

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Nineteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
Panama City (Panama), 14 – 25 November 2022

Strategic matters

REVIEW OF THE ETIS PROGRAMME

1. This document has been submitted by the Standing Committee.*

Background

2. At its 18th meeting (CoP18, Geneva 2019), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decisions 18.18 to 18.20 on the *Review of the ETIS programme* as follows:

Directed to the Secretariat

18.18 *The Secretariat shall include in the terms of reference for the review of the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS) programme the issue of overlapping reporting requirements created under Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on Trade in elephant specimens and Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports and the challenges posed by the different data-sharing policies, and work closely with the consultants carrying out the review to identify possible solutions.*

Directed to the Secretariat

18.19 *The Secretariat shall report the findings of the review of the ETIS programme requested by the Standing Committee, and any recommendations emanating from the review, at the 73rd meeting of the Standing Committee*

Directed to the Standing Committee

18.20 *The Standing Committee shall review the findings and recommendations reported by the Secretariat in accordance with Decision 18.19 and make recommendations for consideration at the 19th meeting of the Conference the Parties.*

3. The terms of reference for the review of ETIS programme 18 were adopted by the Standing Committee at its 70th meeting (SC70, Sochi, October 2018) [see documents [SC70 SR](#), [SC70 Com. 15](#), [CoP18 Doc. 69.1](#), [Annex 4](#)] and the Secretariat included the issue of overlapping reporting requirements as instructed in Decision 18.18.

Review and findings based on the key requirements in the terms of reference

4. At its 74th meeting (SC74, Lyon, March 2022), the Standing Committee considered the report by the Secretariat on the review of the ETIS programme (see document [SC74 Doc. 12](#)). The Secretariat provided the Standing Committee with information relating to the process followed to conduct the review and shared

* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

the key findings and recommendations of the review, the comments submitted by the members of the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup and the observations by the Secretariat. A summary of key aspects and recommendations linked to the terms of reference and proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens* and Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports* are discussed briefly below.

- a) The assessment finding was that ETIS' overall performance could be rated as "Satisfactory" based on the criteria used in the review and the conclusion was that the ETIS analysis can support CITES processes and decision-making, such as the National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) process. It was noted that ETIS was not designed to determine causality but it does, however, provide Parties with analytical outputs to inform compliance processes such as the NIAP process.
 - b) Amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Annex 1 to the Resolution were needed to address the following: the mandate to facilitate exchange of data on seizures of elephant specimens between ETIS, the Secretariat and partners of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC); the scope of data to be submitted by Parties, including minimum data requirements; data governance provisions to address data ownership, stewardship, oversight and accountability; mechanisms for data collection and increased oversight by the MIKE-ETIS Technical Advisory Group (MIKE-ETIS TAG); alignment of the reporting dates of ETIS and the annual illegal trade report (e.g., both deadlines to be 31 October); as well as the need for regular funding to meet the objectives. The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the Conference of Parties the proposed amendments in Annex 1 to the present document to address the aforementioned.
 - c) An amendment to Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports* to facilitate exchange of data on seizures of elephant specimens between ETIS, the Secretariat and ICWC partners was required. The Standing Committee agreed to submit to the Conference of Parties the proposed amendments in Annex 2 to the present document to address this.
5. The Committee requested the Secretariat, TRAFFIC and the MIKE-ETIS TAG, with oversight by its MIKE-ETIS Subgroup, to prioritize the recommendations in the review report and prepare a costed action plan for their implementation, to be included in the present report. The plan is attached in Annex 3 to the present document. Sixteen recommendations are considered high priority, four as medium priority and five as low priority. Five recommendations have already been addressed, mainly through the ETIS Online system and in response to the discussions during the review. The proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) discussed in paragraph 4 above will address four of the 16 high priority recommendations if adopted by the present meeting of the Conference of Parties. Two recommendations relate to continued timely data submission and the objectivity of TRAFFIC to be maintained and are therefore regarded as ongoing activities. A part of one recommendation that relates to the publication of a bi-annual newsletter was not supported for implementation because an ETIS report is considered by either the CITES Standing Committee or Conference of Parties on an annual basis and a newsletter will add costs without adding a lot of value.
 6. The estimated one-off cost associated with the implementation of high and medium priority recommendations is USD 40,000 and the annual cost an estimated USD 67,500. The estimated costs did not include the funds required to implement the ETIS programme (see document [SC74 Doc. 12 - Annex 6](#)) and the costs associated with the development of the resource mobilisation strategy by the Secretariat that will include ETIS.
 7. Based on the further work done as outlined above, the Committee furthermore requested the Secretariat to draft recommendations as required by Decision 18.20 on behalf of the Committee and in consultation with the Standing Committee Chair, for consideration at the present meeting. In this regard, the following recommendations are proposed for consideration by the Conference of Parties:
 - a) If funding can be secured, implementation should focus on the high and medium priority recommendations. High priority recommendations will be implemented during the next intersessional period while medium priority recommendations will be implemented at the latest by the 21st meeting of the Conference of Parties.
 - b) Parties should consider whether, in addition to the code for the ETIS analysis, the data used in the analysis should be made available to further enhance transparency. This will require an assessment of current data access provisions in place and should be included in the implementation of recommendation 16 (Feasibility assessment to evaluate effectiveness / efficiency of alternative supporting mechanisms for ETIS).

8. These recommendations are reflected in the draft decisions contained in Annex 4 to the present document.

Recommendations:

9. The Conference of the Parties is invited to:

- a) adopt the amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens* and its Annex 1 contained in Annex 1 to the present document;
- b) adopt the amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports* contained in Annex 2 to the present document;
- c) consider and agree to the prioritization of recommendations as contained in Annex 3 to the present document;
- d) adopt the draft decisions relating to the implementation of the prioritized recommendations contained in Annex 4 to the present document; and
- e) delete Decisions 18.18 to 18.20 that have been implemented.

COMMENTS OF THE SECRETARIAT

A. The Secretariat recommends the adoption of the recommendations in paragraph 9 of the present document, but proposes minor changes to the amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens* as presented in Annex 1 to the present document, as follows:

- i) Editorial changes to the proposed amendments to paragraph 27 g):

Additions are shown in **bold underline** text, and deletions are shown in **~~bold strikeout~~** text.

