

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Panama City (Panama), 14 – 25 November 2022

Summary record of the tenth session for Committee I

21 November 2022: 09h10 - 12h00

Chair: V. Fleming (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland)

Secretariat: I. Higuero
K. Gaynor
D. Morgan
J.C. Vasquez

Rapporteurs: A. Caromel
F. Davis
J. Gray
L. Oliveira

Proposals to amend the Appendices

89. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 2 to transfer the population of *Ceratotherium simum simum* of Namibia from Appendix I to Appendix II with the exclusive purpose of allowing international trade in live animals for *in-situ* conservation only; and in hunting trophies, was introduced by Namibia. It remarked that the population of southern white rhinoceros in Namibia did not meet the biological criteria for listing in Appendix I, and that necessary control and enforcement measures were in place and had proven effective. It hoped that trade would help create viable subpopulations and also help in the wider conservation of the species by allowing exports of live animals to other countries.

Benin, Congo, Israel, Kenya, Niger, Panama, Senegal, the Environmental Investigation Agency (USA) (EIA – USA), speaking also on behalf of a number of other observer organizations, opposed the proposal. Panama, echoed by EIA – USA, felt that the proposal did not provide sufficient detail on certain aspects of status and management, for example on how trophies would support conservation and local communities. The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland also questioned this. Namibia clarified that a trust fund had been created by its government to ensure that the money raised from rhinoceroses on public land would be invested in conservation.

Botswana as co-proponent, Cambodia, China, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Eswatini, Japan, Mexico, Mozambique, South Africa, the United Republic of Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe, the International Council for Game and Wildlife Conservation, speaking also on behalf a number of other sustainable use observer organizations, and World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF), supported the proposal. They variously considered that the population did not meet the biological criteria for listing in Appendix I, recognized the need for incentives to continue effective conservation, and noted that the proposal was precautionary. The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland expressed support contingent upon clarification on the number of trophies likely to be exported annually and their impact on the rhinoceros population.

The European Union and its Member States, supported by the Central African Republic and Uganda, recognizing Namibia's successful rhinoceros management, but noting that populations remained small, proposed that and only within the species's natural and historical range in Africa be added to the end of paragraph a) of the proposed annotation and that paragraph b) of the annotation be deleted. Namibia and Botswana as proponents accepted this.

The Chair moved to a vote on the proposal as amended by the European Union and its Member States. With 83 voting in favour, 31 against and 13 abstaining, proposal CoP19 Prop. 2 to transfer the population of *Ceratotherium simum simum* of Namibia from Appendix I to Appendix II with the annotation: "For the exclusive purpose of allowing international trade of live animals for *in-situ* conservation only, and only within the species' natural and historical range in Africa. All other specimens shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix I and the trade in them shall be regulated accordingly." was accepted.

Eswatini introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 3** for the removal of the existing annotation on the Appendix-II listing of Eswatini's population of *Ceratotherium simum simum* highlighting the progress made in the management of the species and the reduction in poaching in the country, and stating that such measures represented high costs to the country and that alternative financing was required. The proponent also introduced an amendment to their proposal by adding the following text: An 18-month delay in exercising such an annotation removal shall apply to give the CITES Secretariat and identified trading States time to ensure that all trade control mechanisms are properly and transparently negotiated and implemented. Such oversight shall apply to every consignment.

Botswana, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Japan, Lesotho, Mozambique, Namibia, the United Republic of Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe, and the International Association for Wildlife supported the proposal, noting that rhinoceros conservation measures implemented by Eswatini had significant costs, and range States should receive appropriate funding support for the continuance of sustainable conservation initiatives, particularly following the decline in tourism revenue as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Congo, the European Union and its Member States, Ghana, Israel, Kenya, Niger, Nigeria, Panama, Rwanda, Senegal, Uganda, the United Kingdom and Born Free Foundation (also speaking on behalf of a number of other observer organizations), opposed the proposal, stating that removal of the amendment would increase trafficking and pose challenges to the conservation of the species in other range States. Eswatini invited suggestions from opposing Parties of alternative mechanisms to fund conservation initiatives in their country.

The Chair called for a vote on the proposal as amended by Eswatini. With 15 in favour, 85 against and 26 abstentions, proposal CoP19 Prop. 3 to remove the existing annotation on the Appendix-II listing of Eswatini's population of *Ceratotherium simum simum* and add a new annotation as detailed by Eswatini was rejected.

Mexico introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 6** to transfer *Cynomys mexicanus* from Appendix I to Appendix II, noting the proposal was based on the outcome of the Animals Committee's Periodic Review of the Appendices.

