

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

---



Sixty-first meeting of the Standing Committee  
Geneva (Switzerland), 15-19 August 2011

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation

Elephants

FIRST TECHNICAL EXCHANGE MEETING BETWEEN PRODUCING, CONSUMING, AND  
TRANSITING NATIONS TO REDUCE THE ILLEGAL TRADE IN AFRICAN ELEPHANT IVORY

1. This document has been submitted by the United States of America. It has been prepared in collaboration with the IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group. \*

Background

2. In response to growing concerns about illegal killing of elephants driven by the illegal trade in ivory, the IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group (AfESG) in collaboration with the China, Thailand and the United States of America (USA) developed a concept for a set of technical exchange meetings to contribute to reducing the illegal trade in ivory.
3. Taking into account concerns about range State responsibilities, but also those of the transiting and consuming countries of illegal ivory, a concept was developed for a set of technical exchanges between producing, consuming and transiting nations to develop joint activities to help reduce the illegal trade in ivory.
4. The first Technical Exchange Meeting between producing, consuming, and transiting nations to reduce the illegal trade in African elephant ivory was held during November 11 – 13, 2010 in Hangzhou, China. The meeting was hosted by China and substantial funding was provided by the United States Fish & Wildlife Service. The meeting was facilitated by the AfESG.
5. The meeting was attended by representatives from China, the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Tanzania, Thailand, the USA, and Viet Nam. Representatives from Cameroon and the Philippines were unable to attend. Representatives from TRAFFIC East/Southern Africa, TRAFFIC East Asia China Programme, and the CITES MIKE programme also attended the meeting. A full list of participants is available in Annex I.

Meeting summary

6. The objectives of the meeting were to: initiate discussions about this serious topic amongst all players in the supply chain; understand more deeply the factors involved at each stage in the current illegal killing and trade dynamic; understand the involvement of various actors at all levels in the supply chain; review the interventions that might be most influential in changing the behavior of actors involved; discuss and design further exchanges of technical information and expertise; and identify key awareness-raising activities to be implemented at each step in the supply chain.

---

\* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat or the United Nations Environment Programme concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

7. It was agreed that the meeting would not focus on law enforcement, as there are a number of other mechanisms for undertaking enforcement-related efforts, in particular Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP15), Decision 13.26 (Rev. CoP15) and Decision 15.72. Rather, this meeting would focus on ways to supplement law enforcement activities with an increase in education and awareness all along the supply chain to contribute to reducing illegal trade in ivory.
8. A number of addresses and presentations were given to welcome participants and provide background to the situation.
  - I. Welcome  
*Dr. Meng Xianlin, Deputy Director General, CITES Management Authority of the People's Republic of China*
  - II. Opening remarks  
*Dr. Su Chunyu, Executive Director General, CITES Management Authority of the People's Republic of China*
  - III. Opening remarks  
*Mr. Craig Hoover, Chief of the Branch of CITES Operations for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service*
  - IV. Meeting overview  
*Dr. Holly Dublin, Chair, IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group*
  - V. Growing press coverage of the illegal ivory trade  
*Ms. Diane Skinner, Programme Officer, IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group*
  - VI. Elephant conservation and ivory challenges in Tanzania  
*Mr. Erasmus Tarimo, Director of Wildlife for the United Republic of Tanzania*
  - VII. Challenges of wildlife management in the Democratic Republic of the Congo  
*Pasteur Cosma Wilungula Balongelwa, Director-General for the DRC Institut Congolais pour la Conservation de la Nature*
  - VIII. Challenges Conservation and trade challenges in Viet Nam  
*Mr. Quang Tung Do, Deputy Director of the CITES Management Authority for Viet Nam*
  - IX. Conservation and trade challenges in Thailand  
*Mr. Adisorn Noochdumrong, CITES Management Authority for Thailand*
  - X. Trade challenges in China  
*Mr. Wan Ziming, Director Enforcement and Training Division, CITES Management Authority for the People's Republic of China*
  - XI. USA's work in combating illegal trade in ivory  
*Mr. Craig Hoover, Chief of the Branch of CITES Operations for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service*
  - XII. Relevant results from the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS)  
*Mr. Tom Milliken, TRAFFIC East/Southern Africa*
  - XIII. Relevant results from the CITES MIKE (Monitoring the Illegal Killing of Elephants) programme  
*Mr. Julian Blanc, Data Analyst, CITES MIKE Programme*
9. The presentations and the ensuing discussions demonstrated the wide range of challenges faced along the supply chain. It was particularly useful for African range States to understand the massive challenges faced by the transiting and consuming States in controlling the trade. Equally, the transiting and consuming States found it highly useful to understand the huge amount of resources required to conserve large elephant populations in extremely vast areas of land, both protected and unprotected, in Africa.
10. The activities outlined in the meeting results and recommendations below reflect the main issues which were raised in the presentations and discussions.

