Original language: English SC78 Doc. 82

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Seventy-eighth meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 3-8 February 2025

Appendices of the Convention

Nomenclature matters

NOMENCLATURE OF APPENDIX-III LISTINGS

- 1. This document has been submitted by the specialist on botanical nomenclature of the Plants Committee and the specialist on zoological nomenclature of the Animals Committee.*
- 2. At its 19th meeting (CoP19; Panama City, 2022), the Conference of the Parties revised Decisions 18.313 and 18.314 on *Nomenclature of Appendix-III listings* as follows:

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

18.313 (Rev. CoP19) The Animals and Plants Committees shall, taking into consideration the current guidance in Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature, paragraph 2 g), evaluate how nomenclature changes affect Appendix-III listings and propose further guidance and recommendations as necessary, that address how such nomenclature changes are to be handled, for consideration by the Standing Committee.

Directed to the Standing Committee, in consultation with the Secretariat

18.314 (Rev. CoP19) The Standing Committee, in consultation with the Secretariat, shall take into account the guidance and recommendations from the Animals and Plants Committees and make recommendations to address nomenclature changes that affect an Appendix-III listing, including possible amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) or Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on Inclusion of species in Appendix III, for consideration at the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties

- 3. The particular complications created by progress in taxonomic science to the nomenclature of species listed in Appendix III have been discussed by the Animals and Plants Committee at several meetings (see documents AC31 Doc. 39/PC25 Doc. 33; PC26 Doc. 42.1/AC32 Doc. 45.1 and PC27 Doc. 40.1/AC33 Doc. 47.1).
- 4. Nomenclature changes may affect Appendix-III species, but it is unclear in Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III and Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature how these nomenclatural changes should be dealt with. In the case of Appendix I or Appendix II, the process of how to deal with a nomenclatural change (such as a split-off of a new species, a synonymization, or a genus transfer) is clear: the split-out species remains in the Appendix of the 'parent' species, listed under its new name; genus transfers do not affect the listing of the

.

The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.

specific species, but may lead to changes in how higher taxa are listed in the Appendices (see document SC78 Doc. 83).

- 5. In contrast, there is no established mechanism to determine whether a split-out 'new' species (a 'daughter' species) remains listed in Appendix III if it occurs in a country that is different from the Party who included its 'parent' species in Appendix III. If a widespread species included in Appendix III is divided into two or more 'new' species by progressive taxonomic understanding (and adoption of updated nomenclature references in CITES), and some of these 'new' species do not occur in the country that placed the 'original' species in Appendix III, the question arises whether these 'new', 'non-native' split-off species would remain covered by the original Appendix-III listing. If the existing practice for Appendix I and II species were applied to Appendix III species, and all 'daughter species' of an Appendix-III species would remain included in Appendix III, it leads to the question of how a daughter species can be removed from Appendix III in cases where it is not native to the Party that originally listed it in Appendix III. Conversely, if 'new' split-off species that do not occur within the Party listing the original species in Appendix III were automatically excluded from Appendix III, this creates the risk or opportunity for taxonomy to be influenced by trade considerations: "split the species taxonomically and you no longer have to be concerned about CITES Appendix-III export permit/certificate requirements".
- 6. A joint intersessional working group of the Plants and Animals Committees was established at the 26th meeting of the Plants Committee (PC26; Geneva, June 2023) and the 32nd meeting of the Animals Committee (AC32; Geneva, June 2023) with the mandate and membership as contained in the summary record of the meetings (PC26 SR and AC32 SR).
- 7. The specialist on botanical nomenclature of the Plants Committee and the specialist on zoological nomenclature of the Animals Committee reported on the discussions of the working group to the joint session of the 27th meeting of the Plants Committee and the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee in document PC27 Doc. 40.1/AC33 Doc. 47.1.
- 8. The working group noted that the inclusion and withdrawal of species in CITES Appendix III follow a specific process, as laid out in Article XVI and Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III*. The inclusion and deletion of Appendix-III listings is therefore a decision by an individual Party, and a substantive or non-substantive amendment to an Appendix III listing, such as a nomenclatural change, is also the prerogative of the Party that originally listed the species in Appendix III.
- 9. Trade in Appendix III-listed species is regulated under Article V and has different implications for the Party that has included the species (export permit) than the other range state Parties that have not listed the species in Appendix III (certificate of origin), and for non-range state Parties (re-export certificate, if applicable), alongside the applicable import checks. This is a clear contrast to species included in Appendices I and II, which are decided by the Conference of the Parties following a proposal by one or more Parties, and whose trade provisions apply equally to proponent and non-proponent Parties (including range States and non-range States). Therefore, there are clearly different criteria and procedures for amendment of Appendices I and II on the one hand, and of Appendix III on the other hand.
- 10. The preamble of Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature* notes that nomenclature changes should be adopted by the Conference of the Parties to the Convention. Paragraph 3 of the Resolution does not explicitly differentiate between a procedure for updating nomenclature in Appendices I and II versus in Appendix III. The practice has been that the nomenclature specialists of the Plants and Animals Committees submit recommendations to the Conference of the Parties for non-substantive amendments to the Appendices to reflect updated nomenclature. It should be noted that paragraph 2, subparagraph g), of Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*, instructs the nomenclature specialists to inform the Secretariat if proposed changes to standard nomenclature affecting species listed in Appendix III would also result in changes in distribution, and would therefore affect the determination of which countries would be required to issue certificates of origin.
- 11. Parties agreed that there exist fundamental differences between the procedures to include, exclude, and by extension amend, a taxon listed in Appendix I or II, and a taxon listed in Appendix III, as well as fundamental differences in the implementation of these listings. Recalling paragraph 11 of document AC26 Doc. 42.1 / AC32 Doc. 45.1, a nomenclatural change to a species included in Appendix III, if implemented analogous to the process used for Appendices I and II (i.e., a nomenclatural split leads to the split-out 'daughter' species to be included in the same Appendix as the 'parent' species), could potentially create listings of species that are not native to the Party that originally proposed inclusion of the 'parent species' in Appendix III. This could create an untenable situation where a species could end up listed in Appendix III, but with no range state

