

NATIONAL IVORY ACTION PLAN (NIAP) PROCESS

TABLE 1: Progress ratings of Parties that continue implementation of their NIAPs

- 1) Percentages provided in brackets indicate assessments of the Secretariat diverging from a Party's self-assessment.
- 2) Where cells are 'blank', either no progress reports were due at the time, or Parties revised and updated their NIAPs since SC69 and are now reporting against the new and updated plans.
- 3) Cameroon, Egypt, Ethiopia and the United Republic of Tanzania in accordance recommendations g) and h) adopted by the Committee's at SC69, submitted their reports on progress with NIAP implementation that were due at SC69, to the Secretariat after SC69.
- 4) Malawi, Qatar and Togo as new NIAP Parties, are required to report on progress with NIAP implementation for the first time, to the present meeting.
- 5) Angola, Malaysia, the Democratic Republic of the Congo and Viet Nam revised and updated their NIAPs following SC69, and are required to report on progress with implementation of their revised and updated their NIAPs for the first time, to the present meeting.

NIAP	SC69 (% of NIAP actions in each progress rating category)						SC70 (% of NIAP actions in each progress rating category)					
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Category A Parties												
Malawi							58% (42%)	17% (25%)	17% (25%)	- (8%)	8% (-)	-
Malaysia							18% (-)	55% (27%)	27% (73%)	-	-	-
United Republic of Tanzania ¹	47% (47.5%)	32% (28.5%)	21% (24%)	-	-	-	58% (52.5%)	37%	5% (10.5%)	-	-	-
Togo							-	-	-	-	-	-
Viet Nam ²							-	-	-	-	-	-
Category B Parties												
Cambodia	15% (8%)	8% (15%)	-	54%	-	23%	23% (15.5%)	46% (15.5%)	15.5% (53.5%)	15.5%	-	-

¹ The table above shows the ratings for SC69 by the United Republic of Tanzania based on 19 actions and by the Secretariat based on 21 actions (see paragraph 141 of the present document).

² Viet Nam submitted its revised and updated NIRAP to the Secretariat in July 2018, and assessment of progress was not possible, as explained in paragraph 105 of the present document.

Cameroon ³	-	12%	62%	7%	9%	10%	28% (25%)	42% (25%)	13% (32%)	9%	2%	6%
Congo	8% (4%)	- (4%)	38%	27%	-	27%	-	-	-	-	-	-
Ethiopia	27% (13%)	66% (47%)	7% (33%)	-	- (7%)	-	20%	60% (40%)	20% (33%)	- (7%)	-	-
Gabon	9%	19% (13%)	19%	22% (28%)	6%	25%	-	-	-	-	-	-
Nigeria	64% (29%)	16%	13% (48%)	7%	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Category C Parties												
Angola							40%	-	0% (6.5%)	30% (32%)	21% (6.5%)	9% (15%)
Democratic Republic of the Congo							-	29% (21%)	39% (47%)	21%	4%	7%
Egypt ⁴	-	84%	-	16%	-	-	44%	40% (32%)	0% (8%)	12%	4% (-)	- (4%)
Lao People's Democratic Republic	-	5%	67% (55%)	23% (10%)	-	5% (30%)	5%	22% (16%)	63%	5% (16%)	5% (-)	-
Mozambique ⁵	55%	33% (30%)	5% (7%)	5%	3%	-	56% (54%)	44% (36%)	- (10%)	-	-	-
Qatar							33%	27% (20%)	40%	- (7%)	-	-

³ In its report following SC69 Cameroon did not use the template for reporting on progress with NIAP implementation and instead used the same categories as in its progress report submitted after SC67 to rate its NIAP priority actions. In the table above, the Secretariat converted the reported ratings to the categories in the NIAP template.

⁴ The information provided by Egypt in its progress report following SC69 did not provide sufficiently detailed information to enable the Secretariat to fully assess the progress made. The table above therefore, for SC69, shows only Egypt's self-assessment without any diverging ratings by the Secretariat.

⁵ Mozambique's NIAP contains 39 actions but the Party divides priority action A1 into A1 a) and A1 b). In its assessment for SC69 the Secretariat counted these actions as separate and therefore assessed progress based on 40 actions. In its assessment for the present meeting the Secretariat reverted to assessing action A1 as a single action which is in line with the reporting of Mozambique and the approach taken at SC66 and SC67.

Angola

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Angola's assessment (for SC70)	40% (19 of 47 actions)	0% (0 of 47 actions)	0% (0 of 47 actions)	30% (14 of 47 actions)	21% (10 of 47 actions)	9% (4 of 47 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	40% (19 of 47 actions)	0% (0 of 47 actions)	6.5% (3 of 47 actions)	32% (15 of 47 actions)	6.5% (3 of 47 actions)	15% (7 of 47 actions)

1. Angola has since SC69, revised and updated its NIAP. The [revised and updated NIAP](#) still includes all 33 priority actions, which were originally contained in the NIAP found to be adequate in 2015. It also includes additional actions and an additional pillar G. In the revised and updated NIAP, timelines for the implementation of priority actions have been adjusted as deemed appropriate by the Party to achieve implementation. The Secretariat, considering the justification provided by Angola, and in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines to the NIAP Process*,⁶ contained in Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) on *Trade in elephant specimens*, assessed the revised and updated NIAP as 'adequate', and informed the Party accordingly. The revised and updated NIAP of Angola, approved at ministerial level, contains 47 priority actions. Angola's self-assessment report on progress with NIAP implementation prepared for the present meeting, evaluates 19 actions as 'achieved', 14 as having achieved 'partial progress', 10 as 'pending completion of another action', and four as 'not commenced'.
2. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendations j), k) and l) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Angola. The Secretariat as requested by the Committee in recommendation j), issued a warning letter to Angola on 19 December 2017. The Secretariat, as requested in the warning letter, received a report from Angola within the set deadline, on 31 January 2018. The Secretariat assessed the report and concluded that it satisfied the provisions of Recommendation j), and that no further action in accordance with Recommendation k) agreed at SC69, was warranted.
3. Upon review of Angola's progress report to the present meeting, available as Annex 4 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, the Secretariat note that there are some discrepancies between the ratings of actions B.2, B.7 and E.1 in parts B (summary evaluation of actions) and C (detailed evaluation of actions) of the progress report. The Secretariat used the ratings in part C as the basis for its assessment.
4. Considering the information provided by Angola in its report, the Secretariat believes that it might be more appropriate to rate actions E.5, F.2 and F.3 as 'on track', actions B.5, B.6, E.1 and E.3 as 'partial progress', and actions B.3, C.4, and D.3 as 'not commenced'. With regards to action B.3, the Secretariat notes that, as highlighted in the document on the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC), prepared for the present meeting, a pre-meeting for the implementation of the ICCWC Indicator Framework for wildlife and forest crime⁷ is tentatively scheduled to take place in Angola in August 2018. The implementation of the ICCWC Indicator Framework is anticipated to be followed by the implementation of the ICCWC Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit⁸, which would then complete the implementation of action B.3 of Angola's NIAP. Regarding action E.6, it is not clear from the information

⁶ Referred to as 'the Guidelines' throughout the rest of the present document.

⁷ https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/prog/iccwc/E-ICCWC-Ind-FW-Assessment_guidelines_and_template_clickable-final.pdf

⁸ https://cites.org/common/resources/pub/ICCWC_Toolkit_v2_english.pdf

provided if and how capacity has been strengthened. Based on the information provided, it is not possible for the Secretariat to evaluate action E6. Angola may wish to elaborate on the activities conducted at the present meeting, to explain its self-assessment rating.

5. The ETIS report prepared for SC69⁹ identifies Angola as one of the Parties from which the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa originate. The report states that Angola is one of the Parties that has previously been identified as having an ivory carving industry which appear to be servicing demand for ivory in Asia with the production of products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. In this regard it should be noted that the Secretariat also in 2014, in its report to the 65th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC65, Geneva, 2014),¹⁰ highlighted that information provided to the Secretariat by INTERPOL, indicated that during the previous three years, Angola was the departure country for the largest number of passengers caught with illegal ivory that transited Bole International Airport, Addis Ababa. It was at the time reported by INTERPOL that most of the illegal ivory items originating in Angola consisted of worked ivory, which suggested that an active ivory carving industry may be operating in the country. From the content of the ETIS report prepared for SC69, it seems that little has changed in this regard, and that these illegal activities and the associated illegal trade in worked ivory from Angola, continue to persist.
6. In the light of the above, the Secretariat believes that it would be appropriate for the Committee to consider to request Angola to take urgent steps to significantly step up efforts, to progress implementation of its revised and updated NIAP. This should be done with a particular focus on finalizing the new Criminal Code applying penalties for crimes against the environment, including ivory trafficking, to enable authorities to take strong action against wildlife crime, as anticipated by action A.1 in the revised and updated NIAP. The Secretariat further recommends that the Committee consider to request Angola to focus in particular on taking steps to put in place the Action Plan as reported upon against action C.1 in the revised and updated NIAP, and on mobilizing the Ivory Seizure Task Force as reported on against action D.6 in the NIAP. This should be done with a particular focus on addressing any illegal carving industries in the country, by initiating inspections and enforcement actions in domestic markets, and scaling up inspections at ports and border checkpoints, to detect, prevent and address illegal exports of worked ivory from the country.
7. The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee in line with Step 4 of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'limited progress' for Angola.
8. The Committee may also wish to again draw attention to recommendation I) on *NIAPs*, agreed at SC69, as presented in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev.1), encouraging Parties, governmental, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations and others to, where possible, provide financial and technical assistance to Angola, in accordance with Decision 17.82, and to inform the Secretariat accordingly.

Cambodia

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Cambodia's assessment (SC70)	23% (3 of 13 actions)	46% (6 of 13 actions)	15.5% (2 of 13 actions)	15.5% (2 of 13 actions)	0% (0 of 13 actions)	0% (0 of 13 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	15.5% (2 of 13 actions)	15.5% (2 of 13 actions)	53.5% (7 of 13 actions)	15.5% (3 of 13 actions)	0% (0 of 13 actions)	0% (0 of 13 actions)

⁹ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/69/E-SC69-51-01-A.pdf>

¹⁰ https://www.cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/65/E-SC65-42-01_2.pdf

9. [Cambodia's NIAP](#) includes 13 priority actions. Cambodia's self-assessment for SC70 evaluates three actions as 'achieved', six as 'substantially achieved', two as 'on track', and two as of 'partial progress'.
10. At SC69 the Standing Committee agreed recommendation m) i) - iv) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1). The Committee agreed an overall rating of 'limited progress' for Cambodia, in line with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*, and requested Cambodia to enhance efforts to progress the implementation of NIAP actions between SC69 and SC70, and provide associated reporting in accordance with the provisions set out in the *Guidelines*. The Committee further requested the Secretariat to conduct a technical mission to Cambodia in accordance with paragraph 29 e) in the Annex to Resolution Conf. 14.3 on *CITES compliance procedures*, to meet with national agencies responsible for NIAP implementation, offer assistance, and identify appropriate steps to progress the implementation of the NIAP. The Committee requested the Secretariat to report its findings and recommendations to the present meeting, and agreed that if Cambodia, upon assessment by the Secretariat, does not show any demonstrable progress with the implementation of its NIAP at the present meeting, the Standing Committee issue a recommendation to suspend all commercial trade in CITES-listed species with Cambodia.
11. Cambodia extended an invitation to the Secretariat to conduct the mission called for in the recommendation agreed at SC69, and the Secretariat subsequently conducted the mission from 12-14 June 2018. The Secretariat takes this opportunity to thank Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (SAR) of China and the United States of America for the generous funding provided, which enabled the Secretariat to undertake the mission. The Secretariat also thank the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), for the regional representative it made available to participate in the mission, at the request of the Secretariat. The Secretariat would further like to thank the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) of Cambodia, that through the CITES Management Authority of Cambodia, and the Forestry Administration, the CITES Scientific Authority of Cambodia, developed a program for the mission. The mission programme enabled the Secretariat to meet with representatives from national agencies responsible for NIAP implementation and other entities in Cambodia with a role in combating wildlife crime, and facilitated a field visit to Phnom Penh dry port, where the seizure of 1.36 tonnes of ivory (together with pangolin scales and big cat bones) was made in December 2016.¹¹
12. The Secretariat believes that the mission to Cambodia was timely. It enabled concrete discussions on the measures and activities to implement to progress NIAP implementation and tackle illegal trade in ivory as it affects Cambodia. In addition to detailed discussions with the Forestry Administration of Cambodia, the lead agency responsible for NIAP implementation in the country, the mission facilitated engagement with different authorities in Cambodia to discuss their role in NIAP implementation, and to secure commitment amongst these authorities to progress implementation. The Secretariat welcomes the signature of Declaration (Prorkas) No. 240 PRK.MAFF by the Minister of MAFF at the time of the mission, on 13 June 2018. This Declaration, which is available as an annex to Cambodia's report to the present meeting, classifies additional wildlife species into the lists annexed to Prorkas No.020 PRK.MAFF, dated 25 January 2007. The signature of Declaration (Prorkas) No. 240 PRK.MAFF represents the achievement of one of the important activities in the NIAP of Cambodia, and will enable law enforcement officers to take action against crimes involving African elephant, four rhinoceros species and seven pangolin species.
13. The Secretariat, following the mission, on 20 June 2018 formally wrote to Cambodia, to draw to the attention of the Party the key findings and observations made during the mission. The Secretariat made a number of proposals to Cambodia on activities and measures the Party could consider to implement, to support and further strengthen NIAP implementation. These, *inter alia*, include the establishment of a law enforcement advisory program to facilitate the investigation of wildlife crime offences of a serious and transnational nature, the institutionalization of the collection of samples from seizures for forensic analyses, the implementation of the *ICWC Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit* and the *ICWC Indicator Framework for Wildlife and Forest Crime*, further strengthening national level risk profiles and indicators to detect and prevent illegal trade in wildlife, and developing a uniform national protocol for the marking, recording, handling, storage and disposal of seized and confiscated wildlife specimens.

¹¹ <https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/ivory-pangolin-scales-seized-pp-dry-port>

14. The Secretariat informed Cambodia that some limited funding is available to the Secretariat in the context of Decision 17.82, to support the Party in implementing its NIAP, including some of the proposals outlined above, and that UNODC indicated that it could complement the funding available to the Secretariat, with additional funding available to UNODC, to pursue these proposals.
15. The Secretariat also in its observations to Cambodia, noted that the Wildlife Rapid Rescue Team (WRRT)¹² operational in Cambodia is achieving great success in addressing offences of domestic illegal trade in wildlife, and commended the undertaking. Information shared with the Secretariat during the mission indicated that recent market surveys suggest an increase in retailers selling ivory in the main cities in Cambodia. The Secretariat suggested to Cambodia to task the WRRT to be vigilant in implementing activities that will suppress and address any new trends that may emerge regarding illegal domestic trade in ivory in Cambodia.
16. The Secretariat welcomes the progress made by Cambodia since SC69 in implementing its NIAP, as reflected in the Party's report to the present meeting, available as Annex 5 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. As mentioned in paragraph 12 above, the Secretariat welcomes the signature of Declaration (Prorkas) No. 240 PRK.MAFF by the Minister of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, on 13 June 2018, which represents the achievement of action 1.1 in the NIAP of Cambodia. The Secretariat notes that Cambodia in its report prepared for the present meeting states that significant law enforcement action is planned to be conducted within the next six months, to progress the implementation of the Declaration. Cambodia also reports on operations to be led by the WRRT, that is being planned with the goal to reduce the number of shops selling worked ivory items in three Cambodian cities by 50%, by August 2019. This responds positively to the observations the Secretariat provided to Cambodia, as outlined in paragraph 15 above, and is very encouraging to note. Cambodia also reports on activities already undertaken which resulted in the confiscation of ivory, as well as on the arrest and prosecution of key individuals associated with ivory trafficking affecting Cambodia. The Party further reports on a number of recent training interventions, to enhance the capacity of national agencies to address wildlife crime.
17. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Cambodia for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
18. Regarding action 1.2 in the NIAP, the Secretariat notes that no information is provided on the implementation of this action. Regarding action 2.1 in the NIAP, as noted in paragraph 15 above, the Wildlife Rapid Rescue Response Team (WRRT) represents an important and commendable undertaking in Cambodia. Since its establishment in 2001, the WRRT achieved impressive successes and its work should without doubt be highly valued, continue, and be fully supported. The activities of the WRRT however seem to be limited to domestic level crime in Cambodia, and for this reason the Secretariat believes that the establishment of a law enforcement advisory program as described in paragraph 13 above, to facilitate the investigation of wildlife crime offences of a serious and transnational nature, mobilizing proactive approaches, advanced investigation techniques and modern technology, could greatly assist Cambodia to also address wildlife crime of an organized and transnational nature. The Secretariat propose a rating of 'on track' for this action, and encourage Cambodia to consider the proposal of establishing a law enforcement advisory program, to fully achieve what is anticipated by action 2.1 in the NIAP. Regarding actions 2.2, 5.1 and 5.2, the Secretariat welcomes the progress made but is of the opinion that the essence of the actions has not yet been 'substantially achieved'. The Secretariat would therefore recommend a rating of 'on track' for these actions.
19. Regarding actions 4.1 and 6.1 the Secretariat notes a discrepancy between the ratings of these actions in parts B (summary evaluation of actions) and C (detailed evaluation of actions) of the progress report to SC70. Action 4.1 (development of a national conservation action plan) is rated as 'substantially achieved' in part B and as having achieved 'partial progress' in part C. Given that the national conservation action plan is still a draft waiting since 2016 to be approved by the Ministry of Environment, the Secretariat is of the opinion that this action should be rated as 'on track'. The Secretariat encourages Cambodia to move ahead with the implementation of action 4.1 as a matter of urgency. Action 6.1 (explore implementation of ICCWC Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit) is rated as 'substantially achieved' in part B and as 'achieved' in part C of the progress report. Although the Secretariat encourages

¹² <https://www.wildlifealliance.org/tag/wildlife-rapid-rescue-team/>

Cambodia to continue to consider implementation of the toolkit, the justification provided by Cambodia seems reasonable considering that the action in the NIAP states that the Party will explore implementation of the toolkit. The Secretariat therefore concurs with Cambodia's rating of this action as 'achieved' in part B of the report.

