

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Twenty-sixth meeting of the Plants Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 5 – 9 June 2023

Thirty-second meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 19 – 23 June 2023

Regulation of trade

Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species

REPORT OF THE SECRETARIAT

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.
2. At its 19th meeting (CoP19; Panama City, 2022), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decisions 19.142 to 19.144 on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species* as follows:

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees, in consultation with the Secretariat

19.142 *The Animals and Plants Committees shall establish a joint working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:*

- a) *review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;*
- b) *consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species; and*
- c) *report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Animals and Plants Committees.*

Directed to the Secretariat

19.143 *The Secretariat shall:*

- a) *continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES website and the CITES Virtual College; and*
- b) *report on the progress and make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*

Directed to Parties

19.144 *Parties are encouraged to support the efforts of the working group on identification materials by providing to the Secretariat information on available identification and guidance materials that are used by Parties, and particularly by enforcement and inspection officers, to facilitate implementation of the Convention.*

3. CoP19 also adopted Resolution Conf. 19.4 on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species*. The Resolution directs the Secretariat to, *inter alia*:
 - a) *regularly review and analyze the materials produced by or for Parties to assist in identification of specimens of CITES-listed species and gaps in existing identification materials relative to the needs expressed by the Parties, and provide a summary of this to the Animals and Plants Committees;*
 - b) *publish and maintain in a centralized location on the CITES website access to identification materials in a timely and practical manner and in a format that is readily available for CITES authorities and enforcement officials to use, and make updates as new electronic formats evolve;*
 - c) *where available and practical to do so, continue to link identification materials to existing lists of species, or higher order groupings of species, in the CITES Appendices on the CITES website;*
 -
 - e) *keep the Standing, Animals and Plants Committees informed of progress made and needs identified in the development and maintenance of identification materials, as appropriate; and*
4. The CITES website hosts a webpage on Identification materials, databases for identification materials under the CITES Virtual College and the repository on Timber Identification Resources and Tools. Identification materials related to sharks and rays are also hosted on the Sharks and rays portal. The identification materials are linked to specific CITES-listed species or higher order groupings of species on the Checklist of CITES Species and Species+, and pdf versions of these materials are available for download from these webpages.
5. The Secretariat has not reviewed and analyzed the identification materials and gaps in existing identifications as requested in Resolution Conf. 19.4 on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species*. Additional resources may be needed to be able to complete a thorough inventory of all identification materials and identify gaps in the existing materials.

Implementation of Decision 19.142

6. Decision 19.142 calls for the establishment of a joint Animals and Plants Committee working group on identification materials to review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement and consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species.
7. In preparation of the working group's work under Decision 19.142, paragraph a), the Secretariat has prepared a list of references found in Resolution and Decisions on species identification in Annex 1 and Annex 2 to the present document. To conduct a thorough analysis of the available identification materials, additional resources may be required.

Progress in the implementation of Decision 19.143

8. The Secretariat issued Notification to the Parties [No. 2023/051](#) on *Request for materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species* to invite Parties and other relevant stakeholders to share available information and guidance materials that are used by Parties with a deadline of 2 June 2023. These materials will be shared through the CITES webpage and with the joint Animals and Plants Committee working group on identification materials that will be established under Decision 19.142.
9. In the same Notification, the Secretariat invited Parties to share information on identification materials requested in other Decisions, including Decision 19.109 on *Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)*, Decision 19.146 on *Identification of timber and other wood products*, Decision 19.194 on *West African vultures (Accipitridae spp.)* and Decision 19.203 on *Pangolins (Manis spp.)*.
10. With regards to the responses received relating to Decision 19.146, these will be considered by the Plants Committee under document PC26 Doc. 20.
11. China informed the Secretariat of an initiative entitled *Identification manual of animals listed in Appendix I* that is being launched by the Endangered Species Scientific Commission (ESSC) as the CITES Scientific Authority of China. The goal of the initiative is to:

- a) compile existing identification resources of Appendix-I listed animal species and conduct a gap analysis;
- b) based on the results, develop an updated "Identification manual of animals listed in CITES Appendix I".

The initiative complements the mandate of the Animals and Plants Committee in Decision 19.142 and the Secretariat has encouraged China to participate in the intersessional working group and to share its findings.

Recommendations

12. The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) agree on the draft terms of reference for a joint intersessional working group on ID materials as contained in Annex 3 to the present document; and
- b) establish a joint intersessional working group and agree on the membership from the Animals and Plants Committees.

