

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Twenty-ninth meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 18-22 July 2017

Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

CAPTIVE BREEDING (RESOLUTION CONF. 17.7)
(agenda item 14)

Membership (as decided by the Committee)

Chair: the AC Chair (Mr. Lörtscher);

Parties: Argentina, Austria, Belgium, Canada, China, Czech Republic, Estonia, European Union, France, Hungary, Indonesia, Italy, Japan, Kenya, Malaysia, Malta, Mexico, Netherlands, Norway, Peru, Portugal, Saudi Arabia, South Africa, Spain, Switzerland, Thailand, Turkey, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America, and Zimbabwe; and

IGOs and NGOs: UNEP-WCMC; IUCN; Animal Welfare Institute, Association of Southeastern Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Born Free Foundation, Born Free USA, Center for Biological Diversity, Cruelty Free International (BUAV), Defenders of Wildlife, EIA, European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, FACE, Fondation Franz Weber, Global Eye, Humane Society International, IFAW, IWMC World Conservation Trust, Japan Wildlife Conservation Society, Lewis and Clark College - International Environmental Law Project, Natural Resources Defense Council, Ornamental Fish International, PASA, Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council, ProWildlife, Safari Club International, Society for Wildlife And Nature International (SWAN), Species Survival Network, Sustainable Users Network, TRAFFIC, VERDEVELO SL., Wildlife Conservation Society, World Animal Protection, WAZA, World Parrot Trust, WWF, Zoological Society of London, and Zoological Society of San Diego.

Mandate

Concerning agenda item 14.1:

Taking account of discussions in plenary and using information presented in document AC29 Doc. 14.1, the working group shall, in accordance with paragraph 2 c) of Resolution Conf. 17.7:

- a) select a limited number of species/country combinations for review;
- b) prepare a brief explanation of the reasons for each selection;
- c) draft general or specific questions for the countries selected for review;
- d) determine a prioritised list of species for which a short review of the breeding biology, captive husbandry and any impacts, if relevant, of removal of founder stock from the wild should be requested;

- e) identify any urgent enforcement matters which need to be referred to the Secretariat and the country concerned, and subsequent reporting to the Standing Committee; and
- f) take note of any observations and recommendations regarding the first iteration of Resolution Conf. 17.7, including opportunities for harmonisation with the process in Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17) and other opportunities to achieve the aims of the Resolution most effectively and cost efficiently, for transmission to the Standing Committee after the 30th meeting of the Animals Committee.

Concerning agenda item 14.2:

Based on the information presented in document AC29 Doc. 14.2, the working group shall decide on the terms of reference for an intersessional working group to continue the implementation of Decision 17.104 and, in case it can be undertaken, assess the outcomes of the consultancy mentioned in paragraph 8 of document AC29 Doc. 14.2.

Recommendations

1. **Concerning agenda item 14.1 a) and b):** species/country combinations recommended for review and a brief explanation for selected species/country combinations:

	Family	Species	Countries	Criterion met	Native	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions to be asked [see text in paragraph c) of the mandate]
Referred from RST								
1	Testudinidae	<i>Centrochelys sulcata</i>	Benin Ghana Guinea Mali Sudan Togo		Yes	C, R C, F, R C, F C, F C C, F, R	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.) or questionable use of source code "F" or "R" – as per source code.	Benin: C1-C6; R1-R3; Q2 Ghana: C1-C6; R1-R3; Q2 Guinea: F1-F4 Mali: F1-F4 Sudan: C1-C6 Togo: C1-C6; R1-R3; Q2
2	Papilionidae	<i>Ornithoptera croesus</i>	Indonesia	(ii) volume (iii) shift	Yes	C, F, R	Questionable use of source code "F" or "R"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - How and at what life cycle stage are specimens collected to be introduced into the breeding/ production facility? - Is always the same stage collected or can different stages be collected and reared in the facility? - If different stages are used, are these kept separately at the breeding/ production facility? - Is there a book-keeping mechanism for incoming and outgoing specimens? - Is there a non-detriment finding (NDF) conducted for the offtake of specimens from the wild to supplement the breeding/ production facility? If yes please provide the details of the NDF. - In addition questions C1-C4 - Q1
Table 3 (criteria (i), (ii), (iii) and (vi))								
3	Canidae	<i>Vulpes zerda</i>	Sudan	(iii) shift	Yes	C	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.). Observed shift from W to C	C1-C6 Q1
4	Cacatuidae	<i>Cacatua alba</i>	Indonesia	(i) increase	Yes	C	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6