20. Overall, Cambodia has shown demonstrable progress with the implementation of its NIAP since SC69. Cambodia acknowledges in its report that further work is required to implement its NIAP and states that in coming months a number of focused law enforcement and other actions will be pursued. In the light of the above, the Committee may wish to welcome the progress made by Cambodia and agree an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Cambodia, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Cameroon

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Substantially achieved	On track	Limited progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	Unclear
Cameroon's self - assessment (following SC69)	12% (5 of 43 actions)	62% (27 of 43 actions)	7% (3 of 43 actions)	9% (4 of 43 actions)	5% (2 of 43 actions)	5% (2 of 43 actions)

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Cameroon's self - assessment (SC70)	28% (13 of 47 actions)	42% (20 of 47 actions)	13% (6 of 47 actions)	9% (4 of 47 actions)	2% (1 of 47 actions)	6% (3 of 47 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	25% (12 of 47 actions)	25% (12 of 47 actions)	32% (15 of 47 actions)	9% (4 of 47 actions)	2% (1 of 47 actions)	6% (3 of 47 actions)

21. The [NIAP of Cameroon](#) contains 43 priority actions. In its progress report to SC70, Cameroon reports on all 43 actions of its NIAP as well as on four additional actions. Cameroon's self-assessment evaluates 13 actions as 'achieved', 20 as 'substantially achieved', six as 'on track', four as having achieved 'partial progress', one as 'pending completion of another action' and three as 'not commenced'.
22. Cameroon did not submit a report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC69, in accordance with the provisions of Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, and the Committee agreed recommendations g) and h) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Cameroon amongst others.
23. As requested by the Committee, the Secretariat following SC69 issued a warning letter to Cameroon on behalf of the Committee, requesting the Party to submit its NIAP progress report to the Secretariat within 60 days of the conclusion of SC69. The Secretariat received this report within the set deadline, on 12 January 2018. Although Cameroon did not use the new template for reporting on progress with NIAP implementation and instead used the same categories as in its progress report submitted after SC67 to rate its NIAP priority actions (note categories in the first table above), it provided adequate information to substantiate the self-assessment it provided. The Secretariat conducted an informal assessment of the report received following SC69, which showed that overall Cameroon progressed the implementation of its NIAP in the period between SC67 and SC69. The Secretariat shared its findings and observations with Cameroon.

24. For its progress report to the present meeting, available as Annex 6 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, Cameroon used the new template for progress reports on NIAP implementation available on the NIAP webpage, and substantially reordered its reporting on the actions in its NIAP, in attempt to align it with the new reporting template. The Secretariat prepared a table, annexed to the SC70 progress report received from Cameroon, which correlates the new reporting order with the order of the actions in the NIAP.
25. Cameroon *inter alia* reports upon activities conducted to strengthen inter-agency collaboration, continued training to strengthen criminal investigation capacity to address wildlife crime done in collaboration with the International Law Enforcement Academy in Botswana in June 2018, the updating of training modules used at the Garoua Wildlife College in Cameroon to further strengthen training interventions addressing wildlife crime, ongoing operations in Cameroon to address illegal trade in ivory, which in 2018 resulted in further ivory seizures and prosecutions, and continued meetings of the ad hoc inter-ministerial committee established to monitor NIAP implementation.
26. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Cameroon for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
27. The comparison between Cameroon's progress reports submitted following SC69 and for the present meeting shows that overall Cameroon has progressed the implementation of its NIAP. Regarding action 2.2.3, the Secretariat notes that the same information is provided as in Cameroon's report on progress submitted following SC69, yet the rating of the action has changed from 'on track' to 'substantially achieved'. The Secretariat is of the opinion that the rating of 'on track' should remain in place. Regarding action 2.2.6, the Secretariat notes that the action is still under evaluation/validation and should therefore be rated as 'on track' rather than 'substantially achieved'. Regarding action 2.2.7, the Secretariat notes that a number of detection materials such as scanners could not be purchased due to financial constraints. The Secretariat would therefore suggest a rating as 'on track' for this action. Regarding action 2.2.12, the Secretariat notes that communication and navigation equipment has not yet been fully purchased. The Secretariat therefore believes that a rating of 'on track' for this action is more appropriate. The Secretariat welcomes Cameroon's participation in Africa-TWIX reported under action 2.2.13. However, the reporting under this action does not provide information on the use of informants and the Secretariat therefore believes that a rating of 'on track' would be more appropriate than the rating of 'substantially achieved'. Regarding actions 3.2.1, 3.2.2 and 3.2.3, the Secretariat noted discrepancies between the ratings of the actions in parts B (summary evaluation of actions) and C (detailed evaluation of actions) of the progress report to the present meeting. The Secretariat is of the opinion that these actions should be rated as 'on track'. Regarding action 4.2.1, the Secretariat notes that the erection of a memorial stone for poached elephants to raise awareness amongst the public is still ongoing. The Secretariat would therefore suggest a rating of 'on track' for this action.
28. Overall, the progress report of Cameroon is comprehensive, and except for the actions pointed out in paragraph 27 above, provides sufficient details on the implemented activities to justify the allocated progress ratings. The report demonstrates continued progress with NIAP implementation in Cameroon, and in the light of the above, the Standing Committee may wish to in line with Step 4 of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'limited progress' for Cameroon.

Congo and Gabon

29. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation o) i) and ii) and agreed an overall rating of 'limited progress' for the Congo and Gabon, in line with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*. The Committee requested the Congo and Gabon to enhance their efforts to progress the implementation of NIAP actions between SC69 and the present meeting, and to provide associated reporting in accordance with the provisions set out in the *Guidelines*.
30. The Congo and Gabon did not submit reports on progress with their NIAP implementation for the present meeting, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*.
31. The Secretariat encourages Congo and Gabon to submit their progress reports ahead of SC70, so the Standing Committee can consider their progress with NIAP implementation alongside that of the other NIAP Parties. If progress reports are not received from Congo and Gabon, the Standing Committee might consider inviting the Parties, if present, to provide an oral update on their progress at the present meeting.

32. In the absence of such reports or oral updates to SC70, the Committee may wish to, in line with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines*, consider appropriate measures, in accordance with Resolution Conf. 14.3 on *CITES Compliance Procedures*, to ensure compliance with the NIAP Process.

Democratic Republic of the Congo

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Substantially achieved	On track	Limited progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced	Unclear
DRC's assessment (SC70)	28% (8 of 28 actions)	39% (11 of 28 actions)	18% (5 of 28 actions)	4% (1 of 28 actions)	7% (2 of 28 actions)	4% (1 of 28 actions)

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
DRC's assessment (SC70, current categories)	0% (0 of 28 actions)	29% (8 of 28 actions)	39% (11 of 28 actions)	21% (6 of 28 actions)	4% (1 of 28 actions)	7% (2 of 28 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	0% (0 of 28 actions)	21% (6 of 28 actions)	47% (13 of 28 actions)	21% (6 of 28 actions)	4% (1 of 28 actions)	7% (2 of 28 actions)

33. In its observations to SC69, the Secretariat noted that the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) together with its progress report to SC69 submitted what seemed to be a revised NIAP in which some of the actions contained in the NIAP accepted as adequate in 2015 had been removed and milestones for existing actions changed.
34. The Standing Committee at SC69, agreed recommendation i) i) and ii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1). The Committee agreed an overall rating of 'limited progress' for the DRC, in line with Step 4 paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*, and requested the DRC, in case it wished to revise and update its NIAP found to be adequate in 2015, to do so within 60 days upon conclusion of SC69, and to reinsert in the revised NIAP those actions originally found to be adequate, or to provide justification on why these actions should be removed from the NIAP.
35. Pursuant to the Committee's recommendation, the DRC submitted a [revised and updated NIAP](#) in January 2018, which contains the same actions as the NIAP that found to be adequate in 2015. The timeline for these actions has however been extended in the revised and updated NIAP, from the period April 2015 – December 2016, to the period January 2018 – December 2019. The revised and updated NIAP also contains a number of additional actions and modifications. The Secretariat in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines* assessed the revised and updated NIAP submitted by the DRC as 'adequate' and informed the Party accordingly.
36. The revised and updated NIAP of the DRC includes 28 priority actions. The report on progress with NIAP implementation submitted by the DRC for the present meeting is available as Annex 8 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The DRC did not use the template for reporting on progress as required by Step 4, paragraph b), of the *Guidelines*, for its reporting to the present meeting. The Secretariat therefore converted the

DRC's ratings to the new categories identified in the NIAP Guidelines.¹³ The DRC's self-assessment for SC70 thus evaluates eight actions as 'substantially achieved', 11 as 'on track', six as having achieved 'partial progress', one as 'pending completion of another action', and two as 'not commenced'.

37. The DRC in its report to the present meeting highlights that the process of development of the new revised and updated NIAP facilitated securing commitment from different governmental agencies and other stakeholders to support NIAP implementation. The Party also reports upon the establishment of a task force to address wildlife crime that will facilitate improved national level coordination and collaboration in support of NIAP implementation. Achievements reported upon include, *inter alia*, the training of 150 magistrates and the execution of operations in collaboration with the Customs, Police and local non-governmental organizations, which resulted in a number of ivory seizures in 2018. The DRC notes that a lack of sufficient financial resources poses a challenge to the implementation of some NIAP actions, but also reiterates the commitment of the DRC Government to mobilize sufficient resources for the successful implementation of its 2018-2019 NIAP.
38. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by the DRC for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
39. Upon review of the progress report received from the DRC, the Secretariat notes that actions 3.1 and 6.5 have not yet commenced. Regarding action 1.2 the Secretariat notes that a public consultation has been launched which at the time of reporting was still ongoing and the results of which will be taken into consideration in drafting the implementing measures of the law N° 14/003 of 11 February 2014. The Secretariat therefore believes that a rating of 'on track' rather than 'substantially achieved' might be more appropriate for this action. Regarding action 5.3, the Secretariat welcomes the activities undertaken to address illegal in ivory trade that occurred at Bikeko market, and notes that the ongoing activities to facilitate the implementation of action 1.3 in the NIAP will likely further support achieving the objectives of action 5.3. Noting however that the information provided suggests that other similar illegal domestic markets and ivory processing facilities as highlighted in paragraph 40 below continue to exist, and considering that no information is provided regarding the status of the transformation of the 'Union of Ivorian Artists of Congo' (UNARICO) into the organization 'Action for the Defence of Nature' (ADN), the Secretariat suggests that a rating of 'on track' for this action might be more appropriate than 'substantially achieved'. The Secretariat further welcomes the participation of the DRC in Africa-TWIX but it advises that the participation alone will not be sufficient to achieve the broader objectives of actions 4.5, 4.6 and 4.8.
40. The ETIS report to SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies the DRC as one of the countries of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa, mostly through air transport. The report states that the DRC has previously been identified as one of the countries with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade from countries with such industries involves the use of couriers, predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body. The DRC is encouraged to take these findings into consideration in the implementation of activities in accordance with action 5.3 in its NIAP.
41. The Standing Committee may wish to in line with Step 4 of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'limited progress' for the DRC.

¹³ The rating 'substantially achieved' became 'achieved' or 'substantially achieved' in the new categories, 'on track' became 'on track', 'limited progress' became 'partial progress', 'pending completion of another action' became 'pending completion of another action', 'not commenced' became 'not commenced' and 'unclear' became 'partial progress'.

Egypt

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Egypt's assessment ¹⁴ (following SC69)	0% (0 of 25 actions)	84% (21 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)	16% (4 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)
Egypt's assessment ¹⁵ (for SC70)	44% (11 of 25 actions)	40% (10 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)	12% (3 of 25 actions)	4% (1 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	44% (11 of 25 actions)	32% (8 of 25 actions)-	8% (2 of 25 actions)	12% (3 of 25 actions)	0% (0 of 25 actions)	4% (1 of 25 actions)

42. The [NIAP of Egypt](#) was submitted to the Secretariat on 12 January 2015 and includes 25 priority actions. Egypt's self-assessment for SC70 evaluates 11 actions as 'achieved', 10 as 'substantially achieved', three as having achieved 'partial progress' and one as 'pending completion of another action'.
43. Egypt did not submit a report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC69 in accordance with the provisions of Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, and the Committee subsequently agreed recommendations g) and h) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Egypt amongst others.
44. As requested by the Committee, the Secretariat following SC69 issued a warning letter to Egypt on behalf of the Committee, requesting the Party to submit its NIAP progress report to the Secretariat within 60 days of the conclusion of SC69. The Secretariat received this report within the set deadline, on 23 December 2017. The Secretariat conducted an informal assessment of the report received and, noting the continued positive self-assessment of Egypt, found that the report submitted by Egypt following SC69, mainly repeated what Egypt already reported to the 67th meeting of the Committee (SC67, Johannesburg, 2016). Furthermore, the information provided continued to be, as was highlighted by the Secretariat in the document it prepared for SC67,¹⁶ vague and unclear on a number of actions implemented and did not provide sufficiently detailed information to enable the Secretariat to assess the progress made. The Secretariat shared its findings and observations with Egypt, and indicated to the Party that in order for the Secretariat to allocate the appropriate ratings, it is highly important that additional information is provided by Egypt in its report to the present meeting.
45. Egypt's progress report to the present meeting is available as Annex 9 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. It mainly repeat what the Party already reported to SC67 and following SC69. The limited information provided by Egypt on the implementation of actions continues to make it difficult for the Secretariat to arrive at its independent rating. Regarding action A.2, it is unclear whether and how the legislative amendments have been effected. Regarding action A.3, the Secretariat believes that a rating of 'not commenced' would be more appropriate than the rating 'pending completion of another action' since the implementation of the action is not pending the completion of another action in the NIAP but rather pending broader political change outside of Egypt. Action C.4 was rated by Egypt as being 'on track' at

¹⁴ For its progress report submitted following SC69, Egypt did not use the new template for NIAP progress reports available on the NIAP webpage. The Secretariat therefore 'translated' the ratings provided by Egypt (21 actions 'substantially achieved' and four actions having achieved 'limited progress') to fit the new categories in the template for NIAP progress reports, as shown in the table above. The Secretariat also notes that it interpreted Egypt's reporting on action A.1.3 to include reporting on actions A.1.1 and A.1.2.

¹⁵ The Secretariat noted a number of discrepancies between the ratings of actions against pillar C of Egypt's NIAP, in parts B (summary evaluation of actions) and C (detailed evaluation of actions) of the progress report to SC70. The Secretariat used the ratings given in part C of the report for its assessment.

