

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Panama City (Panama), 14 - 25 November 2022

Summary record of the twelfth session for Committee I

22 November 2022: 09h05 – 12h00

Chair: V. Fleming (United Kingdom of Great Britain and
Northern Ireland)

Secretariat: D. Morgan
H. J. Kim
XXXXXX

Rapporteurs: F. Davis
J. Gray
L. Oliveira
S. Rouse

Species specific matters

Maintenance of the Appendices

87. Amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17)

87.1 Proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17)

Namibia introduced document CoP19 Doc. 87.1 containing proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II* to incorporate livelihoods and food security into the criteria for amending the Appendices. Namibia expanded that the purpose of this was to make people integral to the functioning of CITES, rather than side-lined.

Botswana, Cambodia, China, Cuba, Japan, the United Republic of Tanzania, and Zimbabwe supported the proposal, emphasizing that communities living alongside CITES-listed species should benefit from trade in them.

Burkina Faso, Canada, the European Union and its Member States, Gabon, India, Israel, Kenya, Liberia, Mali, Mauritania, Panama, Senegal, Togo, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, and the United States of America opposed the proposal, variously citing: the proposed amendments would alter the remit of CITES; addressing livelihoods issues was the main focus of other bodies; decisions on livelihoods and food security regarding listing proposals should be taken at national level; and CITES provisions, for example as in Section 10 of Annex 6 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) and Resolution Conf. 16.6 (Rev. CoP18) on *CITES and livelihoods*, already stipulated appropriate consultation in the preparation of amendment proposals. Several of these Parties, although opposing the document, stressed they believed implementation of CITES should involve consultation relevant to livelihoods and food security and were open to continued discussion of the means of minimizing negative impacts of proposals on livelihoods. The United States, echoed by Israel and Kenya, did not support such discussions taking place in the intersessional period. India urged Parties to restrain themselves from overuse of Article II 2 b) of the Convention text, whereby species were listed for 'look-alike' reasons, especially where livelihoods depended on these species.

China believed that more time should be devoted to this matter and proposed the following draft decisions:

Directed to the Animals Committee and Plants Committee

19.AA The Animals Committee and Plants Committee, in collaboration with relevant organizations and experts, shall:

- a) develop multi-disciplinary guidance materials that integrate livelihoods, food security and local knowledge into the relevant scientific decision-making framework of the Convention including, but not limited to, the criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II, Non-Detriment Findings, national quotas and Review of Significant Trade, and
- b) report the outcomes of their work to the Standing Committee.

Directed to the Standing Committee

19.BB The Standing Committee shall, reveal the outcome of the implementation of Decision 19. AA and make recommendations to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to address the identified challenges with the aim of considering livelihoods and food security in the decision-making framework of CITES.

Japan noted it had not been consulted as a range State on a proposal to amend the Appendices at the current meeting and proposed the following text be added to the end of Section 10 in Annex 6 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP18): 'The Secretariat will not accept a proposal if the consultation information described above is not provided.'

Citing Rule 23, paragraph 6, of the Rules of Procedure, Israel observed that the amendments to the document proposed by China and Japan should be decided upon by Parties before any decision on document CoP19 Doc. 87.1 in its original form. It also raised a procedural motion to close debate on the proposal under Rule 20.2 d). Panama spoke in favour of the motion; Botswana and Zimbabwe opposed it stressing the need for more time to debate this important matter.

The Chair proceeded to a vote on the procedural motion. With 58 in favour, 57 against and 12 abstentions, the motion to close the debate was accepted.

China and Japan withdrew their proposed amendments to document CoP19 Doc. 87.1 but asked that they be included in the summary record. Noting a lack of consensus on the original proposal, the Chair moved to a vote. With 31 in favour, 86 against and 11 abstentions, the proposal to amend Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP18) in document CoP19 Doc. 87.1 was rejected.

Species specific matters

72. African lions (*Panthera leo*)

The Secretariat introduced document CoP19 Doc. 72 and its annexes, reporting on activities related to African lions as mandated by Decisions adopted at CoP18, including discussions with range States and relevant stakeholders for the implementation of initiatives on conservation of the species. Annex 1 contained revisions of Decisions 18.244, 18.247, 18.249 and 18.250 and a draft decision directed to the Standing Committee.

Congo, the European Union and its Member States, Ghana, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Somalia, Togo, Uganda, the United Republic of Tanzania, the United States of America and Zimbabwe supported the draft decisions in Annex 1, noting that recent inventories across range States indicate continuing decline of African lions.

