possibility of getting a more detailed audit of CITES financial statements separate from those already included within the UNEP's, and any associated costs, and report on the results to the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.
- d) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat, as a means to further enhance efforts to foster transparency and accountability, establish a section on the Convention website to publish information relevant to the governance of the Convention, including inter alia; completed and accepted audit reports; applicable financial rules and regulations; materials related to staff code of conduct and professional ethics; delegation of authorities; Memorandum of Understanding between the CITES Standing Committee and the Executive Director of UNEP; conflict of interest policy; and any other relevant information.

Agenda item 9.2: Administrative hosting models for the Secretariat

- a) The Standing Committee noted the oral report in plenary by the Secretariat.
- b) The Standing Committee requested the FBSC to continue the work on exploring the potential costs and benefits of alternative administrative hosting arrangements for the CITES Secretariat, on an inter-sessional basis, in line with the terms of reference given at the 69th meeting of Standing Committee.
- c) The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to continue its efforts to get costing details from UNEP for indirect and direct services, for review by FBSC, including as appropriate, information received through tasks undertaken in fulfilment of agenda item 9.1, and compare costs for services between different service providers which will form the basis for the costing analysis to be presented at the 18th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

49. Elephants (Elephantidae spp.)

49.3 Terms of reference for a review of the ETIS programme

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations in document SC70 Com. 15 as follows:

The Standing Committee adopted the Terms of Reference for a review of the ETIS programme in the Annex to document SC70 Com. 15.

The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to:

- i) subject to external funding, appoint a group of independent experts to carry out the review of the ETIS programme under the oversight of the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup and a nominated member of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group; and
- ii) issue a Notification to Parties requesting Parties to submit written observations on the ETIS methodology to be considered in the review process to the Secretariat by 28 February 2019; and to provide financial support for the review of the ETIS programme.

The Standing Committee further requested the Secretariat to prepare a document on this matter for consideration at CoP18, which could include draft decisions on the conduct and delivery of the review, depending on advancements made.

67. Annotations

67.1 Report of the working group

The Standing Committee agreed the recommendations of document SC70 Com. 17 amended as follows:

The Standing Committee recommended the following approach for the revision of the existing Annotation #15:

All parts and derivatives, except:

- a) *Leaves, flowers, pollen, fruits, and seeds;*
- b) *Finished products to a maximum weight of wood of the listed species of 500g per item;*
- c) *Finished musical instruments, finished musical instrument parts and finished musical instrument accessories.*

The Standing Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following revisions to Decision 16.168 and the following new draft decisions:

Decision 18.XX

Directed to the Standing Committee, Animals Committee, Plants Committee

The Standing Committee shall re-establish the working group on annotations, in close collaboration with the Animals and Plants Committees, recognizing that the Animals and Plants Committees are an important source of expertise and advice to Parties on such scientific and technical issues. The group shall include, but not be limited to, members from the Standing Committee, Animals Committee, Plants Committee, observer Parties, CITES Management and Scientific Authorities, enforcement authorities, including customs, and industry representatives. The Standing Committee shall particularly endeavour to ensure balanced representation of importing and exporting Parties. The terms of reference for the working group shall be:

- ~~a) to further consider procedures for crafting annotations and develop recommendations for improving them;~~
- ~~b) to evaluate and address issues related to the drafting, interpretation and implementation of annotations, and assist Parties in drafting future annotations, drawing on appropriate expertise from within and outside its membership;~~
- ~~c) to conduct any relevant additional work on evaluating the existing annotations for plant taxa listed in Appendices II and III, with an emphasis on ensuring that such annotations are clear as to the types of specimens to be covered by a listing, can be readily implemented, and focus on those parts and derivatives primarily exported from the range States and those commodities that dominate the trade in and demand for the wild resource;~~
- ~~d) based on the results of the timber trade study directed to the Secretariat in Decision 15.35 (Rev. CoP16), AND to review existing annotations for tree species and, if appropriate, draft amendments to those annotations and prepare clear definitions for the terms used in the annotations in order to facilitate their use and understanding by CITES authorities, enforcement officers, exporters and importers;~~
- ea) in close collaboration with ongoing efforts in the Plants Committee, to continue reviewing the appropriateness and practical implementation of the annotation(s) of the agarwood-producing taxa (*Aquilaria* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp.), taking into consideration the previous work done by the range and consumer States of these species;
- fb) to review outstanding implementation challenges resulting from the listings of *Aniba rosaeodora* and *Bulnesia sarmientoi* in the Appendices, particularly concerning trade in extracts, and propose appropriate solutions;
- c) to review, in close cooperation with the Standing Committee, the implementation challenges linked to the orchids annotations;
- gd) to draft definitions of terms included in annotations, in cases where the terms are not easily understood or where there has been difficulty in implementing the listing as a result of confusion about what commodities are covered, and submit them to the Standing Committee for adoption by the Conference of the Parties and subsequent inclusion in the Interpretation section of the Appendices;
- e) consider ~~and~~ the preparation of clear definitions for terms used in the annotations, including, for example, the terms “musical instruments” and “transformed wood”, in order to facilitate their use and understanding by CITES authorities, enforcement officers, exporters and importers;
- hf) to conduct any work related to annotations directed to it by the Conference of the Parties, the Standing, Animals or Plants Committee; and
- lg) to prepare reports on progress made in addressing the issues tasked to it and submit them for consideration at the ~~69~~ 73th and ~~70~~ 74th meetings of the Standing Committee.