¹⁶ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/67/E-SC67-13.pdf>

SC67, while following SC69, it was down-rated to having achieved 'limited progress' and for SC70 it is rated as 'partial progress'. No explanation is provided with this difference in ratings compared to SC67, and it is unclear how Egypt intends to implement the action. Regarding actions D.2 and E.1, the explanations Egypt provides for the new ratings in its report to SC70 are repetitions of the explanations provided to SC67, when it rated the actions as 'on track'. Given the absence of further information, the Secretariat believes that it would be appropriate to continue to rate these actions as 'on track'. The Secretariat also notes that there was no progress with actions D.3 and E.3 since SC66, and that Egypt for a large number of actions rated as 'achieved' and 'substantially achieved', has since SC67 not provided sufficient detail of the activities delivered to justify the allocated progress ratings.

46. The ETIS report prepared for CoP16 identified Egypt as a Category B Party. In the ETIS report prepared for CoP17, Egypt moved to a category of lesser prominence, and it is currently a Category C Party. The Secretariat notes however, that the ETIS report to SC69 highlights Egypt as having an unregulated domestic ivory industry, and as being the most important non-Asian destination for illegal consignments of worked ivory products. The ETIS report prepared for SC69 shows that in the period 2011-2013, two seizures involving 37 kg of ivory destined for Egypt were made. This escalated to seven seizures involving 201 kg of ivory in the period 2014-2016.
47. The Secretariat recommends an overall rating of 'limited progress' for Egypt, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.
48. In its observations to SC67, the Secretariat had already noted that it had difficulties assessing progress in Egypt's NIAP implementation due to the limited information provided on the implementation of actions. Furthermore, it noted that the Standing Committee might wish to request Egypt to revise and update its NIAP. In the light of the limited information received from Egypt on how it is responding to illegal trade in ivory as it affects the country, and considering the information outlined in paragraph 46 above, the conclusion of the Secretariat regarding the current assessment is the same as for SC67, namely that the Committee consider to request Egypt to revise and update its NIAP.

Lao PDR

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Lao PDR's assessment (SC70)	5% (1 of 19 actions)	22% (4 of 19 actions)	63% (12 of 19 actions)	5% (1 of 19 actions)	5% (1 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	5% (1 of 19 actions)	16% (3 of 19 actions)	63% (12 of 19 actions)	16% (3 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)

49. The [NIAP of Lao PDR](#) includes 19 priority actions.¹⁷ Lao PDR's self-assessment evaluates one action as 'achieved', four actions as 'substantially achieved', 12 actions as 'on track', one as having achieved 'partial progress', and one as 'pending completion of another action'.
50. At SC69 the Standing Committee agreed recommendation p) i) - iii) on the *NIAP process*, directed to Lao PDR, as presented in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1). The Committee agreed an overall rating of 'limited progress' with NIAP implementation in Lao PDR, and requested the Party to enhance efforts to progress the implementation of NIAP actions between SC69 and SC70. The Committee further requested Lao PDR to focus particularly on the implementation of its amended Penal Code, progressing the implementation of NIAP Actions 2.5 and 2.6 by initiating inspections and enforcement actions in domestic

¹⁷ In the Lao PDR's progress report to SC70 Action 2.1, paragraph a) and paragraph b), are interpreted as separate actions.

markets, and by scaling up inspections at ports and border checkpoints. The Committee also requested the Lao PDR to use the template for progress reports on NIAP implementation available on the NIAP webpage, for its reporting, and to provide sufficiently detailed information in its report, to enable the Secretariat to assess the progress made.

51. In May 2018, the Secretariat conducted a mission to the Lao PDR in the context of the application of Article XIII. The mission was used as an opportunity to also advise Lao PDR on the preparation of its NIAP progress report for the present meeting.
52. In its report to the present meeting, Lao PDR notes that its CITES Management Authority has changed since the last reporting on NIAP implementation to SC69. Since August 2017, the Department of Forestry (DOF), in the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (MAF), is the designated CITES Management Authority in the Lao PDR, and the leading agency responsible for NIAP implementation. It is reported that this recent changeover of the Management Authority impacted on NIAP implementation, and as a result a significant part of the actions in the NIAP is still rated as 'on track' and implementation of these actions is still ongoing.
53. The Secretariat notes that it is encouraging to observe that, despite the challenges posed by structural changes as mentioned above, good progress with some NIAP activities is reflected in the current progress report. Lao PDR used the correct template for the current progress report on NIAP implementation and provided a wealth of information. The Secretariat would like to take this opportunity to thank the Party for the comprehensive report submitted. This responds positively to the Recommendations adopted by the Committee at SC69, and enabled the Secretariat to better assess progress.
54. Lao PDR reports that its National Assembly has adopted the revisions to the Penal Code, and that it was submitted to the Office of the President for promulgation. The report also outlines the penalties that can be imposed for involvement in wildlife crime in accordance with the revised Penal Code. Although the revised Penal Code is not yet in place, Lao PDR highlights in its report that it will, as soon as the Penal Code is promulgated, take action to ensure that it is disseminated to all relevant governmental agencies, for implementation and enforcement. Regarding action 1.4 the Secretariat notes that, in light of the fact that the Penal Code has been adopted by the National Assembly and submitted to the President's Office for promulgation, a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate for this action. The Secretariat also believes that a rating of 'partial progress' will be more appropriate for action 6.1, given that the implementation of the action has not yet gone beyond the planning phase.
55. Other progress to be noted include the Prime Minister's Order No.05/2018, issued on 8 May 2018, on *Strengthening Management and Inspection of Prohibited Wild Fauna and Flora*, the work to formulate recommendations on the development of CITES implementation legislation were completed, the drafting of a decree on international trade in CITES-listed specimens which is under discussion, and the National Wildlife Crime Response Strategy Plan for the national Lao Wildlife Enforcement Network which was approved and signed by the MAF in March 2018 (MAF Decision No. 0654). Regarding action 2.4, the indicator for the action suggests an increase in law enforcement operations and prosecution of offenders, while the activities reported mostly refer to participation in international meetings. Although such activities are essential it does not fully respond to the objective of the action in the NIAP and the Secretariat would therefore suggest a rating of 'partial progress' for this action.
56. Regarding the implementation of actions 2.5 and 2.6 in the NIAP, the Secretariat notes that the rating for these actions have improved since SC69 from 'limited/partial progress' to 'on track'. In this context Lao PDR reports that it has investigated at least five incidents in domestic markets since 2015, of which four have taken place since the new Management Authority was designated in December 2017. The Party also reports that it has successfully scaled up inspections at ports and border checkpoints on the basis of Prime Minister's Order No.05/2018. The Secretariat concurs with Lao PDR's self-evaluation of these actions as being 'on track', and believe that the report indicates that Lao PDR responded positively to the Recommendations adopted by the Committee at SC69.
57. The report received from Lao PDR suggest renewed commitment in the country to progress NIAP implementation. It shows that progress has been made, and Lao PDR itself in the report reiterates its commitment to continue the progress it has made to date with NIAP implementation. The Party also

indicated in its report that it is considering revising and updating its NIAP, to ensure that it take into consideration recent developments, and better respond to the current situation in the country.

58. The Secretariat reports in detail on matters related to Lao PDR in document SC70 Doc. 27.3.1 on the *Application of Article XIII in the Lao PDR*. Lao PDR continues to be a key country affected by illegal wildlife trade, including illegal ivory trade, and it is crucial for the Party to build upon the current momentum and to ensure that urgent measures continue to be taken to progress NIAP implementation.
59. The report received from Lao PDR is available as Annex 13 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The report included a number of Annexes which are considered 'confidential' by Lao PDR, and for this reason, these Annexes are not included in Annex 13.
60. In light of the progress made by Lao PDR, the Secretariat recommends an overall rating of 'partial progress' for the Party, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Malawi

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Malawi's assessment (SC70)	58% (7 of 12 actions)	17% (2 of 12 actions)	17% (2 of 12 actions)	0% (0 of 12 actions)	8% (1 of 12 actions)	0% (0 of 12 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	42% (5 of 12 actions)	25% (3 of 12 actions)	25% (3 of 12 actions)	8% (1 of 12 actions)	0% (0 of 12 actions)	0% (0 of 12 actions)

61. During the postal procedure on NIAPs that followed CoP17, the Standing Committee agreed that Malawi be included in the NIAP process as a Category A Party, and be requested to develop and implement a NIAP. Malawi submitted its NIAP to the Secretariat in September 2017, and is now for the first time reporting on progress with implementation. The [NIAP of Malawi](#) contains 12 priority actions. Malawi's self-assessment evaluates seven actions as 'achieved', two as 'substantially achieved', two as 'on track' and one as 'pending completion of another action'.
62. Malawi notes in the report it submitted for the present meeting, available as Annex 14 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, that it from 2013 already implemented measures aimed at addressing ivory trafficking, and that when the NIAP came into effect, the implementation of a number of actions contained in the NIAP had already started. Therefore, the progress report includes information on actions that have been undertaken both before and after the NIAP process commenced.
63. The report received from Malawi outlines a variety of measures and activities that have been implemented in recent years to address illegal trade in wildlife, in particular illegal trade in ivory. The Secretariat finds that the progress report received from Malawi demonstrates the dedication of the Party to implement its NIAP, and the Secretariat commends Malawi for the progress made.
64. It is worth noting that Malawi reports that all cases of wildlife crime for 2017 were reviewed, and that the number of custodial sentences for elephant related crimes increased from less than 1% to 84%, where cases were subjected to courtroom monitoring. Malawi further reports that in view of this, about 95% of wildlife crime cases have been prosecuted successfully. A sentencing guidelines and legislation handbook has been produced and is in use, and approximately 90% of magistrates countrywide have been trained.

65. The Secretariat notes that milestone M5 for action 2.1 is not yet fully achieved, and that the development of MOUs with police and Customs is still in progress. In the light of this, a rating of ‘substantially achieved’ for this action might be more appropriate. Action 2.2 states that Malawi will plan and initiate at least four joint national intelligence driven operations, whilst milestone M3 for this action anticipates at least three joint national operations. Malawi reports on two joint operations completed with significant success, including Operation Disrupt in 2018, which resulted in 60 arrests and the recovery of 40 illegal firearms, in addition to seizures of ivory and other illegal wildlife products. These operations are commendable, and the results achieved demonstrate their value. Given that Malawi reports on only two joint operations, it seems that a rating of ‘on track’ might be more appropriate for this action, and the Party is encouraged to pursue further operations to fully implement this action. Action 2.3 is evaluated as ‘pending completion of another action’. The Secretariat is of the opinion that the action should be evaluated as having achieved ‘partial progress’ since its implementation is not pending the completion of another action in the NIAP but rather pending supportive action by other government agencies.
66. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report to SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies Malawi as one of the countries of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa. The report states that Malawi was previously identified as one of the countries with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade from countries with such industries involves the use of couriers, predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body. Malawi is encouraged to consider these findings, in particular in the context of actions 2.1, 2.2, 2.3 and 3.2 in its NIAP.
67. In light of the progress made, the Secretariat recommends an overall rating of ‘partial progress’ for Malawi, in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Malaysia

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Malaysia's assessment (SC70)	18% (2 of 11 actions)	55% (6 of 11 actions)	27% (3 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	0% (0 of 11 actions)	27% (3 of 11 actions)	73% (8 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)	0% (0 of 11 actions)

68. At SC69 the Standing Committee concluded that, in the light of the continued role of Malaysia as a transit hub for illegal ivory consignments, it would be appropriate for the Party to revise and update its NIAP to ensure that the actions in the NIAP sufficiently respond to ongoing trafficking in ivory affecting Malaysia as transit country, and agreed recommendation t) i) and ii) presented in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1).
69. Malaysia submitted its [revised and updated NIAP](#) to the Secretariat on 22 June 2018. The Secretariat assessed the NIAP as ‘adequate,’ made it available in the NIAP web page, and informed the Party accordingly. The revised and updated NIAP of Malaysia contains 11 priority actions, of which Malaysia in its progress report to the present meeting, evaluates two actions as ‘achieved’, six as ‘substantially achieved’ and three as ‘on track’.
70. The report on progress with the implementation of its revised and updated NIAP submitted by Malaysia to the present meeting is available as Annex 15 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.

71. The Secretariat notes and commends the enforcement activities undertaken by the Royal Malaysian Customs Department in 2017, resulting in the confiscation of approximately 4000kg of ivory, as highlighted in the report. The report also states that the Department of Wildlife and National Parks in collaboration with other enforcement agencies had intensified measures to combat illegal ivory trade at all entry and exit points nation-wide, including through intelligence sharing, roadblocks and joint operations. The report further states that activities are ongoing to strengthen national legislation and regulations and to develop national level risk profiles and indicators to combat wildlife trafficking. The Secretariat commends Malaysia for pursuing these activities, which are fully in line with the observations made by the Secretariat in paragraphs 117 and 118 of document SC69 Doc. 29.3, as mentioned in the recommendations adopted by the Committee at SC69.
72. Upon review of Malaysia's progress report to SC70, the Secretariat notes that regarding action 1.2 anticipating the review of wildlife crime cases to court to identify measures to improve successful prosecution rates, it was difficult for the Secretariat to determine from the information provided what the status of this review currently is. Malaysia may wish to elaborate further on this at the present meeting. Regarding actions 2.1 and 5.2 the information provided is also limited, but seems to suggest that Standard Operating Procedures have been drafted and consulted with relevant stakeholders but not yet completely established or implemented, as foreseen in the revised and updated NIAP. The Secretariat therefore believes that a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate for these actions.
73. Regarding action 2.2, the Secretariat notes that a coordination meeting to plan Malaysia's capacity-building programmes for the year 2018 has taken place, in accordance with milestone M1 in the revised and updated NIAP. The Secretariat welcomes the capacity-building activities conducted as reported upon, but notes that all these activities were concluded before the revised and updated NIAP was approved and submitted to the Secretariat in June 2018. Considering that the revised and updated NIAP at the time of submission did not indicate that milestones M2 and M3 for action 2.2 are completed, as is done for other milestones that were completed at the time of submission, for example milestone M1 for action 2.2, it is the understanding of the Secretariat that it was at the time of submission of the revised and updated NIAP, the clear intention of Malaysia to conduct future activities to implement this action. The Secretariat notes that it would not have accepted the revised and updated NIAP submitted in accordance with the provisions of SC69 recommendation t), as adequate, if all milestones for activity 2.2 had shown as completed at the time of submission. This would have undermined the purpose of the NIAP, which should include the urgent measures that Malaysia commits to deliver to deal with an ongoing problem, which has not yet been resolved through activities implemented in the past. The Secretariat further notes that it is essential for any capacity-building activities initiated in the context of the NIAP, to include as a key component, addressing ivory trafficking. As reported upon in document SC70 Doc. 27.4, paragraph 25, the Secretariat received generous funding from the United States of America in accordance with the provisions of Decision 17.82, to support NIAP implementation. This funding could be mobilized to support the implementation of this NIAP action, and Malaysia is invited to reach out to the Secretariat in this regard, if needed. Taking into consideration the above, and acknowledging that capacity-building activities were conducted, the Secretariat considers that a rating of 'on track' for action 2.2 is more appropriate.
74. Regarding action 2.4, no information is provided on progress with the development of country-specific national level risk profiles and indicators to combat wildlife trafficking. Given the lack of information it has not been possible for the Secretariat to evaluate progress on this action, and Malaysia may wish to elaborate on this at the present meeting, to justify the allocated rating. Regarding action 3.1, Malaysia is well on track to achieve the implementation of this action, and is commended for its interaction with other Parties through participation in various regional and international events and initiatives. The Secretariat however notes that only one of the activities listed under this action was implemented after the submission of the revised and updated NIAP, and therefore considers that a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate. Regarding action 3.2, rated by Malaysia as "Substantially achieved", the Secretariat notes that the meeting to coordinate the investigation and management of ivory seizures has taken place in accordance with milestone M1 of the revised and updated NIAP. Further information however is not provided with regards to the drafting of a protocol on DNA sampling and the sharing of the results of DNA analysis with other Parties, which in accordance with the milestones in the revised and updated NIAP is only due for completion at future dates. The Secretariat therefore believes that a rating of 'on track' would

be more appropriate for this action. Regarding action 5.1, although not mentioned in the progress report submitted by Malaysia, the Secretariat can confirm that it in April 2018 received a report on government held stockpiles, including ivory stockpiles, from Malaysia. The Secretariat would like to thank Malaysia for the report submitted.