The United States, echoed by the European Union and its Member States and Humane Society International (HSI), opposed the deletion of Decision 18.246 proposed by the Secretariat, stating that it had not been implemented. To reflect this the United States proposed, with the support of Mali, Senegal, and Zimbabwe, the addition of a new draft decision:

Directed to the Secretariat

19.FF The Secretariat shall:

- a) share relevant information generated through the implementation of Decision 19.DD with the CITES Big Cats Task Force, Standing Committee, or both, as appropriate; and
- b) report on the implementation of the previous Decision 18.246 to the 32nd meeting of the Animals Committee.

The Convention on Migratory Species (CMS) highlighted its cooperation with range States under the African Carnivore Initiative for the restoration of Central and West African populations of African lions.

The Committee accepted the draft decisions in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 72 with the new draft decision proposed by the United States of America and agreed to the deletion of Decisions 18.244, 18.246, 18.247, 18.249 and 18.250.

76. Saiga antelope (*Saiga* spp.)

The Chair of the Animals Committee introduced document CoP19 Doc. 76, drawing attention to the development of the 2020-2025 Medium-Term International Work Programme (MTIWP) for the saiga antelope in collaboration with the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS), and the review of stockpile management information received from Parties. Annex 1 contained proposed draft decisions. The Secretariat had proposed amendments to these under its comments.

Mali and the United States of America expressed their support for the draft decisions in Annex 1, the latter also noting its concerns with the amendments suggested by the Secretariat to draft decision 19.BB that limited mandates to requests by Parties. They also emphasized that any re-exports of saiga antelope from lawful stockpiles should be of specimens with evidence of lawful CITES trade prior to 2005 according to the zero export quota annotation agreed at CoP18.

CMS expressed their support to the draft decisions in Annex 1 and highlighted the implementation of international projects funded by the United States Fish and Wildlife Service under the CITES-CMS Joint Programme. Fauna and Flora International, also speaking on behalf of Environmental Investigation Agency and TRAFFIC, noted their concern with the omission of source, transit and consumer countries from paragraph b) of draft decision 19.AA pointing out that this would hamper effective implementation of the decisions.

The Committee accepted the draft decisions in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc.76 and agreed to delete Decisions 18.270 to 18.274.

58. West African vultures (*Accipitridae* spp.)

On behalf of the Standing Committee, the Secretariat introduced document CoP19 Doc. 58 containing, in Annex 1, new draft decisions on West African vultures (*Accipitridae* spp.) and a recommendation to delete Decisions 18.186 to 18.192. Under Comments of the Secretariat, alternative decisions had been proposed.

Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi, the European Union and its Member States, Ghana, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, the United States of America and HSI expressed support for the draft decisions in Annex 1, variously highlighting the ecological importance of vultures, the multitude of threats facing the taxon, and the need to regulate domestic and cross-border trade in West Africa. The United States indicated that it did not support the amendments to the draft decisions proposed by the Secretariat, apart from its correction to the name of the instrument in paragraph a) of draft decision 19.BB, in the table under Comments of the Secretariat.

CMS indicated its support for the draft decisions in document CoP19 Doc. 58 as amended by the Secretariat and drew attention to a 2021 report by the United Nations Environment Programme World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC) on *West African vultures: A review of trade and sentinel poisoning*.

The Committee accepted draft decisions 19.AA to 19.EE contained in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 58 with the amendment to paragraph a) of draft decision 19.BB made by the Secretariat in the document and the deletion of Decisions 18.186 to 18.192.

74. Songbird trade and conservation management (Passeriformes spp.)

The Chair of the Animals Committee introduced document CoP19 Doc. 74 with proposed revisions of Decisions 18.256 to 18.259 in Annex 1, noting that the main tasks under these Decisions could not be completed due to a lack of funding, but that partial funding had been received from the United States of America for a study of the songbird trade.

The European Union and its Member States, Malaysia, Mali, Singapore, the United States, BirdLife International and HSI supported the renewal of the decisions. The United States noted that the study under draft decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) would be focused on the western hemisphere. Malaysia, supported by HSI, emphasized the need for global assessments of the songbird trade and expressed its hope that the study could be extended to Asia. BirdLife International regarded songbirds as underrepresented in the Appendices despite their presence in legal and illegal trade, and offered its support over the next intersessional period. Mali requested capacity-building and training relating to songbird trade.

The Committee accepted the revision of Decisions 18.256 to 18.259 as presented in Annex 1 to document CoP19 Doc. 74.

