

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES  
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirty-third meeting of the Animals Committee  
Geneva (Switzerland), 12 – 19 July 2024

ANNOTATED AGENDA

**Opening of the meeting**

Opening remarks of the Chair ..... *No document*

The Chair of the Animals Committee will open its thirty-third meeting.

Opening remarks of the Secretary-General ..... *No document*

The Secretary-General will welcome the participants and provide an update on the Secretariat's activities.

**Administrative and financial matters**

1. Declaration of conflict of interest ..... *No document*

The Secretariat will invite the Members of the Animals Committee to declare any conflict of interest.

2. Rules of Procedure ..... AC33 Doc. 2

The Animals Committee will be invited to note that its Rules of Procedure, as amended at its 30th meeting (Geneva, July 2018) and set out in the Annex to document AC33 Doc. 2, remain valid for this meeting.

3. Agenda ..... AC33 Doc. 3 (Rev. 1)

The Animals Committee will be invited to adopt its agenda as set out in document AC33 Doc. 3 (Rev. 1).

4. Working programme ..... AC33 Doc. 4

The Animals Committee will be invited to adopt its working programme as set out in document AC33 Doc. 4.

5. Admission of observers ..... AC33 Doc. 5

The Animals Committee will be invited to note the list of observer organizations that had been accepted to participate in the meeting as set out in document AC33 Doc. 5.

**Strategic matters**

6. Animals Committee strategic planning for 2023-2025 (CoP19-CoP20)

6.1 Implementation of the work plan for 2023-2025 ..... AC33 Doc. 6.1

The document by the Chair of the Animals Committee presents an update on the progress made by the Animals Committee concerning the implementation of its 2023–2025 work plan with regard to Decisions directed to the Animals Committee by CoP19. Proposed recommendations to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78) or the 20th meeting of the Conference of Parties (CoP20) are those

currently presented in the documents to be considered at AC33, which may be subject to change. Based on the recommendations adopted at this meeting, these recommendations will be updated before progress on the implementation of the work plan is reported to the Standing Committee and the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP20).

The Animals Committee will be invited to take note of document AC33 Doc. 6.1.

6.2 Preparation of the report of the Chair of the Animals Committee for the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties..... *No document*

The Chair will inform the Animals Committee on the inputs needed for the preparation of the report of the Chair of the Animals Committee for the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP20).

The Animals Committee will be invited to take note of the oral update.

7. CITES Strategic Vision\*  
[Resolution Conf. 18.3 and Decision 19.12] ..... PC27 Doc. 7/AC33 Doc. 7

The document by the Secretariat proposes to use, in addition to the indicator (Indicator 1.4.1) already agreed by SC77 to be submitted to CoP20 (see summary record [SC77 SR](#)), a disaggregate version of the Red List Index (RLI) as a possible indicator for objective 1.4 of the *CITES Strategic Vision*: “The Appendices correctly reflect the conservation status and needs of species.” After an explanation of what is the Red List Index, including its taxonomic coverage, the document presents the advantages and the drawbacks of using two different ways to disaggregate the RLI.

- a) Thematic disaggregation: “Internationally traded species”: this covers species IUCN has identified as internationally traded as part of its assessment. The IUCN Red List Threats Classification Scheme (Version 3.3) outlines the biological resource use threat categories. For each threat, there is supplementary information including whether international trade is a significant driver (yes/no/unknown). This is how the disaggregated “internationally trade species” RLI categorizes species as internationally traded, or not. The threat classification scheme is a mandatory section of the Red List assessment and the international trade selection is a key assessment check.
- b) Disaggregation by international treaties: CITES vs non-CITES species. The Red List Index would be calculated separately for CITES-listed species and for non-CITES listed species. At the time of writing the present document, the Secretariat is consulting with IUCN in order to assess the feasibility and the amount of work such a disaggregation would entail.

The Animals and Plants Committee are invited to provide advice to the Secretariat on the possible additional indicators for objective 1.4 of the Strategic Vision as outlined above.

8. Role of CITES in reducing risk of future zoonotic disease emergence associated with international wildlife trade [Decision 19.16] ..... AC33 Doc. 8

The document presents updates by the Secretariat and by the co-chairs of the intersessional working group on the *Role of CITES in reducing risk of future zoonotic disease emergence associated with international wildlife trade*.

The Secretariat informs the Committee that the Memorandum of Understanding between the CITES Secretariat and the World Organization for Animal Health (WOAH) was signed on 1 March 2024 and that WOAH released *Guidelines for Addressing Disease Risks in Wildlife Trade* in May 2024. The Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity prepared a revised draft global action plan on biodiversity and health with the following voluntary action could be relevant for discussions in CITES processes: *improve, in accordance with other international agreements and within national capabilities the regulation, management and use of and trade in wild species, such that it is sustainable and safe for human and wildlife health*. The Secretariat also informs the Committee of relevant Resolutions and Decisions adopted by the Convention on Migratory Species and provide an update on the One Health Quadripartite activities by the United Nations Environment Programme.

The working group presents the outcomes of its work and propose for consideration by the Animals Committee effective and practical solutions for reducing pathogen spillover risk in wildlife supply chains in

paragraph 14 of the document and opportunities for practical collaboration under the direction of existing Resolutions, Decisions and agreements in paragraph 15.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) note:
  - i) the Memorandum of Understanding between the CITES Secretariat and WOAHA signed on 1 March 2024 and the *Guidelines for Addressing Disease Risks in Wildlife Trade* released by WOAHA in May 2024;
  - ii) the update relating to the implementation of paragraph c) of Decision 19.15 on collaboration with the Convention on Migratory Species; and
  - iii) the update provided by the United Nations Environment Programme on relevant work carried out under the Quadripartite Collaboration for One Health or other relevant initiatives;
- b) share the proposed effective and practical solutions for reducing pathogen spillover risk in wildlife supply chains and opportunities for practical collaboration as contained in paragraphs 14 and 15 with the Standing Committee through its intersessional working group; and
- c) agree that Decision 19.16 has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion.

9. Cooperation with Multilateral Environmental Agreements and other international organizations\* [Decision 19.20]..... *No document*

The Secretariat will present an update on the progress in the implementation of Decision 19.20 and will outline next steps in the development of a partnership strategy for the Parties, the Permanent Committees and the Secretariat to identify priorities for collaboration that specifically enhance the implementation of the Convention, as well as its effectiveness and efficiency, through strategic partnerships. The Secretariat will share the draft partnership strategy with the Chairs of the Animals and Plants Committees who will then consult with the Members of the Committee to provide feedback on the draft prior to the document deadline for SC78.

10. Joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative [Decision 19.25]..... AC33 Doc. 10

The document by the Secretariat identifies two priority activities of the Programme of Work of the African Carnivores Initiative (ACI) that are relevant to CITES and more specifically the Animals Committee: the development of trade resource kits for lions and leopards based on the trade resource kit for cheetahs and the development of an African lion inventory and an African lion database. The Secretariat proposes new draft decisions to support these priority activities.

Looking towards the future as part of its ongoing work with the Convention on Migratory Species, the Secretariat proposes to include the species covered by the ACI [cheetahs (*Acinonyx jubatus*), lions (*Panthera leo*) and leopards (*Panthera pardus*)] in paragraph 1 b) of Resolution Conf. 13.3 on *Cooperation and synergy with the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals*. The Secretariat notes that there may be a need to revise and update the Programme of Work for the ACI that will not be fully implemented by 2025 in order to reflect new Decisions adopted by CMS and CITES.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) consider the following proposed amendment to Resolution Conf. 13.3 on *Cooperation and synergy with the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS)*, amend as appropriate and submit the proposed amendment for consideration by the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for onward submission to the Conference of the Parties at its 20th meeting;
- b) *ensuring that CITES initiatives in respect of the following species or taxonomic groups complement, reinforce and, as far as possible, benefit from the regional collaboration already being undertaken or envisaged in the framework of CMS:*

[...]

- v) cheetahs (*Acinonyx jubatus*), lions (*Panthera leo*) and leopards (*Panthera pardus*);
- b) consider the draft decisions contained in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 10 and shown below, amend as appropriate and submit the draft decisions for consideration by the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for onward submission to the Conference of the Parties at its 20th meeting; and

#### CITES-CMS AFRICAN CARNIVORE INITIATIVE

##### **Directed to range States of African carnivores**

**18.59** *Relevant range States of African carnivores are urged to work through the Joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative to implement CITES Resolutions and Decisions relating to the species covered by this Initiative.*

##### **Directed to Parties**

**18.60 (Rev. CoP19)** *Parties are invited to recognize the importance of the Joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative in implementing CITES Resolutions and Decisions relating to the species covered by the Initiative, and in seeking synergies as appropriate to implement complementary CMS resolutions and decisions.*

##### **Directed to Parties, intergovernmental organizations and non-governmental organizations**

**18.61** *Parties, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations are encouraged to support relevant African range States, through the Joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative, in their implementation of CITES Resolutions and Decisions relating to the species covered by this Initiative.*

##### **Directed to the Secretariat**

**19.24 (Rev. CoP20)** *The Secretariat shall:*

- a) subject to external resources, support the range States of the joint CITES-CMS African Carnivore Initiative in preparing a revised ACI Programme of Work and in implementing relevant CITES Resolutions and Decisions that contribute to the ACI;
- b) inform the Animals Committee regarding the draft revised ACI Programme of Work and the activities and outputs of the ~~Joint CITES-CMS African Carnivore Initiative (ACI)~~ that relate to the Committee's mandate and request advice from the Animals Committee, as appropriate; and
- c) report on the implementation of this Decision to the Conference of the Parties at its 21st meeting.

##### **Directed to the Animals Committee**

**19.25 (Rev. CoP20)** *The Animals Committee shall advise the Secretariat, as appropriate, on information that it provides regarding:*

- a) the revised Programme of Work of the African Carnivore Initiative (ACI);  
and
  - b) the activities and outputs of the ACI that are relevant to the Animals Committee's mandate.
- c) consider the draft decisions contained in Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 10 and shown below and submit the draft decisions for consideration by the Conference of the Parties at its 20th meeting.

DEVELOPMENT OF TRADE RESOURCE KITS FOR  
AFRICAN LIONS (*PANTHERA LEO*) AND LEOPARDS (*PANTHERA PARDUS*)

**Directed to Parties**

**20.AA** Parties are encouraged to:

- a) share trade resource kits for African lion (*Panthera leo*) and leopard (*Panthera pardus*) with the Secretariat; and
- b) request the Secretariat to make these trade resource kits available to the Parties on the CITES website.

**Directed to the Secretariat**

**20.BB** The Secretariat shall subject to external funding,

- a) review the trade resource kits for African lion (*Panthera leo*) and leopard (*Panthera pardus*) shared by Parties;
- b) identify gaps and develop trade resource materials for African lion (*Panthera leo*) and leopard (*Panthera pardus*) based on the gaps identified and taking into consideration lessons learnt from the development of the CITES Cheetah Trade Resource Kit.
- c) share trade resource kits developed by Parties on the CITES website, as appropriate.
- d) inform the Animals Committee, as appropriate, regarding the development of trade resource kits for African lion (*Panthera leo*) and leopard (*Panthera pardus*).

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**20.CC** The Animals Committee shall advise the Secretariat, as appropriate, on aspects of the development of trade resource kits and other guidance materials that are relevant to the Animals Committee's mandate.

SUPPORT TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF AN  
AFRICAN LION INVENTORY AND DATABASE

**Directed to the Secretariat, in consultation with African lion range States**

**20.AA** The Secretariat shall:

- a) subject to external funding, and in consultation with African lion range States, support the process as agreed by the ACI range States relating to the development of an inventory and of an African lion database (see Activities 11.2.1 and 11.4.1 in the [PoW of the ACI](#) and outcome 5.3 of the [outcomes of the ACI2 meeting](#)); and
- b) inform the Animals Committee regarding the development of an inventory and of an African lion database that relate to the Committee's mandate and seek its advice, as appropriate.

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**20.BB** The Animals Committee shall advise the Secretariat, as appropriate, on aspects of the development of an African lion database that are relevant to the Animals Committee's mandate.

11. [IPBES Report on the Assessment of the Sustainable Use of Wild Species](#) \*  
[Resolution Conf. 18.4 and Decision 19.28] .....PC27 Doc. 10/AC33 Doc. 11

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the joint intersessional working group on the *IPBES Report on the Assessment of the Sustainable Use of Wild Species* presents the list of scientific aspects in Chapter

3 and 4 of the [thematic assessment of the sustainable use of wild species](#) relevant to the CITES implementation (see Annex 1 to document PC27 Doc. 10/AC33 Doc. 11). The following key aspects were added: knowledge gap on global scale of sustainable use of wild species among indigenous people and local communities; climate change, technological advances and increasing consumption; and the role of gender in contributing to the sustainable use of wild species.

Annex 2 to document PC27 Doc. 10/AC33 Doc. 11 contains the CITES processes relating to the scientific aspects identified in Annex 1 and includes additional resolutions and decisions relevant to each scientific aspect. The working group did not identify any resolutions listed in Annex 2 to be amended or reviewed during the next intersessional period to address the scientific aspects relevant to CITES implementation.

The working groups identifies in paragraph 10 several aspects relating to drivers of sustainable use and knowledge gaps, challenges and research priorities to be considered by the Standing Committee and provides a detailed list in Annex 3 to the document. With regards to concerns raised about increased demand linked to proposals to list species, the co-chairs recalled in paragraph 11 that the Secretariat proposed to develop draft guidance and best practices related to periods of transition and possible transitory measures, including but not limited to the period between the adoption of a proposal to transfer a species from one Appendix to another and entry into force of new listings.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) agree to provide the results of the review of the scientific aspects of the thematic assessment of the sustainable use of wild species of IPBES as contained in Annex 1 and 2 to the present document to the Standing Committee through its intersessional working group;
- b) agree to recommend that the Standing Committee consider the aspects referred to in paragraphs 10 and 11 through its intersessional working group; and
- c) agree that Decision 19.28 has been implemented and can be deleted.

12. World Wildlife Trade report \*[Decision 19.31].....PC27 Doc. 11/AC33 Doc. 12

The document prepared by the Secretariat summarizes the responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2023/019 of 8 September 2023 seeking feedback on the draft World Wildlife Trade Report and the potential utility and drawbacks of producing such a report on a regular basis. Views were expressed by Parties and organizations that responded to the Notification with regard to the objective, substance, methodology, time frame and necessity/utility of the Report. They commented on both the potential utility and drawbacks of the Report as well as on the periodic preparation of such reports proposed in document CoP19 Doc.12. A summary of the views expressed in the responses is provided focused firstly on the potential utility and other positive considerations, secondly on drawbacks and other concerns, and finally on the various ways forward proposed in the responses.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to review the responses to the Notification to the Parties summarized above and to provide scientific advice to the Standing Committee on the potential scientific utility and drawbacks of producing a World Wildlife Trade Report on international trade in animal and plant species that are included in the CITES Appendices.

Capacity-building

13. Country-wide Review of Significant Trade\* [Decision 19.47]..... PC27 Doc. 13/AC33 Doc. 13

The document by the co-chairs of the joint intersessional working group on *Countrywide Review of Significant Trade* notes the parallels between the work on country-wide Significant Trade Reviews, the Compliance Assistance Programme (CAP), the capacity-building framework (Decision 19.41) and the development of comprehensive new guidance on making Non-Detriment Findings (NDFs), which should serve as a useful new resource for those range States that are currently subject to the Review of Significant Trade (RST).