75. Overall, the Secretariat welcomes the progress made by Malaysia in implementing its revised and updated NIAP, noting that the milestones for most of the actions in the revised and updated NIAP fall beyond the current reporting period. The Secretariat further notes that the limited information provided against some actions impeded the ability of the Secretariat to make its own assessment. The Standing Committee may wish to request Malaysia to provide sufficiently detailed reporting in its next report on progress with NIAP implementation, to justify progress ratings allocated to its NIAP actions, and to enable the Secretariat to fully assess the progress made.
76. In the light of the above, the Secretariat recommends an overall rating of 'partial progress', in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.

Nigeria

77. Nigeria did not submit its report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC69 in advance of the meeting, as required by Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*. Nigeria did however at SC69, present a report that was made available as document SC69 Inf. 46.¹⁸
78. The Standing Committee subsequently agreed recommendation n) i) and ii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), noting that Nigeria submitted a progress report available as an information document, and requesting the Secretariat to evaluate the report and bring any matters arising to the attention of the Committee as may be needed.
79. The Secretariat takes this opportunity to respectfully draw the attention of the Committee to the fact that Nigeria has, since it was requested by the Committee at its 65th meeting (SC65, Geneva, 2014), to develop and implement a NIAP, not submitted a single report on progress with NIAP implementation to the Secretariat in time for progress to be assessed and reflected in the document the Secretariat prepares for consideration by the Committee at its meetings.
80. Following the recommendation agreed by the Committee at SC69, the Secretariat conducted a more detailed analysis of the progress reports received from Nigeria during or after Committee meetings over the past years. The Secretariat shares the following findings:

There are 25 priority actions set out in Nigeria's NIAP.

- a) In the report submitted by Nigeria after SC66, it did not report on 16 of the 25 actions in its NIAP, namely: A3, A4, A6, all of B (4 actions), C2, C4, C5, all of D (5 actions) and E5.
- b) In the report submitted by Nigeria in accordance with Recommendation c) in document SC67 Doc. 13, the Party did not report on 11 of the 25 actions in its NIAP, namely: A4, A6, B2, B4, C5, all of D (5 actions) and E5.
- c) In the report made available as document SC69 Inf. 46, Nigeria did not report on 7 of the 25 actions in its NIAP, namely: A6, B2, B3, B4, D2, D4 and E5.
81. Upon review of document SC69 Inf. 46, submitted by Nigeria at SC69, the Secretariat found that it was not possible to evaluate progress made, as the report with regard to most actions either did not provide any, or provided insufficient justification for the rating provided. The reporting also did not follow the logical structure of the NIAP. The Secretariat formally wrote to Nigeria on 9 January 2018 advising the Party that it was not able to evaluate the report, and requesting Nigeria to revise its progress report and to submit the revised report to the Secretariat no later than 31 January 2018. The Secretariat received the revised report from Nigeria incorporating some of the further details requested by the Secretariat to enable better assessment,

¹⁸ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/69/inf/E-SC69-Inf-46.pdf>

within the set deadline.¹⁹ Upon review of this revised progress report, the Secretariat found that, amongst others, more details were necessary to justify a number of allocated progress ratings. The Secretariat for example concluded that for action A3 in the NIAP, a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate than the rating 'achieved', given that the essence of the action is not yet achieved. Similarly, for action B2 a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate than 'achieved', given the low number of personnel trained and the need for expanding this activity substantially. For actions B3 and C1 the information did not seem to be sufficient to justify the allocated ratings, and for actions D4, E1, E3, E4 and E5 the activities listed only partially responded to the milestones set, hence the ratings of 'achieved' seemed premature, and a rating of 'on track' seemed to be more appropriate for these actions. For actions D5 and E2, the Secretariat concluded that a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate, since the activities listed do not fully satisfy the action set out in the NIAP.

82. For the present meeting, Nigeria again did not submit a report on progress with its NIAP implementation. In preparing its document for the present meeting, the Secretariat informally consulted with ETIS, requesting information on the latest data on Nigeria available to ETIS. The Secretariat would like to thank ETIS for the information provided. The information shows that there has been an increase in ivory seizures made in Nigeria prior to export abroad. In the period 2009-2011 authorities in Nigeria, prior to export from the country, made 11 seizures involving approximately 488 kg ivory, in the period 2012-2014, 20 seizures involving approximately 987 kg ivory were made, and in the period 2015-2017, 21 seizures involving approximately 3 126 kg ivory were made. What raises significant concern however, is the increase in the quantities of ivory seized by other countries, where Nigeria is identified as part of the illegal trade chain. This number rose from approximately 5 629 kg ivory in the period 2009-2011, to approximately 11 769 kg ivory in the period 2012-2014, and to approximately 12 211 kg ivory in the period 2015-2017. This highlights the urgent need for action to be taken in Nigeria to intensify and expand activities to progress the implementation of its NIAP.
83. In May 2018, the Secretariat conducted a mission to Nigeria in the context of the application of the Article XIII process. The Secretariat reports in detail on the results of this mission in document SC70 Doc. 27.3.5 on *Application of Article XIII in Nigeria*, prepared for the present meeting. The Secretariat notes that the findings made during the mission also raise significant concerns regarding illegal trade in other CITES-listed specimens from Nigeria. An analysis done by the Secretariat on illegal trade in pangolin scales associated with Nigeria, for example shows that the quantity of pangolin scales seized in Nigeria or by other Parties after it left Nigeria, escalated significantly in recent years. These escalated from approximately 2000 kg in 2015, to approximately 7 721 kg in 2016, approximately 7 658 kg in 2017, and to approximately 23 987 kg in the seven-month period between 1 January and 31 July 2018. Customs authorities made most of the ivory and pangolin scale seizures within Nigeria. These include three seizures between 1 January and 31 July 2018, totaling 12,264 kg of pangolin scales and 343 kg of ivory. The cases were transferred from Customs authorities to the National Environmental Standards and Regulations Enforcement Agency (NESREA) for further investigation, and investigations are reported to be ongoing.
84. Considering available information suggests that organized crime groups are increasingly targeting Nigeria as a country through and from which illegal trade in wildlife is conducted, the constant failure of the Party in reporting on progress with its NIAP implementation in a timely manner, and the lack of sufficient information in the reports submitted, is of concern. This impedes the ability of the Secretariat and the Committee to understand the progress made by Nigeria in implementing measures and activities to address illegal trade in ivory as it affects the Party. The significant escalation in quantities of ivory and other wildlife specimens seized by Parties elsewhere, identifying Nigeria as part of the illegal trade chain, demonstrate the urgent need for Nigeria to engage fully in the NIAP process, amongst others.
85. The reporting of Nigeria does not conform to the timeframe and provisions set in Step 4, paragraphs a) and b), of the *Guidelines*, and pose a challenge in determining the engagement of the Party in the NIAP process and progress with NIAP implementation. The Secretariat notes that in accordance with the milestones set by Nigeria in its NIAP, the Party committed to implement the actions in its NIAP by October 2016. The urgent measures the Party committed to implement have fallen well behind schedule, and the escalation of illegal trade in ivory and other wildlife specimens from Nigeria suggest that there is significant room for improvement to scale up efforts to implement measures and activities to address ivory trafficking and progress NIAP implementation. The Committee may wish to, in line with Step 4, paragraph f), of the

¹⁹ https://cites.org/sites/default/files/common/prog/niaps/Nigeria_NIAP_PR_Post-SC69_posted%20on%20website.pdf

Guidelines, consider if any measures in accordance with Resolution Conf. 14.3 on *CITES compliance procedures*, is needed.

Qatar

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Qatar's self - assessment (SC70)	33% (5 of 15 actions)	27% (4 of 15 actions)	40% (6 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	33% (5 of 15 actions)	20% (3 of 15 actions)	40% (6 of 15 actions)	7% (1 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)

86. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation b) i) and ii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), and included Qatar in the NIAP process requesting the Party to develop and implement a NIAP in accordance with the *Guidelines*.
87. The Secretariat upon invitation from Qatar conducted a mission to the Party in February 2018, to observe measures and activities in place in Qatar to combat illegal trade in wildlife, in particular ivory trafficking as it affects Qatar, and to support the Party in the development of its NIAP. The Secretariat would like to thank the government of Qatar for the generous funding it provided, which enabled the Secretariat to undertake the mission. The Secretariat also takes this opportunity to thank the CITES Management Authority of Qatar for the mission program it developed, which enabled the Secretariat to meet with representatives from various agencies in Qatar with a role in combating wildlife crime, including ivory trafficking, and to conduct a site visit to Hamad International Airport (HIA). The Secretariat believes that the request of the Standing Committee to Qatar to develop and implement a NIAP was timely. The activities conducted during and after the mission facilitated bringing different authorities together to discuss key gaps in the national response of Qatar to illegal trade in wildlife affecting the Party as a transit country, identifying relevant legislation to apply, and agreeing important measures and procedures to implement.
88. Pursuant to the Committee's recommendation, Qatar submitted its NIAP to the Secretariat in March 2018. The Secretariat in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines* assessed the NIAP as 'adequate', and informed the Party accordingly.
89. The NIAP of Qatar contains 15 priority actions. Qatar's self-assessment on progress with NIAP implementation prepared for the present meeting, available as Annex 18 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, evaluates five actions as 'achieved', four as 'substantially achieved', and six as being 'on track'.
90. Overall, the Secretariat welcomes the rapid progress made by Qatar in implementing its NIAP, noting that the milestones for most of the actions in the NIAP fall beyond the current reporting period. Qatar reports, *inter alia*, on the establishment of a formal collaboration mechanism to facilitate cooperation and collaboration between different governmental agencies operating at HIA, ongoing work to put in place arrangements to mobilize operations targeting passengers from high risk countries, and a variety of measures and activities initiated and implemented by Qatar Airways. The Party also reports on a training workshop for law enforcement officers working at HIA, which was at the time of reporting scheduled to take place in July 2018. Qatar may wish to provide an oral update on this at the present meeting.
91. Parties are invited to consult the full report received from Qatar for detailed information on the activities conducted by the Party to date, to progress NIAP implementation.
92. Upon review of Qatar's progress report to the present meeting, the Secretariat considers that a rating of 'partial progress' for action C3 would be more appropriate than 'on track', given that according to the milestone associated with this action in the NIAP, the exchange of information and intelligence across

the illegal trade chain should already have started. The Secretariat would further encourage Qatar to rate action E3 as 'on track' rather than 'substantially achieved', as the essence of the action (i.e. the submission of the illegal trade report to the Secretariat) has not yet been achieved.

93. The Secretariat notes the seizure of approximately 3.1 kg of cut rhinoceros horn made by Customs authorities in Hong Kong SAR of China,²⁰ in June 2018, alleged to have originated from Mozambique, transiting through South Africa and Qatar to Hong Kong SAR. Illegal ivory and rhinoceros horn consignments from Mozambique have in the past often been associated with Qatar as a transit country. This is also highlighted in document SC69 Doc. 29.3. In this regard, Qatar is encouraged to be vigilant in the implementation of the actions outlined in its NIAP, in particular actions B4, B5, C1, C2 and C3, and to pursue strengthening collaboration with authorities in Mozambique as a matter of priority.
94. The Committee may wish to in line with Step 4, paragraph e) of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Qatar.

Togo

95. The Standing Committee agreed during the postal procedure on NIAPs that followed CoP17, that Togo be included in the NIAP process. In the Addendum to document SC69 Doc. 29.3, the Secretariat reported that, although not in accordance with the timeframe set by the Conference of the Parties in the *Guidelines*, it received the NIAP from Togo and assessed it in accordance with Step 3, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, concluding that some revisions to the NIAP were required before it could be accepted as 'adequate'.
96. At SC69, the Committee agreed recommendation f) i) and ii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), noting that Togo did not submit its NIAP to the Secretariat in accordance with the timeframe set by the Conference of the Parties in Step 2, paragraph b), of the *Guidelines*. The Committee requested Togo to submit its revised NIAP to the Secretariat for assessment in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines*, to commence implementation as soon as the revised NIAP is accepted as 'adequate', and to provide associated reporting in accordance with the provisions set out in the *Guidelines*.
97. Pursuant to the Standing Committee's recommendation, Togo submitted its revised NIAP to the Secretariat on 16 February 2018. In accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines*, the Secretariat assessed the revised NIAP submitted by Togo as 'adequate' and informed the Party accordingly.
98. Togo did not submit a report on progress with its NIAP implementation for the present meeting in accordance with Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*.
99. The Secretariat encourages Togo to submit its progress report ahead of SC70, so the Standing Committee can consider its progress with NIAP implementation alongside that of the other NIAP Parties. If a progress report is not received from Togo, the Committee might consider inviting Togo, if present, to provide an oral update on its progress at the present meeting.
100. In the absence of such reports or oral updates to SC70, the Standing Committee may wish to, in line with Step 4, paragraph f), of the *Guidelines*, consider appropriate measures, in accordance with Resolution Conf. 14.3 on *CITES Compliance Procedures*, to ensure compliance with the NIAP Process.

Viet Nam

101. In its observations to SC69, the Secretariat noted that Viet Nam no longer seems to be affected as a transit country for illegal ivory consignments only, and that information increasingly suggests that it is also a destination country for such consignments. The Secretariat also noted that the closure of domestic ivory markets in China creates the risk that illegal trade might be displaced to its neighbouring countries, including Viet Nam, and that given the findings of the ETIS Report, this might already be the case.
102. The Secretariat further noted that available information indicates that criminal syndicates heavily involved in the trafficking in rhinoceros horn, ivory, tiger and other illicit wildlife specimens continue to operate in

²⁰ https://www.customs.gov.hk/en/publication_press/press/index_id_2204.html

Viet Nam, and that it remains crucial for the Party to further scale up law enforcement efforts, and to continue to initiate operations, to combat illegal trade in wildlife both in its domestic markets and at the international level. The Secretariat concluded that the positive progress made by the Party is seriously undermined by the activities of individuals and organised groups involved in illegal trade in wildlife, that remain active in Viet Nam.

103. Against this background, the Committee at SC69 agreed Recommendation u), in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), requesting Viet Nam to, taking into consideration the observations made by the Secretariat in paragraph 143 of document SC69 Doc. 29.3, revise and update its NIAP in accordance with Step 2 of the *Guidelines*, and to develop a combined National Ivory and Rhinoceros Action Plan (NIRAP), commence implementation, and provide associated reporting.
104. Following SC69, the Secretariat met with the CITES Management Authority of Viet Nam on 27 March 2018, and provided inputs to a draft version of Viet Nam's NIRAP. Viet Nam in accordance with the time frame set in the *Guidelines*, submitted its NIRAP to the Secretariat on 30 March 2018. The NIRAP submitted by Viet Nam was however not finalized and further revisions were needed. The Secretariat considered the NIRAP in accordance with Step 3, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, and requested Viet Nam to in accordance with Step 3, paragraph b), of the *Guidelines*, make the required revisions and submit its revised and finalized NIRAP to the Secretariat. Viet Nam submitted the revised and finalized NIRAP to the Secretariat on 11 July 2018. The Secretariat in accordance with Step 3 of the *Guidelines* assessed the NIRAP as 'adequate', and informed the Party accordingly.
105. Pursuant to Recommendation u) ii) adopted at SC69, Viet Nam submitted a report on progress with the implementation of its NIRAP for the present meeting. Viet Nam did however not use the template for progress reports, as required by Step 4, paragraph b), of the *Guidelines*. It also did not do a self-assessment of its progress. Considering that the revised and finalized NIRAP was received by the Secretariat and assessed as 'adequate' in July 2018, when reporting on NIAP implementation to the present meeting was already due, the Secretariat considers this to be understandable. It would not be practical to expect from Viet Nam to provide a self-assessment of progress for the present meeting. The Secretariat believes that it will be reasonable for the Party to provide its first self-assessment report on progress made with the implementation of its NIRAP, in accordance with the provisions of Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, using the template for progress reports on NIAP implementation, to the next regular meeting of the Committee.
106. The report prepared by Viet Nam for the present meeting, is presented in Annex 24 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The same report is also available as Annex 19 to document SC70 Doc. 56 on *Rhinoceroses (Rhinocerotidae spp.)*, prepared by the Standing Committee Working Group on Rhinoceroses for the present meeting. Document SC70 Doc. 56 addresses the progress made by Viet Nam since SC69, with a particular focus on illegal trade in rhinoceros horn. The Secretariat notes that Viet Nam also provides additional information on the implementation of its NIRAP, in the preamble to its NIRAP, available on the NIAP web page.
107. Viet Nam reports, *inter alia*, on seizures and arrests regarding trafficking of ivory and rhinoceros horn, the inspection of facilities known to be involved in manufacturing and selling of souvenirs associated with animal specimens, and that 190 law enforcement officers were trained between October 2017 and June 2018, to enhance their investigation skills, the application of the Penal Code, and ivory and rhinoceros horn identification skills. The Party further reports that guidance for prosecutors on the handling of wildlife crime cases are under development, and on the collection of samples from seized specimens for forensic analyses. Viet Nam in the preamble to its NIRAP states that statistics on investigations, prosecutions and convictions for criminal offences, and the violation of administrative regulations in relation to illegal import, export, transport, trade, processing, possessing, advertisement, consumption of wildlife, including ivory and rhino horns, for the period October 2016 to November 2017, show that among 87 cases involving 127 suspects, 37 suspects have been sentenced to imprisonment for up to 3 years, while three suspects were imprisoned for three to seven years.
108. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report prepared for SC69 continues to identify Viet Nam as the second greatest destination for worked ivory products moving out of Africa. The report notes that Viet Nam represents 8% of the total number of seizures and 16% of the total weight of this trade. Viet Nam is encouraged to take this into consideration in the implementation of its NIRAP.