SUMMARY OF REFERENCES TO IDENTIFICATION MATERIALS FOUND IN RESOLUTIONS IN EFFECT AFTER COP19

Number	Title	Text
Conf. 7.12 (Rev. CoP15)	<i>Marking requirements for trade in specimens of taxa with populations in both Appendix I and Appendix II</i>	THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 1. RECOMMENDS that: a) with respect to the identification of live specimens, any marking system that requires the attachment of a tag, band or other uniquely marked label, or the marking of a part of the animal's anatomy be undertaken only with due regard for the humane care, well-being and natural behaviour of the specimen concerned; ...
Conf. 8.13 (Rev. CoP17)	<i>Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade</i>	RECOGNIZING the increasingly wide use of coded-microchip implants for the individual identification of animals; ... MINDFUL that the provisions of Article VI, paragraph 7, allow a Management Authority to determine appropriate methods of marking specimens for the purposes of assisting in identification; and AWARE that the International Union for Conservation of Nature / Species Survival Commission (IUCN/SSC) Conservation Breeding Specialist Group has already undertaken an extensive review of the application of coded-microchip implants, and that effective implementation of Article VI, paragraph 7, will result in increasingly wider use of coded-microchip implants for the identification of animals; THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 1. RECOMMENDS that: a) Parties, where possible and appropriate, without excluding the use of other methods, adopt the use of implantable transponders bearing permanent, non-programmable, unalterable and permanently unique codes for the identification of live animals; ...
Conf. 9.5 (Rev. CoP16)	<i>Trade with States not party to the Convention</i>	THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 1. RECOMMENDS that: a) permits and certificates issued by States not party to the Convention not be accepted by Parties unless they contain: ... ii) sufficient identification of the species concerned for the purposes of the Convention; ...
Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses</i>	THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 1. RECOMMENDS that: ... e) immediately bring the seizure of illegal rhinoceros specimens made within their territories: i) to the attention of authorities in countries of origin, transit and destination, as applicable, providing information associated with the seizure, for example on <i>modus operandi</i> , accompanying documentation, any identification marks on the seized specimens, where appropriate the details of the offenders involved, and any other information that could assist the initiation of investigations as appropriate, in countries of origin, transit and destination; or

		<p>ii) to the attention of the CITES Secretariat in cases where sufficient information is not available to identify the countries of origin, transit and destination of the seized rhinoceros specimens, including information describing the circumstances of the seizure;</p> <p>...</p> <p>2. URGES</p> <p>a) all Parties that have stocks of rhinoceros horn to identify, mark, register and secure such stocks, and declare these to the Secretariat each year before 28 February, in a format to be defined by the Secretariat;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17)	<i>Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II</i>	<p>Annex 3 Special cases</p> <p>...</p> <p>Higher taxa</p> <p>...</p> <p>Parties contemplating preparing a proposal to transfer an individual plant species from a higher-taxon listing in Appendix II to a separate listing in Appendix I should consider:</p> <p>...</p> <p>iii) any practical problems in identifying the species, particularly in the form in which it may be traded.</p> <p>Annex 6 Format for proposals to amend the Appendices</p> <p>...</p> <p>A. <u>Proposal Annotations</u></p> <p>If a specific annotation to the listing in the Appendices is proposed, the proponent should:</p> <p>...</p> <p>– where applicable, provide identification sheets to be included in the CITES Identification Manual that illustrate the parts and derivatives covered under the annotation.</p> <p>...</p> <p>C. <u>Supporting statement</u></p> <p>1. <u>Taxonomy</u></p> <p>The proponent should provide sufficient information to allow the Conference of the Parties to identify clearly the taxon that is the subject of the proposal.</p> <p>...</p> <p>1.7 Code numbers</p> <p>If the species concerned is already included in the Appendices, refer to the code numbers in the CITES Identification Manual.</p> <p>...</p> <p>9. <u>Information on similar species</u></p> <p>Give the names of species of which specimens in trade look very similar. Provide details on how they may be distinguished, including, in particular, details on those commodities or parts and derivatives most common in trade, and explain whether or not it is reasonable to expect an informed non-expert to be able to make a firm identification. Provide details on how to resolve potential difficulties in distinguishing specimens of the species proposed for listing from those of similar species, in particular those specimens most common in trade.</p>
Conf. 10.8 (Rev. CoP14)	<i>Conservation of and trade in bears</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. URGES all Parties, particularly bear range and consuming countries, to continue to take action to reduce the illegal trade in bear parts and derivatives by:</p> <p>...</p>

