Original language: English SC78 Doc. 53

# CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

CIE

Seventy-seventh meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 3-8 February 2025

# Regulation of trade

### STOCKS AND STOCKPILES

- This document has been prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with the Chair of the Standing Committee.
- 2. At its 19th meeting (CoP19; Panama City, 2022), the Conference of the Parties adopted a revision of its CoP17 Decision on *Stocks and stockpiles* as follows:

#### Directed to the Standing Committee, with the assistance of the Secretariat

17.170 (Rev. CoP19) The Standing Committee shall, with the assistance of the Secretariat, review the existing provisions agreed by the Parties concerning controls on stocks of specimens of CITES-listed species. It shall consider their objectives and implementation, the resource implications for Parties and the Secretariat, and the work conducted during the previous intersessional periods, and shall report its conclusions and recommendations at the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### Previous intersessional work

- 3. At its 77th meeting, the Secretariat had prepared in consultation with the Chair of the Standing Committee document SC77 Doc. 50. However, due to lack of time, the Standing Committee did not have time to consider the document. The following paragraphs (4-11) on the work conducted during previous sessions are therefore repeated from this document for the sake of ease of reference for the Members of the Standing Committee in its implementation of the Decision.
- 4. To assist the Standing Committee in considering work conducted during previous intersessional periods, the Secretariat is providing a very short summary below. Based on document <u>CoP17 Doc. 47</u>, the Conference of the Parties adopted a Decision at its 17th meeting directing the Standing Committee, with the support of the Secretariat, to review existing provisions agreed by the Parties concerning controls on stocks of specimens of CITES-listed species and report its conclusions and recommendations to its 18th meeting. To implement this Decision, at its 69th meeting (Geneva, November 2017), the Standing Committee established an intersessional working group on stocks and stockpiles with the following terms of reference:

With the assistance of the Secretariat, the working group will pursue the following objectives:

- a) review the existing provisions agreed by the Parties concerning controls on stocks of specimens of CITES listed species provided in Annex 2 of document SC69 Doc. 43;
- b) identify CITES conservation and enforcement objectives in the management of both government and privately held stocks and stockpiles of specimens;
- c) suggest definitions of "stock" and "stockpile";

- d) consult with Parties affected by the measures in Annex 2 of document SC69 Doc. 43, through a Notification to them, to request information concerning the resources they use to implement these Resolutions and Decisions including any significant challenges they face in maintaining these stockpiles and using this information consider resource implications for Parties and the Secretariat;
- e) consult with Parties, INTERPOL, World Customs Organization, UN Office on Drugs and Crime, World Trade Organization, museums, appropriate representatives of private industry and any other technical experts to identify best practices for robust stockpile management systems, identification of specimens (age and origin), inventory, corruption prevention, and disposal / destruction, with particular sensitivity to cost effectiveness required by developing countries;
- f) explore the legal implications of a Party selling confiscated specimens;
- g) consider different approaches to managing stockpiles of legally acquired specimens, and stockpiles of confiscated specimens, as well as the different treatment of stockpiles containing species listed in Appendices I, II and III; and
- on the basis of the discussions at the 69th meeting of the Standing Committee and the results of paragraphs a) to g) above, report conclusions and recommendations to the 70th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- 5. The intersessional working group, chaired by Israel, reported to the 70th meeting of the Standing Committee in document SC70 Doc. 41 on the discussions and broad conclusions in relation to each aspect of the terms of reference. In its report, the working group noted that "Despite these broad conclusions, there is significant division within the working group, particularly regarding specifics of any recommendations based upon these conclusions. As a consequence, we request the Standing Committee to propose the following Decision to CoP18, requesting extension of the working group's mandate until CoP19".
- 6. Based on this request, the Standing Committed submitted a recommendation to the 18th meeting for the continuation of the work (see document <a href="CoP18 Doc. 51">CoP18 Doc. 51</a>). At CoP18 (Geneva, 2019), the Conference of the Parties adopted a revised Decision 17.170 (Rev. CoP18) with wording similar to the one adopted by CoP17. To assist the Committee in its deliberations, the Secretariat prepared an overview of Resolutions and Decisions concerning stocks of specimens of CITES-listed species, contained in document <a href="SC73 Doc. 21">SC73 Doc. 21</a>. The Secretariat also summarized the previous discussions and suggested that the Standing Committee reestablish an intersessional working group to further the implementation of the Decision. Following this suggestion, at its 73rd meeting (online, May 2021), the Standing Committee re-established the intersessional working group with the following terms of reference:
  - a) review the existing provisions agreed by Parties concerning controls on stocks of specimens of CITES-listed species provided in paragraph 7 of document SC73 Doc. 21;
  - b) identify CITES conservation and enforcement objectives in the management of stocks and stockpiles of specimens;
  - c) suggest definitions of "stock" and "stockpile"; and
  - d) report to the Standing Committee at its 74th meeting.
- 7. The working group, chaired by Canada, reported on its discussions to the 74th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC74; Lyon, March 2022) in document <u>SC74 Doc. 60</u>. In its report, the working group presented its perspectives on existing challenges to implementation of CITES provisions on stocks and stockpiles; on the fundamental objectives of conservation and enforcement that should direct the management of stocks and stockpiles; and on the need for, and possible definition of, the terms "stock" and "stockpile".
- 8. In reviewing the existing provisions, the working group had identified the financial cost of maintaining the security and integrity of stockpiles as a major challenge, with existing provisions appearing to encourage retention and management of stocks and stockpiles rather than their destruction.
- 9. With respect to paragraph b) of the mandate, the working group highlighted that a fundamental objective of the provisions related to stocks and stockpiles was to ensure that existing stocks and stockpiles were secured and managed in such a way that specimens would not enter illegal trade. It was also noted that greater emphasis on the provision and use of guidance for the implementation of controls on stocks and