	Family	Species	Countries	Criterion met	Native	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions to be asked [see text in paragraph c) of the mandate]
5 6	Varanidae	<i>Varanus exanthematicus</i>	Ghana Togo	(iii) shift (ii) volume	Yes Yes	R/C? C, F, R	Ghana: Not "ranching" in conformity with Res. Conf.11.16 (Rev. CoP15) Togo: Not "ranching" in conformity with Res. Conf.11.16 (Rev. CoP15)	Ghana: R1-R3; Q1 Togo: R1-R3
7	Varanidae	<i>Varanus timorensis</i>	Indonesia	(ii)	Yes	C, F	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6
8	Colubridae	<i>Ptyas mucosus</i>	Indonesia	(iii)	Yes	C, F	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6; Q1
9	Testudinidae	<i>Testudo hermanni</i>	FYROM	(ii)	Yes	C, F, U	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6
10 11	Dendrobatidae	<i>Oophaga pumilio</i>	Nicaragua Panama	(i) increase (ii) volume	Yes Yes	C C	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	Nicaragua: C1-C6; Q2 Panama: C1-C6; Q2
12	Hylidae	<i>Agalychnis callidryas</i>	Nicaragua	(ii)	Yes	C, F	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6
13	Syngnathidae	<i>Hippocampus comes</i>	Viet Nam	(iii) shift	Yes	C, F	Other incorrect use of source codes (F)	F1-F4; Q1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - How and at what life cycle stage are specimens collected to be introduced into the breeding/ production facility? - Is always the same stage collected and reared in the facility or can different stages be collected? - If different stages are collected, are these kept separately at the breeding/ production facility? - Is there a book-keeping mechanism for incoming and outgoing specimens? - Is there an NDF conducted for the offtake of specimens from the wild to supplement the breeding/ production facility? If yes can you provide the details of that NDF? - explain why you believe that source code 'F' is the most appropriate - In addition questions C1-C4

	Family	Species	Countries	Criterion met	Native	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions to be asked [see text in paragraph c) of the mandate]
14	Tridacnidae	<i>Tridacna crocea</i>	Federated states of Micronesia	(i), (vi)	No	F	Other incorrect use of source codes (F)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - How and at what life cycle stage are specimens collected to be introduced into the breeding/ production facility? - Is always the same stage collected or can different stages be collected? - If different stages are collected, are these kept separately at the breeding/ production facility? - Is there a book-keeping mechanism for incoming and outgoing specimens? - Is there an NDF conducted for the offtake of specimens from the wild to supplement the breeding/ production facility? If yes please provide details of this NDF. - explain why you believe that source code 'F' is the most appropriate - In addition questions F1-F4
15	Trachyphylliidae	<i>Trachyphyllia geoffroyi</i>	Indonesia		Yes	F, C	Other incorrect use of source codes (F)	<p>How many facilities in your country are producing specimens of the species concerned which are exported under source code F?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Describe what monitoring or inspection of these mariculture facilities takes place, how regularly and by whom. 2. Please provide a general description of the production methods employed by the facilities mentioned above and which element(s) of the definition of "bred in captivity" in Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> have not been met. 3. Please explain the basis and justification for your non-detriment finding that has been made for the export of all specimens of the species concerned with the source code "F". 4. Please provide a detailed description of the production methods used to produce <i>Trachyphyllia geoffroyi</i>, source code F, including, but not limited to, those outlined below, distinguishing where different methods are employed by different facilities and the proportion of specimens produced by the production method described. <p>For example, if <i>Trachyphyllia geoffroyi</i> are produced by the fragmentation technique, 'fragging', where the</p>

