

**Responses to the Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10
on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa***

This Annex contains the responses received from Parties as elaborated in paragraph 3 to document PC25 Doc. 24, in the language and format in which they were submitted, and in the following order:

- 1) Bhutan
- 2) Cambodia
- 3) China
- 4) Germany
- 5) the Philippines
- 6) Switzerland
- 7) Thailand
- 8) United States of America

Bhutan

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: Royal Government of Bhutan		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: Ngawang Gyeltshen	
		Phone: 00975 2 325042 (O)	
		Email: ngawanggyeltshen@moaf.gov.bt	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country?			
	Yes: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No: <input type="checkbox"/>		
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned			
	Community owned			
	Individual/family owned	0.80 ha		
	Company owned		4.4 ha	
	Other: Research & trial plot		4.2 ha	

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing
<i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i>	Seed & seedlings	Private nurseries in south Bhutan	NA

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>In the year 1976, seeds and seedlings were collected from wild and raised in the nurseries in south Bhutan. Seedlings were then distributed further to the individual households for plantations at free cost by the Government. Today the seeds are collected from backyard home garden of private individuals. In 2011 unknown defoliator was reported from Chengmari, Samtse, south Bhutan by D. B Chhetri suffering the plantation. The research and trial plots in Bhutan are successful in terms of growth but not in terms of agarwood production.</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>The definition is not useful for regulating the NDFs of agar producing taxa and the vulnerability of the <i>in-situ</i> species is determined by the volume of the traded species in general. Let “under controlled condition” be understood as “<i>ex-situ</i>” or manmade/built-up structure not requiring NDFs however, the authorised agency has to maintain the record of plantation through registration in the country to certify the origin of the species in the CITES Permit/Certificate.</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>The definition is not useful for regulating the NDFs of agar producing taxa. However, the specimens for artificial propagation can be collected from the designated seed orchard and the collection should not be detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild. Such arrangements can be made by prescribing Standard Operating Procedures to an authorised agency in consultation with the registered growers in the country.</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>'Assisted production' shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p>
-----	---

	<p>i) <i>do not fall within the definition of ‘artificially propagated’, and</i> ii) <i>are considered not to be ‘wild’ because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i></p> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>The concept “artificial propagation” does cover all the propagules and the term “assisted production” should be removed or subsumed under “artificial propagation, it does not make much sense. In short, artificial propagation is meant for enhanced production through any artificial means.</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p>We do not have so called assisted production in Bhutan.</p>
--	--

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>In the early 1950s and 60s natural agarwood trees were found in Manas region of south Bhutan. However, in the 1970s all trees were harvested and traded, as of today very few natural stands of <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> is secured inside the Royal Manas National Park. Therefore, NDFs of agarwood was not used and not a concern for Bhutan. Only small scale sporadic plantation of agar does exist in the country today to meet the demand of the cottage industries in the country. Under the Paragraphs 5-6 of the Resolution Conf.16.10 should mention “Bhutan is exempted from NDFs of agarwood products” with annotation.</p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>Training and capacity building of the staff was limited to on station and on farm research and trial plots in few places of central and south Bhutan. The on station research centres hasn’t succeeded in artificial inoculation. However the trial plantation were successful in terms of growth but not in terms of agarwood production, which means the agarwood guidance was not used.</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>Agarwood NDF guidance was not used. Observation or suggestion will be intimated in near future.</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>Registration system is not in place as of today. However, such systems can be initiated in consultation with the authorised agency to do so.</p>
5.2	<p>If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.</p> <p>There will be no obstacles to the registration system in general. However, such interventions may contradict with some of the existing legislation in the country, such as: Forest and Nature Conservation Act of 1995, Land Act of Bhutan 2007 etc.</p>

