CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Thirty-first meeting of the Animals Committee
Online, 31 May, 1, 4, 21 and 22 June 2021

Interpretation and implementation matters

Regulation of trade

Definition of the term ‘appropriate and acceptable destinations’

ADDITION TO APPROPRIATE AND ACCEPTABLE DESTINATIONS

1. This document has been prepared by the co-chairs of the working group on Appropriate and acceptable destinations and the Secretariat.*

Best practice guidance on how to determine whether “the trade would promote in situ conservation”

2. In CITES, the issue of ex situ and in situ conservation has been discussed at regular intervals but there is no agreed definition of these terms within CITES. Therefore, it was suggested to use the following definitions of “in situ” and “ex situ” conservation, which are found in Article 2 to the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD):

   “in-situ conservation’ means the conservation of ecosystems and natural habitats and the maintenance and recovery of viable populations of species in their natural surroundings and, in the case of domesticated or cultivated species, in the surroundings where they have developed their distinctive properties (https://www.cbd.int/convention/articles/?a=cbd-02).”

   “Ex-situ conservation” means the conservation of components of biological diversity outside their natural habitats”.

3. Although the working group was tasked with considering the matter for those listings in Appendix II where the term “appropriate and acceptable destinations” appears in the annotation, it was noted that ex situ breeding operations and in situ conservation are specifically mentioned in Resolution Conf. 13.9 on Encouraging cooperation between Parties with ex situ breeding operations and those with in situ conservation programmes, which could therefore be used as a starting point for discussions. In the operative part of this Resolution, the Conference of the Parties urges:

   a) Parties to encourage ex situ operations that breed Appendix-I animal species or that artificially propagate Appendix-I plant species to seek cooperative measures that would support in situ conservation based on resources generated by those captive-breeding operations; and

* The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.
b) Parties to encourage ex situ operations that breed or artificially propagate Appendix-I species within the range State, to support in situ conservation programmes; such support could consist of, inter alia, technical support, contribution of funds, exchange of specimens for reintroduction into the wild, capacity building and training, technology transfer, investment, infrastructure and other measures.

4. Based on this text, feedback from Parties to Notification No. 2019/70 and other publicly available information, the working group started by compiling a range of possible forms of benefits for in situ conservation presented in Annex 1 to this addendum. It should be emphasized that any of the listed benefits should have the aim to securing long-term populations of species in natural ecosystems and habitats. The list is not exhaustive and can be expanded or reduced in the future.

5. The working group did not have sufficient time or available examples from Parties of best practice on how to determine whether “the trade would promote in situ conservation” to draw upon in order to develop guidance on how to make such a determination. The working group intends to continue to consider this part of the mandate right up until the AC31 meeting and will produce an information document or provide an oral update with any progress made.

Species-specific guidance for living specimens of African elephants and southern white rhinoceroses

6. Information provided by Parties and relevant organizations was compiled into one set of factors to be evaluated when considering whether the proposed recipient of a living specimen is suitably equipped to house and care for it, building on and further developing the elements agreed under the document CoP18 Doc. 44.1. A number of WG members provided comments on the first draft. WG members further provided suggestions on the draft list of factors, and shared additional best practice guidelines and documents.

7. Some WG members suggested to define minimum values regarding diet, animal care, number of staff, etc. At the same time, a number of high-quality guidance documents have been brought to the attention of the working group, containing detailed instructions and recommendations on keeping African elephants and southern white rhinoceros. These existing best practice documents focus on a similar set of factors which are considered in order to ensure that animals are kept in a suitable environment. At the same time, the values for individual factors differ, reflecting specific context in which a guidance document has been developed. Merging these existing best practice documents into one single document does not seem possible under the time and capacity restraints of the WG. It is unclear whether such an effort would lead to increased ambition compared to the current existing best practices. Also, any guidelines document should be periodically evaluated, further developed, and updated as new information becomes available.

