

# CITES SC66 NATIONAL IVORY ACTION PLAN PROGRESS REPORT Parties of 'primary concern'

## Prepared for the 66th meeting of the CITES Standing Committee

-----

# Party: MALAYSIA

# Reporting period: 16 NOVEMBER 2013 – 15 SEPTEMBER 2015

## PART A: Synopsis of NIAP implementation

- 1. This document has been prepared by Malaysia.
- 2. During the 63rd Standing Committee Meeting (Agenda SC63.Doc 18 on Elephant Conservation, Illegal Killing and Ivory Trade), Malaysia verbally updated the meeting on the efforts and progress of work towards compliance with Resolution Conf.10.10 (Rev. CoP15). Malaysia highlighted the successful effort in intercepting and confiscation of a numbers of shipments of ivory, which is investigated under both of Malaysia's main related legislations, the Custom Act (for false declaration and other related custom offences) and of course, the International Trade of Endangered Species Act 2008.
- 3. Based on the list of ivory-related seizures and cases, most of the shipments originated from African ports with final destinations to various Far East countries. These shipments were falsely declared as recycled plastic or concealed with plywood and other materials. This was also reported through the relevant mechanism under CITES (which is captured in the ETIS system) and through collaboration and bilateral channel between Malaysia and the relevant countries of origin.
- 4. The Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, together with the related Management Authorities (MAs) such as the Department of Wildlife and National Parks, have been working closely with other enforcement agencies (EAs) such as the Royal Malaysian Customs, Malaysian Maritime Enforcement Agency and Interpol in curbing illegal smuggling activities of wildlife or its by-products. To date, more than 50 smuggling attempts, apart from ivory, have been successfully intercepted through this initiative at various entry and exit points.

5. In the 64<sup>th</sup> and 65<sup>th</sup> Standing Committee meeting, Malaysia once again voiced out that it should not be grouped together with other countries of concern, without clearly distinguishing that Malaysia is purely a transit country in the illegal ivory trade. Malaysia also highlighted the weakness of the current ETIS reporting and analysis work, which failed to take into consideration various critical component to present an accurate and precise picture of Malaysia's role in tackling illegal ivory trade.

#### Progress to date

- 6. There are 12 action measures in Malaysia's NIAP which are tailored specifically with the fact that:
  - a) Malaysia does not have a domestic industry or market for product made of ivory; and
  - b) The confiscation involved shipments that are destined to the consumer countries in the East Asia region.
- Malaysia noted and appreciated the review by the CITES Secretariat on Malaysia's National Ivory Action Plan on 7<sup>th</sup> August 2014 and has submitted the progress report of NIAP for 2014 on 22<sup>nd</sup> January 2015.
- 8. From the review, 6 out of the 12 actions in the NIAP are rated as 'substantially achieved' while 3 are 'on track' and 3 are stated as 'unclear'. However, from our self-assessment, 6 out of the 12 actions in the NIAP are rated as 'substantially achieved' while 6 are 'on track'. These measures are not one-off, but sustained efforts that need to be strengthened to ensure that it is part of the standard operating procedures or priorities by the Management Authorities (MAs) and the enforcement agencies (EAs).
- 9. Malaysia will continuously take part in regional collaboration and special joint-enforcement operations, as well as domestic multi-agencies operation by our MAs and EAs which also involved with Airport Authority and the Port Authority.
- 10. The outreach and public awareness activities are actually more tailored toward strengthening the capacity and awareness for our various enforcement agencies and department that deal with this issue on daily basis. The government has allocated funds to support capacity building program for species and product identification, interpretation of laws and Training for Trainers for not only the government agencies, but also the industries. We also engage the NGOs such as Traffic South East Asia (Traffic SEA), WWF and others, who had overview and understand of the trade on the international level.
- 11. The works in upgrading the National Wildlife Forensics Laboratory are progressing well, with eight (8) dedicated officers already attached to this unit. This unit had spearheaded the ivory forensic samplings on the confiscated ivories in September 2014 in collaboration with the University of Washington and the TRACE Wildlife Forensic Network.
- 12. The Royal Malaysian Customs will continuously improve their investigation and administrative mechanisms to support the NIAP. The Custom Act of 1967 is the first legislation framework that we use in investigation for all ivory seizures, apart from the International Trade of Endangered Species Act 2008. We also use available information resources from the Commission of Companies, Malaysia and The Royal Malaysian Police to assist in investigations.