		<p>g) sharing forensic technology to assist Parties lacking sufficient capabilities for the identification of bear parts and derivatives, and for examination of products labelled as containing parts and derivatives of bears;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Trade in elephant specimens</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>11. DIRECTS the Secretariat, subject to available resources, to provide technical assistance to Parties to:</p> <p>...</p> <p>c) identify specimens of elephant ivory, other types of ivory and ivory look-alike materials;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 10.13 (Rev. CoP18)	<i>Implementation of the Convention for tree species</i>	<p>...</p> <p>AWARE that unambiguous identification of timber, by its nature, can be a complex procedure, requiring particular expertise; RECOGNIZING that the development of timber identification materials is essential for the effective implementation of the Convention and that the cost of production will be considerable;</p> <p>...</p> <p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>Regarding identification and forensics for tree species</p> <p>j) Parties acknowledge the fundamental importance of timber identification and continued development of advanced analytical wood identification techniques and operational tools to the successful implementation of CITES for timber species;</p> <p>k) Parties are encouraged to collaborate with relevant stakeholders to create and maintain wood sample collections and facilitate exchange of wood samples and associated database information, including guidelines for the collection of wood samples, and make these available to support timber identification and development of analytical methodologies and identification protocols for CITES-listed and look-alike tree species; and</p> <p>l) Parties are encouraged to collaborate with relevant stakeholders to develop shared priorities for timber identification, including priority species, and on developing identification techniques, such as DNA analysis, chemical analysis and imaging, Near Infrared Spectrometry (NIRS), Directed Analysis in Real Time mass spectrometry (DART), and macro- and microscopic identification of wood and fibre samples;</p>
Conf. 10.19 (Rev. CoP14)	<i>Traditional medicines</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. RECOMMENDS that the Parties:</p> <p>...</p> <p>b) promote the development of techniques, including the application of forensic science, for identifying parts and derivatives used in traditional medicines;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 10.20	<i>Frequent cross-border movements of personally owned live animals</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. RECOMMENDS that:</p> <p>...</p> <p>d) the Management Authority require the applicant for a certificate of ownership to provide his name and address and pertinent data regarding the live animal, including the species, sex and mark number or other means of identification;</p> <p>...</p> <p>j) the Parties concerned require that any live animal that is a personal or household effect be securely marked or otherwise appropriately identified and that this mark be included on the certificate of ownership so that the authorities of the State into which the live animal enters can verify that the certificate corresponds to the live animal in question;</p>

<p>Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP19)</p>	<p><i>Compliance and enforcement</i></p>	<p>Regarding additional actions to promote enforcement 13. FURTHER RECOMMENDS that Parties: a) develop and implement a comprehensive strategy for border controls, audits and investigations concerning CITES specimens, including by: ... iii) ensuring the awareness and training of officers in CITES matters regarding, for example, CITES requirements, identification of specimens and the handling of live animals; ... e) carry out focused national and regional capacity-building activities with particular focus on fostering inter-agency cooperation and improving knowledge of legislation; species identification; risk analysis and investigation of criminal actions; and delivering successful prosecutions and deterrent penalties; and</p>
<p>Conf. 11.4 (Rev. CoP12)</p>	<p><i>Conservation of cetaceans, trade in cetacean specimens and the relationship with the International Whaling Commission</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION Regarding cooperation in monitoring illegal trade in whale parts and derivatives 9. ENCOURAGES all countries concerned to voluntarily: ... b) collect and inventory skin or meat samples for DNA identification from all such frozen whale specimens; 10. RECOMMENDS that all countries concerned collect and inventory skin or meat samples for DNA identification from baleen whales:</p>
<p>Conf. 11.7</p>	<p><i>Conservation of and trade in musk deer</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 2. RECOMMENDS that manufacturing and consumer States cooperate in the development and distribution of identification guides for manufactured products containing musk to assist with enforcement efforts; ...</p>
<p>Conf. 11.8 (Rev. CoP17)</p>	<p><i>Conservation of and control of trade in the Tibetan antelope</i></p>	<p>COMMENDING the initiatives by Parties to facilitate cooperation in conservation of the Tibetan antelope and to address illegal hunting of the Tibetan antelope, including: ... b) France, India, Italy, the United Kingdom and the United States, which have taken steps to protect the species, including enforcement and judicial action to halt the illegal trade in Tibetan antelope parts and derivatives and the development of identification techniques for such parts and derivatives; THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 3. URGES: ... b) all countries and territories with relevant experience and technical capabilities to strengthen cooperation and the exchange of information, technology and experience with regard to education and awareness, law enforcement such as smuggling routes and methods, and techniques for the identification of parts and derivatives of the Tibetan antelope; ...</p>
<p>Conf. 11.9 (Rev. CoP18)</p>	<p><i>Conservation of and trade in tortoises and freshwater turtles</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 1. URGES: a) all Parties to: ... iii) develop and implement research programmes to identify the species involved in trade, to monitor and assess the impact of trade on wild populations, and to evaluate the conservation risks and benefits of large-scale commercial breeding of tortoises and freshwater turtles; ... d) all Parties affected by illegal trade in tortoises and freshwater turtles to: ...</p>

