

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Panama City (Panama), 14 – 25 November 2022

Interpretation or implementation matters

Regulation of trade

Identification materials

REVIEW OF RESOLUTION CONF. 11.19 (REV. COP16)
ON IDENTIFICATION MANUAL

1. This document is submitted by the Standing Committee.*

Background

2. At the 18th meeting (Geneva, 2019), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decisions 18.135 to 18.139 on *Identification materials* as follows:

Directed to the Secretariat

18.135 *The Secretariat shall:*

- a) *continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES Website and the CITES Virtual College; and*
- b) *subject to the availability of external funding, and with input from the joint working group called for under Decision 18.137, revise and redesign the CITES Virtual College in order to make the identification materials available in a more user-friendly manner.*

Directed to the Secretariat

18.136 *The Secretariat shall undertake a review of Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) on Identification Manual. It shall:*

- a) *collect and compile information on the current state of species identification activities and needs, and assess their relevance for the review of Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16);*
- b) *consider whether Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) would best be revised or replaced with a new resolution on Identification of specimens of CITES-listed species, and prepare a draft text of the revised or new resolution;*
- c) *propose a revised resolution in consultation with the Animals and Plants Committees and the Standing Committee; and*

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

- d) *report on the progress and make recommendations at the meetings of the Animals and Plants Committees, and the meeting of the Standing Committee, as appropriate.*

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

18.137 *The Animals and Plants Committees shall establish a joint working group on identification materials that are used by Parties to identify CITES-listed species and provide inputs to the Secretariat based on the outcomes of the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:*

- a) *review selected identification materials, including material compiled as per Decision 18.136 paragraph a), and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;*
- b) *review Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) on Identification Manual, taking into account the review outlined in Decision 18.137 paragraphs a) and c), to promote accuracy and availability of identification materials;*
- c) *consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species; and*
- d) *report on progress with these activities at the next meetings of the Animals and Plants Committees.*

Directed to the Standing Committee

18.138 *The Standing Committee shall:*

- a) *provide inputs on the draft resolution text prepared by the Secretariat and revised by the Animals and Plants Committees, to ensure that the needs for identification materials expressed by Parties and authorities responsible for wildlife law enforcement are taken into account; and*
- b) *submit the revised draft resolution to the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting.*

Directed to the Parties

18.139 *Parties are encouraged to support the efforts of the working group on identification materials by providing to the Secretariat information on available identification and guidance materials that are used by Parties, and particularly by enforcement and inspection officers, to facilitate implementation of the Convention.*

A new resolution on species identification

3. At its 74th meeting (SC74, Lyon, March 2022), the Standing Committee considered document [SC74 Doc. 46](#) on *Identification materials* prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with the Animals and Plants Committees and noted the progress made in implementation of Decisions 18.135 to 18.137.
4. The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP19) the draft resolution on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species* contained in Annex 1 to the present document. The draft resolution will replace Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) on *Identification Manual* and was developed based on the review of Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) carried out by the joint working group on identification materials established by the Animals and Plants Committees ([AC31 Doc. 15/PC25 Doc. 18, Addendum](#)) working in collaboration with the Secretariat. The draft resolution was prepared by the joint working group in collaboration with the Secretariat and revised by the joint sessions of the 31st meeting of the Animals Committee and the 25th meeting of the Plants Committee (online, June 2021).
5. The Standing Committee further agreed to submit two alternative sets of draft decisions for the consideration of the CoP. The first set of draft decisions would be proposed for adoption should the CoP agree to adopt the new resolution. The second would be proposed in the case where the CoP decided not to adopt the proposed new resolution. The draft decisions are set out in Annex 2 and 3 to the present document.