#### Future outlook

- 13. In the CoP16 Meeting, Malaysia highlighted that the total number of ivory seizures, which was presented in the ETIS analysis report prepared by TRAFFIC, was seized/confiscated at ports and airports. The ETIS analysis report failed to reflect this fact distinctly, which was very critical to reflect that domestic confiscation of ivory only accounted to 12 units for 2011 to 2012. The report also failed to mention that Malaysia does not regulate or have any industry or market for ivory or ivory products.
- 14. Malaysia strongly believes that there is an urgent need to review and re-look into the ETIS reporting and analysis process, to ensure that the format and role of relevant parties are properly structured and defined. The relevant parties should be consulted in the preparation of the ETIS analysis report, to reflect the actual and accurate representation of the effort made by the relevant countries.
- 15. Malaysia imposes multi-layer legislation in the form of Acts and Regulations to ensure that illegal ivory is intercepted before they reach their destination of consumer countries in the Far East. The possibility of existing organized criminal syndicate involved in the trade as highlighted by the ETIS will require more proof or data to be substantiated, to ensure Malaysia is not one of the targeted countries.
- 16. Malaysia viewed that sharing and coordination of intelligence and information among relevant enforcement agencies of the concerned countries and the CITES Secretariat are critical in ensuring the relevant authorities can follow up and expand their investigation, not only focusing on the interception and confiscation of the illegal ivories on their shores, but dismantling the whole chain of the illegal trade.
- 17. Utilization of new and improved investigation techniques, such as forensic sciences and DNA samplings should be facilitated to all countries of concern, to ensure a tangible result and solid investigation outcome.
- 18. Malaysia identified several low hanging fruits, which will require strong commitment and actions not only at the domestic level, but also regionally and internationally. Doubling up the number of enforcement officers and continuous training to assist front-liners to adequately and accurately identify scheduled species and parts are utmost critical. Long-term actions also include placement of X-Ray machines, which can identify organic matter and utilization of information, gathered through 'sting operations' conducted by various enforcement agencies such as INTERPOL and WCO.
- 19. Support on additional funding and expertise are very much needed to further strengthen the National Wildlife Forensics Laboratory to ensure the existing efforts and plans are sustained and various future targets devised under the action plan and various related resolutions of CoP are fulfilled.
- 20. Currently, Malaysia is highly dependent on tip-off and random checks. Therefore, there are urgent needs to improve intelligence sharing and secured information among enforcement agencies for all among the countries involved, such as the utilization of World Customs Organization (WCO) channel and other possible mechanisms.
- 21. Access to resources especially on technical resources such as forensic, data, equipment, new technologies, capacity and intelligence should be available for identified countries, and should be coordinated or managed by the CITES Secretariat. This is to ensure that these countries may achieve the target outlined under their

respective NIAPs. Therefore, support and assistance are much needed from other parties, who truly believe that the issues of elephant poaching and ivory smuggling are worth fighting.

22. Malaysia is listed as one of the 'primary concern' in the poaching of elephants and the illegal trade in ivory. From the evidence and also the efforts that have been made, Malaysia is very serious in curbing the illegal trafficking especially involving ivory to ensure that the wildlife can be protected and conserved. The assistance from the Secretariat is highly appreciated to withdraw Malaysia from one of the 'primary concern' countries.

## PART B: Summary evaluation of actions (assigned progress ratings)

		PROGRES	S RATING	
CATEGORY/PILLAR	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulation	1.1 Capacity building for ID and other techniques			
2. National-level enforcement action, investigation and inter-agency coordination	<ul><li>2.1 Enforcement activity at entry and exit points</li><li>2.2 Local interagency collaboration</li></ul>			
3. International enforcement collaboration		<ul><li>3.1 Regional collaboration</li><li>3.2 International collaboration</li></ul>		
4. Outreach, public awareness and education	4.1 International demand reduction campaigns	4.2 Public awareness- raising activities		
5. Additional priority activities	<ul><li>5.1 Wildlife enforcement capacity building</li><li>5.2 Stockpile management</li></ul>	<ul> <li>5.3 ID expertise at border crossing points</li> <li>5.4 Forensics technology</li> <li>5.5 Additional investigation tools</li> </ul>		

