

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Sixty-seventh meeting of the Standing Committee
Johannesburg (South Africa), 23 September 2016

SUMMARY RECORD

1. Opening remarks of the Chair *No document*

The Chair welcomed the participants and gave an opening speech.

2. Opening remarks of the Secretary-General *No document*

The Chief of Governing Bodies and Meeting Services also welcomed the participants on behalf of the Secretary-General who was attending the Ministerial Lekgotla hosted by South Africa.

Procedural matters

3. Agenda SC67 Doc. 3 (Rev. 2)

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 3 (Rev. 2).

There were no interventions.

The Committee adopted the provisional agenda in document SC67 Doc. 3 (Rev. 2).

4. Working programme *No document*

The Secretariat introduced this agenda item.

The Committee agreed to consider agenda item 12.1 during the morning session and agenda items 12.2, 19 and 20 during the afternoon session.

5. Adoption of the Rules of Procedure SC67 Doc. 5

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 5.

There were no interventions.

The Committee noted the Rules of Procedure of the Standing Committee as amended at the 65th meeting and contained in the Annex to that document.

6. Credentials *No document*

The Secretariat introduced this agenda item.

There were no interventions.

The Standing Committee noted that 11 of the 19 delegations of the members of the Standing Committee had provided credentials at the outset of the meeting.

7. Admission of observers SC67 Doc. 7

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 7, noting that the Species Survival Network should be added to the list in document SC67 Doc. 7.

The Committee noted the list of organizations that had expressed an interest in attending the meeting.

Administration and finance

8. Report of the Working group on options for administrative hosting arrangements for the CITES Secretariat *No document*

The United States as Chair of the Working group on options for administrative hosting arrangements introduced this agenda item, reported on progress since the 66th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC66), and noted that the United Nations Environment Assembly (UNEA) adopted resolution 2/18 on the relations of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) with the multilateral environmental agreements for which it provides the secretariat. The Chair of the Working group, with the support of its members, proposed to update the terms of reference of the Working group to allow it to continue its work.

The European Union (EU) proposed a substantial revision of the terms of reference for the Committee's working group, proposing that it focus on the implications of UNEA resolution 2/18 for the Memorandum of Understanding between the Executive Director of UNEP and the Chair of the Standing Committee and on the current administrative hosting arrangements. The European Union considered that there was a fundamental problem with some of the options presented in the original terms of reference. In their opinion, one core option was not legally possible: UNEP is the Secretariat to the Convention and this cannot be changed without amending the Convention. They noted further that the UNEA resolution is asking for feedback that the Standing Committee could provide through the Working group. The United States noted that there were various interpretations of the UNEA resolution and that other members of the Working group did not support the EU's proposal.

The representative of UNEP noted that UNEP has been supporting CITES for over 40 years and that they would like to continue providing this support. They further indicated that the upheaval with Umoja should lead to greater transparency on the relationship. UNEP expressed an interest in becoming part of the Working group. The Chair of the Working group noted that UNEP already had a special status since the Working group worked in consultation with UNEP, but that there was no need for UNEP to become a member of the WG.

The Chair of the Standing Committee asked the European Union and the United States to come back with a proposal for a consolidated text of the terms of reference for the Working group.

Based on this proposal, the Standing Committee agreed to renew the mandate of the Working group on options for administrative hosting arrangements for the CITES Secretariat with the following terms of reference:

"Taking into consideration UNEA Resolution 2/18, the Report of the UNEP Task Team on the Effectiveness of Administrative Arrangements and Programmatic Cooperation between UNEP and UNEP-administered Convention Secretariats, the related report of the UNEP Executive Director and further information from the CITES Secretariat and UNEP respectively, consider the implications of UNEA Resolution 2/18, including the information to be provided on administrative and financial challenges to be brought to the attention of the Executive Director of UNEP under operative paragraph 3 of that Resolution, and consider the advantages and disadvantages of different administrative hosting models for the CITES Secretariat, including retaining the status quo; and, present the Working Group findings to the Standing Committee at its 69th meeting."

9. Access to GEF funding: Report of the Secretariat *No document*

The Secretariat introduced agenda item 9 and reported on progress since the 66th meeting of the Standing Committee. The Secretariat had invited the GEF Secretariat to make an intervention on awareness-raising and to provide guidance to Parties at the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP17), but had so far received no formal response from the GEF Secretariat. The Secretariat highlighted a number of side events related to GEF-funded projects during CoP17 and noted its active collaboration with the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) on GEF-7.

The Standing Committee noted the oral report.

