CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Twenty-ninth meeting of the Animals Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 18-22 July 2017

Interpretation and implementation matters

General compliance and enforcement

REVIEW OF SIGNIFICANT TRADE [RESOLUTION CONF. 12.8 (REV. COP17)] (agenda item 13)

Membership (as decided by the Committee)

- Co-Chairs: the representatives of Europe (Mr. Fleming) and North America (Ms. Gnam);
- Parties: Argentina, Austria, Canada, China, Czech Republic, Estonia, European Union, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Italy, Japan, Malaysia, Mexico, Netherlands, Norway, Peru, Portugal, Saudi Arabia, South Africa, Spain, Switzerland, Thailand, Turkey, Uganda, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America, and Zimbabwe; and
- IGOs and NGOs: United Nations Environment Programme- World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN); Animal Welfare Institute, Association of Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Midwest Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Northeast Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Southeastern Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Western Fish and Wildlife Agencies, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Born Free Foundation, Born Free USA, Center for Biological Diversity, Conservation Force, Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), German Society of Herpetology (DGHT), Humane Society International, International Fund for Animal Welfare (IFAW), International Professional Hunter's Association (IPHA), Japan Wildlife Conservation Society, Lewis and Clark College -International Environmental Law Project, Natural Resources Defense Council, Ornamental Fish International, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa (PASA), Pet Industry Joint Advisory Council., ProWildlife, Safari Club International, Safari Club International Foundation, Sea Save Foundation, Society for Wildlife And Nature International (SWAN), Species Survival Network, Sustainable Users Network, The European Federation of Associations for Hunting & Conservation (FACE), TRAFFIC, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Animal Protection, World Association of Zoos and Aquariums (WAZA), World Wildlife Fund (WWF), Zoological Society of London, and Zoological Society of San Diego.

<u>Mandate</u>

Concerning agenda item 13.2:

For the 25 species/country combinations retained in the review after the 28th meeting of the Animals Committee:

In accordance with paragraph 1) g) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17):

- a) review the report in Annex 1 to document AC29 Doc. 13.2 and the responses received from range States contained in Annex 2 (and any additional information) and, if appropriate, revise the preliminary categorizations proposed by UNEP World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC) for the species/country combinations;
- b) recategorize species/country combinations of 'unknown status' as either 'action is needed' or 'less concern', and provide a justification for such recategorization;
- c) formulate time-bound, feasible, measurable, proportionate, and transparent recommendations directed to the range States retained in the review process, using the principles outlined in Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17) and the guidance on the formulation of recommendations contained in Annex 5 to document CoP17 Doc. 33; and
- d) identify and refer to the Secretariat problems that are not related to the implementation of Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a).

Concerning agenda item 13 3:

In accordance with paragraph 1 b) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17):

- a) review the information contained in the annexes to document AC29 Doc.13.3, as well as information available to the Animals Committee, the Secretariat, Parties or other relevant experts; and
- b) on the basis of that information, recommend a limited number of species/country combinations of greatest concern for inclusion in Stage 2 of the Review of Significant Trade.

Recommendations

Concerning <u>agenda item 13.2</u>, and in accordance with paragraph 1) g) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17), for the 25 species/country combinations retained in the review after the 28th meeting of the Animals Committee, the working group **recommends** the following.

That the following species-country combinations are categorised as 'action is needed'.	

Species	Country	Justification
Amazona festiva	Guyana	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Trioceros montium	Cameroon	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Varanus ornatus	Тодо	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Malayemys subtrijuga	Indonesia	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Notochelys platynota	Indonesia	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Chelonoidis denticulatus	Guyana	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Chelonoidis denticulatus	Suriname	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Testudo graeca	Jordan	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2

The working group proposes that the **recommendations** directed to range States in **Annex 1** to this report be adopted with respect to the species/country combinations identified above for which 'action is needed'.

The working group **recommends** that the following species/country combinations are categorised as '**less concern'**.

Species	Country	Justification
Uromastyx aegyptia	Jordan	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Uromastyx aegyptia	Syria	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Ophiophagus hannah	Indonesia	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2
Ophiophagus hannah	Malaysia	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2

Species	Country	Justification	
Malayemys subtrijuga	Lao PDR	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Malayemys macrocephala	Malaysia	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Centrochelys sulcata	Benin	Category changed from unknown to less concern based on trade being predominantly in sources R and C.	
Centrochelys sulcata	Ghana	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Centrochelys sulcata	Guinea	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Centrochelys sulcata	Mali	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Centrochelys sulcata	Sudan	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Centrochelys sulcata	Тодо	Category changed from unknown to less concern based on trade being predominantly in source code C.	
Testudo graeca	Syria	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Ornithoptera croesus	Indonesia	Category changed from unknown to less concern based on trade being predominantly in source code F.	
Ornithoptera rothschildi	Indonesia	Category changed from unknown to less concern based on trade being predominantly in source code F.	
Hirudo medicinalis	Turkey	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	
Hirudo verbana	Turkey	As outlined in Table 1 of Annex 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2	

The working group **recommends** that the following species/country combinations are referred to the working group under <u>agenda item 14.1</u> on Resolution Conf. 17.7 for their consideration on the basis that the trade is predominantly from source codes C, F and R.