stockpiles would be beneficial. On part c) of the mandate related to the definitions of stocks and stockpiles, the working group had not been able to reach any agreed conclusions.

- 10. Overall, the working group had not been able to fully complete the tasks directed to it in the terms of reference and recommended that the Standing Committee request the Secretariat to revise Decision 17.170 (Rev. CoP18) and propose its adoption at CoP19.
- 11. The Committee noted the report and agreed to seek the continuation of the mandate by the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting (see summary record <a href="SC74">SC74</a> SR). At CoP19, the Chair of the Standing Committee reported on the work undertaken by the Committee in document <a href="CoP19">CoP19</a> Doc. 9.1.1 and the Conference adopted the proposed revised Decision as set out above.

# Existing provisions concerning controls on stocks/stockpiles of specimens of CITES-listed species

12. To help the Standing Committee have an overview of current species-specific Resolutions and Decisions of the Conference of the Parties that include provisions related to stocks/stockpiles (in taxonomic order), the subparagraphs below summarize all such provisions. Where possible, reference is made to relevant documents that report on the implementation of these provisions and, where relevant the text has been updated with additional information since SC77.

#### a) Tibetan antelope (Pantholops hodgsonii)

In Resolution Conf. 11.8 (Rev. CoP17) on *Conservation of and control of trade in the Tibetan antelope*, the Conference of the Parties recommends that all Parties and non-Parties in whose territory stocks of Tibetan antelope parts and raw materials exist adopt a registration system and national measures to prevent such stocks from re-entering into trade.

<u>Implementation</u>: The Secretariat reported on the national measures taken by Parties to prevent stockpiles of Tibetan antelope parts and raw materials from entering into trade in document SC74 Doc. 76 on the implementation of Resolution Conf. 11.8 (Rev. CoP17). The document encourages Parties to note the trend that Shahtoosh shawls seized in some Parties' territories may comprise a blend of Tibetan antelope fibres and fibres from other species. An updated report was provided to the 77th meeting in document SC77 Doc. 44. None of the mentioned documents refer explicitly to the adoption of registration systems or the implementation of national measures to prevent Tibetan antelope parts contained in stockpiles from re-entering into trade. Nonetheless, they provide an overview of seizure records and ongoing efforts to tackle illegal trade.

# b) Saiga antelope (Saiga spp.)

In Decision 19.213, saiga range States are encouraged to establish internal market controls for saiga parts, including registration of stockpiles, labelling of parts and products, and registration of manufacturers and traders, and report such information to the Secretariat. Decision 19.214 directs the Secretariat to consult saiga range States and major trading and consumer States concerning their management of stockpiles of saiga specimens; review processes and practices; and provide assistance in ensuring effective stockpile management and monitoring, including the development of inventories and strengthening stockpile security; and report to the Animals Committee and Standing Committee on this matter, as appropriate.

Implementation: Document SC77 Doc. 65, paragraphs 3 to 5, provides a synthesis of efforts to implement Decision 19.213. In response to a letter of the Secretariat, sent in July 2023, two Saiga range States (Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan) stated that a prohibition on the use and trade of saiga and its derivates was in place (except for scientific purposes in one of the Parties). For that reason, no regulations on the internal markets or registration systems for manufacturers and traders were reported to be in place. One of the range States affirmed having developed a mechanism for marking saiga horn and requested the assistance of the Secretariat on stockpile management and monitoring. Among the major consumer and trading countries of saiga parts and derivatives that responded (Malaysia, Japan, Ukraine, Viet Nam), one Party specified that the management of stockpiles, including confiscated saiga antelope specimens, was entrusted to provincial-level authorities. Another Party stressed that, in a part of its national territory, the international and domestic trade of *S. tatarica* may only be conducted by licensed dealers, who are required to record details of the trade and available stockpiles. Finally, one Party informed the Secretariat about its only known stockpile of saiga specimens consisting of 270 skulls of saiga.