		<p>iii) where necessary facilitate the compilation, dissemination and translation into local languages, of information on tortoises and freshwater turtles, for use by enforcement officers, drawing on existing identification and enforcement guides, and focusing on identification, local names, distribution and illustrations;</p> <p>iv) where necessary, develop supplementary identification guidance, tailored to the specific needs of the Party concerned, containing basic information on the characteristics used for tortoise and freshwater turtle identification, to support the accurate application of existing identification material;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 11.10 (Rev. CoP15)	<i>Trade in stony corals</i>	<p>...</p> <p>AWARE, however, that coral rock cannot be readily identified other than to the order Scleractinia and that accordingly non-detriment findings under Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), of the Convention cannot be readily applied;</p> <p>...</p> <p>RECOGNIZING also that it is frequently difficult to identify live or dead corals to the species level owing to the lack of a standard nomenclature and the lack of comprehensive and accessible identification guides for the non-specialist;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 11.11 (Rev. CoP18)	<i>Regulation of trade in plants</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>Regarding enforcement for plants</p> <p>12. RECOMMENDS that Parties ensure that:</p> <p>...</p> <p>b) enforcing agencies obtain access to materials and expertise enabling identification of plant specimens in trade, including whether the specimens are of wild or artificially propagated origin;</p>
Conf. 11.12 (Rev. CoP15)	<i>Universal tagging system for the identification of crocodilian skins</i>	<p>...</p> <p>RECALLING that Article VI, paragraph 7, of the Convention provides that specimens of species listed in the Appendices may be marked to assist in identifying them;</p> <p>...</p> <p>1. RECOMMENDS:</p> <p>a) the maintenance of a universal tagging system for the identification of raw, tanned, and/or finished crocodilian skins by the general application of non-reusable tags to all crocodilian skins entering international trade from the countries of origin;</p> <p>b) that crocodilian skins, flanks and chalecos be individually tagged before export;</p> <p>c) that the non-reusable tags include, as a minimum: the ISO two-letter code for the country of origin; a unique serial identification number; a standard species code (as provided in Annex 1); and, where appropriate, the year of skin production or harvest, in accordance with the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev. CoP15), adopted by the Conference of the Parties at its 11th meeting (Gigiri, 2000) and amended at its 14th and 15th meetings (The Hague, 2007; Doha 2010); and further, that such tags have as a minimum the following characteristics: a tamper-resistant, self-locking mechanism, heat resistance, inertia to chemical and mechanical processing, and alphanumeric information, which may include bar-coding, applied by permanent stamping;</p>
Conf. 11.15 (Rev. CoP18)	<i>Non-commercial loan, donation or exchange of museum, herbarium, diagnostic and forensic research specimens</i>	<p>Annex Examples of the types of forensic reference samples that may qualify for provisions under non-commercial loan, donation or exchange of museum and herbarium specimens and their use (Note: Depending on the specific circumstances, the type of sample and typical sample size eligible for exchange under this Resolution may differ.)</p> <p>[Multiple types of samples listed as “species identification” as the purpose of the use of sample]</p>

<p>Conf. 11.16 (Rev. CoP15)</p>	<p><i>Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION Regarding proposals to transfer populations from Appendix I to Appendix II for ranching 2. RECOMMENDS that: b) in order to be considered by the Conference of the Parties, any proposal to transfer a population to Appendix II in order to conduct a ranching programme satisfy the following general criteria: ... ii) all products (including live specimens) of each operation must be adequately identified and documented to ensure that they can be readily distinguished from products of Appendix-I populations; ...</p>
<p>Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP19)</p>	<p><i>Use of annotations in Appendices I and II</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION 6. RECOMMENDS the following guidance and principles for annotations: a) annotations that specify the types of specimens included in the Appendices should be used sparingly, as their implementation is particularly challenging, especially where there are identification problems or where the purpose of trade has been specified; B) ...</p>
<p>Conf. 12.3 (Rev. CoP19)</p>	<p><i>Permits and certificates</i></p>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION ... VII. Regarding travelling-exhibition certificates 14. RECOMMENDS that: k) Parties require that specimens be marked or identified in such a way that the authorities of each State into which an exhibition enters can verify that the travelling-exhibition certificates correspond to the specimens being imported; ... XI. Regarding permits and certificates for coral specimens 19. RECOMMENDS that: a) on permits and certificates issued to authorize trade in specimens of hard corals of the genera included in the most recent CITES list of Coral taxa where identification to genus level is acceptable , where the species cannot be readily determined, the specimens may be recorded at the genus level. This list is maintained by the Secretariat and may be amended with the concurrence of the Animals Committee; b) on permits and certificates for trade in specimens that are readily recognizable as coral rock [as defined in Resolution Conf. 11.10 (Rev. CoP15) Annex], where the genus cannot be readily determined, the scientific name for the specimens should be 'Scleractinia'; c) any Party wishing to authorize export of coral rock identified to ordinate level only should, in view of the inability to make a non-detriment finding for coral rock pursuant to Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), apply the provisions of Article IV, paragraph 3; ... e) on permits and certificates for trade in worked specimens of black coral, where the species cannot be readily determined, the specimens may be recorded at the genus level and, where the genus cannot be readily determined, the scientific name for the given specimens should be 'Antipatharia'; and f) raw black coral and live black coral should continue to be identified in trade to species level; ... XV. Regarding acceptance and clearance of documents and security measures 24. RECOMMENDS that: ...</p>