Species	Country	
Uromastyx aegyptia	Syrian Arab Republic	
Centrochelys sulcata	Benin, Ghana, Guinea, Mali, Sudan, Togo	
Ornithoptera croesus	Indonesia	
Ornithoptera rothschildi	Indonesia	

Concerning <u>agenda item 13.3</u>, and in accordance with paragraph 1 b) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17), the working group <u>recommends</u> the following species/country combinations for inclusion in Stage 2 of the Review of Significant Trade.

Species	Country selected	Justification
Balearica pavonina	Mali	High volume (globally threatened)
Amazona farinosa	Guyana; Suriname	High volume (globally threatened)
Ara ararauna	Guyana; Suriname	High volume (globally threatened)
Ara chloropterus	Guyana; Suriname	High volume (globally threatened)
Poicephalus gulielmi	Mali; Democratic Republic of the Congo	High volume; Sharp increase (Mali)
Uromastyx geyri	Mali; Ghana; Benin; Togo	High volume; Sharp increase (Togo)
Brookesia minima	Madagascar	Endangered; Sharp increase (Madagascar)
Brookesia peyrierasi	Madagascar	Endangered; Sharp increase (Madagascar)
Cuora amboinensis	Indonesia	High volume
Anguilla anguilla	Morocco; Tunisia; Algeria	Endangered; Sharp increase (globally threatened); Sharp increase (Morocco; Tunisia)

The working group **recommends** that the following species/country combination is referred to the working group under <u>agenda item 14.1</u> on Resolution Conf. 17.7 for their consideration on the basis that the trade is suspected to be predominantly of captive-bred origin but no source code is reported.

Species	Country	
Testudo hermanni	The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	

Additional recommendations

The working group made the following additional recommendations and observations.

Centrochelys sulcata

The working group noted there was reported trade in specimens of wild origin of *Centrochelys sulcata*. This species is annotated in the Appendices to the effect that a zero annual export quota has been established for specimens removed from the wild and traded for primarily commercial purposes. The working group **recommends** that the Secretariat, when contacting the range States for these species to inform them of the outcome of this review, remind them of the provisions contained in the respective annotations.

Trioceros montium

The working group discussed trade in *Trioceros montium*, a Cameroonian endemic, as identified in table 3 of Annex 1 to document AC29 Doc. 13.2. The group noted wild-caught exports of this species from Equatorial Guinea which is not a range State. The working group recommends that this issue be referred to the Standing Committee.

Uromastyx aegyptia

The working group noted that illegal trade in *Uromastyx aegyptia* from Jordan was reported and recommends that the issue be referred to the Standing Committee.

The working group noted, as identified in Table 1 of AC29 Doc. 13.2 Annex 1, that re-exports by the United Arab Emirates of live, captive-bred specimens of *Uromastyx aegyptia* originating from Syria appeared to be substantially higher than reported imports to the country. The working group **recommends** that this issue be referred to the Secretariat.

RECOMMENDATIONS DIRECTED TO RANGE STATES RETAINED IN THE REVIEW PROCESS – AGENDA ITEM 13.2

The following recommendations, directed to the range States retained in the review process, are based on the principles outlined in Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP17) and the guidance on the formulation of recommendations contained in Annex 5 to document CoP17 Doc. 33.

1. *Amazona festiva* (Festive Parrot) / Guyana. The Management Authority of Guyana shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-fram	e for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 Short term action Establish an interim conservative export birds per year within and communicate th the Secretariat. 	days quota of 60 30 days e quota to	e established within 30	Insufficient details have been provided to demonstrate that the level of exports from their country are not detrimental to the survival of the species and are compliant with Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention.
 ii) No exports should on the quota has been p on the Secretariat's 	oublished		
iii) Before making any in the interim quota, the changes should be communicated by the Management Author Guyana to the Secre Chair of the Animals along with a justificat the change is conset based on estimates sustainable off-take use of best available information, for their	e planned e ity of tariat and Committee tion of how totive, of that make scientific		
 Long term action i) Undertake science-b studies, including fie on status of the spec population size/dens distribution) including evaluation of the three species for use as the NDFs 	Id studies, bies (e.g. ity, trends, g an eats to the	ears	Improving species knowledge available for making an NDF and address concerns as outlined in AC29 Doc. 13.2 Annex 1
 ii) Undertake qualitative of the scale and tren harvest (increasing, decreasing) for use i NDFs 	ds of all stable or		
Final recommendation Upon completion of othe recommendations, the Management Authority of should provide the scien by which it has establish exports from their count detrimental to the surviv	of Guyana htific basis hed that ry are not	ears	Improving species knowledge available for making an NDF and address concerns as outlined in AC29 Doc. 13.2