	Family	Species	Countries	Criterion met	Native	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions to be asked [see text in paragraph c) of the mandate]
								<p>parent coral (F₀) is cut into pieces and subsequent fragments allowed to grow on)</p> <p>a) describe the cutting or fragging process for this species and maximum number of fragments produced per parent coral.</p> <p>b) state whether the fragments of <i>Trachyphyllia</i> are routinely attached to an artificial base?</p> <p>c) on average, how long are the corals grown on for before export?</p> <p>d) describe the conditions and facilities they are maintained during this growth stage</p> <p>e) provide photographic evidence of the various stages of fragmentation from parental coral to specimens ready for export.</p> <p>For example, if <i>Trachyphyllia geoffroyi</i> are produced by the budding technique (asexual reproduction):</p> <p>a) describe the facilities and production methods involved [including whether the 'parent' and juvenile corals produced by the 'budding technique' are maintained in tanks on land in a controlled environment?]</p> <p>b) what length of time are the juvenile corals maintained for before export?</p> <p>c) provide photographic evidence of all various stages of asexual reproduction.</p> <p>d) are the parent corals held permanently in captivity or how regularly are they replaced with new wild taken corals?</p> <p>Describe any other 'production' techniques used, for example, other sexual reproduction spawning techniques.</p>
Table 4 (criteria (iv) and (v))								
	No cases							

	Family	Species	Countries	Criterion met	Native	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions to be asked [see text in paragraph c) of the mandate]
Table 5 (criterion of Doc. AC29 Doc. 14.1 (vi) only)								
16	Loriidae	<i>Lorius lory</i>	South Africa	(vi)	No	C,F	Questionable legal acquisition of breeding stock Doubts on how they are being bred based on knowledge about difficulties with breeding	C1-C6; F1-F4; Q1 Please provide information on the legality of the founder stock of these facilities: - When was the founder stock imported? - From where was it imported? - How much time was needed to build up the breeding population?
Other sources (referred to the Secretariat by Parties (table on page 3))								
17	Testudinidae	<i>Geochelone elegans</i>	Jordan		No	C	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6 - What is the exact source code for the specimens exported without a source code indicated? - What is the source of the founder stock? - When was it imported? - From where was it imported? - How much time was needed to build up the breeding population?
18	Cercopithecidae	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Cambodia		Yes	C, F	Not bred in captivity in conformity with Res. Conf 10.16 (Rev.).	C1-C6; F1-F4; Q1; Q2

2. **Concerning agenda item 14.1 c):** general or specific questions for the countries selected for review:

Text of questions to be asked to countries depending on the source code for which they were selected:

Source code "C"

Question code	Question
C1	How many facilities in your country are breeding specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported? How does the breeding facility meet the criteria of a closed environment according to Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> ?
C2	Have all of these facilities been inspected to ensure that the specimens produced comply with Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> ? Please explain further any regulations or measures currently in place for monitoring facilities which claim to be captive breeding this species, for example whether facilities are required to keep records of the acquisition, maintenance or breeding of animals of this species, and whether authorities verify these records?
C3	Which authority carries out these inspections and how often are they undertaken?
C4	For each facility in question 1, either complete the Data Collection Form (document AC29 Inf. 1 may be of assistance), or provide the information on the form in a different way.
C5	How was it determined that the breeding stock was established in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?
C6	Has the breeding stock received additional specimens from the wild since establishment and if so, how many and when and how was it determined that they were obtained in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?

