

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifteenth meeting of the Plants Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 17-21 May 2005

Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species

Report on progress in the implementation of the Review of Significant Trade

SPECIES BASED REVIEW OF SIGNIFICANT TRADE

1. This document has been prepared by the CITES Secretariat.

Background

2. At its 10th meeting (Shepherdstown, December 2000), the Plants Committee selected Cycads for review. Furthermore Decision 12.74 directed to the Plants Committee called for a review of *Prunus africana*, *Aquilaria malaccensis*, *Pericopsis elata* and *Aloe* species from East Africa used as extracts. The report on progress with the implementation of the review of these species was presented at the 14th meeting of the Plants Committee (PC14, Windhoek, February 2004) in document PC14 Doc. 9.2.2.
3. At PC14, the Plants Committee formulated and adopted recommendations concerning these species in accordance with paragraphs m), n) and o) of Resolution Conf. 12.8, except for the case of *Prunus africana*.
4. In consultation with the Plants Committee Chairman, the CITES Secretariat revised the recommendations regarding Cycads, *Aquilaria malaccensis*, *Pericopsis elata* and *Aloe* species from East Africa used as extracts and communicated them to all range States concerned. These recommendations are shown in Annex 1.
5. Replies have been received from Cameroon, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Indonesia and Thailand but no other range States.
6. In accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.8. (Rev. CoP13), paragraph q), the Secretariat will now consult with the Chairman of the Plants Committee to determine whether the recommendations referred to above have been implemented and report to the Standing Committee accordingly.
7. It was agreed at PC14 that the results of experts' visits to range States for *Pericopsis elata* would be reported at PC15. This work was undertaken by Fauna and Flora International (FFI) and their report can be found as document PC15 Inf. 2.
8. At PC14, the Plants Committee also agreed that, under the terms of paragraph b) of Resolution Conf 12.8, a review of trade in *Galanthus woronowii*, *Podophyllum hexandrum*, *Cyathea contaminans*, *Cibotium barometz*, *Dendrobium nobile* and an orchid species from Belize (to be selected), should be undertaken. In accordance with paragraph d) of the same Resolution, the Secretariat notified the range States of these species, explained the reason for this selection and requested comments regarding possible problems with the implementation of Article IV.

Recommendations

Regarding Cycads, *Aquilaria malaccensis*, *Pericopsis elata* and *Aloe* species from East Africa used as extracts

9. The Plants Committee is invited to note the report in paragraphs 2 to 7 above.

Regarding *Prunus africana*

10. The Secretariat understands that the Plants Committee already concluded that Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3, is not implemented satisfactorily for *Prunus africana*. The Secretariat has contracted a consultant to compile information on the biology and management of and trade in *Prunus africana*. Once completed and made available in the three working languages, the Secretariat will submit the report of the consultant to the Committee so that it can consider this matter further.

Regarding *Galanthus woronowii*, *Podophyllum hexandrum*, *Cyathea contaminans*, *Cibotium barometz*, *Dendrobium nobile* and an orchid species from Belize

11. According to paragraph f) of Resolution 12.8 (Rev. CoP13), the Committee is requested to consider the responses received from the range States in order to determine whether it is satisfied that Article IV, paragraphs 2 (a) and 3, are being correctly implemented for the species concerned. Annex 2 gives an overview of those responses. Hard copies of all responses (in the language in which they were received) were forwarded to the members of the Plants Committee 40 days before the present meeting, together with the other working documents. If the Committee is satisfied that Article IV is correctly implemented, the species will be eliminated from the review and the Secretariat will notify the concerned Parties accordingly. If not, the Secretariat will proceed with the compilation of more detailed information regarding the species, engaging consultants as necessary in accordance with paragraphs g)-i) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP13). The Secretariat will then report its findings at PC16.

RECOMMENDATIONS CONCERNING CYCADS, *AQUILARIA MALACCENSIS*, *PERICOPSIS ELATA*
AND EAST AFRICAN *ALOE* SPECIES SENT TO RANGE STATES CONCERNED

Cycads

Recommendations per country

‘Species of urgent concern’: China, Madagascar, Mozambique, South Africa, Thailand, Viet Nam

‘Species of least concern’: all other range States

China

Within 1 year

- a) The Management Authority should take measures to improve the control of trade in Cycads between Viet Nam and China, assess the effectiveness of existing regulations, and develop new measures when necessary.
- b) The Management Authority should collaborate with the Management Authority of Viet Nam to enhance the monitoring of trade in Cycads between Viet Nam and China.

Madagascar

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should report to the Secretariat how the Scientific Authority makes non-detriment findings to allow exports of wild harvested specimens of *Cycas thouarsii*.
- b) The Management Authority should liaise with the CITES Secretariat to ensure the implementation of the provisions of Article IV through the Action Plan for a country-based Review of Significant Trade for Madagascar.

