

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirty-third meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 12 – 19 July 2024

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
MONDAY 15 JULY 2024

Adoption of executive summary AC33 Sum. 1

The Animals Committee adopted executive summary AC33 Sum. 1 with the following amendment:

- in the Spanish version, the title of the document should be translated into Spanish to read “Resumen ejecutivo, viernes 12 de julio de 2024”.

14. Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species
Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) and Decisions 17.108 (Rev. CoP19) to 17.110 (Rev. CoP19)]

14.1 Overview of the Review of Significant TradeAC33 Doc. 14.1 (Rev.1)

The Animals Committee noted document AC33 Doc. 14.1 (Rev. 1).

14.2 Implementation of recommendations for species selected
following CoP14, CoP15 and CoP17.....AC33 Doc. 14.2

- a) Concerning *Notochelys platynota* from Indonesia, the Animals Committee agreed the removal of *Notochelys platynota* from Indonesia from the Review of Significant Trade. Any increase in the quota above 250 wild specimens with restriction on trade in live individuals with a maximum straight carapace length of 15 centimetres should be communicated to the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee along with a non-detriment finding, including a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable offtake that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement in advance of any additional trade taking place.
- b) Concerning *Anguilla anguilla* from Algeria, the Animals Committee:
 - i) agreed that recommendations d), g), h) and k) have been implemented;
 - ii) invited Algeria to liaise with the IUCN anguillid specialist group of the to assist in the development of an NDF; and
 - iii) invited Algeria to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations i), j) and l) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- c) Concerning *Anguilla anguilla* from Tunisia, the Animals Committee:
 - i) agreed that recommendations d) to f) have been implemented;
 - ii) invited Tunisia to liaise with the IUCN anguillid specialist group to assist in the development of an NDF; and

- iii) invited Tunisia to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations g) to l) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- d) For all remaining cases selected post CoP17, the Animals Committee invited range States that did not reply to consultations following SC77 to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations by 30 September 2024 for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.

14.3 Species selected following CoP19.....AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev.1)

Concerning *Falco cherrug*/Jordan, the Animals Committee invited the Secretariat to look into possible instances of illegal trade and report to the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting.

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on the Review of Significant Trade (agenda items 14.2 and 14.3) with the mandate to:

Concerning agenda item 14.2

- a) consider the species/country combinations *Pandinus imperator*/Togo and *Chamaeleo gracilis*/Togo and make recommendations as appropriate;

Concerning agenda item 14.3

For the species/country combinations selected following the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP19) at the 32nd meeting of the Animals Committee, in accordance with paragraphs 1) g) and i) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18):

- b) review the responses received from range States contained in Annex 1 to document AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1), any additional information provided by range States and recommendations from the in-session working group on sharks and rays at AC33, the report in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1) , and if appropriate, revise the preliminary categorizations proposed by the United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC) for the species/range State concerned, providing a justification for such recategorization;
- c) formulate recommendations directed to the range States retained in the review process, using the principles outlined in Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) and the guidance on the formulation of recommendations contained in Annex 5 to document CoP17 Doc. 33;
- d) formulate separate recommendations directed to the Standing Committee for problems identified in the course of the review that are not directly related to the implementation of Article IV paragraph 2(a), 3 or 6(a), following the principles outlined in Annex 3 of the Resolution; and
- e) report its recommendations in relation to agenda items 14.2 and 14.3 to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Co-Chairs: representative for Europe (Mr. Benyr) and representative for North America (Mr. Benitez Diaz);

Members: representatives for Asia (Mr. Mobaraki and Mr. Hamidy), representative for Central and South America and the Caribbean (Mr. Gongora), representative for Oceania (Mr. Robertson), nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);

Parties: Australia, Austria, Belgium, Cameroon, Canada, China, Ecuador, European Union, Finland, France, Germany, Ghana, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Israel, Japan, Kenya, Lao People’s Democratic Republic, Malaysia, Maldives, Mexico, New Zealand, Oman, Panama, Portugal, Republic of Korea, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, South Africa, Spain, Suriname, Switzerland, Togo, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America; and