DATA COLLECTION FORM

GENERAL INFORMATION ON THE FACILITY

Date of inspection: _____	Name of senior inspecting officer: _____
Facility name: _____	

Name and position(s) of all inspecting officer(s) present:

1. _____

2. _____

Type of inspection: Initial Date of last inspection: _____

Routine

Follow-up (*in cases where discrepancies or anomalies, detected during a previous inspection, remain outstanding*)

Facility trading name(s): _____

Facility owner(s): _____

Facility address and contact information: _____

Year the facility was established: _____

How many staff are currently employed at the facility?

 Full time Part time

Name and job title of facility staff accompanying inspecting officer(s):

Does the operation have access to professional veterinary services? Yes No

If yes, what is the name and address of vet? _____

Does this company keep animals at any other location(s)? Yes No

If yes, where? _____

If yes, make arrangements to inspect the location(s) as soon as possible

DATA COLLECTION FORM

SPECIES INFORMATION *(to be completed separately for each species held at the facility)*

Date of inspection: _____	Name of senior inspecting officer: _____
Facility name: _____	Species : _____

*Date species first acquired? _____ Source and life-stage of initial stock? _____

Numbers of initial stock, and sexes, if known _____ Males? Females?

*Have additional animals been obtained since you acquired the initial stock? If so, from where?

Do you **BREED** this species? Yes No

When did you start breeding? _____

litters/clutches per year? _____

offspring/eggs in litter/clutch? _____

produced in the previous year? _____

ADULT BREEDING STOCK	Facility information	Inspector count <i>(where possible)</i>
Number of adults present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Number of males present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Number of females?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
What % of females breed each year?	<input type="text"/>	
What do you feed adult animals? _____		

REARING STOCK (CAPTIVE BRED AND RANCHED COMBINED)	Facility information	Inspector count <i>(where possible)</i>
Number of juveniles present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Age at sexual maturity (years)?	<input type="text"/>	
Size or mass at sexual maturity (cm or g)?	<input type="text"/>	
Size at sale (cm or g)	<input type="text"/>	
What percentage of juveniles survive beyond 2 weeks? <i>Includes mortalities of eggs that didn't hatch.</i>	<input type="text"/>	
What do you feed rearing and juvenile animals? _____		

Source code “R”

Question code	Question
R1	In relation to all species that have been transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II under the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev CoP15) on <i>Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i> , please provide any missing reports under paragraph 5 a) and the information specified under paragraph 5 b) of that Resolution.
R2	1. In relation to all species that have <u>not</u> been transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II under the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev CoP15) on <i>Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i> , please provide the following information [from paragraph 5 a) and b) of that Resolution]: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) the status of the wild population concerned established by monitoring at an appropriate frequency and with sufficient precision to allow recognition of changes in population size and structure owing to ranching; ii) the number of specimens (eggs, young or adults) taken annually from the wild and the percentage of this offtake used to supply ranching operations; iii) details of the annual production levels, and product types and quantity produced for export; iv) an estimate of the percentage of the annual wild production of eggs, neonates or other life stages taken for the ranching operation; v) the number of animals released and their survival rates estimated on the basis of surveys and tagging programs, if any; vi) the mortality rate in captivity and causes of such mortality; vii) conservation programs and scientific experiments carried out in relation to the ranching operation or the wild population concerned; and viii) an estimation of the percentage of the distribution area of the species where the ranching is operating
R3	How many facilities in your country are ranching specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported?

Source code “F”

Question code	Question
F1	For all exports of specimens of the selected species using source code “F”, please explain which element(s) of the definition of “bred in captivity” in Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> have not been met.
F2	Please confirm that non-detriment findings have been made for the export of all specimens of the species concerned with the source code “F” and the way in such findings have been made, particularly for species not native to your country.
F3	How many facilities in your country are producing specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported?
F4	Has the breeding stock received additional specimens from the wild since establishment and if so, how many and when and how was it determined that they were obtained in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?