Mozambique

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should provide the CITES Secretariat with information on seizures of specimens of Cycads, including on shipments coming from South Africa and on plants confiscated within the country.
- b) The Management Authority should provide the CITES Secretariat with information on the measures that are in place or were taken to monitor and regulate trade in Cycads.

South Africa

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should provide the CITES Secretariat with information on seizures of specimens of Cycads, including on shipments coming from Mozambique and on plants confiscated within the country.
- b) The Management Authority should provide the CITES Secretariat with information on measures that are in place or have been taken to monitor and regulate trade in Cycads.

Thailand

Within 3 months

- a) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how its Scientific Authority determines that levels of export of wild-collected specimens of Cycads are not detrimental to the wild populations concerned, and are exported in accordance with Article IV of the Convention.
- b) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how it ensures that wild-harvested Cycads that are exported are correctly identified to the species level, and what control mechanisms or procedures it has in place in this regard.

Viet Nam

Within 3 months

- a) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how its Scientific Authority determines that levels of export of wild-collected specimens of Cycads are not detrimental to the wild populations concerned, and are exported in accordance with Article IV of the Convention.
- b) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how it ensures that wild-harvested Cycads that are exported are correctly identified to the species level, and what control mechanisms or procedures it has in place in this regard.

Within 1 year

- c) The Management Authority should develop and implement a programme to improve the regulation of all trade in Cycads between Viet Nam and China in consultation with the Secretariat and the Management Authority of China.

Other recommendations made in accordance with paragraph I) of Resolution Conf. 12.8

CITES Secretariat

- a) The CITES Secretariat is requested to send a Notification to the Parties encouraging Parties to use species names when reporting on trade in cycads as well as standardized units.
- b) The CITES Secretariat should develop a checklist of species of concern for enforcement officers.

The Plants Committee

The Plants Committee shall write a letter to southern African range States for *Encephalartos* species to express the concern of the Committee that Appendix-I Cycads are continuing to decline in these countries and request information on what additional management strategies are being proposed to deal with this situation.

IUCN-SSC Cycad Specialist Group

IUCN will notify UNEP-WCMC, the CITES Secretariat and the CITES Nomenclature Committee when lists of New World cycads are published.

Aquilaria malaccensis

Recommendations per country

Bangladesh

Within 3 months

Bangladesh to provide recent trade data (2000-2004) for *A. malaccensis* including trade in specimens under the synonym *A. agallocha*.

India

Within 6 months

- a) India to clarify the regulatory and management framework currently in operation to distinguish imported stock from any production from native populations of *Aquilaria malaccensis*.

Within 1 year

- b) India to determine and implement a method to make non-detriment findings for the export of products derived from *A. malaccensis*.
- c) India to examine national legislation to ensure that incentives for good management of both wild stocks and plantations of *A. malaccensis* are in place.

Indonesia

Within 6 months

- a) The Indonesian Management Authority to provide information on the procedure to make non-detriment findings to allow exports of *A. malaccensis*, with particular attention to the calculation of the real amount of *A. malaccensis* (within the quota including four other agarwood-producing species) being harvested and traded.
- b) The Management and Scientific Authorities of Indonesia and the representative to the CITES Plants Committee, to work with the Indonesian agarwood trading association to improve existing procedures for making non-detriment findings.

Within 1 year

- c) Implement the NDF recommendations made in paragraphs a) and b) above.
- d) The Management and Scientific Authorities of Indonesia to liaise with Malaysia and other range States to explore the possibility of organizing a workshop to discuss and adopt regional *Aquilaria* spp. non-detriment finding methodologies.

Malaysia

Within 3 months

- a) The Management Authority of Malaysia to clarify whether specimens of *A. malaccensis* are being shipped between Sabah and the other two Malaysian jurisdictions (Peninsular Malaysia and Sarawak), whether these are monitored by the relevant authorities, and how many harvesting permits for *A. malaccensis* are issued in Sabah on an annual basis.

Within 6 months

- b) Recognizing that under the laws of both Peninsular Malaysia and Sarawak, legal harvest of and trade in agarwood are regulated by a permit system, prior to the application for a CITES permit for export, the Management and Scientific Authorities of Peninsular Malaysia to collate domestic license data from 1998 to 2002 (and 2003 and 2004 if available), indicating the harvesting locations, and clarify:
 - i) The percentage and volume of the agarwood harvest and trade that is legal;
 - ii) How harvest and trade are being managed and could be improved; and
 - iii) To cross-check the trade statistics referred to above.
- c) Recognizing that under the laws of both Peninsular Malaysia and Sarawak, legal harvest of and trade in agarwood are regulated by a permit system, prior to the application for a CITES permit for export, the Management Authority of Sarawak to collate domestic license data from 1998 to 2002 (and 2003 and 2004 if available), indicating the harvesting locations, and clarify:
 - i) The percentage and volume of the agarwood harvest and trade that is legal;
 - ii) How harvest and trade are being managed and could be improved; and

- iii) To cross-check the trade statistics referred to above.
- d) The Management Authority of Peninsular Malaysia in conjunction with the Scientific Authority of Malaysia to establish a cautious quota to be managed through the Malaysian licensing system.
- e) Malaysia to report on progress being made on the implementation of recommendations b) to d) to the CITES Secretariat.