27. g) *summaries and aggregates of data provided to MIKE and ETIS, and the analyses of such data, constitute information that will be considered to be in the public domain once they are published on the CITES website, or otherwise publicly distributed;* ~~*The detailed data on individual seizure cases, elephant mortalities and law enforcement submitted to MIKE or ETIS are owned by the respective data providers, which in most case are the CITES Parties; any such data relating to a CITES Party will be accessible to that Party, and the members of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group for information and review purposes, and the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) for global research and analysis purposes, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, in accordance with as provided for in paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports, but.*~~ **The detailed data on individual seizure cases, elephant mortalities and law enforcement will not be released to any third party without the consent of the Party concerned; data may also be released to contractors (e.g. statisticians) or other researchers (e.g. MIKE ETIS Subgroup approved research collaborations) under appropriate nondisclosure agreements; and**

- ii) Clarification relating to the minimum information required to allow a record to be included in the analysis referred to in paragraph 2. a) of Annex 1 on *Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens* to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18). Currently, non-ivory elephant products are not included in the trend analysis but may be included in future analysis. Furthermore, the Secretariat proposes that the word 'product' be replaced with 'specimen' to ensure all non-ivory specimens are reported, and not only products.

Proposed new text are shown in **bold underline**; text to be deleted are shown in **~~bold strikeout~~**.

2. Data scope

.....

a) Minimum information to allow a record to be included in the **trend** analysis (information required to enable data entry of a seizure case into ETIS):

- i. source of information
 - ii. date of seizure
 - iii. agency responsible for seizure
 - iv. country of seizure
 - v. type of ivory and quantity
 - vi. type and/or quantity of non-ivory elephant ~~products-specimens~~
- iii) Encouraging Parties to report on elephant specimen seizures or confiscations using the CITES annual illegal trade report by replacing the word “acceptable” in the fourth sub-paragraph in paragraph 4. of Annex 1 on *Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens* to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) with the word “encouraged”:

4. Data collection and compilation

.....

Standardized data for ETIS will be collected through several mechanisms and formats, including direct online data submission to the ETIS website, using the ETIS Data Collection Form for individual seizure cases or the ETIS Data Collection Excel template for reporting multiple seizure cases at one time. Reporting on elephant specimen seizures or confiscations using the CITES annual illegal trade report is **acceptable encouraged**. No other formats **than those mentioned** are ~~not~~ recommended

- B. To further facilitate the exchange of data on seizures of elephant specimens between ETIS and ICCWC partners, the Secretariat will update the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports* to align the information to be reported by Parties in their annual illegal trade reports relating to seizures involving elephant specimens with the ETIS reporting requirements. The amendments to the *Guidelines* will be submitted to the Standing Committee for consideration as provided for in paragraph 1 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports*.
- C. Annex 3 (*Guidelines to the National Ivory Action Plan Process*) of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens* provides in Step 1 a) that the foundation for identifying Parties to participate in the NIAP Process is the ETIS report submitted to each Conference of Parties (CoP); and in Step 1 b) that the Secretariat will, in cooperation and consultation with the Parties identified through the ETIS report to CoP as requiring attention, determine whether there is additional information to be considered in developing its recommendation to the Standing Committee.

The following descriptions of the categories are provided as footnotes in Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18):

- Category A Parties consists of Parties most affected by illegal trade in ivory
- Category B Parties consists of Parties markedly affected by illegal trade in ivory
- Category C Parties consists of Parties affected by illegal trade in ivory

The ETIS report to the Conference of Parties categorizes Parties based on the results of the cluster analysis and the consideration of bias adjusted data and other sources of information. There is no clear guidance or criteria specified for each category other than the description referred to above. The Secretariat is of the view that clear criteria will provide clarification relating to the inclusion of Parties in the categories.

The Secretariat recommends the adoption of the following draft decisions directed to the Secretariat and the Standing Committee to develop clear criteria for the categorization of Parties.

Directed to the Secretariat

- 19.AA** Subject to external funding, the Secretariat shall, in consultation with the MIKE-ETIS Technical Advisory Group and TRAFFIC, develop draft criteria for the categorization of Parties based on the ETIS analysis and seizure data relating to elephant specimens submitted to TRAFFIC; and submit the draft criteria to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for consideration.

Directed to the Standing Committee

19.BB The Standing Committee shall consider the draft criteria for the categorization of Parties based on the ETIS analysis referred to in Decision 19.AA and recommend the adoption of criteria for the categorization of Parties, as appropriate, to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

- D. Document CoP19 Doc. 66.7, submitted by Malawi, Senegal and the United States of America, calls for the review of the National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) Process and the associated Guidelines, contained in Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens*. As mentioned above, the foundation for identifying Parties to participate in the NIAP Process is the ETIS report submitted to each Conference of Parties (CoP) and therefore the review, if agreed to by CoP19, should consider whether the adoption of criteria for the categorization of Parties will have implications on the NIAP Process and the associated Guidelines.

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO RESOLUTION CONF. 10.10 (REV. COP18)
ON TRADE IN ELEPHANT SPECIMENS

Additions are shown in underline text, and deletions are shown in ~~strikeout~~ text.

Proposed amendment to paragraph 27 g) of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on *Trade in elephant specimens*:

27. g) *summaries and aggregates of data provided to MIKE and ETIS, and the analyses of such data, constitute information that will be considered to be in the public domain once they are published on the CITES website, or otherwise publicly distributed; the detailed data on individual seizure cases, elephant mortalities and law enforcement submitted to MIKE or ETIS are owned by the respective data providers, which in most case are the CITES Parties; any such data relating to a CITES Party will be accessible to that Party, and the members of the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group for information and review purposes, and the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) for global research and analysis, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, in accordance with paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports, but will not be released to any third party without the consent of the Party concerned; data may also be released to contractors (e.g. statisticians) or other researchers (e.g. MIKE ETIS Subgroup approved research collaborations) under appropriate nondisclosure agreements; and*

Proposed amendments to Annex 1 on *Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens* to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18):

Annex 1

Monitoring illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens

1. Introduction

In order to monitor and record levels of illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens on a global basis, there is a need for a system to collect and compile law enforcement data on seizures and confiscations. At its 10th meeting, the Conference of the Parties recognized the Bad Ivory Database System (BIDS) established by TRAFFIC for this purpose in 1992.