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	<p>Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.</p> <p>This may be possible with the recent advances in the field of Bio-technology elsewhere. So far the research in Bhutan has no capacity to determine the products either from wild or plantation.</p>
5.4	<p>Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.</p> <p>Not in a position to answer.</p>
5.5	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>Registration system is not in place as of today. However, the exporter obtain export license from the Ministry of Economic Affairs</p>
5.6	<p>Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.</p> <p>No samples were collected and maintained for future record. However, such systems can be initiated in consultation with the authorised agency and the CITES secretariat.</p>
5.7	<p>Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?</p> <p>The glossary of agarwood products was never referred. Looking forwards to the outcome of the 25 meeting of the plant committee.</p>

Final considerations

6.1	<p>Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. NA2. NA3. NA4. NA
6.2	<p>Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country.</p> <p>Only small scale sporadic plantation of <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> does exist in the country today to meet the demand of the cottage industries in the country. The natural stand is almost non-existence with few trees inside Royal Manas National Park. Therefore, Bhutan wishes to be exempted from NDFs of agarwood products as submitted above.</p>

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!

Cambodia

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: Cambodia		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: CHHANG Phourin	
		Phone: +855 747 666	
		Email: c_phourin@yahoo.com	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country?			
	Yes: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No: <input type="checkbox"/>		
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned	N/A		
	Community owned	N/A		
	Individual/family owned	60	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
	Company owned	N/A		
	Other			

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing
<i>Aquilaria crassna</i> Pierre ex Lec.	Seeds	Natural	

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>N/A</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>N/A</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>N/A</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>‘Assisted production’ shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>i) do not fall within the definition of ‘artificially propagated’, and</i> <i>ii) are considered not to be ‘wild’ because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>N/A</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p>
-----	--

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>No</p>
-----	---

4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>No</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>No</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>No</p>
5.2	<p>If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.</p> <p>No</p>

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate. No
5.4	Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain. No
5.5	Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied? No
5.6	Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.
5.7	Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting? N/A

Final considerations

6.1	Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain. 1. 2. 3. 4.
6.2	Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country. N/A

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!

China

Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa

1.1	Party: China		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: YUAN Liangchen (CITES MA)	Wei Jianhe(CITES SA)
		Phone: 86-10-84238439	86-10-57833358
		Email: citesyuan@126.com	wjianh@263.net
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country?			
	Yes: ✓	No:		
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned	100 ha	100 ha	0
	Community owned			
	Individual/family owned	4950 ha	4950 ha	0
	Company owned	Same as above, because all involved companies are private or family owned		
Other				

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing
<i>Aquilaria sinensis</i> (Lour.) Spreng.	seeds, seedlings, saplings	cultivated parental stock	artificially propagated

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of ‘cultivated parental stock’ in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>For a country or region without plantations of agarwood-producing trees, it may be necessary to collect seeds or seedlings from wild populations as propagules in the early stages from wild to domestic. Although it may have some impact on wild populations, it does not cause devastating damage. However, the agarwood plantation of <i>Aquilaria sinensis</i> has developed rapidly, and its cultivation area and quantity have been extremely rich in China. There are enough seeds and seedlings are produced by the cultivated adult agarwood-producing trees annually.</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “For agarwood-producing taxa, ‘under controlled conditions’ means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>The concept is useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products.</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of ‘cultivated parental stock’ in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>It is useful to regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products. The government of China attaches great importance to the protection and development of agarwood resources. <i>Aquilaria sinensis</i> was listed as the national grade II protected wild plant by the State Council in 1999. Therefore, collecting wild agarwood is illegal in China. At the same time, the government of China has encouraged farmers to plant agarwood-producing trees for more than 20 years.</p> <p>There is no doubt that this definition can help to protect wild populations of agarwood-producing taxa.</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p>
-----	---

	<p><i>'Assisted production' shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <p><i>i) do not fall within the definition of 'artificially propagated', and</i></p> <p><i>ii) are considered not to be 'wild' because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i></p> <p>Do you believe this concept of "assisted production" could complement or replace the concepts relating to "artificial propagation" as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>This concept of "assisted production" is not clearly defined and could not complement or replace the concepts relating to "artificial propagation".</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p>No.</p>
--	--