8. It is therefore suggested that the non-binding guidance for determining whether a proposed recipient of a living specimen of African elephant and/or southern white rhinoceros is suitably equipped to house and care for it contains a detailed list of factors which should be considered, as well as a list of existing best practice documents that can be used by the facilities to guide them in setting up specific values (Annex 2 to this addendum). To avoid situations when one or more factors are set up in a way that would compromise the overall objective of keeping animals in an appropriate environment, a box setting up an overall objective for each group of factors has been introduced at the beginning of each section.

9. The working group did not have enough time to consider some questions that were raised during the deliberations sufficiently, including whether or not specific values should be provided after consensus has been reached as to the factors themselves and whether two separate sets of guidance for elephants and rhinos would be preferable to a single set of guidelines. The working group intends to continue to consider this part of the mandate right up until the meeting and will produce an information document or provide an oral update with any progress made.
Possible forms of benefits for *in situ* conservation

The proceeds of export of wildlife can be used to directly finance a variety of activities that may benefit *in situ* conservation of CITES species in the wild and the ecosystems on which they depend. These include but are not limited to:

- financing of material/equipment, infrastructure and investment in technologies that aim at protecting wildlife areas (parks, conservation areas and established habitats) and the protected species living therein.

- recruitment of personnel to enhance the management and protection of species within their natural range

- provision of capacity building and support for field staff/managers, *in situ* conservation personnel, community members and local stakeholders to
  - successfully protect threatened species from poaching
  - improve the technical capacity to analyze and report on spatially explicit data in a timely manner
  - use satellite tracking collars, software, GPS devices to protect wildlife
  - use science-based management practices of species or populations,

- expansion, restoration or creation of habitats securing and improving the quality and carrying capacity of habitats so that viable populations can be maintained

- development and carrying out of community awareness, education and conservation programs for indigenous and local communities in order to
  - improve coexistence with wildlife
  - develop incentive schemes for conserving threatened species to reduce harvest where it is biologically unsustainable
  - provide assistance with alternative livelihoods
  - develop humane deterrents to keep target species away from areas of human habitations and reduce human-wildlife conflict
  - implement humane measures to protect crops
  - to reduce and/or eliminate illegal exploitation of natural resources
  - to enhance environmental attitudes, values, and knowledge
  - to build skills that prepare individuals and communities to collaboratively undertake positive environmental action.

- establishment of rescue, rehabilitation, reintroduction, release and post-release monitoring programs that prioritize endangered or threatened species

- conducting research on threatened species, including but not limited to ecology, population monitoring, wildlife health, establishment of monitoring and adaptive management plans

- development and support of control protocols that oversee the implementation and monitoring activities in relation to the protection and biologically sustainable use of threatened species

Non-monetary contributions can also have direct and indirect benefits for *in situ* conservation. These include but are not limited to:

- research from *ex situ* locations intended to support scientific work relating to *in situ* conservation and/or directly contribute to the conservation of species or ecosystems:
  - monitoring methods, life history information, nutritional requirements, disease transmission/treatments
- Genetic and demographic modelling – assess the relative importance of different threats to the different populations
- animal physiology,
- ecological and behavioral studies
- husbandry/recognized captive breeding programs (such as the SSP of AZA, the EEP of EAZA or the GSMPs of WAZA) that support conservation of the threatened species in the wild in the return of rescue animals to the wild, and/or release and reintroduction purposes
- veterinary health
- demand reduction research for rhino and elephant products which threaten wild populations
- development of knowledge that allows for the carrying out of community awareness, education and conservation programs mentioned above
- exchange of specimens from recognized breeding programs (such as the SSP of AZA, the EEP of EAZA or the GSMPs of WAZA) for reintroduction into the wild, applying the IUCN guidelines for reintroductions
- holding workshops, conferences, symposia or other meetings intended to share and expand knowledge for the conservation of the species in situ and build capacity in situ.

Below you find a list of references to important guidelines and examples of best practices in relation to our mandate.