Through further development and refinement, BIDS evolved into the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS), which has been used to monitor the pattern and scale of illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens since 1998.

2. Data scope

ETIS is a comprehensive and global information system whose central feature is a database holding the details of law enforcement records for seizures or confiscations of elephant ivory and other elephant specimens which have been reported to occur since 1989. ~~ETIS also maintains a series of subsidiary information on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors~~

The following data relating to seizures of elephant specimens will be collected by Parties and consolidated and analyzed by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat and the MIKE-ETIS TAG:

Irrespective of whether the seizure was made at an international border, or at domestic level for example during the search of a private or business property or during inspections at domestic markets, the following data on all seizures for violations involving ivory and other elephant specimens are collected by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat:

- a) Minimum information to allow a record to be included in the trend analysis (information required to enable data entry of a seizure case into ETIS):
- i. source of information

- ii. date of seizure
- iii. agency responsible for seizure
- iv. country of seizure
- v. type of ivory and quantity
- vi. type and/or quantity of non-ivory elephant products

b) Additional trade route information, if available, that informs the modelling (information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of the trade routes):

- i. country of origin
- ii. country of export
- iii. country of transit
- iv. country of destination/import

c) Optional information that is used contextually to understand illegal activity (information that is desirable to provide to assist in improving the understanding of type of illegal activity, transport used, methods of detection and nationality of those involved in illegal trade of ivory and other elephant specimens):

- i. type of transaction
- ii. mode of transport
- iii. ~~modus operandi~~ method of detection
- iv. nationality of suspects

In addition to the seizure data, ETIS-TRAFFIC also maintains a series of subsidiary information, including on law enforcement effort and efficiency, rates of reporting, legal and illegal elephant product markets, governance issues, background economic data and other factors to enable and inform the statistical analysis and its interpretation. Upon consultation with the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG), the subsidiary data required for analysis and interpretation may be revised and updated, in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat, as necessary to improve the analysis and the resulting output and interpretation. Parties will be informed about the additional data elements to be added and its rationale through a Notification and on CITES website.

Parties should validate seizure data relating to their country through ETIS Online or in response to a Notification to be issued by the Secretariat on an annual basis prior to the analysis of the data. TRAFFIC will include seizure data relating to their country in the analysis unless the Party indicates through ETIS Online or within the timeframe as specified in the Notification that the data should not be included.

3. **Methods Data governance**

~~Data and information on illegal trade in elephant ivory and other elephant specimens will be collected by TRAFFIC in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat. In this regard, a standardized methodology has been developed for the collection of data, including, inter alia and to the extent known:~~

- ~~—source of information~~
- ~~—date of seizure~~
- ~~—agency responsible for seizure~~
- ~~—type of transaction~~
- ~~—country of seizure~~
- ~~—country of origin~~
- ~~—country of export~~
- ~~—country of destination/import~~
- ~~—type of ivory and quantity~~
- ~~—mode of transport~~
- ~~—modus operandi~~
- ~~—nationality of suspects~~

~~Standardized data are collected through a number of mechanisms and formats, including direct online data submission to the ETIS website, using the ETIS Data Collection Form for individual seizure cases or the ETIS Data Collection Spreadsheet for reporting multiple seizure cases at one time. Reporting on elephant product seizures or confiscations using other formats is also acceptable.~~

a) Oversight and accountability

The CITES Secretariat is responsible for data governance, in consultation with TRAFFIC. An agreement between the Secretariat and TRAFFIC will formalize the matters associated with data governance as provided for in this Resolution. Data governance will address sensitive and non-sensitive information collected and the use of this data and information, taking into consideration paragraph 27 g) of the Resolution. Information relating to governance will be made available on the ETIS Online system and the CITES website. Roles, responsibilities and accountability of data owners and stewards for all ETIS data are set out below.

b) Data ownership

The detailed data on individual seizure cases submitted to ETIS are owned by the respective CITES Parties. Each Party has data ownership accountability over the data submitted by the Party. The CITES Secretariat has data ownership accountability for all other data/information/measures used by TRAFFIC in the ETIS analysis. Data owners are accountable for the quality and integrity of their own data; however, the day-to-day data management activities may be delegated to the data stewards (CITES Secretariat and TRAFFIC).

c) Data stewardship

Data stewardship is the management of data and information, including content and metadata, on behalf of the data owners to ensure high quality data, required controls and data integrity in accordance with the data scope. The CITES Secretariat is the primary data steward of all ETIS data; all data management responsibilities are delegated to TRAFFIC in terms of the agreement referred to in paragraph 3 a) above.

4. Data collection and compilation

The MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG) will support the development and implementation of ETIS. ETIS will be managed and coordinated by TRAFFIC in consultation with the TAG and in collaboration with the CITES Secretariat.

All Parties, through their CITES Management Authorities, following liaisons with appropriate law enforcement agencies, should provide information on seizures and confiscations of ivory or other elephant specimens in the prescribed formats, either to the Secretariat or directly to TRAFFIC within 90 days of their occurrence or by 31 October each year for the submission of data covering seizures in the preceding year. In addition, law enforcement agencies in States not-party to the Convention are invited to provide similar information.

TRAFFIC will assist the Parties in collecting data, ensuring data quality and consistency, and providing tools and training in data collection, data utilization and information management to designated officials around the world as appropriate.

Standardized data for ETIS will be collected through several mechanisms and formats, including direct online data submission to the ETIS website, using the ETIS Data Collection Form for individual seizure cases or the ETIS Data Collection Excel template for reporting multiple seizure cases at one time. Reporting on elephant specimen seizures or confiscations using the CITES annual illegal trade report is acceptable, but other formats are not recommended.