Progress to date: other activities of the Secretariat

6. Since CoP18, the Secretariat has undertaken or initiated the following activities pursuant to Decisions 18.135 and as part of its continued efforts to collect identification materials on CITES-listed species and improve their accuracy and availability through the CITES website and the CITES Virtual College:
 - a) The Secretariat, in cooperation with the United Nations Environment Programme-World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), has made available a scan of the *CITES Identification Manual* on the CITES website and by searching on the [CITES Checklist](#) and [Species+](#). The Secretariat is considering adding further functionalities.
 - b) The Secretariat, in cooperation with World Wildlife Fund – United States of America (WWF-US), TRAFFIC and the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (US-FWS) published the 4th edition of the *Identification guide for ivory and ivory substitutes*. It is available as a printed booklet and in an electronic version on the [CITES website](#) in English, French and Spanish.
 - c) The Secretariat is currently developing an updated CITES Virtual College, which includes a searchable database of identification materials. The updated Virtual College is expected to be launched in 2022.

Recommendations

7. The Conference of the Parties is invited to:
 - a) adopt the draft resolution on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species*, as contained in Annex 1 to the present document;
 - b) adopt the draft decisions contained in Annex 2, subject to adoption of the new draft resolution on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species*; and
 - c) delete Decisions 18.135 to 18.139 as they have been implemented.
8. Should the Conference of the Parties decide not to adopt the draft resolution contained in Annex 1 and the draft decisions contained in Annex 2, the Conference of the Parties is invited to adopt the draft decisions contained in Annex 3 to the present document.

COMMENTS OF THE SECRETARIAT

- A. The Secretariat recommends the adoption of the draft resolution on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species* with a few minor changes in the text as shown below

Added text shown underlined and deleted text shown in ~~strike through~~

2. DIRECTS the Secretariat to:

....

- c) where available and practical to do so, continue to link identification materials to existing ~~electronic~~ lists of species, or higher order groupings of species, in the CITES Appendices on the CITES website;

ANNEX TO THE RESOLUTION

- Uses and known trading patterns, and routes
- B. With respect to the draft decisions contained in Annex 2, the Secretariat notes that the activities called for therein are covered by the proposed new resolution in the following way:
 - Draft decision 19.AA repeats in part and in different terms the obligations of the Animals and Plants Committees set out in the proposed new resolution. In addition, it directs the two Committees to establish a joint working group; the Secretariat considers that it should be for the Committees themselves to determine how they discharge obligations like the ones set out in the Resolution;

- Draft decision 19.BB seems to repeat what is in paragraph 2 of the proposed resolution; and
 - Draft decision 19.CC seems to repeat paragraph 4 of the draft resolution.
- C. Overall, the Secretariat considers that the proposed resolution if adopted would make the draft decisions unnecessary; the Secretariat therefore recommends that the CoP not adopt the draft decisions in Annex 2.
- D. If the proposed resolution is not adopted, the Secretariat recommends that the Conference of the Parties adopt the alternative draft decisions, contained in Annex 3 to the present document with the following changes (Proposed deletions are indicated in ~~strike through~~):

19.AA Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

The Animals and Plants Committees shall:

- a) establish a joint working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:
 - i) continue to draft the proposed new resolution on identification materials if necessary; ~~[to be deleted if the Conference of the Parties adopts the resolution]~~
 - ii) review selected identification materials, including material compiled as per Decision 18.136 paragraph a), and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;
 - iii) consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species; and
 - iv) report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Animals and Plants Committees; and
- b) submit the proposed new resolution on identification materials to the Standing Committee for inputs and onward submission to the Conference of the Parties. ~~[to be deleted if the Conference of the Parties adopts the resolution]~~

19.BB Directed to the Secretariat

The Secretariat shall:

- a) continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES Website and the CITES Virtual College;
- b) provide inputs to the proposed new resolution on identification materials drafted by the joint working group on identification materials called for in Decision 19.AA; and
- c) report on the progress and make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.

