

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirty-third meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 12 – 19 July 2024

Species conservation and trade

Terrestrial species

SONGBIRD TRADE AND CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT (PASSERIFORMES SPP.)

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.
2. At its 19th meeting (CoP19; Panama City, 2022), the Conference of the Parties revised Decisions 18.256 to 18.259 on *Songbird trade and conservation management (Passeriformes spp.)* as follows:

Directed to the Secretariat

18.256 (Rev. CoP19) *Subject to available funds, the Secretariat shall:*

- a) *within 12 months of the conclusion of the meeting of the Conference of the Parties, commission a preliminary study on the scale and scope of international songbird trade to consider the management and conservation priorities of songbird taxa involved in such trade;*
- b) *consult with appropriate technical experts in the preparation of documents on the conservation, trade, management, enforcement and regulatory priorities of the songbird taxa identified;*
- c) *convene a technical workshop to consider the findings of the study and the reports referred to in paragraph b);*
- d) *invite the members of the Animals and Standing Committees, representatives from range, exporting, transit and consumer States, and relevant intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations to participate in the workshop; and*
- e) *make the results of the study and workshop, together with recommendations, available to the Animals Committee for its consideration.*

Directed to the Animals Committee

18.257 (Rev. CoP19) *The Animals Committee shall review document CoP18 Doc. 79 and the results of the study and workshop on trade in songbirds, with the recommendations of the Secretariat, as per Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19), and make its own recommendations to the Standing Committee or 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties, as appropriate.*

Directed to the Standing Committee

18.258 (Rev. CoP19) *The Standing Committee shall consider the recommendations by the Animals Committee and make its own recommendations to the 20th meeting of the Conference of the Parties.*

Directed to Parties and non-Parties, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, commercial traders and donors

18.259 (Rev. CoP19) *Parties and non-Parties, intergovernmental organizations, non-governmental organizations, commercial traders and donors are encouraged to provide funding to the Secretariat for the implementation of these Decisions.*

Implementation of Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19)

3. Thanks to the generous contributions from Sweden and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, the Secretariat implemented Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) on *Songbird trade and conservation management (Passeriformes spp.)*, including the preliminary study followed by an in-person technical workshop. The Secretariat appreciates the support provided in this regard.
4. With regard to paragraph a), the Secretariat consulted with the Chair of the Animals Committee on the terms of reference for the preliminary study to ensure that they reflected the intention of the Conference of the Parties accurately.
5. Pursuant to the implementation of paragraphs a) and b) of Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19), the Secretariat developed a questionnaire to gather information on songbirds, including
 - a) the levels of international trade in songbirds (legal and illegal);
 - b) the conservation status of the main species or species groups that are traded internationally;
 - c) captive breeding of songbirds; and
 - d) the national/regional (and/or local) management, enforcement and regulatory priorities of songbirds in international trade.
6. In [Notification to the Parties No. 2023/103](#) of 22 August 2023, Parties were invited to access the questionnaire through the link [Songbirds in trade survey](#) and submit their responses by 15 September 2023. A total of 24 Parties and two organizations responded to the questionnaire. A [summary of the responses to the Notification](#) was prepared and the responses were incorporated in the preliminary study.
7. The preliminary study was conducted in two parts by BirdLife International, in collaboration with the Secretariat:
 - a) [Part 1](#) analyses the patterns and processes in the global trade in songbirds. It provides an overview of the current state of knowledge on the scale and scope of international songbird trade to consider the management and conservation priorities of songbird taxa involved in such trade. It is based on a literature review of both grey and peer-reviewed literature and an analysis of a number of global trade databases, including the [CITES Trade Database](#), the United States Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) Law Enforcement Management Information System (LEMIS), market surveys¹, the Songbirds in Trade Database (SiTDB)², the European Union (EU) Trade in Wildlife Information Exchange (TWIX), and the Wildlife in Trade Information System ([WiTIS](#)), among others. Although CITES explicitly concerns only international trade, the study considered that international trade is not independent of domestic trade, and both were therefore considered in the initial scoping exercise.

¹ Donald, P.F. et al. (2023) 'Assessing the global prevalence of wild birds in trade'. *bioRxiv*, p. 2023.08.09.552606. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2023.08.09.552606>.