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>The government of China has not yet implemented the agarwood NDF guidance. Because it is not necessary for China to carry out it. China has established strict laws to prohibit the collection wild agarwood from 1990s. On the other hand, till now there are more than 30 million of planting agarwood-producing trees in China for agarwood induction.</p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>No.</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>No.</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>Not yet.</p>
5.2	<p>If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.</p>

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	<p>Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.</p> <p>For the unprocessed agarwood products produced by drilling, burning, or Agar-Wit technology except for cutting method, they can be distinguished from wild ones. However, it is difficult to distinguish agarwood processed products, such as powder, essential oils between planting and wild.</p>
5.4	<p>Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.</p> <p>Yes, there are. Agarwood inducing by cutting planting agarwood-producing trees may by mix with wild ones. But in China, such agarwood is impossible used for export, because it is expensive and welcomed in the domestic market.</p>
5.5	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>No, not yet. Because almost no such kind of product was exported up to now.</p>
5.6	<p>Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.</p> <p>No.</p>
5.7	<p>Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?</p> <p>No comments. China believes that this glossary well covers relevant information.</p>

Final considerations

6. 1	<p>Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain.</p> <p>1. The main research papers on Agar-Wit technology are as follows:</p> <p>[1] Liu Y, Chen H, Yang Y, et al. Whole-tree agarwood-inducing technique: an efficient novel technique for producing high-quality agarwood in cultivated <i>Aquilaria sinensis</i> trees[J]. <i>Molecules</i>, 2013, 18(3): 3086-3106.</p> <p>[2] Yang Y, Feng J, Zhu J X, et al. Quality of agarwood produced by whole tree agarwood-inducing technique (Agar-Wit) from China and southeast Asian countries[J]. <i>Chinese Pharmaceutical Journal</i>, 2019, 54(23): 1988-1994.</p> <p>2. The induction trees number of the application of Agar-Wit technology in China and Southeast Asian countries (units:).</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: left;">Regions</th> <th style="text-align: left;">Technique</th> <th style="text-align: left;">Date</th> <th style="text-align: left;">Num of inducing trees</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Hainan,China</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2012.01-2019.12</td><td>147000</td></tr> <tr><td>Guangdong,China</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2011.01-2019.12</td><td>134800</td></tr> <tr><td>Guangxi,China</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2012.03-2015.12</td><td>43000</td></tr> <tr><td>Yunnan,China</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2013.01-2015.12</td><td>55000</td></tr> <tr><td>Fujian,China</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.01-2015.12</td><td>1000</td></tr> <tr><td>Myanmar</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2018.01-2019.12</td><td>1000</td></tr> <tr><td>Vietnam</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.01-2019.12</td><td>5000</td></tr> <tr><td>Cambodia</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2016.01-2019.12</td><td>3000</td></tr> <tr><td>Thailand</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.03-2014.12</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>Bangladesh</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2015.10-2016.05</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>Laos</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.09-2015.09</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>Brunei</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2019.01-2019.12</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>Malaysia</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.11-2015.06</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr><td>Indonesia</td><td>Agar-Wit</td><td>2014.08-2015.09</td><td>100</td></tr> <tr> <td colspan="3">Total</td> <td>390400</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Regions	Technique	Date	Num of inducing trees	Hainan,China	Agar-Wit	2012.01-2019.12	147000	Guangdong,China	Agar-Wit	2011.01-2019.12	134800	Guangxi,China	Agar-Wit	2012.03-2015.12	43000	Yunnan,China	Agar-Wit	2013.01-2015.12	55000	Fujian,China	Agar-Wit	2014.01-2015.12	1000	Myanmar	Agar-Wit	2018.01-2019.12	1000	Vietnam	Agar-Wit	2014.01-2019.12	5000	Cambodia	Agar-Wit	2016.01-2019.12	3000	Thailand	Agar-Wit	2014.03-2014.12	100	Bangladesh	Agar-Wit	2015.10-2016.05	100	Laos	Agar-Wit	2014.09-2015.09	100	Brunei	Agar-Wit	2019.01-2019.12	100	Malaysia	Agar-Wit	2014.11-2015.06	100	Indonesia	Agar-Wit	2014.08-2015.09	100	Total			390400
Regions	Technique	Date	Num of inducing trees																																																														
Hainan,China	Agar-Wit	2012.01-2019.12	147000																																																														
Guangdong,China	Agar-Wit	2011.01-2019.12	134800																																																														
Guangxi,China	Agar-Wit	2012.03-2015.12	43000																																																														
Yunnan,China	Agar-Wit	2013.01-2015.12	55000																																																														
Fujian,China	Agar-Wit	2014.01-2015.12	1000																																																														
Myanmar	Agar-Wit	2018.01-2019.12	1000																																																														
Vietnam	Agar-Wit	2014.01-2019.12	5000																																																														
Cambodia	Agar-Wit	2016.01-2019.12	3000																																																														
Thailand	Agar-Wit	2014.03-2014.12	100																																																														
Bangladesh	Agar-Wit	2015.10-2016.05	100																																																														
Laos	Agar-Wit	2014.09-2015.09	100																																																														
Brunei	Agar-Wit	2019.01-2019.12	100																																																														
Malaysia	Agar-Wit	2014.11-2015.06	100																																																														
Indonesia	Agar-Wit	2014.08-2015.09	100																																																														
Total			390400																																																														