The working group concludes that the development of an integrated capacity-building framework remains ongoing and that it is not yet possible to determine if this will sufficiently address the scientific and management issues identified in the country-wide Review of Significant Trade for Madagascar. The working group further concluded that a country struggling with RST may not be selected as a priority country for

assistance within the CAP and that future work should support those Parties with re-occurring issues regarding NDFs for multiple species and who are not currently eligible for the CAP.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) note the conclusions of the working group as outlined in paragraphs 19 to 21; and
- b) agree to propose replacing Decisions 19.47 and 19.48 with the draft decisions in paragraph 22 of document PC27 Doc. 13/AC33 Doc. 13 (also shown below) for consideration by the Standing Committee.

***Directed to Parties subject to recommendations under the Review of Significant Trade***

**20.AA** *Parties subject to recommendations under the Review of Significant Trade are encouraged to make use of the Guidance on the making of non-detriment findings (NDFs) developed under Decision 19.132; and provide feedback on the use of this guidance to the Secretariat.*

***Directed to the Secretariat***

**20.BB** *Subject to the availability of resources, the Secretariat shall provide targeted capacity-building support at a national level to Parties currently subject to recommendations under the Review of Significant Trade, including the application of the new NDF Guidance produced under Decision 19.132.*

***Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees***

**20.CC** *The Animals and Plants Committees shall, taking into account the progress made under the Compliance Assistance Programme and the development of a Capacity-Building Framework:*

- a) *consider whether a complementary new mechanism should be developed to provide targeted support to Parties with recurring issues in making non-detriment findings for multiple species as highlighted through the Review of Significant Trade Process and on the possible role of the Scientific Committees in facilitating this; and*
- b) *provide recommendations, including possible amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) on Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species or other existing resolutions, or the development of a new resolution; for consideration by the Standing Committee.*

***Directed to the Standing Committee, in consultation with the Secretariat***

**20.DD** *The Standing Committee shall review the report and the recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees, and in consultation with the Secretariat, make recommendations for consideration at the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties.*

**Compliance**

14. Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species  
[Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18)]

14.1 Overview of the Review of Significant Trade ..... AC33 Doc. 14.1 (Rev. 1)

The document by the Secretariat updates the Animals Committee on the status of the Review of Significant Trade (RST) for fauna species. Annex 1 provides an overview of all fauna cases (species/range State combinations) with updates since the 31st meeting of the Animals Committee, and an indication of their current status under the review process, and the reference documents that provide detailed information for each case. Annex 2 presents a summary table of all fauna range State/species combinations subject to a recommendation to suspend trade under RST or for which the review process is currently ongoing.

The document also provides an update on the implementation of Decisions 17.108 (Rev. CoP19) to 17.110 (Rev. CoP19) on the development of an RST Tracking and Management database that was

launched during a side event at the 19th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP19; Panama City, 2022). The Secretariat is currently enhancing the RST Tracking and Management System, in particular to make it easier to use the search filters and provide alerts to Parties in the RST process.

The Animals Committee will be invited to take note of document AC33 Doc. 14.1 (Rev. 1).

14.2 Implementation of recommendations for species selected following CoP14, CoP15 and CoP17 ..... AC33 Doc. 14.2

The document by the Secretariat reports on 6 cases where actions were taken by Parties to implement recommendations made by the Animals and Standing Committees since the Secretariat last reported on implementation and recommended action to the Standing Committee at its 77th meeting (SC77; Geneva, November 2023) in document SC77 Doc. 35.3. The fauna species/country combinations reviewed in document AC33 Doc. 14.2 are: *Pandinus imperator*/Togo (this case is subject to a recommendation to suspend trade); *Chamaeleo gracilis*/Togo; *Notochelys platynota*/Indonesia; *Anguilla anguilla*/Algeria; and *Anguilla anguilla*/Tunisia. The document presents the Secretariat's determination of implementation and draft recommendations based on new information provided by the Parties concerned.

In accordance with paragraph 1 k) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18), the Animals Committee will be invited to consider the following recommendations of the Secretariat to be transmitted to the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting:

- a) Concerning *Pandinus imperator* from Togo, the Animals Committee will be invited to:
  - i) congratulate Togo for the progress made towards the implementation of the recommendations of the Animals Committee; and
  - ii) request Togo to provide information relating to the implementation of recommendations a), b) and d) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- b) Concerning *Chamaeleo gracilis* from Togo, the Animals Committee will be invited to:
  - i) congratulate Togo for the progress made towards the implementation of the recommendations of the Animals Committee; and
  - ii) request Togo to provide further detailed information relating to the implementation of recommendations a), c), d), e), f), g), h) and i) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- c) Concerning *Notochelys platynota* from Indonesia, the Animals Committee will be invited to recommend the removal of *Notochelys platynota* from Indonesia from the Review of Significant Trade. Any increase in the quota above 250 wild specimens should be communicated to the Secretariat and the Chair of the Animals Committee along with a non-detriment finding, including a justification of how the change is conservative, based on estimates of sustainable offtake that make use of best available scientific information, for their agreement in advance of any trade taking place.
- d) Concerning *Anguilla anguilla* from Algeria, the Animals Committee will be invited to:
  - i) agree that recommendations d), g), h) and k) have been implemented;
  - ii) invite Algeria to liaise with the IUCN anguillid specialist group of the to assist in the development of an NDF; and
  - iii) invite Algeria to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations i), j) and l) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- e) Concerning *Anguilla anguilla* from Tunisia, the Animals Committee will be invited to:
  - i) agree that recommendations d) to f) have been implemented;



- ii) invite Tunisia to liaise with the IUCN anguillid specialist group to assist in the development of an NDF; and
  - iii) invite Tunisia to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations g) to l) by 30 September 2024 at the latest for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.
- f) For all remaining cases selected post CoP17, the Animals Committee will be invited to invite range States that did not reply to consultations following SC77 to provide an update on the implementation of the outstanding recommendations by 30 September 2024 for consideration before the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee.

14.3 Species selection following CoP19 ..... AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1)

The document by the Secretariat presents the responses from range States for the 21 animal species/country combinations selected for the Review of Significant Trade at AC32 (see Annex 1 to document AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1). The document also contains a report compiled by the United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC) about the biology, management and trade in the species selected at AC32 (see Annex 2) and provides preliminary categorizations of each species/country combination into one of the three categories outlined in paragraph 1) e) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18), namely: ‘action is needed’, ‘unknown status’ and ‘less concern’.

The Animals Committee will be invited to undertake the tasks outlined in paragraphs 13 to 16 of document AC33 Doc. 14.3 (Rev. 1), in accordance with paragraphs 1 g) and i) of Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18), i.e. review the responses from the range States in Annex 1 and the report from UNEP-WCMC in Annex 2, along with any additional information received from the range States concerned; review and if appropriate revise the preliminary categorization proposed for species/country combinations, providing a justification for any revision; for cases where ‘action is needed’, formulate, in consultation with the Secretariat, time-bound, feasible, measurable, proportionate, and transparent recommendations directed to the range States retained in the review process; and formulate separate recommendations directed to the Standing Committee for problems identified in the course of the review that are not directly related to the implementation of Article IV paragraph 2(a), 3 or 6(a).

15. Review of trade in specimens reported as produced in captivity  
[Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP18)]

15.1 Overview and update on implementation of the review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity ..... AC33 Doc. 15.1

The document by the Secretariat presents a record of the status of the *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity*. Details of the 44 cases of species/country combinations that have been selected for the review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity during the two iterations to-date are presented in tables in Annex 1. A table of the 25 current ongoing cases, arranged alphabetically by Party, is presented in Annex 2 to this document.

The Secretariat also reports on actions taken by Parties to implement recommendations made by the Animals Committee and the Standing Committee in order to ensure compliance with the obligations of Article IV, paragraph 4 and 5 of the Convention for the 4 cases selected at the 29th meeting of the Animals Committee (AC29; Geneva, July 2017) and retained in the review of trade in animals specimens reported as produced in captivity and retained in the process at SC77. The Secretariat consults the Animals Committee on its determination as to whether the recommendations have been implemented by the Party concerned. Annex 5 to the present document contains a summary update of the status of those species / country combinations selected for review following CoP17 at AC29 and retained at SC77.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Benin,

- i) recommend retaining *C. sulcata* from Benin in the review and maintain its current zero export quota for captive bred specimens (C) of *C. sulcata* until such time as it addresses the concerns of the Animals and Standing Committees; and
  - ii) encourage Benin to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standings Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).
- b) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Mali,
- i) recommend retaining *C. sulcata* from Mali in the review until such time as it addresses the concerns of the Animals and Standing Committees; and
  - ii) urge Mali to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025.).
- c) Concerning *Centrochelys sulcata* / Togo,
- i) recommend retaining *Centrochelys sulcata* from Togo in the review, until it provides evidence of legal acquisition of all breeding stock for all facilities, including information on source of animals used to augment the breeding stock; and
  - ii) encourage Togo to provide an update on the implementation of the recommendations to the Secretariat by 30 September 2024 so that the matter can be considered at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).
- d) Concerning *Varanus exanthematicus* / Ghana,
- i) recommend removing *Varanus exanthematicus* from Ghana from the review; and
  - ii) request Ghana to ensure that the correct source code is applied in future.
- e) note that *Centrochelys sulcata* / Ghana was removed from the review following the publication of a maximum size limit of 15cm straight carapace length with its export quota on the CITES website.
- f) consider and agree to submit the draft decision in paragraph 26 (also shown below) to the Standing Committee for consideration at its 78th meeting (SC78; Geneva, February 2025).

**Directed to the Secretariat**

**20.AA** Subject to external funding and available Secretariat resources, the Secretariat shall develop, test and establish a Captive Breeding tracking and management database as an essential tool for the effective implementation and transparency of the process under Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP18) on *Review of animal specimens reported as produced in captivity*.

15.2 Species selected following CoP19 ..... AC33 Doc. 15.2

The document by the Secretariat presents the responses from Parties concerned for the 21 species-country combinations selected for review at AC32 (see Annex 2f to document AC33 Doc. 15.2) and the review of known information relating to the breeding biology and captive husbandry for the 17 species selected for review at AC32 (see Annex 3).

The Animals Committee will be invited to establish an in-session working group to review the responses received from countries selected and, in consultation with the Secretariat, formulate draft recommendations and other advice for the consideration of the Standing Committee.

In order to inform the process for future reviews, the Secretariat would appreciate any comments from the Committee on the points raised in paragraph 9 of document AC33 Doc. 15.2 concerning the exact nature of how the species reviews can determine any impacts of removal of founder stock from the wild.

The Animals Committee may wish to provide some guidance concerning what is envisaged in such a review or whether this text should be deleted from the Resolution.

15.3 Review of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on Review of trade in specimens reported as produced in captivity [Decision 19.64]..... AC33 Doc. 15.3

The document prepared by the Secretariat, in consultation with the Chair of the Animals Committee and the United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre (UNEP-WCMC), presents a comparative analysis of the objectives and processes outlined in Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity* and Resolution Conf 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) on *Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species*, focusing on source codes R (ranchered) and F (born in captivity); exceptional cases; short and long-term recommendations; timelines and deadlines; compliance and determination of whether recommendations are met; and differences in 'selection criteria'.

The Secretariat proposes a minor amendment to paragraph 2 d) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. COP19) on *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity* to amend an incorrect reference to a paragraph in Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) and consults the Animals Committee as to whether it wishes to continue the process of reviewing Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) and Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18).

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) agree to propose to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to amend paragraph 2 d) of Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) on *Review of trade in animal specimens reported as produced in captivity* as follows:
  - d) *Where the Animals Committee finds that a species/country combination raises concerns better dealt within the process of the Review of Significant Trade, it can introduce that combination into stage 2 of the process in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18), paragraph ~~4-d)~~ 1 c) as an exceptional case; and*
- b) consider whether it wishes to continue with the process of reviewing Resolution Conf. 17.7 (Rev. CoP19) and Resolution Conf. 12.8 (Rev. CoP18) and, if so:
  - i) consider the draft decisions in paragraph 19;
  - ii) agree the submission of draft decision 20.AA for consideration by the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting; and
  - iii) agree the draft decisions 20.BB and 20.CC and request the Chair of the Animals Committee to consult the Plants Committee through its Chair on these draft decisions and submit the outcome for consideration by the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting; and
- c) agree that Decisions 19.63 and 19.64 have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion at CoP20.

### Regulation of trade

16. Non-detriment findings\*  
[Resolution Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) and Decision 19.133]..... PC27 Doc. 16/AC33 Doc. 16

The document prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with the Chair of the Animals Committee and the Vice-Chair of the Plants Committee provides an update on the publication of the preliminary CITES NDF guidance on the [CITES website](#) and indicates how the NDF guidance will be field tested. The document also proposes a way forward for a strategy and feedback mechanism from Parties and the wider CITES community to share experiences with using NDF guidance materials, and to review and update NDF materials as may be needed.

---

\* This agenda item is addressed to the Animals and Plants Committees.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) note the progress of the CITES NDF project and the publication of the preliminary CITES NDF guidance on the CITES website;
- b) advise on any additional amendments to the NDF guidance;
- c) agree that Decisions 19.132 to 19.134 have been implemented and propose their deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties;
- d) consider the draft decisions contained in:
  - i) Annex 3 to document PC27 Doc. 16/AC33 Doc. 16 on Article III paragraph 3 (a) of the Convention on Appendix I imports (also shown below), and

***Directed to the Standing Committee, in consultation with the Animals and Plants Committees***

**20.AA** *The Standing Committee, in consultation with the Animals and Plants Committees, shall consider paragraph 3 (a) of Article III of the Convention and the meaning of the term “purposes” and propose guidance to the Conference of the Parties on how Scientific Authorities of importing Parties should interpret and assess whether the import of specimen of Appendix I-listed species are for purposes which are not detrimental to the survival of the species involved.*

- ii) Annex 4 to document PC27 Doc. 16/AC33 Doc. 16 on a strategy and feedback mechanism to review and update NDF guidance materials; and

***Directed to the Secretariat***

**20.AA** *The Secretariat shall*

- a) *publish a Notification to the Parties inviting them to share:*
  - i) *feedback on the use of the CITES Non-detriment finding (NDF) guidance with the Secretariat, preferably through the regional representatives of the Animals and Plants Committees; and*
  - ii) *examples with the Secretariat and / or regional representatives of the Animals and Plants Committees of how the NDF guidance has been used;*
- b) *taking into consideration the information received through the Notification as well as the experience gained through the field-testing of the guidance, prepare recommendations for consideration by the Animals and Plants Committees regarding:*
  - i) *possible amendments of the CITES NDF guidance, as appropriate; and*
  - ii) *possible amendments to Resolution Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) on Non-detriment findings, to establish a regular mechanism for the Animals and Plants Committees to identify, review and agree updates to the CITES NDF guidance; and*
- c) *subject to external funding, prepare draft amendments to the NDF guidance based on advice received from the Animals and Plants Committees and submit the proposed amendments for consideration by the Committees.*

***Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees***

**20.BB** *The Animals and Plants Committees shall:*

- a) *consider the recommendations submitted by the Secretariat under Decision 20.AA;*

- b) *advise the Secretariat on amendments to the CITES NDF guidance, as appropriate; and*
- c) *if necessary and as appropriate, propose to the Conference of the Parties amendments to Resolution Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) on Non-detriment findings to establish a regular mechanism for the Animals and Plants Committees to identify, review and agree updates to the CITES NDF guidance; and*
- d) *report to the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties.*

e) report their recommendations to the Conference of the Parties.