Additional questions to be asked in specific circumstances:

Question code	Circumstance	Question
Q1	Shift in source codes	Please explain the changes over time in the quantities of different source codes used by your country for this species.
Q2	Mixed production systems	If different source codes apply to specimens in the same facility, please explain how it is ensured that the correct source codes can be attributed to each specimen upon export.

3. **Concerning agenda item 14.1 d):** determine a prioritised list of species for which a short review of the breeding biology, captive husbandry and any impacts, if relevant, of removal of founder stock from the wild should be requested.

The prioritization of these cases (the species selected for this process) was left in the hands of the AC Chair, in collaboration with the Secretariat and the IUCN specialist groups.

4. **Concerning agenda item 14.1 e):** identify any urgent enforcement matters which need to be referred to the Secretariat and the country concerned, and subsequent reporting to the Standing Committee as appropriate:

- a) Concerning Syria: There is concern about ongoing trade in captive-bred specimens of *Uromastix aegyptia* in spite of the lack of functioning CITES authorities in the country;
- b) Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia: The Animals Committee asks the Secretariat to remind the country to ensure that a source code is indicated for all specimens exported in conformity with Resolution Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP17);
- c) The Animals Committee noted that the export of *Python brongersmai*, *Python bivittatus* and *Python reticulatus* from the Lao People's Democratic Republic was a source of concern, but did not select these cases for review in view of the Article XIII procedure underway for this Party; and
- d) The Animals Committee was concerned that export of specimens of *Pandinus imperator* of ranched source continues from Togo in spite of the Standing Committee's recommendation to suspend trade in this species from that Party at its 63rd meeting.

5. **Concerning agenda item 14.1 f):** Provisional observations and recommendations regarding the first iteration of Resolution Conf. 17.7, including opportunities for harmonisation with the process in Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17) and other opportunities to achieve the aims of the Resolution most effectively and cost efficiently, for further consideration at AC30:

- a) The Animals Committee recommends to harmonise this process and the Review of Significant Trade (RST), especially the multiplication factors used for the IUCN Red List categories should be the same;
- b) The Animals Committee noted that there is not yet a process for cases where this process notes that there is not yet a non-detriment finding to be re-referred to the RST process. The Animals Committee could consider or clarify whether this is necessary or whether it would be appropriate or possible to make relevant recommendations relating to making of NDFs under the captive breeding and ranching process;
- c) The Animals Committee observed that trade in Appendix I species under source code 'C' for commercial purposes (code "T") may be an issue to be considered by the Standing Committee where it is not in compliance with the Convention;
- d) The Animals Committee recommends a mechanism to ensure that cases which are already subject to Standing Committee actions under compliance procedures such as Article XIII are excluded from this process; and

- e) The Animals Committee might consider reviewing the general questions contained in this report and to amend Resolution Conf. 17.7 with an annex.

6. **Concerning agenda item 14.2:**

Terms of reference for the intersessional working group or consultant

- a) Compare and contrast the nature of non-detriment findings (NDFs) for specimens originating from production systems that meet the definitions of source codes R and F, with NDFs for specimens originating from the wild (source code W) using case studies, existing guidance and input from Parties, as follows:
 - i) Case studies should be compiled representing a wide variety of life histories, life stages, and production systems from terrestrial and marine species. Examples could include: amphibians, reptiles, butterflies, corals, humphead wrasse, giant clam, queen conch, etc.;
 - ii) Consider existing guidance that may be applicable to NDFs for source codes R and F, including NDF guidance on tortoises and freshwater turtles that is contained in AC28 document 15.2, and NDF guidance for snakes contained in document AC29 Doc. 31.1, or any other existing guidance; and
 - iii) Solicit and consider input from Parties on NDFs for source codes R and F, including examples, guidance, or concerns/issues that have arisen in their country during the course of implementation of the Convention.
- b) Based on the review and analysis above, develop draft guidance on making NDFs for specimens from source codes R and F for consideration by the Animals Committee or the consultant through an intersessional working group.