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
species and are compliant with Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention. Particular focus should be given to how the actions Guyana has taken or will take address the concerns/problems identified in the Review of Significant Trade process.		

2. *Trioceros montium* (Mountain Chameleon) / Cameroon. The Management Authority of Cameroon shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 <u>Short term action</u> i) Establish a zero export quota within 30 days for the species and communicate the quota to the Secretariat. ii) No exports should occur until the quota has been published on the Secretariat's website. iii) Before making any increases to this zero export quota, the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of Cameroon to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement. 	Quota to be established within 30 days	The basis for non-detriment findings for export of wild- sourced specimens for this endemic and range restricted species has not been provided. International trade appears to be impacting the species.

3. *Varanus ornatus* (Ornate Monitor) / Togo. The Management Authority of Togo shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

 in 90 No information on population size, status or trends available within Togo. The basis for non-detriment findings for export of wild-sourced and ranched specimens and the establishment of the high quotas for this species in Togo, for which conservation status is unknown, has not been provided.
siz wit Th fin an es for co

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 justified as conservative based on estimates of sustainable off- take that make use of best available scientific information. iv) Before making any increases to the interim quota (including increases from a zero export quota), the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of Togo to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off- take that make use of best 		recommended action
available scientific information, for their agreement.		

4. *Malayemys subtrijuga* (Mekong Snail-eating Turtle) / Indonesia. The Management Authority of Indonesia shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 <u>Short term action</u> Review and revise, within 90 days, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee, the export quota for the species and communicate the quota to the Secretariat. The revised quota should be conservative and include a restriction on trade to live individuals with a maximum straight carapace length (SCL) of 10 cm until the non-native status of the population in Indonesia is confirmed and the new management plan is established. No exports should occur until the quota has been published on the Secretariat's website. The export quota (which could include zero allowable exports) should be justified as conservative based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information. Before making any increases to the interim quota (including increases from a zero export quota), the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of 	Within 90 days	The species categorised globally as Vulnerable. The basis for non-detriment findings for export of wild- sourced specimens for this rare and apparently declining species in Indonesia does not appear to be robust. A size-selective harvest measure is recommended to ensure sustainability and avoid harvest of adults (adult males rarely exceed 13 cm carapace length, and most females reach no more than 18 cm straight carapace length).

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
Indonesia to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement.		
 Long term action Undertake science-based studies to determine the natural occurrence of the species in Indonesia (e.g. molecular-phylogenetic studies to determine whether the species is native or introduced in Indonesia) on the status of the species (e.g. population size/density, trends, distribution) including an evaluation of the threats to the species for use as the basis for NDFs Undertake qualitative monitoring of the scale and trends of all export (increasing, stable or decreasing) for use in making NDFs 	Within 2 years	Refer to AC29 Doc 13.2 Annex 1
<u>Final recommendation</u> Upon completion of the recommendations above, the Management Authority of Indonesia should provide the scientific basis by which it has established that exports from their country are not detrimental to the survival of the species and are compliant with Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention. Particular focus should be given to how the actions Indonesia has taken or will take address the concerns/problems identified in the Review of Significant Trade process.	Within 2 years	Refer to AC29 Doc.13.2 Annex 1

5. *Notochelys platynota* (Malayan Flat-shelled Turtle) / Indonesia. The Management Authority of Indonesia shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 Short term action Review and revise, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals 	Within 90 days	The basis for non-detriment findings for exports of wild- sourced specimens and the establishment of the export

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
Committee, the export quota for the species within 90 days and communicate the quota to the Secretariat. The revised quota should be conservative and include a restriction on trade to live individuals with a maximum straight carapace length (SCL) of 15 cm.		quota has not been provided, and the impact of on-going trade on this apparently declining species is unclear. (AC29 Doc.13.2 Annex 1)
 No exports should occur until the quota has been published on the Secretariat's website. 		
 iii) The export quota (which could include zero allowable exports) should be justified as conservative based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information and clearly demonstrate how the quota is managed considering the variability in status across the country. 		
 v) Before making any increases to the interim quota (including increases from a zero export quota), the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of Indonesia to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement. 		
 Long term action i) Undertake science-based studies on status of the species (e.g. population size/density, trends, distribution) including an evaluation of the threats to the species for use as the basis for NDFs. ii) Undertake qualitative monitoring of the scale and trends of all harvest (increasing, stable or 	Within 2 years	Refer to AC29 Doc.13.2 Annex 1
decreasing) for use in making NDFs		Refer to AC29 Doc.13.2 Annex 1
Final recommendation Upon completion of other recommendations, the Management Authority of Indonesia should provide the scientific basis by which it has established that exports from their country are not detrimental to the survival of the species and are compliant with	Within 2 years	