#### c) Vicuña (Vicugna vicugna)

Resolution Conf. 18.8 on *Conservation of vicuña* (Vicugna vicugna) and trade in its fibre and products urges all Parties trading in vicuña fibre to identify and record existing volumes of vicuña fibre in order to ensure appropriate traceability and control of the fibre and prevent illegal specimens to enter legal markets.

<u>Implementation:</u> At present, the Secretariat has no information regarding the implementation of this provision by Parties trading in vicuña fibre.

#### d) Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)

In Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19) on *Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Appendix-I Asian big cat species*, Parties and non-Parties on whose territories stocks of parts and derivatives of tiger and other Asian big cat species (such as tiger bone stocks) exist, but not including pre-Convention specimens, are urged to consolidate and ensure adequate control of such stocks, and where possible destroy them, with the exception of those used for educational and scientific purposes.

Implementation: Document SC77 Doc. 41.2 summarizes the responses received by the Secretariat to Notification No. 2023/091, in which Parties were invited to submit information on the implementation of Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19). From the seven responding Parties, only two affirmed possessing stockpiles of tiger carcasses or their parts and derivates in facilities hosting Asian big cats in captivity. Of these Parties, one Party informed about the existence of seven functional facilities hosting Asian big cats, of which six are reported to host stockpiles of tiger carcasses or parts and derivatives. The Party stressed that, in four of the facilities, when specimens die, these are incinerated. In two other facilities, the dead tigers are reported to be kept in frozen condition and disposed of or handed over to a museum. In one facility, the procedure consisted of directly transporting the specimen to the Museum of Nature. The other Party possessing stockpiles of the aforementioned specimens and their parts and derivates notified that out of the 12 operational facilities where Asian big cats are held (one of which is under maintenance), seven contain tiger carcasses or parts and derivatives. All of these seven facilities hold either carcasses, taxidermized carcasses, skeletons, bones, skulls, skins, tanned leather, or claws; all of which are reported to be registered and legally acquired.

### e) Rhinoceroses (Rhinocerotidae spp.)

In Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP19) on *Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses*, the Conference of the Parties urges all Parties that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat. The Secretariat has developed a <u>template</u> for the submission of such information. The Resolution directs the Secretariat, prior to each meeting of the Conference of the Parties, and subject to external funding, to commission the African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups of the Species Survival Commission of the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN/SSC) and TRAFFIC to prepare and submit a report to it, including on stocks of specimens of rhinoceros and stock management. The Secretariat is to make an aggregated summary of the rhinoceros horn stock declarations of Parties available to the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and to TRAFFIC for its analysis and inclusion in its report. The Secretariat is then to make the report available to the Conference of the Parties and, on the basis of it, formulate draft decisions for consideration by the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.

Implementation: Document CoP19 Doc. 75 (Rev. 1) summarizes, among other findings, results of the commissioned report on stockpile management of rhinoceros specimens. On average 20 Parties reported stockpile information to the Secretariat for each of the years 2018, 2019, and 2020. Notably, seven out of 13 African range States reported stockpile data, amounting to a total of 87.3 tonnes of rhino horns and pieces, with a significant proportion held in private stocks. Although only one Party among the Asian range States shared stockpile information, the report found that the vast majority of horns entering illegal trade between 2018 and 2020 originated from poached rhinoceroses, rather than from other sources such as theft from stockpiles. Furthermore, non-range States reported a total of two tonnes of rhino horns and pieces. Due to a discrepancy between the expected stockpiled weight and the reported data, the report calls for better monitoring and reporting by the Parties.

# f) Pangolins (Manis spp.)

Resolution 17.10 (Rev. CoP19) on *Conservation of and trade in pangolins* encourages Parties on whose territories stocks of parts and derivatives of pangolins exist to take urgent steps to establish and apply, where not yet done, strict control measures to secure and monitor these stocks, and inform the Secretariat of the level of stocks each year, indicating the type and number of specimens, the species, the source of the specimens, management measures, and the reasons for any significant changes in the stockpile compared to the preceding year. Decision 19.202 encourages Parties in whose territories stocks of parts and derivatives of pangolins exist to take urgent steps to establish and apply, where not yet done, strict control measures to secure these stocks, as called for in paragraph 3 of Resolution Conf. 17.10 (Rev. CoP19) on *Conservation of and trade in pangolins* and report on the implementation of this Decision to the Secretariat. The Secretariat is directed to report on the implementation of Decision 19.202 to the Standing Committee, together with any recommendations it may have.

<u>Implementation:</u> The Secretariat notes that the provisions in Resolution Conf. 17.10 (Rev. CoP19) mentioned above are recent as they were only adopted when the Resolution was revised at CoP19. Notification to the Parties No. 2024/096 was issued in September 2024. The report of the Secretariat on the implementation is contained in document SC78 Doc. 67.2 in accordance with Decision 19.203, paragraph f).