17. Non-detriment findings for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction [Decision 19.137] ..... AC33 Doc. 17

The document by the Secretariat presents the background information (see Annexes 1 and 2) and the outcomes (paragraph 16 and Annexes 3 and 4) of the technical workshop on *Non-detriment findings for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction* it organized from 25 to 26 April 2024 in Geneva, Switzerland. In addition to the recommendations in paragraph 16, Annex 3 contains observations made by certain Parties and observer organizations during the technical workshop. Annex 4 contains a compilation of the implementation challenges around taking of specimens from areas beyond national jurisdiction identified during the workshop.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

a) consider the recommendations in paragraph 16 of document (also shown below);

16. In accordance with Decision 19.136 paragraph d), the technical workshop on *Non-detriment findings for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction* recommends that the Animals Committee:

- a) agree that NDFs should ideally be made at a stock level – e.g., a single NDF covering the stock as a discrete unit irrespective of whether catch / harvest is taking place in the exclusive economic zone (EEZ) or in areas beyond national jurisdiction (ABNJ);
- b) agree that distinct stocks / distinct populations, if defined, should require separate NDFs or a single NDF clearly describing findings for each distinct stock / population;
- c) clarify that ‘international scientific authorities’ are not designated bodies and are separate from CITES Scientific Authorities. The interpretation of ‘international scientific authorities’ should remain inclusive and flexible to facilitate the use of information from various sources and engagements with a range of relevant bodies, organizations and experts (allow flexibility for CITES Scientific Authorities to identify the information sources they require to develop NDFs, as appropriate);
- d) consider what biological and capture location information could be included as a traceability element to help inform the making of an NDF for specimens taken from ABNJ;
- e) consider submitting relevant implementation matters raised at this workshop (Annex 4) to the Standing Committee for its consideration, as appropriate;
- f) encourage Parties to ensure engagement and collaboration between fisheries management authorities and CITES Authorities on matters relating to NDF for specimens taken from ABNJ;
- g) encourage Parties to engage with RFBs, including RFMOs, where possible, to access and use data / information to inform NDFs for specimens taken from ABNJ;
- h) encourage Parties to collaborate regionally, including with CITES Parties not Party to RFMOs, to share information, including information to understand stock status and trends, stock assessments, NDFs, quotas, and capacity-building initiatives;
- i) invite Parties to consider, where possible, establishing regional networks of CITES Scientific Authorities and international scientific authorities such as RFBs to share information,

experiences, best practice and build capacity for the making of NDFs for specimens taken from ABNJ;

- j) invite Parties to consider using stock assessment data from RFBs, including RFMOs, in addition to national information and other relevant sources of information, as appropriate, in informing the making of NDFs for specimens taken from ABNJ; and
- k) invite the Secretariat to append the outcomes of the workshop on *Non-detriment findings for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction* and the Animals Committee's deliberations to the CITES NDF guidance for aquatic species, and integrate it into any updated versions of the guidance, as appropriate.

b) note the observations of the workshop as contained in Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 17; and

c) make recommendations to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee (SC78), as appropriate.

18. Guidance on non-detriment findings for trade in leopard (*Panthera pardus*) hunting trophies [Decision 18.168 (Rev. CoP19)] ..... AC33 Doc. 18

The document by the Secretariat informs the Committee that it is organizing an online meeting on 20 and 21 June 2024 during which Parties with quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) will exchange information and lessons learnt regarding the process for determining that such quotas are non-detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild. Unique elements associated with making NDFs for trade in leopard hunting trophies and methodologies used to survey and monitor the populations will also be discussed to inform the need for additional guidance. The Secretariat will provide an oral update on the outcomes of this online meeting. It is anticipated that the Decisions may have to be renewed to finalize the process and to develop guidance that can assist Parties in the making of non-detriment findings for trade in leopard hunting trophies in compliance with Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) as outlined in Decision 18.169 (Rev. CoP19).

The Animals Committee will be invited to note the progress made and, if appropriate, to propose the renewal of Decisions 18.166, 18.168 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.169 (Rev. CoP19) to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

On 29 June 2024, the Secretariat posted an addendum following the 20 June 2024 online workshop with Parties which have quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) on *Quotas for leopard hunting trophies and skins for personal use*. Parties agreed that further guidance on making NDFs for leopards is not needed and existing information (guidelines / protocols / training material) should be consolidated by the range States identified during the online workshop and shared with Parties which have quotas for leopard hunting trophies. An in-person workshop to discuss the afore mentioned consolidated information and to do an NDF training course will facilitate information exchange, provide an opportunity to discuss potential standardization of processes, where feasible, and address some capacity-building needs.

The Animals Committee is invited to:

- a) note the observations and recommendations made by Parties which have quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) that participated in the online workshop;
- b) agree that Decisions 18.166 and 18.168 (Rev. CoP19) have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and
- c) agree to submit the revisions to Decision 18.169 (Rev. CoP19) and the new draft decision proposed in paragraph 10 above (also shown below) for consideration by the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

***Directed to the Secretariat***

**18.169 (Rev. CoP2019)** *The Secretariat shall, subject to external resources and as part of the African Carnivore Initiative:*

- a) *encourage and support all Parties with quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) to exchange information and lessons learnt regarding the process for determining that such quotas are non-detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild; and*
- b) *support ~~in cooperation with~~ range States, upon request, and relevant experts, to consolidate existing information relating to the management and monitoring of leopard and hunting quotas ~~develop guidance that can assist Parties in the making of non-detriment findings for trade in leopard hunting trophies in compliance with Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19), facilitate the sharing e of the information with relevant Parties~~ draft guidance and bring any aspects relevant to the mandate of with the Animals Committee to its attention. for its review, make such guidance available on the CITES website, and encourage its use by relevant Parties.*

**Directed to Parties which have quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19)**

**20.AA**

*Parties which have quotas for leopard hunting trophies established under Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19) to consolidate existing information relating to the management and monitoring of leopard and hunting quotas that assist Parties in the making of non-detriment findings for trade in leopard hunting trophies in compliance with Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP19).*

19. Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species

19.1 Report of the intersessional working group\*

*[Resolution Conf. 19.4 and Decision 19.142] ..... PC27 Doc. 17/AC33 Doc. 19.1 (Rev. 1)*

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the joint inter-sessional working group on *Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species* presents an overview of all references to identification materials found in Resolutions and Decisions and draws the attention to an [Identification materials database](#) on the CITES website. The identification materials cover various taxonomic levels ranging from subspecies, species, genus, family, class and order levels. Around 2250 taxonomic groups are covered, of which 1942 are on fauna and 193 are on flora.

The document presents a set of observations in paragraph 11 and, *inter alia*, indicates that the scope and volume of materials presented a significant challenge to implement the mandate and a more focused approach is needed. It also notes in the same paragraph that the process for reviewing existing materials and assessing the need for their revision and improvement may benefit from having separate Animals and Plants Committee working groups that conduct targeted reviews, prioritize the identification materials to be reviewed, identify new material needed and provide recommendations relating to the improvement or development of identification materials based on such prioritization.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to consider the revised draft decisions contained in paragraph 12 of document PC27 Doc. 17/AC33 Doc. 19.1 (Rev. 1) (also shown below) for submission to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

***Directed to the Secretariat***

***19.143 (20.AA) The Secretariat shall issue a Notification to the Parties requesting Parties to:***

- a) *share information with the Secretariat relating to the materials used to identify specimens of Appendix-II listed species and Appendix-I listed plants and any challenges experienced in accessing or using existing materials, including gaps in information;*

- b) identify specific species in trade for which identification materials need to be developed and indicate if such materials are needed to cover parts and derivatives, as well as whole specimens; and
- c) share the information with the intersessional working groups on Identification materials to inform the selection of identification materials to be reviewed and the prioritization of new material to be developed.
- ~~b) continue collecting information on identification materials and share it through the CITES website and the CITES Virtual College; and~~
- ~~e) report on the progress and make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.~~

**Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees, in consultation with the Secretariat**

**19.142 (20.BB) The Animals and Plants Committees shall**

- a) establish a ~~joint~~ working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:
  - i) ~~review the information provided by Parties in response to the Notification to the Parties issued by the Secretariat referred to in Decision 20.AA review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions;~~
  - ii) prepare a proposed selection of identification materials to be reviewed and new material to be prioritized for development;
  - iii) review progress made with the initiative by China on the development of identification materials for Appendix-I listed animal species;
  - iv) consider ways to improve the applicability, accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed animal species; and
  - v) report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Animals and Plants Committees.
- c) consider the report of the working group on identification material and make recommendations to the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties relating to identification materials to be updated or developed.

**Directed to the Plants Committee**

**20.CC The Plants Committee shall:**

- a) establish a working group on identification materials and undertake the following working group tasks, in consultation with the Secretariat:
  - i) review the information provided by Parties in response to the Notification to the Parties issued by the Secretariat referred to in Decision 20.AA;
  - ii) prepare a proposed selection of identification materials to be reviewed and new material to be prioritized for development;
  - iii) consider ways to improve the applicability, accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed plant species; and
  - iv) report on the progress with these activities at the meeting(s) of the Plants Committee.



- b) *consider the report of the working group on identification material and make recommendations to the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties relating to identification materials to be updated or developed.*

***Directed to Parties***

**19.144(20.DD)** *Parties are encouraged to*

- a) *support the efforts of the working group on identification materials by providing to the Secretariat information on available identification and guidance materials for specimens of Appendix-II listed species that used by Parties and particularly by enforcement and inspection officers, and any challenges experienced or gaps in the available materials, to facilitate the review and development of materials to assist Parties in identification of specimens of CITES-listed species implementation of the Convention; and*
- b) *establish collaboration and communication between key experts/specialists at a national and regional level to assist the Committees in implementing Decisions 20.BB ii) and iv); 20 CC ii) and iii).*

***Directed to Parties***

**20.EE** *Parties, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations are encouraged to provide financial and technical assistance to Parties to implement the recommendations made by the Animals and Plants Committees as appropriate.*

19.2 Identification Manual of animals listed in CITES Appendix I ..... AC33 Doc. 19.2

The document prepared by China as the focal point of the *Expert Contact Group on the Identification Manual of Animals Listed in CITES Appendix I* provides an update on the development of an Identification Manual of Animals Listed in CITES Appendix I (AIA-ID).

The document presents in paragraph 14 the results of a gap analysis based on the inventory of ID materials available on the CITES Checklist and Species+ and the CITES listings of Appendix-I animals downloaded in September 2023. The gap analysis focuses also on distinct gaps per taxonomic groups, i.e., mammals, birds, reptiles and amphibians. The document also outlines the ambition of the new “Identification manual of animals listed in CITES Appendix I” in paragraphs 15 to 18 with a focus on exploring innovative ways (including Artificial Intelligence) to provide sustainable access, integration, analysis and update mechanisms for relevant data and resources. The aim of this system is to improve law enforcement capabilities and efficiency.

As indicated in paragraphs 19 and 20, the next key step for the new ID manual is the establishment of a knowledge base of CITES ID materials for Appendix I animal species that will urgently need to be coordinated with other processes of the Convention to avoid duplication of work. It is recommended that mechanisms be established to integrate technical cooperation, financial support and computing capacity.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) note of the progress and activities made by the Expert Contact Group on the Identification Manual of Animals Listed in CITES Appendix I;
- b) invite more Parties, especially French speakers and stakeholders, including zoos and aquariums, to contribute to the initiative, as well as to make more ID materials available to experts through the Online Library and the image database;
- c) provide comments and further instructions on the gap analysis and comments set out in paragraph 14 and the ambition of the new ID Manual in paragraphs 15-18, if any;
- d) formulate recommendations on the work and steps planned in paragraphs 19-20.

20. Transport of live specimens\* [Decision 19.158] ..... PC27 Doc. 19/AC33 Doc. 20

The document prepared by the Secretariat informs the Committees of the organization of an online workshop on transport of live specimens that took place on 21 March 2024. The aim of the workshop was to share best practices in transporting live animals and plants. The workshop focused on regulatory compliance; container requirements; contingency procedures at entry points; confiscation; handling of dead or injured specimens; temporary holding of wildlife before and/or after transport; high welfare detentions and biosecurity; and transports of flora. With regard to the accessibility of the IATA Live Animal Regulations (LAR) and IATA Perishable Cargo Regulations (PCR), the Secretariat has provided an initial forecast to the International Air Transport Association regarding the number of accesses required by developing country Parties in order to initiate the negotiation on the discounted rate.

The Animals Committee and the Plants Committee are invited to:

- a) note this document and to agree that Decision 19.158 has been implemented.
- b) request the Secretariat to make the information available from the workshop available on the Secretariat's website.

21. Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade..... AC33 Doc. 21

The document prepared by the Chair of the Animals Committee, in consultation with the ISO Secretariat and the CITES Secretariat, presents issues identified with Resolution Conf. 8.13 (Rev. CoP17) on *Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade*. These include reference to the IUCN/SSC Conservation Breeding Specialist Groups review on the application of coded micro-chips that is not available anymore and an ISO standard (ISO 14223) for which several security measures have not been developed yet. In order to continue the work to update Resolution Conf. 8.3 (Rev. CoP17) taking into consideration changes in technologies and standards and the potential need to conduct an overall review of all Resolutions dealing with the issues of marking, draft decisions to undertake these reviews are proposed.

The Animals Committee will be invited to consider proposing the draft decisions in paragraph 8 of document AC33 Doc. 21 (also shown below) to the Standing Committee for consideration at its 78th meeting.

***Directed to the Secretariat***

**20.AA** *The Secretariat shall,*

- a) *prepare an overview of all currently valid Resolutions dealing with the issue of marking; and*
- b) *in collaboration with the ISO Secretariat, develop guidance on the various issues in relation to marking as outlined in Resolution Conf. 8.13 (Rev. CoP17) and document AC33 Doc. 21.*

***Directed to the Animals Committee***

**20.BB** *The Animals Committee shall:*

- a) *consider the overview and draft guidance developed by the Secretariat under Decision 20.AA and determine whether Resolution Conf. 8.13 (Rev CoP17) and other relevant Resolutions should be amended or if a new Resolution or other technical guidance on marking techniques and standards is required, and*
- b) *submit its recommendations, including possible amendments to existing Resolutions or a new draft resolution to the Standing Committee for its consideration.*

***Directed to the Standing Committee***

**20.CC** *The Standing Committee shall:*

- a) *consider the overview and draft guidance developed by the Secretariat under Decision 20.AA and the recommendations from the Animals Committee under Decision 20.BB; and*
- b) *submit the results of this work along with its own recommendations for consideration of the Conference of the Parties at its 21st meeting (CoP21).*

22. Specimens produced through biotechnology\* [Decision 19.162]..... No document

The Secretariat, on behalf of Cuba, Chair of the Standing Committee intersessional working group on specimens produced through biotechnology, will provide an oral update on the implementation of Decisions 19.161 to 19.163.

23. Definition of the term ‘appropriate and acceptable destinations’ [Decision 19.165]..... AC33 Doc. 23

The document prepared by the Secretariat summarizes the responses and feedback received on the Parties’ experience with using the [Non-binding guidance for determining whether a proposed recipient of a living specimen is suitably equipped to house and care for it](#), the [Non-binding guidance for determining whether a proposed recipient of a living specimen of African elephant and/or southern white rhinoceros is suitably equipped to house and care for it](#) and the [Non-binding best practice guidance on how to determine whether “the trade would promote in situ conservation”](#). Only two responses had been received from the following Parties: New Zealand and Zimbabwe. The Secretariat notes low number of responses may be due to the limited period of time for Parties to have tested the guidance material since it was made available and it is noted from the trade database that there has been very little trade in live African elephants or southern white rhinoceros since CoP19. Paragraphs 13 to 21 outline possible improvements and further clarifications as suggested by the two Parties. It is the Secretariat’s assessment that no amendments to the guidance are required at this point in time.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) consider the points raised in paragraphs 13 to 21 and, if necessary, make recommendations for consideration by the Standing Committee; and
- b) agree that Decisions 19.164 and 19.165 have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the Conference of the Parties.