Within 1 year

- f) The Management and Scientific Authorities of Malaysia to liaise with Indonesia and other range States to explore the possibility of organizing a workshop to discuss and adopt regional *Aquilaria* spp. non-detriment finding methodologies.
- g) The Scientific Authority of Malaysia to convene a working group, in conjunction with the Malaysian Timber Industries Board (MTIB – the CITES Management Authority for timber and timber products in Peninsular Malaysia), the Peninsular Malaysia Forestry Department, the Sarawak Forestry Department (the CITES Management Authority for Sarawak), the Forest Research Institute of Malaysia (FRIM) and associated technical experts (for instance, IUCN; the CITES Plants Committee and TRAFFIC Southeast Asia), to develop a reliable non-detriment finding methodology to monitor agarwood harvest and trade.
- h) The Management Authority of Malaysia to report on progress made with the National Forest Inventory 4 (NFI-4) and the ability of the inventory to provide baseline data for establishing a non-detriment finding methodology for *Aquilaria* species.

Singapore

Within 3 months

The CITES Secretariat to ask Singapore to clarify how it controls imports and re-exports, particularly with regard to differentiating between each agarwood-producing species.

Thailand

Within 3 months

Thailand to provide recent trade data (2000-2004) for *A. malaccensis*.

The Plants Committee

In association with the Secretariat, to liaise with the Indonesian Management Authority to review the need to prepare proposals to include all agarwood-producing genera (*Aquilaria* spp., *Aetoxylon* spp., *Gonocarpus* spp. and *Gyrinops* spp.) in CITES Appendix II.

Pericopsis elata

Recommendations per country

‘Species of possible concern’: Cameroon, Central African Republic, Congo, Democratic Republic of the Congo

‘Species of least concern’: Côte d’Ivoire, Ghana, Nigeria

Cameroon

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority of Cameroon needs to clarify to the Secretariat how the existing forestry policies provides the scientific basis for the formulation of non-detriment findings for exports of *Pericopsis elata*, and confirm that the exports are allowed in accordance with the requirements of Article IV. The information to be provided could include information on: the national forest extent, protected areas, concession policies, species inventories, quotas, current areas of harvesting,

information regarding minimum felling diameters and compliance and enforcement measures, and efforts to minimize environmental impacts.

- b) The Management Authority should collaborate with the Management Authority of other range States to share experiences in the implementation of Article IV, to exchange information on procedures in place and to take common steps to enhance the monitoring of trade of *Pericopsis elata* from these countries.

Without time-frame

- c) The evaluation of the current mechanisms to implement Article IV for *Pericopsis elata* will be facilitated by expert visits to Cameroon, the Congo and the Democratic Republic of the Congo, for which funding is required. The expert visits will be undertaken in consultation with the CITES Secretariat and results will be reported to the Plants Committee at its 15th meeting.

Central African Republic

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how its Scientific Authority determines that levels of export of specimens of *Pericopsis elata* are not detrimental to the wild populations concerned, and are exported in accordance with Article IV of the Convention. The information to be provided could include information on: the national forest extent, protected areas, concession policies, species inventories, quotas, current areas of harvesting, information regarding minimum felling diameters and compliance and enforcement measures, and efforts to minimize environmental impacts.
- b) The Management Authority should provide information on the measures in place to issue export permits and to monitor that levels of exports are allowed in compliance with Article IV, paragraph 2 (a) and (b).
- c) The Management Authority should collaborate with the Management Authority of other range states to share experiences in the implementation of Article IV, to exchange information on procedures in place and to take common steps to enhance the monitoring of trade of *Pericopsis elata* from these countries.

Additional recommendations

The evaluation of the current mechanisms to implement Article IV for *Pericopsis elata* will be facilitated by expert visits to Cameroon, the Congo and the Democratic Republic of the Congo, for which funding is required. The expert visits will be undertaken in consultation with the CITES Secretariat and results will be reported to the Plants Committee at its 15th meeting.

Congo

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how its Scientific Authority determines that levels of export of specimens of *Pericopsis elata* are not detrimental to the wild populations concerned, and are exported in accordance with Article IV of the Convention. The information to be provided could include information on: the national forest extent, protected areas, concession policies, species inventories, quotas, current areas of harvesting, information regarding minimum felling diameters and compliance and enforcement measures, and efforts to minimize environmental impacts.
- b) The Management Authority should collaborate with the Management Authority of other range States to share experiences in the implementation of Article IV, to exchange information on procedures in place and to take common steps to enhance the monitoring of trade of *Pericopsis elata* from these countries.

