

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirtieth meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 16-21 July 2018

CAPTIVE-BREEDING

Membership (as decided by the Committee)

- Chair: the Chair of the Animals Committee (Mr. Lötscher);
- Members: the acting representative of Europe (Mr. Nemtzov);
- Parties: Australia, Austria, Canada, Chile, China, Czech Republic, European Union, France, Germany, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Italy, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Mexico, Mozambique, Netherlands, Norway, South Africa, Spain, Switzerland, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America, Viet Nam and Zimbabwe; and
- IGOs and NGOs: United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), International Council for Game and Wildlife Conservation (CIC), International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center (SEAFDEC), Annamiticus, Association of Southeastern Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Born Free Foundation, Center for Biological Diversity, Defenders of Wildlife, Environmental Investigation Agency UK, Environmental Investigation Agency USA, German Society of Herpetology (DGHT), Humane Society International, Lewis and Clark College – International Environmental Law Project, Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC), Ornamental Fish International, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa (PASA), Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council, ProWildlife, Society for Wildlife and Nature, Species Survival Network (SSN), Species360, Sustainable Users Network, TRAFFIC, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Animal Protection, World Association of Zoos and Aquariums (WAZA), World Wildlife Fund, Zoological Society of London and Zoological Society of San Diego.

Mandate

Concerning agenda item 13.1, the in-session working group shall:

- a) review the responses from countries in Annex 2 of document AC30 Doc. 13.1, the information in Annex 3 of document AC30 Doc. 13.1 and any additional relevant information and determine if trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5.
- b) In instances where this is not the case, the in-session working group shall:
 - i) identify concerns appropriately within the Committee's remit;
 - ii) in consultation with the Secretariat, formulate draft recommendations directed to the relevant country which are time-bound, feasible, measurable, proportionate, transparent, and aimed at ensuring long-

term compliance which, where appropriate, aim to promote capacity building and enhance the ability of the country to implement relevant provisions of the Convention; and

iii) prepare supporting information for the Standing Committee on these cases.

c) identify any concerns that are more appropriately considered by the Standing Committee.

Concerning agenda item 13.2, the in-session working group shall, in the light of discussion in the plenary and taking into account the comments and recommendations of the Secretariat in document AC30 Doc. 13.2, draft observations and recommendations regarding the first iteration of Resolution Conf. 17.7, including opportunities for harmonisation with the process in Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17) and other opportunities to achieve the aims of the Resolution most effectively and cost efficiently.

Recommendations regarding country-species combinations selected

***Vulpes zerda* from Sudan**

The working group recommends to the Animals committee that if no response is received from Sudan in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee, through its Chair, and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee.

***Macaca fascicularis* from Cambodia**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

***Cacatua alba* from Indonesia**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that Indonesia should explain by 1 February 2019, the high productivity reported by the two facilities breeding this species and confirm whether the facilities have produced specimens to the F2 generation or how they are managing their stock in a manner that has been demonstrated to do so. The working group notes that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.

***Lorius lory* from South Africa**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review and that South Africa should be encouraged to continue its activities to improve the process of record keeping and monitoring by all the breeding facilities of the species.

***Varanus exanthematicus* from Ghana**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that Ghana should confirm by 1 February 2019 that it will report all specimens from facilities that are produced under the management practices described in document AC30 Doc. 13.1 A2 as source code W and that accordingly they will undertake a non-detriment finding (NDF) for all exports.

***Varanus exanthematicus* from Togo**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

***Varanus timorensis* from Indonesia**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Indonesia should agree to require all facilities breeding this species to maintain records of their activities in line with page 11 of the *Guidance for inspection of captive breeding and ranching facilities* and carry out regular inspection and monitoring. The working group notes that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.

***Ptyas mucosus* from Indonesia**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Benin**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Benin should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;
- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species;
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Benin to produce F2 specimens or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so; and
- Agree to restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Benin is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Ghana**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Ghana should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Ghana to produce F2 specimens or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so; and
- Restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Ghana is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Guinea**

The working group recommends that the Animals Committee flag this species-country combination for the Standing Committee and the Secretariat to be included in the ongoing Article XIII compliance process involving Guinea.

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Mali**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Mali should:

- Provide evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock;

- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species; and
- Agree to restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length.

Mali is further encouraged to:

- Introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate; inspections should occur at the end of the breeding season for each stock
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Sudan**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that if no response is received from Sudan in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee, through its Chair, and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee.