Meetings of the Conference of the Parties

10. Arrangements for the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties

10.1 Election of officers *No document*

The Secretariat introduced agenda item 10.1. The selection panel established by the Standing Committee had identified the following nominees:

Chair of the Conference: Ms. Maite Nkoana-Mashabane (South Africa – Minister of International Relations and Cooperation)

Alternate Chair of the Conference: Ms. Bomo Edna Molewa (South Africa - Minister of Environmental Affairs)

Vice-Chairs of the Conference: Mr. Cyril Taolo (Botswana) and Ms. Shereefa Al-Salem (Kuwait)

Committee I: Ms. Karen Gaynor (Ireland)

Committee II: Mr. Jonathan Barzdo (Switzerland)

Credentials Committee: Mr. Bandar Al Faleh (Saudi Arabia)

The Standing Committee noted the oral report and confirmed the nominations proposed by the selection panel.

10.2 Other matters *No document*

There were no interventions.

Compliance and enforcement

11. National laws for implementation of the Convention: Report of the Secretariat.....SC67 Doc. 11

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 11. Since the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the legislation of eight additional Parties had been placed in Category 1 under the National Legislation Project (NLP): Albania, the Plurinational State of Bolivia, the European Union, Mauritius, Paraguay, the Republic of Moldova, Serbia, and the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela. Eleven Parties had submitted legislative timetables: Algeria, Angola, the Central African Republic, Comoros, Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea, Kazakhstan, Mauritania, Niger, Sri Lanka and the United Republic of Tanzania, and some of these has also submitted draft legislation for comments. With a view to promote accountability and transparency, the Secretariat had been asking Parties to have high-level officials sign the timetables and had made the legislative plans available as an information document (see SC67 Inf. 1). Rwanda, as party requiring attention as a priority, did not submit any legislation or timetable signed off at a higher level. As such, Rwanda was the only Party subject to a possible trade suspension at the meeting. Finally, the Secretariat asked the Standing Committee to add Ecuador to the list of Parties requiring attention as a priority.

The Secretariat thanked the donors and partners supporting this work: the European Union, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Norway, Japan and the United States of America. It also highlighted its good working relationship with UNEP on the project.

Colombia and France supported the work of the Secretariat on the NLP and informed the Standing Committee of new CITES implementing legislation adopted by the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela and by the Congress of New Caledonia.

Hungary, on behalf of the European Union, expressed its continued support for the project and agreed to the criteria for the identification of Parties requiring attention as a priority listed in paragraph 13 of the document. The United States of America, noting that the effectiveness of CITES was undermined when Parties lacked implementing legislation, emphasized the importance of the project. They supported the Secretariat's recommendations in paragraphs 14 a) and 14 c). For the recommendation in paragraph 14 b),

they noted that the draft decisions in document CoP17 Doc. 22 would entail regrettably, in their view, another postponing of deadlines until the 70th meeting of the Standing Committee in 2018.

The Standing Committee recommended that all Parties suspend commercial trade in specimens of CITES-listed species from Rwanda since this Party that required attention as a priority had failed to adopt appropriate measures for the effective implementation of the Convention or agreed an appropriate legislative timetable as required under Decision 16.33. This recommendation would take effect 60 days after the conclusion of the 67th meeting of the Standing Committee.

The Standing Committee agreed to issue a warning to those Parties that had not responded to the public notice to alert Parties of a Compliance matter (Notification to the Parties No. 2016/25) advising these Parties that they are in non-compliance and reminding them of the need to accelerate their efforts to enact adequate legislation as soon as possible. Parties affected by this compliance message were: Afghanistan, Eritrea, Gabon, India, Lesotho, Mongolia, Palau, Sierra Leone, Solomon Islands, Tunisia and Uzbekistan.

The Standing Committee agreed to update the list of Parties requiring attention as a priority by deleting the Plurinational State of Bolivia, Paraguay and the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela as legislation had been adopted and placed in Category 1, and by including Ecuador in the list.

12. Application of Article XIII

12.1 Application of Article XIII in the Lao People's Democratic Republic SC67 Doc. 12.1

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 12.1 and reported on its July 2016 technical mission to the Lao People's Democratic Republic (Lao PDR) under Article XIII of the Convention, undertaken at the request of the Standing Committee. The Secretariat thanked the Lao authorities for their support and the Wildlife Working Group 15.7, noted all the efforts deployed by Lao PDR and highlighted the gaps in implementation of the Convention. The Secretariat presented a list of recommendations.