### g) Elephants (Elephantidae spp.)

- i) In Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP19) on *Trade in elephant specimens*, the Conference of the Parties urges Parties to introduce recording and inspection procedures to enable monitoring of the movement of ivory within the State, particularly by means of compulsory trade controls over raw ivory and comprehensive and demonstrably effective stock inventory, reporting, and enforcement systems for worked ivory.
- ii) Specifically, paragraph 7 e) of the Resolution urges Parties to maintain an inventory of government-held stockpiles of ivory and, where possible, of significant privately held stockpiles of ivory within their territory, and to inform the Secretariat of the level of this stock each year before 28 February, indicating: the number of pieces and their weight per type of ivory (raw or worked); for relevant pieces, and if marked, their markings in accordance with the provisions of this Resolution; the source of the ivory; and the reasons for any significant changes in the stockpile compared to the preceding year. The Secretariat has developed a template for the submission of such information. Under Decision 18.184 (Rev. CoP19), the Secretariat is to annually publish updated summary data based on the inventories submitted by Parties, disaggregated to regional but not country level, including the total ivory stockpiles by weight. The 2023 summary data as reported by 28 February 2024 is currently available on the CITES website.
- iii) Under Decision 19.157, the Secretariat is directed to compile feedback from Parties on available management tools, and new techniques and technologies related to any of the elements mentioned or referred to in the "Practical guidance on ivory stockpile management" and to submit to the Standing Committee recommendations relating to the incorporation of new information in the guidance documents or any of the documents referred to in the guidance documents.
- iv) Decisions 18.184 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.185 (Rev. CoP19) direct the Standing Committee to consider reports and recommendations from the Secretariat on Parties that have not provided information on the level of government held stockpiles of ivory and significant privately held stockpiles of ivory within their territory or where stockpiles are not well secured and determine whether any further actions are necessary.

Implementation: The Secretariat summarized in document SC77 Doc. 51 the submissions by Parties concerning their ivory stockpile volumes until February 2023. For the reports submitted by 28 February 2024, a notable increase in the number of Parties submitting data is observed, with 29 Parties submitting stockpile data in 2024, compared with 22 in 2023. Nonetheless, many Parties still do not declare their government ivory stockpiles in a timely manner, despite signs that stockpiles exist in some of these Parties' territories. Regarding the reporting of privately held stockpiles of ivory, only a few Parties declared these to the Secretariat. The Secretariat has launched several initiatives to support the stockpile management and reporting activities of Parties, for example, through awareness-raising sessions initiated by the MIKE programme targeting elephant range States. Despite several Parties not having declared ivory stockpiles, some have developed National Ivory Action Plans (NIAPs) which also contain measures related to ivory stockpiles. Additionally, in line with Decision 19.157, the Secretariat

issued Notification No. 2024/044 inviting Parties to submit information about available management tools, and new techniques and technologies related to any of the elements referred to in the "Practical guidance on ivory stockpile management". Submissions were received from six Parties and two observer organizations. A summary of the responses to the Notification is contained in document SC78 Doc. 54 for consideration at the present meeting.

# h) Pythons (Boidae spp.)

Resolution Conf. 17.12 on *Conservation, sustainable use of and trade in snakes* encourages range and consumer State Parties to test and consider the introduction of innovative traceability methods for snake skins. It recommends that, prior to the implementation of a traceability system for python skins, Parties inventory and tag those skins and provide this information to the Secretariat as a baseline. Inventories of the initial stockpiles should contain information on the species concerned, the stage of processing of the skins (crust, dried, etc.) and the corresponding quantities and tag numbers, and also the year of harvest for skins newly entering the stockpiles. The tagging method used should distinguish between skins of the initial stockpiles and skins harvested at later points in time.

<u>Implementation:</u> At this point in time, the Secretariat has no information as to whether Parties have implemented tagging methods that distinguishes between skins of the initial stockpiles and skins harvested at later points in time.

### i) Sharks and rays (Elasmobranchii spp.)

i) In accordance with their national legislation, Parties are encouraged in Decision 19.222 to provide a brief report to the Secretariat about the assessment of stockpiles of shark parts and derivatives for CITES-listed species stored and obtained before the entry into force of their inclusion in the Convention in order to control and monitor their trade, if applicable. The Secretariat was also instructed to issue a Notification to the Parties inviting them to provide a summary of activities concerning the recording of stockpiles of commercial and/or pre-Convention shark parts and derivatives for CITES Appendix-II elasmobranch species and controlling the entry of these stocks into trade.

