

Responses to Notification to the Parties No 2018/037

Table of Contents

Australia	2
China	3
The Netherlands	4
New Zealand	5
The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	7
The United States of America	8

Daniel Kachelriess

From: Pascal PERRAUD <Pascal.Perraud@cites.org> on behalf of INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Sent: Wednesday, May 2, 2018 8:56 AM
To: Daniel Kachelriess
Subject: Fw: Notification 2018/037 - Australian response [SEC=UNCLASSIFIED]
Attachments: Australian coral databse - comparison with WoRMS.xlsx

----- Forwarded by Pascal PERRAUD/UNEP/GVA/UNO on 02-05-18 08:55 -----

From: "Ollerenshaw, Rhedyn" <Rhedyn.Ollerenshaw@environment.gov.au>
To: "info@cites.org" <info@cites.org>
Cc: "Gowland, Sarah" <Sarah.Gowland@environment.gov.au>, "Muirhead, Jeanette" <Jeanette.Muirhead@environment.gov.au>, Wildlife Communications <dehcommunications@environment.gov.au>
Date: 01-05-18 02:18
Subject: Notification 2018/037 - Australian response [SEC=UNCLASSIFIED]

Dear Secretariat

Australia is pleased to provide the following (and attached) response to Notification 2018/037 on Nomenclature of CITES-listed corals.

In accordance with Decision 17.307, Australia has undertaken an internal assessment of the WoRMS database with regard to consistency with our own internal nomenclature database (known as 'SPRAT' – Species PRofile and Threats Database).

In summary, we have identified an **approximately 15% rate of inconsistency** in accepted scientific names between the nomenclature currently contained in SPRAT and WoRMS, and approximately **10% inconsistency in nominated authorities**.

Our database managers and nomenclature specialists have helpfully prepared the attached spreadsheet which articulates precisely where inconsistencies between the two databases occur. I particularly draw your attention to columns C/D and M, which identify the particular inconsistencies.

We look forward to discussion of this matter at AC30 in July.

Kind Regards

Rhedyn Ollerenshaw
A/g Assistant Director
Wildlife Trade Assessments | CITES Scientific Authority of Australia
Department of the Environment and Energy
ph: +61 (02) 6274 1353 fax: +61 (02) 6274 1921
email: rhedyn.ollerenshaw@environment.gov.au
mail: GPO Box 787 Canberra ACT 2601
(See attached file: *Australian coral databse - comparison with WoRMS.xlsx*)



Ref: 2018-AL-008

May 15th, 2018

To:
Mr. David Morgan
CITES Secretariat
Geneva, Switzerland
Fax: +41-(0)22-797-34-17
Email: info@cites.org

Subject: Nomenclature of CITES-listed corals

Dear Mr. David Morgan,

First of all, I would like to extend my gratitude for your continuous support to the implementation of CITES in China.

In China, the WoRMS database is used widely in coral research. The consistency evaluation score of the scientific name of corals between the Species 2000 China Node and the WoRMS database is 89.6%. Among the 865 records, 744 records are exactly matched, 16 records are ambiguous, 13 records are near, 10 records are phonetic, and 90 records are nonexistent in the WoRMS database.

If any further information is needed, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely yours,


Mr. Meng Xianlin
Executive Director General,
CITES Management Authority of China
Tel: +86-10-8423 9003
Fax: +86-10-8423 8897

Daniel Kachelriess

From: Pascal PERRAUD <Pascal.Perraud@cites.org> on behalf of INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Sent: Monday, May 14, 2018 12:47 PM
To: Daniel Kachelriess
Cc: Karen Gaynor
Subject: Fw: 2018/037 Nomenclature of CITES-listed corals

----- Forwarded by Pascal PERRAUD/UNEP/GVA/UNO on 14-05-18 12:46 -----

From: "Langeveld, ing. M.W.L.H. MSc (Marijke)" <m.w.l.h.langeveld@minez.nl>
To: INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Cc: "Schelvis, T.I. (Tessa)" <tessa.schelvis@rvo.nl>
Date: 14-05-18 11:03
Subject: Re: 2018/037 Nomenclature of CITES-listed corals

Dear CITES secretariat,

On behalf of the Dutch CITES Scientific Authority I send you the input with regards to Notification 2018/037:

17.3017: internal assessment of the WoRMS database with regard to consistency with their own internal coral nomenclature databases, and report their findings to the Secretariat for communication to the Animals Committee.

The use of genera instead of species seems easy at first sight as an aid to identifications, but that is not always clear and successful. The problem with lists of mainly genera is that genera can also resemble each other. The Dutch CITES SA therefore also sees incorrect identifications at the genus level.