## PART C: Detailed evaluation of actions

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i> )
CATEGORY 1: Legislation a	and regulation	
1.1 Capacity building for enforcement officers on species identification, investigation technique, prosecution and other related skills (tagging, marking, inventory)	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED <u>SC65 rating</u> : SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul> <li>i. Seven (7) capacity-building seminars or workshops covering a range of enforcement-related matters were conducted by national enforcement organizations, including workshops on wildlife and forestry related laws, and workshops on CITES enforcement activities, exhibit management and ivory workshops for Customs and Royal Malaysian Customs Department (RMCD) staff.</li> <li>ii. Based on the activity reported, the specified milestone to hold three capacity-building seminars has been exceeded.</li> </ul>
CATEGORY 2: National-leve	el enforcement: Action	n, investigation and national inter-agency coordination
2.1 Strengthened interagency Enforcement activity at the entry points, airport and port. Includes Royal Custom, Royal Police, Malaysia Maritime Enforcement Agency and Department of Wildlife and National Parks (DWNP)	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED <u>SC65 rating</u> : SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul> <li>i. Enforcement activity at entry and exit points includes 61 Department of Wildlife and National Parks (DWNP) enforcement officers placed at 14 designated entry/exit points, RMCD officers located at all legal landing places and five anti-smuggling unit checkpoints at designated trans-border locations.</li> <li>ii. In 2014, five (5) random operations were conducted at Kuala Lumpur International Airport, and three random operations were conducted at both Customs and Immigration Quarantine Complex (CIQ) Gelang Patah, Johor, and Senai International Airport, Johor.</li> <li>iii. In 2015, two (2) random operations in entry and exit points were conducted by RMCD together with PDRM, Anti-Smuggling Unit and Immigrations.</li> <li>iv. Management Authority, enforcement agencies together with Freight and Forwarding Company at Kuala Lumpur International Airports (KLIA) had agree with the General Guidelines to import/export/transit wildlife via KLIA.</li> <li>v. Forty-three (43) new enforcement and prosecution officer posts at DWNP were filled, and the terms of reference of RMCD CITES Officers in all 16 Customs administrations in 12 States and four Federal territories were updated to clarify job responsibilities relating to CITES enforcement.</li> <li>vi. Coordination meetings of the Management, Scientific and Enforcement Authorities of the Act 686 were held on 15 December 2014, 21 January 2015 and 31 July 2015 to discuss and coordinate the progress of implementation and collaboration.</li> </ul>
CATEGORY 3: International	l enforcement collabo	ration
3.1 Regional collaboration (Asian and ASEAN)	ON TRACK <u>SC65 rating</u> : ON TRACK	<ul> <li>Malaysia is supportive to the regional collaboration by attending the 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> ASEAN Wildlife Enforcement Network (ASEAN-WEN) meeting in Viet Nam, May 2014 and Brunei Darussalam, May 2015 respectively.</li> <li>Malaysia is involved in formulating the development of a wildlife training module for Customs officers in ASEAN</li> </ul>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
		member states with TRAFFIC South-East Asia's (TRAFFIC SEA) assistance.
		iii. Four (4) ivory surveillance operations, resulting in three (3) seizures, had been conducted by RMCD at the time of last reporting.
		iv. Malaysia participated in preparing the Guidelines for Forensic Methods and Procedures of Ivory Sampling & Analysis in partnership with the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC). This guideline serves as a standard forensic methods and procedures of ivory sampling and analysis used by DWNP laboratories, to support transnational criminal investigations and law enforcement operations worldwide.
3.2 International /interregional	ON TRACK <u>SC65 rating</u> : ON TRACK	i. Participation in international seminars and workshops such as the Asian Development Bank-CITES Symposium on Combating Wildlife Crime during CoP16 in Bangkok, Thailand, and involvement in pre-operational training and planning meetings for Operation COBRA II, and participation within the operation itself.
	UN TRACK	ii. ICCWC workshops and training events, such as a DNA expert's workshop, were also attended to build international collaboration.
		iii. Close coordination and communication with other range states on elephant.
		iv. Participation of enforcement officers in international expert group seminars/workshops/meetings on elephant and ivory related issue.
		v. Collaboration with Regional Intelligence Liaison Offices (RILO) of the World Customs Organizations and the INTERPOL
CATEGORY 4: Outreach, pul	blic awareness and ed	ducation
4.1 Placement of publication and public service announcement to	ON TRACK <u>SC65 rating</u> :	<ul> <li>Publication of brochures, buntings and/or video took place at Kuala Lumpur International Airport, the Low Cost Carrier Terminal in Kuala Lumpur and Kuching Airport. Information highlighted were species listed and the severity of penalties under Act 686. (See Annex 1)</li> </ul>
increase public awareness on international wildlife trade	UNCLEAR	ii. In 2014, RMCD collaborate with TRAFFIC SEA has distributed a bunting and banner to 126 entry/exit points for Ivory awareness to public and Customs Officers. (See Annex 2)
		iii. A press statement released by RMCD in The Star dated on 26th January 2015 with regards to the confiscated ivory. (See Annex 3)
4.2 Engagement sessions with public and	ON TRACK	<ul> <li>DWNP had hosted a dialogue session with licensed traders, captive breeders, zoo operators and wildlife-related society on 26 February 2014. Issues related to animal welfare were discussed.</li> </ul>
DWNP stakeholder	<u>SC65 rating</u> : ON TRACK	ii. Engagement sessions with public and traders were conducted by DWNP, once in every state in Peninsular Malaysia between January-May 2014. Issues related to markings of live animals and products (including trophies) were discussed.
		Note: Malaysia would like to request to discontinue this activities as this is no longer relevant as Malaysia is not a consumer country.