Implementation: The Secretariat issued Notification to the Parties N° 2023/027 on 16 March 2023 requesting this information. Responses were received from Bangladesh, Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, Croatia, El Salvador, European Union, Guatemala, Honduras, Indonesia, Italy, Japan, Maldives, Mexico, Mozambique, Nicaragua, Panama, Peru, Republic of Korea, Slovakia, Spain, Sweden, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and United States of America and can be found in Annex 2 to document AC32 Doc. 37. Six of the responding Parties explicitly reported on their activities concerning the recording of stockpiles of commercial and/or pre-Convention parts and derivatives. Three Parties stressed that there are no records of such stockpiles. One considered that the trade with fish caught pre-Convention requires the issuance of a Non-Detriment Finding (NDF) and thus the recording of such stockpiles is not applicable. Another Party outlined its plans to make a national inventory of pre-Convention stockpiled sharks. Finally, one Party underlined the difficulties faced in applying the existing legal instruments and highlighted the importance of creating a specific framework for shark protection.

ii) In Decision 19.226, the Standing Committee is directed to develop new guidance or identify existing guidance on the control and monitoring of stockpiles of shark parts and derivatives, in particular for specimens caught prior to the inclusion of the species in Appendix II, and the Secretariat is instructed to disseminate this guidance to Parties in Decision 19.224, paragraph d).

<u>Implementation:</u> At its 75th meeting, the Standing Committee established an intersessional working group on sharks and rays. The mandate of the working group includes consideration of this Decision and is reported on in document SC78 Doc. 70.1.

## j) Marine turtles

Resolution Conf. 19.5 on *Conservation of and trade in marine turtles* contain guidelines for evaluating marine turtle ranching proposals submitted pursuant to Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev. CoP15) on *Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II* set out in the Annex to the Resolution and measures to be taken with regard to trade controls. Proposing Parties must *inter alia* undertake registration of any existing stockpiles of marine turtle parts and derivatives

held within its territorial jurisdiction and instigate marking and control systems to ensure that such items are readily distinguishable from similar items deriving from approved ranches. In addition, importing States shall undertake to provide documentation of the measures taken to control existing stockpiles of such specimens.

<u>Implementation:</u> This Resolution was adopted recently and no information is available yet on the implementation of this provision.

Malagasy ebonies (Diospyros spp.) and Malagasy palisanders and rosewoods (Dalbergia spp.)

In Decision 19.71, Madagascar is directed to strengthen the management of all *Dalbergia* spp. and *Diospyros* spp. timber stockpiles in Madagascar (including through traceability and control systems); request financial and technical assistance therefor; and submit regular updates on audited inventories and independent oversight mechanisms, for consideration and further guidance from the Standing Committee.

<u>Implementation</u>: The progress made by Madagascar on the implementation of Decision 19.71 was outlined by the Party in document <u>SC77 Doc. 33.12</u>. The report explained that, through a project supported by the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO), a system of traceability, control, and inventory of stockpiles of seized wood was being developed in the regions of Menabe and Boeny, with the goal to scale it up to the national level by the end of 2023. At the time of writing, the Secretariat does not have information on any progress in this regard. According to the report, the inventory should help estimate the costs associated with making further progress towards the implementation of Decision 19.71, paragraph a). The Party further noted that it holds inventoried stockpiles of seized rosewood and ebony amounting to 3,200 m³ and seized palisander amounting to 1,606 m³.

# I) Brazil wood (Paubrasilia echinata)

In Decision 19.251, Parties, and in particular source, transit and destination Parties for *Paubrasilia echinata*, are invited to consider the registration of stockpiles of *Paubrasilia echinata* as appropriate; and the Secretariat is directed to prepare a report on the implementation of Decision 19.251 and submit any resulting recommendations to the Standing Committee.

Implementation: Following the amendment to annotation #10 for Paubrasilia echinata agreed at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the Secretariat issued Notification No. 2023/033 in March 2023 requesting information regarding Decisions 19.249 to 19.253 and included a questionnaire on Paubrasilia echinata. Of the 12 Parties that responded to the Notification, four affirmed being aware of the existence of stockpile registration systems for specimens of Paubrasilia echinata whereas six affirmed not being aware of it. One Party did not explicitly respond to that part of the questionnaire. The responses, together with draft terms of reference of a study to assess and monitor the implications of the amendment of annotation #10 on the conservation and international trade of Brazil wood, were compiled in document PC26 Doc. 31. The Plants Committee made comments on the terms of reference and invited the Secretariat to take them into account for the finalization of the document. As detailed in document SC77 Doc. 6, paragraph 17, the Plants Committee requested that the study should also consider a traceability system covering unfinished products (bow blanks) and the stocks of discarded materials as part of the manufacturing process of bows. Since the 26th meeting of the Plants Committee, the study has been initiated thanks to a financial contribution from the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland. The expected outputs are synthesized in document PC27 Doc. 29. At the 27th meeting of the Plants Committee, the Secretariat provided an oral report on the progress made in implementing the study now available in document SC78 Doc. 73. The Plants Committee noted the progress achieved and invited the Secretariat to include in its report to the Standing Committee a revision or the deletion of Decisions 19.249 and 19.250 on Brazil wood (Paubrasilia echinata) based on progress in implementation.