***Centrochelys sulcata* from Togo**

The working group recommends the following to the Animals Committee:

By 1 February 2019, Togo should

- provide evidence of Legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock
- Provide the justification for, and details of, the scientific basis by which it has been established that the quantities of *Centrochelys sulcata* taken from the wild and used as breeding stock would not be detrimental to the survival of the species.
- Provide information on the ability of the facilities in Togo to produce F2 or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so.
- Restrict export to specimens of less than 15cm straight carapace length
- Confirm that they will export specimens produced in these facilities with source code “F” only and make a legal acquisition and non-detriment finding prior to authorizing export, until such time that a given facility is able to produce to F2 generation in which case source code “C” can be used those specimens in accordance with Resolution conf.10.16 rev.

Togo is further encouraged to:

- introduce standard reporting forms to be used by the facilities according to the ones in the guidance
- Continue regular monitoring and inspections as appropriate at the end of the breeding season
- Establish a unique marking system for the breeding stock
- Re-evaluate their existing export quota in consultation with the scientific authority

***Geochelone elegans* from Jordan**

The Animals Committee recommends that Jordan immediately and until the Standing Committee recommends otherwise, establishes a zero export quota for *Geochelone elegans* from all sources and provides the following to the Secretariat by 1 February 2019:

- evidence of Legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock

- information on the ability of the facilities in Jordan to produce F1 and/or F2 in an amount that corresponds to the number of specimens exported by these facilities or manage the species in a manner demonstrated to be capable of doing so.

***Testudo hermanni* from the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that if no response is received from the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia in time for consideration at the next meeting of the Standing Committee, the Standing Committee should take appropriate action. Should a response be received, the Animals Committee, through its Chair, and the Secretariat should confer to make any appropriate recommendations to the Standing Committee

***Oophaga pumilio* from Nicaragua**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Nicaragua should confirm that it will export specimens from facilities breeding this species with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.

***Oophaga pumilio* from Panama**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Panama should confirm that it will export specimens from facilities breeding this species with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.

***Agalychnis callidryas* from Nicaragua**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

***Hippocampus comes* from Viet Nam**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that by 1 February 2019, Viet Nam should confirm that if export of specimens recommence from these or similar facilities it will export specimens from these facilities with source code “W” or “F” and will make legal acquisition and non-detriment findings prior to authorising export.

***Ornithoptera croesus* from Indonesia**

The working group recommends to the Animals Committee that, by 1 February 2019, Indonesia provide a report on the ranching operation to the Secretariat and confirm that an NDF will be made prior to authorizing exportation of any specimens with source code ‘R’. The working group notes that Indonesia has suspended all trade in this species since 2017.

***Tridacna crocea* from the Federated States of Micronesia**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

***Trachyphyllia geoffroyi* from Indonesia**

The working group has determined that trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5 and therefor recommends to the Animals Committee that the species-country combination should be excluded from the review.

General recommendations:

Regarding paragraph 6 d) in AC30 Doc. 13.2 submitted by the Secretariat, the working group suggests the following amendments to the new paragraphs to be included in Resolution Conf. 17.7 proposed:

RECOMMENDS that the Animals Committee, when selecting species-country combinations for review under paragraph 2 c) of the present Resolution, not select species-country combinations where the Standing

Committee has already entered a dialogue with the country concerned over the use of source codes C, D, F or R under another compliance process.

RECOMMENDS that the Standing Committee, when drafting recommendations to the country or countries under paragraph 2 j) of the present Resolution, not duplicate engagement with the country concerned over the use of source codes C, D, F or R under another compliance process.

Recommends to insert a new paragraph in Resolution Conf. 17.7 as follows:

Where the Animals Committee finds that a species/country combination raises concerns better dealt within the process of the Review of Significant Trade, it can introduce that combination into stage 2 of the process in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17), paragraph 1 d) as an exceptional case.

In addition, the WG provides the following general observations to the Animals Committee to be submitted to the Standing Committee:

- The process is not obviously flagging deliberate misuse of source codes; we are instead seeing that source code shifts are more commonly a result of importing countries' influence on exporting countries' source code assignments;
- The Committee noted that for certain types of production systems it is difficult to know whether the specimens produced meet the definition of "bred in captivity" in Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev) e.g., "controlled environment" as defined within Resolution Conf. 10.16. Existing source codes might not adequately capture the life history of certain types of certain species such as butterflies, corals, clams and seahorses. Controlled environment for clams might only be necessary during the mobile reproductive/juvenile stages of development and not otherwise. It is not obvious whether source codes R, F or C should be used in some cases. This has hampered the Committee's work in the implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.7.
- The Committee considers that the current criteria focus on species that are traded in significant numbers, or where there are significant increases in trade, but might overlook species that are difficult to breed in captivity for which trade occurs at relatively low levels. The breeding biology of species is a key consideration that ideally should be factored into the selection process in future in order to identify species of concern, and we hope that there would be scope to explore the inclusion of these aspects within a revised methodology.