

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirty-second meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 19 – 23 June 2023

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
THURSDAY 22 JUNE 2023

19. Materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species

19.1 Report of the Secretariat..... PC26 Doc. 19 /AC32 Doc. 19.1

The Committee established a joint intersessional working group on materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species with a mandate to, in consultation with the Secretariat:

- a) review selected identification materials and assess the need for their revision and improvement, taking into account the materials that are being developed or have already been developed by Parties and materials requested in Decisions or Resolutions as well as materials received in response to the Notification to the Parties No. 2023/051, and other relevant information, such as that compiled during previous discussions of joint intersessional working groups established since CoP16 (Bangkok, 2013);
- b) take into consideration other items on the agendas of the Animals and Plants Committees related to the development of identification material to support coordination and avoid duplication of effort;
- c) when assessing gaps in identification materials, take into account those taxa that have been included in the Appendices at higher taxon levels solely due to look-alike issues, as well as the need for frontline and forensic identification tools;
- d) consider ways to improve the accuracy and availability of identification materials on CITES-listed species, including considerations and implications of linking identification materials directly in the *Checklist of CITES Species* (checklist.cites.org/#/en); and
- e) report on the progress with these activities to the joint session of the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee and 27th meeting of the Plants Committee.

The membership was decided as follows¹:

Chair for AC: representative for Oceania (Mr. Robertson);

Chair for PC: alternate representative for Asia (Mr. Chong);

PC Members: representative for Africa (Mr. Balama);

¹ This includes the expression of interest at the 26th meeting of the Plants Committee.

Parties: Argentina, Canada, China, European Union, Germany, India, Kuwait, Mexico, New Zealand, Republic of Korea, Singapore, Togo, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America; and

IGOs and NGOs: United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre, American Herbal Products Association, Association Technique Internationale des Bois Tropicaux, European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, European Pet Organisation, ForestBased Solutions, German Society of Herpetology, Humane Society International, International Wood Products Association, South African Taxidermy and Tannery Association, Species Survival Network, SUCO-SA, Wildlife Conservation Society.

The Committee noted the updated provided by India on its photographic identification work on tigers.

19.2 Identification Manual of animals listed in CITES Appendix I AC32 Doc. 19.2

The Committee welcomed the initiative by China and encouraged China to feed the results of this identification work into the joint intersessional working group on materials for the identification of specimens of CITES-listed species. The Committee requested the Secretariat to publish a Notification to the Parties asking Parties and observers to communicate to China their interest in participating in the initiative on Identification Manual of animals listed in CITES Appendix I.

22. Specimens produced through biotechnology PC26 Doc.22 / AC32 Doc. 22

The Committee noted document PC26 Doc. 22 / AC32 Doc. 22 and agreed to nominate the alternate representative for North America (Mr. Leuteritz) and the alternate representative for Oceania (Ms. McIntyre) to participate in the Standing Committee's intersessional working group on specimens produced through biotechnology.

26. Assessment of Appendix-I listed species..... PC26 Doc.25 / AC32 Doc. 26

The Committee established a joint intersessional working group on Appendix-I species to:

- a) review the results of the rapid assessment in information document AC31 Inf. 6/ PC25 Inf. 8 on Rapid assessment of Appendix-I taxa that could potentially benefit from further CITES action, the suggestions in document AC31/PC25 Com. 1 (Rev. by Sec.), the Annex to the present document, the case studies and responses from range States on the 10 species selected for detailed assessments;
- b) refine the methodology and its criteria for carrying out an assessment of species listed in Appendix I that might benefit from measures adopted by the Conference of the Parties; and
- c) formulate draft recommendations for consideration at the joint session of the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee and 27th meeting of the Plants Committee.