Kind regards,

Marijke Langeveld

CITES Management Authority and Wildlife Crime

.....
Ministry of Agriculture, Nature and Food Quality

Directorate-general for Agro and Nature
Nature and Biodiversity Department
Bezuidenhoutseweg 73 | 2594 AC The Hague
The Netherlands

.....
T (+31) (0)70 3785587

M (+31) (0) 650633242

m.w.l.h.langeveld@minez.nl
.....

Dit bericht kan informatie bevatten die niet voor u is bestemd. Indien u niet de geadresseerde bent of dit bericht abusievelijk aan u is gezonden, wordt u verzocht dat aan de afzender te melden en het bericht te verwijderen.

De Staat aanvaardt geen aansprakelijkheid voor schade, van welke aard ook, die verband houdt met risico's verbonden aan het elektronisch verzenden van berichten.

This message may contain information that is not intended for you. If you are not the addressee or if this message was sent to you by mistake, you are requested to inform the sender and delete the message.
The State accepts no liability for damage of any kind resulting from the risks inherent in the electronic transmission of messages.

Daniel Kachelriess

From: Pascal PERRAUD <Pascal.Perraud@cites.org> on behalf of INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Sent: Wednesday, May 2, 2018 9:05 AM
To: Daniel Kachelriess
Subject: Fw: Notification No. 2018/037

----- Forwarded by Pascal PERRAUD/UNEP/GVA/UNO on 02-05-18 09:04 -----

From: Hugh Robertson <hrobertson@doc.govt.nz>
To: INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Cc: Sarah McIntyre <smcintyre@doc.govt.nz>, Anastacia Kirk <akirk@doc.govt.nz>
Date: 02-05-18 05:31
Subject: Notification No. 2018/037

2 May 2018

Dear CITES Secretariat

In response to Notification No. 2018/037, concerning the nomenclature of CITES-listed corals, and Decision 17.307 in particular, NEW ZEALAND would like to advise that Dr Diane Tracey has confirmed that the nomenclature used in WoRMS database is that used by the national collection of corals held by the National Institute of Water and Atmospheric Research in New Zealand.

Kind regards

Dr Hugh Robertson

NZ Scientific Authority, CITES
Biodiversity Group
Department of Conservation
PO Box 10-420,
Wellington
NEW ZEALAND

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

Daniel Kachelriess

From: Pascal PERRAUD <Pascal.Perraud@cites.org> on behalf of INFO-CITES <INFO@cites.org>
Sent: Tuesday, April 24, 2018 9:00 AM
To: Thomas De Meulenaer
Cc: Karen Gaynor; Daniel Kachelriess
Subject: Fw: Cites notification 2018/037

----- Forwarded by Pascal PERRAUD/UNEP/GVA/UNO on 24-04-18 08:59 -----

From: "Doyle, Alejandro (DEFRA)" <Alejandro.Doyle@defra.gsi.gov.uk>
To: "info@cites.org" <info@cites.org>
Cc: Alison Littlewood <Alison.Littlewood@jncc.gov.uk>, Vin Fleming <vin.fleming@jncc.gov.uk>, "Biott, Elizabeth (DEFRA)" <Elizabeth.Biott@defra.gsi.gov.uk>, "Blake, Kristopher (DEFRA)" <Kristopher.Blake@defra.gsi.gov.uk>, "Kendall, Elaine (Defra)" <Elaine.Kendall@defra.gsi.gov.uk>, "Skinner, Elif (Defra)" <Elif.Skinner@defra.gsi.gov.uk>
Date: 23-04-18 17:07
Subject: RE: Cites notification 2018/037

Dear CITES Secretariat,

I am writing to you in regards to Cites **notification 2018/037** on [Nomenclature of CITES-listed corals](#). I have consulted with our scientific authority and they have provided me with the following information:

We (UK) don't host a separate national coral taxonomic database, but in accordance with Resolution Conf 12.11(Rev Cop 17) use the standard checklist of all CITES listed coral species compiled by UNEP-WCMC (2012) (and used in Species+ www.speciesplus.com), for ensuring the accepted scientific name appears on CITES permits we issue. However, we have noted differences on occasion between the nomenclature found in Species+ and the various online databases such as WoRMs and Veron's Corals of the World (2000). For example *Dipsastraea* appears to be widely accepted as a Genus within the literature, including on [WoRMs](#) (& the World checklist of Scleractinia which forms part of the WoRMs register), but doesn't appear within Species+, and therefore, for the purpose of issuing CITES permits, we have had to treat *Dipsastraea* as a synonym of *Favia*. We look forward to the forthcoming discussions on this issue at AC30 and welcome efforts to identify a new standard nomenclature reference for CITES-listed corals that can be used by CITES Authorities, researchers and traders alike.