Guidelines:

IUCN have guidelines for reintroductions and other wildlife translocations


One Plan Approach from IUCN: The One Plan Approach to Conservation | Conservation Planning Specialist Group (cpsg.org)

Examples/ best practice:

North Carolina Zoo:

Colchester Zoo Project: Elephant Orphanage Project (EOP), South Kafue National Park, Zambia -

Zoological Society of London – London and Whipsnade


The Thermal imaging elephant work at ZSL, zoo elephant contributing to wild counterparts: HEAT-seeking | Zoological Society of London (ZSL)


Prigen Conservation Breeding Ark https://prigenark.com
Non-binding guidance for determining whether a proposed recipient of a living specimen of African elephant and/or southern white rhinoceros is suitably equipped to house and care for it, for consideration of adoption by the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties

This non-binding guidance has been developed on the basis of the mandate given to the Animals Committee through Decision 18.155 b).

Assessment of whether a proposed recipient of a living specimen of African elephant and/or southern white rhinoceros is suitably equipped to house and care for them should focus on factors related to physical housing, diet, animal care and husbandry, animal well-being, security, long-term sustainability of maintaining the facility and the care of the animals, and breeding\(^1\), as outlined in Section A.

The list of factors in Section A is indicative and can be further developed to reflect local situations.

While not compromising the overall objective of keeping animals in appropriate environment and ensuring their well-being, the values set up for different factors in Section A need to take into consideration the specific situation of each facility, and they need to be considered in their totality. While some factors are mutually interlinked and their values may be interdependent, each factor needs to be evaluated and satisfied in making the determination of suitably equipped to house and care for specimens in captivity. There needs to be care taken not to compromise on a factor due to mutual interlinking, and each individual factor needs to be set up at a level not to cause physical or social suffering to an animal.

All facilities should have a written and regularly reviewed management plan, which should include standards to determine how each of these factors will be implemented by the facility for the lifespan of the animals. This document should build on one or combination of existing best practice guidelines, as outlined in Section B.

While some minimum standards of husbandry are defined by Parties and represent the minimum requirements that each facility is obliged to meet to avoid mistreatment of animals, these non-binding best practice guidelines should not be understood as minimum requirements; they provide guidance for development and further improvements of facilities keeping African elephants and southern white rhinoceros in captivity.

Section A - Factors to be evaluated when considering whether the proposed recipient of a living specimen of African elephant or southern white rhinoceros is suitably equipped to house and care for it

1. Physical housing (indoor and outdoor)

| All elements of physical housing (enclosures, doors, barriers, substrates, etc.) are designed and maintained to ensure safety for animals and humans. Elephants have sufficient space to make environmental and social choices, to move about and lie down without restriction in inside enclosures, and to walk appropriate distances on a daily basis in outside enclosures to maintain a healthy body condition, while engaging in natural behaviours such as foraging, feeding, exploring, socializing. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Construction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i. professional design of the facility with an emphasis on the needs of the specific animal species to be housed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. safety considerations of all construction elements and substrates (including sloped entries, non-slip surfaces, door construction, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. size of the enclosure corresponds to the group composition and dynamics, as well as to climatic conditions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*indoor - adequate space for each animal to lie down and move around with free access to the outdoor areas day and night, in the absence of adverse weather, safety or health conditions

\(^1\) While breeding is not a prerequisite to a facility being suitably equipped to house and care for a specimen, it is important to consider protocols established relating to breeding if breeding or not
- outdoor - sufficient space and environmental complexity to both allow for and stimulate natural behavioural activities and social interactions
- interplay between the size of the enclosure and its structural, vertical, and horizontal complexity and furnishing

iv. construction materials suitable for use with elephants and/or rhinoceros, no sharp ends, objects or potentially dangerous components

v. containment barriers - appropriate choice of materials and design, avoiding dry moats with steep slopes

vi. substrate - safe and appropriate due to health implications and its role in enrichment and comfort