Meeting results and recommendations

11. A number of activities were identified for the group to implement. These are outlined in the table below, divided into each step along the supply chain:

| <b>Activities at the producing level</b>                |   |
|---|---|
| 1.  | <p>Inform listeners in Africa through Radio China International (RCI) about the laws in Africa and China governing ivory trade and the penalties given to those contravening the laws. These programs should also inform listeners about conservation of elephants and other wildlife.</p> <p><i>China Management Authority will request RCI HQ to undertake this programme. TRAFFIC and AfESG will help to prepare the information and script.</i></p>   |
| 2.  | <p>Produce handout for Chinese visitors and laborers. This will be a small, wallet-sized piece, with practical information on one side and information on the wildlife trade on the other. This activity will be piloted initially in Tanzania.</p> <p><i>TRAFFIC will develop the handout and work with the Tanzania Management Authority to disseminate through the Tanzanian embassy in China and with appropriate companies in Tanzania.</i></p>  |
| 3.  | <p>Identify Chinese companies in African range States and educate laborers in range States on the laws surrounding wildlife trade.</p> <p><i>This will be undertaken initially in DRC and Tanzania through collaboration between select companies, the relevant range State Management Authority and the Chinese embassies in those countries.</i></p>  |
| 4.  | <p>Educate travelers about the illegal ivory trade through in-flight videos, airline magazines, and handouts on flights in and out of Africa, particularly on flights operated by Ethiopian Airlines, Kenya Airlines, Qatar Airlines, and Emirates.</p> <p><i>TRAFFIC will compile data which can be taken to airlines regarding illegal ivory moving on specific flight routes. AfESG will approach Kenya Airways, Ethiopian Airlines, Emirates, and Qatar Airways in Nairobi. TRAFFIC will approach Ethiopian Airlines in Beijing.</i></p>  |
| 5.  | <p>Produce leaflet on the illegal wildlife trade which will be inserted into passports when visas are issued at Chinese and Thai embassies in DRC and Tanzania and at the Chinese embassy in Thailand.</p> <p><i>China Management Authority and Thailand Management Authority will take this on, with assistance from TRAFFIC if necessary.</i></p>   |
| 6.  | <p>Educate travelers about the illegal wildlife trade using posters and leaflets in airport arrival halls of international airports and at land border posts in appropriate languages. These activities should be focused on African range States and in Thailand.</p> <p><i>Tanzania, DRC and Thailand Management Authorities</i></p>  |
| 7.  | <p>Educate tourists to Tanzania and Thailand through tour operators and tourism boards</p> <p><i>TRAFFIC and the Tanzanian and Thailand Management Authorities</i></p>  |
| <b>Activities at the consuming and transiting level</b> |   |
| 8.  | <p>Produce leaflets on the illegal wildlife trade to educate travelers from China and Thailand to Africa. These leaflets will be inserted into passports when visas are issued at Tanzania and DRC embassies in China and Thailand.</p> <p><i>TRAFFIC will develop material and the Tanzanian and DRC Management Authorities will request their embassies to collaborate with the China Management Authority to disseminate information. AfESG will follow up with the China Management Authority to determine which embassies are in Beijing and approach those countries to encourage them to also undertake this activity.</i></p> |
| 9.  | <p>Request the Chinese Ministry of Commerce to ask companies, travel agencies and provincial governments to educate laborers in particular industries (construction and mining) operating in Africa.</p> <p><i>China Management Authority to approach Chinese Ministry of Commerce on this issue to see whether they are willing to partner on this.</i></p>  |
| 10.   | <p>Communicate how the legal ivory market works in China through, for example, Pachyderm, National Geographic, Al Jazeera, Discovery, etc.</p> <p><i>Tom Milliken will assist the China Management Authority with drafting this document.</i></p>   |
| 11.   | <p>Outreach to tourists through tour agencies in China and Thailand</p> <p><i>TRAFFIC and the Thailand and China Management Authorities</i></p>   |
| 12.   | <p>Continue to educate Chinese consumers on the legal avenues for ivory and the legal consequences of buying and selling illegal ivory</p>  |