3. Some photos of artificially propagated agarwood-producing trees in China.



Haikou, Hainan, China



Haikou, Hainan, China



Beiliu, Guangxi, China



Gaozhou, Guangdong, China

6. Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
2 *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa* in your country.
1. The international trade of artificial propagated agarwood products should be encouraged and the approval process should be simplified to a large extent.
 2. Some countries whose climate is suitable for the planting of agarwood producing trees should encourage the trees cultivation, and promote the researches and application of advancing agarwood inducing technologies.

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!

Germany

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: Germany; Scientific Authority for Flora		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: Daniel Wolf	
		Phone:+4922884911440	
		Email:Daniel.wolf@bfn.de	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country? N/A			
	Yes:	No:		
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned			
	Community owned			
	Individual/family owned			
	Company owned			
	Other			

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>N/A</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>Please see response to 3.4</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>Please see response to 3.4</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>‘Assisted production’ shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>i) do not fall within the definition of ‘artificially propagated’, and</i> <i>ii) are considered not to be ‘wild’ because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>As specimens which are certified to be artificially propagated by a Management Authority don't need any of the permits or certificates required under the provisions of Article III, IV or V (see Article VII of the Convention) source code “A” should be applied in a restrictive and precautionary way. “A” is therefore well defined in Res. Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18). The same Resolution describes the new source code “Y”, which covers anything which is between artificial propagation and the wild. It is therefore a cogent conclusion that those production systems for agarwood described in Res. Conf. 16.10, which exceed the definitions given in Res. Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) for artificial propagation are covered by the new source code “Y”. Paragraph 1 vi) of Res. Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) says that “the methodology used to make a non-detriment finding should reflect the origin and type of specimen, such that the method used to make a non-detriment finding for a specimen known to be of non-wild origin may be less rigorous than that for a specimen of wild origin for example”. Thus, the rigour of an NDF can be adapted when to determine whether a proposed export is detrimental to the survival of that species. We therefore believe that the new source code is at least a good alternative to the implementation of the Convention for artificially propagated agarwood specimens interpreted to be artificially propagated in line with Res. Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17).</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p>There is up to now and according to our knowledge no assisted production of CITES listed specimens in Germany.</p>
-----	---

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>Almost all imports in the past years have been sourced artificially propagated. In principal the guidance presented in CoP16 Inf. 11 could be integrated into the guidance used by DE for NDF for plants (9 Steps NDF Guidance). However, the biggest concern in this context is that often a lot of data necessary to make a well informed NDF seems to be lacking.</p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>In principal the agarwood NDF guidance would profit from additional guidance on what to do with the information gathered (evaluation of the information) and how to deal with information gaps (precautionary approach).</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>N/A</p>
-----	---

5.2	If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.
5.4	Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.
5.5	Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?
5.6	Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.
5.7	Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?