The Minister of Natural Resources and Environment from the Lao People's Democratic Republic thanked the Secretariat and informed the Standing Committee that his country was committed to the implementation of CITES and was seriously looking at the recommendations of the Secretariat. The Lao PDR recently prohibited the export of all logs from the country and has been discussing with partners of the Wildlife Working Group on captive-breeding farms. In its fight to implement CITES, the Minister asked for greater cooperation and support from both international and local partners, citing as an example the signature of a Memorandum of Understanding with South Africa.

The United States of America, on behalf of the North American region, and the European Union welcomed the commitment by the Lao authorities and supported the recommendations of the Secretariat, emphasizing that substantial progress was still needed in Lao PDR.

Wildlife Conservation Society, also supported by the Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), called for the closure of tiger captive-breeding facilities. EIA regretted that the suspension for *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* announced by the Lao PDR did not include all finished products and encouraged the country to close both legal and illegal domestic ivory markets.

The Standing Committee recommended that:

1. *Regarding management of exports of Dalbergia cochinchinensis*

Parties

- a) suspend commercial trade in specimens of the species *Dalbergia cochinchinensis* (except finished products, including carvings and furniture) from Lao PDR until that Party:
 - i) makes scientifically based non-detriment findings for trade in the species in the country to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and the Chair of the Plants Committee;
 - ii) develops a National Management Plan for the species and commences its implementation; and
 - iii) provides a copy of the National Management Plan to the Secretariat.

2. *Regarding national legislation:*

Lao PDR

- a) develop CITES implementing legislation in accordance with the guidance provided under the National Legislation Project and Resolution Conf. 8.4 (Rev. CoP15), and amend relevant provisions of existing national laws mentioned in the present report to include all CITES-listed species and verify that specimens were not obtained in contravention of national law;
- b) strengthen the criminal legal framework in relation to illegal trade in wildlife, notably, by amending the Penal Code to increase penalties for serious wildlife-related offences, especially when they are perpetrated through organized groups, transnationally and repetitively;
- c) promulgate a new Prime Minister Order on Strengthening Controls for Wildlife Harvesting, Farming, Management, Transport, Possession and Trade; and
- d) develop and enact legislative guidelines for wildlife farming. Guidelines should, inter alia, clearly define the meaning and scope of farming for scientific research. Potential loopholes should be closed taking into consideration all possible ambiguities and inconsistencies in the application of national laws and Article VII paragraphs 4 and 5 of the Convention, Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.), Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) and Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP16) as it relates to the use of source codes R, F, D, A and C.

3. *Regarding CITES Scientific Authorities, population surveys and non-detriment findings*

Lao PDR

- a) designate and appoint one or more new CITES Scientific Authorities with appropriate competency and autonomy, and sufficient modern resources;
- b) undertake science-based analysis to develop indices drawn from harvested animals or field surveys that can be used to provide evidence of whether a population is increasing, decreasing or stable and whether an average size animal in the population is increasing, decreasing or stable for the following species:
 - *Macaca fascicularis* (long-tailed macaque/monkey)
 - *Ptyas mucosus* (Common rat snake)
 - *Python reticulatus* (Regal Python)
 - *Naja* Spp. (Cobra snakes)
 - *Cuora galbinifrons* (turtle species)
 - *Heosemys annandalii* (turtle species)
 - *Dendrobium nobile* (orchid)
- c) develop National Management Plans for these species, taking into account the recommendations made under the Review of Significant Trade; and
- d) provide the results of the surveys and Management Plans to the Secretariat for comments, review, and processing in compliance with Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP13).

4. *Regarding compliance and law enforcement*

Lao PDR

- a) focus on the effective implementation of the existing relevant plans, in particular NIAP, NBSAP, and the National Tiger Action Plan 2010-2020;
- b) strengthen the enforcement capacity of the members of Lao-WEN, notably the environmental police, customs, the Department of Forest Inspections, prosecutors and judges, to investigate mid-high profile cases that involve organized and transboundary activities;
- c) encourage members of Lao-WEN to adopt result-oriented law enforcement qualitative indicators (e.g. profile of offenders, convictions, use of advanced investigative techniques);

- d) encourage collaboration between law enforcement agencies from Thailand, Singapore, Viet Nam, and China to tackle the issues of transiting of wildlife and wildlife tourism; and
- e) provide to the Secretariat the results of any investigations conducted by competent national authorities to determine the origin of specimens in trade, the identities of individuals involved in smuggling, and the results of any legal proceedings against alleged perpetrators.