24. Trade in stony corals (Scleractinia spp.)..... AC33 Doc. 24

The document prepared by the Secretariat on behalf of the co-chairs of the working group on *Trade in stony corals* indicates that detailed responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2023/081 (see Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 24) have been received but that the working group has not been able to analyse them in order to implement its mandate.

The Animals Committee will be invited to consider establishing an in-session working group to consider the proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 11.10 (Rev. CoP15) and sections 3 and 6 a) of the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports* and section 4 a) of the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual illegal trade reports* and any further recommendations from the intersessional working group.

Exemptions and special trade provisions

25. Review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source\* [Decision 19.180]..... PC27 Doc. 21/AC33 Doc. 25 (Rev. 1)

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the joint intersessional working group on the *Review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source* presents the results of its intersessional work to support the Standing Committee’s intersessional working group by identifying the conservation risks associated with non-wild trade, any accompanying mitigating actions and the assumptions on which those mitigating actions are based, as well as the potential differences between animals bred in captivity and artificially propagated plants. The document presents the consolidated summaries of the responses to the questions shared with the working group and through Notification to the Parties No. 2024/021 in Annex 1 and the scientific aspects/advice to be considered by the Standing Committee intersessional working group in Annex 2.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) consider the information provided in document PC27 Doc. 21/AC33 Doc. 25 (Rev. 1) and its Annexes;

- b) provide the scientific advice contained in Annex 2 to document PC27 Doc. 21/ AC33 Doc. 25 (Rev. 1) to the Standing Committee through its intersessional working group on the *Review of CITES provisions related to trade in specimens of animals and plants not of wild source*; and
- c) agree that Decision 19.180 has been implemented and recommend its deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

26. Implementation of paragraph 5 j) of Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) on Registration of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species in captivity for commercial purposes..... AC33 Doc. 26

The document prepared by the Secretariat responds to the request made by the Standing Committee to draft elements of guidance on standardized and objective criteria to implement the requirement stated in paragraph 5 j) of Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) to assist Management Authorities in making the findings about the continuing meaningful contribution that the captive-breeding operation will make to the conservation needs of the species concerned. Based on an analysis of the information included in the applications submitted by CITES Management Authorities for 406 operations breeding Appendix-I listed animal species, the Secretariat identified seven conservation strategies mentioned by Parties in their answer to question 15 of the sample application form in Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) on *Registration of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species in captivity for commercial purposes*: “Describe the strategies used or activities conducted by the breeding operation to contribute to the conservation of wild population(s) of the species.” The Secretariat also presents how responses to question 15 vary by taxonomic groups.

The main conservation strategy used is “Reduction of the pressure on wild populations”, followed by “Financial contribution to a conservation fund” and “Potential reintroduction into the wild”, in particular for the families Crocodylidae and Pangasidae. Only eight Parties have registered operations for non-native species and no reintroductions into the wild have been recorded. The Secretariat notes that there is no way for the Secretariat to determine whether these strategies are implemented or to determine their impact on conservation of wild populations. Furthermore, Parties are under no obligation to inform the Secretariat of the reintroduction into the wild of specimens bred in captivity. The Secretariat also reflects on existing guidance that may be relevant to the discussion.

The Secretariat asks guidance from the Animals Committee as to whether the 7 identified conservation strategies and the *IUCN Guidelines for reintroductions and other conservation translocations*, Resolution Conf. 13.9 on *Encouraging cooperation between Parties with ex situ breeding operations and those with in situ conservation programmes*, the *Non-binding practice guidance on how to determine whether “the trade would promote in situ conservation”* and the *IUCN/SSC Guidelines on the Use of Ex Situ Management for Species Conservation* mentioned in paragraph 29 and 30 provide enough guidance to constitute standardized and objective criteria or whether separate draft guidance for native species would be useful, taking into consideration the guidance mentioned in paragraph 29. The Secretariat asks what specific elements should the guidance focus on?

- a) additional guidance to include in the *Guidance for Inspection of Captive Breeding and Ranching Facilities* to help CITES authorities monitor the strategies of the operation or its activities contributing to the conservation of wild populations of the species?
- b) additional guidance for individual species or families on the frequency with which the parental stock should be augmented to increase the genetic pool of the captive population in order to avoid any deleterious inbreeding without any detrimental effect on the conservation of the species in the wild?
- c) any other specific guidance related to one of the seven strategies identified?

Based on the responses provided to the questions above, the Animals Committee will be invited to ask the Secretariat to prepare a document for the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee:

- a) proposing that the seven conservation strategies identified in paragraph 9, the already existing guidance mentioned in paragraphs 29 and 30 as well as any relevant conclusions related to the implementation of Decisions 19.179 and 19.180 be circulated through a Notification to the Parties and published on the CITES website to help Management Authorities determine whether the captive breeding operation makes a continuing meaningful contribution according to the conservation needs of the species concerned;

OR

- b) proposing draft decisions for the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties asking the Secretariat, subject to the availability of external funding and in consultation with the Animals Committee, to prepare additional guidance with standardized and objective criteria to implement the requirement stated in paragraph 5 j) of Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP15) to assist Management Authorities in making the findings about the continuing meaningful contribution that the captive-breeding operation will make to the conservation needs of the species concerned, for approval by the Standing Committee. The guidance should focus on the gaps identified by the Animals Committee at the present meeting.

27. Conservation aspects of captive-breeding of Asian big cats (Felidae spp.)..... AC33 Doc. 27

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the five steps to evaluate the appropriateness of *ex situ* management as part of a comprehensive species conservation strategy as outlined by the IUCN SSC [Guidelines on the use of ex situ management for species conservation](#). The Secretariat is of the view that the IUCN SSC [Guidelines on the use of ex situ management for species conservation](#) provides useful guidance that could assist Parties in evaluating the conservation aspects of tiger captive breeding facilities as called for by the Standing Committee at its 77th meeting.

The Animals Committee will be invited to consider whether the IUCN SSC [Guidelines on the use of ex situ management for species conservation](#) provides adequate guidance to Parties on how to evaluate the conservation aspects of tiger captive breeding facilities.

**Species conservation and trade**

28. Assessment of Appendix-I listed species\*

28.1 Report of the Secretariat [Decision 19.184]..... PC27 Doc. 23.1/AC33 Doc. 28.1

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the results of the detailed assessments on the 10 species listed in paragraph 15 of document CoP19 Doc. 11. The Secretariat shared the detailed assessments (available as an Annex to document PC27 Doc. 23.1/AC33 Doc. 28.1) and a questionnaire requesting further information with the range States or territories of the species concerned. For each species, the Secretariat drafted recommendations, which were expanded on by the range States. The full list of recommendations can be found in each detailed assessment in the Annex. The recommendations included species specific actions, but the recurring themes included the following: a) demand reduction for illegal specimens; b) combatting illegal wildlife trade; and c) further research on biology of the species to inform conservation actions.

The Secretariat makes several observations on the overall aim of the process in paragraph 12, highlighting the need to clarify the overall aim and clarify the added value of the process given the overlap between the process with existing processes and activities outlined in CITES Resolutions, such as the Periodic Review and the Review of trade in animals reported as produced in captivity.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) take note of the progress made under Decision 19.184 and the detailed assessments conducted on the 10 species;
- b) consider the observations by the Secretariat in paragraph 12 and the need and merit of continuing the work on assessing Appendix-I listed species in conjunction with the report of the intersessional work in document PC27 Doc. 23.2 / AC33 Doc. 28.2; and
- c) make recommendations to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

28.2 Report of the intersessional working group [Decision 19.185]..... PC27 Doc. 23.2/AC33 Doc. 28.2

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the joint intersessional working group on the *Assessment of Appendix-I listed species* presents the outcomes of their intersessional works and reflects on the methodology and the criteria for carrying out an assessment of species listed in Appendix I. In paragraph

11, the co-chairs identify elements that would require further consideration, particularly in terms of whether and how certain criteria should be incorporated into the rapid assessment.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) consider substituting criterion 2.1 used in the original rapid assessment that are no longer available with other criteria and information contained in the IUCN Red List assessment;
- b) consider the outstanding questions in paragraph 11 of document PC27 Doc. 23.2/AC33 Doc. 28.2; and
- c) make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties.

29. Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade\* [Decision 19.187]..... PC27 Doc. 24/AC33 Doc. 29

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the joint intersessional working group on *Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade* presents general observations (paragraph 8) and draft recommendations (paragraph 9) of the intersessional working group.

In paragraph 8, several members of the working group observed that it is the decision of the Parties to select and propose species for inclusion into the Appendices of CITES. Most members consider that Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II* provides good guidance for the preparation of listing proposals, but that capacity to identify species that may warrant CITES listing and capacity to draft listing proposals may still be lacking among Parties. The working group felt that the Scientific Committees should not proactively play a major role in assessing information concerning species at risk of extinction that might merit consideration under CITES.

In paragraph 9, the working group proposes eight recommendations for consideration by the Animals and Plants Committee, including updates to the CITES website [recommendations a) to c) and e)], options for Parties needing information or support with the preparation of a CITES listing proposal [recommendation d)], the role of the Animals and Plants Committees [recommendation f)] and the Standing Committee [recommendation g)] and a proposed amendment to Resolution Conf. 19.2 [recommendation h)], i.e. the inclusion of a new subparagraph (d) under paragraph 2 Resolution Conf. 19.2 as follows (new text underlined)

2. INVITES Parties to:

[...]

- d) upload to and update the CITES website, either directly or through the Secretariat, with relevant studies, analyses, or other sources on species that are or may be affected by international trade, are at risk of extinction and are either not yet regulated under CITES or may receive insufficient CITES regulation.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) consider the general observations and draft recommendations in paragraphs 8 and 9 of document PC27 Doc. 24/AC33 Doc. 29;
- b) agree to the recommendations to be submitted for consideration by the Standing Committee through its intersessional working group on *Species at risk of extinction*, to facilitate the implementation of Decision 19.186; and
- c) agree that Decision 19.187 has been implemented and propose its deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

30. Aquatic species listed in the Appendices [Decision 19.190]..... AC33 Doc. 30

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the background information and the outcomes of the technical workshop on *Aquatic species listed in the CITES Appendices* that took place from 23 to 24 April 2024 in Geneva, Switzerland.

In addition to the recommendations in paragraph 10 of document AC33 Doc. 30, paragraph 12 reflects the observations made by certain Parties and observer organizations during the workshop. Annex 2 contains the collation of work done on the interpretation of the criteria that has been considered by CoP as it relates to application of criteria Annex 2a criterion B referred to in paragraph 10 d).

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) consider the recommendations in paragraph 10 of document AC33 Doc. 30 (also shown below);

*The Animals Committee is invited to:*

- a) *note the background document prepared by the Secretariat Variability of life history parameters and productivity in elasmobranchs and other commercially exploited aquatic species;*
- b) *invite the Secretariat to consider including information on the application of footnote 2 to commercially exploited aquatic species when developing general capacity-building materials on Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II;*
- c) *invite the Secretariat to provide a collation of the work done on the interpretation of the criteria that has been considered by the CoP as it relates to application of criteria Annex 2a criterion B to the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee and make it available on the CITES website;*
- d) *consider the collated information and discuss the need for draft decisions to be submitted for consideration by the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee and 20th meeting of the Conference of Parties to:*
- i) *review the collated information and determine the need to develop further guidance;*
- ii) *if so determined, develop further guidance on the application of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) and its footnote 2 to Elasmobranchii and other aquatic species; and*
- e) *consider the need to define the term “commercially exploited aquatic species”.*
- b) finalize and agree recommendations to be submitted for consideration by the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee; and
- c) agree that Decisions 19.189 and 19.190 have been implemented.

#### Terrestrial species

31. West African vultures (Accipitridae spp.) [Decision 19.195]..... AC33 Doc. 31

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents an update on the implementation of Decisions 19.192 to 19.194 and on the recommendations agreed by AC32 and SC77. The document includes in Annex 2 the executive summary of the [midterm implementation review](#) (MTIR) of the CMS Multi-species Action Plan to Conserve African-Eurasian Vultures (Vulture MsAP). The MTIR concludes that many vulture populations are still declining at a precipitous rate in Africa where data are especially scant and where monitoring is often difficult. The MTIR also includes an assessment of threats and concluded that the prioritization of threats as reflected in the Vulture MsAP has not changed.

The Secretariat informs the Animals Committee about the launch of the West African Vulture Conservation Action Plan (WAVCAP) by CMS, BirdLife International and the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) in collaboration with West African vulture range States. The WAVCAP builds upon the Vulture MsAP and is considered to be the regional implementation plan of the Vulture MsAP for West Africa. It aims to address key threats faced by vultures in West Africa, with a focus on reducing the imminent threat posed by belief-based use.

The Secretariat further notes that the number of trade transactions are declining over time and none of the three range States that submitted annual illegal trade reports reported seizures involving specimens of these vulture species. Considerations regarding illegal trade in vultures have been integrated into the implementation of the WASCWC to ensure it is prioritized in the subregion.

The Secretariat therefore proposes that more focused decisions may assist Parties, West African range States, the Secretariat and intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations to make progress in addressing the threats posed to vultures in West Africa linked to CITES implementation.

The Animals Committee will be invited to

- a) consider and amend, as appropriate, the draft revised decisions contained in Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 31 (and show below); and
- b) submit the draft revised decisions to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for submission to the Conference of the Parties for consideration at its 20th meeting.

Text proposed to be deleted is ~~crossed-out~~ and proposed new text is underlined.