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i> )
4.3 Awareness seminar and exhibition on wildlife	ON TRACK	<ul> <li>Save the Nature Seminar was conducted on 19-20 April 2014 in collaboration with DWNP, Royal Malaysian Police and Forestry Department of Peninsular Malaysia. (See Annex 4)</li> </ul>
conservation	<u>SC65 rating</u> : UNCLEAR	ii. An awareness exhibition was set up in Fraser's Hill, Pahang on 21-22 June 2014 in conjunction with Fraser's Hill International Bird Race 2014.
		iii. Celebrate World Elephant Day on 5 <sup>th</sup> September 2015, Kuala Gandah National Elephant Conservation Centre, Pahang. (See Annex 5)
		<ul> <li>iv. 182 awareness exhibition was organized/participated by DWNP in Peninsular Malaysia (132 in 2014 and 37 in 2015, as of June 2015). (See Annex 6)</li> </ul>
CATEGORY 5: Additional pr	iority activities	
5.1 Enhancing the utilization	ON TRACK	i. Existing Wildlife Forensic Laboratory received accreditation ISO 14644-1 (Clean Room Class 1000).
of forensic technology	<u>SC65 rating</u> : UNCLEAR	ii. A new National Wildlife Forensic Laboratory will operate in November 2015. This lab is currently under evaluation process for Biosafety Level (BSL) 2 accreditation. DWNP will apply an additional accreditation ISO-IEC 17025:2005 for this new lab.
		iii. Malaysia is now using the Guidelines on Methods and Procedures for Ivory Sampling and Laboratory Analysis for every forensic sampling and analysis of seized ivory.
5.2 Wildlife enforcement capacity building	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	i. Two (2) investigation courses were conducted by DWNP for 2014 to improve investigation techniques and prosecution processes, the first involving 30 participants on 27 January 2014 and the second on 9 June 2014.
	SC65 rating:	ii. Two (2) capacity building on CITES Policy and Species Identification conducted on Jun and August 2015.
SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED		iii. Five (5) Wildlife Officers and one (1) Legal Advisor attended legal-related training courses conducted by Judicial and Legal Training Institute (ILKAP).
		iv. Twenty-five (25) Enforcement Officer participated in Intensive Crime Scene Investigation (CSI) Workshop in Paya Indah Wetland on 16-18 December 2014.
5.3 Investigation	ON TRACK	i. Wildlife Offences has been included in Anti-Money Laundering, Anti-Terrorism Financing and Proceeds of Unlawful Activities (AMLATFA) Act 2001 in November 2014.
	SC65 rating: UNCLEAR	ii. Strengthening capacity of investigating officers of informant and rewards system.
	0.10222.11	iii. To conduct parallel investigations under the Anti-Money Laundering laws.
		iv. Two (2) DWNP officers undergo Certified Financial Investigator Programme (CFIP) to enable them to be investigator under AMLATFA Act 2001.
5.4 Seized/confiscated ivory stockpile	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	i. All seized ivory has been marked and tagged and information on the level of stock was provided to the CITES

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i> )		
	0005	Secretariat in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP16).		
	<u>SC65 rating</u> : SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	ii. Reports on inventory of Government-held stockpiles have been sent and recorded to Secretariat before every 28 Feb each year.		
		iii. As of September 2014, 300 ivory samples had been collected for DNA analysis. Another DNA ivory sampling for large seizure will be conducted in November 2015.		
		iv. Enhance cooperation with other enforcement agencies involved in the confiscation of ivory.		
5.5 Identification and	ON TRACK	i. Capacity building in the identification of endangered species included training to 11 RMCD officers in November 2013.		
verification expert in border crossing points	SC65 rating:	ii. Capacity building in the identification of endangered species has been conducted in October 2014 by RMCD.		
	ON TRACK	iii. Twenty-eight (28) DWNP officers are designated as identification experts to assist in investigation and prosecution cases.		
		iv. Capacity building on CITES Policy and Species Identification for agencies that monitors and operates activities at the country's entry/exit point (Royal Malaysian Customs, Immigration, DWNP, Cargo Operators, Pos Malaysia, Royal Malaysian Police, Flight Security) was conducted by DWNP on 3 -7 August 2015.		