5. *Regarding information systems*

Lao PDR

- a) subject to the availability of external funds, establish an efficient information system to:
 - i) share information expeditiously between agencies responsible for wildlife science, management, monitoring, enforcement, prosecution and sentencing;
 - ii) issue CITES electronic permits and annual reports that are interconnected with customs, e.g. future Single Windows Systems (Asycuda); and
 - iii) submit CITES annual trade reports based on effective trade data (and not data in permits issues).

6. *Regarding monitoring of wildlife farms and related trade*

Lao PDR

- a) verify the legal origin of parental stocks and specimens in trade;
- b) register, control and monitor authorized farms to ensure that only authorized trade occurs; and
- c) ensure that export permits and re-export certificates are endorsed, with quantity, signature and stamp, by an inspecting official, such as customs, in the export endorsement block of the document.

7. *Public awareness and outreach campaigns*

Lao PDR

- a) develop outreach campaigns in Lao and Mandarin to raise awareness among nationals, traders, visitors and consumers from neighbouring countries about the laws and regulations of the State for the protection of fauna and flora. Campaigns should focus on international airports, main ports, markets and special free economic zones.

The Standing Committee encouraged Lao PDR to report on progress on the implementation of recommendations 1 through 6 by 1 July 2017, in order for the Secretariat to convey this report and its comments at the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee.

12.2 Application of Article XIII in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

12.2.1 Report of the Secretariat..... SC67 Doc. 12.2.1

and

12.2.2 Report of the Democratic Republic of the Congo SC67 Doc. 12.2.2

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 12.2.1 on quota management and issuance of export permits; management of exports of *Psittacus erithacus*; illegal trade; and collaboration among national CITES authorities in the Democratic Republic of the Congo.

The Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) outlined its efforts to deal with the issues raised during the SC66 and emphasized that it was committed to the timely implementation of the SC66 recommendations. It took note of the deadline for the study on African grey parrots.

The European Union congratulated the Democratic Republic of the Congo on its efforts and renewed its commitment to cooperate with the DRC on these issues. Echoed by the World Parrot Trust, they also expressed concern about the poaching of African grey parrots reported by the Secretariat.

The Standing Committee took note of the reports of the DRC contained in documents SC67 Doc. 12.2.2 and SC67 Doc. 20 informing of its remedial actions; acknowledged the commitment and initial progress demonstrated; and requested the DRC to step up its efforts to fully implement the Standing Committee's recommendations.

The Standing Committee requested the DRC to investigate, prosecute and judge perpetrators involved in the illegal trade in grey parrots and other CITES-listed species and submit detailed information on the concrete results of its enforcement activities to the Secretariat.

The Standing Committee requested the DRC to complete the field study on *Psittacus erithacus* by 30 April 2017 and submit it to the 29th meeting of the Animals Committee together with a National Management Plan, including a proposed quota, subject to any decision of the Conference of the Parties in relation to *Psittacus erithacus*.

The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to report to its 69th meeting on progress made by the DRC in implementing the Standing Committee's recommendations.

The Secretariat announced to the Standing Committee that it will keep it informed of preliminary consultations on Article XIII, noting that it was corresponding with Japan on whaling issues and with Serbia about export permits issued by Slovenia and other countries to Kosovo. The Secretariat will report on these issues at the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee.

13. National Ivory Action Plans process..... SC67 Doc. 13

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 13 and presented a progress report since the 66th meeting of the Standing Committee on implementation of NIAPs by concerned Parties. It thanked Parties that had substantially achieved their NIAPs that submitted reports and noted that no reports had been received from Cameroon and Gabon, two Parties that had not substantially achieved their NIAPs. The Secretariat encouraged Parties to use the new reporting template.

Cameroon provided an oral update on its implementation efforts and noted that it was preparing a report to the Standing Committee. Gabon committed to submitting a NIAP implementation report within 30 days.

Angola, Kenya, Togo, Uganda, the United Republic of Tanzania and Viet Nam reported on further efforts to implement their NIAPs. Viet Nam indicated it was ready to develop a revised NIAP to address illegal ivory trade. Kenya inquired as to what would need to be done to move a country out of the NIAP process.

Singapore and Togo noted that Parties should be consulted in order to verify the accuracy of ETIS data.

The European Union and the United States of America commended the NIAPs as a useful tool against poaching and ivory trafficking, while noting that the process could be improved so that it does not become a mere paperwork exercise.

Wildlife Conservation Society, also speaking on behalf of the Environmental Investigation Agency and the Zoological Society of London, called for the NIAP process to move away from self-assessment and advocated for an independent assessment of progress by experts with independent indicators.