**Directed to West African range States (Benin, Burkina Faso, Cabo Verde, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, Sierra Leone and Togo)**

**19.192 (Rev. CoP20)** *West African range States for Gyps africanus (Whitebacked vulture), Gyps fulvus (Griffon vulture), Gyps rueppelli (Rüppell's vulture), Necrosyrtes monachus (Hooded vulture), Neophron percnopterus (Egyptian vulture), Torgos tracheliotos (Lappet-faced vulture), and Trigoniceps occipitalis (White-headed vulture) are urged to:*

- ~~a) integrate illegal vulture trade considerations into their implementation of the West Africa Strategy on Combatting Wildlife Crime (WASCWC) and any decisions relating to Wildlife crime enforcement support in West and Central Africa adopted by the Conference of the Parties at its 19th meeting;~~
- ba) ensure that national laws to protect vultures and control trade in vulture parts and derivatives are effectively implemented, and ensure that penalties for non-compliance are sufficient to deter illegal trade;
- eb) ensure that any international trade in West African vultures is not allowed except in accordance with CITES requirements, and if international trade is found not to be in accordance with CITES requirements, consider implementing a zero export quota;
- ec) follow Resolution Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) on Non-detriment findings, and, in cases where there is an interest in exporting globally threatened vulture species, consider submitting non-detriment findings for the export of vulture specimens to the Secretariat for inclusion on the CITES website and review by the Animals Committee;
- ed) prioritize implementation of the ~~identify any~~ trade-related issues associated with the ~~implementation of the~~ West Africa Vulture Conservation Action Plan, the regional implementation plan of the Multi-species Action Plan to Conserve African-Eurasian Vultures (Vulture MsAP) 2017-2029 of the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS);
- fe) work with relevant experts and organizations for implementing demand reduction strategies for vultures and their parts and derivatives including for belief-based use and consumption and, where appropriate, expand the implementation of strategies that have been successful;
- gf) work with relevant organizations to initiate wide-scale public awareness campaigns at regional, national and local levels about the impacts of trade in these species, including the importance of vulture species to ecology and human health, the negative impacts of belief-based use of vulture body parts, and existing national and international legislation that protects vultures; and



- hg) ~~provide information report to the Secretariat on the implementation of this Decision well in advance of the 34th meeting of the Animals Committee and the 81st meeting of the Standing Committee to assist it in its reporting to the Animals Committee and Standing Committee, as appropriate.~~

**Directed to Parties, West African range States and relevant intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations**

**19.193 (Rev. CoP20)** Parties, West African range States and relevant intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations are encouraged, subject to resources, to:

- a) collaborate in the conservation and restoration of West African vultures and support the implementation of the West Africa Vulture Conservation Action Plan, the regional implementation plan of the Multi-species Action Plan to Conserve African-Eurasian Vultures (Vulture MsAP) 2017-2029 of the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS), taking into consideration the findings of the Midterm implementation review of the MsAP; and
- b) gather and exchange scientific knowledge and expertise on West African vultures, with a particular focus on:
  - i) documenting the scale of vulture trade by surveying markets in and outside West Africa, and identifying inter-regional and international trade routes;
  - ii) characterizing links between poisoning and trade in vultures, and contributing to the African Wildlife Poison Database; and
  - iii) updating the conservation and population status information of West African vultures, and *Gyps africanus* (white-backed vultures), *Gyps rueppellii* (Rüppell's vultures) and *Torgos tracheliotus* (lappet-faced vultures) in particular; and
- c) provide information to the Secretariat on the implementation of this Decision well in advance of the 34th meeting of the Animals Committee and the 81st meeting of the Standing Committee to assist it in its reporting to the Committees.

**Directed to the Secretariat**

**19.194 (Rev. CoP20)** The Secretariat shall:

- ~~a) cooperate with the International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) partner organizations, regional and subregional wildlife enforcement networks, and competent national authorities, where relevant and feasible, to consider vultures in the context of ICWC's enforcement and capacity-building efforts in West Africa;~~
- ~~ba) subject to external funding, support the production of identification materials focusing on parts and derivatives of vulture species for use by law enforcement officials;~~
- ~~c) liaise with the Secretariat of the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS) to assist in the implementation of the trade-related aspects of the Multi-species Action Plan to Conserve African-Eurasian Vultures (Vulture MsAP) 2017-2029 subject to external funding, and share information based on the work of the Animals Committee;~~
- ~~db) subject to external funding and upon request from Parties, liaise with the Secretariat of the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species~~

*(CMS) to support the implementation of capacity-building activities aimed at providing support to the West African range States in implementing the trade-related aspects of the West Africa Vulture Conservation Action Plan ~~Vulture MsAP~~;*

~~e) in collaboration with the CMS Secretariat, consider available trade data and conservation status information from the whole geographic range of the vulture species concerned for inclusion in its reporting to the Animals and Standing Committees; and~~

f) collect information from West African vulture range States on their implementation of Decision 19.192 (Rev. CoP20), and report as appropriate this and other information on the implementation of Decisions 19.192 (Rev. CoP20) to 19.194 (Rev. CoP20), paragraphs a), b), c), d) and e) to the Animals Committee and Standing Committee, at their first regular meetings following the 4920th meeting of the Conference of the Parties with conclusions and recommendations for their consideration.

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**19.195 (Rev. CoP20)** The Animals Committee shall:

~~a) encourage West African range States to undertake a Periodic Review of the vulture species referred to in Decision 19.192 pursuant to Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP19) on Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II, taking note of the offer of the Vulture Specialist Group of the International Union for Conservation of Nature to assist range States in such an effort;~~

b) consider any reports or requests for advice submitted by Parties with respect to the making of non-detriment findings for trade in CITES-listed West African vulture species;

c) consider the reports and recommendations of the Secretariat submitted in accordance with Decision 19.194 (Rev. CoP20), paragraph e); and

d) make recommendations as appropriate for consideration by range States, Parties, the Standing Committee and the Secretariat.

**Directed to the Standing Committee**

**19.196 (Rev. CoP20)** The Standing Committee shall review the implementation of Decisions 19.192 (Rev. CoP20) to 19.195 (Rev. CoP20) and make recommendations as appropriate to West African vulture range States, Parties and the Secretariat, and for consideration by the Conference of the Parties at its 21st<sup>0th</sup> meeting.

32. Conservation of amphibians (Amphibia spp.) [Decision 19.198]..... AC33 Doc. 32

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the background information and the outcomes of the *Online workshops on conservation of amphibians (Amphibia spp.)* that took place from 27 to 28 November 2023 and from 30 November to 1 December 2023 to consider the conservation of amphibian taxa involved in international trade.

The Secretariat presents a [revised Species Prioritization Matrix](#), in the form of an Excel workbook and contained in the Annex to document AC33 Doc. 32 to include the updated red list assessments and a list of range States for the non-CITES listed species that were prioritized. In response to paragraph a) of Decision 19.197, the workshops proposed that Parties be invited to implement biosecurity measures to avoid the spread of pathogens and examined current enforcement efforts to deter and detect illegal and unreported trade and identify additional actions needed. Noting the variety in units of measure used to record amphibian specimens in trade, the workshops concluded that there is a need to compile information on conversion factors between number and live weight of traded amphibians.

In paragraph 25, concerning trade terms, issues were noted in two types of trade in particular: (i) high volume trade for food, where products in trade may be referred to as legs (LEG), meat (MEA) or live animals (LIV), and (ii) trade in scientific specimens is described either as specimen (SPE), body (BOD) or live animals (LIV).

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) consider the key outcomes of the online workshops and agree the recommendations contained in paragraph 29 as amended by the Secretariat in paragraph 32 and shown below:

*The Animals Committee is invited to:*

- a) *encourage Parties to share non-detriment findings for CITES-listed amphibian species for inclusion on the CITES website;*
  - b) *invite Parties to implement biosecurity recommendations to avoid spread of pathogens, such as:*
    - i) *diagnostic testing upon import/export ;*
    - ii) *maintaining closed system amphibian breeding operations;*
    - iii) *packing animals in lower densities to reduce pathogen transmission;*
    - iv) *disinfection of shipping materials to prevent spreading infectious material through water (to be treated before disposal), cartons, containers and substrates;*
  - c) *encourage Parties developing a possible listing proposal under Resolution Conf 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) to take note of Resolution Conf 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature and to contact the nomenclature specialist of the Animals Committee in the early drafting stage to confirm the appropriate use of CITES-adopted amphibian nomenclature in the proposal;*
  - d) *invite Parties to consider Appendix-III listings for species that meet the criteria set out in Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III, and in consultation with other range States, as a possible way of generating more awareness of, and data on, trade in nationally protected species;*
  - e) *encourage Parties to record trade in amphibians to the level of individual species involved in a shipment; and*
  - f) *encourage Parties to indicate the life stage or size of animals being traded as part of the trade data, if feasible, to help strengthen traceability and confidence that the animals in trade are generally coming from the sources described.*
- b) consider whether any changes to trade term codes for body (BOD), frog legs (LEG), live (LIV), meat (MEA) and specimens (SPE) (trade term codes included below) taking into consideration paragraphs 25 and 31;

Description	Trade term code	Preferred unit	Alternative unit	Explanation
body	BOD	no.	kg	substantially whole dead animals, including whole fish, stuffed turtles, preserved butterflies, reptiles in alcohol, whole stuffed hunting trophies, etc. If referring to specimens of sharks and rays (Elasmobranchii spp.), the preferred unit is kg.
frog legs	LEG	kg		frog legs
live	LIV	no.	kg	live animals and plants, excluding live fingerling fish – see FIG
meat	MEA	kg		meat, including flesh of fish if not whole (see

				"body"), fresh or unprocessed meat as well as processed meat (e.g. smoked, raw, dried, frozen or tinned) The code for meat (MEA) should be used in preference for trade in eels for human consumption.
specimen (scientific)	SPE	kg/l/ml/ no.		scientific specimens – includes blood, tissue (e.g. kidney, spleen, etc.), histological preparations, preserved museum specimens, etc.

- c) in the context of the discussions on Decision 19.186 to 19.188 on *Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade* ([PC27 Doc. 24 / AC33 Doc. 29](#)), make recommendations on how to make the material in this document available to Parties on the CITES website;
- d) include any identification materials for amphibians, particularly those for use by customs and law enforcement officers, in view of the sensitivity of amphibians to being handled and the way in which they are packaged, in the mandate of the proposed Animals Committee working group on identification materials, should it be established after CoP20;
- e) agree to propose the draft decisions in paragraph 33 (also shown below) to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP20);

**Directed to Parties**

**20.AA** Parties are invited to:

- a) collect information on the priority species identified in the [revised species prioritization matrix](#) for amphibians concerning:
  - i) national legislation protecting those species, including legislation covering the protection of amphibian habitats;
  - ii) current levels of trade;
  - iii) harvesting levels of amphibians subject to high volumes of international trade; and
  - iv) captive breeding; and
- b) provide the information to the Secretariat.

**Directed to the Secretariat, in close consultation with the Animals Committee and relevant experts**

**20.BB** Taking into account document AC33 Doc. 32, the Secretariat shall, subject to availability of external funding, and in close consultation with the Animals Committee and relevant experts,

- a) update [the revised species prioritization matrix](#) with information from Parties under Decision 20.AA and make this information available to Parties;
- b) develop a table of conversion factors for amphibian specimens in trade;
- c) identify existing identification materials for amphibians, particularly those for use by customs and law enforcement officers, in view of the sensitivity of amphibians to being handled and the way in which they are packaged; and
- d) report its findings, with draft recommendations to the Animals Committee.

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**20.CC** The Animals Committee shall:

- a) consider the report submitted by the Secretariat as per Decision 20.BB; and
- b) make recommendations to the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

f) agree that Decisions 19.197 and 19.198 can be proposed for deletion at CoP20; and

g) agree that the Chair of the Animals Committee include in their report to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee the recommendations agreed by the Animals Committee pursuant to Decision 19.199.

33. Tortoises in Madagascar (*Astrochelys radiata*, *A. yniphora*, *Pyxis arachnoides* and *P. planicauda*) [Decision 19.126] ..... AC33 Doc. 33

The document prepared by Madagascar reports on initiatives that have already been initiated and on existing plans for the conservation of Madagascar's endemic tortoises and freshwater turtles and recommends that the Animals Committee take this information into consideration for possible recommendations.

Concerning the implementation of Decision 19.125, paragraph b), Madagascar will report to the next meeting of the Animals Committee.

34. Outcomes of the CITES Big Cats Task Force: consultation on a resolution on big cats (Felidae spp.) ..... AC33 Doc. 34

The document prepared by the Secretariat summarizes in paragraphs 8 to 10 the perspectives expressed by Brazil, the European Union and its Member States, and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland on a possible resolution on all big cats in response to Notification to the Parties No. 2023/130. The Secretariat notes that only a limited number of responses were received and that there was a lack of responses from range States. Nevertheless, the responses received show that perspectives on the merits of a resolution on all big cats remain divided. The Secretariat then outlines in paragraph 13 to 16 the merits and drawbacks of a possible resolution on all big cats and presents all existing Resolutions and Decisions on Felidae spp. in the Annex to document Ac33 Doc. 34.

The Animals Committee will be invited to review the conservation and management aspects of the responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2023/130 and the preliminary findings outlined in document AC33 Doc. 34, and advise the Secretariat about the merits and drawbacks of a new resolution on all big cats or the possible revision of Resolution Conf. 12.5 (Rev. CoP19) to be applicable to all big cat species.

35. Pangolins (*Manis* spp.) [Decision 19.200] ..... AC33 Doc. 35

The document prepared by the Secretariat summarizes the information submitted by Parties concerning the development and implementation of *in situ* pangolin management and conservation programmes in Annex 1 to document AC33 Doc. 35 and presents an updated report on conversion parameters for pangolins in Annex 2.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) consider the response to Notification to the Parties No. 2024/022, contained in Annex 1; and the conversion parameters presented in the table in paragraph 13 of document AC33 Doc. 35 (also shown below);

**Table 1. Scale mass estimates as conversion parameters for the eight species of pangolin, based on contributed data.**

Species	Mean ± SD (95% CIs) (g)	Range (g)	Median (g)
Giant pangolin <i>M. gigantea</i>	3853.01 ± 617.22 (3815.12-3980.89)	2030 - 5448	3876.5
Temminck's pangolin <i>M. temminckii</i>	2020.1 ± 935.72 (1582.17-2458.03)	342.25 - 3911	1928.88
Indian pangolin <i>M. crassicaudata</i>	1299.95 ± 623.64 (923.08-1676.81)	56.25 - 2099.66	1096.89
Chinese pangolin <i>M. pentadactyla</i>	592.98 ± 217.63* (518.22-667.73)	129.47 - 1121.07*	573.47*

Sunda pangolin <i>M. javanica</i>	367.54 ± 161.48 (338.24-396.24)	27.19 - 824.54*	357.75
Philippine pangolin <i>M. culionensis</i>	368.28 ± 79.84 (331.93-404.62)	275 - 553	341
Black-bellied pangolin <i>M. tetradactyla</i>	322.68 ± 27.82 (320.97-324.38)	118 - 379	324
White-bellied pangolin <i>M. tricuspis</i>	184.02 ± 50.61 (165.45-202.58)	115.5 - 322.06	184.31

\*This estimate was first reported in Zhou *et al.* (2012).

- b) agree that the conversion parameters presented in the table in paragraph 13 (and shown above) for *M. gigantea*, *M. javanica*, *M. pentadactyla*, *M. tetradactyla* and *M. tricuspis* can be used by Parties in cases where national legislation demands that such information be provided for law enforcement and court purposes
- c) submit the following draft decisions to the Standing Committee for its consideration and onward submission to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP20):

**Directed to the Secretariat**

**20.AA** *The Secretariat shall, subject to external funding, work with the Species Survival Commission Pangolin Specialist Group of the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) and other relevant experts and in collaboration with the pangolin range States to further develop conversion parameters for all pangolin species, in particular M. culionensis, M. crassicaudata and M. teminckii, taking into account document AC33 Doc. 35. These conversion parameters should enable the reliable determination of the number of animals associated with any quantity of pangolin scales seized, that can be used by Parties in cases where national legislation demands that such information be provided for court purposes.*

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**20.BB** *The Animals Committee shall:*

- a) *review the conversion parameters for all pangolin species, developed in accordance with the provisions of Decision 20.AA, to enable the reliable determination of the number of animals associated with any quantity of pangolin scales seized, and that can be used by Parties in cases where national legislation demands that such information be provided for law enforcement and court purposes; and*
- b) *make recommendations as appropriate to the Parties and the Standing Committee.*
- d) invite Parties to use the following identification materials to support the identification of seized pangolin specimens at species level:
  - [https://www.traffic.org/site/assets/files/17352/eng\\_identification\\_sea\\_e.pdf](https://www.traffic.org/site/assets/files/17352/eng_identification_sea_e.pdf) and
  - <https://www.usaidrdw.org//pangolin-guide/>
- e) agree to prioritize pangolins in the mandate of the proposed Animals Committee working group on identification materials, should it be established after CoP20; and
- f) agree that Decision 19.239 has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion at CoP20.