109. Overall, the reporting from Viet Nam indicates that progress has already been made in the implementation of a number of actions contained in its NIRAP. The Secretariat commends Viet Nam for the efforts it has made to secure the agreement and engagement of multiple national agencies, to support NIRAP implementation. The Secretariat also notes that the NIRAP of Viet Nam responds well to the observations made by the Secretariat in paragraph 143 of document SC69 Doc. 29.3. The continued dedication of Viet Nam to implement measures and activities to ensure sustained action to address ivory and rhinoceros horn trafficking as it affects Vietnam, are commendable, and demonstrate the firm commitment of the Party to build upon the progress made to date through sustained action.

Decisions 17.70, 17.73, paragraph b) and 17.76: Parties reporting to the present meeting that they have 'substantially achieved' their NIAPs

Ethiopia

% OF NIAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Ethiopia's assessment (following SC69)	27% (4 of 15 actions)	66% (10 of 15 actions)	7% (1 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)
Ethiopia's assessment (SC70)	20% (3 of 15 actions)	60% (9 of 15 actions)	20% (3 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	20% (3 of 15 actions)	40% (6 of 15 actions)	33% (5 of 15 actions)	7% (1 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)	0% (0 of 15 actions)

110. Ethiopia did not submit a report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC69 in accordance with the provisions of Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, and the Committee subsequently agreed Recommendations g) and h) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Ethiopia amongst others.

111. As requested by the Committee, the Secretariat following SC69 issued a warning letter to Ethiopia on behalf of the Committee, requesting the Party to submit its NIAP progress report to the Secretariat within 60 days of the conclusion of SC69. The Secretariat received this report within the set deadline, on 9 January 2018. The Secretariat conducted an informal assessment of the report received, and concluded that Ethiopia has made good progress with NIAP implementation since SC67. The Secretariat shared its findings and observations with Ethiopia.

112. The NIAP of Ethiopia includes 13 priority actions. Upon the advice from the Secretariat, Ethiopia rearranged the order of its NIAP actions in its report on progress with NIAP implementation received following SC69, to align them with the pillars of the new template for reporting on progress. This resulted in some milestones being converted into two additional actions, and Ethiopia now reports against 15 priority actions. The self-assessment report prepared by Ethiopia for the present meeting, available as Annex 10 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, evaluates three actions as 'achieved', nine as 'substantially achieved', and three as being 'on track'.

113. The report submitted for the present meeting highlights the implementation of a number of important measures and activities to progress NIAP implementation. This includes, *inter alia*, the finalization of draft national legislation and regulations which will make provision for stricter penalties for wildlife crime, ongoing work as part of a GEF-6 project in the country, an elaborate awareness raising campaign on the importance of combating wildlife crime, and an ivory destruction event in held in March 2015.

114. The Party also reports on the arrest of 231 offenders since 2015, in connection with poaching and wildlife trafficking, of which 169 (73.1%) were foreign nationals. Ethiopia reports that 182 of these offenders have at the time of reporting been penalized, nine with imprisonment and 173 with administrative fines. Most arrests were made at Addis Ababa Bole International Airport, and of the 169 arrested foreign nationals, 18 (10.65%) were departing from Ethiopia, whilst 151 (89.3%) were passengers coming from different countries in Africa on flights transiting in Ethiopia.
115. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Ethiopia for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report in Annex 10 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4, for detailed information.
116. Based on its self-assessment prepared for the present meeting, Ethiopia has 'achieved' its NIAP in accordance with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*. Upon evaluation of the report in accordance with Step 4, paragraph c), of the *Guidelines*, the Secretariat however concluded that the information provided did not in all cases provide sufficient details on the implemented activities to justify the allocated progress ratings, and that an overall rating of 'partial progress' might be more appropriate. The Secretariat elaborates in more detail on this in the paragraphs below.
117. Ethiopia has progressed well with the implementation of its NIAP since SC67. However, the report from Ethiopia prepared for the present meeting mainly repeats the information the Party provided in its report on progress with NIAP implementation following SC69. Regarding action 1.1 on improving the legal framework on wildlife crime with a focus on deterrents, Ethiopia down-rated the action from 'substantially achieved' to 'on track'. The Secretariat concurs that the latter is the more appropriate rating. Regarding action 1.2, the Secretariat also notes that Ethiopia down-rated this action from 'substantially achieved' to 'on track'. However, the Secretariat is of the opinion that a rating of 'partial progress' might be more appropriate for this action, considering that the report suggests that only one harmonized regional wildlife act has been drafted to date, and that the Ethiopian Wildlife Conservation Authority (EWCA) will continue to motivate and support other regional states to put in place harmonized regional wildlife legislation.
118. Action 3.2, rated by Ethiopia as 'substantially achieved', would be more appropriately rated as 'on track', given that several milestones are still unreached and Ethiopia itself thinks that 'only' 71.4% of the action have been achieved. (A 'substantially achieved' rating would be appropriate if at least 80% of an action have been achieved.)
119. With regard to action 3.4 Ethiopia states that 75% of milestones are achieved and that further work under the GEF 6 project in the country is anticipated. In the light of this a rating of 'substantially achieved' does not seem appropriate and could be replaced with a rating of 'on track'.
120. With regard to action 4.2, Ethiopia down-rated the action from 'achieved' to 'substantially achieved'. The Secretariat note that Ethiopia provided the same information on the implementation of this action in its report to the present meeting, as in its report following SC69. However, in its current report Ethiopia states that 83% of the milestones are achieved, while in its report following SC69, Ethiopia stated that 75% of the action has been achieved. Without any further information that would explain the increase in achievement, the Secretariat believes that a rating of 'on track' might be more appropriate.
121. Regarding action 3.1 under Pillar 3 in the progress report, it is unclear from the explanations provided by Ethiopia whether any cross border and regional cooperation agreements provided for in priority action D3 in Ethiopia's NIAP have been signed. It is however noted that multiple other activities have been conducted to support the implementation of this action. It will be good if Ethiopia could clarify if cross border and regional cooperation agreements might still be needed, or if the need for this has been mitigated in the light of the other activities conducted.
122. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report to SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies Ethiopia as one of the countries of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa. The report also states that Ethiopia were previously identified as one of the countries with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade involves the use of couriers,

predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body. Considering the content of paragraph 114 in the present document, this seems in particular relevant for Ethiopia, as also alluded to by the Party in its report prepared for the present meeting. Ethiopia is encouraged to continue to take this into consideration in the delivery and implementation of activities outlined in its NIAP.

123. In the light of the above, the Standing Committee may wish to in line with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'partial progress' for Ethiopia.

Mozambique

% OF NIRAP ACTIONS IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Mozambique's assessment (SC70)	56% (22 of 39 actions)	44% (17 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	54% (21 of 39 actions)	36% (14 of 39 actions)	10% (4 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)	0% (0 of 39 actions)

124. Mozambique was requested by the Standing Committee to develop a NIAP and a National Rhinoceros Action Plan. As a result, Mozambique prepared a combined National Ivory and Rhinoceros Action Plan (NIRAP). The [NIRAP of Mozambique](#) includes 39 priority actions. Mozambique's self-assessment report prepared for the present meeting evaluates 22 actions as 'achieved', and 17 as 'substantially achieved'.
125. At SC69, the Committee agreed Recommendation q) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), welcoming the progress made by Mozambique in implementing its NIRAP, and agreed an overall rating of 'partial progress' in line with Step, 4 paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*.
126. The report Mozambique prepared for the present meeting, is available as Annex 16 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The same report is also available as Annex 8 to document SC70 Doc. 56 on *Rhinoceroses* (*Rhinocerotidae* spp.), prepared by the Standing Committee Working Group on Rhinoceroses for the present meeting. Document SC70 Doc. 56 also provides an assessment of the progress made by Mozambique since SC69, with a particular focus on rhinoceros poaching and illegal trade in rhinoceros horn.
127. The report prepared by Mozambique for the present meeting is comprehensive and shows that continued progress were made with NIAP implementation. A minimum of 80% of NIAP actions are now self-assessed as 'substantially achieved', and the remaining actions are self-assessed as 'on track' for achievement. The report prepared for the present meeting includes information already reported by Mozambique in its reports to previous meetings of the Standing Committee. However, except for the actions pointed out in paragraph 130 below, the Secretariat believes that the report prepared for the present meeting provides sufficient details on the implemented activities to justify the allocated progress ratings. Mozambique is now able to report its NIRAP as 'Achieved', in accordance with Step 5, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*.
128. The report submitted by Mozambique for the present meeting highlights the substantial measures and activities implemented and conducted by the Party to implement its NIRAP, and the Secretariat welcomes the further progress made by Mozambique in implementing its NIRAP. Mozambique amongst others reports that since the entry into force of the new amended Conservation Law, 372 poachers were arrested, of which 25 were convicted to date. It is also reported that 3 455.9 kg ivory and 42 kg rhinoceros horn were seized. It should be noted however, that the vast majority of ivory seized, resulted from a single

seizure at the port in Maputo, as elaborated upon in paragraph 134 below. Mozambique reports that measures are being implemented to improve the management and security of confiscated ivory and rhinoceros horn. The Party is encouraged to, as far as possible, use its central strong room for the storage of confiscated ivory and rhinoceros horn, in particular considering that Mozambique in its report indicates that the large quantity of the ivory seized at the port in Maputo is believed to have originated from a provincial storage facility in Mozambique.

129. The Party reports on a GEF-6 funded project on 'Strengthening the conservation of globally threatened species in Mozambique through improving biodiversity enforcement and expanding community conservancies around protected areas', being implemented in the country, and which is expected to significantly contribute to strengthening law enforcement in Mozambique to address wildlife crime. Mozambique further reports on the establishment of the National Criminal Investigation Service (SERNIC), which amongst others, aims to monitor crime trends, including for wildlife crime, and gathering intelligence on such crimes. The Party also reports it is envisaged that the Wildlife Crime Unit to be established with funding from the GEF-6 project, will in the near future coordinate all investigations on wildlife crime in Mozambique. Against action D7 in its NIRAP, Mozambique reports that it will work with South Africa to consider the feasibility of establishing a project for the two Parties to jointly conduct operations at points of entry and exit to combat illegal trade in wildlife. Mozambique and South Africa are encouraged to continue their deliberations to pursue this matter, in the light of what seem to be an increase in the number of illegal consignments of in particular rhinoceros horn, originating from Mozambique, and transiting through South Africa, without being detected by authorities in either of these two countries.²¹
130. The Secretariat notes that actions B.7, E.2, E.9 and F.2 are now evaluated with ratings higher than those given by Mozambique in its reporting to SC69. However, no additional information is provided by Mozambique to explain the improved ratings. With regards to action E.2, the Secretariat in the document it prepared for SC69 noted that more than half of the villages in question seem to be still awaiting resettlement, and the report prepared for the present meeting received from Mozambique seems to suggest that no further progress was made. Also in the document it prepared for SC69, the Secretariat regarding action E9, commended Mozambique for acknowledging the difficulty in implementing this action. The information provided in the report prepared by Mozambique for the present meeting, does not seem to justify the new allocated progress rating for this action. The Secretariat believes that actions B.7, E.2, E.9 and F.2 should be rated as 'on track', as implementation of these actions is still ongoing. The Secretariat further continues to observe that while welcoming cooperation between Mozambique and Viet Nam, it is unclear as to why these activities are reported under action D.6.
131. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Mozambique for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
132. The ETIS Report prepared for CoP16 identified Mozambique as a Category B Party. Mozambique has however since then moved to a category of lesser prominence, and the ETIS Report prepared for CoP17 identify Mozambique as a Category C Party. The report prepared by Mozambique for the present meeting, demonstrates continued efforts and measures being implemented to address poaching and ivory and rhinoceros horn trafficking as it affects Mozambique.
133. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report prepared for SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies Mozambique as one of the Parties of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa, in particular through air transport via Qatar in the case of Mozambique. The report states that Mozambique has previously been identified as one of the Parties with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade involves the use of couriers, predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body. In this context, activities conducted as reported upon against action E13 in the NIRAP seem to have delivered good results, but the Secretariat notes that since

²¹ <https://allafrica.com/stories/201806190166.html>

July 2017, no further similar activities are reported. Mozambique is encouraged to pursue these activities further, to also address illegal trade in ivory associated with domestic markets.

134. Good work is being done in Mozambique, as is exemplified by the seizure of six containers containing 3354.2 kg ivory at the Maputo International Marine Point, on 12 April 2018, and the seizure of 4.2 kg rhinoceros horn at Maputo International Airport, in April 2018. Regarding the 12 April 2018 ivory seizure, the CITES Management Authority of Mozambique, the National Administration for Conservation Areas (ANAC), at the time informed the Secretariat that the matter is under investigation. The Secretariat is pleased to note that the report prepared by Mozambique for the present meeting, highlights that offenders involved have been arrested and that further investigations are ongoing. Whilst acknowledging the actions taken by law enforcement authorities in Mozambique, the Secretariat also notes that these seizures suggest that Mozambique continues to be heavily targeted by organized crime groups involved in illegal trade in wildlife. This is also highlighted by seizures made in other countries, implicating Mozambique as country of origin, for example the seizure of rhinoceros horn by authorities in Hong Kong SAR of China in June 2018,²² allegedly originating from Mozambique.
135. The extensive measures and activities undertaken by Mozambique to implement its NIRAP are commendable. The Secretariat notes however, that in the case of Mozambique, urgent and sustained action to address illegal trade in ivory and rhinoceros horn remains essential. Mozambique continues to be affected by poaching and illegal trade in ivory and rhinoceros horn, and this justify further measures and activities being undertaken. In particular, such measures and activities could focus on detecting and preventing illegal ivory and rhinoceros horn consignments from being smuggled through ports in Mozambique, and further strengthening efforts to gather intelligence about the members of criminal syndicates that continue to operate from Mozambique, to map out these criminal networks, and to initiate intelligence driven operations and investigations to address them. The work conducted by SERNIC and the envisaged Wildlife Crime Unit to be established with funding from the GEF-6 project, seems particularly relevant in this regard.
136. Mozambique has implemented its NIRAP, and the implementation of a variety of measures and activities to enhance and strengthen its responses to poaching, illegal trade in ivory and illegal trade in rhinoceros horn continues. The progress reported by Mozambique meets the requirements in Step 5, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*. The Committee may wish to commend the Party for achieving its NIRAP, and to in line with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'Achieved' for Mozambique.
137. The Secretariat recommends that Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines* be applied to Mozambique. The Secretariat believes that it is premature for Mozambique to exit the NIAP process at this time, but also that further measures and activities needed could be achieved without revising and updating the NIRAP at present.
138. The Committee may wish to request Mozambique to report to its 73rd meeting, on any further measures and activities implemented to address poaching and illegal trade in ivory and rhinoceros horn as it affects Mozambique, and to complete the implementation of any NIRAP actions that have not yet been 'Achieved'.