The Standing Committee noted document SC67 Doc. 13 and its annexes, and commended China (including Hong Kong SAR), the Philippines, Thailand and Viet Nam for the further measures taken to implement their NIAPs, and the initiatives and policy developments that have taken place since the 66th meeting of the Standing Committee to combat elephant poaching and illegal ivory trade.

With respect to the Parties that had not "substantially achieved" their NIAP, the Standing Committee noted that Cameroon and Gabon had not submitted their reports as requested, and encouraged other Parties engaged in the NIAPs process to report back to the Standing Committee at its 69th meeting.

The Standing Committee agreed to set a deadline of 30 days for the submission by Cameroon and Gabon of their NIAP implementation report. Should these reports not be submitted on time, the Standing Committee would consider potential compliance measures by postal procedure.

14. Adoption of revised Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports SC67 Doc. 14

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 14, outlining briefly the process through which the revision of the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports* was undertaken, as well as its main sections. The revised *Guidelines* would apply to the annual reports from 2016 onwards.

Hungary, on behalf of the European Union, supported the adoption of the revised *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports*.

The United States of America also supported their adoption, with the following amendments: inclusion of a new “status” field in the annual reports, noting that this field would be optional; changing the label “code” in the second column of the “Description of specimens and units of quantity” table in section 6 a) to “trade term code” and correcting the cross-references to section 6 throughout the *Guidelines*.

The Standing Committee adopted the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports*, as amended by the United States of America.

15. Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species: Implementation of recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees SC67 Doc. 15

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 15 focusing on four cases: Cameroon/*Hippopotamus amphibius*, Thailand/*Hippocampus kelloggi*, *H. kuda* and *H. spinosissimus*, Cambodia and Viet Nam/*Macaca fascicularis* and Togo/*Kinixys homeana* and *Chamaeleo gracilis*.

Viet Nam noted that it had reported on the matter at the 28th meeting of the Animals Committee and emphasized that it had put strict controls at the border with Cambodia. Viet Nam had recently conducted an inspection and found no illegal trade in *Macaca fascicularis*. Viet Nam had established an export quota 15,000 individuals per year, but had recently only exported under 5,000 individuals. Based on the information provided above, Viet Nam concluded that there was no demand to export more *Macaca*, legally or illegally.

Cameroon reported that it had been working with the International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN) on a management plan for *Hippopotamus amphibius*, and maintained that the hippopotamus population in Cameroon ranged between 3,827 and 4,424 individuals. Since their habitat is not considered to be threatened, Cameroon had established a quota of 25 hunting trophies per year.

The United States of America, supported by Hungary, on behalf of the European Union, agreed with the recommendations proposed by the Secretariat, including a quota of 10 hunting trophies for *Hippopotamus amphibius* from Cameroon. They further suggested that the quota for *Kinixys homeana* from Togo should include a size limit of less than 10 centimetres.

Regarding Cameroon/*Hippopotamus amphibius*, the Standing Committee recommended that Cameroon maintain an annual export quota of 10 trophies of *Hippopotamus amphibius* until it provides information substantiating a revision of this quota in compliance with Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3, of the Convention, including information on the establishment of non-detriment findings for trade in *H. amphibius*, and population status information.

Regarding Thailand/*Hippocampus kelloggi*, *H. kuda* and *H. spinosissimus*, the Standing Committee recommended that Thailand be removed from the Review of Significant Trade process concerning *H. kelloggi*, *H. kuda* and *H. spinosissimus*, recognizing that Thailand suspended the exportation of specimens of *Hippocampus* spp. from 1 January 2016 until further notice; and that Thailand inform the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee about any change in the trade suspension for *H. kelloggi*, *H. kuda* and *H. spinosissimus*, together with a justification, for their agreement.

Regarding Togo/*Chamaeleo gracilis*, the Standing Committee requested Togo to establish export quotas for *Chamaeleo gracilis* for 2017 of 2,500 live specimens of ranched origin, and 500 live specimens of wild origin; and urged Togo to implement recommendations d) to i) by 2 June 2017 (see Annex 1 of document SC67 Doc. 15).

Regarding Togo/*Kinixys homeana*, the Standing Committee requested Togo to establish export quotas for *Kinixys homeana* for 2017 of 400 live specimens of ranched origin with a size limit of less than 10 centimeters, and zero of wild origin for 2017; and urged Togo to implement recommendations c) to h) by 2 June 2017 (see Annex 1 of document SC67 Doc. 15).