36. African lions (*Panthera leo*) [Decision 19.206] ..... AC33 Doc. 36

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents an update on the implementation of activities in joint African lion conservation plans and strategies, and review of such plans and activities, as well as the *Guidelines for the conservation of lions in Africa*.

The Secretariat initiated the comparative study on African lion population trends and conservation and management practices called for in paragraph b) of Decision 19.205; consulted the range States on the proposed approach for the study, sources of information to be used, key research questions, criteria to identify the countries for the comparative assessment of population trends and conservation and

management practices, and invited African lion range States to actively participate in the study. Based on the timeline for the study, the report will be available for consideration by the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee and the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

The Secretariat developed draft guidance on the making of non-detriment findings (NDFs) for African lions in collaboration with IUCN and in close consultation with range States. The Secretariat invites African lion range States to test the general *CITES NDF guidance* and the *Guidance for Non-Detriment Findings for African lions (Panthera leo) under CITES* (see Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 36) and to provide feedback to the Secretariat on their experiences.

The Animals Committee will be invited to consider the information in document AC33 Doc. 36 and the draft decisions contained in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 36 (also shown below) for consideration by the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting and onward submission to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

***Directed to the Secretariat, in collaboration with African lion range States, the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS) and the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)***

**19.205 (Rev. CoP20)** *Subject to external funding, the Secretariat shall, in collaboration with African lion range States, the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS) and the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) and, as appropriate, taking into consideration the joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative and the Guidelines for the Conservation of Lions in Africa ~~in information document CoP18 Inf. 10:~~*

- a) *support the implementation of activities in joint African lion conservation plans and strategies that relate to trade in African lion specimens and the implementation of CITES and as needed, the review of such plans and strategies;*
- b) *jointly with the CMS Secretariat, undertake a comparative study of African lion population trends and conservation and management practices, such as lion hunting, within and between countries, including the role, if any, of international trade;*
- c) *support capacity-building in African lion conservation and management including where appropriate, in the making of non-detriment findings by range States according to Resolution Conf. 16.7 (Rev. CoP17) on Non-detriment findings and the implementation of Resolution Conf. 17.9 on Trade in hunting trophies of species listed in Appendix I or II, taking into consideration the available guidance on the making of non-detriment findings; and*
- ~~d) *assist in maintaining a joint CITES-CMS web portal on African lions, that also allows for the posting and sharing of information and guidance on the conservation and management of African lions;*~~
- ~~ed) *share any relevant update of the Guidelines for the Conservation of Lions in Africa that relate to the Committee's mandate with the Animals Committee for its review; and*~~
- ~~f d) *report on the implementation of the present Decision to the Animals Committee and the Standing Committee and to the Conference of the Parties at its 21st0th meeting.*~~

***Directed to the Animals Committee***

**19.206 (Rev. CoP20)** *The Animals Committee shall:*

- a) *review any relevant update of the Guidelines for the Conservation of Lions in Africa that relate to the Committee's mandate and that has been brought to the Committee's attention by the Secretariat;*

- b) review the information reported by the Secretariat under Decision 19.205 (Rev. CoP20) and submit recommendations to the Secretariat, the Standing Committee and African lion range States, as appropriate.

**Directed to the Standing Committee**

**19.207 (Rev. CoP20)** The Standing Committee shall:

- a) review any reports received from the Secretariat and the Animals Committee under Decisions 19.205 (Rev. CoP20) and 19.206 (Rev. CoP20) and;
- b) make recommendations to the Conference of the Parties, the Animals Committee, the Secretariat and/or African lion range States to improve the implementation of the Convention for African lions, as appropriate.

**Directed to Parties**

**19.208** Parties, including range States and consumer countries of African lion, as relevant, are encouraged to:

- a) increase enforcement efforts to detect illegal, unreported or misreported trade in specimens of African lion and other big cats;
- b) use, where appropriate, South Africa's Barcode of Wildlife Project to help identify lion specimens in trade and, when importing lion specimens from South Africa, collaborate where necessary with relevant authorities in South Africa to improve the traceability of such specimens;
- c) provide details on the observed and/or removed lion body parts in trade when collecting and communicating data on illegal killing and illegal trade in lions to CITES in their annual reports; and
- d) cooperate on lion conservation, including by sharing information on lion populations, illegal killing and illegal trade.

**Directed to Parties, governmental, intergovernmental, non-governmental organizations, donors and other entities**

**19.209 (Rev. CoP20)** All Parties, governmental, intergovernmental, non-governmental organizations, donors and other entities are encouraged to support African lion range States and the Secretariat in their efforts to conserve and restore African lions across their range, taking into consideration the Guidelines for the Conservation of Lions in Africa, the joint CITES-CMS African Carnivores Initiative and the outcomes of the CITES Big Cat Task Force meeting, and the implementation of Decision 19.205 (Rev. CoP20) and 19.208.

**Directed to the Secretariat**

**19.210** The Secretariat shall:

- ~~a) share relevant information generated through the implementation of Decision 19.208 with the CITES Big Cats Task Force, the Standing Committee, or both, as appropriate; and~~
- ~~b) report on the implementation of the previous Decision 18.246 to the 32nd meeting of the Animals Committee.~~

37. Jaguars (*Panthera onca*) [Decisions 19.110 and 19.111]..... AC33 Doc. 37

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the terms of reference of a consultancy estimated at a cost of USD 30,000 that will be tasked to carry out a situational analysis and prepare terms of reference for the creation of a modular system for monitoring illegal killing of jaguars, illegal trade in their parts and



derivatives and other aspects related to conservation; the creation of an intergovernmental platform as specified in paragraph 21 of document SC77 Doc. 43, including the option of a joint CITES-CMS jaguar initiative; and the development of a proposal of a draft joint CITES-CMS working.

The Animals Committee will be invited to take note of the Secretariat's progress in the implementation of SC77 recommendations on jaguars and provide comments and feedback on the draft terms of reference in the Annex to document AC33 Doc. 37.

38. Leopards (*Panthera pardus*) in Africa [Decision 19.212] ..... AC33 Doc. 38

The document prepared by the Secretariat informs the Committee that although the *Roadmap for the Conservation of the Leopard in Africa* has not yet been updated by the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) in consultation with the range States, the IUCN provided information on the proposed process to update the *Roadmap*. The Secretariat therefore suggests that Decisions 19.211 and 19.212 be renewed to provide an opportunity to the Animals Committee to review the *Roadmap* during the next intersessional period.

The Animals Committee will be invited to propose the renewal of Decisions 19.211 and 19.212 to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

39. Songbird trade and conservation management (Passeriformes spp.) [Decision 18.257 (Rev. CoP19)] ..... AC33 Doc. 39

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the background information, including a preliminary study on *A Global Assessment of Songbirds in Trade* and the outcomes of the technical workshop on the management and conservation of songbird taxa in international trade that took place in Bangkok, Thailand from 11 to 14 December 2023.

The workshop agreed to submit the following outputs to be considered further by AC33:

- a) The preliminary study (Parts [1](#) and [2](#));
- b) The workshop report (to be shared through an information document);
- c) The priority list of 204 species (162 songbird species where there is evidence of significant trade in wild-caught individuals and 42 species that are already listed in CITES Appendix I or II) that may require further attention (Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 39). The workshop considered that the priority list could be used to inform possible listings under CITES, management and conservation actions, and the periodic review of CITES listed species;
- d) A list of range States of each of the species in the long list of 548 species for which there is evidence that they are heavily traded (Annex 4 to document AC33 Doc. 39).
- e) A list of Critically Endangered and Endangered species for which international trade may impact their conservation status (Annex 5 to document AC33 Doc. 39);
- f) A table recognizing the standard nomenclature, indicating where the nomenclature used in the study deviates from standard nomenclature adopted by Parties; and
- g) a series of observations (Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 39) and recommendations to help improve the management and conservation priorities of songbird taxa involved in international trade.

Paragraphs 15 to 23 of document AC33 Doc. 39 contain 30 recommendations on, *inter alia*, CITES implementation; capacity-building; captive-breeding and marking; demand; the role of indigenous peoples and local communities; data recording and management; harvest methodologies and mortality rates; disease management; and the possible inclusion of songbird species in the CITES Appendices.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) note the preliminary study and the workshop report;
- b) note the observations from the workshop, as presented in Annex 2 to the present document;

- c) consider the recommendations in paragraphs 15 to 23, taking into account the comment in paragraph 25;
- d) agree to prioritize songbirds in the mandate of an Animals Committee working group on identification materials, should one be established after CoP20;
- e) consider how the handling of birds impacts their well-being in the context of the review of Resolution Conf. 8.13 (Rev. CoP15) on the *Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade*;
- f) agree that Decisions 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.257 (Rev. CoP19) have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion at CoP20; and
- g) in the context of the discussions on Decision 19.197 on *Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade*, make recommendations on how to make the material in this document, in particular the priority lists in Annexes 3 to 5, available to Parties on the CITES website (see document [PC27 Doc. 24 / AC33 Doc. 29](#)).

#### Aquatics species

#### 40. Eels (*Anguilla* spp.) [Decision 19.220] ..... AC33 Doc. 40

The document prepared by the co-chairs of the intersessional working group on eels (*Anguilla* spp.) presents an update on the implementation of the mandate of the working group. The working group analysed the responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2021/018 and Notification to the Parties No. 2023/062 and concludes that there are important gaps in knowledge for certain countries and that Decisions aimed at filling these gaps would be helpful. The working group also notes that these Parties could still provide information now, without the need for a specific Decision.

In paragraph 11, the document outlines relevant Resolutions and information and contains the conclusions of the working group on the potential use of source code R (ranching) for specimens of European eel (*A. anguilla*) from aquaculture production systems.

In paragraph 13, concerning the potential development of a specific resolution on European eels or a Resolution on the genus *Anguilla* spp, the working group concluded that regardless of whether or not a future CoP decides to list additional *Anguilla* species, the remit of the Resolution should cover the entire genus, as it is not possible to separate the problems associated with the implementation of the listing of *Anguilla anguilla* from wider issues.

In paragraph 14, the document also contains a list of topics (with some associated comments) that might be considered for inclusion in a potential Resolution on eels, specifically on knowledge gaps; customs/tariff codes and other trade reporting requirements; illegal harvest/trade and enforcement challenges; traceability of glass eels along the supply chain; where management plans and/or stock assessments have been developed, sharing of lessons learned to inform those of other range states, and species would be valuable; where monitoring programmes have been developed, sharing of lessons learned to inform those of other range states, and species would be valuable; where measures have been developed to ensure traceability, sharing of lessons learned to inform those of other range States, and species would be valuable; where NDFs have been developed, sharing of lessons learned to inform those of other range states, and any species listed in the future would be valuable; how are harvest and trade informed by national/international/global scientific Advice, and how frequently is this updated; how are harvest, aquaculture input and/or trade limits and/or prohibitions developed; whether harvest and/or aquaculture production is informed by national / regional / international demand; what data sharing/transparency mechanisms are in place, e.g. are they a requirement of harvest/trade permits; of measures outlined, which are voluntary and which are mandatory; are there disciplines where knowledge/capacity sharing would be helpful for Parties; how are national measures aligned with regional/international measures; if restocking is part of any harvest/trade measures, are these monitored for effectiveness, etc.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) request that China, Egypt and Türkiye submit detailed information on trade in eels for consideration at the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee, and invite the Standing Committee to propose a specific draft decision directed to those Parties that do not respond, seeking this information;

- b) note the information in paragraph 11 concerning the potential use of source code R (ranching) for specimens of European eel (*A. anguilla*) from aquaculture production systems and make recommendations, as appropriate;
- c) agree to propose the draft decision in paragraph 12 (also shown below) to renew the unfinished task to discuss the potential risks and benefits of reintroducing seized live European eels into the wild to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and

**Directed to the Animals Committee**

**20.AA** *The Animals Committee shall:*

- a) *review the potential risks and benefits of reintroducing seized, live European eels to the wild; and*
- b) *make recommendations for consideration by the Standing Committee or the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*

- d) convey the contents of paragraphs 13 and 14 to the Standing Committee for its consideration, through its intersessional working group on eels.

41. Sharks and rays (*Elasmobranchii* spp.)

*[Resolution Conf. 12.6 (Rev. CoP18) and Decision 19.225]..... AC33 Doc. 41*

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents information submitted by Parties related to conservation and management of sharks in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 41 and information from the CITES Trade Database on commercial trade in CITES-listed sharks and rays since 2010 sorted by species and by product in Annex 3. The document also presents the outcomes of the study on the apparent mismatch between reported and expected trade in shark species, available in Annex 5. The Secretariat also presents an update on capacity-building assistance for implementing Appendix-II shark and ray listings, on its contacts with relevant Regional Fisheries Management Organizations and Arrangements (RFMO/As) and on its collaboration with the UN Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO).

In paragraphs 22 to 28, the Secretariat presents three possible options to include shark catch locations in reporting: 1) ocean basins – to include all the oceans recognized by the International Hydrographic Organization (IHO) and their defined limits (the Indian Ocean, North Pacific, South Pacific, North Atlantic, South Atlantic, Arctic Ocean and the Southern Ocean); 2) Convention areas of certain RFMOs; or 3) the 19 Major Fishing Areas of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. The Secretariat is of the view that Option 1, which provides seven divisions of the high seas, is the best option. As the divisions proposed in Option 1 are simple, it would add a minimal burden on the Parties to include in their reporting, but still provide additional information on the location of the catch.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) review the responses to the Notification the Parties in Annex 2 to document AC33 Doc. 41 and the information from the CITES Trade Database on commercial trade in CITES-listed sharks and rays since 2010 presented in Annex 3;
- b) review the study and its recommendations conducted under Decision 19.223, paragraph c), as shown in paragraph 15 (also shown below);

*Noting that paragraph c) and d) would depend on availability of resources, the Animals Committee is invited to:*

- a) *strongly encourage Parties to report all shark and ray trade in weight and not in number of specimens as indicated in the [Guidelines for the preparation and submission of CITES annual reports](#);*

- b) invite Parties to adopt traceability systems along the supply chains of CITES-listed species, noting the definition of traceability<sup>1</sup>, which has been agreed by the Parties to CITES and further guidance;
  - c) invite the Secretariat to follow-up on mismatches (differences in transactions reported by exporter/importer countries under the same permit; weights; species; etc.) in the CITES Trade Database and correct the mismatch, where possible;
  - d) invite the Secretariat to follow-up with countries that appear to not be reporting exports of sharks and rays (i.e., trade only reported by importing countries) to determine the reason for underreporting and provide necessary support to encourage reporting;
  - e) invite the Secretariat to examine the trade in source code “C” specimens of shark and rays that are unlikely to be captive-bred based on the biology of the specimens;
  - f) invite the Secretariat to propose clear guidance on the reporting of specimens taken from ABNJ; and
  - g) remind Parties of the obligation to submit annual reports to the CITES Secretariat, which includes introduction from the sea and export of sharks and rays and to report at the species level.
- c) review the Secretariat’s suggestions for adding ocean basins to the *Guidelines for the preparation and submission for CITES annual reports* shown in paragraphs 22-28; and
  - d) draft recommendations and decisions to be submitted to the 78th meeting of the Standing Committee for its consideration.

42. Seahorses (*Hippocampus* spp.)

42.1 Report of the Secretariat [Decision 19.229]..... AC33 Doc. 42.1

The document prepared by the Secretariat summarizes key aspects contained in Parties’ responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2024/027 regarding *Request for information on the development of national or regional action plans to improve CITES implementation for seahorses (Hippocampus spp.)*. Based on the responses, some Parties have taken significant steps that align with Decision 19.229. Where not yet done, source, transit and consumer Parties affected by illegal and/or unsustainable international trade in seahorses are encouraged to pursue similar activities, drawing upon the knowledge and experiences gained by other Parties. Among the challenges highlighted by Parties are substantial data gaps regarding seahorse populations and trade dynamics, as well as limited financial, technical, and human resources to implement conservation and enforcement measures.

