

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventieth meeting of the Standing Committee
Rosa Khutor, Sochi (Russian Federation), 1-5 October 2018

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR THE REVIEW OF THE ETIS PROGRAMME

Recommendations

The MIKE and ETIS Subgroup recommends that the Standing Committee:

- a) adopts the Terms of Reference for a review of the ETIS program in Annex 1 to the present document;
- b) request the Secretariat to:
 - i) subject to external funding appoint a group of independent experts to carry out the review of the ETIS program under the oversight of the MIKE and ETIS subgroup and a nominated member of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group; and
 - ii) issue a Notification to Parties requesting Parties to:
 - A. submit written observations on the ETIS methodology to be considered in the review process to the Secretariat by 28 February 2019; and
 - B. provide financial support for the review of the ETIS program; and
- c) request the Secretariat to prepare a document on this matter for consideration at CoP18, which could include draft decisions on the conduct and delivery of the review, depending on advancements made.

TERMS OF REFERENCE
FOR THE REVIEW OF THE ETIS PROGRAM, INCLUDING OPERATIONS, DATA COLLECTION,
VALIDATION AND MANAGEMENT, ANALYSIS AND TECHNICAL OUTPUTS

Activities

1. Review the provisions in Annex 1 (*Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens*) of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) on *Trade in elephant specimens*, with special reference to sections 2 (*Scope*), 3 (*Methods*), 4 (*Data collection and compilation*) and 5 (*Information, data analysis and interpretation*), to determine:
 - a) whether these provisions and their implementation are adequate to meet the objectives of ETIS, as set out in paragraph 26 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and are sufficiently robust, transparent and scientifically justifiable;
 - b) whether the following processes and methods used by TRAFFIC are adequately described in Annex 1 to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and sufficiently contribute to achieving the objectives of ETIS:
 - data collection
 - data validation
 - data management
 - data analysis and interpretation, including the code (algorithm used for the analysis)
 - data dissemination
 - review ~~process~~ of analysis
 - technical outputs and reports; ~~and~~
 - c) whether there is a need to amend Annex 1 in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) and if so, propose amendments as required; and
 - d) whether the ETIS analysis is able to support CITES processes and decision making such as the National Ivory Action Plan process
2. In undertaking the review indicated above, due consideration should be given to:
 - a) the context within which ETIS was developed and how the ETIS analysis is currently used in CITES processes and decision making;
 - b) the institutional arrangements, operations and ability to meet the objectives of ETIS set out in paragraph 26 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17);
 - c) the issues raised by Parties in relation to the ETIS methodology and analysis (to be provided by the CITES Secretariat);
 - d) the submissions received from Parties concerning the ETIS methodology, in accordance with paragraph 158 v) of document SC69 Doc. 29.3 and submissions received by the Secretariat on or before 28 February 2019 (to be provided by the CITES Secretariat);
 - e) ETIS reports submitted for consideration by the Conference of Parties, including documents CoP17 Doc. 57.6 (Rev. 1) and CoP16 Doc. 53.2.2 (Rev. 1);
 - f) information provided by the MIKE-ETIS Technical Advisory Group relating to the ETIS analysis (including Information documents CoP17 Inf. 67 and SC69 Inf. 22);

- g) Peer-reviewed scientific publications relating to the ETIS analyses, including: Underwood, F.M., Burn, R.W., Milliken, T. (2013). *Dissecting the illegal ivory trade: an analysis of ivory seizures data*. PLoS One 8(10): e76539; and Burn, R.W., Underwood, F.M. (2012). *A new statistical modelling framework to interpret ivory seizures data: A technical report describing the new modelling framework for analysing seizures data from the Elephant Trade Information System*. Mathematics Report series (1/2013), Department of Mathematics and Statistics, University of Reading, UK;
 - h) the existing databases and standard operating procedures used in the ETIS analysis; and
 - i) other relevant scientific literature and studies on the statistical analysis of:
 - i) data relating to illegal trade in elephant specimens; ~~and~~
 - ii) illegal wildlife trade data; and
 - iii) other illicit trade data.
3. In undertaking the review, due consideration should furthermore be given to the institutional arrangements and resources needed to:
- a) implement any proposed recommendations to amend the current ETIS methodology or Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17); and
 - b) adequately meet the objectives of ETIS and ensure its longer-term sustainability.
4. Consult with Parties, TRAFFIC, the statisticians involved in the development of the statistical analysis for ETIS and responsible for the ETIS analysis, the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group members and the Standing Committee. This should include sharing the progress report, preliminary findings and the final report with Parties, TRAFFIC and the statisticians involved in the development of the statistical analysis for ETIS and responsible for the ETIS analysis.

Timeframe

6 months

Deliverables

A report to the Secretariat that includes specific sections on the following:

- a) The key outcomes of the review of the ETIS programme relating to:
 - i) the technical¹ and operational aspects of the analytical framework of the ETIS programme;
 - ii) the institutional arrangements for ETIS, including operations and resources;
 - iii) the provisions contained in Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), with specific reference to sections 2 to 5; ~~and~~
 - iv) whether these provisions and their implementation are adequate to meet the objectives of ETIS, set out in paragraph 26 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17); and
 - v) any other matter identified in the review process that could strengthen the ETIS program.
- b) Recommendations resulting from the review of the ETIS programme, ~~including proposals for amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17),~~ as appropriate.

¹ *Technical aspects include all aspects referred to in paragraph 1 b) of the Terms of Reference as well as other considerations such as socio-economic and governance aspects.*

Competencies / expertise

Key competencies and areas of expertise that are required as a minimum to effectively carry out this review are:

- a) ~~Knowledge of CITES, in particular decisions, processes and discussions relating to elephant conservation, trade in elephant specimens, elephant poaching and illegal trade in ivory [Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17)];~~
- a) Knowledge and understanding of institutional governance, especially in terms of managing sensitive and controversial processes, and balancing the interests of a diversity of stakeholders;
- b) Experience in programme and project evaluation, with a strong focus on institutional strengthening, change and restructuring processes;
- c) Expertise in business process analysis and auditing, especially analysing business processes to improve transparency, and verifying if procedures, practices and controls are adequate;
- d) Expertise in statistical modelling and interpretation, particularly the use of Bayesian hierarchical models, and in reviewing statistical methodology;
- e) Postgraduate qualification in statistics and extensive experience of applying modern statistical methods to produce pragmatic solutions to real world problems;
- f) Experience in managing the collection and processing of data and its flow through a system to provide information to policy makers at national and international level, for example from leasing a government statistics office or from performing statistical audits;
- g) Knowledge of database management and maintenance;
- h) Skills in networking and communications, and experience structuring meaningful engagement with multiple parties, scientists, specialists and stakeholders.

Knowledge of CITES, in particular decisions, processes and discussions relating to elephant conservation, trade in elephant specimens, elephant poaching and illegal trade in ivory [Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17)] will be advantageous.

Members of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group and MIKE and ETIS Subgroup shall not be appointed as independent experts due to the oversight role members will fulfil.