² Juergens, J. et al. (2021) 'A standardized dataset for conservation prioritization of songbirds to support CITES', *Data in Brief*, 36. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2021.107093>.

- b) [Part 2](#) of the report combined a total of 14 datasets (including the aforementioned global trade databases) and developed a set of 17 criteria³ to identify species for which these datasets provide evidence that trade takes place. Species were scored on the basis of these trade criteria to develop a list of songbird species likely to be heavily and/or unsustainably traded. This list serves as a proposed prioritization of songbird species in global trade to inform conservation, trade, management, enforcement, and regulatory priorities of those taxa. As part of this prioritization, the following steps were carried out:
- i) A long-list was developed by filtering out all songbird species for which there is no evidence of significant trade, leaving 548 songbird species identified as being traded in quantities that might affect their conservation status;
 - ii) The long-list was filtered to remove species already included in any of the three CITES Appendices, as well as species considered not to be traded internationally in significant volumes. Of the remaining species, those for which their trade is sourced mostly from captive-bred birds were also filtered out, leaving a list of 162 species for which there is evidence of significant international trade in wild-caught birds;
 - iii) The list was then filtered down further to include all species with a trade criteria score of 7 (this threshold was selected because it approximates the top tenth percentile of scores), as well as all remaining globally threatened species scoring 3 or higher. This resulted in a list of 22 internationally traded songbird species that might be prioritised for management and conservation action (highlighted in yellow in Annex 3 to the present document).

8. Key outcomes of the preliminary study include the following:

- a) Songbirds have low representation in CITES Appendices relative to their prevalence in all trade sectors. Around 60% of all birds are songbirds, and songbirds comprise a high proportion of all birds in trade, yet they comprise just 1.4% of the species listed in CITES Appendices. Furthermore, the taxonomic representation of songbirds in CITES Appendices is heavily skewed towards a small number of families.
- b) Songbird families with particularly high prevalence in trade include the Estrildidae (estrildid finches), Paradisaeidae (birds of paradise), Cardinalidae (cardinals and allies), Viduidae (indigobirds and wydahs), Sturnidae (starlings, mynas and allies), and Emberizidae (buntings). In contrast, the avian families Furnariidae (ovenbirds), Grallaridae (antpittas), Tyrannidae (tyrant flycatchers), Rhinocryptidae (tapaculos) and Thamnophilidae (antbirds), comprising largely South American assemblages of dull-plumaged forest birds with simple songs, are among the least traded families of songbirds globally.
- c) South-East Asia, South America, Western Africa, the Mediterranean (including the Maghreb region of North Africa) and the Middle East emerge as hotspots of trade in songbirds, with some of this trade supplying significant exports of songbirds to North America and Western Europe.
- d) In most trade sectors, particularly in domestic trade, the majority of songbirds in trade are presumed to be wild-caught, largely due to the ease with which songbirds can be harvested from the wild relative to the challenge of breeding them in captivity. In contrast, the numbers and proportion of wild-caught songbirds in international trade have fallen, due to improved legislation, concerns about the spread of zoonotic diseases and improvements in the captive breeding of a few highly traded species.
- e) Challenges relating to the interpretation and enforcement of existing regulations often compromise their effectiveness, particularly of regulations used to fight against illegal trade. There is clear evidence that where songbird trade is poorly regulated because of these challenges, it poses a threat to numerous songbird species.

Technical workshop

9. The information collected through the preliminary study was used to inform the technical workshop referred to in paragraph c) of Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19).
10. The Secretariat hosted a technical workshop in Bangkok, Thailand from 11 to 14 December 2023 at the UN Economic Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UN-ESCAP). The workshop considered the management

³ For the set of 17 criteria, see the table in Section 3 of the background study [Part 2](#)

and conservation of songbird taxa in international trade. Participants had the option to either attend the workshop in person in Bangkok or online.