5. Information, data analysis and interpretation

Information generated by ETIS is hereby defined as the outcomes and outputs of ETIS data analysis, including summaries and aggregates in different forms, trends and other analytical presentations, and the relationships and factors which comprise underlying trade dynamics.

~~Data is hereby defined as the facts gathered through ETIS processes on individual seizures, including those collected using the CITES 'Ivory and elephant product data collection form' or other mechanisms used for obtaining elephant product seizure data. It also includes data that is part of the subsidiary databases within ETIS, and any other data that have been primarily collected under ETIS auspices to facilitate ETIS analyses.~~

The analysis and interpretation of data will be coordinated by TRAFFIC in association with the CITES Secretariat and MIKE (see Annex 2), and in consultation with the relevant Parties and the TAG. The statistical methodology, underlying code and supporting documentation, including how data is processed, bias-adjusted and then used in the ETIS analysis, will be made available to all Parties. The statistical modelling

and techniques will be reviewed and refined as deemed necessary by the TAG, TRAFFIC and the CITES Secretariat, and submitted to the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup of the Standing Committee for consideration.

6. Intersessional remedial action

In the event that there is a need for urgent intersessional action, TRAFFIC will report as appropriate to the Standing Committee via the Secretariat.

7. Funding

Regular funding should be secured A funding mechanism will be established to ensure that ETIS is fully operational can meet minimum operational requirements to deliver on the objectives in paragraph 27 a) of the Resolution.

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO
RESOLUTION CONF. 11.17 (REV. COP18) ON NATIONAL REPORTS

Additions are shown in underline text, and deletions are shown in ~~strikeout~~ text.

Proposed amendment to paragraph 4 of Resolution Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on *National reports*:

4. *AGREES that, unless otherwise specified by the reporting Party, data collected in the annual illegal trade report and included in the database should be made available to Parties for research and analysis of wildlife and forest crime as it affects them, ~~and to the members of the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) for ICCWC global research and analysis studies on wildlife and forest crime, and any data related to seizures of elephant specimens (as prepared by the Secretariat) to ETIS to support the monitoring the illegal trade in ivory and other elephant specimens as provided for in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18);~~*

ETIS REVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS
PRIORITIES AND ESTIMATED COSTS

High-Level Itemized List of Recommendations: Consolidated report – ETIS review

Summary:

1. Sixteen recommendations are considered high priority, four as medium priority and five as low priority. Five recommendations have already been addressed, mainly through the ETIS Online system and in response to the discussions during the review. The 74th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC74, Lyon, March 2022) agreed to submit amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Res Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) (SC74 Doc. 12) to the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP19). These amendments will address four of the 16 high priority recommendations if adopted by CoP19. Two recommendations address actions that will be on-going as part of the implementation of the ETIS programme because it relates to data submission and the objectivity of the ETIS programme to be maintained. A part of one recommendation relating to the publication of a bi-annual newsletter was not supported for implementation considering the fact that an ETIS report is developed and considered by either the CITES Standing Committee or Conference of Parties on an annual basis.
2. The estimated costs associated with the implementation of the **high and medium priority recommendations** are:
 - a) USD 67,500 per annum [note: annual cost is in addition to ETIS budget requirements ([SC74 Doc. 12 - Annex 6](#): 2022 - USD 387,568; 2023 - USD 433,826; 2024 - USD 447,062)]; and
 - b) USD 40,000 once-off costs.

The cost implications associated with some low priority recommendations contributed to the prioritization.

Prioritization: Interpretation and timeframe

	High	Recommendation to be implemented as a priority, subject to availability of external funding, either on ongoing basis or if additional work is required during the intersessional period between CoP19 and CoP20
	Medium	Recommendation to be implemented, subject to availability of external funding, before CoP21
	Low	Recommendation not essential and will only be implemented after high and medium priorities have been implemented or if external funding is allocated to the specific recommendation
	On-going	Recommendations that require on-going implementation.
	Addressed	Recommendation addressed with details provided in the Status column
	Not to be implemented	Recommendation not recommended for implementation with reasons status in the Status column

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
Governance							
1	Augment Annex 1 to include 'Data Governance' and introduce other minor refinements	CITES Secretariat	TBD	Data governance addressed in proposed amendments to Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) (SC74 Doc. 12 and CoP19 Doc. 66.1). If the Parties adopt the proposed amendments to Annex 1, this recommendation will be addressed	High	0	Not Applicable (N/A)
2	CITES Secretariat to take on a more proactive role in helping TRAFFIC with data acquisition and as the mediator for concerns and issues raised by the Parties pertaining to data integrity, to facilitate timely data collection.	CITES Secretariat	Short term ASAP, in anticipation of upcoming CoP19, subject to availability of resources	CITES Secretariat and TRAFFIC to agree on a process	High	CITES Staff time (10% of P3 staff member - the 10% will cover the costs associated with the implementation of recommendations 2, 3 and 15: USD 7,500 per annum)	CITES Trust Fund / Donor funds
3	Currently there is no defined formal "ETIS team" within CITES; although there is an informal support network of CITES resources that do play a role at	CITES Secretariat	Short term	Addressed MIKE Coordinator fulfilling the role of CITES ETIS	Addressed	Cost indicated above: CITES Staff time (10% of P3 staff member)	CITES Trust Fund / Donor funds

¹ Anticipated timeframes in review report:

Short term: up to one year, depending on available funding;

Medium term: three years (one CoP cycles), depending on available funding; and

Long term: up to six years (two CoP cycles), depending on available funding.