		<p>e) Parties refuse to accept permits and certificates that do not indicate the scientific name of the species concerned (including subspecies when appropriate), except in the case where:</p> <p>...</p> <p>III) CERTAIN MANUFACTURED PRODUCTS CONTAIN PRE-CONVENTION SPECIMENS THAT CAN NOT BE IDENTIFIED TO THE SPECIES LEVEL;</p>
Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Appendix-I Asian big cat species</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. URGES:</p> <p>...</p> <p>l) all Parties that make seizures of tiger skins within their territories, when possible, to share images of the seized tiger skins with the national focal points or agencies in tiger range States, which have photographic identification databases for tigers, and the capacity to identify tigers from photographs of tiger skins, so as to identify the origin of illegal specimens. The images should be taken from above with the skin spread. In the case of whole tiger carcasses seized with the skin intact, images should be taken of both sides of the carcass;</p> <p>...</p> <p>4. REQUESTS:</p> <p>a) countries and organizations with the relevant expertise to encourage and support range and consumer States, as a matter of urgency, in the development of practical identification manuals to aid the detection and accurate identification of parts and derivatives of Asian big cats;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 12.6 (Rev. CoP18)	<i>Conservation and management of sharks</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>11. FURTHER ENCOURAGES Parties, intergovernmental and non-governmental bodies to develop robust, low-cost tools and systems, where not already existing, to ensure that shark species, in particular CITES-listed species, are identified accurately at the first point of capture/landing, and undertake studies of trade in all shark products;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 12.7 (Rev. CoP17)	<i>Conservation of and trade in sturgeons and paddlefish</i>	<p>...</p> <p>RECALLING that Article VI, paragraph 7, of the Convention provides that specimens of species listed in the Appendices may be marked to assist in identifying them;</p> <p>...</p> <p>NOTING that, in order to assist the Parties in identifying legal caviar in trade, marking should be standardized and that particular specifications for the design of labels are fundamental, should be generally applied and should also take into account marking systems currently in place and anticipated technological advances in marking systems;</p> <p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>7. CALLS UPON range States, importing countries and other experts and appropriate organizations, such as the IUCN/SSC Sturgeon Specialist Group, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Animals Committee, to continue to explore the development of a uniform DNA-based identification system for parts and derivatives and aquaculture stocks of Acipenseriformes species to assist in the subsequent identification of the origin of specimens in trade and the development and application of methods for differentiating wild from aquaculture origin caviar in cases where DNA-based methods are not useful;</p> <p>...</p> <p>Annex 1 CITES guidelines for a universal labelling system for the trade in and identification of caviar</p>
Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15)	<i>Registration of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p>

	<i>in captivity for commercial purposes</i>	<p>5. RESOLVES that:</p> <p>...</p> <p>f) registered captive-breeding operations shall ensure that an appropriate and secure marking system is used to clearly identify all breeding stock and specimens in trade, and shall undertake to adopt superior marking and identification methods as these become available;</p> <p>...</p> <p>8. AGREES further that:</p> <p>a) Parties shall restrict imports for primarily commercial purposes, as defined in Resolution Conf. 5.10 (Rev. CoP15), of captive-bred specimens of Appendix-I species to those produced by operations included in the Secretariat's Register and shall reject any document granted under Article VII, paragraph 4, if the specimens concerned do not originate from such an operation and if the document does not describe the specific identifying mark applied to each specimen;</p>
Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Standard nomenclature</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>2. RECOMMENDS that:</p> <p>a) a subspecies be proposed for inclusion in the Appendices only if it is generally recognized as a valid taxon, and easily identifiable in the traded form;</p> <p>b) where there are identification difficulties, the problem be approached by either including the entire species in Appendix I or Appendix II or by circumscribing the range of the subspecies warranting protection and listing the populations within this area on a country basis;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 13.11 (Rev. CoP18)	<i>Wild meat</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>6. ENCOURAGES Parties to, as appropriate:</p> <p>...</p> <p>b) support the development and dissemination of identification tools for identifying CITES-listed species traded as wild meat;</p>
Conf. 16.5	<i>Cooperation with the Global Strategy for Plant Conservation of the Convention on Biological Diversity</i>	<p>"CITES Identification Manual and Web pages" mentioned under CITES's potential contribution towards GSPC Targets 14 (<i>The importance of plant diversity and the need for its conservation incorporated into communication, education and public awareness programmes</i>) and 15 (<i>The number of trained people working with appropriate facilities sufficient according to national needs, to achieve the targets of this Strategy</i>).</p>
Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17)	<i>Non-detriment findings</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. RECOMMENDS that:</p> <p>...</p> <p>v) the making of an effective non-detriment finding relies upon a correct identification of the species concerned and verification that it is specimens of this species that are to be exported;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 16.8 (Rev. CoP17)	<i>Frequent cross-border non-commercial movements of musical instruments</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. RECOMMENDS that for non-commercial cross-border movement of musical instruments derived from CITES species, other than Appendix-I specimens acquired after the species was included in the Appendices:</p> <p>...</p> <p>c) the competent CITES authority require the applicant for a musical instrument certificate to provide their name and address and pertinent data regarding the musical instrument, including the species used to manufacture the instrument, and a means of identification, such as the manufacturer's name or serial number or other means of identification;</p>