IGOs and NGOs: Convention on Migratory Species, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC); International Union for Conservation of Nature, Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center; Animal Welfare Institute, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Bloom Association, Blue Resources Trust, Born Free USA, Bundesverband für fachgerechten Natur-, Tier- und Artenschutz e.V., Defenders of Wildlife, European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, Fauna and Flora International, German Society for Herpetology, Global Guardian Trust, Humane Society International, International Fund for Animal Welfare, International Fur Federation, ProWildlife, Save our Seas Foundation, Shark Conservation Fund, Society for Wildlife and Nature International, Species Survival Network, Sustainable Use Coalition South Africa, Sustainable Users Network, TRAFFIC, Whale and Dolphin Conservation, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Association of Zoos and Aquariums, World Wide Fund for Nature, Zoo and Aquarium Association Australasia, Zoological Society of London; Florida International University.

41. Sharks and rays (Elasmobranchii spp.)
 [Resolution Conf. 12.6 (Rev. CoP18); Decision 19.225].....AC33 Doc. 41 (Rev.1)

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on sharks and rays with the mandate to:

- a) consider the issues raised in paragraphs 10 and 11 of document AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1) concerning shark species that were selected for Stage 2 of the Review of Significant Trade (RST) and make recommendations concerning the treatment of multiple stocks for the same species and single stocks being harvested by multiple harvesting nations for sharks;
- b) consider the following questions raised by the representative for Europe (Mr. Benyr) in plenary:
 - i) based on best available information, is it feasible to request a stock based NDF for the shark species in RST? If the answer is 'yes' for some species, which ones?
 - ii) formulate feasible and practical recommendations on making NDFs that could be included as RST recommendations; and
 - iii) formulate recommendations for Parties that are fishing in shared stocks to help them coordinate sustainable offtake levels;
- c) consider document AC33 Doc. 41 (Rev. 1), including the scientific elements in its Annexes, and any other relevant information, and
 - i) review the responses to the Notification to the Parties in Annex 2 and the information from the CITES Trade Database on commercial trade in CITES-listed sharks and rays since 2010 presented in Annex 3;
 - ii) review the study and its recommendations conducted under Decision 19.223, paragraph c), as shown in paragraph 15, noting that Japan proposed that paragraph 15 b) should read "invite Parties to adopt traceability systems along the supply chains of CITES-listed sharks and rays species for international trade...";
 - iii) review the Secretariat's suggestions for adding ocean basins to the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission for CITES annual reports* shown in paragraphs 22-28; and
 - iv) draft recommendations and decisions to be submitted to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for its consideration; and
- d) consider the information presented in information document AC33. Inf. 20 and make species-specific recommendations, if necessary, on improving the conservation status of deep water sharks;
- e) report its recommendations to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: representative for Oceania (Mr. Robertson);

Members: representative for Asia (Mr. Mobaraki);

Parties: Argentina, Australia, Austria, Brazil, Canada, China, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Ecuador, European Union, France, Germany, Ghana, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Japan, Kenya, Maldives, Mexico, Mozambique, Netherlands, New Zealand, Oman, Panama, Peru, Portugal, Republic of Korea, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, South Africa, Spain, Suriname, Switzerland, Thailand, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America; and

IGOs and NGOs: Cartagena Convention, Convention on Migratory Species, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC); International Union for Conservation of Nature, Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center; Bloom Association, Blue Resources Trust, Defenders of Wildlife, European Bureau for Conservation and Development, Fondation Franz Weber, Global Guardian Trust, Humane Society International, International Fund for Animal Welfare, International Fur Federation, Save our Seas Foundation, Shark Conservation Fund, Sustainable Use Coalition South Africa, TRAFFIC, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Wide Fund for Nature, Zoo and Aquarium Association Australasia, Zoological Society of London; Florida International University.