Argentina, Belize, Canada, Costa Rica, Cuba, the European Union and its Member States, Israel and Peru supported the proposal, agreeing that international trade did not pose a threat to the species. Israel and Panama queried the rationale for transferring the species to Appendix II. Mexico clarified that the species no longer met the criteria for listing and that the proposal represented the first step towards removal from the Appendices.

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 6 for the transfer of *Cynomys mexicanus* from Appendix I to Appendix II was accepted by consensus.

The United States of America introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 7** for the transfer of *Branta canadensis leucopareia* from Appendix I to Appendix II based on the outcome of the Periodic Review of the Appendices.

Argentina, Benin, Cambodia, Cameroon, Costa Rica, Guatemala, Mexico, New Zealand, Peru, Senegal and the United Republic of Tanzania supported the proposal and congratulated the United States on its successful recovery of the taxon.

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 7 for the transfer of *Branta canadensis leucopareia* from Appendix I to Appendix II was accepted by consensus.

Malaysia and Singapore introduced **proposal CoP19 Prop. 8** to include *Kittacincla malabarica* in Appendix II emphasizing the increasing threat to the species from trapping and trafficking for the local and international songbird trade.

Australia, Bangladesh, Canada, China, the European Union and its Member States, Gabon, India, Indonesia, the Lao People's Democratic Republic, Mexico, Nepal, Panama, the Philippines, Senegal, Seychelles, Thailand and Viet Nam supported the proposal.

Indonesia, as a range State of *Kittacincla malabarica*, sought an 18-month delay to the entry into force of the inclusion in Appendix-II. Co-proponents Malaysia and Singapore stated a preference to include the species in Appendix II with no delay as originally proposed and Indonesia noted they would not block consensus.

India requested an objection be noted to the political boundaries of countries indicated in the maps in Figures 1 and 2 of the proposal.

Proposal CoP19 Prop. 8 for the inclusion of *Kittacincla malabarica* in Appendix II was accepted by consensus.

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.



Motion Prop 2 [21.11.2022 10:13:56 AM]

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 72.81%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	NO
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	Not Allowed
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	YES
7	ARGENTINA	NO
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	ABST
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	YES
12	BAHRAIN	Not Present
13	BANGLADESH	YES
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	YES (eu)
17	BELIZE	YES
18	BENIN	NO
19	BHUTAN	YES
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	NO
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	YES
23	BRAZIL	YES
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	YES (eu)
26	BURKINA FASO	NO
27	BURUNDI	Not Present
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	YES
30	CAMEROON	YES
31	CANADA	YES
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	NO
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	ABST
35	CHINA	YES
36	COLOMBIA	YES
37	COMOROS	ABST
38	CONGO	NO
39	COSTA RICA	NO
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	NO
41	CROATIA	YES (eu)
42	CUBA	YES
43	CYPRUS	YES (eu)
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	YES (eu)
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	YES
46	DENMARK	YES (eu)
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	NO



Motion Prop 2 [21.11.2022 10:13:56 AM]

50	ECUADOR	YES
51	EGYPT	Not Present
52	EL SALVADOR	NO
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	YES
55	ESTONIA	YES (eu)
56	ESWATINI	YES
57	ETHIOPIA	NO
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Voted
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	YES (eu)
61	FRANCE	YES (eu)
62	GABON	NO
63	GAMBIA	Not Present
64	GEORGIA	YES
65	GERMANY	YES (eu)
66	GHANA	NO
67	GREECE	YES (eu)
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	NO
70	GUINEA	NO
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	Not Present
72	GUYANA	YES
73	HONDURAS	NO
74	HUNGARY	YES (eu)
75	ICELAND	YES
76	INDIA	YES
77	INDONESIA	YES
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	YES (eu)
81	ISRAEL	NO
82	ITALY	YES (eu)
83	JAMAICA	YES
84	JAPAN	YES
85	JORDAN	NO
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	NO
88	KUWAIT	NO
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	ABST
91	LATVIA	YES (eu)
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	YES
94	LIBERIA	Not Present
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	YES
97	LITHUANIA	YES (eu)
98	LUXEMBOURG	YES (eu)
99	MADAGASCAR	YES
100	MALAWI	YES
101	MALAYSIA	NO
102	MALDIVES	ABST



Motion Prop 2 [21.11.2022 10:13:56 AM]