#### Discussion

13. The Standing Committee is invited to note this brief summary of work conducted during previous sessions and to focus its attention on those aspects that have not been fully covered yet. This includes the issue of proposing a definition of "stocks and stockpiles" and the development of additional guidance related to the management and control of stocks and stockpiles.

14. As mentioned above, the previous meeting of the Standing Committee did not have time to consider this issue and therefore requested that the Secretariat issue a Notification to invite Parties and stakeholders to provide comments on SC77 Doc. 50. Seven Parties and eight observers submitted their responses which almost exclusively addressed the issue of the proposed definition on stocks and stockpiles that was included in that document.

#### Definition of stocks/stockpiles

- 15. Based on the above review and on work conducted during the previous intersessional periods, it would appear that there is a common understanding that the fundamental objective of provisions related to stockpiles is to ensure that existing stockpiles are secured and managed in such a way that specimens would not enter or re-enter illegal trade. This seems to be irrespective of the origin of the specimens and of the purpose of the stockpiling, or the ultimate destination, disposal or destruction of the specimens. With regard to the implementation and the resource implications of the provisions related to stocks and stockpiles, there also seems to be agreement that one of the major challenges identified is the financial cost of maintaining the security and integrity of stockpiles. On this last aspect, with respect to illegally traded and confiscated specimens, Parties are encouraged to implement paragraph 5 a) of Resolution Conf. 17.8 (Rev. CoP19) on *Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species* to make legislative provisions to require the importer or the carrier who violated the Convention, or both, to meet the costs of confiscation, custody, storage, destruction or other disposal.
- 16. The Secretariat notes that a common understanding of the terms stocks/stockpile would be useful for Parties to know whether they are expected to implement the above-mentioned provisions with respect to stocks and stockpiles of certain species. In reviewing the provisions in paragraph 12 above, it can be observed that Parties seem to have used the two words stocks and stockpiles interchangeably in Resolutions and Decisions and sometimes even in relation to the same species (elephant):

"Stocks" used in the context of the following	"Stockpiles" used in the context of the following
species	species
Tibetan antelope [subparagraph a)]	Saiga antelope [subparagraph b)]
Elephant [subparagraph g)]	Elephant [subparagraph g)]
Rhinoceroses [subparagraph e)]	Pythons [subparagraph h)]
Pangolins [subparagraph f)]	Sharks and rays [subparagraph i)]
Tigers and other Asian big cats [subparagraph d)]	Marine turtles [subparagraph j)]
	Malagasy ebonies, palisanders and rosewood
	[subparagraph k)]
	Brazil wood [subparagraph I)]

- 17. In their response to Notification No. 2023/130, Parties (except one) and organizations agreed on the benefit of having a common understanding/definition of stocks/stockpiles. Additionally, most comments suggested that the definition should only refer to the term *stockpiles*, as the word *stock* is also used in other contexts, such as "breeding stock" or "fish stock". One Party stated that the management of stockpiles falls outside the mandate of CITES and that a definition of stockpiles should be determined on a species-by-species basis, as appropriate.
- 18. Regarding the use of the term "accumulated", one Party argued that this term would align well with the language used in paragraph 2 a) of Resolution Conf. 17.8 (Rev. CoP 19) and effectively convey the intention to consolidate specimens in one single place. Another Party disagreed with the inclusion of this term due to concerns that it might exclude specimens derived from a single acquisition or seizure.
- 19. One Party and seven observer organizations voiced opposition to excluding from the definition specimens held privately by individuals or those subject to law enforcement procedures. The reasons provided included two main points. First, excluding from the definition of stockpiles an accumulation of specimens held by individuals might undermine efforts to combat illegal trade because they could be easily traded. Second, specimens involved in law enforcement processes might be stored for long durations and, given that seizures often involve large amounts of material, it is crucial to mark, measure, and inventory such specimens. One further Party noted that the discussed definition would exclude all private collections regardless of their size, which could result in large private collections being overlooked by the definition.
- 20. Two Parties suggested to include a clarification that specimens excluded from the definition (such as those held by museums or scientific institutions) should be only held for "non-commercial purposes". One Party also expressed concern about the phrase "any volume or number", asserting that a small volume or number

of specimens would not meet the criteria for a stockpile. In this context, the same Party proposed that the definition of what constitutes a stockpile should be based on specific thresholds or other defining features. This Party argued that specimens not designated for destruction after the enforcement process should be considered part of stockpiles.

- 21. Finally, the observer organizations recommended replacing the term "any volume or number" with "any quantity." Several observer organizations also emphasized the need to clarify that CITES guidelines on stockpiles should not only aim to prevent the material from (re-)entering illegal trade, but also to avoid its commercial use.
- 22. Based on these considerations, the Standing Committee is invited to consider the following suggested draft definition of stockpiles:

In the context of CITES, 'stockpiles' refer to any quantity of accumulated dead specimens, including parts and derivates, of CITES-listed species held by public or private entities. Specimens included in permanent collections held by museums, scientific institutions, or individuals for non-commercial purposes, are excluded from the definition. In general, provisions related to stockpiles in CITES Resolutions and Decisions are intended to ensure that these are secured, managed and disposed of in such a way that the specimens would not enter or re-enter illegal trade.