The Animals Committee will be invited to note document AC33 Doc. 42.1 and the information provided by Parties in their responses to Notification to the Parties No. 2024/027.

42.2 Report of the intersessional working group [Decision 19.231]..... AC33 Doc. 42.2

The document prepared by the chair of the intersessional working group on *seahorses (Hippocampus spp.)* presents the outcomes of its work and proposes recommendations for consideration by the Animals Committee. In paragraph 7, the working group identifies tools and training materials to help Parties implement the Appendix-II listing for live seahorses, which need to be developed in collaboration with species experts, subject to available resources. In paragraph 8, the working group proposes 15 recommendations directed to Parties and in paragraph 9, two recommendations directed to importing Parties. In paragraph 10, the working group proposes 5 recommendations directed to the Secretariat and, in paragraph 11, two recommendations directed to the Animals Committee. Paragraph 12 contains a list of nine issues to be referred to the Standing Committee.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

---

<sup>1</sup> The working definition of CITES traceability is: traceability is the ability to access information on specimens and events in a CITES species supply chain. This information should be carried, on a case-by-case basis, from as close to the point of harvest as practicable and needed to the point at which the information facilitates the verification of legal acquisition and non-detriment findings and helps prevent laundering of illegal products.

- a) consider the recommendations in paragraphs 7 to 11 and make recommendations, as appropriate; and
- b) refer the recommendations in paragraph 12 to the Standing Committee for further consideration.

43. Queen conch (*Strombus gigas*) [Decision 19.235]..... AC33 Doc. 43

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents an update on meetings of the CITES Working Group on Queen Conch; the queen conch NDF project and the queen conch genetics project.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) note this report; and
- b) propose the renewal of Decisions 19.233 to 19.236 on *Queen conch* (*Strombus gigas*) to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

44. Marine ornamental fishes [Decision 19.238] ..... AC33 Doc. 44 (Rev. 1)

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the [background information](#) and the outcomes of the workshop on marine ornamental fishes that took place from 7 to 10 May 2024 in Brisbane, Australia. Annex 3 to document AC33 Doc. 44 (Rev. 1) contains the workshop’s observations on the nature and scale of the international trade in marine ornamental fishes; information exchange; best practices; biology, conservation priorities and management needs; livelihoods; areas of future research; potential options for future monitoring; and miscellaneous observations. Annex 4 contains a catalogue of over 2,000 fishes in international trade based on the various background documents prepared for the workshop.

In paragraph 14, the workshop proposes 21 recommendations for consideration by the Animals Committee. These recommendations pertain to the outcomes of the workshop; the recording of international trade; data accessibility; Appendix-III listings; IATA and IUCN Guidelines; mentoring arrangements; the involvement of indigenous peoples and local communities; conservation and management plans for marine ornamental fishes; best practices; an ecosystem approach; future IUCN Red List Assessments; CITES NDF Guidance; future research topics; information-sharing; FAO’s existing global fishery and aquaculture statistics databases; and the use of the nomenclature in Eschmeyer’s Catalogue of Fishes.

The Animals Committee will be invited to:

- a) note the observations from the international technical workshop on marine ornamental fishes presented in Annex 3;
- b) consider the catalogue of fishes in international trade presented in Annex 4;
- c) agree to the recommendations in paragraph 14 of document AC33 Doc. 44;
- d) agree to submit the following draft decisions to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties:

***Directed to the Secretariat***

**20.AA** *The Secretariat shall monitor the development of any methods or analytical tools to support prioritisation of species of marine ornamental fisheries (e.g. Productivity Sustainability Analysis or other vulnerability analyses, FishBase) and report relevant developments to the Animals Committee, as appropriate.*

***Directed to the Animals Committee***

**20.BB** *The Animals Committee shall review any developments brought to its attention by the Secretariat under Decision 20.AA and make recommendations to the Parties, the Standing Committee or Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*

- e) agree that Decisions 19.237 and 19.238 have been implemented and can be deleted.

45. Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II  
 [Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP17)]

45.1 Overview of species under Review\* ..... PC27 Doc. 33.1/AC33 Doc. 45.1 (Rev. 1)

The document by the Secretariat presents an overview of the animal and plant species in the periodic review process since CoP13. Annex 1A contains the record of animal species selected for review between CoP13 and CoP15; Annex 1B the record of animal species selected for review between CoP15 and CoP17; Annex 1C the record of animal species selected for review between CoP16 and CoP18; Annex 1D the record of animal species selected for review between CoP17 and CoP19; and Annex 1E a summary of all cases of animal species that remain ongoing, as of May 2024.

The Secretariat proposes the deletion of a number of species from the Periodic review pursuant to paragraph 3 d) of the Resolution because no volunteers offered to undertake the reviews. The Secretariat furthermore reached out to the range States who had volunteered to undertake reviews but have not provided an update on progress. The Secretariat will provide an oral update relating to feedback received.

The Animals and the Plants Committee are invited to note the document and the oral update provided by the Secretariat and to consider and agree the deletion of the species from the periodic review as proposed by the Secretariat in paragraphs 13, 14 and 19 and request the Secretariat to update the records in the Annexes accordingly.

The Animals and the Plants Committee are invited to note the document and the oral update provided by the Secretariat and to consider and agree:

- a) the completion of the review as proposed by the Secretariat in paragraph 13,
- b) the deletion of the species from the periodic review as proposed by the Secretariat in paragraph 14 and 19; and
- c) to request the Secretariat to update the records in the Annexes accordingly.

The deletions proposed by the Secretariat in paragraphs 13, 14 and 19 are summarized below:

*CoP15 to CoP17 – species selected at the 25th meeting of the Animals Committee (AC25; Geneva, July 2011)*

Taxon CITES Appendix	Proposed action
<i>Pteropus tokudae</i> (App. II)	<p>Consider review completed.</p> <p>Review submitted for consideration by the 27th meeting of the Animals Committee (AC27, Veracruz (Mexico), 2014): <a href="#">AC27 Doc. 24.3.5</a>.</p> <p>The summary record of AC27 (AC27 SR) indicates that the working group agreed in principle with the recommendation to retain this extinct species on Appendix II (where it is currently listed as part of <i>Pteropus</i> spp.) due to similarity of appearance to other <i>Pteropus</i> spp. being traded in the region and any resulting enforcement challenges, specifically the risk of this species' name being used to trade other species without permits. Further, its deletion from the higher taxon listing in Appendix II would complicate rather than streamline the Appendices.</p> <p>A decision was deferred pending proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.24. Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP19) – special cases: Extinct species already included in the Appendices should be retained in the Appendices if they meet one of the precautionary criteria included in Annex 4.D.</p> <p>Based on the information available, the Secretariat proposes that the Animals Committee consider the review completed.</p>

CoP17 to CoP19 – species selected at the 29th meeting of the Animals Committee (AC29; Geneva, July 2017)

Taxon CITES Appendix	Proposed action
<i>Ovis ammon</i> (App. II)	Delete species from review – no volunteer
<i>Ovis aries</i> complex (App. I/II)	Delete species from review – no volunteer
<i>Podilymbus gigas</i> (App. I)	Delete species from review – no volunteer (the species is extinct)
<i>Struthio camelus</i> (App. I)	Delete species from review – no volunteer
<i>Podarcis lilfordi</i> (App. II)	Delete species from review – no volunteer

CoP17 to CoP19 – species selected at the 23rd meeting of the Plants Committee (PC23; Geneva, July 2017)

Taxon CITES Appendix	Proposed action
<i>Melocactus paucispinus</i> (App. I)	Delete species from review – no volunteer
<i>Caryocar costaricense</i> (App. II)	Delete species from review – no volunteer
<i>Abies guatemalensis</i> (App. I)	Delete species from review – no volunteer

45.2 Selection of species for the periodic review\* ..... PC27 Doc. 33.2 / AC33 Doc. 45.2

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents the assessment outlined in the Annex to Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP19) on *Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II*. Paragraph 8 of the document describes Annexes 1 and 2 to document PC27 Doc. 33.2 / AC33 Doc. 45.2 that include the following three outputs: output 1 - Appendix-I listed animal or plant taxa for which there has been commercial and unreported international trade in wild sources (W, R, U, X, Y and unreported) over the period 2013 – 2022, output 3 - Appendix-I listed animal or plant taxa for which there has been no or minimal reported international trade over the period 2013 – 2022 and output 4 - Appendix-II listed animal or plant taxa for which there has been no or minimal reported international trade over the period 2013 – 2022. Output 2 is covered by the Review of Significant Trade (RST) post-CoP19 summary output contained in document AC32 Doc. 14.2 for animals and in document PC26 Doc. 16.5 for plants.

In paragraph 9, the Secretariat notes that paragraphs 2 and 3 b) ii) of Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP19) detail taxa that should not be considered for review within the periodic review process. Whilst paragraphs 2 and 3 b) ii) A-C establish clear criteria for exclusion of taxa, paragraph 3 b) ii) D (referred to here as 'criterion D'), which proposes the exclusion of species "*for which it is clear that there has been no change in the status, range or trade and for which there is no possibility to need to amend the Appendices*" is less clearly defined. Looking at past practice, clarification and guidance from the Animals and Plants Committee would be helpful in order to 1) refine the various elements of criterion D (i.e., what is meant by a change in status, change in range (distribution) or change in trade), and 2) determine whether criterion D can be assessed to a useful extent considering availability of the required data.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) during their joint sessions, consider the draft decision in paragraph 9 (also shown below) and agree to submit the draft decision for consideration by the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties; and

**Directed to the Animals and Plants Committees, with the support of the Secretariat**

**20.AA** *With the support of the Secretariat, the Animals and Plants Committees shall consider the application of criterion D in paragraph 3 b) ii) of Resolution Conf. 14.8 (Rev. CoP19) on Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II, including past practice; provide any advice to the Secretariat; and make recommendations for consideration by the 21st meeting of the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*

- b) during their separate sessions, establish a schedule for the Periodic Review of the Appendices, and based on outputs indicated in paragraph 8, identify a list of animal or plant taxa to review during the next intersessional period until CoP21(2028).

45.3 Periodic review of *Arctocephalus townsendi*..... AC33 Doc. 45.3

The document by Mexico provides a periodic review of *Arctocephalus townsendi*, the Guadalupe fur seal, which has been included in Appendix I since 1975. The document outlines the biology, status, trade, and management of the species and notes that population is estimated at 34,000-44,000 individuals and is increasing. The document recommends the transfer of *A. townsendi* from Appendix I to Appendix II considering that it does not meet the biological criteria set out in Annex 1 of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) and in accordance with precautionary measures A1 and A2 of Annex 4 of the same Resolution.

The Animals Committee will be invited to provide comments on this review.

45.4 Periodic review of *Monachus tropicalis*..... AC33 Doc. 45.4

The document by Mexico provides a periodic review on *Monachus tropicalis*, the Caribbean monk seal, which has been included in Appendix I in 1975. The document indicates that records show that *M. tropicalis* was last sighted in 1952. In 1986, the IUCN Pinniped Specialist Group classified the species in the IUCN Red List as Extinct. In 2008, the United States of America finalized an in-depth review of its List of Endangered Species (ESA), and also concluded that the species was extinct. The document recommends the deletion of *Monachus tropicalis* from the CITES Appendices, given that it does not meet the biological criteria (Annex 1), nor the precautionary criteria for possibly extinct species (Annex 4D) of Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17).

The Animals Committee will be invited to provide comments on this review.

#### Annotations

46. Informal review mechanism for existing and proposed annotations\*  
[Decision 19.267]..... PC27 Doc. 37/AC33 Doc. 46

The document prepared by the Secretariat presents in its Annex a study on the feasibility and requirements for an informal review mechanism for existing and proposed annotations in accordance with Decision 19.266. The Secretariat is of the view that the annexed study provides important background information on the subject matter for the Parties and constitutes a useful basis for discussion. The Secretariat considers that there would be value in elaborating various aspects, including but not limited to the implications of such a mechanism – considering the wide range of issues and species and specimens that may be considered under different annotations – and potential terms of reference or a rapid guide developing criteria to guide the review of annotations.

The Animals and Plants Committee are invited to:

- a) take note of the Secretariat's progress in the implementation of Decision 19.266; and
- b) consider the report annexed to document PC27 Doc. 37/AC33 Doc. 46 and provide comments on the scientific aspects that may need to be taken into account when conducting an informal review of existing and proposed annotations, to inform the Secretariat's reporting to the Standing Committee at its 78th meeting.

#### Nomenclature matters

47. Botanical and zoological nomenclature\*  
[Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) and Decisions listed below]

47.1 Nomenclature of Appendix-III listings\*  
[Decision 18.313 (Rev. CoP19)].....PC27 Doc. 40.1/AC33 Doc. 47.1

---

\* This agenda item is addressed to the Animals and Plants Committees.



The document is prepared by the specialist on botanical nomenclature of the Plants Committee and the specialist on zoological nomenclature of the Animals Committee, with significant contributions from the Secretariat and incorporating the views expressed by the members of the joint intersessional working group on nomenclature. The document summarizes the perspectives of Parties and observers on nomenclature of Appendix-III listings. The submissions propose that the standard nomenclature review process already carried out for Appendices I and II integrates the species listed in Appendix III, to avoid a parallel review process, while acknowledging that nomenclature amendment of Appendix-III listings has to follow a different approach, because the inclusion and deletion of a species in Appendix III is decided by an individual Party. It therefore proposes in paragraph 33 to develop a specific procedure for any nomenclatural amendments to species listed in Appendix III, to be reflected in Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III* and/or Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*.

The Plants and Animals Committees are invited to:

- a) review document PC27 Doc. 40.1 / AC33 Doc. 47.1 and consider the merit of revising Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III* and/or Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*;
- b) consider the draft amendments contained in the Annex to document PC27 Doc. 40.1/AC33 Doc. 47.1 (also shown below) and agree to submit the draft amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III* and to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature* for consideration by the Standing Committee in accordance with Decision 18.313 (Rev. CoP19); and

**Proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18) on *Implementation of the Convention for species in Appendix III*:**

1. *RECOMMENDS that, when considering the inclusion of a species in Appendix III, a Party:*

a) *ensure that:*

i) *the species is native to its country;*

ii) *if the species concerned is included in one of the standard lists of names or taxonomic references adopted by the Conference of the Parties, the name provided by that reference be used; if the species concerned is not included in one of the adopted standard references, the Party provide references as to the source of the name used as indicated in sub-paragraph e) below, and in cases where there is any doubt regarding the nomenclature to follow, consult the nomenclature specialist of the Animals Committee or the Plants Committee;*

iii) *its national regulations for the conservation of the species are adequate to prevent or restrict exploitation and to control trade, and include penalties for illegal taking, trade or possession and provisions for confiscation; and*

iv) *its national enforcement measures are adequate to implement these regulations;*

[...]

c) *inform the Management Authorities of other range States, the known major importing countries, the Secretariat and the Animals Committee or the Plants Committee that it is considering the inclusion of the species in Appendix III, provide the Nomenclature Specialist of the Animals or Plants Committee with the reference as to the source of the name used to describe the species being proposed, and seek their opinion on the potential effects of such inclusion;*

[...]

e) *after due consultation, and having satisfied itself that the biological and trade status of the species justify the action, submit to the Secretariat its considerations under paragraph 1*

a) to d) above, specifying the following, in accordance with paragraph 1 of Article XVI of the Convention:

- i) the scientific name of the species it is submitting for inclusion in Appendix III:
  - A. if the species concerned is included in one of the standard lists of names or taxonomic references adopted by the Conference of the Parties, the reference citation and the name provided by that reference should be submitted; and,
  - B. if the species concerned is not included in one of the adopted standard references, the Party(ies) should provide reference(s) as to the source of the name used, either at the time of the request or within the 90 days before the listing takes effect; and
- ii) any readily recognizable parts and derivatives to be included, unless it intends to include all readily recognizable parts and derivatives derived from the species;

[...]