103	MALI	NO
104	MALTA	YES (eu)
105	MAURITANIA	NO
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	YES
108	MONACO	YES
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	YES
111	MOROCCO	Not Present
112	MOZAMBIQUE	YES
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	YES
115	NEPAL	Present
116	NETHERLANDS	YES (eu)
117	NEW ZEALAND	NO
118	NICARAGUA	ABST
119	NIGER	NO
120	NIGERIA	NO
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	YES
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	Not Present
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	ABST
127	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	YES
128	PARAGUAY	YES
129	PERU	YES
130	PHILIPPINES	YES
131	POLAND	YES (eu)
132	PORTUGAL	YES (eu)
133	QATAR	Not Allowed
134	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	YES (eu)
135	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	NO
136	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
137	ROMANIA	YES (eu)
138	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Not Present
139	RWANDA	Not Allowed
140	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
141	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
142	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
143	SAMOA	YES
144	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
145	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
146	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
147	SENEGAL	NO
148	SERBIA	Not Allowed
149	SEYCHELLES	ABST
150	SIERRA LEONE	YES
151	SINGAPORE	ABST
152	SLOVAKIA	YES (eu)
153	SLOVENIA	YES (eu)
154	SOLOMON ISLANDS	YES
155	SOMALIA	Not Allowed



Motion Prop 2 [21.11.2022 10:13:56 AM]

156	SOUTH AFRICA	YES
157	SPAIN	YES (eu)
158	SRI LANKA	ABST
159	SUDAN	Not Present
160	SURINAME	YES
161	SWEDEN	YES (eu)
162	SWITZERLAND	YES
163	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	NO
164	TAJIKISTAN	Not Allowed
165	THAILAND	YES
166	TOGO	Not Present
167	TONGA	YES
168	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	ABST
169	TUNISIA	NO
170	TÜRKIYE	YES
171	UGANDA	YES
172	UKRAINE	Not Allowed
173	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	ABST
174	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	YES
175	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	YES
176	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	YES
177	URUGUAY	YES
178	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
179	VANUATU	YES
180	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	Not Present
181	VIET NAM	YES
182	YEMEN	ABST
183	ZAMBIA	YES
184	ZIMBABWE	YES



Motion Prop 3 [21.11.2022 11:01:31 AM]

Quorum: Yes > 66.66%

EU-Vote: block

YES: 15.00%

1	AFGHANISTAN	Not Allowed
2	ALBANIA	Not Allowed
3	ALGERIA	Not Present
4	ANDORRA	Not Allowed
5	ANGOLA	Not Allowed
6	ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA	YES
7	ARGENTINA	NO
8	ARMENIA	Not Allowed
9	AUSTRALIA	NO
10	AZERBAIJAN	Not Allowed
11	BAHAMAS	ABST
12	BAHRAIN	Not Present
13	BANGLADESH	NO
14	BARBADOS	Not Allowed
15	BELARUS	Not Allowed
16	BELGIUM	NO (eu)
17	BELIZE	YES
18	BENIN	NO
19	BHUTAN	ABST
20	BOLIVIA (PLURINATIONAL STATE OF)	NO
21	BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA	Not Allowed
22	BOTSWANA	YES
23	BRAZIL	ABST
24	BRUNEI DARUSSALAM	Not Allowed
25	BULGARIA	NO (eu)
26	BURKINA FASO	NO
27	BURUNDI	NO
28	CABO VERDE	Not Allowed
29	CAMBODIA	ABST
30	CAMEROON	ABST
31	CANADA	NO
32	CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC	NO
33	CHAD	Not Allowed
34	CHILE	NO
35	CHINA	YES
36	COLOMBIA	ABST
37	COMOROS	Present
38	CONGO	NO
39	COSTA RICA	NO
40	CÔTE D'IVOIRE	NO
41	CROATIA	NO (eu)
42	CUBA	NO
43	CYPRUS	NO (eu)
44	CZECH REPUBLIC	NO (eu)
45	DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC OF THE CONGO	YES
46	DENMARK	NO (eu)
47	DJIBOUTI	Not Allowed
48	DOMINICA	Not Allowed
49	DOMINICAN REPUBLIC	NO



Motion Prop 3 [21.11.2022 11:01:31 AM]