11. The Secretariat invited the Members of the Animals and Standing Committees, representatives from range, exporting, transit and consumer States, and relevant intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations and industry representatives to participate in the workshop. Simultaneous interpretation in the three languages of the Convention (English, French and Spanish) was provided during the workshop.
12. In total, participants from 28 countries gathered either in person (32 participants, which included 3 Members of the Animals Committee including its Chair and Vice-Chair, 14 participants from 10 Parties, 15 participants from 10 observer organizations) or online (64 participants, which included 2 Members of the Animals Committee including the nomenclature specialist, 39 participants from 18 Parties, and 23 participants from 14 observer organizations). Eight sponsored participants representing Management and/or Scientific Authorities from the following countries: Belize, Cuba, Malaysia, Morocco, Senegal, Solomon Islands, Trinidad and Tobago, and Uganda participated in the workshop in person. Unfortunately, nine other Party representatives for whom the Secretariat had confirmed its intention to sponsor their attendance at the workshop in Bangkok were unable to attend, mostly due to challenges obtaining a visa. Some of these participants were able to attend online instead. The Secretariat notes that the hybrid approach facilitated the engagement of a larger number of participants than would otherwise have been possible. The agenda for the workshop is presented in Annex 1.
13. Two breakout groups were established to examine the documentation and data presented mindful of the mandate given in the Decision. Each group developed draft observations and recommendations, which were consolidated and reviewed in plenary to develop a set of agreed observations and recommendations from the workshop to be presented for consideration by the Animals Committee at its 33rd meeting (AC33). A series of observations from the workshop are presented in Annex 2 to this document.
14. Based on these observations, the workshop agreed to submit the following outputs to be considered further by AC33:
 - a) The preliminary study (Parts [1](#) and [2](#));
 - b) The workshop report (to be shared through an information document);
 - c) The priority list of 204 species (162 songbird species where there is evidence of significant trade in wild-caught individuals and 42 species that are already listed in CITES Appendix I or II) that may require further attention (Annex 3). The workshop considered that the priority list could be used to inform possible listings under CITES, management and conservation actions, and the periodic review of CITES listed species;
 - d) A list of range States of each of the species in the long list of 548 species for which there is evidence that they are heavily traded (Annex 4).
 - e) A list of Critically Endangered and Endangered species for which international trade may impact their conservation status (Annex 5);
 - f) A table recognizing the standard nomenclature, indicating where the nomenclature used in the study deviates from standard nomenclature adopted by Parties (see paragraph 25 below); and
 - g) a series of observations (Annex 2) and recommendations (paragraph 15 to 23 below) to help improve the management and conservation priorities of songbird taxa involved in international trade.

Recommendations from the technical workshop

15. In accordance with Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19), the workshop on *Songbird trade and conservation* recommends that the Animals Committee:
 - a) encourage Parties to:
 - i) consider implementing measures to gain a better understanding of the trade in songbirds and, if needed, also implement measures to make sure the species that are or may be affected by international trade are used in a sustainable manner;

- ii) share legislation concerning nationally protected songbird species and regulation of their trade, including national lists of species which are considered to be invasive;
 - iii) collect and share data to address knowledge gaps concerning songbird trade;
 - iv) taking into account the complexity of the trade, consider multi-species approaches in national conservation planning and collaboration with other range States, and transit and consumer States; and
 - v) share non-detriment findings (NDFs) for songbird species for inclusion on the CITES website;
- b) invite importing Parties to inform countries of origin, where these can be identified, in case of seizure of non-CITES listed species that may be nationally protected;
 - c) remind Parties of the provisions of [Resolution Conf. 17.8 \(Rev. CoP19\)](#) on *Disposal of confiscated specimens of CITES-listed species*, including in particular paragraph 5 and Annexes 1 and 3 of this Resolution, and invite them to consider how these may be applied to non-CITES listed species, as appropriate;
 - d) invite Parties to test the new draft guidance coming from the NDF workshop to determine whether or not offtake is sustainable and provide feedback to the Secretariat;
 - e) invite Parties to consider involving graduate students in the making of NDFs (e.g. the CITES Master's course);
 - f) remind Parties that an NDF is required for the founder stock of CITES-listed species in captive-breeding operations; and
 - g) consider songbird species in the upcoming Periodic Review.
16. Concerning **capacity-building**, the workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) identify existing identification (ID) material for songbirds included in the CITES Appendices and request the Animals Committee to review the ID material as part of ongoing work on ID materials (see Decisions 19.142 to 19.144) to ensure it is simple and fit for purpose;
 - b) encourage Parties to develop structures for a species identification network for songbirds, noting the importance of correct identification of songbirds in trade, where possible down to (sub)species/geographically distinct varieties, to ensure preservation of natural genetic diversity; and
 - c) encourage Parties to continuously build their capacity (technical and financial) to handle seized and repatriated live songbirds.
17. Concerning **Captive breeding and marking**, the workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) invite Parties to consider national registration of all songbird breeding operations, ensuring regular inspection and record-keeping to ensure traceability;
 - b) encourage Parties to share expertise on veterinary care, animal husbandry and techniques of differentiating the origin (wild-caught or captive-bred) or gender of songbird species;
 - c) encourage Parties to consult the CITES website (https://cites.org/eng/prog/imp/Wildlife_forensics) and share information concerning registered forensic labs and techniques to assist with determination of origin;
 - d) invite Parties to undertake research into the impacts of handling of birds on their well-being [to be taken into consideration during the review of [Resolution Conf. 8.13 \(Rev. CoP17\)](#) on *Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade*];
 - e) invite Parties to consider for which species captive-breeding may make meaningful contributions to conservation of those species in the wild, as appropriate;