The membership was decided as follows²:

Co-Chairs for AC: representative for Asia (Mr. Hamidy) and alternate representative for Oceania (Ms. McIntyre);

Chair for PC: representative for Asia (Ms. Zeng);

AC Members: representative for Africa (Ms. Maha);

PC Members: representative for North America (Mr. Boles);

Parties: China, Colombia, European Union, Germany, India, Indonesia, Japan, Madagascar, Mexico, Namibia, New Zealand, Peru, Portugal, South Africa, Spain, Switzerland, United States of America, Zimbabwe; and

² This includes the expression of interest at the 26th meeting of the Plants Committee.

IGOs and NGOs: United Nation Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre, International Union for Conservation of Nature, BirdLife International, Conservation Force, European Association of Zoos and Aquaria, ForestBased Solutions, German Society of Herpetology, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, Safari Club International, TRAFFIC, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Wide Fund for Nature.

27. Identifying information on species at risk of extinction affected by international trade..... PC26 Doc. 26 /AC32 Doc. 27

The Committee established a joint intersessional working group on species at risk of extinction with the mandate to develop draft recommendations on:

- a) a possible process or mechanism under Resolution Conf. 19.2 on *Capacity-building* to provide Parties with information to be considered in the preparation of listing proposals when Parties request information such as:
 - i) relevant studies, analyses or other sources of information on the identification of species at risk of extinction that are not yet regulated under CITES and may be affected by international trade, or
 - ii) relevant studies, analyses or other sources of information on the identification of species that may receive insufficient CITES regulation and may be affected by international trade;
- b) possible processes/ mechanisms for providing support or guidance to Parties in the development of listing proposals in addition to the process or mechanism referred to under a) above;
- c) coordination with the CITES Secretariat, CITES Parties, IUCN, UNEP-WCMC, FAO, regional competent authorities, and relevant experts, as appropriate as part of a possible process/es or mechanism/s to provide Parties with information to be considered in the preparation of listing proposals when Parties request information; and
- d) report back with its recommendations to the joint session of the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee and 27th meeting of the Plants Committees.

The membership was decided as follows³:

Co-Chairs for AC: Chair of the Animals Committee (Mr. Lörtscher) and the nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);

Chair for PC: representative for North America (Mr. Boles);

PC Members: Chair of the Plants Committee (representative for Africa, Ms. Koumba Pambo) and the representative for Asia (Ms. Zeng);

Parties: Brazil, Canada, China, European Union, India, Indonesia, Japan, Mexico, New Zealand, Peru, Russian Federation, Senegal, Thailand, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America, Zimbabwe; and

IGOs and NGOs: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre, International Union for Conservation of Nature, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, BirdLife International, Center for Biological Diversity, Conservation Force, Defenders of Wildlife, European Federation of Associations for Hunting and Conservation, European Pet Organisation, German Society of Herpetology, Humane Society International, IWMC-World Conservation Trust, Natural Resources Defense Council, OCEANA, Organization of Professional Aviculturists, Safari Club International, Species Survival Network, SUCO-SA, TRAFFIC, Zoological Society of London.

³ This includes the expression of interest at the 26th meeting of the Plants Committee.

The Committee agreed to nominate its Chair (representative for Europe, Mr. Lörtscher) and the nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk) to participate in the Standing Committee's intersessional working group on species at risk of extinction.

31. Pangolins (*Manis* spp.)..... AC32 Doc. 31

The Committee noted document AC32 Doc. 31 and comments made during the plenary and invited the International Union for Conservation of Nature to provide an updated report to the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee. The Committee requested the Secretariat to publish a Notification to the Parties to solicit samples from relevant and potential sources holding carcasses and skins, including zoos and museums, that can be used to increase the sample sizes to meet or exceed the minimum baseline of 30 specimens for those species not adequately represented.

41. Trade in medicinal and aromatic plants PC26 Doc.34 / AC32 Doc. 41

The Committee agreed that it did not need to contribute to the Plants Committee's work on this issue.

16. Non-detriment findings PC26 Doc. 16 / AC32 Doc. 16

The Committee noted the continuation of the Technical Advisory Group (TAG) and the progress of the CITES NDF project. The Committee further noted the likely dates and venue of the international expert workshop, and the advice regarding its organization and work plan made by the TAG at its second meeting.