## Part D: Indicators (OPTIONAL)

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
Legislation and regulation	1	Three (3) capacity building seminar/ workshops for relevant Management Authorities and Enforcement Officer conducted	For 2013: i. Workshop on Forensic Science (Crime Scene Investigation) conducted on 16-18 December 2013 for DWNP Investigation Officer.
			For 2014: i. ESABII Trainers (ToT) on CITES Policies and Identification of Threatened Species on 18-21 February 2014 in Kuala Lumpur. (Participated by DWNP, Sabah Wildlife Department and Forest Department of Sarawakofficers) organize by TRAFFIC South East Asia.
			ii. Workshop on Ivory Sampling and Marking Techniques conducted on 15-19 June 2014 in Negeri Sembilan. Attended by 21 DWNP officers.
			iii. RMCD conducted Endangered Species Identification Course under 686 Act at Lumut Perak conducted on 10-13 June 2014. The course was done in collaboration with NRE, DWNP, Fishery, MTIB and TRAFFIC SEA.
			<li>iv. RMCD conducted Wildlife Trade Regulation Workshop at Johor Bahru conducted on 13-16 October 2014.</li>
			v. Lab for enforcement agencies with PERHILITAN on 14 August 2014 at Paya Indah Wetland, Dengkil, Selangor.
			vi. New 16 designated Customs Officers were appointed as a CITES Officers. This officers was representing 16 Customs administrations in 12 states. They were train and updating with all CITES matters from time to time.
			For 2015: i. Capacity building for enforcement officers at Ports, Airports and land border crossing points to be

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
			able to identify endangered species conducted by DWNP have been held on 3 -7 August 2015; ii. Capacity Building for Enforcement officers conducted by Forest Department Sarawak on June 2015.
National-level enforcement: Action, investigation and national inter-agency coordination	1	Five (5) major operation/inspection at sea ports and airports	<ul> <li>Kuala Lumpur International Airport (KLIA), three (3) random operations carried out on 26 Nov 2013, 1 May</li> </ul>
	2	Three (3) joint–enforcement operation/checks at sea ports and airports	2014 & 10 June 2014 ii. Penang International Airport, Penang, ten (10) random operations carried out between Nov 2013 – June 2014
			<li>iii. Senai International Airport, Johor six (6) random operations/ inspections were carried out between Jan – May 2014</li>
			<li>iv. Planned Customs border control operations will be more focus on inter-agency cooperation and from information received from international sources.</li>
			v. Customs CITES Officers in states conducting these operations will lead the Customs teams in those states.
	3	Coordination Meeting of the Management, Scientific and Enforcement Authorities of the Act 686.	The main agenda of the meeting is to discuss and coordinate the progress of implementation and collaboration.
			For 2014: A meeting was held on 15 <sup>th</sup> December 2014.
			For 2015: Two (2) meetings were held on 21 <sup>ST</sup> January 2015 and 31 <sup>st</sup> July 2015.
International enforcement collaboration	1	Collaboration with partners to develop Asian elephant genotype map to allow seizures, etc. to be traced to their origin	A Guidelines on Methods and Procedures for Ivory Sampling and Laboratory Analysis was developed in partnership with ICCWC. This guideline will serve as a standard forensic methods and procedures of ivory sampling and analysis to be used by DWNP laboratories, to support transnational criminal

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
			investigations and law enforcement operations worldwide.
	2	ASEAN Wildlife Enforcement Network meeting	For 2014: Attended the 9 <sup>th</sup> ASEAN WEN Meeting held in Hanoi, Vietnam on May 2014.
			For 2015: Attended the 10 <sup>th</sup> ASEAN WEN Meeting held in Bandar Seri Begawan, Brunei Darussalam on May 2015.
	3	The ASEAN Customs Enforcement & Compliance Working Group	Bi-annual meetings involving only Customs Administrations of all ASEAN Member States.
	4	A Project Proposal of using TRAFFIC, SEA's assistance to develop a Wildlife Training Module relevant to Customs Officers in ASEAN Member States (AMS)	The Proposal to receive TRAFFIC's assistance was approved and the training modules have been distributed to AMS in 2013.
	5	A Project Proposal to link Customs Enforcement Liaison Officers (CELO) in AMS to TRAFFIC, SEA for the purpose of receiving alerts.	The Project Proposal to link TRAFFIC to CELO is under consideration and was raised in the CECWG Meeting on 2 – 4 Dec 2013. The ASEAN Secretariat informed the Meeting that had advised TRAFFIC to approach each Member States on Bilateral basis on TRAFFIC request to have access to CELO contact points.
	6	Joint cross-border enforcement operation	In 2013, RMCD had conducted four (4) ivory surveillance operations leading to 3 seizures.
			In 2014, RMCD and DWNP were involved in Ops Cobra II, which was conducted on 30 Dec 2013 – 26 Jan 2014. This operation is to combating the smuggling of endangered flora and fauna species.
			In 2015, DWNP has went to Ops Cobra III, which was conducted on 3 – 28 May 2015. This is a continuation of commitment by Malaysia in exchanging intelligence to tackle the illegal wildlife trade across source, transit, and consumer countries.
International enforcement collaboration	1	Coordination and communication with other range states	On-going