- f) invite Parties to use the Songbirds in Trade Database (SiTDB) (<https://www.sitdb.org/>) and contribute any available information in relation to the ease of breeding; and
 - g) encourage Parties to implement capacity-building activities, as required, to develop breeding know-how and protocols (e.g. diets, numbers per cage, etc) in countries of origin.
18. Concerning **demand**, the workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) remind Parties of the provisions of [Resolution Conf. 17.4 \(Rev. CoP19\)](#) on *Demand reduction strategies to combat illegal trade in CITES-listed species*; and consider how those provisions may be applied to non-CITES listed species, as appropriate; and
 - b) encourage Parties to undertake behaviour-change interventions where trade is unsustainable, taking into consideration specific factors driving demand (along the entire trade chain in country of origin and in consumer states), and share lessons learned with other Parties.
19. Concerning the **role of Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities (IPLCs)**, the technical workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) encourage Parties to identify alternative income-generating opportunities for IPLCs when species become protected and/or otherwise unavailable for harvest;
 - b) encourage Parties to understand the value chain for traded species of songbirds in order to inform their decision-making; and
 - c) encourage Parties to enable the rights of IPLCs and support livelihood options contributing to the conservation of songbirds as an integral part of making trade legal and sustainable (e.g. promote IPLCs stewardship to protect songbirds and their habitats, and add value to their relationship with the resource, such as involving IPLCs in captive breeding).
20. Concerning **data recording and management**, the workshop recommends that the Animals Committee encourage traders, customs and law enforcement personnel to record trade and seizures at the species level, including CITES-listed and non-CITES listed species.
21. Concerning **harvest methodologies and mortality rates**, the workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) invite Parties to consider adopting measures through legislation to control the use of non-selective trapping practices, including provisions to regulate bycatch and prohibit trapping during reproductive periods; and
 - b) recall the provisions of [Resolution Conf. 10.21 \(Rev. CoP19\)](#) on *Transport of live specimens*, and the International Air Transport Association Live Animal Regulations (IATA LAR).
22. Concerning **disease management**, the technical workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) invite Parties to perform health checks and treatment on illegally and legally traded birds, as soon as they are in possession of the authorities;
 - b) encourage Parties to include sanitary measures in their national legislation relating to the release of seized animals back into the wild; and
 - c) invite Parties to implement biosecurity recommendations to avoid spread of pathogens, such as diagnostic testing upon import/export, maintaining closed system songbird breeding operations, transporting animals in lower densities to reduce pathogen transmission, disinfection of shipping materials.
23. Concerning the **possible inclusion of songbird species in the CITES Appendices**, the technical workshop recommends that the Animals Committee:
- a) encourage Parties developing a listing proposal under [Resolution Conf 9.24 \(Rev. CoP17\)](#) to take note of [Resolution Conf 12.11 \(Rev. CoP19\)](#) on *Standard nomenclature* and to contact the nomenclature

specialist of the Animals Committee in the early drafting stage to confirm the appropriate use of CITES-adopted birds nomenclature in the proposal; and

- b) invite the Secretariat to prepare an additional table recognizing the standard nomenclature, indicating where the nomenclature used in the study deviates from standard nomenclature adopted by Parties.