vii. drainage to remove excess water

viii. appropriate and safe plantings

ix. Housing design includes structural and other precautions to mitigate against natural disasters such as flooding, hurricanes/typhoons, tornados/cyclones, earthquakes, wildfires, extreme temperatures/drought, etc., which can be reasonably anticipated in a given location

x. shelter from adverse weather (sun/rain/wind)

xi. enclosure furnishing
- diversity of zones to display species-specific behaviour
- pools (not necessary for southern white rhinoceros)
- shade
- sand bath or wallow (can be mud wallows)
- scratching posts
- resting areas
- other physical enrichment (water features, other varying topography, multiple feeding stations, long term feeding options)

xii. physical arrangement for management of social groups, possibility to hide from the view of other animals and visitors, escape routes to permit animals to safely remove themselves from incidents of aggression by a conspecific

xiii. space to expand as the animal / herd grows / develops

xiv. areas adapted for bulls to separate them from females and calves if needed, in particular during oestrus / musth periods, while providing the same standard of housing to bulls (e.g. appropriate size, complexity, substrate and furnishing of enclosures, shelter, visual barriers and safety)

xv. physical arrangements for isolation / quarantine, avoiding compromising welfare if isolation is prolonged

xvi. enclosure construction designed to accommodate management under protected contact, and availability of area for training in positive Protected Contact\(^2\) handling of elephants

xvii. if breeding, space/arrangements for newborn animals

xviii. if animal is on public display, availability of an off-display area with permanent access

xix. cameras for security and for monitoring animals (pregnant females, elderly individuals, social tensions in a group, etc.)

b) climate conditions, with specific consideration of the local weather conditions

i. temperature
- zones with appropriate temperature
- heating / cooling, for example heavy plastic or rubber curtains for entry doors, as appropriate
- monitoring / limiting time spent outdoors in cold weather

ii. light
- as much natural light as possible, including indoor
- quality artificial lightning indoor, gradual switch on/off

iii. air quality (limiting dust, appropriate ventilation, measures to prevent transmission of airborne diseases)

---

\(^2\) Protected Contact is a style of elephant management where all contact with the animal is performed through a protective barrier. Protected contact training is achieved through positive reinforcement techniques using targets, food rewards, body positioning and the voluntary participation by the elephant. Protected contact also includes situations where the elephant is handled through a protective barrier but is also spatially confined by an Elephant Restraint Device (ERD). Similar approach based on Positive Reinforcement Training is also used to perform the necessary procedures on rhinos. See EAZA, GFAS and other standards for more details.
2. Dietary needs

A properly balanced and healthy diet is provided in a stimulating way, based on the needs of each animal. Fresh clean water is available in sufficient quantity and at all times.

a) Nutrition
   i. basic diet designed and regularly reviewed by appropriate staff (veterinarian or nutritionist)
   ii. appropriate quantity of food and energy consumption
   iii. vitamins and minerals
   iv. special dietary requirements (pregnancy, lactation, age, etc.)
   v. appropriate storage conditions, quality and hygiene of food
   vi. variety of food and feeding methods
   vii. respecting feeding pattern (in time)
   viii. provision of hay with low nutritional quality at all times and browse (for elephants)
   ix. ensuring access of all individuals to food
   x. avoiding obesity (in particular for elephants) – monitoring body condition scores

b) Potable water available at sufficient quality, quantity, and at all times

3. Animal care and husbandry

All aspects of husbandry, including veterinary care, environmental enrichment and diet are designed to optimize the animal’s well-being. All animals are routinely monitored as frequently as needed. Animals are not fearful or aggressive in response to human presence or routine care procedures, and necessary handling and restraint is done safely and appropriately, with minimal distress to animals. Staff are trained in species-specific safe handling techniques/practices.

