

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventieth meeting of the Standing Committee  
Rosa Khutor, Sochi (Russian Federation), 1-5 October 2018

Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

Trade in specimens bred in captivity or artificially propagated

IMPLEMENTATION OF RESOLUTION CONF. 17.7 ON  
*REVIEW OF TRADE IN ANIMAL SPECIMENS REPORTED AS PRODUCED IN CAPTIVITY:*  
REPORT OF THE SECRETARIAT

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.

Background

2. At its 17th meeting (CoP17, Johannesburg, 2016), the Conference of the Parties adopted a new compliance procedure through Resolution Conf. 17.7 on *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity*. It concerns trade in specimens using the source codes C, D, F or R as defined in paragraph 3 i) of Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP17) on *Permits and certificates*. The Animals Committee, together with the Standing Committee and in cooperation with the Secretariat, is directed to play a key role in the implementation of this Resolution.

Selection of species-country combinations for review and responses from countries

3. At its 29th meeting (AC29, Geneva, July 2017), in accordance with paragraph 2 c) of Resolution Conf. 17.7, the Animals Committee reviewed a summary from the CITES Trade Database of annual report statistics of specimens of species traded between 2011 and 2015 under source codes C, D, F or R. This summary is found in [Annex 1 of document AC29 Doc. 14.1](#). The Committee selected a number of species-country combinations for review under the Resolution (see Table 1 of the present document), taking into account the biology of the species. In making the selection, the Committee was mindful of paragraph 2 e) of the Resolution which refers to the need to “determine if the correct source codes have been used, under the applicable Resolutions, for specimens claimed to be produced in captivity” and of paragraph 2 g), which refers to the need to “determine if trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5”.
4. In accordance with paragraph 2 c) of the Resolution, for each species-country combination selected for review, the Animals Committee drafted general or specific questions to be addressed by the Secretariat to the Parties concerned. Full details of the rationale for the selections and the questions asked of the countries involved can be found in Annex 1 of the present document.
5. On 30 August 2017, the Secretariat notified the countries concerned that certain species produced in captivity in their country had been selected for review as well as providing them with an overview of the review process and an explanation for the selection provided by the Animals Committee. The species-country combinations selected for review by the Committee at AC29 are shown in the Table 1 below together with an indication of whether or not a response was received. The copies of the responses received can be found in [Annex 2 of document AC30 Doc. 13.2 \(Rev. 3\)](#) and its [addendum](#). The Secretariat removed all

personal details concerning the facilities/operations referred to in the replies and the names of inspectors who may have been cited as visiting them.

Table 1. Species-country combinations selected for review at AC29 and responses received from countries which were subsequently reviewed by the Animals Committee at its 30th meeting (AC30, Geneva, July 2018).

	<b>Species</b>	<b>Country</b>	<b>Response received?</b>
1	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Benin	Yes
2	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Cambodia	Yes
3	<i>Tridacna crocea</i>	Federated States of Micronesia	Yes
4	<i>Testudo hermanni</i>	the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	No response received
5	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Ghana	Yes
6	<i>Varanus exanthematicus</i>	Ghana	Yes
7	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Guinea	Yes
8	<i>Cacatua alba</i>	Indonesia	Yes
9	<i>Ornithoptera croesus</i>	Indonesia	Yes
10	<i>Varanus timorensis</i>	Indonesia	Yes
11	<i>Ptyas mucosus</i>	Indonesia	Yes
12	<i>Trachyphyllia geoffroyi</i>	Indonesia	Yes
13	<i>Geochelone elegans</i>	Jordan	Yes
14	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Mali	Yes
15	<i>Agalychnis callidryas</i>	Nicaragua	Yes
16	<i>Oophaga pumilio</i>	Nicaragua	Yes
17	<i>Oophaga pumilio</i>	Panama	Yes
18	<i>Lorius lory</i>	South Africa	Yes
19	<i>Vulpes zerda</i>	Sudan	No response received
20	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Sudan	No response received
21	<i>Varanus exanthematicus</i>	Togo	Yes
22	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Togo	Yes
23	<i>Hippocampus comes</i>	Viet Nam	Yes

#### Review of responses from countries

6. At AC30, under paragraph 2 g) of the Resolution, the Animals Committee reviewed the responses from the countries concerned in order to determine if trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5. In doing so, the Animals Committee took account of [a review on the breeding biology and captive husbandry of the species concerned](#), which had been commissioned by the Secretariat in accordance with paragraph 2 f) of Resolution Conf. 17.7.
7. Where the Animals Committee concluded that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5, the species-country combination was excluded from the review and the Secretariat has informed the countries concerned of this outcome.
8. Where this was not the case and the Committee identified concerns appropriately within its remit, it has formulated the draft recommendations directed to the relevant countries. The Committee was mindful of paragraph 2 h) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 that these recommendations should be time-bound, feasible, measurable, proportionate, transparent and aimed at ensuring long-term compliance and, where appropriate, aim to promote capacity building and enhance the ability of the country to implement relevant provisions of the Convention.
9. In accordance with paragraph 2 h) of the Resolution, the Secretariat hereby transmits these draft recommendations and supporting information from the Animals Committee to the Standing Committee.
10. Regarding paragraph 2 i) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 and for species-country combination which were retained in the review, on this occasion, the Animals Committee did not identify any concerns that are more appropriately considered by the Standing Committee, rather than the Animals Committee.