Observations of the Secretariat

- 24. With the submission of the study undertaken by BirdLife (Parts 1 and 2) in collaboration with the Secretariat and the results of this workshop to the Animals Committee for its consideration, the Secretariat considers that Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.257 (Rev. CoP19) have been implemented.
- 25. Concerning the recommendation in paragraph 23 b) on nomenclature, the species lists provided in the report followed the BirdLife International Illustrated Checklist of the Birds of the World. Under Decision 19.278, the Animals Committee is currently evaluating the implications of adopting this Checklist as the new standard nomenclature reference for birds at the species, family and order levels. Therefore, the Secretariat did not see value in producing an additional table using the current CITES standard nomenclature. The Secretariat agrees with the recommendation in paragraph 23 b) that any Party considering a proposal is encouraged to contact the nomenclature specialist of the Animals Committee in the early drafting stage to confirm the appropriate use of CITES-adopted birds nomenclature in the proposal.

Recommendations

- 26. The Animals Committee is invited to:
 - a) note the preliminary study and the workshop report;
 - b) note the observations from the workshop, as presented in Annex 2 to the present document;
 - c) consider the recommendations in paragraphs 15 to 23, taking into account the comment in paragraph 25;
 - d) agree to prioritize songbirds in the mandate of an Animals Committee working group on identification materials, should one be established after CoP20;
 - e) consider how the handling of birds impacts their well-being in the context of the review of Resolution Conf. 8.13 (Rev. CoP15) on the *Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade*;
 - f) agree that Decisions 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) and 18.257 (Rev. CoP19) have been implemented and can be proposed for deletion at CoP20; and
 - g) in the context of the discussions on Decision 19.197 on *Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade*, make recommendations on how to make the material in this document, in particular the priority lists in Annexes 3 to 5, available to Parties on the CITES website (see document [PC27 Doc. 24 / AC33 Doc. 29](#)).

Agenda of the workshop

Workshop on songbird trade and conservation management

11-14 December 2023 (UN Conference Centre, Bangkok, Thailand)

- *Interpretation available in English, French and Spanish*
- *Online participation in plenary sessions of the workshop will be possible via Zoom (links shared by email from remco.vanmerm@un.org)*

DAY 1 Monday 11 December 2023

9:00 – 12:00 (Plenary)

1. Welcoming remarks
2. Conduct of the workshop
3. Objectives of the workshop

The aim of the workshop is to discuss the results of the songbird study and other information shared with participants.

4. Presentation of background information followed by a Q&A session
 - *Introduction by BirdLife International (including methodologies, data sources and responses to notification)*
 - preliminary study on the scale and scope of international songbird trade
 - identification of priority songbird taxa

12:00 – 14:00 Lunch

14:00 – 17:00 (Plenary)

4. Presentation of background information contd. followed by a Q&A session
 - *Other submissions received*
 - IUCN SSC Asian Songbird Trade Specialist Group (Ms. Jessica Lee and Ms. Serene Chng)
 - EAZA (Mr. Simon Bruslund)
 - Species 360 (Mr. Simon Bruslund)
 - TRAFFIC (Ms. Serene Chng)

DAY 2 Tuesday 12 December 2023

9:00 – 12:00 (Plenary)

5. Presentations by workshop participants (15 minutes max.) followed by a Q&A session

Central and South America and the Caribbean

- Suriname (Mr. Romeo Lala - online)
- Cuba (Ms. Viana Barceló Pérez)

North America

- United States of America (Ms. Jen Miller – online)

Asia

- Bangladesh (Ms. Fa-Tu-Zo Khaleque Mela)
- Thailand (Ms. Klairoong Poonpon)

Africa

- Morocco (Mr. Mohamed Noaman)
- Senegal (Ms. Rokhaya Pléa)