		<p>...</p> <p>h) the Parties concerned require that the musical instrument be appropriately identified and that the identification mark or a detailed description of the instrument be included on the musical instrument certificate so that the authorities of the State into which the musical instrument enters can verify that the certificate corresponds to the musical instrument in question;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 17.8 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species</i>	<p>Annex 3 Guidelines to develop an action plan on seized and/or confiscated live specimens</p> <p>...</p> <p>6. include a list of experts who or institutions which can assist in species identification, care and/or other technical aspects of the seizure, confiscation and disposal process;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 17.10 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Conservation of and trade in pangolins</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>1. URGES all:</p> <p>...</p> <p>e) range States to seek to ensure enforcement units and personnel receive relevant and effective support in anti-poaching operations including through the acquisition of equipment and other means to combat poaching, such as canine units and identification manuals; the gathering, use, and sharing of intelligence; targeting offenders; wildlife crime investigative techniques; collecting evidence; inter-agency liaison and cooperation; and preparing cases for prosecution;</p> <p>f) carry out capacity-building activities with a particular focus on:</p> <p>i) methods and techniques to detect and identify illegally traded pangolins, including specimens from alleged captive-breeding operations;</p> <p>...</p> <p>g) Parties and non-Parties to promote the development of techniques, including the application of forensic science, for identifying parts and derivatives of pangolins in trade;</p> <p>...</p>
Conf. 17.12	<i>Conservation, sustainable use of and trade in snakes</i>	<p>THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION</p> <p>...</p> <p>Regarding monitoring and trade controls</p> <p>16. ENCOURAGES Parties to pursue the development and dissemination of forensic methods to assist Parties in the identification of snake parts and derivatives, and for examination of products labelled as containing parts and derivatives of snakes;</p> <p>Regarding traceability systems for snake skins</p> <p>...</p> <p>18. ENCOURAGES Parties to share experiences in the use of traceability systems for specimens of CITES-listed snake species, including the use of identification technologies;</p> <p>19. RECOMMENDS:</p> <p>...</p> <p>e) the identification of skins make use of devices that are tamper-proof, affordable, uniquely serially numbered and contain the following minimum information: species, country of origin (where relevant regional code), year of harvest or production, unique serial number, and source code, or technologies that may accomplish the same requirements. In addition, Parties are encouraged to add other information they deem necessary; and</p> <p>f) the Secretariat should compile such information on available identification technologies and projects to make them available to Parties;</p>

		...
Conf. 18.2	<i>Establishment of Committees</i>	Annex 2 Terms of Reference of the Animals and Plants Committees of the Conference of the Parties ... <i>Membership</i> 10. Regarding nomination of candidates, the following guidelines should be implemented: ... d) provide scientific advice on identification issues, and on training and other capacity-building materials, tools and guides to promote their accuracy and availability.
Conf. 18.3	<i>CITES Strategic Vision: 2021-2030</i>	Goal 1 recognizes that only through ensuring compliance with CITES provisions will the aim of the Convention be achieved. This goal speaks to the performance of the Convention and how effectively it is resulting in the conservation and sustainable use of CITES-listed wild fauna and flora. It recognizes that the effectiveness of the Convention at achieving its Vision depends upon its full implementation by all Parties. Full implementation includes commitment by each Party to the Convention and its principles. Equally important is the commitment of each Party to embody the international co-operation essential for the success of the Convention. Actions to achieve the intent of this goal might include developing innovative tools for the identification and traceability of species in trade, the making of non-detriment findings, determining legal acquisition and for the sharing of trade information. It requires Parties to develop provisions for trade that are proportionate and that can be implemented without undue complexity. ... Objective 2.5 Information gaps and needs for key species are identified and addressed.
Conf. 18.7 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Legal acquisition findings</i>	Annex 1 Guidance for making legal acquisition findings ... 2. Practical steps for the verification of legal acquisition by the State of export ... b) To verify legal acquisition, the Management Authority should review all the documentary and other information presented by the applicant. The documentation should, to the extent practicable, provide information on the entire chain of custody back to the source of the specimen. Such information may include records demonstrating that the specimen or parental stock was removed from the wild in accordance with relevant laws (licenses, collections permits, etc.), records identifying the specific specimen (band numbers or other marks, etc.) and documenting the history of transfers of ownership (sales, receipts, invoices, etc.), and records showing that the specimen was reared at a particular facility, for example. Where a Management Authority considers that the evidence is incomplete, it should provide the applicant with an opportunity to produce additional information.
Conf. 18.8	<i>Conservation of vicuña (Vicugna vicugna) and trade in its fibre and products</i>	... AWARE that the traceability of vicuña fibre is not occurring throughout the entire value chain because of the successive re-exports that turn fibre into fabric and manufactured products, with varying percentages of vicuña fibre content and different forms of identification – in some cases, even losing the identification of its country of origin;
Conf 19.5	<i>Conservation of and trade in marine turtles</i>	<u>2. Trade controls</u> Proponents must take every reasonable measure to ensure that the trade in products from approved ranches does not stimulate an increase in trade from other sources in a manner detrimental to the survival of the population, other populations or other species of marine turtle, or serve as a cause for such trade. Therefore, before international trade is authorized, the proponent Party should ensure that both it and any country to which the products of the ranching operation are destined have adequate legal frameworks and administrative measures for monitoring and reporting, and adequate local and national enforcement capabilities. In particular each proponent Party must: ...