Exemptions and special trade provisions

16. Implementation of the Convention relating to captive-bred and ranched specimens - trade in *Caiman crocodilus fuscus* skins from Colombia: Report of Colombia SC67 Doc. 16

Colombia introduced document SC67 Doc. 16, summarizing its activities related to the following: regulations and tracking mechanisms for monitoring the export of specimens of *Caiman crocodilus fuscus*; status of the populations and prospects for establishing a ranching programme at pilot sites; the establishment of an export quota based on a non-detriment finding, for the ranched specimens at the pilot sites; and the establishment and implementation of a marking system for the ranched specimens. Colombia clarified that its current legislation did not incorporate limits on the size of the skins that may be exported, but that it did regulate the obtaining of the environmental licence, the performance of the excision of the 10th caudal scute of new-born animals on farms; the monitoring and tracking of the cutting of the skins and the monitoring and tracking of exports at the port of embarkation, carried out by Colombia's CITES Management Authority. Finally, Colombia noted that its actions on the management of *Caiman crocodilus fuscus* cannot be separated from its overarching efforts to bring about peace in the country and that the ongoing peace process should enable faster implementation of the Standing Committee's recommendations.

Portugal, on behalf of the European Union and its member States, expressed their interest in the information provided by Colombia, especially the regulations and rules on export to prevent illegal trade and the enforcement measures taken by the government. They thanked Colombia for their cooperation on this matter.

The Standing Committee noted the report submitted by Colombia and invited Colombia to provide a progress report at its 69th meeting about the implementation of the declaration of Colombia on the *Caiman crocodilus fuscus* at the 66th meeting of the Standing Committee.

17. Registration of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species in captivity for commercial purposes: Registration of the operation "Nouvelle découverte" breeding *Astrochelys radiata*..... SC67 Doc. 17 (Rev. 1)

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 17 (Rev. 1) and explained the procedure for registration of captive-breeding operations in Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15).

Mauritius noted that the captive-breeding operation they wished to register will not endanger the survival of the species, that the original parental stock had been acquired legally and that the operation had agreed to disburse USD 100 per specimen sold for the conservation of the species. The issue of traceability raised by Madagascar was addressed in the document.

Madagascar noted that the illegal trafficking of tortoises was a real problem in their country and that Mauritius would have to ensure that specimens produced by that captive-breeding operation can be clearly traced. Madagascar intended to continue engaging bilaterally with Mauritius in order to solve that traceability issue.

The Standing Committee accepted the registration of the operation "Nouvelle découverte" breeding *Astrochelys radiata*.

18. Sturgeons and paddlefish (*Acipenseriformes* spp.): Report of the Secretariat on country of origin of caviar SC67 Doc. 18 (Rev. 1)

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 18 (Rev. 1).

The Russian Federation noted that its proposal for the overview about stocks of sturgeons and paddlefish shared by range States and the respective species had been partly confirmed by expert opinion. On the issue of country of origin, the Russian Federation further noted that the discussion on the definition of country of origin reflected in the document missed something, and went on to propose a new definition of the country of origin of roe.

The United States of America and China opposed the bracketed definition of country of origin proposed by the majority of Standing Committee working group on sturgeons at SC66 and reiterated in the document, noting the provisions about labelling all caviar in trade in Resolution Conf. 12.7 (Rev. CoP16) and the current emphasis on traceability within CITES. Portugal noted that this issue would be addressed by the Conference of the Parties at its 17th meeting.

The Standing Committee noted the document and agreed that this issue would be further considered during the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

19. Ebonies (*Diospyros* spp.) and rosewoods and palisanders (*Dalbergia* spp.) from Madagascar

19.1 Report of the Secretariat..... SC67 Doc. 19.1

and

19.2 Report of Madagascar SC67 Doc. 19.2 (Rev. 1)

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 19.1 focusing on the implementation of the Action plan for *Diospyros* spp. and *Dalbergia* spp. The report of Madagascar indicated some progress with the adoption of national legislation to address the Action plan. However, the Secretariat emphasized that the report of Madagascar lacked clarity on the issues of seizures, investigations and prosecutions and did not allow the Secretariat to conclude that Madagascar had made significant progress. It noted the imbalance between the efforts made by Madagascar to fight against illegal trade and its efforts to negotiate the return of seized stocks. The Secretariat recommended that all Parties suspend all trade in specimens of CITES-listed species from Madagascar.