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
|                                 | <i>China Management Authority</i>   |
| 13.                             | Continue to communicate to the carving industry that the size of the industry is capped and the reasons for capping the industry<br><i>China Management Authority</i>   |
| 14.                             | Communicate enforcement successes<br><i>All</i>   |
| <b>Activities at all levels</b> |   |
| 15.                             | Documentary on the challenges of taking care of confiscated ivory stocks throughout the value chain.<br><i>J. Blanc to suggest to UNEP's Division of Communications and Public Information</i>  |
| 16.                             | Explore the possibility of undertaking an update of ivory stocks held around the world<br><i>TRAFFIC will explore the possibility of undertaking this</i>   |
| 17.                             | Explore the possibility of developing a co-sponsored document for the next CoP regarding confiscated ivory, outlining the issue in detail and exploring possibilities for non-commercial disposal of the stocks.<br><i>All Management Authorities at this meeting. CITES Secretariat can be asked for technical advice.</i>                         |
| 18.                             | Explore a collaborative effort by all countries in the value chain to understand and communicate the problem of confiscated ivory at all stages, perhaps through a study tour (for the EU, for example). Austria, Germany and the USA might be good donors to approach.<br><i>Viet Nam Management Authority with support from TRAFFIC and AfESG</i> |

12. A number of activities were identified which the meeting considered to be very important, but not actionable by the participants at this time. However, they hoped to be able to implement or provide influence on these issues in the future.

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>Activities to be undertaken at a later stage</b> |   |
| a.  | Link with TRAFFIC initiative for capacity building and training on wildlife trade and CITES issues in East African seaports, currently under development.   |
| b.  | Outreach to laborers in Africa directly through relevant companies.   |
| c.  | Educate the Chinese public through programs on CCTV which broadcasts throughout Africa.   |
| d.  | Develop and test an anonymous hotline in appropriate languages to encourage reports on illegal wildlife trade.  |
| e.  | Collaborate with the private sector (transport industry) to discuss movement of ivory in container traffic.   |
| <b>Areas where this group can provide input</b>     |   |
| f.  | Inform and assist the work of relevant law enforcement initiatives, such as the Association of Southeast Asian Nations Wildlife Enforcement Network, Lusaka Agreement Task Force and the Rhinoceros and Ivory Environment Task Force, to be established under CITES Decision 15.72. |
| g.  | Facilitate bilateral collaboration between countries.   |
| h.  | Provide advice on overcoming jurisdictional and legal matters, or help to identify these issues and refer them to the CITES Secretariat.  |
| i.  | Encourage collaboration and linkages between implicated airlines (Ethiopian Airlines, Kenya Airways, Qatar Airways, and Emirates) with the relevant Customs authorities and CITES management authorities to enhance law enforcement.  |

13. The meeting identified two issues of major importance which, while not within the scope of this meeting, the participants felt needed to be brought to the attention of the CITES community. These were: the continuing need to implement Decision 13.26 (Rev. CoP15), *Action plan for the control of trade in elephant ivory* in order to control unregulated domestic ivory markets; and jurisdictional challenges, particularly with respect to the relationship between Customs authorities and CITES MAs in many countries, which block the ability to properly investigate and prosecute cases and also create uncertainty about "ownership" of ivory seizures. It was noted that this is an issue that the CITES Secretariat could take on in the context of its formal cooperative agreements with Interpol and the World Customs Organization.

14. It was agreed that a document outlining the results of the meeting and the activities which had been successfully implemented since the meeting would be submitted to the 61<sup>st</sup> meeting of the CITES Standing Committee.
15. It was also agreed that this set of exchanges, delinked from the CITES listing process, was a valuable opportunity for engagement across the entire ivory flow chain, and should be continued with subsequent meetings, which should include additional key countries in the supply chain, such as Ethiopia, Gabon, Mozambique, Nigeria, and the United Arab Emirates.