The Secretariat proposes that this definition be included in the <u>CITES Glossary</u> as a way to facilitate the understanding of Parties as they implement provisions related to stockpile management in the Resolutions and Decisions described in paragraph 12.

23. As noted above, most comments suggested that the definition should only concern the word "stockpiles". The meaning of the word "stock" is broader and is used in other contexts such as "breeding stock" and "fish stock". As a consequence, the five Resolutions that are currently using the word "stocks" in the context of seized and confiscated specimens would need to be amended so that they would refer to "stockpiles" instead. The Secretariat notes that this would be in line with French and Spanish where the same word is used in all Resolutions. In the Annex to the present document, the Secretariat has included the relevant parts of the five Resolutions to show what the amended text would look like.

Guidance material related to the management and control of stockpiles

- 24. As noted in paragraph 9 above, the previous working group noted that guidance material related to the management and control of stockpiles would be beneficial. From a practical perspective to help Parties manage and control stockpiles of specimens of CITES-listed species, there might be some merit in providing guidance on management and control of stockpiles and on the methods for preventing specimens from entering into illegal trade. Practical guidance on the forensic use, inventorying and maintenance, monitoring and marking, security, and elimination or destruction of stockpiles developed by experts among Parties and observers would assist stockpile management.
- 25. Guidance related to non-perishable goods, including elephant ivory, pangolin scales and rhino horn, is available in the <u>Practical Guidance</u> agreed at SC74 (see information <u>document CoP18 Inf. 72 Ensuring Effective Stockpile Management: A Guidance Document)</u>. The document provides hands-on guidance on the prerequisites for effective stockpile management, including a simple checklist to assess the status of stockpile management at the national level; as well as guidance on how to conduct a stockpile inventory or an audit of such an inventory. Finally, it also contains basic guidance on security and storage. As mentioned above, Parties are encouraged to use this guidance and provide feedback to the Secretariat on any experiences and new techniques and methodologies. The guidance document exists in English and <u>French</u> and several non-CITES languages as well. This guidance can be readily applied to stockpiles of saiga horn and will be the basis for the support of the Secretariat to Parties under Decision 19.214. The Secretariat welcomes any feedback on the use of the guidance with respect to stockpiles of other species.
- 26. The guidance has not been designed for the effective and secure management of stockpiles of timber tree species or other plant species and no other such guidance has been developed in the context of CITES. However, there might be a need for this, both for confiscated specimens and for pre-Convention specimens, in particular after the inclusion of some 500 tree species in Appendix II at CoP19, some with a delayed implementation date.
- 27. Referring to the discussions reported by the previous intersessional working group on stocks and stockpiles in document SC74 Doc. 60, the Secretariat had proposed in its document to SC77 that the Standing

- Committee consider whether additional guidance on management and controls of stockpiles of timber tree species would be needed.
- 28. In the feedback provided to on the document submitted to SC77, there was only one Party and some observer organizations who expressed some support for developing additional guidance on the management and control of stockpiles of tree species. However, no other Party commented on this matter. In view of this limited feedback and the fact that this was not part of the mandate in Decision 17.170 (Rev. CoP19), the Secretariat suggests to not undertake further activities in this area for the time being.

#### Conclusions and recommendations

- 29. The Standing Committee is invited to
  - a) note the work conducted in past intersessional periods as summarized in paragraphs 3 to 11 above;
  - b) note the review of existing provisions on stocks/stockpiles in Resolutions and Decisions and the information on their implementation contained in paragraph 12 above;
  - c) consider and agree on the suggested definition of stockpiles contained in paragraph 22 of the present document to assist Parties with implementation (also included below for ease of reference) and request the Secretariat to include it in the <u>CITES Glossary</u>;
    - In the context of CITES, 'stockpiles' refer to any quantity of accumulated dead specimens, including parts and derivates, of CITES-listed species held by public or private entities. Specimens included in permanent collections held by museums, scientific institutions, or individuals for non-commercial purposes, are excluded from the definition. In general, provisions related to stockpiles in CITES Resolutions and Decisions are intended to ensure that these are secured, managed and disposed of in such a way that the specimens would not enter or re-enter illegal trade.
  - d) agree to not use the term stock in the context of accumulated dead specimens as defined and therefore agree to submit the amendments to the five Resolutions as set out in the Annex to the present document for consideration by the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties;
  - e) encourage Parties to use the <u>Practical Guidance</u> and <u>Ensuring Effective Stockpile Management: A Guidance Document</u> as needed for the management of stockpiles of rhino horn, elephant ivory, pangolin scales and saiga horn, as well as stockpiles of other species where the guidance can be applied and provide feedback to the Secretariat on the use of the guidance; and
  - f) agree that Decision 17.170 (Rev. CoP19) has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion.