20. Transport of live specimens PC26 Doc. 21 / AC32 Doc. 20

The Committee requested the alternate representative for Asia (Ms. Terada) and the alternate representative for Europe (Mr. Benyr), in collaboration with the Secretariat, to develop the Terms of Reference (ToR) for the virtual workshop to share best practices related to live animal and plant transport and submit the ToR for consideration by the Standing Committee. The Committee furthermore requested the Secretariat to publish a Notification to the Parties to welcome feedback about the workshop content and to request expressions of interest from Parties and relevant experts in serving as workshop instructors.

The Committee noted the comments made in plenary and invited its representatives working on the TOR of the workshop to convey these ideas and concerns.

21. Use of coded-microchip implants for marking live animals in trade AC32 Doc. 21

The Committee noted document AC32 Doc. 21 and further noted that Germany would commission in 2024 a study on methods for individual marking of animal species based on recent scientific and practical experience.

24. Definition of the term 'appropriate and acceptable destinations' AC32 Comp.

The Committee noted document AC32 Comp.

Adoption of executive summary AC32 Sum. 1:

The Committee adopted executive summary AC32 Sum. 1 with the following amendments:

- under agenda item 7, the number of the document should read “PC26 Doc. 7 / AC32 Doc. 7” instead of “PC26 Doc. 7 / AC232 Doc. 7”;
- under agenda item 12, add Humane Society International as a member of the joint intersessional working group;
- under agenda item 10, correct the spelling of the name of the alternate representative for North America (Mr. Leuteritz);
- under agenda item 37, paragraph b) of the mandate should read: “make recommendations, if necessary, on whether any species/country combination should be considered under the selection process for the Review of Significant Trade;”, paragraph c) of the mandate should read: “identify information pertinent to...” and not “identify information pertinent on”; the second e) of the mandate should be replaced by f); and

- under agenda items 25 and 45, specify whether the representatives who are members of the working group are from the Animals Committee or from the Plants Committee.

Adoption of executive summary AC32 Sum. 2:

The Committee adopted executive summary AC32 Sum. 2 with the following amendments:

- under agenda item 46, add the word “time-bound” before the word “extracts” in paragraph d) of the mandate; and
- under agenda item 43, add “paragraphs g) and h) of” before “annotation A10”.

30. Conservation of amphibians (Amphibia spp.) AC32 Doc. 30

The Committee noted document AC32 Doc. 30 and the oral report by the Secretariat. The Committee further noted the comments made in plenary on the three studies described in the document.

34. Songbird trade and conservation management (Passeriformes spp.) AC32 Doc. 34

The Committee noted document AC32 Doc. 34 and the comments made in plenary on the preparatory work, including the studies and the organization of the workshop.

39. Queen conch (*Strombus gigas*) AC32 Doc. 39

The Committee noted document AC32 Doc. 39 and the oral report by the Secretariat.

40. Marine ornamental fishes AC32 Doc. 40

The Committee thanked Indonesia for offering to host the workshop on marine ornamental fishes and agreed the terms of reference and *modus operandi* for the technical workshop on marine ornamental fishes presented in the Annex to document AC32 Doc. 40 with paragraph 2 to read “The workshop will contribute to the following outcomes:”

42. Periodic Review of species included in Appendices I and II PC26 Doc. 35 / AC32 Doc. 42

The Committee noted document PC26 Doc. 35 / AC32 Doc. 42 and the concerns raised in plenary about the lack of funding for this work. The Committee emphasized the importance of the Periodic Review process. The Committee proposed to include *Ramphastos vitellinus citreolaemus* in the Periodic Review and invited the representatives for Central and South America and the Caribbean to reach out to seek a volunteer from their region for the review. The Committee noted the offer made by the United States of America to provide technical support for the review.

17. Non-detriment findings for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction AC32 Comp.

The Committee noted the information relating to *Non-detriment findings (NDF) for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction* as contained in document AC32 Comp. The Committee further noted the comments made in plenary, especially the idea of holding back-to-back workshops on NDF for specimens of Appendix-II species taken from areas beyond national jurisdiction and on aquatic species listed in the Appendices.