#### Activities since the meeting

16. There has been significant progress on a number of the activities outlined above and these are summarized below with reference to the activity number from the table in Paragraph 11 above.
  - a. The CITES MIKE programme has, through UNEP's Division of Communications and Public Information, connected the China Management Authority in Beijing with the Nairobi bureau of CCTV and CNC, which are Xinha's news channels in English, for potential screening of awareness materials. **(Ref: Activity 1)**
  - b. The China Management Authority, in partnership with the International Fund for Animal Welfare, is producing a CITES brochure to display at the visa section of Chinese embassies in selected African elephant range states and at the embassies of selected African elephant range states in Beijing. **(Ref: Activities 2, 5 and 8)**
  - c. The AfESG is working with Kenya Airways to develop an awareness campaign on key routes between destinations in Africa and destinations in Asia to alert passengers about the legal and conservation consequences of engaging in the illegal trade in ivory. **(Ref: Activity 4)**
  - d. The State Forestry Administration of China, in partnership with the Ministry of Commerce and the State Tourism Administration, has launched a campaign that aims at raising the CITES awareness of the Chinese nationals who will be going abroad in particular tourists, laborers and traders. The campaign will be implemented by forest, commerce and tourism departments at all levels, who will work with relevant companies and travel agencies to provide the CITES leaflet and any additional necessary information to Chinese citizens who are preparing to go abroad **(Ref: Activities 5 and 9)**.
  - e. The China Management Authority, in partnership with the State Customs General Administration and the International Fund for Animal Welfare, has designed a set of CITES posters, 1,200 of which have been distributed to 400 Chinese ports for display at the Customs declaration areas **(Ref: Activity 6)**.
  - f. The China Management Authority, in partnership with ASEAN-WEN, Conservation International and other governmental agencies, are displaying hundreds of CITES posters produced in Chinese, Vietnamese, Burmese and Laotian languages at the ports located in Sino-Viet Nam, Sino-Laos and Sino-Myanmar borders **(Ref: Activity 6)**.
  - g. Thailand, in collaboration with a number of NGO partners, has launched a number of awareness events, the most recent of which was held at Suvarnabhumi International Airport explicitly focusing on the illegal ivory trade. The campaign entitled "Buy Ivory - Buy Trouble" was aimed at informing tourists and foreign visitors to Thailand not to buy ivory products. **(Ref: Activity 6)**
  - h. The Thailand Management Authority is preparing training courses for tourist guides on the regulations surrounding the trade in ivory, in particular the small items of worked ivory favored by tourists and visitors. **(Ref: Activity 7 and 11)**
  - i. The State Forestry Administration of China organized a seminar on the control of trade in ivory to which all designated ivory processors and retailers were invited. **(Ref: Activity 13)**.
  - j. The Ministry of Commerce of Thailand has recently issued two Ministerial Proclamations which concern the registration of all ivory traders and the control of ivory stock. It is envisaged that this registration requirement, once complete, will help enable the effective control of domestic ivory trade. These requirements will be accompanied by a series of training courses to sensitize ivory traders to the regulations. **(Ref: Activity 13)**

- k. The authorities in China, Thailand, and the USA have made a number of high profile seizures, which have reached the international press. **(Ref: Activity 14)**.
- l. The CITES MIKE programme has suggested to UNEP's Division of Communications and Public Information the idea of making a documentary about the problems faced by governments at various points in the supply chain who, as a result of their successful law enforcement actions, have to safely store and maintain ivory stockpiles. **(Ref: Activity 15)**

#### Conclusion

- 17. It is hoped that this initiative will catalyze additional efforts to educate and increase awareness of consumers all along the ivory supply chain, and particularly consumer country nationals in Africa, and that these efforts will lead to a substantial reduction in illegal ivory trade.

**Meeting Participants**

**Cosma Wilungula Balongelwa**

Directeur General  
ICCN/ Ministere de l'Environnement Conservation,  
De la Nature et Tourisme  
D. R. CONGO

**Jose Julian Juarez Blanc**

Data Analyst  
CITES MIKE Programme

**Quang Tung Do**

Deputy Director  
Viet Nam CITES Management Authority  
VIET NAM

**Holly T. Dublin**

Chair  
IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group

**Craig Hoover**

Chief, Branch of CITES Operations  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
USA

**Tianyong Luo**

Executive Director, Hangzhou Office  
CITES Management Authority  
CHINA

**Xianlin Meng**

Deputy Director General  
Endangered Species Ipm. & Exp. Administrative  
Office  
State Forestry Administration  
CHINA

**Tom Milliken**

Regional Director  
TRAFFIC East/Southern Africa

**Adisorn Noochdumrong**

Professional Forest Officer  
Department of National Parks, Wildlife and  
Plant Conservation, Ministry of Natural Resources  
& Environment  
THAILAND

**Diane Skinner**

Programme Officer  
IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group

**Chunyu Su**

Executive Director General  
Endangered Species Ipm. & Exp.  
Administrative Office  
State Forestry Administration  
CHINA

**Erasmus M. Tarimo**

Director of Wildlife  
Wildlife Division  
TANZANIA

**Ziming Wan**

Director of Enforcement and Training Division  
Endangered Species Ipm. & Exp.  
Administrative Office  
State Forestry Administration  
CHINA

**Hongfa Xu**

Director, TRAFFIC East Asia China Programme  
TRAFFIC

**Apologies received from:**

**Philip Tabi Tako-Eta**

Director of Wildlife & Protected Areas  
Ministry of Forestry & Wildlife  
CAMEROON

**Reynaldo Villafuerte**

Regional Technical Director  
Department of Environment & Natural  
Resources  
PHILIPPINES