Directed to the Standing Committee

~~[to be deleted if the Conference of the Parties adopts the resolution]~~

19.CC The Standing Committee shall:

- a) provide inputs on the draft resolution text prepared by the Animals and Plants Committees to ensure that the needs for identification materials expressed by Parties and authorities responsible for wildlife law enforcement are taken into account; and
- b) submit the revised draft resolution to the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting.

DRAFT RESOLUTION ON MATERIALS FOR THE IDENTIFICATION OF
SPECIMENTS OF CITES-LISTED SPECIES

Conf. 19.X Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species

RECALLING that the definition of “specimen” in Article I, paragraph (b) includes any animals or plants, whether alive or dead, and includes readily recognizable parts and derivatives thereof unless otherwise annotated in the Appendices;

RECALLING that Article II, paragraph, 4 states that the Parties shall not allow trade in specimens of species included in Appendices I, II, and III except in accordance with the provisions of the Convention;

RECALLING that the provisions of Article XII, paragraph 2 (f), require the Secretariat to publish periodically and distribute to the Parties current editions of Appendices I, II and III together with any information which will facilitate identification of specimens of species included in those Appendices;

RECALLING that paragraph C. 9. “Information on similar species” in Annex 6 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II* resolves that Parties provide details on how species proposed for listing are to be distinguished from similar species;

RECALLING the interpretation of the term “readily recognizable part or derivative” in Resolution Conf. 9.6 (Rev. CoP16) on *Trade in readily recognizable parts and derivatives*;

NOTING that accurate identification of animal and plant specimens is important to determine whether and which provisions of the Convention apply to their international trade, including, where appropriate, identification that a species belongs to a higher order (e.g., genus or family) listing, as well as the identification of commodities in trade;

NOTING that CITES authorities and enforcement officials need to be able to recognize specimens of CITES-listed species in international trade in a timely, practical, accurate and effective manner;

NOTING that identification methods continue to advance and diversify;

RECOGNIZING that new electronic formats for providing identification materials are rapidly evolving, and can continue to assist CITES authorities and enforcement officials to identify specimens in international trade;

NOTING that CITES authorities and enforcement officials will not always have access to real-time electronic databases and may have to rely on printed or printable materials;

RECOGNIZING the usefulness of developing or making available identification materials in the working languages of the Convention;

AWARE that information facilitating the identification of animal and plant specimens has been and may continue to be developed as a result of various CITES processes, including through amendments to the Appendices, Resolutions and Decisions, and recommendations and agenda item discussions of the Conference of the Parties and of the Committees; and

RECALLING that the CITES Identification Manual was begun in 1977 and continued through Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) on *Identification Manual*. However, much of the information has become outdated since it has not been updated since 2009.

THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION

1. ENCOURAGES the development of identification materials that include key elements particularly useful to identifying species and specimens thereof in trade, as presented in the Annex to the present Resolution;
2. DIRECTS the Secretariat to:
 - a) regularly review and analyze the materials produced by or for Parties to assist in identification of specimens of CITES-listed species and gaps in existing identification materials relative to the needs expressed by the Parties, and provide a summary of this to the Animals and Plants Committees;
 - b) publish and maintain in a centralized location on the CITES website access to identification materials in a timely and practical manner and in a format that is readily available for CITES authorities and enforcement officials to use, and make updates as new electronic formats evolve;
 - c) where available and practical to do so, continue to link identification materials to existing electronic lists of species, or higher order groupings of species, in the CITES Appendices;
 - d) upon request from a Party and subject to the availability of financial and human resources, provide advice in coordination with the Chair of the Animals or Plants Committee on the identification of species or particular specimens, or seek advice from experts on the taxa concerned and, where relevant, share this information through the CITES website;
 - e) assist Parties in developing and promulgating national or regional identification materials, enlisting input from the appropriate technical committees or specialist organizations when possible;
 - f) keep the Standing, Animals and Plants Committees informed of progress made and needs identified in the development and maintenance of identification materials, as appropriate; and
 - g) report progress and developments to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate;
3. REQUESTS the Animals and Plants Committees to:
 - a) identify where materials are lacking or inaccurate, or where improvements might be made on existing identification materials, taking into consideration information on gaps and needs identified by Parties and the Secretariat, and make recommendations when appropriate to prioritize development of new or updated materials;
 - b) provide input and recommendations to Parties and the Secretariat concerning the development of new or updated identification materials, or where draft materials are submitted for input; and
 - c) identify and suggest to the Secretariat improvements to the access of CITES identification materials;
4. RECOMMENDS that Parties:
 - a) provide identification information to the extent possible in the proposals for amendment of the Appendices, including information outlined in the Annex to this Resolution, and in the case of proposals to amend Appendix I or II, in paragraphs C. 1. "Taxonomy", 3. "Species characteristics" and 9. "Information on similar species" in Annex 6 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II*;
 - b) continue to develop and share national, regional, or taxon-based guides to the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species, especially for those specimens that are commonly traded and/or found in their country or region, and when practicable include in these identification materials for commonly traded species that are not listed on the CITES Appendices to assist in identifying and differentiating between listed and unlisted species;
 - c) coordinate with other Parties in the development of identification materials, as appropriate;