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator		Performance
	2	Participation of enforcement officers in international expert group seminar/workshop/meetings on Elephant and ivory related issue.	i.	The Deputy Director of Enforcement Division of DWNP attended the Pre- Operational Training and Planning meeting for Operation COBRA II on 20th October 2013 to 1st November 2013 in Nairobi, Kenya.
			ii.	One (1) DWNP officer attended the United Nations Office for Drugs & Crimes (UNODC) Experts Group Meeting on 4-6 December 2013 in Vienna.
			iii.	Attended Workshop on Combating Wildlife Trafficking, 6-8 May 2014, Bogor, Indonesia. Participated by Director of DWNP Enforcement Division.
			iv.	Attended Workshop on Fugitives Wanted for Environmental Crimes on 9-11 June 2014, Jakarta, Indonesia (Interpol). Participated by DWNP enforcement officer.
			v.	One (1) RMCD officer attended the 26th Administrative Meeting for National Contact Point of RILO, Asia Pacific at Langkawi on 11-13 Nov 2014.
			vi.	Two (2) enforcement officers attended APEC Workshop on Wildlife Trafficking - Related Customs practices in CEBU, 22-23 August 2015.
	3	Collaboration with Regional Intelligence Liaison Offices of the World Customs Organizations and the INTERPOL	i.	One (1) officer from the RMCD and DWNP respectively has attended ICCWC workshops that is a platform for collaboration with the World Bank, INTERPOL, UNODC, WCO and CITES Secretariat. These collaborations will be based on the programs scheduled by these agencies under the ICCWC.
			ii.	The WCO has led one (1) wildlife operation by Customs administrations in 2011. RMCD will lead such operations when a request is made for

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
			participation by the WCO. For 2014: i. One (1) RMCD officer attended Regional Seminar on National Customs Enforcement Network and Utilization of Customs Enforcement Network Database at Seoul, Korea on 16-18 Sept 2014. For 2015: i. Three (3) enforcement officers attended Workshop on the Application to Illegal Consignment of Wildlife Product, Prague, Czech Republic on 30 <sup>th</sup> March to 2 April 2015.
International enforcement collaboration	1	Placement of awareness bunting and brochure at airports	Brochure and buntings related to International Trade in Endangered Species Act 2008 (Act 686) were placed and distributed at KLIA and LCCT airport. Information highlighted were species listed and the severity of penalties under Act 686. In 2014, RMCD collaborate with TRAFFIC SEA has distributed a bunting and banner to 126 entry/exit points for Ivory awareness to public and Customs Officers.
Outreach, public awareness and education	2	Two (2) engagement session with public, traders or wildlife-related society	DWNP had hosted a dialogue session with licensed traders, captive breeders, zoo operators and wildlife-related society on 26 Feb 2014. Issues related to animal welfare were discussed. Engagement sessions with public and traders were conducted by DWNP, once in every state in Peninsular Malaysia between January-May 2014. Issues related to markings of live animals and products (including trophies) were discussed.
	3	Two (2) awareness seminar/ exhibition conducted	<ul> <li>Save the Nature Seminar was conducted on 19-20 April 2014 in collaboration with DWNP, Royal Malaysian Police and Forestry Department of Peninsular Malaysia.</li> </ul>

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
			<li>An awareness exhibition was set up in Fraser's Hill, Pahang on 21-22 June 2014 in conjunction with Fraser's Hill International Bird Race 2014.</li>
			<ul> <li>iii. Celebrate World Elephant Day on 5<sup>th</sup> September 2015, Kuala Gandah National Elephant Conservation Centre, Pahang</li> </ul>
Additional priority activities	1	Strengthening of Wildlife Genetic Resources Bank and Wildlife Forensic Laboratory (procurement of new equipment and filling up of new post)	<ul> <li>The Wildlife Genetic Resources Bank are now keeping ivory samples of all seizures surrendered to DWNP.</li> </ul>
			<ul> <li>ii. A new National Wildlife Forensic Laboratory will ready to operate in November 2015 with 11 Research Officer are dedicated to work at this lab. This lab is currently under evaluation process for Biosafety Level (BSL) 2 accreditation. DWNP will apply an additional accreditation ISO-IEC 17025:2005 in the future.</li> <li>iii. New and improved Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) of Wildlife Forensics and Species Identification was produced.</li> </ul>
	2	Forensic sampling for large confiscated ivory to determine the country of origin	An ivory forensic sampling session has been conducted on September 2014 for large stockpile confiscated on Dec 2012 at Port Klang, Selangor. The DNA collected have been processed to determine the country of origin, in order to understand the ivory crime chain.
			This was a collaboration between DWNP with Dr. Samuel K. Wasser from University of Washington, US.
			Results from the sampling have been received and countries of origin were informed.
	3	Improvement in investigation technique and prosecution processes (participation in programmed under international collaboration and periodic judiciary seminars)	Workshop in strengthening the enforcement capacity of DWNP was conducted on 27-29 Jan 2014 at Biodiversity Institute, Pahang, involving 30 participants.