Final considerations

6.1	Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain. 1. 2. 3. 4.
6.2	Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country.

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!



Republic of the Philippines
Department of Environment and Natural Resources
BIODIVERSITY MANAGEMENT BUREAU
Quezon Avenue, Diliman, Quezon City
Tel. Nos.: (632) 924-6031 to 35 Fax: (632) 924-0109, (632) 920-4417
Website: <http://www.bmb.gov.ph> E-mail: bmb@bmb.gov.ph

31 March 2020

THE CITES SECRETARIAT

International Environment House
11 Chemin des Anenomes
CH-1219 Chantelaine, Geneva
Switzerland
Fax No. +41 (22) 797 3417
Email: at (martin.hitziger@cites.org)


Dear Sir/Madam:

This pertains to the CITES Notification No. 2020-022 requesting for the national CITES authorities to complete the questionnaire on Agarwood producing taxa in compliance with Decision 18.204.

We wish to inform you that the Philippines is not yet engage in any trade of agar-wood producing species both local and international. We are currently developing our domestic policy on the commercial propagation of agar-wood producing species and we will ensure that said policy will be consistent with CITES Resolution Conf. 16.10.

Thank you.

Very truly yours,


RICARDO L. CALDERON, CESO III
OIC-Assistant Secretary for Climate Change
and Concurrent Director, BMB



Switzerland

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: Switzerland		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: Moser Ursula	
		Phone: +41 58 463 83 99	
		Email: ursula.moser@blv.admin.ch	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country? Yes: _____ No: X			
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned			
	Community owned			
	Individual/family owned			
	Company owned			
	Other			

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p><i>Consulting with our CITES control unit the following question has arisen:</i></p> <p><i>Because the definition is very new there are some uncertainties regarding the monitoring of this “controlled conditions” especially with the option of “including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives”.</i></p> <p><i>How can these conditions be checked i.e. on a border control when agarwood products are imported?</i></p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p><i>Same concern as above mentioned.</i></p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>'Assisted production' shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) <i>do not fall within the definition of 'artificially propagated', and</i>
-----	---

	<p><i>ii) are considered not to be 'wild' because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i></p> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p><i>From a scientific point of view, this seems clear but from an enforcement point of view, this is very difficult to handle. Where are the distinctions and how can enforcement officers differentiate?</i></p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p><i>We don't know because we are not aware of any instances of assisted production in CH.</i></p>
--	---

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p><i>Switzerland does not use an NDF because the first country of entry is always the EU and there is already a close monitoring of all information indicated on the permits.</i></p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p><i>Switzerland uses the agarwood guide but there are difficulties in practice, i.e. differentiate between exhausted and non-exhausted powder (both still smell quite strong).</i></p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>-</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p><i>No</i></p>
-----	---

5.2	If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	<p>Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.</p> <p><i>It is very difficult in practice. You have to be very experienced and the examples in the agarwood glossary are not so clear.</i></p>
5.4	<p>Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.</p> <p><i>Don't know.</i></p>
5.5	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p><i>No.</i></p>
5.6	<p>Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.</p> <p><i>No.</i></p>
5.7	<p>Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?</p> <p><i>See comment above point 5.3</i></p>

Final considerations

6.1	Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain. 1. 2. 3. 4.
6.2	Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country.

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!

Thailand

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: Thailand		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: Sumalee Tongdon-ae	
		Phone: +66 2940 5687	
		Email: citesflora@gmail.com , lee.cites@gmail.com	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country?			
	Yes: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No: <input type="checkbox"/>		
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields:			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned	-	-	24 ha
	Community owned	-	-	-
	Individual/family owned	219	786	1,168
	Company owned		325	186
	Other			

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing
<i>Aquilaria crassna</i>	seed	Selected from home gardens and owned plantations	Grow under controlled conditions/ from seedling to harvest and induced resin by human.
<i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i>	seed	Selected from Home garden and owned plantation	
<i>Aquilaria subintegra</i>	seed	Selected from owned plantation	