- d) develop or make available identification materials in the working languages of the Convention, as well as other languages used by Parties where appropriate;
 - e) develop and promote the use of rapid, accurate and inexpensive techniques to identify species in trade, especially for identifying specimens that are traded in a highly processed or modified form, or where derivatives of multiple species are combined, which may include molecular or isotope techniques, digitized field guides, apps, or other tools being developed for identification;
 - f) raise awareness of the availability of identification materials and techniques that are used by CITES authorities and enforcement and inspection officers to facilitate the implementation of the Convention, through training programmes for customs and border officials;
 - g) inform the Animals or Plants Committee of any difficulties experienced in identifying particular taxonomic groups, species or specimens, where improved identification guidance would be beneficial, for consideration and any appropriate recommendation under paragraph 3; and
 - h) consider submitting draft identification material under development to the Animals or Plants Committee to review and provide input, as appropriate.
5. INVITES any Party having submitted a proposal for an amendment of Appendix I or II in accordance with Article XV, or having submitted a species for inclusion in Appendix III in accordance with Article XVI, that results in the inclusion of a new species or in new annotations in the Appendices, to:
- a) develop identification materials as expeditiously as possible, and where possible before such amendments become effective; and
 - b) provide the Secretariat with identification materials to be published on the CITES website and otherwise shared with CITES Parties;
6. ENCOURAGES Parties and organizations to provide funds to assist in the production and publication of identification materials; and
7. REPEALS Resolution Conf. 11.19 (Rev. CoP16) on *Identification Manual*.

ANNEX TO THE RESOLUTION

To support implementation and enforcement for CITES-listed species, the following key information should be considered when developing CITES identification materials to provide information specific to the identification of CITES-listed species and commodities in trade.

The development of CITES identification materials should be guided by the need to recognize both *species* and *specimens* thereof and provide information of sufficient quality and detail, to aid enforcement authorities to distinguish between CITES and non-CITES-listed species and commodities.

Main elements: The following information might be considered fundamental to all CITES identification materials:

- Order / Family / Genus / Species
- Synonyms
- Vernacular Names (multi languages, as available)
- Description - Identifying features may include morphological, anatomical, physiological, behavioural, or molecular information
- Images – Consider including line drawings or diagnostic images; colour photos of specimens and commodities in trade; finished products
- Geographic range
- Distribution by country
- Protection [Appendix I, II, or III]
- Uses and known trading patterns
- Parts and derivatives in trade (description)
- Verifiable methods for distinguishing wild from non-wild specimens
- Similar species or commodities

Additional information pertinent to specific groups of traded specimens, such as:

- Pharmaceutical names, characteristics of the parts and derivatives in trade (odour, taste, other characteristics) for species of plants or animals traded for medicinal purposes
- As appropriate, available information on conversion metrics

References:

- Author, affiliation, date

DRAFT DECISIONS ON MATERIALS FOR THE IDENTIFICATION
OF SPECIMENS OF CITES-LISTED SPECIES

For adoption should the Conference of the Parties adopt the draft resolution in Annex 1

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

19.AA The Animals and Plants Committees shall establish a joint working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:

- a) review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;
- b) consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species; and
- c) report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Animals and Plants Committees.