The Minister of Environment, Ecology and Forestry of Madagascar highlighted the numerous actions undertaken since the listing of *Diospyros* spp. and *Dalbergia* spp. in Appendix II, especially its new legislation, strengthened international cooperation against trafficking, notably with the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, the inventory and auditing of stocks, progress towards the making of a non-detriment finding with the help of the United States Agency for International Development and scientific research in order to publish an identification manual for *Diospyros* spp. and *Dalbergia* spp. Madagascar recognized that much more needed to be done, specifically with the implementation of the new legislation and the prosecution of infractions. It highlighted the creation of a special chain to fight against trafficking of rosewood and ebony. With regards to the 3,000 tons seized by Singapore, Madagascar had actively engaged with that country and was surprised by the court's decision not to return the seized stocks. Madagascar concluded by recalling the numerous governance issues the country is facing and calling for increased financial and technical support to implement the Standing Committee's recommendations. It emphasized that a trade suspension would have a significant destabilizing impact on its economy.

Botswana and South Africa recognized the concerns raised by the Secretariat, but cautioned against a suspension of all trade, calling on Madagascar to implement the recommendations of the Secretariat. The World Wildlife Fund and the Environmental Investigation Agency expressed their support for the proposed suspension of all trade.

The World Bank described its work in Madagascar and highlighted that there had been some significant improvement on the ground, noting that the logistical needs for the stockpile audits were very important and costly. Humane Society International and the International Wildlife Management Consortium also called on the Standing Committee to help Madagascar achieve better conservation results. ForestBased Solutions suggested the establishment of a public-private partnership to this end.

While encouraged by the commitment made by the Minister of Madagascar before the Standing Committee, the European Union remained concerned about the lack of implementation of the Action plan and the lack of control of illegal trade at the national level. Supporting the analysis of the Secretariat, the European Union considered that the sale of seized stocks would be premature and emphasized that any future sale should ensure that the profits go to the conservation of the species and to the implementation of CITES. Rather than a full trade suspension, the European Union proposed a suspension for only commercial trade.

The United States of America, seconded by IUCN and Canada, expressed its concern about the impact of a trade suspension on the IUCN programme on the Nile crocodile *Crocodylus niloticus* and proposed

that the Nile crocodile be excluded from the commercial trade suspension. Kuwait suggested that the trade suspension would only enter into effect on 31 December 2016.

The Standing Committee agreed to maintain the current commercial trade suspension in specimens of the species *Dalbergia* spp. and *Diospyros* spp. from Madagascar.

The Standing Committee requested Madagascar to provide by 31 December 2016 a report on the implementation of paragraph 32 a) sub-paragraphs i), ii) and iii). The Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to circulate Madagascar's report, along with its recommendations, to the Standing Committee. The Standing Committee agreed to decide via postal procedure on the suspension of commercial trade, with the exception of the Nile crocodile.

The Standing Committee drew the attention of Madagascar and relevant Parties to the options outlined in paragraph 35 of document SC66 Doc. 46.1, concerning the disposal of seized illegal consignments of timber from Madagascar, namely: auction, transformation, return of seized or confiscated stocks to Madagascar and destruction.

20. African teak (*Pericopsis elata*): Report of the Democratic Republic of the Congo..... SC67 Doc. 20

The Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) introduced document SC67 Doc. 20 highlighting that it believed that it had provided a satisfactory response to the recommendations adopted by SC66. The DRC noted that it was working in close collaboration with the European Union and the CITES Secretariat on the management of the export quotas and the completion of the forest inventories.

The European Union noted that supplementary information was needed on the implementation of SC66 recommendations, especially on the systematic conversion of the volumes of processed products into round wood volume. They noted the efforts made by the DRC to establish non-detriment findings based on independently verified forest inventories.

The Standing Committee noted the report. Upon suggestion by the European Union, the Standing Committee requested the Democratic Republic of the Congo to submit by 30 April 2017 its report on the systematic conversion of the volumes of processed products into round wood volume. The Standing Committee further requested the Democratic Republic of the Congo to intensify its efforts to develop an information system to efficiently manage permits, export quotas and conversion rates for *Pericopsis elata*.

21. Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses (*Rhinocerotidae* spp.)

21.1 Report of the Secretariat..... SC67 Doc. 21.1

and

21.2 Report of the working group SC67 Doc. 21.2

The Secretariat introduced document SC67 Doc. 21.1, noting that the Standing Committee at SC66 had adopted recommendations directed to Mozambique, South Africa and Viet Nam, requesting these Parties to submit reports at its 67th meeting on a variety of matters, and that reports were received from all these Parties. The report of Mozambique was comprehensive and informative and illustrated the good momentum in that country. The report of Viet Nam included a number of commendable measures, but the Secretariat remained concerned about several instances of illegal trafficking reported to be occurring in that country.