		<p>d) Describe marking and tracking procedures for all parts and derivatives from approved ranches that will allow the unambiguous identification of ranch products, including methods for marking products and packages, packaging types, transport methods, shipping routes, product documentation, secure storage of products, inventory control up to the point of export and specification of the maximum quantities of products (quotas) to be exported annually.</p> <p><u>3. The ranching operation</u></p> <p>To satisfy recommendation in paragraph 2 d) ii)¹ of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev. CoP15)², the proponent should provide information on:</p> <p>...</p> <p>c) <u>Operating procedures</u>, taking account of:</p> <p>...</p> <p>iii) production schedules, including production profiles by age- and size-class, growth rates, methods used to identify ranch stocks, culling procedures exclusive of harvesting, reports of non-harvest mortality, methods of disposal of carcasses from non-harvest mortality and number of specimens by age- and size-class that will be harvested each year;</p>
--	--	---

¹ Corrected by the Secretariat following the 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties: originally referred to "paragraph e) ii)".

² Corrected by the Secretariat following the 11th, 14th and 15th meetings of the Conference of the Parties: originally referred to Resolution Conf. 10.18, later corrected to Resolution Conf. 11.16, then to Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev. CoP14).

SUMMARY OF REFERENCES TO IDENTIFICATION MATERIALS FOUND IN DECISIONS IN EFFECT AFTER COP19

Number	Title	Directed to	Text
19.147	<i>Identification of timber and other wood products</i>	<i>Parties</i>	Parties are encouraged to collaborate with the Secretariat in sharing relevant information in support of the implementation of Decisions 19.145 and 19.147.
19.147	<i>Identification of timber and other wood products</i>	<i>Plants Committee</i>	<p>The Plants Committee shall, in collaboration with relevant stakeholders and building on information on existing initiatives, and progress to date:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) develop a plan to prioritize the CITES-listed tree species to focus global efforts on developing and sharing identification reference databases and tools, including sampling campaigns for vouchered reference samples; b) prioritize the development of identification material for <i>Dalbergia</i> species, taking into consideration progress made in document PC25 Doc. 34 and document CoP19 Doc. 84.1, and giving attention to frontline identification materials to assist differentiating look-alike species that may not be of conservation concern, such as <i>Dalbergia sissoo</i>; c) develop a list of available techniques and tools, and evaluate their standards and usefulness to species-specific identification and enforcement for CITES-listed tree species and their look-alikes; d) determine gaps in current knowledge sources for CITES timber identification, on their availability and usefulness, and consider challenges and resourcing required to make these tools more widely available to CITES Parties; e) develop standardized information templates and other tools that could be used by Parties to facilitate sharing information on the content and status of wood sample collections, and exchange with research institutions, law enforcement agencies, and other authorities; f) determine methods to stimulate global, regional and national exchange of best practices in wood identification technologies between Parties, including lessons learned on how Parties have built their timber identification capacity and expertise <p>...</p>
19.109	<i>Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)</i>	<i>Parties</i>	<p>Parties are encouraged to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) inform the Secretariat of forensic research projects, including genetic and other methods, undertaken in their territory focusing on the development of techniques to support addressing illegal trade in Asian big cat specimens, for this information to be made available to Parties; b) in accordance with their national regulations, share samples of Asian big cat specimens from living animals, seized animals or products that could contain DNA of Asian big cats with genetic research projects focusing on the development of techniques to address illegal trade in Asian big cat specimens; and c) take note that methods for the identification of tiger species and individual identification from different types of specimens of tiger parts and derivatives have been developed in the Czech Republic, and that analytical kits for use of these methods, as well as testing of tiger samples, are available to Parties free of charge.