NIAP CATEGORY		Indicator	Performance
			DWNP enforcement officer participated in Environmental Crime Course on 9-11 June 2014, hosted by Judicial and Legal Training Institute, Malaysia.
	4	To conduct parallel investigations under the Anti-Money Laundering laws.	28 Predicate Offence under AMLATFA 2001 have been included.
	5	Inventory of all government-held stockpile. Enhance cooperation with other enforcement agencies involved in the confiscation of ivory.	<ul> <li>All seized ivory has been marked and tagged and information on the level of stock was provided to the CITES Secretariat in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP16).</li> </ul>
			ii. Reports on inventory of Government-held stockpiles have been sent and recorded to Secretariat before every 28 Feb each year.
			<li>As of September 2014, 300 ivory samples had been collected for DNA analysis. Another DNA ivory sampling for large seizure will be conducted in October 2015.</li>
			<li>Enhance cooperation with other enforcement agencies involved in the confiscation of ivory.</li>
	6	Capacity building for enforcement officers at Ports, Airports and land border crossing points to be able to identify endangered species.	Seventy (70) RMCD officers have received training in the identification of ivory in training in September 2013 organized in collaboration with TRAFFIC Southeast Asia.
			Eleven (11) RMCD officers attended training in the identification of endangered species in collaboration with training by the Fisheries Department on 26 – 28 Nov 2013.
			In 2014, thirty-eight (38) RMCD officers were involved in the course Endangered Species Identification and 40 Customs officers from Enforcement Division were involved in the Wildlife Trade Regulation Workshop
			Twenty-eight (28) DWNP officers have be designated as identification experts to assist in

NIAP CATEGORY	Indicator	Performance	
		investigation and prosecution cases.	
		Capacity building for enforcement officers at Ports, Airports and land border crossing points to be able to identify endangered species conducted by DWNP have been held on 3 -7 August 2015.	

#### Part E: Annex (supporting information) (OPTIONAL)

- Annex 1: CITES Bunting in Airports
- Annex 2: CITES Bunting in 126 points for Ivory Awareness to public and Customs Officers
- Annex 3: A press statement released by RMCD in The Star dated on 26th January 2015 with regards to the confiscated ivory
- Annex 4: Save the Nature Seminar
- Annex 5: Celebration of World Elephant Day on 5th September 2015
- Annex 6: Data on Awareness Exhibition by DWNP

## **CITES BUNTING**



## ANNEX 2

# CITES BUNTING FOR IVORY AWARENESS TO PUBLIC AND CUSTOMS OFFICERS



Published: Monday January 26, 2015 MYT 3:00:00 AM Updated: Monday January 26, 2015 MYT 1:51:25 PM

# The fate of seized ivory in Malaysia

#### BY LIM CHIA YING



Illicit cargo: A Customs officer checking seized elephant tusks in Port Klang, Selangor. Since 2012, Malaysia has seized tusks worth over RM19mil. — Filepic

## Malaysia is not spared as a transit point for illegal ivory shipment.

Every year, thousands of elephants in Africa are butchered for their highly-prized tusks to fuel a lucrative global trade and black market demand. The tusks are exported and smuggled into Asia, where they are turned into carved ornamental ivories.

Malaysia is not spared as a transit point for some of the shipments but thankfully, checks at immigration points have deterred several of the illicit cargoes. The Royal Malaysian Customs Department has, since 2012, made seven seizures valued at RM19,805,132, according to director-general Datuk Seri Khazali Ahmad.

"Up until 2012, all seizures of ivory were made at ports, in Klang, Pasir Gudang and Penang. But since 2013, seizures were made at Kuala Lumpur International Airport. We constantly monitor all points of entry as smugglers change their smuggling *modus operandi* to avoid detection."

Khazali says all seized tusks are kept by the department to facilitate investigations. It maintains stock records and these are verified during store audits.

"Once the investigation is completed on our part, we will hand over the ivories to the Wildlife and National Parks Department (Perhilitan) for their disposal.



Khazali says Customs officers routinely checks for illegal ivory shipments at major entry points in the country. Photo: RICKY LAI/The Star

"However, the investigation process itself takes a long time, usually years, because of the amount of intelligence work involved to get to the bottom of the trafficking."

Khazali says the department has handed over tusks valued at RM19,697,953 from five cases (from the seven confiscations made in 2012 and 2013) to Perhilitan for their

handling. Last year's seizures were valued at RM107,179. (He declined to give the tonnage for the stocks.)

"We don't interfere with what Perhilitan does with the ivory (after the handing over), and we don't follow up with them either," says Khazali.

Activist Sean Whyte of Britain-based group Nature Alert had raised questions on the outcome of the seizures, particularly on where the tusks are. He claimed that no independent audit has been carried out on the seized ivory and questioned why the illicit stocks have not been destroyed as has been done in China. He also criticised the authorities for failing to make any arrests. Ivory is on Appendix I of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES), and so cannot be traded.