Europe

- Switzerland (Mr. Mathias Lörtscher)

Oceania

- New Zealand (Mr. Hugh Robertson)

12:00 – 14:00 Lunch

14:00 – 17:00

5. Presentations by workshop participants contd.
6. Moderated discussion (Mr. Hugh Robertson and CITES Secretariat)
 - a) reporting on CITES Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) under the following headings for the priority taxa identified (has this aspect been addressed or not; is more work needed; identification of knowledge gaps, possible sources of information; develop draft recommendations, etc.):
 - conservation
 - trade
 - management
 - enforcement
 - regulatory priorities
 - b) Any other issues concerning conservation and trade in songbirds not covered above.
7. Establishment of breakout groups (topics to be determined)

DAY 3 Wednesday 13 December 2023

9:00 – 12:00 (Plenary)

8. Breakout groups

12:00 – 14:00 Lunch

14:00 – 17:00 (Plenary)

9. Reports from breakout groups
10. Proposed draft recommendations

Participants are invited to submit proposed draft recommendations in advance. These draft recommendations will be collated with the recommendations coming from the workshop. A consolidated set of draft recommendations will be produced at the end of the workshop.

DAY 4 Thursday 14 December 2023

9:00 – 12:00 (Plenary)

11. Criteria for inclusion of a species in the CITES Appendices (CITES Secretariat)
 - Appendix I or Appendix II [Res. Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP19)]

- Resolution Conf. 8.21 (Rev. CoP16)
- Appendix III [Res. Conf. 9.25 (Rev. CoP19)]

12:00 – 14:00 Lunch

14:00 – 17:00 (Plenary)

13. Review of final outputs and draft recommendations

14. Next steps

15. Closure of meeting

OBSERVATIONS ON DISCUSSION TOPICS AGREED AT THE TECHNICAL WORKSHOP ON SONGBIRD TRADE AND CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT

General Observations

- Large numbers of songbirds are traded both domestically and internationally and for various purposes. This trade is very complex, involving hundreds of species, many of which are not listed in CITES and therefore not subject to international trade regulation.
- The trade in songbirds often overlaps with trade in other bird species (i.e. the same holding facilities, traders, transport companies and routes are involved), and in some cases may provide cover for illegal trade.
- Analyses have shown that there are several hotspots in this trade, with regard to consumer perspective as well as from origin.
- However, there are large gaps in the knowledge on the actual volume, trends, species concerned and impact of this trade on wild populations as well as on the actors, and their motivations, in the various trade chains.
- There are also gaps in the knowledge regarding captive-breeding, animal welfare, potential risks with regards to invasive species, and biosecurity of songbirds.
- There is a need for executable guidance, knowledge sharing and capacity-building for the management and disposal of confiscated songbirds, particularly when confiscated in large numbers.
- There is variability in legislation around the management and keeping of songbirds as well as its enforcement.

What to do with seized birds

- Repatriation of species seized in non-range States to the Parties of origin is a challenge (issuing of CITES permits and veterinary complications, another problem often is identifying and proving the origin of the seized birds – use of DNA testing to identify origin). An observed tendency is that they are placed with qualified appropriate facilities (zoos, rescue centres or, in some countries, private breeders), unless the country of origin wants them back. Birds need veterinary care before being repatriated.
- Repatriation is foreseen by CITES: the country of repatriation must accept repatriated animals. Resources available for repatriation are often limited, meaning seized birds may instead be sent to rescue centres.
- Genetically appropriate place to release birds (e.g. sub-species).
- What to do with seized hybrids/semi-domesticated birds? Hybrids and/or semidomesticated birds may have impacts on wild populations by contaminating the gene pool (although hybrids may be infertile) and/or affecting the song of wild birds (unknown).

Non-Detriment Findings (NDFs)

- NDF methodology is a useful methodology for determining sustainability in CITES and non-CITES listed species.
- It is important to consider sex ratios of birds in trade and the different impacts on wild populations.
- There is a need to understand the whole trade chain from harvest to consumer.
- The NDF workshop concluded in Nairobi on 8 December 2023, and will result in general guidance and specific guidance for birds and migratory species on making NDFs.
- Invite Parties to consider involving graduate students in the making of NDFs (e.g. the CITES Master's course).
- Remind Parties that NDF is required for the founder stock of CITES-listed species in captive breeding operations.