# RESOLUTIONS TO BE AMENDED TO REFER TO "STOCKPILES" INSTEAD OF "STOCKS" (new text is <u>underlined</u>; deleted text is in <u>strikethrough</u>)

# Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP19) on Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses

#### Preambular paragraph

CONCERNED that threats to rhinoceros populations and demand for rhinoceros horns and other parts and derivatives still exist, and that the cost of ensuring adequate security for rhinoceroses and rhinoceros horn stocks stockpiles is increasing and cannot easily be met by many range States;

#### Operative paragraphs 2, 7 and 9:

#### 2. URGES

- a) all Parties that have stocks stockpiles of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks stockpiles, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat;
- the Secretariat and other appropriate bodies, where possible, to assist those Parties with inadequate legislation, enforcement, or control of <u>stocks</u> <u>stockpiles</u>, by providing them technical advice and relevant information:
- 7. DIRECTS the Secretariat, prior to each meeting of the Conference of the Parties, and pending external funding, to commission the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC to submit a report to the Secretariat on:

[...]

- c) stocks stockpiles of specimens of rhinoceros and stock stockpile management,
- 9. DIRECTS the Secretariat to:
  - a) make an aggregated summary of the rhinoceros horn stock stockpile declarations of Parties available to the IUCN/SSC African and Asian Rhino Specialist Groups and TRAFFIC for analysis and inclusion in their reporting to the Secretariat pursuant to the Resolution;

# Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP 19) on Trade in elephant specimens

#### Preambular paragraph

RECOGNIZING also that the theft of ivory, including from inadequately secured government stocks stockpiles, further adds to illegal trade and wildlife crime;

#### Paragraph 7:

7. FURTHER URGES those Parties in whose jurisdiction there is an ivory carving industry, a legal domestic trade in ivory, an unregulated market for or illegal trade in ivory, or where ivory stockpiles exist, and Parties designated as ivory importing countries, to ensure that they have put in place comprehensive internal legislative, regulatory, enforcement and other measures to:

[...]

- c) introduce recording and inspection procedures to enable the Management Authority and other appropriate government agencies to monitor the movement of ivory within the State, particularly by means of:
  - i) compulsory trade controls over raw ivory; and
  - ii) comprehensive and demonstrably effective stock stockpile inventory, reporting, and enforcement systems for worked ivory;

[...]

e) maintain an inventory of government-held stockpiles of ivory and, where possible, of significant privately held stockpiles of ivory within their territory, and inform the Secretariat of the level of this stock stockpile each year before 28 February, inter alia to be made available to the programme Monitoring the Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE) and the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS) for their analyses, indicating the number of pieces and their weight per type of ivory (raw or worked); for relevant pieces, and if marked, their markings in accordance with the provisions of this Resolution; the source of the ivory; and the reasons for any significant changes in the stockpile compared to the preceding year;

# Resolution Conf. 11.8 (Rev. CoP17) on Conservation of and control of trade in the Tibetan antelope

#### Paragraph 1

- 1. RECOMMENDS that
  - d) all Parties and non-Parties in whose territory stocks stockpiles of Tibetan antelope parts and raw materials exist, adopt a registration system and national measures to prevent such stocks stockpiles from re-entering into trade;

# Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19) on Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Appendix-I Asian big cat species

#### Paragraph 1

1. URGES

[...]

i) those Parties and non-Parties on whose territories there exist stocks stockpiles of parts and derivatives of tiger and other Asian big cat species (such as tiger bone stocks stockpiles), but not including pre-Convention specimens, to consolidate and ensure adequate control of such stocks stockpiles, and where possible destroy the same, with the exception of those used for educational and scientific purposes;

### Resolution Conf. 17.8 (Rev. CoP19) on Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species

Annex 2 CITES guidelines for the disposal of confiscated live plants

#### **OPTION 1 – MAINTENANCE IN CULTIVATION**, last paragraph

Where plants are transferred by the confiscating authority but not sold, ownership by the Management Authority should be specified as one of the terms and conditions of the transfer. Where the country of origin may desire return of the plants, this desire should be respected, so long as the condition of the plants is such that they will survive the return voyage. The custodian (botanic garden or other organization) of confiscated plants should only move confiscated stocks plants to another facility for legitimate propagation purposes with the authorization of the administrative authority.

# Resolution Conf. 17.10 (Rev. CoP19) on Conservation of and trade in pangolins

# Paragraph 3

3. ENCOURAGES Parties on whose territories stocks stockpiles of parts and derivatives of pangolins exist, to take urgent steps to establish and apply, where not yet done, strict control measures to secure and monitor these stocks stockpiles, and inform the Secretariat of the level of stocks stockpiles each year, indicating the type and number of specimens, the species, the source of the specimens, management measures, and the reasons for any significant changes in the stockpile compared to the preceding year;