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>According to item 2.3, the parental stock of propagules of agarwood plantation in Thailand does not come from the wild, so it does not detriment to agarwood population in the wild. However, collecting plant propagules, such as seeds or seedling from the wild, are still useful for plant vigor and genetic diversity, but appropriate quantity/harvest methods should be specified so that it does not affect the wild population</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>The definition of “under controlled conditions” in Para. 2 of Res .Conf. 16.10, which does not, specified “<i>the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” in Res. Conf. 11.11, is useful for regulating non-detrimental management, due to the main purpose of agarwood cultivation to produce plant derivative (resin). In addition, the term of ‘artificially propagated’ of agarwood plantation interpret for specimens which grow in mixed (especially in the home garden and mixed with orchard) is also useful to determine the source code “A” for agarwood. So, the range state countries propose to create Res.Conf. 16.10 to manage with agarwood only. The arising of the Res.Conf. 16.10 can solve the problem of agarwood plant in Thailand, thus we have a guideline to enact the rule and procedure of registration. We can use the law to implement agarwood trade. The challenge in trade regulation of agarwood products, the competent officials have difficulty to identify the differentiation between wild and artificially specimen because of agarwood product trade in the form of woodchip oil and other products.</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>The definition of “under controlled conditions” in Para. 2 of Res .Conf. 16.10, is useful for regulating non-detrimental management in agarwood which the same reason as 3.1 and 3.2 above. Therefore, the control of parental stock and sources of propagules will lead to sustainable use.</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>‘Assisted production’ shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>i) do not fall within the definition of ‘artificially propagated’, and</i> <i>ii) are considered not to be ‘wild’ because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>concept of “assisted production” Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) could not replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” in Res. Conf. 16.10 as the reason in item 3.3, and agarwood plantation are required human intervention at all levels of growth since young plants until induce the resin. Furthermore, the most assisted production often used with ornamental plants, such as introduced seedling from tissue grow in forest.</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p>We have assisted production in orchid plants by using propragues from tissue culture and grow in orchard or community forest. However, we do not allow to export because the specimens do not grow under controlled conditions and do not comply with national laws. Therefore, the national law must be amended to establish rules and procedure for regulation the trade of plants or specimen from the assisted production system. In addition, we concern about distinguish between specimen from wild (W) and assisted production (Y) because the assisted production does not controlled environment, so,the specimen will be look alike from wild source.</p>
-----	--

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>We used to make NDF for agarwood species in Thailand by following the IUCN guideline, we found that making NDF in the wild was difficult than in plantation. Because the agarwood in Thailand located in a remote area (in the rainforest jungle) so we cannot access the population in the habitat.</p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>No .Because we enact the rules and procedures for registration agarwood plantation, I thought that this is one method for making NDF.</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>Difficulty to identify species of agarwood plants in the jungle which without reproductive parts (as indicate in 4.1).</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>We enact national laws to define rules and procedures for register agarwood plantation and using Res. Conf. 16.10 as a guideline for our law since 2017, the registration conditions as follows;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - grow under controlled conditions (intend to plant, fertilizer and tillage since the young plants and induce the resin for making chip and oil. - legal acquisition of parental stock. - grow from private or state lands which are not controlled the Royal Forest Department.
5.2	<p>If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.</p> <p>As, agarwood uses only the part of wood that has resin (derivatives) and the amount of resin produced in each plant is uncertain. So, it difficult to estimate the yield per plant and making stock. Therefore, plantation registration is useful for MA to confirm that the product of agarwood is come from legal acquisition.</p>

On registration systems and identification of export products

5.3	<p>Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.</p> <p>Agarwood products as oil cannot differentiate between A and W source while we can distinguish A and W in wood chips.</p>
5.4	<p>Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.</p> <p>-N/A-</p>
5.5	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>The exporters have to register agarwood stock by inform quantity and number of agarwood plantation registration before submit for CITES export permit, also declare pure or mixed agarwood oils to competent officer.</p>
5.6	<p>Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.</p> <p>We do not making label for export agarwood wood chip but we can classify which wood comes from which region of country, Owing to each region has different production methods.</p>
5.7	<p>Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?</p> <p>In my opinion, some words are still confusing such as wood pieces vs chips and log vs blocks.</p>

Final considerations

6.1	Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain. 1. - 2. - 3. - 4. -
6.2	Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country. -Non-

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!