Additional recommendations

The evaluation of the current mechanisms to implement Article IV for *Pericopsis elata* may be facilitated by expert visits to Cameroon, the Congo and the Democratic Republic of the Congo, for which funding would be required. The expert visits will be undertaken in consultation with the CITES Secretariat and results will be reported to the Plants Committee at its 15th meeting.

Democratic Republic of Congo

Within 6 months

- a) The Management Authority should clarify to the CITES Secretariat how its Scientific Authority determines that levels of export of specimens of *Pericopsis elata* are not detrimental to the wild populations concerned, and are exported in accordance with Article IV of the Convention. The information to be provided could include information on: the national forest extent, protected areas, concession policies, species inventories, quotas, current areas of harvesting, information regarding minimum felling diameters and compliance and enforcement measures, and efforts to minimize environmental impacts.
- b) The Management Authority should collaborate with the Management Authority of other range States to share experiences in the implementation of Article IV, to exchange information on procedures in place and to take common steps to enhance the monitoring of trade of *Pericopsis elata* from these countries.

Additional recommendations

The evaluation of the current mechanisms to implement Article IV for *Pericopsis elata* will be facilitated by expert visits to Cameroon, the Congo and the Democratic Republic of the Congo, for which funding is required. The expert visits will be undertaken in consultation with the CITES Secretariat and results to be reported to the Plants Committee at its 15th meeting.

Aloe species from East Africa used as extracts

Recommendations per country

'Species of urgent concern': Kenya

'Species of least concern': Djibouti, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Mozambique, Somalia, Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania and Uganda

Kenya

Within 6 months

- a) The Management and Scientific Authorities of Kenya shall clarify how they control and monitor trade in *Aloe*, and specify the role and responsibilities of each in the process.
- b) The Management Authority should investigate the apparent high levels of illegal trade from Kenya, determine and implement appropriate actions to control trade, and request assistance from the Secretariat for undertaking these actions.

Within one year

- c) The Management Authority shall ensure that terms of reference are established and a programme implemented allowing the Scientific Authority to annually monitor *Aloe* harvests and its impact on wild populations, and determine non-detrimental levels of export.
- d) The Management Authority should ensure that new CITES legislation includes provisions and administrative procedures to regulate the export of *Aloe* extracts and that it is enacted within deadlines established under the National Legislation Project.

Other recommendations made in accordance with paragraph I) of Resolution Conf. 12.8

CITES Secretariat

The Secretariat should send a Notification to the Parties to:

- a) encourage importing countries to improve reporting in *Aloe* extracts and treat *Aloe* extract as readily recognizable under the terms of the Convention; and
- b) remind all range States of eastern Africa of the potential risk to wild populations of *Aloe* species, particularly the narrow endemics, of the developing *Aloe* extract industry in the region, noting that if well regulated this could provide benefits to rural communities in semi-arid areas.

RESPONSES RECEIVED FROM RANGE STATES TO CORRESPONDENCE SENT BY THE SECRETARIAT

<i>Cibotium barometz</i>		
Countries		Reply
China	E	Reply received
India	E	No reply
Indonesia	E	No reply
Japan	E	No reply
Malaysia (Penisular)	E	Reply received
Malaysia (Sabah)	E	No reply
Malaysia (Sarawak)	E	Reply received
Myanmar	E	No reply
Nepal	E	No reply
Papua New Guinea	E	No reply
Philippines	E	Reply received
Thailand	E	No reply
Viet Nam	E	No reply

<i>Cyathea contaminans</i>		
Countries		Reply
India	E	No reply
Indonesia	E	No reply
Malaysia (Penisular)	E	Reply received
Malaysia (Sabah)	E	No reply
Malaysia (Sarawak)	E	Reply received
Myanmar	E	No reply
Papua New Guinea	E	No reply
Philippines	E	Reply received
Thailand	E	No reply
Viet Nam	E	No reply

<i>Dendrobium nobile</i>		
Countries		Reply
Bhutan	E	Reply received
China	E	Reply received
India	E	No reply
Lao People's Democratic Republic	E	No reply
Myanmar	E	No reply
Nepal	E	No reply
Thailand	E	No reply
Viet Nam	E	No reply

<i>Galanthus woronowii</i>		
Countries		Reply
Georgia	E	No reply

Russian Federation	E	No reply
Turkey	E	Reply received

<i>Podophyllum hexandrum</i>		
Countries		Reply
Afghanistan	E	No reply
Bhutan	E	Reply received
China	E	Reply received
India	E	No reply
Nepal	E	No reply
Pakistan	E	No reply