50	ECUADOR	NO
51	EGYPT	Not Present
52	EL SALVADOR	ABST
53	EQUATORIAL GUINEA	Not Allowed
54	ERITREA	NO
55	ESTONIA	NO (eu)
56	ESWATINI	YES
57	ETHIOPIA	NO
58	EUROPEAN UNION	Voted
59	FIJI	Not Present
60	FINLAND	NO (eu)
61	FRANCE	NO (eu)
62	GABON	NO
63	GAMBIA	NO
64	GEORGIA	Not Present
65	GERMANY	NO (eu)
66	GHANA	NO
67	GREECE	NO (eu)
68	GRENADA	Not Allowed
69	GUATEMALA	NO
70	GUINEA	NO
71	GUINEA-BISSAU	NO
72	GUYANA	ABST
73	HONDURAS	NO
74	HUNGARY	NO (eu)
75	ICELAND	NO
76	INDIA	NO
77	INDONESIA	ABST
78	IRAN (ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF)	Not Allowed
79	IRAQ	Not Allowed
80	IRELAND	NO (eu)
81	ISRAEL	NO
82	ITALY	NO (eu)
83	JAMAICA	NO
84	JAPAN	YES
85	JORDAN	Not Present
86	KAZAKHSTAN	Not Allowed
87	KENYA	NO
88	KUWAIT	NO
89	KYRGYZSTAN	Not Allowed
90	LAO PEOPLE'S DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC	ABST
91	LATVIA	NO (eu)
92	LEBANON	Not Allowed
93	LESOTHO	YES
94	LIBERIA	Not Present
95	LIBYA	Not Allowed
96	LIECHTENSTEIN	NO
97	LITHUANIA	NO (eu)
98	LUXEMBOURG	NO (eu)
99	MADAGASCAR	YES
100	MALAWI	ABST
101	MALAYSIA	NO
102	MALDIVES	ABST



Motion Prop 3 [21.11.2022 11:01:31 AM]

103	MALI	NO
104	MALTA	NO (eu)
105	MAURITANIA	NO
106	MAURITIUS	Not Allowed
107	MEXICO	ABST
108	MONACO	ABST
109	MONGOLIA	Not Allowed
110	MONTENEGRO	Not Present
111	MOROCCO	Not Present
112	MOZAMBIQUE	YES
113	MYANMAR	Not Allowed
114	NAMIBIA	YES
115	NEPAL	NO
116	NETHERLANDS	NO (eu)
117	NEW ZEALAND	NO
118	NICARAGUA	ABST
119	NIGER	NO
120	NIGERIA	NO
121	NORTH MACEDONIA	Not Allowed
122	NORWAY	NO
123	OMAN	Not Allowed
124	PAKISTAN	ABST
125	PALAU	Not Allowed
126	PANAMA	NO
127	PAPUA NEW GUINEA	ABST
128	PARAGUAY	YES
129	PERU	Present
130	PHILIPPINES	NO
131	POLAND	NO (eu)
132	PORTUGAL	NO (eu)
133	QATAR	Not Allowed
134	REPUBLIC OF AUSTRIA	NO (eu)
135	REPUBLIC OF KOREA	NO
136	REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	Not Allowed
137	ROMANIA	NO (eu)
138	RUSSIAN FEDERATION	Not Present
139	RWANDA	Not Allowed
140	SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS	Not Allowed
141	SAINT LUCIA	Not Allowed
142	SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES	Not Allowed
143	SAMOA	ABST
144	SAN MARINO	Not Allowed
145	SAO TOME AND PRINCIPE	Not Allowed
146	SAUDI ARABIA	Not Allowed
147	SENEGAL	NO
148	SERBIA	Not Allowed
149	SEYCHELLES	ABST
150	SIERRA LEONE	Present
151	SINGAPORE	ABST
152	SLOVAKIA	NO (eu)
153	SLOVENIA	NO (eu)
154	SOLOMON ISLANDS	NO
155	SOMALIA	Not Allowed



Motion Prop 3 [21.11.2022 11:01:31 AM]

156	SOUTH AFRICA	ABST
157	SPAIN	NO (eu)
158	SRI LANKA	NO
159	SUDAN	Not Present
160	SURINAME	ABST
161	SWEDEN	NO (eu)
162	SWITZERLAND	NO
163	SYRIAN ARAB REPUBLIC	NO
164	TAJIKISTAN	Not Allowed
165	THAILAND	NO
166	TOGO	NO
167	TONGA	ABST
168	TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO	ABST
169	TUNISIA	NO
170	TÜRKIYE	NO
171	UGANDA	NO
172	UKRAINE	Not Allowed
173	UNITED ARAB EMIRATES	ABST
174	UNITED KINGDOM OF GREAT BRITAIN AND NORTHERN IR	NO
175	UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA	YES
176	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	NO
177	URUGUAY	NO
178	UZBEKISTAN	Not Allowed
179	VANUATU	NO
180	VENEZUELA (BOLIVARIAN REPUBLIC OF)	Not Present
181	VIET NAM	NO
182	YEMEN	ABST
183	ZAMBIA	YES
184	ZIMBABWE	YES