The United Republic of Tanzania

% of NIAP actions IN EACH CATEGORY						
	Achieved	Substantially achieved	On track	Partial progress	Pending completion of another action	Not commenced
Tanzania's assessment (following SC69)	47% (9 of 19 actions)	32% (6 of 19 actions)	21% (4 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)

²² <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2018-06-18-rhino-horn-slips-past-security-uncovered-in-hong-kong/>

Tanzania's assessment (SC70)	58% (11 of 19 actions)	37% (7 of 19 actions)	5% (1 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)
Secretariat's assessment (SC70)	52.5% (10 of 19 actions)	37% (7 of 19 actions)	10.5% (2 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)	0% (0 of 19 actions)

139. The NIAP of the United Republic of Tanzania contains 19 priority actions.²³ The United Republic of Tanzania's self-assessment prepared for the present meeting evaluates 11 actions in its NIAP as 'achieved', seven as 'substantially achieved', and one as 'on track'.
140. The United Republic of Tanzania did not submit a report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC69 in accordance with the provisions of Step 4, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*, and the Committee agreed recommendations g) and h) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1),²⁴ directed to the United Republic of Tanzania, amongst others.
141. As requested by the Committee, the Secretariat following SC69 issued a warning letter to the United Republic of Tanzania on behalf of the Committee, requesting the Party to submit its NIAP progress report to the Secretariat within 60 days of the conclusion of SC69. The Secretariat received this report²⁵ within the set deadline, on 30 January 2018. Although the United Republic of Tanzania did not use the template for reporting on progress with NIAP implementation, it provided adequate information to substantiate the self-assessment it provided. The Secretariat conducted an informal assessment of the report received after SC69, and shared its findings with the United Republic of Tanzania. In its report prepared for the present meeting, the United Republic of Tanzania clarifies that its progress report following SC69 contained ratings for 19 priority actions and that the action of reporting in the NIAP should not have been considered by the Secretariat in its assessment. Although there was a discrepancy in the interpretation of the SC69 report by the United Republic of Tanzania and the Secretariat as pointed out by the United Republic of Tanzania in its report prepared for the present meeting, the assessments largely concurred, and the report reflected good progress with NIAP implementation since the 67th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC67).²⁶
142. The Secretariat welcomes the further progress made by the United Republic of Tanzania in implementing its NIAP, as reflected in the Party's report to the present meeting, available as Annex 23 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The Secretariat notes that the progress report included two annexes, which were marked as 'confidential' by the United Republic of Tanzania, and for this reason the two annexes were removed by the Secretariat. A minimum of 80% of NIAP actions are self-assessed as 'substantially achieved', and the remaining actions are self-assessed as 'on track' for achievement, by the United Republic of Tanzania. The Secretariat believes that the report prepared for the present meeting, except for the actions pointed out in paragraph 144 below, provides sufficient details on the implemented activities to justify the allocated progress ratings. The United Republic of Tanzania is now able to report its NIAP as 'Achieved', in accordance with Step 5, paragraph a), of the *Guidelines*.
143. In its report prepared for the present meeting, the United Republic of Tanzania explains under action 1.2, that action 1.5 ('Enactment of the Tanzania Wildlife Management Authority Act') as contained in its report on progress with NIAP implementation to SC67, might not be needed because the current structure of the Tanzania Wildlife Management Authority (TAWA) enables it to operate within the existing legal framework. In the light of this the United Republic of Tanzania reports on the introduction of a new action 1.5, on the 'Improvement of prosecutions of wildlife related cases', which is in line with SC66

²³The NIAP of Tanzania is not publicly available. Prior to CoP17, the Secretariat did not have a mandate to make the NIAPs of Category A Parties available publicly. CoP17 adopted Decision 17.79, directing the Secretariat to make all NIAPs and progress reports publicly available on the CITES NIAP webpage. The NIAPs of all Category A Parties received after CoP17 are available on the NIAP webpage.

²⁴ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/69/sum/E-SC69-Sum-10-R1.pdf>

²⁵ https://cites.org/sites/default/files/common/prog/niaps/NIAP_PR_Post-SC69_with%20Annexes.pdf

²⁶ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/67/E-SC67-13.pdf>

recommendation h) ii) B), contained in document SC66 COM. 1 (Rev. by Sec.).²⁷ The United Republic of Tanzania also reports that it has refocused action 2.2 to implement the 2014 National Anti-Poaching Strategy, as it encapsulates the previous action addressed at establishing a multi-agency task team. The Secretariat believes that, in the light of the clarifications provided by the United Republic of Tanzania, these changes are appropriate.

144. Regarding action 4.2, the Secretariat welcomes the progress made towards genetic identification of elephant tusks. The information provided does however not report on aspects related to the mapping of the available data, and the United Republic of Tanzania may wish to elaborate on this at the present meeting. Regarding action 4.3, the Secretariat notes that the updated Tanzania Elephant Management Plan still needs to be validated at a stakeholders' workshop, and be approved and published. The Secretariat would therefore suggest a rating of 'on track' for this action. Regarding action 7.1 the Secretariat noted a discrepancy between the rating of the action in parts B (summary evaluation of actions) and C (detailed evaluation of actions) of the progress report to SC70. The Secretariat is of the opinion that this action should be rated as 'substantially achieved'.
145. Subsequent to submitting its report on progress with NIAP implementation for SC70, the United Republic of Tanzania provided a further update to the Secretariat regarding actions 1.3. and 7.2 in its NIAP. The Party informed the Secretariat that the process of publishing the CITES Implementation Regulations 2018 and the Wildlife Management Areas Regulations 2018 in the Government Gazette has been completed. The two regulations shared with the Secretariat in the further reporting received from the United Republic of Tanzania are available as an addendum to the progress report from the United Republic of Tanzania in Annex 23 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. In the light of this additional information, the Secretariat concurs with the United Republic of Tanzania's rating of these actions as 'achieved'.
146. In preparing its report for the present meeting, the Secretariat informally consulted with ETIS, requesting information on the latest data on the United Republic of Tanzania available to ETIS. The Secretariat would like to thank ETIS for the information provided. The information shows that there has been a decrease in ivory seizures made in the United Republic of Tanzania prior to export abroad. In the period 2009-2011 authorities in the United Republic of Tanzania prior to export from the country, made 75 seizures involving approximately 5 594 kg ivory, in the period 2012-2014, 270 seizures involving approximately 14 067 kg ivory were made, and in the period 2015-2017, 137 seizures involving approximately 3 981 kg ivory were made. The number of seizures prior to export abroad were significantly lower in the period 2015-2017, considering that only 137 seizures were made compared to 270 seizures in the period 2012-2014. Although the number of seizures made in Tanzania before the illegal consignments leave the country decreased in the period 2015-2017, it still remains high and this suggests good law enforcement action. This reduction should also be seen in the context of the significant decrease in the quantities of ivory seized by other countries, where the United Republic of Tanzania is identified as part of the illegal trade chain, suggesting that less ivory is leaving the country. In the light of this it seems logical that in country seizures would also decrease. Regarding the quantities of ivory seized by other countries, where the United Republic of Tanzania is identified as part of the illegal trade chain, the numbers decreased from 26 seizures involving approximately 27 857 kg ivory in the period 2009-2011, to 22 seizures involving approximately 31 264 kg ivory in the period 2012-2014, and to 13 seizures involving approximately 7 966 kg ivory in the period 2015-2017. The quantity of ivory which was seized both in the United Republic of Tanzania and by other countries where the United Republic of Tanzania was identified as part of the illegal trade chain, in the period 2015 to 2017, remained high, and totals almost 12 tonnes in this three-year period. It is however encouraging to observe the significant downward trend in the period 2015-2017, compared to previous periods. This suggest that the measures and activities taken by the United Republic of Tanzania are delivering results. To continue these downward trends, the need to be vigilant and to sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal trade in ivory remains essential for the United Republic of Tanzania, and the Party is encouraged to continue to take strong action, to build upon the progress made to date.
147. The report on progress with NIAP implementation prepared by the United Republic of Tanzania for the present meeting highlights a number of activities suggesting that positive action continues to be taken to address elephant poaching and illegal ivory trade as it affects the United Republic of Tanzania. These

²⁷ <https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/66/Com/E-SC66-Com-01%28RevbySec%29.pdf>

include a number of arrests made in the current reporting period and continued workshops on prosecution as reported against action 1.5, the undertaking of anti-poaching actions as reported against action 2.1, the acquisition of equipment as reported against action 2.4, successes achieved by the sniffer dog unit in Dar es Salaam reported against action 2.5, and others. In addition, the Party reports positive overall downward trends in poaching levels, with the exception of the Ruaha-Rungwa area.

148. The extensive measures and activities undertaken by the United Republic of Tanzania to implement the NIAP are commendable. As pointed out in paragraph 142 above, a minimum of 80% of actions in the NIAP of the United Republic of Tanzania are now assessed as 'substantially achieved', and the remaining actions as 'on track' for achievement. In the light of this, the Committee may wish to in line with Step 4, paragraph e), of the *Guidelines*, consider an overall rating of 'Achieved' for the United Republic of Tanzania, and to commend the Party for achieving its NIAP. The Standing Committee may further wish to encourage the Party to complete the implementation of any NIAP actions that have not yet been 'achieved'.
149. The United Republic of Tanzania implemented comprehensive measures and activities to combat poaching and illegal trade in ivory. Considering that the quantity of ivory seized both in the United Republic of Tanzania and by other countries where the United Republic of Tanzania are identified as part of the illegal trade chain, remained high in the period 2015 to 2017, the need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal trade in ivory continues to exist in the case of the United Republic of Tanzania. The Secretariat however believes that further activities can be pursued outside the NIAP process, and therefore recommends that the United Republic of Tanzania exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
150. Sustained action by the United Republic of Tanzania to address poaching and illegal trade in ivory remains essential, and in the light of this, the Committee may wish to request the Secretariat continue to monitor this matter in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

Decisions 17.70, 17.73, paragraph b) and 17.76: Parties that have 'substantially achieved' their NIAPs at previous meetings of the Standing Committee

China

151. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to China amongst others. The Committee commended China for the measures it has taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged China to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
152. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether China should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*.
153. China, as encouraged by the Committee, submitted its report to the Secretariat on 3 July 2018. This report is available as Annex 7 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.
154. The Secretariat in its assessment prepared for SC69, observed that China was to close its domestic ivory markets by the end of 2017. The Secretariat noted that, although the effects of the closure of domestic ivory markets in China remained to be seen, the closure represented a very significant development, in particular taking into consideration that the ETIS report prepared for CoP17 stated that since 2002, successive ETIS analyses identified China's domestic ivory market as the key driver behind illicit trade in ivory. China, in its report to the present meeting, provides an update on the implementation of the closure of its domestic ivory markets, highlighting that as of 31 December 2017, all ivory retail outlets and ivory carving factories in China have been closed and that any commercial trade of ivory in China is now illegal. China further notes that the suspension implemented in 2016, on the import and export of pre-Convention tusks from elephants and its products, ivory carvings of African elephants gained after the Convention

entered into force, and tusks from hunting trophies obtained in Africa, remains in place until 31 December 2019.²⁸

155. The Party reports that crimes involving wildlife, including those involving ivory specimens, are treated as serious in China. In accordance with Article 151 of the Criminal Law of the People's Republic of China, these crimes are, in the case of minor offences punishable with imprisonment of no more than 5 years concomitant with a fine; or imprisonment between 5-10 years concomitant with a fine; or in the case of especially serious offences, imprisonment of more than 10 years, up to life, concomitant with confiscation of property.
156. China further reports that other laws, for example the Postal Law and provisional regulations on express delivery, are mobilized to combat wildlife crime, and that these laws require postal enterprises to examine the contents of postal materials when receiving and mailing them. Another example is the Cyber Safe Law, which requires network operators to obtain detailed user information, which assists in addressing illegal trade in wildlife on the Internet. China also reports on the revision of its Wildlife Protection Law, which entered into force on 1 January 2017, and that amendments were made to this law to facilitate stricter regulation of wildlife protection and more effective measures against illegal trade in wildlife. Among the amendments are new regulations prohibiting the publishing of any advertisements for selling, purchasing or using wildlife specimens of illegal origin and restricted hunting equipment, and prohibiting online trade platforms from providing services that could facilitate such activities. China in its report acknowledges that in recent years, illegal online trade in ivory escalated significantly, and notes that the new regulations provide a legal basis for law enforcement authorities to investigate cases of illegal online trade in ivory. China also notes that these measures have proven to be particularly valuable in combating illegal trade in ivory.
157. China reports on the launch of an Internet Enterprise Coalition against Cyberspace Illegal Wildlife Trade, in November 2017, which consists of the three biggest internet service providers in China (Baidu.com, Alibaba.com and Tencent.com) and eight others in the fields of collectables and tourism. By signing a Coalition Charter, these companies pledged to zero tolerance for illegal trade in wildlife on the internet, and committed to support the work of China's enforcement agencies by strictly monitoring their own platforms to remove any content associated with illegally traded wildlife specimens, and to report users suspected to be involved in illegal activities to authorities for follow-up action. China further reports that this coalition, in March 2018, established an alliance with Google, Facebook, and six other international technology companies to combat illegal wildlife trade on the Internet.
158. The ETIS report prepared for CoP17 states that evidence from on-going market monitoring suggests that illegal channels for retail ivory trade are progressively moving away from physical markets to e-commerce through the internet, including exclusive social media platforms that function on an invitation-only basis, using courier delivery services to move products to consumers. In the light of this, the above developments reported upon by China, are in particular relevant to respond to the emerging threats highlighted in the ETIS report.
159. China also reports revisions to the Wildlife Protection Law that facilitates improved international and domestic cooperation to combat wildlife crime, and that amongst others, makes provision for recording offences in the national personal integrity files of offenders, and for strict disciplinary measures against officers responsible for wildlife law enforcement, who fail to implement the law.
160. China further reports illegal trade in wildlife is addressed by Chinese customs authorities as one of the top six priority inspection targets for Customs, with ivory being the highest priority target specimen amongst wildlife specimens. It is also reported that risk management practices are widely deployed to target high-risk passengers, flights, shipments, packages, and luggage. The Party in its report also highlights that customs developed an official website to highlight its work and raise awareness, titled *Protection of endangered species, we are in action*,²⁹ listing achievements in combating illegal trade in ivory as a separate section. The report submitted by China also highlights a large number of other activities and measures the Party has undertaken and implemented to combat illegal trade in wildlife, including illegal trade in ivory. This includes information on the National Interagency CITES Enforcement

²⁸ <https://www.cites.org/sites/default/files/notif/E-Notif-2016-034.pdf>

²⁹ <http://www.customs.gov.cn/customs/xwfb34/302413/302417/bhysdzw/index.html>

Coordination Group, the Inter-Ministerial Joint Conference on Combating Illegal Wildlife Trade, and a large number of law enforcement operations initiated by China or in which it participated. Most recent operations include 'Spring Thunder II' in 2017, 'Spring Thunder III' in 2018 and 'Sword of Country gate' each year from 2016 to 2018 at national level, and operations 'Thunderbird' and 'Thunderstorm' in 2017 and 2018 at international level. China notes that illegal trade in ivory was targeted as part of all these operations.