Party able to withdraw or further amend such a listing. Therefore, the accepted procedure for nomenclatural amendments of listings in Appendices I and II cannot be applied to Appendix III.

- 12. The submissions by working group members considered by PC27/AC33 proposed that the standard nomenclature review process already carried out for Appendices I and II integrate the species listed in Appendix III to avoid a parallel review process, while acknowledging that nomenclature amendment of Appendix-III listings has to follow a different approach, because the inclusion and deletion of a species in Appendix III is decided by the individual Party that has included the species in Appendix III. It was therefore proposed to include a specific procedure for any nomenclatural amendments to species listed in Appendix III in Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III* and/or Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*.
- 13. The joint session of PC27/AC33 agreed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III contained in Annex 1 to the present document and Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature contained in Annex 2 to the present document (see summary records PC26 SR and AC32 SR). The joint session of PC27/AC33 furthermore agreed that Decision 18.313 (Rev. CoP19) has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the Conference of the Parties.

Recommendations:

- 14. The Standing Committee is invited to:
 - a) review this document and the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III* in Annex 1 and Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature* in Annex 2 agreed by the joint session of the Plants and Animals Committees;
 - b) agree to submit the proposed amendments contained in Annex 1 and 2 to the present document to be considered at the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and
 - c) agree that Decisions 18.313 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.314 (Rev. CoP19) have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the Conference of the Parties.

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO RESOLUTION CONF. 9.25 (REV. COP18) ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CONVENTION FOR SPECIES IN APPENDIX III

The Plants and Animals Committees agreed the following amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18):

Text proposed to be deleted is crossed out and proposed new text is underlined.

- 1. RECOMMENDS that, when considering the inclusion of a species in Appendix III, a Party:
 - a) ensure that:
 - i) the species is native to its country;
 - ii) if the species concerned is included in one of the standard lists of names or taxonomic references adopted by the Conference of the Parties, the name provided by that reference be used; if the species concerned is not included in one of the adopted standard references, the Party provide references as to the source of the name used as indicated in sub-paragraph e) below, and in cases where there is any doubt regarding the nomenclature to follow, consult the nomenclature specialist of the Animals Committee or the Plants Committee, as appropriate;
 - iiii) its national <u>laws and regulations</u> for the conservation of the species are adequate to prevent or restrict exploitation and to control trade, and include penalties for illegal taking, trade or possession and provisions for confiscation; and
 - iiiv) its national enforcement measures are adequate to implement these regulations;

[...]

c) inform the Management Authorities of other range States, the known major importing countries, the Secretariat and the Animals Committee or the Plants Committee that it is considering the inclusion of the species in Appendix III, provide the Nomenclature Specialist of the Animals or Plants Committee with the reference as to the source of the name used to describe the species being proposed, and seek their opinion on the potential effects of such inclusion;

[...]