28. Aquatic species listed in the Appendices AC32 Comp.

The Committee noted the information relating to *Aquatic species listed in the CITES Appendices* as contained in document AC32 Comp.

18. Guidance on non-detriment findings for trade in leopard (*Panthera pardus*) hunting trophies AC32 Comp.

The Committee noted the information relating to *Guidance on non-detriment findings for trade in leopard hunting trophies* as contained in document AC32 Comp.; the concerns raised in plenary; and the funding

pledged by Conservation Force and Dallas Safari Club Foundation for the development of guidance in the making of non-detriment findings for trade in leopard hunting trophies.

23. Trade in stony corals (*Scleractinia* spp.)

23.1 Report of the Chair of the Animals Committee AC32 Doc. 23.1

and

23.2 Reporting of trade in stony corals (*Scleractinia* spp.) AC32 Doc. 23.2

The Committee adopted document AC32 Com. 1 with the following amendments:

- add the following text at the beginning of the first sentence of paragraph 3 in the draft Notification to the CITES Parties: “At the request of the Animals Committee..”;
- amend the title in Annex 1 to replace the term “Proposed” with “Possible”; and
- amend the title in Annex 2 to replace the term “Suggested” with “Possible”.

46. Report of the specialist on zoological nomenclature AC32 Doc. 46

The Committee adopted the substance of document AC32 Com. 2 amended as follows:

- a) The Committee encouraged the Secretariat to continue its work on the use of online databases as standard nomenclature references and report back to AC33.
- b) The Committee acknowledged the scientific merit of recognizing the two species of African elephants, recognizing that hybrids and mixed-species groupings occur, and noted that a relevant nomenclature standard reference for these animals be further deliberated intersessionally, with the outcomes of deliberations reported back to AC33.
- c) The Committee requested the Secretariat to include in the Notification described in Decision 19.275, paragraph a), a request for suggested publications that can serve as nomenclatural standard reference for African elephants.
- d) The Committee recommended that the review of the implications of adopting the HBW/BI *Illustrated Checklist of the Birds of the World* be continued and that a report be submitted for consideration by the Committee at AC33.
- e) The Committee recommended that in terms of the preparation of future checklists based on time-bound extracts from online databases, the essential elements to include are the valid species name, taxonomic synonyms, taxonomic hierarchy, and countries of distribution. Desirable but not essential are a distribution map and illustrations for each species. The intersessional working group shall further consider this matter, including options to prepare simplified checklists, with the outcomes of deliberations reported back to AC33.
- f) The Committee recommended for adoption by the Parties at CoP20 the checklists proposed for the lizard family Iguanidae in paragraph 20 and for the genus *Phrynosoma* in Annex 1 to document AC32 Doc. 46.
- g) The Committee established an intersessional working group on nomenclature with a mandate to:
 - i) continue the work on checklists based on time-limited extracts from online databases;
 - ii) identify an appropriate nomenclature standard reference for the African elephant(s);
 - iii) review the nomenclatural changes summarised in Annex 2 and Annex 3 of document AC32 Doc. 46;
 - iv) consider options to address the present status of *Ramphastos vitellinus citreolaemus* in the CITES Appendices; and

v) report to the 33rd meeting of the Animals Committee.

The membership was decided as follows:

Chair: nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);

Member: representative for Africa (Ms. Maha);

Parties: Cameroon, China, Democratic Republic of the Congo, France, India, Japan, Russian Federation, Saudi Arabia, Senegal, Singapore, South Africa, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United Republic of Tanzania, United States of America, Zimbabwe; and

IGOs and NGOs: United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre, International Union of Conservation of Nature, BirdLife International, Center for Biological Diversity, Conservation Force, Dallas Safari Club, Humane Society International, International Fur Federation, IWMC-World Conservation Trust, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, Safari Club International Foundation, South African Taxidermy and Tannery Association, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Wide Fund for Nature.