a) General care
   i. sufficient numbers, training and expertise of staff who care for the animals
   ii. general handling
      • daily checks of each individual
      • periodic health checks (body condition scores / weight, nutritional status), in appropriate frequencies for each individual depending on its age, health condition, etc.
      • regular cleaning of enclosures from manure and left-over food, cleaning / regular maintenance of pools (to avoid contamination and spreading of water-borne diseases)
      • protocol for safe handling (Protected Contact)
      • where possible and appropriate, Protected Contact is used to carry out the necessary procedures and checks of animals; other types of restraint should be limited to the shortest time possible in order to reduce stress
      • overnight visual monitoring techniques (including those capable of recording in low light/night conditions), such as CCTV monitoring to record social relationships and behavioural patterns, with regular review of footage
   iii. safe disposal of faeces and urine in a manner that eliminates pollution and avoids spreading of pathogens
   iv. feasibility of long-term care (for the lifespan of the animal)
   v. regular review of procedures to ensure continued level of care

b) Veterinary care
   i. qualified veterinarian care
   ii. regular veterinary care for each animal
   iii. care at birth and death
   iv. preventive medicine
      - regular check-ups
      - vaccination
      - parasite control
      - regular tests to monitor overall health, including blood tests, trunk wash, eye swabs and saliva tests, as appropriate
      - regular testing of elephant calves to identify and subsequently treat active EEHV (elephant endotheliotropic herpesvirus) infections
      - dental and horn care
- foot care
v. disease and injury care
vi. postmortem examination of dead animals
vii. availability of veterinary medicinal products

c) arrangements for quarantine and isolation
d) transportation
  i. availability of a plan for safe transportation
  ii. respect guidelines for safe transportation (IATA, CITES, IUCN)
  iii. close cooperation between sender and receiver of an animal, including on-site visits, in order to provide a better common understanding and better outcomes for housing and care

e) safety and security measures
  - safety of animals
    a) preventing injury
    b) preventing escape
    c) regular inspections and maintenance of physical environment and enclosures, including their furnishing
    d) security to prevent theft and death of specimens
  - safety of staff
  - safety of visitors
  - emergency management plan in the event of a disaster, such as flooding, hurricanes/typhoons, tornados/cyclones, earthquakes, wildfires, extreme temperatures/drought, etc., which can be reasonably anticipated in a given location
  - plan for secure and legal maintenance, disposal, or destruction of specimens after death, in particular to prevent entering of dead body parts into illegal commercial trade

4. Animal well-being

Animals are kept in appropriate social groups. They are provided with a complex physical and social environment which stimulates natural behaviours, social interactions and activity. Food is prepared and presented in a safe and appropriate manner to meet health and social needs. The behavioural/psychological well-being of each animal is evaluated and addressed.

a) appropriate group size and composition
  i. social structure
  ii. ability to separate the group and individuals within the group when needed
  iii. methods of integration / introduction of new animals into the social structure and for changing group structure

b) possibility to hide from the view of other members of the herd/group, to exercise normal defence reactions and to keep appropriate flight or escape distances

c) proximity of other species / sharing enclosure with other species (consider safe zones and escape routes for other species as elephants and rhinoceros may be dominant)

d) animal behaviour
  i. behavioural enrichment plan
    • diverse nutrition
    • food to stimulate natural grazing conditions, food-based enrichment
    • materials to play
    • materials to scratch (trunks of trees, rocks)
    • enrichment frequency, training programs, etc.

e) exposure to visitors
  i. appropriate distance from visitors, including access to off-display areas
  ii. no touching / riding by visitors of African elephants and southern white rhinoceros
  iii. privacy from visitors (partial visual and sound dampening barriers)
  iv. measures to prevent visitors from discarding objects into enclosure (intentionally or unintentionally)
5. Record keeping

**Written policy exists and is followed to maintain complete medical records and appropriate statistics for each individual animal.**

a) all animals have permanent identification

b) maintain for each individual, from being acquired / born to the death, and until certain period after the animal's death, or its transfer from the facility, records of:
   i. source, date of acquisition, evidence of legal acquisition, parentage (if known), means of transport to the current facility, health records prior to acquisition (if available), relevant permits etc.
   ii. preventive care and veterinary treatment, including weights and/or body condition scores
   iii. dietary records
   iv. behavioural, enrichment records
   v. accidents, uncommon events
   vi. breeding
   vii. pregnancy and births, if applicable
   viii. transportation and transfers, if applicable, when they occurred, for what purpose and how done, including permanent transfer to another facility
   ix. death and final disposal, including disposal of body parts requiring specific attention (tusks, horns)

c) records should be made available to relevant government authorities upon request, or as otherwise required by law