48. Report of the specialist on zoological nomenclature
[*Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) and Decisions 19.276 (African elephants), 19.278 (Bird family and order names) and Decision 18.310 (Rev. CoP19) (time-specific versions of online-databases)*] AC33 Doc. 48

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on nomenclature to consider the recommendations in paragraph 34 of document AC33 Doc. 48 and to report back to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);

Members: representative for Africa (Ms. Maha), representative for Europe (Mr. Benyr);

Parties: Botswana, Cameroon, China, Democratic Republic of the Congo, European Union, France, Germany, Ghana, Israel, Japan, Kenya, Namibia, Portugal, Russian Federation, Senegal, South Africa, Togo, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America, Zimbabwe; and

IGOs and NGOs: Convention on Migratory Species, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC); International Union for Conservation of Nature; Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Brazilian Association of breeders and Traders of Native and Exotic Animals, Bundesverband für fachgerechten Natur-, Tier- und Artenschutz e.V., Center for Biological Diversity, Conservation Force, German Society for Herpetology, Humane Society International, International Fund for Animal Welfare, International Fur Federation, IWMC-World Conservation Trust, Pan-African Sanctuary Alliance, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, ProWildlife, Wildlife Ranching South Africa NPC, Safari Club International, Society for Wildlife and Nature International, Sustainable Use Coalition South Africa, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Association of Zoos and Aquariums.

24. Trade in stony corals (Scleractinia spp.)..... AC33 Doc. 24

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on trade in stony corals with the mandate to, taking into consideration the comments made in plenary,

- a) consider the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.10 (Rev. CoP15) and sections 3 and 6 a) of the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports* and section 4 a) of the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual illegal trade reports*;

- b) provide advice on the conversion factors used to analyse trade in corals for the Review of Significant Trade process; and
- c) report its recommendations to the Committee

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: representative for Central and South America and the Caribbean (Mr. Gongora)

Parties: Australia, Austria, Canada, China, European Union, India, Indonesia, Maldives, Malaysia, Netherlands, New Zealand, Portugal, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America, Zimbabwe;

IGOs and NGOs: Cartagena Convention, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Centre for Biological Diversity, European Pet Organisation, Fondation Franz Weber, Ornamental Fish International, Pet Advocacy Network, Zoo and Aquarium Association Australasia

40. Eels (*Anguilla* spp.) [Decision 19.220]..... AC33 Doc. 40

The Animals Committee:

- a) requested that China, Cuba, Egypt and Türkiye submit detailed information on trade in eels for consideration at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee, and invited the Standing Committee to propose a specific draft decision directed to those Parties that do not respond, seeking this information;
- b) noted the information in paragraph 11 of document AC33 Doc. 40 concerning the potential use of source code R (ranching) for specimens of European eel (*A. anguilla*) from aquaculture production systems;
- c) agreed to propose the following draft decision to renew the unfinished task to discuss the potential risks and benefits of reintroducing seized live European eels into the wild to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and

Directed to the Animals Committee

20.AA *The Animals Committee shall:*

- a) *review the potential risks and benefits of reintroducing seized, live European eels to the wild; and*
- b) *make recommendations for consideration by the Standing Committee or the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*
- d) agreed to convey the contents of paragraphs 13 and 14 to the Standing Committee for its consideration, through its intersessional working group on eels, noting the need for refinement.

15. Review of trade in specimens reported as produced in captivity
[Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19)]

15.1 Overview and update on implementation of the review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivityAC33 Doc. 15.1

The Animals Committee:

- a) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Benin,
 - i) agreed to retain *C. sulcata* from Benin in the review and maintain its current zero export quota for captive bred specimens (C) of *C. sulcata* until such time as it addresses the concerns of the Animals and Standing Committees; and

- ii) encouraged Benin to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standings Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).
- b) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Mali,
 - i) agreed to retain *C. sulcata* from Mali in the review until such time as it addresses the concerns of the Animals and Standing Committees; and
 - ii) urged Mali to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025,).
- c) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Togo,
 - i) agreed to retaining *Centrochelys sulcata* from Togo in the review, until it provides evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock; and
 - ii) encouraged Togo to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).
- d) noted that *Centrochelys sulcata* / Ghana was removed from the review following the publication of a maximum size limit of 15cm straight carapace length with its export quota on the CITES website.
- e) agreed to submit the following amended draft decision to the Standing Committee for consideration at its 78th meeting (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).