Capacity Building

- Challenges identified include the lack of data (particularly quantitative) on trade in (and captive breeding of) non-CITES listed species, evolving taxonomy and species identification.
- Technical and financial capacity of Parties to handle seized and repatriated live songbirds is often lacking.

Captive breeding and marking

- Some species are difficult to breed in captivity, which means trade is dependent on wild-caught specimens.
- On marking:
 - Doing both microchipping and ringing enhances security.
 - Where the species is too small for microchipping, ringing will be sufficient.
 - Smaller species of songbirds may suffer mortality from attempted ringing.
 - Chicks and nest sites may be abandoned by parents after the ringing process.
- Maintaining a close relationship between regulators and breeders, and trade associations, may reduce illegal activity (e.g. Bali myna), but could be labour intensive.
- Ways to differentiate between captive bred specimens and wild specimens include rings, behaviour, morphology, genetics, and the use of other technologies.
- There are concerns in relation to the release of captive-bred hybrids, sick individuals and/or surplus females.
- Tools and expertise for veterinary care, and appropriate animal husbandry, are lacking for songbird species.

Demand

- If trade is sustainable, demand reduction may not be necessary.
- If trade is unsustainable and/or illegal, demand-reduction or other behaviour-change measures may be necessary.
- Bird keepers often stick to a particular type of bird, e.g. those with the same diet.
- Shifts in trade may occur as a result of a wide variety of factors such as overexploitation, changing consumer preferences, or in response to a CITES listing. Additional research on value chains, investigating livelihoods, social studies to investigate different aspects of the trade, could be beneficial.

Role of Indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs)

- IPLCs play various roles, which may be gender-specific, in the songbird trade chain (e.g. trapping, cage building, etc) and they should be involved in ensuring trade is sustainable.
- Sustainability of livelihoods is often overlooked when considering the sustainability of trade.
- Sometimes trade in songbirds does not significantly contribute to livelihoods, but is a traditional activity with spiritual, ceremonial, recreational or other values. There is a need to enable the rights of IPLCs and support livelihood options contributing to the conservation of wildlife as an integral part of the response to address illegal trade in wildlife.
- Listings come with bureaucratic costs that some countries cannot bear. In some cases, trade shifts to breeders outside range States, who reap the benefits instead of the range States, and could undermine sustainable harvest of wild specimens by IPLCs.
- There is a need to acknowledge the complexity of livelihood issues and diversity of markets and how they drive trade.

Data recording and management

- Traders and law enforcement personnel do not always record complete information regarding the species being traded/seized.
- Accurate data on trade in non-CITES listed species is incomplete, in relation to both quantities and species involved, as well as trade routes, origins and destinations.
- CITES listing (Appendix III) could assist in the collection of trade data. One of the criteria is the species has to be protected by law in the country that proposes the App. III listing.
- Remind Parties that there is a feedback loop to validate what has been entered into the CITES trade database, as a mechanism to overcome reporting/recording errors.

Harvest methodologies and mortality rates

- Some trapping methods are very indiscriminate, e.g. use of mist nets and glue sticks. Bycatch is usually taken to market rather than killed/released.
- Trappers coming into an area from outside often target specific species.
- There is consensus that mortality rates are higher in illegal trade. More information is needed on the mortality rates along the trade chain from harvest to export (both legal and illegal) to determine the overall mortality rates to make NDFs.

Disease management

- In legal trade there is disease screening and better animal welfare standards [true for late stages of international trade, less certain for early stages (capture and holding)].
- There is a risk of disease (and parasites) transmission to consumer, other birds in trade, and the environment (wild bird populations).
- Health regulations and transport regulations not always observed even in legal trade.

Possible inclusion of songbird species in CITES Appendices

It is important to make the outcomes of this workshop and the study referred to in Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) available to Parties (link to decision 19.186 on identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade).

Implementation of Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19)

- With the submission of the study (Parts 1 and 2) and the results of this workshop, Decision 18.256 (Rev. CoP19) will have been implemented.