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	different junctures such as overseeing TRAFFIC contractual obligations and supporting CoP reporting during Plenary. At minimum, it is recommended to establish a 'CITES ETIS Focal Point' role to work closely with TRAFFIC and MIKE-ETIS TAG, to orchestrate content reviews (and approvals) between different governance structures and processes, to address Parties' procedural/data disputes, and to aid in ETIS data collection from the Parties. This role can be assigned to current staff member(s) and does not necessarily need a new headcount.		ASAP, subject to availability of resources	Focal Point in the Secretariat. Staff in the various units in the Secretariat assist with specific aspects, e.g., NIAP process.			
4	<p>TRAFFIC should continue to practice objectivity to avoid the appearance of bias pertaining to the ETIS programme.</p> <p>It is also recommended that TRAFFIC coordinates with the CITES Secretariat (i.e., on official media releases) on external communications pertaining to ETIS.</p>	TRAFFIC	<p>Short term</p> <p>ASAP, in anticipation of upcoming CoP19</p>	<p>TRAFFIC is the custodian of ETIS data submitted by the Parties and doesn't share data internally or with third Parties in line with the provisions specified in Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18). TRAFFIC also continues to maintain objectivity regarding ETIS with oversight provided by the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup.</p> <p>TRAFFIC treats its external engagement and other communications on</p>	On-going	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				<p>elephant issues in CITES completely separately from its objective support of ETIS and maintains a good distance between the two activities.</p> <p>Finally, press releases issued by the CITES Secretariat relating to all ETIS matters (and not only linked to the ETIS report) are prepared through a consultation process between the CITES Secretariat and TRAFFIC.</p>			
Supporting Processes							
5	Define clear process (system + workflow) for confirmation and validation of Parties that are implicated in the trade chain respectively	TRAFFIC & Review Team Assistance	Short term	<p>Process is in place for the confirmation and validation of data including for implicated Parties within ETIS Online.</p> <p>Proposed amendments to Annex 1 of Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. COP18) provides for consideration of information relating to implicated Parties and if adopted by CoP19 this</p>	High	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				recommendation will be addressed.			
6	Frequently scheduled (quarterly), regimented, real-time training sessions that are recorded and posted covering ETIS Online, data management, and analytics, with pre-defined agenda based on feedback from Parties, complimented by a bi-annual newsletter	TRAFFIC	Short term	<p>TRAFFIC provides on-demand training and a recorded session will be made available on ETIS Online.</p> <p>TRAFFIC is in progress to implement (funding permitted), changes to ETIS Online based on Parties feedback.</p> <p>The latest ETIS findings and notable data are communicated as part of the annual trend analysis report, and in line with item no. 4, press releases are issued if there is information to be communicated in collaboration with CITES Secretariat.</p>	Addressed	Annual costs to provide training, produce reports, and participate in CITES meetings is already included in the minimum operational budget for the ETIS Programme.	Donor funded

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				Bi-annual newsletter: ETIS reports are produced an annual basis for consideration by either the CITES Standing Committee or the Conference of Parties. Access to data is restricted and managed as provided for in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and as indicated in recommendation 4 press releases are released by the Secretariat as required after a consultation process. Information to be shared through a periodic newsletter is limited and considering that this will also require additional budget, the implementation of this recommendation is not supported.	Not to be implemented	0	
7	Streamline and consolidate existing SoPs & methodology documentation for TRAFFIC's internal use and operations, and a refined version suitable for online publication outlining detail procedures and assumptions	TRAFFIC	Short term Internal SoP online SoP: Subject to the	Detailed internal SoP revisions should be finalized by CoP19. A refined version of the SoP is subject to funding as stated.	High	One-time costs for a refined version of the SoP: ETIS Staff time – USD 10,000	Donor funded

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
			availability of funding	Parties need to keep in mind that even with full understanding of the SoP and access to the full code (which is already available), the results cannot be reproduced by anyone other than TRAFFIC as the dataset is not available. If full understanding of the processes behind the ETIS report, and with that full transparency is what Parties aim for, this can probably only be achieved by disclosing the data.			
8	Incorporation of ETIS Online notification-enabling data validation/confirmation workflow	TRAFFIC	Complete	<p>Although specific aspects of the recommendation has been implemented through the ETIS Online system that allows Parties who are data providers on ETIS Online to validate and confirm their data at any given time, further refinements should be made.</p> <p>These refinements include adding an automated notice every time a record is added for each Party or</p>	High	One-time costs for ETIS Online software / programming enhancement – USD 5,000	Donor funded

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				if a record is queried by an affected (or implicated) Party, thereby notifying all affected Parties, the ETIS administrator, and the CITES Secretariat.			
9	Emphasize advance distribution of the reports to the Parties to give them time and opportunity to understand the findings, get clarification on their concerns, if any, and to receive feedback on what is being prepared/proposed before the standing committee and CoP meetings. To ensure clarity and confirmation, a supporting SoP needs to be developed (i.e., to set out the processes to be followed to engage implicated Parties and facilitate engagement)	TRAFFIC & CITES Secretariat	Short term, subject to the availability of funding	Existing provisions that address the recommendation: Timeframes in RoPs and Annex 3 to Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) In terms of Rule 22 of the Rules of Procedure of the Conference of the Parties documents must be submitted 150 days before the meeting to the Secretariat, which shall place them on the website of the Convention. In terms of Rule 11 of the Rules of Procedure of the Standing Committee documents shall be provided to the Secretariat at least 60 days before the meeting and the Secretariat shall to the extent possible place the documents on its website	Addressed	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				<p>at least 45 days before each meeting.</p> <p>In terms of Annex 3 (Guidelines to the National Ivory Action Plan Process) of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) on <i>Trade in elephant specimens</i> the Secretariat will, in cooperation and consultation with Parties identified through the ETIS report to CoP, determine whether there is additional information to be considered in developing its recommendation to the Standing Committee, on whether the Party should be included in process or not.</p>			
10	Mobile enablement of ETIS Online to improve data quality through facilities like form-level validation rules while working offline, enabling Parties law enforcement staff to record seizures in remote field locations	TRAFFIC (Significant system change required)	Medium term Subject to the availability of funding	ETIS Online already provides a platform that can be accessed by field staff. As such enhancements can be considered to make the current website outline more mobile device friendly, or, make it	Low	Software development costs for website enhancements: USD 10,000 Costs for implementation of a field App:	Donor funded