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention. Particular focus should be given to how the actions Indonesia has taken or will take address the concerns/problems identified in the Review of Significant Trade process.		

6. *Chelonoidis denticulatus* (Yellow-footed Tortoise) / Guyana and Suriname. The Management Authority of Guyana and Suriname shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 <u>Short term action</u> i) Review and revise, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee, the export quota for the species and communicate the quota to the Secretariat. The revised quota should be conservative and include a restriction on trade to live individuals with a maximum straight carapace length (SCL) of 10 cm. 	Quota to be established within 90 days	No justified basis for current quota. Limited details provided by range States relating to information that underpins the NDF, including population information. The restriction of international trade to specimens under 10 cm carapace length ensures that trade is limited to juveniles, and that the adult breeding stock is left in habitat and not exploited
 No exports should occur until the quota has been published on the Secretariat's website. 		for international trade.
iii) The export quota (which could include zero allowable exports) should be justified as conservative based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information and clearly demonstrate how the quota is managed considering the variability in status across the country.		
 iv) Before making any increases to the interim quota (including increases from a zero export quota), the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of the respective range State to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement. 		

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 Long term action i) Undertake science-based studies on status of the species (e.g. population size/density, trends, distribution) including an evaluation of the threats to the species for use as the basis for NDFs ii) Undertake qualitative monitoring of the scale and trends of all harvest (increasing, stable or decreasing) for use in making NDFs 	Within 2 years	Improving species knowledge available for making an NDF and address concerns as outlined in AC29 Doc. 13.2 Annex 1
<u>Final recommendation</u> Upon completion of other recommendations, the range State should provide the scientific basis by which it has established that exports from their country are not detrimental to the survival of the species and are compliant with Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention. Particular focus should be given to how the actions the range State has taken or will take address the concerns/problems identified in the Review of Significant Trade process.	Within 2 years	Improving species knowledge available for making an NDF and address concerns as outlined in AC29 Doc. 13.2 Annex 1

8. *Testudo graeca* (Spur-thighed Tortoise) / Jordan. The Management Authority of Jordan shall report to the Secretariat on the implementation of the following:

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 Short term action i) Either establish a zero quota for wild taken specimens, or, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee, establish an interim conservative export quota for wild sourced specimens for the species and communicate the quota to the Secretariat. The revised quota should be conservative and include a restriction on trade to live individuals with a maximum straight carapace length (SCL) of 10 cm. 	Within 90 days	The basis for a non-detriment finding for trade in this declining species does not appear to be robust, and collection for trade appears to be having an impact on this species. The restriction of international trade to specimens under 10 cm straight carapace length ensures that trade is limited to juveniles, and that the adult breeding stock is left in habitat and not exploited for international trade. Refer to AC29 Doc 13.2 Annex 1
 No exports of wild-sourced specimens should occur until the quota has been published on the Secretariat's website. 		

Recommended Action	Time-frame for implementation	Justification for choice of recommended action
 The export quota for wild- sourced specimens should be justified as conservative based on estimates of sustainable off- take that make use of best available scientific information. 		
 iv) Before making any increases to this interim quota for wild- sourced specimens (including increases from a zero export quota), the planned changes should be communicated by the Management Authority of Jordan to the Secretariat and Chair of the Animals Committee along with a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable off-take that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement 		
 Long term actions i) Implement/ improve a system to ensure individuals in trade originating from captive / ranched production systems are distinguished from wild-sourced specimens if both wild specimens and non-wild specimens are in trade 	Within 2 years	Refer to AC29 Doc 13.2 Annex 1
Final recommendation Upon completion of other recommendations, the Management Authority of Jordan should provide the scientific basis by which it has established that exports from their country are not detrimental to the survival of the species and are compliant with Article IV, paragraphs 2(a), 3 and 6(a) of the Convention. Particular focus should be given to how the actions Jordan has taken or will take address the concerns/problems identified in the Review of Significant Trade process.	Within 2 years	Improving species knowledge available for making an NDF and address concerns as outlined in AC29 Doc. 13.2 Annex 1