Kind regards,

Alejandro.

Alejandro Doyle | International Species Conservation | Natural Environment and Rural Policy | Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs

Email: alejandro.doyle@defra.gsi.gov.uk | Phone: 02078955470

Address: 2nd Floor, Horizon House, 1 Deanery Road, Bristol, BS1 5AH

[Website](#) [Twitter](#) [Facebook](#) [LinkedIn](#) [Instagram](#)

Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra) This email and any attachments is intended for the named recipient only. If you have received it in error you have no authority to use, disclose, store or copy any of its contents and you should destroy it and inform the sender. Whilst this email and associated attachments will have been checked for known viruses whilst within Defra systems we can accept no responsibility once it has left our systems. Communications on Defra's computer systems may be monitored and/or recorded to secure the effective operation of the system and for other lawful purposes.



United States Department of the Interior



FISH AND WILDLIFE SERVICE
Washington, D.C. 20240

IN REPLY REFER TO:
FWS/DMA/TRE 1-06b.

MAY 09 2018

CITES Secretariat
International Environment House
11 Chemin des Anémones
CH-1219 Châtelaine-Geneve
Switzerland

Via email: info@cites.org

Dear Sir or Madam:

This letter provides the U.S. response to Notification to the Parties No. 2018/037, concerning nomenclature for CITES-listed corals. Parties were requested to provide information on “their internal assessment of the consistency of the WoRMS database with their internal coral nomenclature databases pursuant to Decision 17.307.”

Following internal consultation within the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Division of Management Authority, Division of Scientific Authority, and Office of Law Enforcement) and with the National Marine Fisheries Service (NOAA-Fisheries), we provide the following information:

- The Division of Management Authority and the Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) do not use the taxonomy in either the WoRMS database or the new Corals of the World website by John Veron, although we are aware of them. Before the CITES Parties adopted taxonomic guidance related to corals, Veron’s *Corals of the World* was widely used at U.S. ports of entry since the majority of the corals imported into the United States originate in Indonesia. Currently, the United States adheres to the nomenclatural guidance adopted by the CITES Parties for both CITES-listed and non-listed coral species. In the event that a coral taxon is not included in the current CITES nomenclatural reference, we rely on the Integrated Taxonomic Information System (ITIS).

NOAA-Fisheries provided the following additional information:

- The World Register of Marine Species (WoRMS) is the most complete and authoritative source for taxonomic names of marine species (including corals). The U.S. National Database of Deep-Sea Corals and Sponges is standardized to WoRMS taxonomy. The specific coral groups are curated by leading taxonomic experts. For example, the

taxonomic editor for scleractinian and stylasterid corals - both listed in the CITES Appendices - is Dr. Stephen Cairns of the Smithsonian Institution's National Museum of Natural History, the leading expert on these taxa. Dennis Opresko, the leading taxonomist on black corals (Antipatharia - the other CITES-listed coral group) is the taxonomic expert for this group. The editors have also been quick to incorporate corrections when NOAA-Fisheries has identified issues. NOAA-Fisheries is currently working with the octocoral taxonomic editor to incorporate recent revisions to the taxonomy of species in the precious corals (family Coralliidae). The Ocean Biogeographic Information System (OBIS), as well as nearly all international marine organizations, are using WoRMS.

- The nomenclature of the WoRMS database for the seven Caribbean corals listed under the U.S. Endangered Species Act (ESA) is synonymous with nomenclature used by NOAA-Fisheries.

We also provide the following additional information, which we believe is relevant to the information request:

- WoRMS covers reef-building spp. (stony corals with zooxanthellae) and non-reef-building spp. (stony corals without zooxanthellae, soft corals). Most or all of both coral groups are CITES-listed, but Corals of the World only includes reef-building corals.
- For each species, Corals of the World has a range map, photos of living colonies, photos of the skeleton, a thorough description of identifying characteristics, and notes about how to distinguish the species from similar species. WoRMS has much less information for each species.
- With respect to some of NOAA-Fisheries' work in the Pacific Islands, there is a dependence on the nomenclature in the Corals of the World due to the ease of use and applicability. Species names for the 15 ESA-listed Indo-Pacific corals are the same in both Corals of the World and WoRMS. While WoRMS is generally a reliable and widely-used source for taxonomic names of marine species, Corals of the World is the preferred reference for Indo-Pacific reef-building coral taxonomy, especially given the expansion of this database over the last several years.

We hope you will find this information useful to the Secretariat's evaluation. If you have any questions concerning the information we have provided, please feel free to contact me at: craig_hoover@fws.gov.

Sincerely,



Craig Hoover, Chief
Division of Management Authority