6. URGES Parties having included species in Appendix III to:

- a) review periodically the status of these species, seek assistance of the Animals or Plants Committee in undertaking the review mentioned in paragraph 5 of this Resolution, if necessary, and taking into account these guidelines and any recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees, to consider the necessity to maintain the species in Appendix III;
- b) inform the Secretariat and the Animals and Plants Committees about any taxonomic or nomenclatural changes impacting species included in Appendix III to determine whether these changes would also result in changes in distribution that would affect the determination of which countries would be required to issue certificates of origin; and
- c) respond in a timely manner to requests from the Secretariat on proposed nomenclature changes proposed by the Animals or Plants Committee through its process to identify and address nomenclature issues in accordance with Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature and may result in changes in distribution that potentially alter the scope of protection for fauna and flora (inclusion or deletion of species or populations) included in Appendix III, to inform amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) and any action to be taken by the Party that listed the species in Appendix III.

**Proposed amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on Standard nomenclature:**

2. RECOMMENDS that:

[...]

- g) if the Animals or Plants Committee become aware of taxonomic or ~~proposes~~ nomenclatural changes proposed in the scientific literature relating to taxa included in Appendix-III, they should advise the Secretariat of such proposed changes and whether ~~they these changes would~~ also result in changes in species distribution that would affect the ~~issuance of determination of which countries would be required to issue~~ certificates of origin by range States. To ensure the Party (or Parties) that included the species in Appendix III are aware of the potential changes and their potential impacts on implementation, the Secretariat will inform the Party (or Parties) of the nomenclature changes and any resulting changes in distribution that potentially alter the scope of protection for fauna and flora (inclusion or deletion of species or populations) included in Appendix III.

[...]

8. AGREES that the adoption of a standard checklist or reference by the Conference of the Parties does not by itself change the status vis-à-vis CITES of any entity, whether it is listed in

*the Appendices or not, and the status of the entity remains as intended in the proposal adopted by the Conference unless specifically changed by the adoption of a further amendment proposal; any Party that identifies a change in the status vis-à-vis CITES of any entity as a result of the adoption of a new standard reference should consult the Secretariat and nomenclature specialist as soon as possible.*

- c) agree that Decision 18.313 (Rev. CoP19) has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the Conference of the Parties.

#### 47.2 Higher taxon listings in the Appendices\*

[Decision 19.272]..... PC27 Doc. 40.2/AC33 Doc. 47.2 (Rev. 1)

The document is prepared by the specialist on botanical nomenclature of the Plants Committee and the specialist on zoological nomenclature of the Animals Committee, with significant contributions from the Secretariat and incorporating the views expressed by the members of the joint intersessional working group on nomenclature. The document reviews the scientific implications and impacts of existing and future higher taxon listings in the Appendices and summarizes the perspectives and recommendations of the working group on:

- a) whether changes to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) on *Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II* are needed to provide further clarification on when a higher taxon listing may be deemed appropriate, taking into consideration the scientific aspects of Annex 3 to Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17); and
- b) regarding the difference between a higher taxon listing and a listing of all individual species in that higher taxon, whether converting a complete listing of all species in a genus into a genus listing represents a substantive change [i.e., subject to a full amendment proposal under Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17)], or could be considered a non-substantive change that could be made as a matter of nomenclatural updates to the Appendices mandated under Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*.

Taking into account the broadly held view of the Parties that a higher taxon listing is substantively different from a comprehensive listing of all individual species contained in that higher taxon, the document concludes that any conversion of a listing of individual species to a higher taxon listing, or a higher taxon listing converted to a listing of individual species, is a substantive change, which therefore requires a proposal to the Conference of the Parties compliant with the Criteria for amendment of Appendices I and II specified in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP17) and/or Resolution Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP18).

It was concluded that the changes that may be proposed by the nomenclature specialists under the mandate of Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) should be restricted to:

- a) taxon splits (i.e., recognition of new names applied to populations or taxa previously considered part of an already-listed species or higher taxon);
- b) taxon merges (i.e., synonymisations).

All such changes should be at the same taxonomic rank as the current listing of the population, species or higher taxon concerned, i.e. a split or merge of a listed species still results in species listed in the Appendices (and not a genus), and a split or merge of a genus/genera results in two or one genera being listed (not a set of individual species, or a family).

The Plants and Animals Committees are invited to:

- a) consider the merit of revising the section on Higher taxa in Annex 3 to [Resolution Conf. 9.24 \(Rev. CoP17\)](#) as proposed in paragraphs 8 and 10 (see text below):

Text from paragraph 8 of the present document:

*Proposals for the inclusion of higher taxa in the Appendices need to demonstrate for each of the included species that it complies with the listing criteria detailed in this Resolution.*

Text from paragraph 10 of the present document:

*The listing of a higher taxon does not automatically accept the addition or exclusion of species in the listing resulting from future changes in taxonomy accepted by the scientific community, but not yet by CITES. Any such changes would be considered substantive and should be evaluated by the nomenclature specialist, in consultation with the Animals or Plants Committee, to assess its validity and its impact on the scope of the current listing. If the taxonomic changes involving the addition or exclusion of species from the listing are agreed on by the Animals or Plants Committee, the appropriate procedures under Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) should be followed for the submission of proposals to amend the Appendices for consideration at the next meeting of the Conference of the Parties.*

b) consider whether revisions are desirable to Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature* in order to:

i) instruct the Secretariat, in consultation with the Animals and Plants Committees [through their nomenclature specialists], to evaluate whether proposed changes in the taxonomic rank of a listing represents a substantive change, as proposed in paragraph 13 (see text below):

*whenever a change in the name of a taxon included in the Appendices, or the taxonomic level in which a taxon is included in the Appendices, is proposed, the Secretariat, in consultation with the Animals or Plants Committee, determine whether this change would alter the scope of protection for fauna or flora under the Convention. In the case where the scope of a taxon is redefined, the Animals or Plants Committee shall evaluate whether acceptance of the taxonomic change would cause additional species to be included in the Appendices or listed species to be deleted from the Appendices and, if that is the case, the Depositary Government should be requested to submit a proposal to amend the Appendices in accordance with the recommendation of the Animals or Plants Committee, so that the original intent of the listing is retained. Such proposals should be submitted for consideration at the next regular meeting of the Conference of the Parties, at which the recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees that are determined not to alter the scope of protection for fauna and flora under the Convention will also be considered by the Conference of the Parties;*

ii) clarify that changes to the Appendices proposed by the nomenclature specialists of the Animals and Plants Committees should be limited to the same rank as the originally listed species or higher taxon; and

c) agree that Decision 19.272 has been implemented and can be proposed for deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.

#### 47.3 Development of a standardized global checklist of species\*

[Decision 19.274].....PC27 Doc. 40.3/AC33 Doc. 47.3

The document is prepared by the specialist on botanical nomenclature of the Plants Committee and the specialist on zoological nomenclature of the Animals Committee, with significant contributions from the Secretariat and incorporating the views expressed by the members of the joint intersessional working group on nomenclature. The document presents an update on the work of the Checklist Governance Working Group (CGwg) established under the auspices of the International Union of Biological Sciences (IUBS).

The nomenclature specialists are of the view that the Global Checklist process is a long-term process and propose in paragraph 4 of document PC27 Doc. 40.3/AC33 Doc. 47.3 that the Animals and Plants Committees consider incorporating the participation in initiatives to develop a standardized global checklist of species in Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*.

Furthermore, in undertaking their work in terms of Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*, the nomenclature specialists noted that paragraph 5 and paragraph 11 in the Resolution could be a duplication and propose that these paragraphs be merged.

Finally, paragraph 7 of the document presents possible priorities for the selection, preparation, or updating, and adoption of nomenclature standard references based on feedback received from members of the joint intersessional working group on nomenclature.

The Animals and Plants Committees are invited to:

- a) note the list of priority taxa for the adoption of nomenclature standard references in paragraph 7 of document PC27 Doc. 40.3/AC33 Doc. 47.3 (also shown below);

REPTILIA: SAURIA

Gekkonidae: *Carphodactylus* spp., *Nephrurus* spp., *Orraya* spp., *Phyllurus* spp., *Saltuarius* spp., all listed *Sphaerodactylus* species, *Strophurus* spp., *Underwoodisaurus* spp., and *Uvidicolus* spp.

Helodermatidae: *Heloderma* spp.

Phrynosomatidae: *Phrynosoma* spp.

Scincidae: *Egernia* spp.

INSECTA: LEPIDOPTERA

Papilionidae: *Bhutanitis* spp., *Teinopalpus* spp.

MOLLUSCA: BIVALVIA

Tridacnidae spp.

MOLLUSCA: GASTROPODA

Achatinellidae: *Achatinella* spp.

Cepolidae: *Polymita* spp.

FLORA

Amaryllidaceae: *Galanthus* spp., *Sternbergia* spp.

Apocynaceae: *Hoodia* spp.

Asparagaceae: *Beaucarnea* spp.

Bignoniaceae: *Handroanthus* spp., *Roseodendron* spp., *Tabebuia* spp.

Crassulaceae: *Rhodiola* spp.

Cyatheaceae: *Cyathea* spp.

Dicksoniaceae: *Dicksonia* spp.

Didiereaceae spp.

Euphorbiaceae: Succulent *Euphorbia* spp.

Leguminosae: *Afzelia* spp.

Meliaceae: *Cedrela* spp.

Nepenthaceae: *Nepenthes* spp.

Portulacaceae: *Anacampseros* spp., *Avonia* spp.

Primulaceae: *Cyclamen* spp.

Sarraceniaceae: *Sarracenia* spp.

Stangeriaceae: *Stangeria* spp., *Bowenia* spp.

Thymelaeaceae: *Aquilaria* spp., *Gyrinops* spp., *Gonystylus* spp.

Zamiaceae spp.

Zygophyllaceae: *Guaiacum* spp.

- b) consider the proposals contained in paragraph 4 (also shown below) relating to the extension of the mandate to participate in initiatives to develop a standardized global checklist; and

Insert the following paragraph after paragraph 5 in Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*:

ENCOURAGES the Animals and Plants Committees, through their respective nomenclature specialists and subject to external funding, to participate in initiatives to develop a standardized global checklist of species;

- c) consider the proposals contained in paragraph 5 (also shown below) relating to duplicate provisions relating to the promotion of harmonization of the taxonomy and nomenclature used by biodiversity-related multilateral environmental agreements.

Amend paragraph 5 to include text from paragraph 11 and delete paragraph 11:

5. *DIRECTS the Secretariat, in close cooperation with the nomenclature specialists of the Animals and Plants Committees, and in the implementation of its memoranda of understanding or cooperation, or programmes of work with other biodiversity-related multilateral environmental agreements, to ~~consider ways of harmonizing~~ promote harmonization of the taxonomy and nomenclature of species included in their respective provisions;*

48. Report of the specialist on zoological nomenclature  
[Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) and Decisions 19.276  
(African elephants), 19.278 (Bird family and order names) and  
Decision 18.310 (Rev. CoP19) (time-specific versions of online-databases)]..... AC33 Doc. 48

The document is prepared by the Nomenclature Specialist of the Animals Committee, with support and input from the Secretariat and the members of the intersessional working group on nomenclature. The document presents an update on the implementation of the nomenclatural tasks referred to the Animals Committee at CoP19; updates to standard nomenclature under Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19), including the preparation of checklists, standard references for Reptilia (Sauria and Testudines), cartilaginous and bony fishes and sea cucumbers.

The Nomenclature Specialist of the Animals Committee also reflects on the ever-increasing tasks assigned by the Conference of Parties to the nomenclature specialists, the frequency of consultations by the Parties, and the increasing complexity and acceleration of taxonomic and nomenclatural analyses and developments in the scientific community and reminds the Animals Committee that the terms of reference of the Animals and Plants Committees provides for the election of an alternate member to the specialists on botanical and zoological nomenclature.

The Animals Committee will be invited to establish an in-session working group to consider the following recommendations:

- a) encourage the Secretariat to continue its work on the use of online databases as standard nomenclature references and report to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties;
- b) suggest the inclusion of *Loxodonta cyclotis* in Appendix I as a split-out from the populations of *Loxodonta africana* currently listed in Appendix I, and recommend that the nomenclatural standard references concerning African elephants be updated by
- i) deleting Wilson & Reeder 1993 as the specific reference for *Loxodonta africana* in the Annex of Resolution Conf. 12.11 (Rev. CoP19) on *Standard nomenclature*; and
- ii) adopting Mondol *et al.* 2015, or a more up-to-date publication if that becomes available soon, as a supplementary standard reference to clarify the distribution of *Loxodonta africana*, *L. cyclotis*, and their hybrids;
- c) agree to suspend work on consideration of the HBW/BI *Illustrated Checklist of the Birds of the World* as the new standard nomenclature reference for birds at the species, family and order levels, and await the availability of the consolidated checklist of birds of the world currently being prepared before proceeding further with updating bird nomenclature used in CITES; and thus propose Decision 19.278 for deletion to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties;
- d) note progress in the preparation and evaluation of updated checklists for *Phrynosoma* and Iguanid lizards, Turtles, CITES-listed and closely related fishes (Annex 1), and sea cucumbers (Annex 2);

- e) consider the merit of including the three taxa of the bony fish genus *Probarbus* in the Periodic Review of species included in the Appendices;
- f) further consider the merit of adopting additional or updated nomenclatural standard references as listed in the sixth column of Annex 3, which would result in non-substantive amendments to the Appendices as listed in the seventh column, and other changes as listed in the eighth column; and
- g) encourage Parties to consider nominating candidates for the vacant alternate position for the specialist on zoological nomenclature.

## Regional matters

### 49. Regional reports

- 49.1 Africa ..... *No document*
- 49.2 Asia..... *No document*
- 49.3 Central and South America and the Caribbean ..... *No document*
- 49.4 Europe..... *No document*
- 49.5 North America ..... AC33 Doc. 49.5
- 49.6 Oceania..... AC33 Doc. 49.6

The Members of the Animals Committees from the six major geographical regions (Africa, Asia, Europe, North America, Central and South America and the Caribbean, and Oceania) will be invited to submit a regional report on activities undertaken in the region since the 33rd meeting of Animals Committee.

The Animals Committee will be invited to take note of each of the regional reports.

## Concluding items

### 50. Any other business ..... *No document*

The Animals Committee will be invited to discuss any other business that might be brought to its attention. Delegations wishing to propose subjects for discussion under this item are invited to inform the Secretariat as soon as possible.

### 51. Time and venue of the 34th meeting of the Animal Committee ..... *No document*

The Secretariat will inform the Animals Committee on plans for time and venue of the 34th meeting of the Animals Committee that will take place after CoP20.

### 52. Closing remarks ..... *No document*

Following the remarks by Members of the Committee, observers representing Parties and intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and the Secretary-General, the Chair will thank all participants for their cooperation and the Secretariat and the interpreters for their work and will close the meeting.