- e) after due consultation, and having satisfied itself that the biological and trade status of the species justify the action, submit to the Secretariat its considerations under paragraph 1 a) to d) above, specifying the following, in accordance with paragraph 1 of Article XVI of the Convention:
 - i) the scientific name of the species it is submitting for inclusion in Appendix III:
 - A. <u>if the species concerned is included in one of the standard lists of names or taxonomic references adopted by the Conference of the Parties, the reference citation and the name provided by that reference should be submitted;</u>
 - B. if the species concerned is not included in one of the adopted standard references, the Party(ies) should provide reference(s) as to the source of the name used; and
 - C. if there are nomenclature uncertainties concerning the species, Party(ies) should consult the nomenclature specialist of the Animals Committee or the Plants Committee, as appropriate; and
 - ii) any readily recognizable parts and derivatives to be included, unless it intends to include all readily recognizable parts and derivatives

.

- 6. URGES Parties having included species in Appendix III to:
 - a) review periodically the status of these species, seek assistance of the Animals or Plants Committee in undertaking the review mentioned in paragraph 5 of this Resolution, if necessary, and taking into account these guidelines and any recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees, to consider the necessity to maintain the species in Appendix III;
 - b) inform the Secretariat and the Animals and Plants Committees about any taxonomic or nomenclatural changes affecting species included in Appendix III to determine whether these changes would also result in changes in distribution that would affect the determination of which countries would be required to issue certificates of origin, and proceed to amend the Appendix-III listing, if needed; and
 - c) respond in a timely manner to requests from the Secretariat on proposed nomenclature changes for Appendix-III listed species recommended by the Animals or Plants Committee through its process for updating current standard nomenclatural references in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature to inform amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) and proceed to amend the Appendix-III listing, if needed.

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO RESOLUTION CONF. 12.11 (REV. COP19) ON STANDARD NOMENCLATURE:

The Plants and Animals Committees <u>agreed</u> the following amendments to Resolution Conf.12.11 (Rev. CoP19) [Note the Secretariat made an editorial amendment in paragraph g) to replace '(see definition in paragraph 2.h)', with ', as defined in subparagraph h) below']:

Text proposed to be deleted is crossed out and proposed new text is underlined.

2. RECOMMENDS that:

.

- f) whenever a change in the name of a taxon included in the Appendices is proposed, the Secretariat, in consultation with the Animals or Plants Committee, determine whether this change would alter the scope of protection for fauna or flora under the Convention. In the case where the scope of a taxon is redefined, the Animals or Plants Committee shall evaluate whether acceptance of the taxonomic change would cause additional species to be included in the Appendices or listed species to be deleted from the Appendices and, if that is the case, a range state Party or the Depositary Government should be requested to submit a proposal to amend the Appendices in accordance with the recommendation of the Animals or Plants Committee, so that the original intent of the listing is retained. Such proposals should be submitted for consideration at the next regular meeting of the Conference of the Parties, at which the recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees will be considered:
- g) if the Animals or Plants Committee become informed of taxonomic or proposes nomenclatural changes in a published taxonomic authority, as defined in subparagraph h) below relating to taxa included in Appendix III, they should advise the Secretariat of such proposed changes and whether they these changes would also result in changes in species distribution that would affect the issuance of determination of which countries would be required to issue certificates of origin by range States. To ensure the Party (or Parties) that included the species in Appendix III are aware of the potential changes and their potential impacts on implementation, the Secretariat will inform the Party (or Parties) of the nomenclature changes and any resulting changes in distribution that potentially alter the scope of protection for fauna and flora (inclusion or deletion of species or populations) included in Appendix III and in consultation with the nomenclature specialist(s) as appropriate, encourage the Party (or Parties) to revise the nomenclature of their Appendix-III listing in accordance with the procedure described in Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III.

.

8. AGREES that the adoption of a standard checklist or reference by the Conference of the Parties does not by itself change the status vis-à-vis CITES of any entity, whether it is listed in the Appendices or not, and the status of the entity remains as intended in the proposal adopted by the Conference unless specifically changed by the adoption of a further amendment proposal; any Party that identifies a change in the status vis-à-vis CITES of any entity as a result of the adoption of a new standard reference should consult the Secretariat and nomenclature specialist as soon as possible.