## Conclusions

11. The Standing Committee is requested to review, revise if necessary, and endorse the recommendations of the Animals Committee in order to prepare any required recommendations for the country or the countries concerned.

## Recommendations regarding country-species combinations selected

### **1. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Benin**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Benin should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;
- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species;
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Benin to produce F2 specimens or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so; and
- Agree to restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Benin is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock.
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock.

### **2. *Macaca fascicularis* from Cambodia**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

### **3. *Tridacna crocea* from the Federated States of Micronesia**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

### **4. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Ghana**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Ghana should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Ghana to produce F2 specimens or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so; and
- Restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Ghana is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance

- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock.
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock.

#### **5. *Varanus exanthematicus* from Ghana**

The Animals Committee recommends that Ghana should confirm by 1 February 2019 that it will report all specimens from facilities that are produced under the management practices described in document AC30 Doc. 13.1 A2 as source code W and that accordingly they will undertake a non-detriment finding (NDF) for all exports.

#### **6. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Guinea**

The Animals Committee recommends to flag this species-country combination for the Standing Committee and the Secretariat to be included in the ongoing Article XIII compliance process involving Guinea.

#### **7. *Cacatua alba* from Indonesia**

The Animals Committee recommends that Indonesia should explain by 1 February 2019, the high productivity reported by the two facilities breeding this species and confirm whether the facilities have produced specimens to the F2 generation or how they are managing their stock in a manner that has been demonstrated to do so. The Animals Committee noted that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.”

#### **8. *Ornithoptera croesus* from Indonesia**

The Animals Committee recommends that Indonesia provide a report on the ranching operation to the Secretariat by 1 February 2019 and confirm that an NDF will be made prior to authorizing exportation of any specimens with source code 'R'. The Animals Committee noted that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.

#### **9. *Varanus timorensis* from Indonesia**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Indonesia should agree to require all facilities breeding this species to maintain records of their activities in line with page 11 of the *Guidance for inspection of captive breeding and ranching facilities* and carry out regular inspection and monitoring. The Animals Committee notes that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.

#### **10. *Ptyas mucosus* from Indonesia**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

#### **11. *Trachyphyllia geoffroyi* from Indonesia**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

#### **12. *Geochelone elegans* from Jordan**

The Animals Committee recommends that Jordan immediately and until the Standing Committee recommends otherwise, establishes a zero export quota for *Geochelone elegans* from all sources and provides the following to the Secretariat by 1 February 2019:

- evidence of Legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock
- information on the ability of the facilities in Jordan to produce F1 and/or F2 in an amount that corresponds to the number of specimens exported by this facility or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so.

### **13. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Mali**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Mali should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;
- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species; and
- Agree to restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Mali is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock.
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock.

### **14. *Agalychnis callidryas* from Nicaragua**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

### **15. *Oophaga pumilio* from Nicaragua**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Nicaragua should confirm that it will export specimens from facilities breeding this species with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.

### **16. *Oophaga pumilio* from Panama**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Panama should confirm that it will export specimens from facilities breeding this species with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.

### **17. *Lorius lory* from South Africa**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review and that South Africa should be encouraged to continue its activities to improve the process of record keeping and monitoring by all the breeding facilities of the species.

### **18. *Vulpes zerda* from Sudan**

The Animals Committee recommends that if no response is received from Sudan in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee, through its Chair, and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee.

### **19. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Sudan**

The Animals Committee recommends that if no response is received from Sudan in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee through its Chair and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee.

## **20. *Testudo hermanni* from the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia**

The Animals Committee recommends that if no response is received from the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee through its Chair and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee

## **21. *Varanus exanthematicus* from Togo**

The Animals Committee determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

## **22. *Centrochelys sulcata* from Togo**

The Animals Committee recommends that:

By 1 February 2019, Togo should

- provide evidence of Legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock
- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species.
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Togo to produce F2 or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so.
- Restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length
- Confirm that they will export specimens produced in these facilities with source code “F” only and make a legal acquisition and non-detriment finding prior to authorizing export, until such time that a given facility is able to produce to F2 generation in which case source code “C” can be used those specimens in accordance with Resolution conf.10.16 rev.

Togo is further encouraged to:

- introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate at the end of the breeding season
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock
- Re-evaluate their existing export quota in consultation with the scientific authority

## **23. *Hippocampus comes* from Viet Nam**

The Animals Committee recommends that by 1 February 2019, Viet Nam should confirm that if export of specimens recommence from these or similar facilities it will export specimens from these facilities with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.