Directed to the Secretariat

20.AA Subject to external funding and available Secretariat resources, the Secretariat shall develop, test and ~~establish~~ maintain a Captive Breeding tracking and management database as an essential tool for the effective implementation and transparency of the process under Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP18) on *Review of animal specimens reported as produced in captivity*.

15.2 Species selected following CoP19.....AC33 Doc. 15.2

The Animals Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the following amendment to paragraph 2 h) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on *Review of trade in specimens reported as produced in captivity*: (new text is underlined)

The Secretariat shall also commission, if requested by the Animals Committee, a short review of the species concerned, in consultation with relevant countries and specialists, to compile and summarise known information relating to the breeding biology and captive husbandry, as well as on the conservation status and threats to the species in the respective countries of origin of the founder stock to facilitate an assessment of any impacts, if relevant, of removal of founder stock from the wild.

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on review of captive-breeding (agenda items 15.1 and 15.2) with the mandate to:

Concerning agenda item 15.1:

- a) consider the species/country combination *Varanus exanthematicus*/Ghana, and make recommendations as appropriate;

Concerning agenda item 15.2:

- b) review the responses from countries in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 15.3, the information in Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 15.2 and any additional relevant information and determine if

trade is in compliance with Article III and Article IV of the Convention, as well as Article VII, paragraphs 4 and 5;

- c) in instances where this is not the case:
 - i) identify concerns appropriately within the Committee's remit;
 - ii) in consultation with the Secretariat, formulate draft recommendations directed to the relevant country which are time-bound, feasible, measurable, proportionate, transparent, and aimed at ensuring long-term compliance which, where appropriate, aim to promote capacity-building and enhance the ability of the country to implement relevant provisions of the Convention; and
 - iii) prepare supporting information for the Standing Committee on these cases.
- d) identify any concerns that are more appropriately considered by the Standing Committee; and
- e) report its recommendations to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

- Chair: Chair of the Animals Committee (Mr. Loertscher);
- Members: representative for Asia (Mr. Hamidy), representative for Central and South America and the Caribbean (Mr. Gongora), representative of Europe (Mr. Benyr), nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);
- Parties: Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Cambodia, Canada, Chile, China, Costa Rica, Czech Republic, Denmark, European Union, Finland, France, Germany, Ghana, Hungary, Indonesia, Israel, Japan, Kenya, Kuwait, Lao People's Democratic Republic, Malaysia, Morocco, Portugal, Russian Federation, Slovakia, South Africa, Spain, Switzerland, Thailand, Togo, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America; and
- IGOs and NGOs: Convention on Migratory Species, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations; International Union for Conservation of Nature; ADM Capital Foundation, Animal Welfare Institute, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, Born Free Foundation, Brazilian Association of breeders and Traders of Native and Exotic Animals, B Bundesverband für fachgerechten Natur-, Tier- und Artenschutz e.V., Center for Biological Diversity, Defenders of Wildlife, Environmental Investigation Agency UK, European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, European Pet Organisation, Fauna and Flora International, German Society for Herpetology, Humane Society International, International Fur Federation, National Association for Biomedical Research, Ornamental Fish International, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, Pet Advocacy Network, ProWildlife, San Diego Zoo Wildlife Alliance, Society for Wildlife and Nature International, Species Survival Network, Sustainable Users Network, Whale and Dolphin Conservation, Wildlife Conservation Society, Wildlife Ranching South Africa NPC, World Association of Zoos and Aquariums, World Wide Fund for Nature.