Draft decision 18.AA

Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall, in collaboration with the Animals and Plants Committees, determine requirements for development and adoption by the Conference of the Parties of:

- a) a mechanism for undertaking a periodic review of existing annotations; and
- b) a mechanism for the a priori review of annotations proposed for consideration at meetings of the Conference of the Parties, to support consistent implementation of the guidance on annotations provided in Resolution Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP17).

Draft decision 18.BB

Directed to the Standing Committee

The Standing Committee shall explore the feasibility of, and the requirements for developing an information system for the purpose of processing trade data associated with transactions in specimens of CITES-listed tree species authorized under the provisions of the Convention.

49. Elephants (Elephantidae spp.)

49.1 Elephant conservation, illegal killing and ivory trade

Report of the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup

The Standing Committee noted the report and agreed the recommendations in paragraphs 2, 9 and 11 of document SC70 Com. 18 as follows:

The Standing Committee adopted the following amendment to section c) of the Terms of Reference of the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup to give effect to the clarification provided at its 61st meeting relating to attendance of the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup meetings.

Modus operandi

- c) *Meetings of the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup are open to members of the ETIS and MIKE Technical Advisory Groups, Party representatives, representatives of the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Elephant Specialist Groups, and any other observers as agreed to by the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup.*

The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat, together with TRAFFIC, to prepare an annex of the comments received from Parties on the ETIS report and circulate it as part of the document to be considered by the Parties at CoP18; and capture in the document whether comments were received and where possible, respond to issues raised by Parties.

The Standing Committee requested TRAFFIC to compile aggregated summaries of the validated ETIS data on an annual basis for presentation on the CITES website. Parties should continue to be involved in the validation of ETIS data.

The Standing Committee invited donors to make funding available to support the monitoring systems (MIKE and ETIS) established in terms of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17).

The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to develop a proposal for consideration by the 73rd meeting of the Standing Committee on possible approaches to be explored to address the financial and operational sustainability of the MIKE and ETIS programmes.

Adoption of Executive Summaries

The executive summary of the fourth session in document SC70 Sum. 4 was adopted with the following amendments:

- Under agenda item 31.3, in the third paragraph, fifth line, replace the word “decided” with “posed”.

The Committee agreed that outstanding Executive Summaries would be adopted using the procedure provided for in Rule 19 of the Rules of Procedure.

69. Reports of regional representatives

69.1 Africa

69.2 Asia

69.3 Central and South America and the Caribbean

69.4 Europe

69.5 North America

and

69.6 Oceania

The Standing Committee noted all of the reports received from regional representatives.

70. Any other business

There was no decision taken by the Standing Committee.

71. Determination of the time and venue of the 71st and 72nd meetings

The Standing Committee noted that its 71st meeting would take place in Colombo, Sri Lanka, on 22 May 2019, and that its 72nd meeting would be held immediately after the close of CoP18, on 3 June 2019.

72. Closing remarks

Following the remarks by members of the Committee, observers representing Parties and intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and the Officer-in-Charge, the Chair thanked the Russian Federation for its warm welcome, all participants for their cooperation and thanked the Secretariat, the interpreters and the Russian volunteers for their work, and closed the meeting at 17h45.