161. Regarding capacity-building China reports that it each year conducts more than 30 domestic training seminars on CITES, for more than 3000 wildlife protection and law enforcement officers. It is further reported that in 2017, the CITES MA of China conducted 46 training seminars for law enforcement officers, during which training on CITES implementation and enforcement was provided to approximately 5000 law enforcement officers and other stakeholders.
162. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by China for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
163. Overall, the Secretariat finds that China has taken significant steps and implemented multiple measures in recent years to address illegal trade in ivory. At the same time, the Secretariat notes that the ETIS report prepared for SC69 continues to identify China as the greatest destination of worked ivory products moving out of Africa, and that nearly three-quarters of the trade in worked ivory products was destined for the greater China market, including Special Administrative Regions (SAR) in Hong Kong and Macao. The report states that this trade accounted for over 60% of the total weight of seized worked ivory products between 2011 and 2016.
164. The Secretariat also notes however, as it has pointed out in its observations for SC69, that the ETIS report prepared for CoP17 states that although the many proactive actions taken by the authorities in China since CoP16 are not yet showing consequential impact sufficient to displace its position as Category A Party in the CoP17 analysis, deeper assessment of the ETIS Transaction Index suggests some measure of positive change, and that the proportion of trade activity that concerns China and Hong Kong SAR collectively against that for all other countries has not grown further and has dropped below 30% for the first time in 2014 (Figure 9 in the CoP17 ETIS Report). This suggests that the measures being taken in China could be starting to produce positive results, and the significant further steps taken by China since CoP17 demonstrate that the Party remains firmly committed to building upon this positive progress through sustained action to combat illegal trade in ivory.
165. On balance, the Secretariat is of the opinion that although the full impact of the measures taken by China remains to be seen, the substantial efforts made by the Party to implement its NIAP, and the progress made to date, must be fully recognized.
166. NIAPs are developed in compliance with recommendations made by the Standing Committee, and facilitate the implementation of enhanced and strengthened measures and activities by Parties most affected by illegal trade in ivory, to address this illegal trade. Each plan outlines the urgent measures that a Party commits to deliver along with specified time frames and milestones for implementation. China has implemented its NIAP, as well as a variety of additional measures and activities, to enhance and strengthen its response to illegal trade in ivory. The measures and activities implemented by China are diverse and comprehensive. The Party also continues the implementation of measures and activities to address illegal trade in ivory, and it is unlikely that requesting the Party to continue activities under the NIAP process will at present, will have any significant additional impact beyond what is already being done. The Secretariat therefore believes that it would be appropriate for China to exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
167. Sustained action by China to address illegal trade in ivory remains essential, and in the light of this, the Committee may wish to request the Secretariat continue to monitor this matter in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

Hong Kong, Special Administrative Region of China

168. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Hong Kong, Special Administrative Region (SAR) of China, amongst others. The Committee commended Hong Kong SAR for the measures it has taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged Hong Kong SAR to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
169. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether Hong Kong SAR should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
170. Hong Kong SAR had not submitted a report for the present meeting as encouraged by the Committee. The Secretariat however notes that it, at the request of China, published Notification to the Parties No. 2018/057 of 1 June 2018,³⁰ informing Parties that Hong Kong SAR is implementing a three-step plan to phase out trade in elephant ivory by the end of 2021, and to impose heavier penalties to enhance deterrent against illicit trade in endangered species.
171. As outlined in the Notification, Step 1 of the three-step plan comprises that the import and re-export of all elephant hunting trophies and non-pre-Convention ivory items is banned from 1 May 2018. It further includes a significant increase in penalties that apply to all CITES-listed species including elephants. The administrative penalty doubled to a maximum of HK\$10 000 000 (approximately USD 1 270 000), whilst the penalty of two years imprisonment has increased to 10 years imprisonment. In accordance with Step 2, the import and re-export of pre-Convention ivory (except for antique ivory) is banned from 1 August 2018, and import of antique ivory will require an import permit in addition to an export permit. In accordance with Step 3, domestic trade in elephant ivory (except antique ivory) will be banned in Hong Kong SAR from 31 December 2021.
172. The Secretariat in its assessment prepared for SC69, observed that Hong Kong SAR is taking significant and commendable steps to respond to illegal trade in ivory, and that good law enforcement action is being taken by authorities in Hong Kong SAR, as also highlighted in the ETIS Report prepared for CoP17. In its report to SC69, the Secretariat noted that, acknowledging the excellent actions taken by law enforcement authorities in Hong Kong SAR in relation to seizures of ivory as well as rhinoceros horn, these seizures suggest that Hong Kong SAR continues to be heavily targeted by organized crime groups involved in this illegal trade. The ETIS report prepared for SC69 continues to identify China, including its Special Administrative Regions of Hong Kong and Macao, as the greatest destination of worked ivory products moving out of Africa.
173. With the closure of domestic ivory markets in mainland China, there is a risk that illegal trade might be displaced to Hong Kong SAR, as well as other countries neighboring China. For this reason, the urgent need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal ivory trade continues to exist in the case of Hong Kong SAR. Such action should build upon the strong and commendable enforcement actions that have been taken by authorities in Hong Kong SAR to date. It remains important for Hong Kong SAR to continue to target illegal consignments from other countries destined to Hong Kong SAR. Implementation of strong domestic enforcement action to enforce the new law, and apply the penalties that have been put in place as described in paragraph 171 above, is also essential. Further, it remains crucial to ensure that measures remain effective and are quickly adapted to respond to any newly identified trends, with a particular focus on addressing any displacement of crime that may result from the closure of domestic ivory markets in mainland China.
174. The comprehensive measures and activities that have, and continue to be implemented by Hong Kong SAR, demonstrate that Hong Kong SAR remains firmly committed to build upon the progress made to date, through sustained action to combat illegal trade in ivory. For the reasons outlined in paragraphs 172

³⁰ <https://www.cites.org/sites/default/files/notif/E-Notif-2018-057.pdf>

and 173 above, this is essential. The need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal trade in ivory is in particular relevant in the case of Hong Kong SAR. This include progressing the implementation of the three-step plan described in paragraphs 170 and 171 above, and ensuring that the measures implemented remain effective and are quickly adapted to respond to any newly identified trends, in particular any displacement of crime that may result from the closure of domestic ivory markets in mainland China.

175. Hong Kong SAR has implemented its NIAP, and a variety of additional measures and activities continue to be implemented. Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines* apply to Hong Kong SAR. The substantial efforts made by Hong Kong SAR to implement its NIAP and the progress made to date must be fully recognized. The measures and activities implemented are commendable, yet, taking into consideration the matters outlined in paragraphs 172 to 174 above, the Secretariat believes that it is premature for Hong Kong SAR to exit the NIAP process at present. However, considering the firm commitment demonstrated by Hong Kong SAR to build upon the progress made to date, through sustained action to combat illegal trade in ivory, and given the ongoing nature of activities and measures being implemented, requesting the Party to revise or update the completed NIAP would not be appropriate.
176. The Committee may wish to commend Hong Kong SAR for implementing its NIAP, the additional measures and activities implemented to address illegal trade in ivory, and the firm commitment demonstrated to build upon the progress made to date. The Committee may further wish to encourage Hong Kong SAR to report to its 73rd meeting, on progress with the implementation of ongoing measures and activities to address illegal trade in ivory as it affects Hong Kong SAR, and on any further measures or activities that may have been implemented. In this regard, the Committee may wish to encourage Hong Kong SAR to prepare a comprehensive report for consideration at SC73, on the matters outlined in recommendation s), in paragraph 35 of document SC70 Doc. 27.4.
177. The Committee may also wish to request the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
178. The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee postpone its decision on whether Hong Kong SAR should exit the NIAP process in accordance with Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*, to SC73.

Kenya

179. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Kenya amongst others. The Committee commended Kenya for the measures it has taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged the Party to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
180. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether Kenya should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*.
181. Kenya, as encouraged by the Committee, submitted its report to the Secretariat on 28 June 2018. This report is presented in Annex 12 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.
182. The report submitted by Kenya for the present meeting is comprehensive. It highlights the substantial measures and activities conducted by the Party to implement its NIAP, as well as a large number of additional activities and measures the Party continued to implement and pursue after its NIAP was assessed as 'substantially achieved' by the Committee, at its 66th meeting (SC66, Geneva, 2016).
183. Kenya reports amongst others on the Gazettement in November 2017, of subsidiary regulations to the Wildlife Conservation and Management Act of 2013. The Party reports that major offences involving wildlife are treated as serious crimes under the legal framework in Kenya, and that a good penalty framework for these crimes exist in the country. Prosecution and sentencing guidelines for wildlife related offences are reported to be in place and applied routinely. Kenya further highlights that a special unit was set up at the

Office of the Director of Public Prosecutions (ODPP), specifically to deal with the prosecution of wildlife crime cases. In addition, the Wildlife Management Authority has a unit responsible for prosecution, which works closely with the ODPP. The report also provides information on a variety of training interventions that were conducted, and states that wildlife agency staff has been trained on crime scene management, evidence collection, and maintaining the chain of custody to facilitate successful prosecution. It is reported that the Wildlife Management Authority has well-trained personnel, with sufficient status and authority, including powers of arrest provided for in the Wildlife Conservation and Management Act of 2013.

184. Kenya reports on the recruitment of a significant number of rangers to enhance anti-poaching operations and law enforcement efforts to address wildlife crime, and that its national forensic and genetics laboratory is operational. The Party reports that samples were collected from large-scale ivory seizures, as well as from the national government stockpile of ivory and rhinoceros horn, for analyses and profiling. The report highlights that a national level mechanism was established to facilitate interagency collaboration, and that different law enforcement agencies have deployed officers to work with Customs at border points to address illegal trade in wildlife. In addition, the Wildlife Management Authority deployed a sniffer dog unit that is operational at sea and airports. Kenya further reports on the establishment of border post investigation units at five international border posts. The Party also reports continued collaborative law enforcement operations and the institutionalization of these activities. It is reported that regional meetings of Directors of Wildlife and Ministers responsible for wildlife have been convened since SC66, as well as meetings of Ministers under the auspices of the Lusaka Agreement, to discuss threats to elephants and addressing illegal ivory trade. The Party further reports on its engagement with Kenya Airways and the partnership established with the Reducing Opportunities for Unlawful Transport of Endangered Species (ROUTES) project, which resulted in Kenya Airways signing a declaration on zero tolerance towards wildlife crime, as well as making available awareness raising materials on its flights.
185. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Kenya for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
186. The Secretariat in its assessment prepared for SC69, observed that the ETIS report prepared for CoP17 states that since 2013, Kenya has been interdicting with greater success, large-scale ivory consignments prior to export abroad, and that positive action continues to be taken in Kenya. The Secretariat also highlighted media reports suggesting commendable efforts in Kenya to address illegal ivory trade. This included highlighting the July 2016 sentence of 20 years' imprisonment imposed on Feisal Mohamed Ali, an alleged key player in the illegal ivory trade who was found guilty of possessing more than two tonnes of ivory.³¹ In this regard, the Secretariat notes recent media reports, indicating that the High Court in Kenya acquitted Feisal Mohammed Ali and set aside the sentence imposed in 2016.³² The acquittal raises questions about what may have contributed to this outcome. There could have been multiple reasons for this, for example the measures put in place as reported upon in paragraph 183 above might not be fully effective, or the quality of crime scene management, evidence collection and case file preparation might have lacked, or it might relate to a problem with the judicial process in Kenya, or corruption might have played a role. In the light of the high profile nature of this case, Kenya is encouraged to investigate what may have been the cause of the outcome. The Secretariat however also notes that the effectiveness of the measures and activities implemented by Kenya cannot be assessed on the basis of a single case alone. The Party may however wish to conduct a broader review of arrests made for illegal trade in ivory, and the results of the associated prosecutions, to determine where gaps may still exist and if any additional activities or measures as may be needed,
187. In its report to SC69, the Secretariat observed that individuals and organised crime groups in Kenya continue to play a significant role in the illegal ivory trade chain, and the urgent need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat poaching and illegal ivory trade continues to exist in Kenya.
188. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report prepared for SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies Kenya as one of the Parties of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked

³¹ <https://www.economist.com/middle-east-and-africa/2017/02/09/do-dope-smugglers-also-peddle-ivory>

³² <https://www.nation.co.ke/counties/mombasa/Freeing-of-suspected-ivory-kingpin-shocking-KWS/1954178-4696884-format-xhtml-1dlootz/index.htm>

ivory products moving out of Africa, mostly through air transport. The report states that Kenya has previously been identified as one of the Parties with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade involves the use of couriers, predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body.

189. In preparing its report for the present meeting, the Secretariat informally consulted with ETIS, requesting information on the latest data on Kenya available to ETIS. The Secretariat would like to thank ETIS for the information provided. The information shows that the quantity of ivory which was seized both in Kenya, and by other countries where Kenya was identified as part of the illegal trade chain, in the period 2015 to 2017 remained high, and totals over 17 tonnes in this three-year period. Important to note though, is that quantities significantly declined since 2015, with 9 075kg seized in 2015, 5 059kg in 2016 and 3 480 in 2017, the lowest since 2009. Seizures made by other countries, where Kenya was identified as part of the illegal trade chain, decreased from 14 in 2015, to 12 in 2016 and 4 in 2017. Data provided by ETIS covered the period 2008 to 2017, and the four seizures in which Kenya were implicated in 2017, represent by far the lowest number of seizures made by other countries where Kenya was identified as part of the illegal trade chain, since 2008. In addition, the weight of ivory seized by other countries where Kenya was identified as part of the illegal trade chain, also radically decreased, from 9 075kg in 2015, to 2 732kg in 2016, and 1 353kg in 2017, the lowest figure since 2009. As mentioned in paragraph 186 above, the ETIS Report prepared for CoP17 states that since 2013, Kenya has been interdicting with greater success, large-scale ivory consignments prior to export abroad. Noting that although the quantities of ivory seized in Kenya decreased, information provided by ETIS shows that Kenya continues interdicting ivory successfully within the country, with 133 seizures in 2014, 71 in 2015, 111 in 2016 and 95 in 2017. Prior to these years, the highest number recorded was 87 seizures, in 2009. This suggests that the activities and measures implemented by Kenya is producing positive results, and that levels of illegal trade in ivory associated with the Party is continuously decreasing as a result of sustained efforts.
190. Kenya has implemented its NIAP, as well as a variety of additional measures and activities, to enhance and strengthen its response to illegal trade in ivory. The measures and activities implemented are diverse and comprehensive, and upon review of the report, the Secretariat notes that the Party has continued to take positive action to address elephant poaching and illegal trade in ivory as it affects Kenya. The substantial efforts made by the Kenya to implement its NIAP and the progress made to date must be fully recognized.
191. The comprehensive measures and activities implemented by Kenya demonstrate the commitment of the Party to address elephant poaching and illegal trade in ivory. Kenya also emphasizes in its report prepared for the present meeting, that it remains firmly committed to the continued implementation of actions towards addressing elephant poaching and illegal trade in ivory. The Party further notes that such commitment is not dependent on being subject to the NIAP process.
192. Commendable progress has been made, but the urgent need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal trade in ivory continues to exist in the case of Kenya. The Party is encouraged to build upon the positive progress made in targeting known dealers and poachers, by further expanding its efforts to gather information and intelligence on organized crime groups that remain active in the country, to map out these networks, and to identify and address in particular those individuals that continue to manage and organize ongoing illegal activities.
193. Kenya implemented comprehensive measures and activities to combat poaching and illegal trade in ivory, and in the light of the continued firm commitment of the Party to build upon the progress made to date through sustained action, the Secretariat believes that further activities can be pursued outside the NIAP process. The Secretariat therefore recommends that Kenya exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
194. The Committee may wish to request the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

The Philippines

195. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to the Philippines amongst others. The Committee commended the Philippines for the measures it has taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged the Philippines to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
196. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether the Philippines should exit the NIAP process in accordance with Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*.
197. The Philippines, as encouraged by the Committee, submitted its report to the Secretariat on 4 July 2018. This report is presented in Annex 17 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4. The report included the names and addresses of alleged offenders. The Secretariat deleted the names and addresses from the report, since it would not be appropriate to make this information available publicly.
198. In its progress report to the present meeting, the Philippines highlights measures taken to implement its NIAP, as well as a number of additional activities and measures the Party continued to implement and pursue after its NIAP was assessed as 'substantially achieved' by the Committee, at its 66th meeting (SC66, Geneva, 2016). The Philippines reports, *inter alia*, that the proposed Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) Administrative Order on the "Registration of Raw and Worked Elephant Ivory" is in the finalization stage, and that the amendment of the Wildlife Resources Conservation and Protection Act, to strengthen responses to wildlife crime, is currently, after three stakeholder consultations, under review by the DENR legal department and the Philippines House of Representatives-Committee on Natural Resources. The Party further reports that the Philippine Operations Group on Ivory and Illegal Wildlife Trade (POGI), and the DENR regional offices, in collaboration with other national law enforcement agencies, conducted 32 enforcement operations from 16 June 2016 to 31 May 2018, which resulted in the confiscation of a large number of wildlife specimens, and the filing of 15 criminal cases against 36 offenders. It is reported that seven of these cases were finalized in court, whilst the remainder are still ongoing. Although it is not clear from the report if any of these cases relate to illegal trade in ivory, the operations are welcomed and encouraged by the Secretariat.
199. The Philippines also reports upon the First National Wildlife Law Enforcement Summit it convened on 22-23 November 2016. It is reported that the output of this Summit contributed to the draft Wildlife Law Enforcement Action Plan (WildLEAP), which will serve as the national framework for combating illegal trade in wildlife in the Philippines. It is further reported that the Biodiversity Management Bureau (BMB) plans to convene the second national wildlife summit in November 2018. The Philippines further reports on a number of training events initiated, the latest in May and November 2017, and March 2018, during which collectively 154 officers from various national agencies were trained with a particular focus on strengthening capacity to address wildlife crime. The Party reports that the eighth of a series of train the trainer events, is scheduled to take place in September 2018. Regarding international enforcement collaboration, the Philippines reports on good collaboration with the United States Fish and Wildlife Service, as well as multiple international events and initiatives it participated in. The Party further reports that to raise awareness, DENR and BMB continued activities through the "Stop Illegal Wildlife Trade" campaign, and that since June 2016, 15 seminars were conducted in this context at various airports and seaports in the country.
200. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by the Philippines for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
201. In its assessment for SC69, the Secretariat observed that most notable is the shift of the Philippines from a Category A Party in the ETIS analysis prepared for CoP16 to a Category C Party in the ETIS analysis prepared for CoP17. This represents the most significant shift into a group of lesser prominence among all NIAP Parties to date. The ETIS report prepared for CoP17 states that the role of the Philippines in the illegal ivory trade chain shifted to being an 'occasional' transit country, and that it at the time had a role in at least one recent large ivory seizure case, yet it was rarely otherwise involved in the trade chains of

seizures reported by other countries. The ETIS report prepared for CoP17 concludes that this points to a major shift in the Philippines' contemporary connection to evolving ivory trade dynamics.