Prioritisation of songbirds in trade (methodology)

- CITES listed species have been excluded from the current list of 162 species identified as being in international trade.
- There was consensus that the shortlist of 22 had limited value.
- Reason for listing should be whether a species is or may be affected by international trade.
- New cases for Periodic Review will be selected at AC33.

PRIORITY LIST OF 204 SONGBIRD SPECIES THAT MAY REQUIRE FURTHER ATTENTION

Annex in separate Excel file.

LONG LIST OF SONGBIRD SPECIES IN TRADE AND THEIR RANGE STATES

Annex in separate Excel file.

List of Critically Endangered (CR) and Endangered (EN) species for which international trade may impact their conservation status. Those highlighted in yellow were also in the shortlist of 22 priority species for further attention.

Common name	Scientific name	Family	IUCN Red List category
Black-winged Myna	<i>Acridotheres melanopterus</i>	Sturnidae	CR
Araripe Manakin	<i>Antilophia bokermanni</i>	Pipridae	CR
Javan Green Magpie	<i>Cissa thalassina</i>	Corvidae	CR
Banded Cotinga	<i>Cotinga maculata</i>	Cotingidae	CR
Yellow-breasted Bunting	<i>Emberiza aureola</i>	Emberizidae	CR
Rufous-fronted Laughingthrush	<i>Garrulax rufifrons</i>	Leiotrichidae	CR
Nias Hill Myna	<i>Gracula robusta</i>	Sturnidae	CR
Javan Pied Starling	<i>Gracupica jalla</i>	Sturnidae	CR
Gurney's Pitta	<i>Hydrornis gurneyi</i>	Pittidae	CR
Bali Myna	<i>Leucopsar rothschildi</i>	Sturnidae	CR
Blue-crowned Laughingthrush	<i>Pterorhinus courtoisi</i>	Leiotrichidae	CR
Straw-headed Bulbul	<i>Pycnonotus zeylanicus</i>	Pycnonotidae	CR
Elegant Sunbird	<i>Aethopyga duyvenbodei</i>	Nectariniidae	EN
Brown-cheeked Bulbul	<i>Alophoixus bres</i>	Pycnonotidae	EN
Javan Leafbird	<i>Chloropsis cochinchinensis</i>	Chloropseidae	EN
Sumatran Leafbird	<i>Chloropsis media</i>	Chloropseidae	EN
Greater Green Leafbird	<i>Chloropsis sonnerati</i>	Chloropseidae	EN
Seychelles Magpie-robin	<i>Copsychus sechellarum</i>	Muscicapidae	EN
Yellow-throated Seedeater	<i>Crithagra flavigula</i>	Fringillidae	EN
Gran Canaria Blue Chaffinch	<i>Fringilla polatzeki</i>	Fringillidae	EN
Sumatran Laughingthrush	<i>Garrulax bicolor</i>	Leiotrichidae	EN
Chestnut-capped Thrush	<i>Geokichla interpres</i>	Turdidae	EN
Tenggara Hill Myna	<i>Gracula venerata</i>	Sturnidae	EN
Yellow Cardinal	<i>Gubernatrix cristata</i>	Thraupidae	EN
Sumatran Mesia	<i>Leiothrix laurinae</i>	Leiotrichidae	EN
Java Sparrow	<i>Lonchura oryzivora</i>	Estrildidae	EN
Aceh Bulbul	<i>Pycnonotus snouckaerti</i>	Pycnonotidae	EN
Red Siskin	<i>Spinus cucullatus</i>	Fringillidae	EN
Great-billed Seed-finch	<i>Sporophila maximiliani</i>	Thraupidae	EN
Marsh Seedeater	<i>Sporophila palustris</i>	Thraupidae	EN
Golden-winged Laughingthrush	<i>Trochalopteron ngoclinhense</i>	Leiotrichidae	EN
Collared Laughingthrush	<i>Trochalopteron yersini</i>	Leiotrichidae	EN
Saffron-cowled Blackbird	<i>Xanthopsar flavus</i>	Icteridae	EN
Javan White-eye	<i>Zosterops flavus</i>	Zosteropidae	EN