The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, as chair of the Working group, introduced document SC67 Doc. 21.2, emphasizing that there continue to be a lack of information in the reports submitted by Viet Nam, especially on issues related to arrests and prosecutions.

Viet Nam acknowledged it was a key country in the illegal rhino horn trade route and recognized the need for further action to combat illegal rhino horn trade. It emphasized its commitment to improve its response to illegal trade and noted that the adoption of a new penal code should lead to a higher conviction rate of criminals accused of illegal wildlife trafficking. Viet Nam, seconded by Mozambique, reaffirmed its commitment to the fight against illegal trade.

The United States of America supported the proposed recommendations and expressed its concern about the lack of additional reporting and advancement made by Viet Nam.

Mozambique

- a) The Standing Committee requested Mozambique to prepare a report on the full implementation of the priority actions in its NIRAP as outlined in SC66 recommendations d) i) to v) on Rhinoceroses (*Rhinocerotidae* spp) [(see document SC66 Com. 7 (Rev. by Sec.)], building upon the report provided to SC67, and in particular on:
 - i) the Parliament's approval of the amendment proposal to broaden the application of the Conservation Law; the finalization of the new implementing Regulations for the amended Conservation Law; the publication of the CITES Regulation, as presented in Annex 2 to the report from Mozambique prepared for SC67 (see document SC67 Doc. 21.1 Annex 1), in the official journal of Mozambique; and the administrative circular by the President of the Supreme Court addressed to all courts;
 - ii) the application of the amended Conservation Law and Regulations mentioned in paragraph a) i) above in the country;
 - iii) information on successful prosecutions and penalties, as well as on failures to prosecute successfully, and key reasons for these successes or failures, based upon information collected through the Registry of Infractions operational in conservation areas, and through the national level database to collect information and follow up on the prosecution of wildlife crime cases in court; and
 - iv) measures implemented in response to the findings of the risk audit of rhinoceros horn and ivory storage facilities conducted in the country, to improve management of and security for confiscated rhinoceros horn and ivory in Mozambique.
- b) The Standing Committee requested Mozambique to submit the report to the Secretariat at least 90 days before the deadline for submission of documents to the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee, so that the Secretariat can make the report available to the Standing Committee and convey any recommendations it may have.

Viet Nam

- c) The Standing Committee encouraged Viet Nam to establish a task force consisting of the different national agencies responsible for wildlife law enforcement, to investigate the activities of organised crime groups within the country involved in the trafficking of rhinoceros horn and other wildlife specimens, drawing upon available information and intelligence, including the information and intelligence alluded to in document SC67 Doc. 21.1, paragraphs 23 to 25;
- d) The Standing Committee encouraged Viet Nam to further expand its positive collaboration through the Memorandum of Understanding between the CITES Management Authority of China and the CITES Management Authority of Viet Nam, to address the activities of organized crime groups involved in cross-border tourist trade in illicit wildlife specimens from Viet Nam to China; and
- e) The Standing Committee requested Viet Nam to prepare a comprehensive report on:
 - i) the implementation of the new penal code approved by the Vietnamese National Assembly in 2015;
 - ii) measures implemented and activities conducted within the country to investigate organised crime groups involved in the trafficking of rhinoceros horn and other wildlife specimens;
 - iii) measures implemented to address the activities of organized crime groups involved in cross-border tourist trade in illicit wildlife specimens, in particular rhinoceros horn, between China and Viet Nam;
 - iv) progress made in accordance with Resolution Conf 9.6 (Rev. CoP16) to ensure that any product purported to be rhinoceros horn is treated as such for enforcement purposes; and

- v) arrests, seizures, prosecutions, convictions and penalties for offences involving the illegal possession and trade of rhinoceros horn detected at border points or domestic markets in Viet Nam, as well as failures to prosecute successfully, and key reasons for these successes or failures.
- f) The Standing Committee requested Viet Nam to submit the report to the Secretariat at least 90 days before the deadline for submission of documents to the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee, so that the Secretariat can make the report available to the Standing Committee and convey any recommendations it may have. The Standing Committee, after assessing Viet Nam's progress, and after considering the recommendations of the Secretariat, will make such recommendations as appropriate.

22. Any other business *No document*

There were no interventions.

23. Determination of the time and venue of the 68th meeting *No document*

The Standing Committee noted that its 68th meeting would take place in Johannesburg, South Africa, on 5 October 2016.

24. Closing remarks *No document*

The members of the Standing Committee thanked the outgoing Chair of the Standing Committee for his outstanding work over the last six years.