202. The Philippines made significant strides to move from Category A to Category C, and its role as transit country for illegal ivory consignments significantly diminished. The Party also continues to take positive action and to implement measures and activities to address illegal trade in wildlife, including illegal trade in ivory as it affects the Philippines. Sustained action and vigilance is essential, and the Philippines is encouraged to continuously review ivory trafficking trends, to ensure that the measures implemented to prevent and combat ivory trafficking remain effective and are quickly adapted to respond to any newly identified trends.
203. The substantial efforts made by the Philippines to implement its NIAP and the progress made to date must be fully recognized. The Secretariat believes that it would be appropriate for the Philippines to exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*, and that the Secretariat continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17).

Thailand

204. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Thailand amongst others. The Committee commended Thailand for the measures it has taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged Thailand to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
205. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether Thailand should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
206. Thailand, as encouraged by the Committee, submitted its report to the Secretariat on 1 July 2018. This report is presented in Annex 21 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.
207. Thailand in its report, highlights the key results achieved through NIAP implementation. This *inter alia* includes the enactment of the Wildlife Animal Reservation and Protection Act (WARPA) 2014 and the Elephant Ivory Act 2015. To further strengthen measures to address illegal trade in wildlife, the Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation (DNP) since then pursued further revisions to relevant laws and regulations. It is reported that the new proposed WARPA was approved by Cabinet on 3 March 2017, and that it is currently being reviewed by the Office of the Council of State. Under the new proposed WARPA, penalties will increase to an administrative fine of up to 200 000 Thai Baht (approximately USD 6000), or imprisonment of up to 10 years. Thailand also reports that its Department of Tourism proposed the revision of the Tourism Business and Tour Guide Committee's regulation, to include violations involving elephant ivory and protected wild fauna and flora. The report received from Thailand states that this revised regulation is expected to be approved by September 2018, and the Party may wish to provide a further update on these matters at the present meeting. Thailand reports on progress with the collection of DNA samples from domesticated elephants, and that the process to include DNA codes in elephant identification certificates to prevent wild elephants from being presented as domesticated elephants, is more than 87% complete. In addition, the ivory management database system is currently being improved to expand its capacity, and the new improved system is expected to be operational by December 2018. Thailand also reports upon the Ivory Action Plan put in place by the Royal Thai Police, and being implemented by all police departments in the country. It is reported that implementation of this plan from 2017 to date, resulted in seven arrests relating to crimes involving ivory. Thailand further reports that cooperation between the Royal Thai Police, the DNP, and Thai Customs to address illegal online ivory trade through enforcement of the Ivory Action Plan is delivering results, and that it led to arrests as well as the seizure of 171.67kg of ivory to date. Thailand further reports that forensic analyses of this ivory will be conducted, which could facilitate further investigations and arrests. Thailand also reports that joint DNP / police task forces conduct monthly inspections at ivory shops, and that these task forces have also been targeting high risk areas known to be

affected by illegal trade in ivory, such as tourist markets and border posts. Thailand reports upon a cooperative dialogue initiated with Lao PDR to explore opportunities to combat illegal trade in wildlife, including ivory, across the Thai-Lao border. Thailand also reports upon, *inter alia*, good collaboration between Thai Customs and Kenyan Customs, which led to the seizure of ivory in February 2017, in Kenya. It is further reported that this cooperation also included coordination between the Consulates of Guinea and Mozambique in Thailand, which resulted in the issuance of warrants of arrest in Thailand in September 2017, for three suspects from Guinea, Liberia and Mozambique respectively. It is also reported that Thai Customs deploys risk management practices to address wildlife crime.

208. Thailand in its report also highlights a number of further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal trade in ivory, and includes information on further policy developments. This includes, *inter alia*, reporting on a Global Environment Facility GEF-6 supported program on combatting illegal trade in wildlife, focussing on ivory, rhinoceros horn, tiger and pangolin, approved in January 2018, the implementation of a Smart Border Patrol system at two wildlife checkpoints in provinces identified as hotspots for wildlife trafficking, the establishment of the WILD HAWK Special Task Force for special field operations to investigate and arrest persons involved in wildlife crime, the establishment of a 24-hour hotline and web link for the public to report wildlife crime, and the deployment of the latest available technologies at airports, seaports and land border crossings, to detect and address illegal trade, including illegal trade in wildlife. It is further reported that DNP is currently planning a study on zoning areas for ivory shops, to further strengthen domestic ivory trade control. Thailand also reports on a number of capacity building interventions undertaken or planned, to enhance the capacity of law enforcement officers to respond to wildlife crime.
209. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Thailand for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
210. The Secretariat in its assessment prepared for SC69, observed that most notable is that Thailand shifted from being identified as a Category A Party in the ETIS analysis prepared for CoP16, to a category of lesser prominence in the ETIS analysis prepared for CoP17, which identifies it as a Category B Party. The Secretariat highlighted that the ETIS report prepared for CoP17 states that the domestic ivory market in Thailand has experienced a major decline following implementation of new legislation, and that this is also corroborated by the rapid assessment report of the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) entitled *Criminal justice response to wildlife crime in Thailand*,³³ which states that based on research undertaken by TRAFFIC in 2016, a 96% reduction in ivory on sale in the domestic market compared with 2012 was observed as a consequence of Thailand's NIAP implementation. The same report states however that continued success is dependent on further law enforcement action as well as anti-corruption measures targeted at wildlife trafficking.
211. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS Report prepared for CoP17 states that Thailand was not the destination for any large-scale ivory seizures in the period 2012-2014 and that, in the context of its NIAP, a series of far-reaching changes in policy, legislation, law enforcement and awareness initiatives have been rolled out by the Government. The ETIS report further states that, given the past positioning of Thailand in ETIS analyses, it has arguably made the most impressive strides of any country in addressing illegal ivory trade problems since CoP16.
212. Upon review of the report Thailand prepared for the present meeting, the Secretariat notes that the Party continues to take positive action to address illegal ivory trade as it affects Thailand. The measures and activities implemented by Thailand demonstrate the commitment of the Party to address illegal trade in ivory. The Party in its report also expresses its strong commitment to combating illegal trade in wildlife, including illegal trade in ivory. The measures and activities implemented by Thailand are diverse and comprehensive, and the Party continues to take positive action to address illegal trade in ivory as it affects Thailand. Sustained action remains essential, but the substantial efforts made by Thailand to implement its NIAP and the progress made to date must be fully recognized. The Secretariat believes that it would be appropriate for Thailand to exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*.

³³ https://www.unodc.org/documents/southeastasiaandpacific/Publications/2017/Thai_Assessment_13_16_May_2017.pdf

213. The Committee may wish to request the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

Uganda

214. The Secretariat in its document prepared for SC67, noted that Uganda provided ample information in its report to SC67, to justify progress ratings allocated to its NIAP actions, and that Uganda was at SC67 able to report that it has 'substantially achieved' its NIAP. At SC69, the Secretariat reported that positive action continued to be taken in Uganda to combat illegal ivory trade. The Standing Committee at SC69 agreed recommendation r) i) - iii) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), directed to Uganda, amongst others. The Committee commended Uganda for the measures taken to implement its NIAP, and encouraged Uganda to submit a report to the present meeting on any further measures taken and activities implemented to combat illegal ivory trade, including on any new or further policy developments. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.
215. The Standing Committee further agreed recommendation s) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), to consider at the present meeting, whether Uganda should exit the NIAP process, in accordance with Step 5, paragraph d), of the *Guidelines*.
216. Uganda, as encouraged by the Committee, submitted a report to the Secretariat on 23 June 2018. This report is presented in Annex 22 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.
217. Uganda reports that the Wildlife Amendment Bill (2017), which addresses gaps in national legislation to effectively respond to illegal trade in wildlife, was at the time of reporting, a priority for debate and passing into law during the 3rd Parliamentary Session of the 10th Parliament of Uganda, in June 2018. The Party may wish to provide a further update in this regard at the present meeting. Uganda further reports on the establishment of a Special Wildlife and Utilities Court in 2016 to expeditiously handle wildlife crime cases. It is reported that this has improved the conviction rate of offenders involved in wildlife crime to over 80%, from less than 50% before its creation. In addition, a Rapid Reference Guide (RRG) for wildlife investigators and prosecutors has been developed, with support from the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC). This is an activity conducted to implement one of the recommendations that resulted from implementation of the of the *ICCWC Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit*³⁴ in Uganda, as is reported upon in more detail in the document on the *International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC)*, prepared for the present meeting. The RRG was launched by the Minister of Tourism, Wildlife and Antiquities in Uganda, in April 2018.
218. The report of Uganda highlights the establishment of an intelligence unit at the Uganda Wildlife Authority, which resulted in 80 staff members being deployed throughout the country to address illegal trade in wildlife. It is further reported that a number of capacity-building interventions have been conducted, specifically targeting officers from this unit, since its establishment. Uganda reports that since CoP17, a total of 26 different training workshops were convened, targeting enforcement and prosecution authorities to enhance their capacity to respond to wildlife crime. Uganda also acquired, for the first time, sniffer dogs, and reports that these dogs were deployed with great success, resulting in seizures of both ivory and rhinoceros horn at the airport and other border points.
219. To improve coordination and collaboration at national level, a National Wildlife Crime Coordination Task Force comprised of all national enforcement agencies responsible for wildlife law enforcement has been created, whilst the Party also reports good collaboration at regional and international levels. Uganda reports that it is collaborating with China, and that a conference to discuss areas of cooperation between the two countries on wildlife conservation and combating illegal trade in wildlife, attended by the Chinese CITES Management Authority, staff from the Chinese Embassy in Uganda and the Chinese Chamber of Commerce comprising a consortium of Chinese Companies operating in Uganda, was held in Uganda in May 2018. It

³⁴ https://cites.org/common/resources/pub/ICCWC_Toolkit_v2_english.pdf

is further reported that a similar conference is being organized, to be held in China later this year. In addition, Uganda reports that the Government of China offered to provide training to officers from Uganda, on addressing wildlife crime. The first batch of officers was, at the time of reporting, due to depart to China in June 2018.

220. The Secretariat notes that the ETIS report prepared for SC69 highlights evidence of increased ivory processing in Africa for the purpose of exporting finished products to Asian markets. It identifies Uganda as one of the Parties of origin and/or export behind the greatest numbers of seizures and quantities of worked ivory products moving out of Africa, mostly through air transport. The report states that Uganda has previously been identified as one of the Parties with an ivory carving industry that, amongst similar industries in other countries, appears to be servicing ivory demand in Asia with the production of key generic products such as bangles, name seals and chopsticks. The report further states that much of this trade involves the use of couriers, predominantly Asian nationals, who in recent years have frequently been detected wearing purposely designed clothing to conceal ivory on the body. In this regard, Uganda and China are encouraged to actively pursue addressing these matters, as part of their ongoing collaboration.
221. In its assessment for SC69, the Secretariat observed that the ETIS Report prepared for CoP17 states that, since 2013, Uganda has been interdicting with greater success, large-scale ivory consignments prior to export abroad, and that the Party has greatly increased the number of seizures being made and reported to ETIS during the period 2012-2014. This is also a matter elaborated upon by Uganda in its report prepared for the present meeting.
222. It is beyond the scope of this document to give full justice to the elaborate progress report prepared by Uganda for the present meeting. Parties are invited to consult the full report for detailed information.
223. Uganda has implemented its NIAP, as well as a variety of additional measures and activities, to enhance and strengthen its response to illegal trade in ivory. The measures and activities implemented are diverse and comprehensive, and demonstrate political commitment at the highest level in the country to address illegal trade in wildlife. The Party also continues the implementation of measures and activities, and overall, the Secretariat finds that Uganda has taken significant steps to address illegal trade in ivory. The substantial efforts made by the Uganda to implement its NIAP and the progress made to date must be fully recognized.
224. In the light of the above, the Secretariat believes that it would be appropriate for Uganda to exit the NIAP process in accordance with the provisions of Step 5 paragraph d) of the *Guidelines*. The need to remain vigilant and sustain strong enforcement action to combat illegal trade in ivory remains essential for Uganda. It is equally important that new amended legislation and regulations must be effectively implemented. The Wildlife Amendment Bill and associated regulations can only have the desired impact if effectively implemented. In the light of this, the Committee may wish to request the Secretariat to continue monitoring the measures taken and activities implemented by Uganda to combat illegal trade in ivory, in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any matters of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

Parties not included in the NIAP process

Japan

225. At SC69 the Committee agreed recommendation a) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1) and encouraged Japan to remain vigilant in its efforts to combat illegal trade in ivory, and to closely review trends to ensure that the activities and measures it is implementing respond effectively to illegal trade in ivory as it affects the country. The Committee also invited Japan to report through the Secretariat to the present meeting, on its implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee at the present meeting.
226. Pursuant to the Standing Committee's recommendation, Japan submitted a report to the Secretariat on 3 July 2018, containing updated information on measures taken by the Party to combat illegal trade in ivory. The Secretariat would like to thank Japan for the report submitted, which is available in the language received, as Annex 11 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.

227. The Secretariat finds that the additional information provided by Japan demonstrates continued progress with the implementation of activities and strengthening of measures to combat illegal trade in ivory. The Party is encouraged to further build upon the progress made to date, and to continue to closely review trends to ensure that the activities and measures it is implementing respond effectively to any ongoing illegal trade in ivory as it affects Japan.

Singapore

228. At SC69, the Standing Committee agreed not to include Singapore in the NIAP process, and agreed recommendation c) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1).

229. The Committee invited Singapore to report through the Secretariat to the present meeting on its implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee.

230. Pursuant to the Standing Committee's recommendation, Singapore submitted a report to the Secretariat on 18 June 2018, containing updated information on its implementation of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17). The Secretariat would like to thank Singapore for the report submitted, which is available in the language received, as Annex 19 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.

231. The Secretariat finds that the additional information provided by Singapore demonstrates continued vigilance and the pursuance of further measures to strengthen the response of the Party to wildlife crime, including illegal trade in ivory. The Party is encouraged to maintain its continuous review of activities and measures as highlighted in the report, to ensure that it responds effectively to ivory trafficking as it affects Singapore.

South Africa

232. At SC69 the Standing Committee agreed recommendation d) in document SC69 Sum.10 (Rev. 1), noted the report received from South Africa, available as information document SC69 Inf. 43, and requested South Africa to submit a report to the Secretariat so that the Secretariat can make the report available to the Standing Committee at the present meeting, together with any recommendations it may have.

233. The Committee also requested the Secretariat to continue to monitor progress in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17), and to bring any issues of concern that may arise to the attention of the Committee at SC70.

234. In accordance with the Standing Committee's recommendation, South Africa submitted a report to the Secretariat on 15 June 2018, containing updated information on measures taken by the Party to combat illegal trade in ivory. The Secretariat would like to thank South Africa for the report submitted, which is available in the language received, as Annex 20 to document SC70 Doc. 27.4.

235. The Secretariat finds that the additional information provided by South Africa demonstrates continued progress with the implementation of activities and measures to combat illegal trade in ivory. The Party is encouraged to further build upon the progress made to date, and to continue to closely review trends to ensure that the activities and measures it is implementing respond effectively to any ongoing illegal trade in ivory as it affects South Africa.