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				possible to enter data when off-line or via an App.		USD 80,000	
11	<p>Annual illegal trade report and ETIS report automated or manual reconciliation of data relating to elephant specimens and in parallel ensure that the responsible CITES Management Authority in each country enters and reconciles the data for elephant specimens for both reports.</p> <p>It is also recommended to make changes to Res Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Res Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) on National reports, in line with the proposed amendments in <u>Annex N</u>.</p>	CITES Secretariat (in collaboration with UNODC)	Short term Subject to the availability of funding	<p>Amendments proposed to Res Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Res Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18) to facilitate this process [SC74 Sum.13 (Rev. 1)]. If the Parties adopt the proposed amendments to the Annex, this recommendation will be addressed.</p> <p><u>Note:</u> The Annual Illegal Trade Report should be altered for seizures relating to elephant specimens, so Parties can submit all relevant "ETIS" data in their annual illegal trade submission.</p> <p>Integrating seizure data across databases requires ETIS staff time for data management.</p>	High	<p>ETIS staff time to integrate databases:</p> <p>USD 2,500 - 10,000 depending if data are submitted to ETIS and are exported to the illegal trade report (lower costs) or if they are submitted to illegal trade report and are then imported to ETIS (higher costs if data requirements are not aligned)</p>	Donor funded
12	Consider a robust forensic assessment, through DNA analysis and other methods, is important in the context of establishing the trade chain, and its	The Parties in consultation with TRAFFIC	Medium term	Currently only 31 records (out of ~16,800 used in the latest trend analysis) have forensic information that	Low	May require an independent evaluation of the DNA analysis	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	viability and dependability need to be tested and verified	& CITES Secretariat	Subject to the availability of funding	informs countries of origin. While a few Parties indicated forensic analysis was conducted, no results were reported to ETIS.		<p>techniques beyond the scope of ETIS.</p> <p>The cost associated with an independent assessment to test and verify the dependability of the forensic assessments is difficult to determine - estimate: Between USD50,000 and USD100,000 depending on the level of detail (in field verification).</p>	
Sustainability							
13	From a resource and knowledge/expertise perspective, leverage synergies with other UN and global agencies	CITES Secretariat	TBD	<p>Partially addressed through the amendments proposed to Res Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and Res Conf. 11.17 (Rev. CoP18). If the Parties adopt the proposed amendments to the Annex, this recommendation will be addressed in terms of providing the mandate to leverage synergies.</p> <p>UNODC, as one of the ICCWC partners, is</p>	High		

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				involved in the development of the Annual Illegal Trade Report database. Alignment of the two databases could facilitate exchange of data, but more work is required to determine feasibility and cost of this part of the recommendation.			
14	Independent research initiative to analyse and investigate alternative statistical models and techniques with the view towards enhancing and improving the analytical framework for ETIS and/or explore 'crowdsourcing' options for research into assessment of alternative statistical modelling (Access to the detailed seizure data is a pre-requisite to enable this) ²	TRAFFIC / CITES Secretariat	TBD	New members appointed to the MIKE ETIS TAG. The capacity of the TAG to advise on enhancements and improvements has increased. Recommendation 25 will be prioritized. TRAFFIC explores improvements to the analytical framework (in consultation with the TAG) on an on-going basis.	Low		
15	With the expanded responsibility for TAG and dependency outlined in this report, it would be prudent to revisit/adjust the TAG's ToRs and reasonable financial provisioning (i.e.,	CITES Secretariat	Short term	Process to be initiated after CoP19 through the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup	High	CITES Staff time (included in 10% referred to under recommendation 2 and will cover	CITES Trust Fund./Donor funds

² Crowdsourcing is a sourcing model in which individuals or organizations obtain goods and service, including ideas, micro-tasks and finances, from a large, relatively open and often rapidly evolving group of participants. Currently, crowdsourcing typically involves using the internet to attract and divide work such as research projects between participants to achieve a cumulative result.

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	1-2 members to participate in CoP and SC)					recommendations 2, 3 and 15)	
16	Feasibility assessment to evaluate effectiveness / efficiency of alternative supporting mechanisms for ETIS (i.e., UNODC or CITES Secretariat supporting ETIS in place of TRAFFIC)	CITES Secretariat	Medium term, subject to the availability of funding	Assessment not initiated. The overall assessment finding was that ETIS's overall performance could be rated as Satisfactory. Sustainability was rated as Moderately Likely and therefore a feasibility assessment could inform alternative options. Key issues relating to IP and data ownership will have to be addressed in the process.	Medium	USD 35,000	
17	With respect to the provision of financial resources to meet minimum requirements of ETIS to "keep the lights on" ³ , Parties should be made aware of the implications of insufficient resources on core operations. A dedicated budget to cover these minimum requirements is required.	CITES Secretariat and CITES Parties	Short term	Budget requirements included as Annex 6 to document SC74 Doc. 12 on the <i>Review of the ETIS programme</i> and in Annexes to document SC74 Doc. 13 on the <i>MIKE and ETIS Programmes</i> that reflect the funding	High	As per SC74 Doc. 12 Annex 6 includes the 3-year operating budget for the ETIS programme. Because no dedicated budget exists and current budget is donor funded,	Donor funded

³ To keep the lights on (i.e. continue supporting ETIS infrastructure and seizure data collection and cyclic analytics and reporting activity, without any further enhancements) there is a need for approximately USD 220k – 300k per annum, bearing in mind that CoP years are slightly more resource intensive. There is currently an estimated USD 200k shortfall in the budget for the 2020 - 2023 cycle.