60. Conservation of amphibians (Amphibia spp.)

The Chair of the Animals Committee introduced document CoP19 Doc. 60, Annex 1 to which contained draft decisions to extend Decisions 18.194 to 18.196, noting there had been insufficient resources to convene workshops as originally envisaged in Decision 18.194. Minor amendments to draft decisions 19.AA and 19.BB were proposed in the document under Comments of the Secretariat.

The draft decisions were supported by Argentina, Burundi, Colombia, Costa Rica, Eritrea, Guinea, Mali and Peru.

The Committee accepted draft decisions 19.AA to 19.CC in Annex 1 of CoP19 Doc. 60 and the deletion of Decisions 18.194 to 18.196.

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.



Motion Item 87 Proc [22.11.2022 10:12:02 AM]

Quorum: Yes > 50.00%

EU-Vote: individual

YES: 50.43%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	YES
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	YES
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	Not Present
7	ARGENTINA	YES
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	YES
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	Not Present
12	BAHRAIN	Not Present
13	BANGLADESH	YES
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	NO
17	BELIZE	NO
18	BENIN	YES
19	BHUTAN	NO
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	NO
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	NO
23	BRAZIL	ABST
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	NO
26	BURKINA FASO	YES
27	BURUNDI	YES
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	NO
30	CAMEROON	NO
31	CANADA	NO
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	YES
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	YES
35	CHINA	NO
36	COLOMBIA	YES
37	COMOROS	Present
38	CONGO	YES
39	COSTA RICA	NO
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	YES
41	CROATIA	NO
42	CUBA	NO
43	CYPRUS	NO
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	NO
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	NO
46	DENMARK	NO
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	YES



Motion Item 87 Proc [22.11.2022 10:12:02 AM]

50	ECUADOR	ABST
51	EGYPT	NO
52	EL SALVADOR	NO
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	NO
55	ESTONIA	NO
56	ESWATINI	NO
57	ETHIOPIA	YES
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Present
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	NO
61	FRANCE	NO
62	GABON	YES
63	GAMBIA	YES
64	GEORGIA	Not Present
65	GERMANY	NO
66	GHANA	YES
67	GREECE	NO
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	YES
70	GUINEA	YES
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	YES
72	GUYANA	YES
73	HONDURAS	YES
74	HUNGARY	NO
75	ICELAND	YES
76	INDIA	YES
77	INDONESIA	NO
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	NO
81	ISRAEL	YES
82	ITALY	NO
83	JAMAICA	ABST
84	JAPAN	NO
85	JORDAN	YES
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	YES
88	KUWAIT	YES
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	YES
91	LATVIA	NO
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	NO
94	LIBERIA	YES
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	NO
97	LITHUANIA	NO
98	LUXEMBOURG	NO
99	MADAGASCAR	ABST
100	MALAWI	ABST
101	MALAYSIA	YES
102	MALDIVES	YES



Motion Item 87 Proc [22.11.2022 10:12:02 AM]

103	MALI	YES
104	MALTA	NO
105	MAURITANIA	YES
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	YES
108	MONACO	ABST
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	Not Present
111	MOROCCO	YES
112	MOZAMBIQUE	NO
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	NO
115	NEPAL	YES
116	NETHERLANDS	NO
117	NEW ZEALAND	YES
118	NICARAGUA	ABST
119	NIGER	YES
120	NIGERIA	Not Present
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	YES
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	Not Present
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	YES
127	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	ABST
128	PARAGUAY	Not Present
129	PERU	NO
130	PHILIPPINES	YES
131	POLAND	NO
132	PORTUGAL	NO
133	QATAR	Not Allowed
134	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	NO
135	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	YES
136	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
137	ROMANIA	NO
138	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Present
139	RWANDA	Not Allowed
140	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
141	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
142	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
143	SAMOA	Not Present
144	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
145	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
146	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
147	SENEGAL	YES
148	SERBIA	Not Allowed
149	SEYCHELLES	YES
150	SIERRA LEONE	YES
151	SINGAPORE	ABST
152	SLOVAKIA	NO
153	SLOVENIA	NO
154	SOLOMON ISLANDS	ABST
155	SOMALIA	Not Allowed



Motion Item 87 Proc [22.11.2022 10:12:02 AM]

156	SOUTH AFRICA	NO
157	SPAIN	NO
158	SRI LANKA	YES
159	SUDAN	NO
160	SURINAME	Not Present
161	SWEDEN	NO
162	SWITZERLAND	NO
163	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	YES
164	TAJIKISTAN	Present
165	THAILAND	Present
166	TOGO	YES
167	TONGA	YES
168	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	ABST
169	TUNISIA	YES
170	TÜRKIYE	YES
171	UGANDA	NO
172	UKRAINE	YES
173	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	YES
174	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	YES
175	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	NO
176	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	YES
177	URUGUAY	YES
178	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
179	VANUATU	ABST
180	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	Not Present
181	VIET NAM	NO
182	YEMEN	Not Present
183	ZAMBIA	NO
184	ZIMBABWE	NO