Directed to the Secretariat

19.BB The Secretariat shall:

- a) continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES website and the CITES Virtual College; and
- b) report on the progress and make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.

Directed to Parties

19.CC Parties are encouraged to support the efforts of the working group on identification materials by providing to the Secretariat information on available identification and guidance materials that are used by Parties, and particularly by enforcement and inspection officers, to facilitate implementation of the Convention.

ALTERNATIVE DRAFT DECISIONS ON MATERIALS FOR THE IDENTIFICATION
OF SPECIMENS OF CITES-LISTED SPECIES

Alternative set of draft Decisions should the Conference of the Parties not adopt the draft resolution in Annex 1

Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees

19.AA The Animals and Plants Committees shall:

- a) establish a joint working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:
 - i) continue to draft the proposed new resolution on identification materials if necessary; [to be deleted if the Conference of the Parties adopts the resolution]
 - ii) review selected identification materials, including material compiled as per Decision 18.136 paragraph a), and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;
 - iii) consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species; and
 - iv) report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Animals and Plants Committees; and
- b) submit the proposed new resolution on identification materials to the Standing Committee for inputs and onward submission to the Conference of the Parties. [to be deleted if the Conference of the Parties adopts the resolution]

Directed to the Secretariat

19.BB The Secretariat shall:

- a) continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES Website and the CITES Virtual College;
- b) provide inputs to the proposed new resolution on identification materials drafted by the joint working group on identification materials called for in Decision 19.AA; and
- c) report on the progress and make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.

Directed to the Standing Committee

19.CC The Standing Committee shall:

- a) provide inputs on the draft resolution text prepared by the Animals and Plants Committees to ensure that the needs for identification materials expressed by Parties and authorities responsible for wildlife law enforcement are taken into account; and
- b) submit the revised draft resolution to the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting.

Directed to Parties

19.DD Parties are encouraged to support the efforts of the working group on identification materials by providing to the Secretariat information on available identification and guidance materials that are used by Parties, and particularly by enforcement and inspection officers, to facilitate implementation of the Convention.

**TENTATIVE BUDGET AND SOURCE OF FUNDING
FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DRAFT RESOLUTIONS OR DECISIONS**

In paragraph 6 of Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP18) on Submission of draft resolutions, draft decisions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties, the Conference of Parties decided that any draft resolutions or decisions submitted for consideration at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties that have budgetary and workload implications for the Secretariat or the permanent committees must contain or be accompanied by a budget for the work involved and an indication of the source of funding.

The Secretariat estimates that the cost of implementing subparagraphs 2 a), b) and c) of the draft resolution for the review, analysis, publication and maintenance of the materials may cost approximately USD 40,000 for the triennium. An additional cost of USD 5,000 may be required to print the materials.

The Secretariat estimates that the support required from the Secretariat as outlined in draft decisions 19.BB, paragraphs a) and b), could be accommodated within the daily work of existing Secretariat staff within reasonable limits.

The Secretariat estimates that a total budget of minimum USD 45,000 will be required for the implementation of the draft resolution and decisions.

Decision	Activity	Estimated budget (2023-2025) USD	Indicative budget source
Res. Conf 19.X Subparagraphs 2 a), b) and c)	Review, analysis, development, publication and maintenance of the materials and making them available in print and online.	45,000 (15,000/year)	Extrabudgetary