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				<p>requirements for both programmes.</p> <p>Currently ETIS receives funding from the CITES Secretariat through the EU funded MIKES+ project, with remaining funds of USD 215,000. No ongoing dedicated budget is committed and TRAFFIC has been fundraising, mainly from Party donors, securing an additional USD 290,000 (from USFWS and Germany) for operating funds through 2024. Therefore current shortfall through 2024 is approximately USD 450,000.</p>		TRAFFIC expends annually USD 10,000 on staff time for grant writing and reporting	
18	<p>For any enhancements / improvements moving forward there are two main requirements:</p> <p>i) change requests should be logged, costed and prioritized by the TAG and subsequently vetted by the Standing Committee to ensure the availability of funding, and upon approval, formal communication of planned changes to all ETIS stakeholders. Recognizing funding and capacity constraints, this</p>	CITES Secretariat with support from TRAFFIC	<p>Medium term</p> <p>By CoP20 subject to the availability of funding</p>	<p>See above relating to minimum budget requirements.</p> <p>The MIKE-ETIS TAG is not responsible for administrative matters but provides guidance on technical aspects relating to enhancements. The details associated with enhancements /</p>	High	<p>Same (not additive) as above for ongoing fundraising efforts:</p> <p>Because no dedicated budget exists and current budget is donor funded,</p> <p>TRAFFIC expends annually USD 10,000</p>	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	<p>should be undertaken on a "best effort" basis;</p> <p>ii) for the provisioning of additional funds for any improvements or enhancements for which there is insufficient funding, more emphasis should be placed on the private sector and philanthropic contributions. Moreover, to alleviate legal obstacles for the receipt of private sector contributions, a legal expert should be asked to propose (and set up) an appropriate legal framework for establishing an appropriate international fund;</p> <p>For minimum funding requirements, the following should be implemented:</p> <p>iii) a dedicated marketing campaign for ETIS, targeting the private sector (including technology firms) but leveraging messaging linked to the illegal killing of elephants (as opposed to illegal ivory trade) should be launched to promote non-traditional sources of funding.</p> <p>iv) An experienced consultant(s) should be recruited for the development and implementation of a Sustainable Financing Framework, resource mobilization, private sector engagement strategy, as well as</p>			<p>improvements and the associated budget requirements will be communicated to Parties through a Notification as was done in the past.</p> <p>In terms of Sustainable Financing Framework, the Secretariat will initiate a process to develop a resource mobilisation strategy that will include ETIS's minimum funding requirements.</p> <p>In the meantime, TRAFFIC continues to fundraise for the programme as specified above with preference to Party donors.</p> <p>Parties should consider a minimum allocation under the CITES Trust Fund.</p>		on staff time for grant writing and reporting	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	establishing the required legal frameworks to operationalize preferred options.						
Data Governance							
19	It is recommended to determine the appropriateness of all data elements stored in ETIS database both from a privacy policy and data ownership requirement perspective	TRAFFIC / CITES Secretariat	Short term	<p>Process to be initiated</p> <p>In terms of seizure data - a detailed analysis of data ownership will be completed by CoP19.</p> <p>In line with Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) Parties own their data; non-Party submitted data from WCO are shared in line with the resolution; other non-Party data are open-source (e.g., CITES reports, NGO reporting, media).</p> <p>In terms of subsidiary data – data are either derived from ETIS seizure data or are extracted from open sources (e.g., World Bank, Transparency International, etc.).</p>	High	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
20	Inclusion and implementation of data governance principles, policies, and standards	TRAFFIC / CITES Secretariat	Short term	Addressed in proposed amendments to Annex 1 of Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) If the Parties adopt the proposed amendments to the Annex, this recommendation will be addressed	Addressed	0	
Data Management							
21	Timely seizure data reporting by the Parties is absolutely crucial in order for TRAFFIC to produce quality science-based estimates of trends, hence a more concerted effort for timely submission by ALL the Parties needs to be emphasized and committed to	Parties	Short term Soon after publication & distribution of this report	Emphasized in report to SC74 (SC74 Doc. 68) While improvements in compliance with data reporting and use of ETIS Online were made in the latest data collection effort, there are still delays or non-reporting by Parties, and many seizures submitted have incomplete quantity data (analysis pending for Inf Doc for CoP19).	On-going	0	
22	Define a more efficient and effective ETIS user access management process	TRAFFIC / CITES Secretariat	Short term	Linked to recommendation 2 - prioritized in terms of support required from the CITES Secretariat to enhance efficiency.	High	ETIS staff time annually to manage user access (correspondence with Management Authorities):	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
				<p>User access to ETIS Online is defined based on agreed protocol with the CITES Secretariat. Data providers are added only if Party's Management Authority authorizes access.</p> <p>Further efficient user access is maintained, whereby no recent user access issues were reported.</p>		USD 5,000	
23	Leverage BI/dashboarding tool such as 'Tableau', 'ActivTrak' or 'Matomo' to present the trends and anomalies dynamically/interactively	TRAFFIC	<p>Medium term</p> <p>Subject to the availability of funding</p>	ETIS Online includes functionalities to display data graphically and as aggregated reports. Additional functionalities to include dynamic reporting (graphics and/or maps by user-specified parameters) can be explored but are subject to funding.	Low	Depending on functionality costs could be roughly USD 30,000 for website development and testing	Donor funded
Analytics Methodology							
24	Greater identification and testing of other covariates that could feature as independent country-specific variables for bias adjustment purposes or as explanatory factors to interpret and	TRAFFIC / TAG	<p>Medium term</p> <p>For CoP20 Cycle, subject to the</p>	Engagements with MIKE-ETIS TAG members to identify and test covariates to take place after CoP19.	High	Anticipated that the ETIS staff (Senior Analyst) would prioritize this within current budgeted activities,	Donor funded