USA

**Questionnaire on Resolution Conf. 16.10 on
Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa**

1.1	Party: United States of America		
1.2	Contact information of the representative who responded to the questionnaire:	Name: Rosemarie Gnam, Chief, Division of Scientific Authority	
		Phone: (703) 358-2497	
		Email: rosemarie_gnam@fws.gov	
		Other:	

On the extent of plantation of agarwood-producing taxa

2.1	Do you have information on agarwood plantations in your country? Yes: No: To the best of our knowledge, there is no information to indicate that there are agarwood plantations in the United States.			
2.2	If available, please specify the area of agarwood plantations (ha) in each of the following fields: Not applicable			
		Gardens	Mono-species	Mixed-species
	State owned			
	Community owned			
	Individual/family owned			
	Company owned			
	Other			

2.3 On species name and origin of agarwood-producing taxa in plantation

Not applicable

Species name	Type of propagules	Origin of propagules*	Manipulated producing

*Please describe briefly if agarwood derives from outside of the natural agarwood distribution.

Regarding artificially propagated specimens (paragraphs 1-4 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On the terms employed in the Resolution Conf. 16.10 on *Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa*

3.1	<p>Paragraph 1(b) in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> states that “<i>propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be obtained from the wild according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i>” Please describe briefly how plantations obtain and maintain the propagules for cultivation of agarwood-producing taxa, including any concerns over management of genetic diversity and any impacts on wild populations.</p> <p>We believe that the cultivation of agarwood-producing species may be more in line with the definition of “assisted production” adopted at CoP18 and we would recommend that the Plants Committee take this into consideration in its discussions of the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10.</p>
3.2	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> adopts the following definition of “under controlled conditions”: “<i>For agarwood-producing taxa, 'under controlled conditions' means in a tree plantation, including other non-natural environment, that is manipulated by human intervention for the purpose of producing plants or plant parts and derivatives.</i>” Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns or implementation challenges that you might have?</p> <p>The production of agarwood-producing species grown in tree plantations and other non-natural environments may be more in line with the definition adopted at CoP18 of “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) than “artificially propagated.”</p>
3.3	<p>Paragraph 2 in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> determines that the term ‘artificially propagated’ shall be interpreted as referring to agarwood specimens as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) <i>grown under controlled conditions; and</i> b) <i>grown from seeds, seedlings, saplings, cuttings, grafting, marcoting/air-layering, divisions, plant tissues or other propagules that have been derived from wild or cultivated parental stocks, according to the definition of 'cultivated parental stock' in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</i> <p>Please describe briefly whether this definition seems useful for regulating non-detrimental management and trade in agarwood products and please state any concerns that you might have?</p> <p>The definition of “artificially propagated” in paragraph 2. of Resolution Conf. 16.10 is more in line with the definition of “assisted production” in paragraph 9 of Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18). It may be more appropriate to treat specimens produced from agarwood species grown in tree plantations and other non-natural environments as having been derived from “assisted production.”</p>

On the term “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on *Regulation of trade in plants*

3.4	<p>Paragraph 9(a) in the revised Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Regulation of trade in plants</i> contains the following definition of the term “assisted production”:</p> <p><i>'Assisted production' shall be used to refer to plant specimens that:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) <i>do not fall within the definition of 'artificially propagated', and</i> ii) <i>are considered not to be 'wild' because they are propagated or planted in an environment with some level of human intervention for the purpose of plant production.</i> <p>Do you believe this concept of “assisted production” could complement or replace the concepts relating to “artificial propagation” as they are currently defined in Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of</i></p>
-----	---