15.3 Review of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on Review of trade in specimens reported as produced in captivity [Decision 19.64]AC33 Doc. 15.3

The Animals Committee:

- a) agreed to propose to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to amend paragraph 2 d) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity* as follows:
 - d) *Where the Animals Committee finds that a species/country combination raises concerns better dealt within the process of the Review of Significant Trade, it can introduce that combination*

into stage 2 of the process in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18), paragraph 1-c) as an exceptional case; and

- b) agreed that Decisions 19.63 and 19.64 have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion at CoP20; and
- c) noted the comments made in plenary and invited the Secretariat to take those comments into consideration in its report to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.

45. Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II*
[Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP17)]

45.2 Selection of species for the periodic review*.....PC27 Doc. 33.2/AC33 Doc. 45.2 (Rev. 1)

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on the periodic review with the mandate to:

- a) establish a schedule for the Periodic Review of the Appendices;
- b) based on outputs indicated in paragraph 8 of document AC33 Doc. 45.2 (Rev. 1), identify a list of animal taxa to review during the next intersessional period until CoP21 (2028); and
- c) report its recommendations to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: representative for Asia (Mr. Hamidy) and the alternate representative for Oceania (Mr. Murrell);

Parties: Australia, Brazil, Cambodia, China, European Union, Germany, India, Indonesia, Israel, Japan, Mexico, New Zealand, Portugal, Russian Federation, South Africa, Spain, Thailand, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America; and

IGOs and NGOs: United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC); International Union for Conservation of Nature, Animal Welfare Institute, Bundesverband für fachgerechten Natur-, Tier- und Artenschutz e.V., European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, European Bureau for Conservation and Development, German Society for Herpetology, International Fur Federation, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, Society for Wildlife and Nature International, Species Survival Network, Sustainable Use Coalition South Africa, Sustainable Users Network, Whale and Dolphin Conservation, Wildlife Ranching South Africa NPC.

45.3 Periodic review of *Arctocephalus townsendi*.....AC33 Doc. 45.3

The Animals Committee thanked Mexico and supported the submission of a proposal to transfer *Arctocephalus townsendi* from Appendix I to Appendix II.

45.4 Periodic review of *Monachus tropicalis*AC33 Doc. 45.4

The Animals Committee thanked Mexico and supported the submission of a proposal to delete the extinct species *Monachus tropicalis* from Appendix I. The Animals Committee encouraged Mexico to liaise with the nomenclature specialist to resolve any nomenclature issues before the submission of the amendment proposal to the Conference of the Parties.

42. Seahorses (*Hippocampus* spp.)

42.1 Report of the Secretariat [Decision 19.229].....AC33 Doc. 42.1

The Animals Committee noted document AC33 Doc. 42.1 and the information provided by Parties in their responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2024/027. The Animals Committee noted that, as

requested by Mexico, paragraph 18 of document AC33 Doc. 42.1 should indicate that the number of recorded seized dried seahorse specimens is 4,946 (and not 5,975).

The Animals Committee agreed to propose to the Conference of the Parties the renewal of Decision 19.229.

42.2 Report of the intersessional working group [Decision 19.231]AC33 Doc. 42.2

The Animals Committee agreed to refer the recommendations in paragraph 12 of document AC33 Doc. 42.2 to the Standing Committee for further consideration.

The Animals Committee noted the suggestion to consider the costs and benefits of releasing live animals to the wild for all relevant aquatic taxa.

The Animals Committee agreed to establish an in-session working group on seahorses with the mandate to:

- a) consider the recommendations in paragraphs 7 to 11 and make its own recommendations or draft decisions, as appropriate; and
- b) report its recommendations to the Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: representative for Central and South America and the Caribbean (Mr. Ramadori);

Parties: Argentina, Australia, Canada, China, India, Japan, Netherlands, United States of America; and

IGOs and NGOs: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations; International Union for Conservation of Nature, Southeast Asian Fisheries Development Center; European Bureau for Conservation and Development, European Pet Organisation, Global Guardian Trust, World Wide Fund for Nature, Zoological Society of London.

Membership of in-session working groups

The Animals Committee agreed that Manta Trust could be added to the in-session working group on the Review of Significant Trade and on sharks and rays.