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	understand ETIS results more effectively, accompanied by supporting documentation for communication and reference by stakeholders.		availability of funding			therefore no additional cost needed beyond current ETIS operating budget.	
25	Further exploratory analysis with a view towards enhancing and improving the analytical framework for ETIS (in concert with recommendation 26)	TRAFFIC / TAG/ Research Consultancy	Medium term Subject to the availability of funding	To be implemented in collaboration with the MIKE ETIS TAG and the CITES Secretariat	High	Same (not additive) as above: Anticipated that the ETIS staff (Senior Analyst) would prioritize this within current budgeted activities, therefore no additional cost needed beyond current ETIS operating budget.	Donor funded
26	Streamline the 'R' scripts (+30) to enhance execution performance and minimize hands-on intervention	TRAFFIC	Short term Subject to the availability of funding	Any major coding issues were addressed.	Addressed	0	
27	Per Paragraph 27 of Resolution 10.10 (Rev CoP18) on <i>Trade in elephant specimens</i> , bring to a successful conclusion the exploration and incorporation of overall illegal trade patterns/trends in the overall analysis using the datasets held by the IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group's African Elephant Database (elephant numbers), MIKE (illegal	ETIS/MIKE Supporting Team, CITES Secretariat / TAG / TRAFFIC	Medium term For CoP20 Cycle	The MIKE-ETIS TAG already explored the integration of the PIKE analysis and population estimates. Further work is required. Due to the complexities associated with data collection and analysis involved in all three systems this	Medium	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	killing) and ETIS (illegal trade) in a single model			recommendation will require significant additional work.			
28	Modelling exploration of the impact of removing lower source grades (B and C) data from trend analyses	TRAFFIC / TAG	Short term Noted as a planned activity for 2021 to be prioritized by TAG Subject to the availability of funding	In line with recommendation 19 an analysis of data sources was conducted for an Inf Doc for CoP19 to identify non-Party reporting. Additional modeling analysis can be explored.	Medium	Same (not additive) as above: Anticipated that the ETIS staff (Senior Analyst) would prioritize this within current budgeted activities, therefore no additional cost needed beyond current ETIS operating budget.	Donor funded
<i>Analytics Interpretation</i>							
29	Active engagement and involvement of the entire TAG in the overall interpretation and identification and fit-for purpose covariates and proxies before they are considered for the analysis, and refinement and validation of the analytics results and stakeholder communication of this important contribution and oversight.	TAG / CITES Secretariat	Short term Immediate	Linked to recommendation 24.	High	0	
30	Examine the relevance of the ivory price to better understand the economics of illegal trade in ivory and potential for integration with core ETIS activity. TRAFFIC's ivory price dataset can be	TRAFFIC / TAG	Medium term For CoP20 Cycle Subject to the	TRAFFIC price data are collected in projects separately to ETIS and stored in TRAFFIC's proprietary data base. In	Low	0	

Reviewers' Recommended Actions, Responsible Party and Anticipated Timeframes				Standing Committees' update on status, prioritization and costing			
No.	Reviewers' Recommended Actions	Responsible Party	Anticipated Timeframe ¹	Status	Priority	Nature of the cost and estimate (USD)	Funding Source
	leveraged as seen fit by TRAFFIC and the TAG		availability of funding	relation to investigation into improvements in analyses approaches this is a low priority.			
31	Examine the relationship between ivory stockpiles and illegal ivory trade needs.	TRAFFIC / TAG	Medium term For CoP20 Cycle Subject to the availability of funding	As a first step, ivory stockpile data reported to the Secretariat needs to be consolidate into a database. MIKE-ETIS TAG can then consider this in more detail after CoP19. Discussed at the 18 th meeting of the MIKE-ETIS TAG (Online, April 2022).	High	Ivory stockpile database - CITES Secretariat (USD 25,000).	
32	Thoroughly examine the key drivers and their correlation in terms of elephant poaching and the illegal killing of elephant and illegal ivory trade. This activity can be undertaken in concert with recommendation 27 above	ETIS/ CITES Secretariat / TAG	Medium term Subject to the availability of funding	Covariate analysis carried out and do be included in MIKE report to CITES CoP19. The next covariate analysis will be carried out prior to CoP21.	Medium	Same (not additive) as above: Anticipated that the ETIS staff (Senior Analyst) would prioritize this within current budgeted activities, therefore no additional cost needed beyond current ETIS operating budget	Donor funded

Note: Detailed technical recommendations relating to data management and statistical analysis relevant to the implementation of the recommendations contained in the consolidated report of the review will be incorporated as appropriate.

DRAFT DECISIONS ON THE
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRIORITY RECOMMENDATIONS
FROM THE REVIEW OF THE ETIS PROGRAMME

Directed to the Secretariat

19.AA Subject to the availability of external funding, the Secretariat shall work with TRAFFIC to, in consultation with the MIKE and ETIS Technical Advisory Group (TAG) where required, implement the high and medium priority recommendations in Annex 3 to document CoP19 Doc. 21.

Directed to the Secretariat

19.BB *The Secretariat shall report progress made with the implementation of the high and medium priority recommendations in Annex 3 to document CoP19 Doc. 21, and make any other recommendations emanating from the implementation to the Standing Committee.*

Directed to the Standing Committee

19.CC *The Standing Committee shall review the report provided by the Secretariat in accordance with Decision 19.BB and make recommendations to improve the ETIS system and the use of its results for consideration at the 20th meeting of the Conference the Parties.*

**TENTATIVE BUDGET AND SOURCE OF FUNDING
FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DRAFT RESOLUTIONS OR DECISIONS**

According to Resolution Conf. 4.6 (Rev. CoP18) on *Submission of draft resolutions, draft decisions and other documents for meetings of the Conference of the Parties*, the Conference of the Parties decided that any draft resolutions or decisions submitted for consideration at a meeting of the Conference of the Parties that have budgetary and workload implications for the Secretariat or permanent committees must contain or be accompanied by a budget for the work involved and an indication of the source of funding. The Secretariat proposes the following tentative budget and source of funding:

The amendments to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP18) and the implementation of the action plan contained in Annex 3 have workload and funding implications for the Secretariat, TRAFFIC and the MIKE-ETIS Technical Advisory Group. The Secretariat proposes the following tentative budget and source of funding:

Decision / Annex	Activity	Indicative costs (USD) (excludes Programme Support Costs)	Source of funding
Annex 3 to present document	<p>Recommendations prioritized for implementation. The budget requirements associated with each recommendation are specified in Annex 3 to present document.</p> <p>Some recommendations have continued annual cost implications (e.g., coordination on data collection, training, integration of databases) while others only require funding for a specific intervention (e.g., revision of Standard Operating Procedure).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 40,000 one-off costs. • 67,500 per annum [Note: annual cost is in addition to ETIS budget requirements (SC74 Doc. 12 - Annex 6: 2022 - USD 387,568; 2023 - USD 433,826; 2024 - USD 447,062)]; 	Extrabudgetary funds
19.AA	Develop draft criteria for the categorization of Parties based on the ETIS analysis and seizure data relating to elephant specimens.	5,000	Extrabudgetary funds

In the view of the Secretariat, implementation of the amendments to the Resolution can be accomplished within the regular workloads of the Standing Committee and the Secretariat.