Motion Item 87.1 [22.11.2022 10:22:07 AM]

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: individual

YES: 26.50%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	NO
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	ABST
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	Not Present
7	ARGENTINA	NO
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	NO
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	Not Present
12	BAHRAIN	Not Present
13	BANGLADESH	YES
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	NO
17	BELIZE	NO
18	BENIN	NO
19	BHUTAN	YES
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	YES
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	YES
23	BRAZIL	ABST
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	NO
26	BURKINA FASO	NO
27	BURUNDI	NO
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	YES
30	CAMEROON	NO
31	CANADA	NO
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	NO
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	NO
35	CHINA	YES
36	COLOMBIA	NO
37	COMOROS	Not Present
38	CONGO	NO
39	COSTA RICA	ABST
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	NO
41	CROATIA	NO
42	CUBA	YES
43	CYPRUS	NO
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	NO
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	YES
46	DENMARK	NO
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	YES



Motion Item 87.1 [22.11.2022 10:22:07 AM]

50	ECUADOR	YES
51	EGYPT	NO
52	EL SALVADOR	NO
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	NO
55	ESTONIA	NO
56	ESWATINI	YES
57	ETHIOPIA	NO
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Present
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	NO
61	FRANCE	NO
62	GABON	NO
63	GAMBIA	NO
64	GEORGIA	Not Present
65	GERMANY	NO
66	GHANA	NO
67	GREECE	NO
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	NO
70	GUINEA	YES
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	YES
72	GUYANA	ABST
73	HONDURAS	NO
74	HUNGARY	NO
75	ICELAND	NO
76	INDIA	YES
77	INDONESIA	YES
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	NO
81	ISRAEL	NO
82	ITALY	NO
83	JAMAICA	NO
84	JAPAN	YES
85	JORDAN	NO
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	NO
88	KUWAIT	NO
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	NO
91	LATVIA	NO
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	YES
94	LIBERIA	NO
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	NO
97	LITHUANIA	NO
98	LUXEMBOURG	NO
99	MADAGASCAR	ABST
100	MALAWI	YES
101	MALAYSIA	Present
102	MALDIVES	NO



Motion Item 87.1 [22.11.2022 10:22:07 AM]

103	MALI	NO
104	MALTA	NO
105	MAURITANIA	NO
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	NO
108	MONACO	NO
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	Not Present
111	MOROCCO	NO
112	MOZAMBIQUE	YES
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	YES
115	NEPAL	YES
116	NETHERLANDS	NO
117	NEW ZEALAND	NO
118	NICARAGUA	Present
119	NIGER	NO
120	NIGERIA	Not Present
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	NO
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	Not Present
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	NO
127	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	NO
128	PARAGUAY	Not Present
129	PERU	NO
130	PHILIPPINES	YES
131	POLAND	NO
132	PORTUGAL	NO
133	QATAR	Not Allowed
134	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	NO
135	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	NO
136	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
137	ROMANIA	NO
138	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Present
139	RWANDA	Not Allowed
140	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
141	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
142	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
143	SAMOA	Not Present
144	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
145	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
146	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
147	SENEGAL	NO
148	SERBIA	Not Allowed
149	SEYCHELLES	YES
150	SIERRA LEONE	YES
151	SINGAPORE	NO
152	SLOVAKIA	NO
153	SLOVENIA	NO
154	SOLOMON ISLANDS	YES
155	SOMALIA	Not Allowed



Motion Item 87.1 [22.11.2022 10:22:07 AM]

156	SOUTH AFRICA	YES
157	SPAIN	NO
158	SRI LANKA	NO
159	SUDAN	NO
160	SURINAME	Not Present
161	SWEDEN	NO
162	SWITZERLAND	NO
163	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	NO
164	TAJIKISTAN	Present
165	THAILAND	ABST
166	TOGO	NO
167	TONGA	NO
168	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	ABST
169	TUNISIA	NO
170	TÜRKIYE	NO
171	UGANDA	YES
172	UKRAINE	ABST
173	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	NO
174	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	NO
175	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	YES
176	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	NO
177	URUGUAY	NO
178	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
179	VANUATU	ABST
180	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	ABST
181	VIET NAM	YES
182	YEMEN	ABST
183	ZAMBIA	YES
184	ZIMBABWE	YES