6. Breeding

**Written policy exists to determine whether or not breeding occurs in the facility, with sound practices in place to properly care for infants born.**

a) If not breeding: preventive measures and contraception (in consultation with the relevant breeding coordinator and veterinarian)

b) If breeding: develop a plan in advance, focusing on
   i. mating
   ii. pregnancy
   iii. birth
   iv. care of young including appropriate setup of enclosures to meet the needs of calves, plans in place for testing for and the treatment of active EEHV (elephant endotheliotropic herpesvirus) infections, should it arise
   v. population and genetic management
   vi. physical space requirements
   vii. participation in a recognised breeding programme

7. Wildlife and animal welfare laws

**All relevant international, national and local wildlife and animal welfare conventions, laws and regulations are complied with.**

a) compliance with national laws and/or regulations

b) compliance with international commitments
   i. CITES requirements
   ii. other (veterinary laws for international transport, etc.)
   iii. conservation agreements, if applicable

8. Other factors

a) Membership in a recognised Zoo association can provide further reassurance that the destination adheres to the standards and guidelines of that association and helps to exchange males to prevent inbreeding, but it is as such neither a pre-condition for assessment of an appropriate destination, nor a proof that the facility is an appropriate and acceptable destination
b) long-term policy of the facility of continual improvement to the quality of care and husbandry of the animals it maintains

c) arrangements should be made to ensure that any subsequent sale, donation or transfer of the animal (internationally or domestically) or of any animal born in the facility is also only to a facility suitably equipped to house and care for the specimen

d) support to in situ conservation

Section B - Examples of best practice documents for keeping living specimens of African elephant and southern white rhinoceros

Guidelines on keeping African elephants and southern white rhinoceros

EAZA. 2018. EAZA Best Practice Guidelines for the white rhinoceros (*Ceratotherium simum*). European Association of Zoos and Aquaria.


BIAZA (British & Irish Association of Zoos & Aquariums Elephant Welfare Group): BIAZA (2019) Guidelines for the management of elephants within BIAZA zoos. These are available on request via the BIAZA office (admin@biaza.org.uk).


Rhino Husbandry Manual – International Rhino Foundation


https://assets.speakcdn.com/assets/2332/aza_standards_for_elephant_management_and_care.pdf

GFAS. Global Federation of Animal Sanctuaries Standards for Elephant Sanctuaries.


GFAS. Global Federation of Animal Sanctuaries Standards For Rhinoceros, Hippopotamus and Tapir Sanctuaries


Kane, L; Forthman D & Hancock D eds (2005) Optimal Conditions for Captive Elephants: A Report by the Coalition for Captive Elephant Well-Being


Kane, L; Forthman D & Hancock D eds (2005) Best Practices by the Coalition for Captive Elephant Well-Being


Secretary of State’s Standards of Modern Zoo Practice - Appendix 8 – Specialist exhibits, Elephants - June 2017

Other relevant documents

Guidance for appropriate and acceptable destinations: African elephants and southern white rhinoceroses


IUCN. 2014. IUCN guidelines on the use of ex situ management for species conservation. IUCN SSC,


Caring for wildlife – The world zoo and aquarium animal welfare strategy (WAZA)

https://www.waza.org/priorities/animal-welfare/animal-welfare-strategies/

WAZA code of ethics and animal welfare


EAZA animal welfare resources https://www.eaza.net/about-us/areas-of-activity/animal-welfare/


CITES Website which is regularly updated contains further guidance documents: https://cites.org/eng/imp/appropriate_and_acceptable_destinations