In response to the allegations, Khazali says: "The allegations are baseless. For what should we keep the stocks? All I have to say is that we are taking action to stop the illegal trade, are keeping an eye on ivory trading on our shores, and are serious about seizures. We want to make it clear that Malaysia is no springboard for this business to flourish."

He adds that the seizures were made without any prosecutions and the investigations did not lead to arrests because Malaysia is at the tail-end of the smuggling. The poachers, he says, are not here and often, the logistics company for the shipment does not exist, all of which makes prosecution of the smugglers impossible.

"The only thing we can do is to catch hold of the consignment during its transfer and make sure it is not used illegally. They are usually not intended for the Malaysian market but for countries elsewhere. The perpetrators may think they can get pass us but our officers are always on the alert."

Khazali says that between December 2013 and January 2014, Customs officers participated in Operation Cobra II organised by the World Customs Organisation for detection of wildlife crimes involving species protected by CITES. There are collaborations between domestic and international enforcement agencies as well as NGOs to take action on suspected shipments. Various risk indicators are used to detect high-risk shipments at seaports and the airport. "As we cannot open the boxes, selected cargoes will undergo X-ray checks for suspicious images, while suspected ones will be subjected to full physical examination to detect ivory concealed among other goods," explains Khazali.

Perhilitan enforcement division director Abdul Kadir Abu Hashim says there is no domestic industry for ivory products. Contrary to claims that there has been no arrests, he says a China national was prosecuted last January for attempting to smuggle 16 ivories at the Low Cost Carrier Terminal. He was imprisoned for two months and fined RM250,000.

On the seized tusks, Abdul Kadir says stocks are being held by Perhilitan. "The cargo is not lost and has not been sold. It is still with us for safe-keeping. Under CITES rules, we cannot sell this illegal cargo. We are also committed to report the government-held ivory stockpile to the CITES secretariat annually."

He says Malaysia has developed a National Ivory Action Plan (which was submitted to CITES in 2013) with measures to prevent illegal import and re-export of ivory from Malaysian ports and entry points.

SAVE THE NATURE SEMINAR 19-20 APRIL 2014 KUALA LUMPUR







**ANNEX 4** 

## **ANNEX 5**

## WORLD ELEPHANT DAY 5TH SEPTEMBER 2015 KUALA GANDAH NATIONAL ELEPHANT CONSERVATION CENTRE, PAHANG



# Awareness Program Conducted in 2014

Bil. <i>No.</i>	Negeri <i>State</i>	Pusat <i>Center</i>	Pameran Exhibition
1	Perlis	PPBD Wang Pinang Wang Pinang Biodiversity Education Centre (BEC)	8
2	Kedah	Gunung Jerai	23
3	Pulau Pinang	Taman Negara Pulau Pinang Penang National Park	2
		PERHILITAN Negeri State of DWNP	17
		PKHL Sungkai Sungkai Wildlife Conservation Centres (WCC)	1
4	Selangor	PKHL Sg Dusun <b>Sg Dusun WCC</b>	13
		Paya Indah Wetlands <b>PIW</b>	5
5	Melaka	PPBD Tanjung Tuan <b>Tanjung Tuan BEC</b>	9
6	Johor	PPBD Jemaluang Jemaluang BEC	24
7	Terengganu	PPBD Bukit Marak Terengganu <b>Bukit Marak BEC, Terengganu</b>	6
8	Pahang	Perhilitan Negeri dan Daerah-Daerah State of DWNP State & Dictrict	6
		Institut Biodiversiti Institute of Biodiversity	11
		Sg. Relau Taman Negara Pahang <b>Sungai Relau, Pahang National Park</b>	3
		Tapak RAMSAR Tasek Bera <i>Tasek Bera Ramsar Site</i>	4
Total			132

# Awareness Program Conducted as of June 2015

Bil. No.	Negeri <i>State</i>	Pusat Center	Pameran Exhibition
1	Perlis	PPBD Wang Pinang <i>Wang Pinang BEC</i>	4
2	Kedah	Gunung Jerai	8
3	Pulau Pinang	Taman Negara Pulau Pinang Penang National Park	3
		PERHILITAN Negeri State of DWNP	8
4	Selangor	PKHL Sg Dusun <b>Sg Dusun WCC</b>	5
5	Melaka	PPBD Tanjung Tuan <b>Tanjung Tuan BEC</b>	6
6	Johor	PPBD Jemaluang Jemaluang BEC	4
7	Terengganu	PPBD Bukit Marak Terengganu <b>Bukit Marak BEC, Terengganu</b>	5
8	Pahang	Perhilitan Negeri dan Daerah-Daerah State of DWNP State & Dictrict	1
		Institut Biodiversiti Institute of Biodiversity	4
		Sg. Relau Taman Negara Pahang <b>Sungai Relau, Pahang National Park</b>	1
		Tapak RAMSAR Tasek Bera <b>Tasek Bera Ramsar Site</b>	1
	50		