18.103 (Rev. CoP19)	<i>Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)</i>	<i>Parties</i>	All Parties that make seizures of tiger skins are encouraged to take note of the information on tiger range States which have photographic identification databases for tigers, and the capacity to identify tigers from photographs of tiger skins, as presented in paragraph 14 in document SC70 Doc. 42.1, and to share images in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19) on Conservation of and trade in tigers and other Appendix-I Asian big cat species, paragraph 1 I) within 90 days of such seizure.
19.123	<i>Tortoises and freshwater turtles (Testudines spp.)</i>	<i>Parties affected by illegal trade in tortoises and freshwater turtles</i>	Parties affected by illegal trade in tortoises and freshwater turtles are encouraged to: ... b) draw the Identification guide to tortoises and freshwater turtles: Parts, products and derivatives in trade to the attention of their national agencies responsible for wildlife law enforcement and promote its use; and c) translate the guide into their national languages where needed and inform the Secretariat about the availability of such translated versions. ...
19.124	<i>Tortoises and freshwater turtles (Testudines spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	Subject to available funding, the Secretariat shall: ... b) develop a CITES App version of the Identification guide to tortoises and freshwater turtles: Parts, products and derivatives in trade, to be made available for use by Parties; and ...
19.194	<i>West African vultures (Accipitridae spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	The Secretariat shall: ... b) subject to external funding, support the production of identification materials focusing on parts and derivatives of vulture species for use by law enforcement officials; ...
19.200	<i>Pangolins (Manis spp.)</i>	<i>Animals Committee</i>	The Animals Committee shall: ... b) review existing identification materials concerning pangolin species, their parts and derivatives, and consider the need for new or additional materials to be developed, including to support the identification of seized pangolin specimens at species level; ...
19.201	<i>Pangolins (Manis spp.)</i>	<i>Parties</i>	All Parties are strongly encouraged to identify seized pangolin specimens at species level and report the seizures at species level in their annual illegal trade reports.
19.203	<i>Pangolins (Manis spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	The Secretariat shall: a) issue a Notification inviting Parties, international organizations, international aid agencies and non-governmental organizations that developed tools and materials that could assist Parties in the implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.10 (Rev. CoP19) or identification materials concerning pangolin species, their parts and derivatives, to bring such materials to the attention of the Secretariat; b) bring any materials reported in accordance with paragraph a) of the present Decision to the attention of the Animals Committee or the Standing Committee, as appropriate, together with any recommendations it may have, and taking into account any subsequent recommendations from the Animals Committee or the Standing Committee, make such materials available to the Parties; c) subject to external funding, provide training to Parties on the identification of pangolin specimens;
19.208	<i>African lions (Panthera</i>	<i>Parties</i>	Parties, including range States and consumer countries of African lion, as relevant, are encouraged to:

	<i>leo</i>)		... b) use, where appropriate, South Africa's Barcode of Wildlife Project to help identify lion specimens in trade and, when importing lion specimens from South Africa, collaborate where necessary with relevant authorities in South Africa to improve the traceability of such specimens;
19.214	<i>Saiga antelope</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	Subject to the availability of external resources, the Secretariat shall: ... c) provide training to strengthen cross-border cooperation in CITES implementation, identification of saiga products and techniques for countering illegal trade; and d) ...
19.224	<i>Sharks and rays (Elasmobranchii spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	The Secretariat shall: a) issue a Notification to the Parties, inviting Parties to: i) in accordance with Resolution Conf 12.6 (Rev. CoP18) on Conservation and management of sharks, provide concise (with 200 word executive summary, if the report exceeds four pages) new information on their shark and ray conservation and management activities, in particular: ... C. the identification and monitoring of CITES-listed shark-products in trade, in source, transit, and consumer Parties ...
19.241	<i>Boswellia trees (Boswellia spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	The Secretariat shall share the report in information document CoP19 Inf. 10 (Rev. 1). with the Plants Committee.* * <i>information document CoP19 Inf. 10 (Rev. 1) concerns with identification challenges, look-alike issues, identification materials and identification technologies for Boswellia spp.</i>
19.242	<i>Boswellia trees (Boswellia spp.)</i>	<i>Plants Committee</i>	The Plants Committee shall: ... b) review the available information submitted by the Secretariat in accordance with Decision 19.241 and the gaps in knowledge identified in document PC25 Doc. 25 on <i>Boswellia trees (Boswellia spp.)</i> to inform possible listing proposals for <i>Boswellia</i> species, including consideration of appropriate annotations consistent with the guidance in Resolution Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP19) on Use of annotations in Appendices I and II.* * <i>the available information submitted by the Secretariat concerns with identification challenges, look-alike issues, identification materials and identification technologies for Boswellia spp.</i>
19.246	<i>Products containing specimens of Appendix II orchids (Orchidaceae spp.)</i>	<i>Secretariat</i>	The Secretariat shall: ... b) subject to availability of external resources, consult with Parties and stakeholders and undertake a study to compile an overview of Appendix-II orchid taxa that are particularly affected by wild harvest for international trade to inform the following assessments: i) an assessment of the conservation impacts of exempting artificially propagated Appendix-II listed orchid taxa from CITES regulations, including as articulated in footnote annotation 10 (after CoP19, footnote annotation P3) of the CITES Appendices, including identification challenges and look-alike issues; and ...

DRAFT TERMS OF REFERENCE

JOINT ANIMALS AND PLANTS COMMITTEE INTERSESSIONAL WORKING GROUP ON MATERIALS FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF SPECIMENS OF CITES-LISTED SPECIES

The joint intersessional working group of the Animals and Plants Committees will, in consultation with the Secretariat:

- a) review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions as well as materials received in response to the Notification to the Parties No. 2023/051;
- b) consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species;
and
- c) report on the progress with these activities to the joint session of the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee and 27th meeting of the Plants Committee.