	<p><i>the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i>, and as they are elaborated in the questions 3.1–3.3 supra? Please explain briefly.</p> <p>Yes, we believe that it is likely that the definition of “assisted production” adopted at CoP18 more closely aligns with the way in which agarwood-producing species are grown in tree plantations and other non-natural environments.</p> <p>Are there instances of assisted production in your country? If yes, please describe briefly and state any concerns that you might have.</p> <p>To the best of our knowledge, there is no information to indicate that agarwood-producing species are grown/cultivated in the United States.</p>
--	---

Regarding non-detriment findings (NDFs) (paragraphs 5-6 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

4.1	<p>Does your country use the agarwood NDF guidance for making NDFs of agarwood products as well as for the source of propagules? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>Not applicable</p>
4.2	<p>Does your country use the agarwood guidance in training and capacity building? Please give brief details and describe any concerns that you might have about its application.</p> <p>Not applicable</p>
4.3	<p>Does your country have any observations or suggestions on the quality and utility of the agarwood NDF guidance? If so, please give details.</p> <p>The document <i>Proposed Guidance for making Non-detriment findings for agarwood-producing species</i> (CoP16 Inf. 11; 2013) has useful information on the making of NDFs, and we believe that it could be updated with more relevant and current information. We believe this to be particularly the case with regard to the definition of “assisted production” in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18), which specifies that plant material to produce such specimens be obtained in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild.</p>

Regarding management and trade control (paragraphs 7-9 of Resolution Conf. 16.10)

On registration systems for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees

5.1	<p>Does your country apply a registration system for the artificial propagation of agarwood-producing trees? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?</p> <p>Not applicable</p>
5.2	<p>If your country applies a registration system, are there any obstacles to its application? Please provide detailed information.</p> <p>Not applicable</p>

On registration systems and identification of export products.

5.3	Can artificially propagated agarwood product be distinguished from wild agarwood products? Please elaborate.
5.4	Are there any mixed products between wild and artificial propagated wood products? If yes, please explain.
5.5	Does your country apply a registration system for exporters of pure or mixed agarwood oils? If yes, please specify the registration system and since when it was applied?
5.6	Does your country maintain sample collections of labels and lists of relevant exporters? If yes, please describe the procedure your country follows, and whether the samples were shared with the CITES Secretariat.
5.7	<p>Does your country have any observations or comments on the utility of the glossary of agarwood products adopted by the Plants Committee at its 20th meeting?</p> <p>During discussions prior to and following the adoption of the Glossary of Agarwood Products, we raised concerns about the utility of the document as a tool for enforcement personnel. We do not believe that those concerns were ever resolved, and we would recommend that the Plants Committee revisit the document with an eye toward determining if it is useful and if so, how it could be revised to be improved. We think that revisions should focus on clarifying what specimens are subject to CITES controls and how to differentiate them. In particular, we note that the discussions on differentiating exhausted powder from non-exhausted powder have not occurred and this remains a serious hindrance to effective implementation of the agarwood listing. We believe that it will be particularly important to include enforcement personnel in these discussions. Any work on this matter should be done in conjunction</p>

	with the Standing Committee's Annotations Working Group, which has been tasked with reviewing the agarwood annotation.
--	--

Final considerations

6.1	<p>Would you like to attach any supporting documents, data sources, etc. to this questionnaire? If so, please list the relevant materials and specify to which section they pertain.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1.2.3.4.
6.2	<p>Please provide any additional suggestions relevant to the implementation of Resolution Conf. 16.10 on <i>Implementation of the Convention for agarwood-producing taxa</i> in your country.</p> <p>Currently, specimens of wild-collected agarwood plant material (e.g., saplings) can be exported as “artificially propagated” specimens (source code “A”) under the provisions of Resolution Conf. 16.10. In order to effectively regulate such specimens in trade, and to ensure that wild agarwood plant material is obtained in a manner that is non-detrimental to species in the wild, it may be more appropriate to treat and trade such specimens as derived from “assisted production” (source code “Y”) as defined in Resolution Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18).</p>

Thank you very much for your responses, please submit them to martin.hitziger@cites.org!