

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Thirty-second meeting of the Animals Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 19 – 23 June 2023

Compliance

CAPTIVE-BRED AND RANCHED SPECIMENS

Membership (as decided by the Committee)

- Chair: Chair of the Animals Committee (Mr. Lörtscher);
- Members: representatives for Africa (Ms. Maha and Mr. Kasoma), representative for Asia (Mr. Hamidy), representatives for Central and South America and the Caribbean (Mr. Gongora and Mr. Ramadori), representative for Europe (Ms. Zikova), representative for North America (Mr. Benítez Diaz), alternate representative for Africa (Mr. Diouck), alternate representative for Asia (Ms. Terada), alternate representative for Oceania (Ms. McIntyre), nomenclature specialist (Mr. van Dijk);
- Parties: Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Cambodia, Canada, China, Colombia, Croatia, Czech Republic, European Union, France, Germany, India, Indonesia, Israel, Japan, Mexico, Netherlands, Peru, Portugal, Republic of Korea, Russian Federation, Singapore, South Africa, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Thailand, United Arab Emirates, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America; and
- IGOs and NGOs: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, United Nations Environment Programme – World Conservation Monitoring Centre, International Union for Conservation of Nature, ADM Capital Foundation, Association of Zoos and Aquariums, BirdLife International, Born Free Foundation, Center for Biological Diversity, Defenders of Wildlife, European Animal Research Association, European Pet Organisation, German Society of Herpetology, Humane Society International, International Fur Federation, IWMC-World Conservation Trust, National Association for Biomedical Research, Natural Resources Defense Council, Organization of Professional Aviculturists, Ornamental Fish International, Pan African Sanctuary Alliance, Parrot Breeders Association of Southern Africa, Pro Vision Reef, Pro Wildlife, San Diego Zoo Wildlife Alliance, Society for Wildlife and Nature International, South African Taxidermy and Tannery Association, Species Survival Network, SUCO-SA, Sustainable Users Network, TRAFFIC, Wildlife Conservation Society, World Wide Fund for Nature.

Mandate

- a) select a limited number of species-country combinations for review,
- b) prepare a brief explanation of the criteria used to justify each selection;
- c) draft general or specific questions for the countries selected for review;

- d) determine and prioritize for which species a request should be made for the commissioning of a short review of the breeding biology, captive husbandry and any impacts, if relevant, of removal of founder stock from the wild; and
- e) identify any urgent enforcement matters which need the attention of the Secretariat, the country concerned and/or the Standing Committee.

Recommendations

Species / country combinations recommended for review and brief explanation for the selection and also questions to be asked to the country (for details on the criteria see page 4 in the Annex to document AC32 Doc. 15.1, while details on the questions can be found in the Annex to this document.

	Species	Country	Criterion met	Source code	Explanation for selection	Questions
1	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Indonesia	ii)	F		F1, F2, F3, F4
2	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Cambodia	ii) vi)	C, F, D	In relation to criterion vi refer to document AC32 doc 15.3	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 F1, F2, F3, F4
3	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Philippines	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
4	<i>Macaca fascicularis</i>	Vietnam	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
6	<i>Rhyticerus undulatus</i>	South Africa	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
7	<i>Chlamydotis macqueenii</i>	United Arab Emirates	ii)	C,R		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 R2, R3
8	<i>Chlamydotis macqueenii</i>	Kazakhstan	i)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
9	<i>Chlamydotis undulata</i>	Morocco	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
10	<i>Kinyongia boehmei</i>	Kenya	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
11	<i>Gecko gecko</i>	Indonesia	ii)	F		F1, F2, F3, F4
12	<i>Ctenosaura quinquecarinata</i>	Nicaragua	i)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6

						In addition, explain the sudden increase in volume
13	<i>Ctenosaura similis</i>	Nicaragua	i)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 In addition, explain the sudden increase in volume
14	<i>Testudo graeca</i>	Jordan	iii)	C	Might be difficult to breed in large numbers if kept "intensive"	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 In addition, explain the shift of source code Indicate the ages of animals exported
15	<i>Testudo horsfieldii</i>	Uzbekistan	ii) iii)	F, R, C		F1, F2, F3, F4 R2, R3 C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 In addition, explain the shift of source code Indicate the ages of animals exported
16	<i>Testudo kleinmanni</i>	Syrian Arab Republic	i) vi) vii)	C	Appendix I, small population size, CR, reference was made to AC31 document and concerns were raised about one sudden high number of captive bred specimens in 2017 for a species not easy to breed in high numbers without information on legal acquisition (no range state and no legal imports) of the breeding stock and if it has been established in a	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 Indicate the ages of animals exported

					manner not detrimental to the wild population	
17	<i>Testudo kleinmanni</i>	Egypt	vii) (vi))	C	Appendix I, small population size, CR, no information if the breeding stock has been established in a manner not detrimental to the wild population	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 Indicate the ages of animals exported
18	<i>Nectophrynoides asperginis</i>	United States of America	ii)	F, C		Explain the use of "F" in combination with IUCN red list status "EW" If this is incorrect → F1, F2, F3, F4 C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
19	<i>Dendrobatus auratus</i>	Nicaragua	ii)	C		C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
20	<i>Oophaga pumilio</i>	Nicaragua	ii)	F, C		F1, F2, F3, F4 C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
21	<i>Agalychnis callidryas</i>	Nicaragua	ii)	C	Large increase and all are captive bred	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
22	<i>Cheilinus undulatus</i>	Indonesia	ii)	R	Not meeting the definition of source code R in that the larvae are harvested after settlement, i.e, after the point of highest mortality in their life cycle, so it cannot be argued that they are taken when they would otherwise have had a very low probability of surviving to adulthood	R2, R3
23	<i>Hirudo medicinalis</i>	Azerbaijan	i) ii)	C	Trade only started in 2019 rising to 1,498,500 in 2021	Confirm the presence of the species in Azerbaijan,

			vi)		Not recognized as a range State for this species on Species+ Source of breeding stock unknown and whether regular introductions of wild into breeding stock occur	Confirm whether Azerbaijan is a range State for this species and identify source of founder breeding stock. C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6
24	<i>Batagur borneoensis</i>	United States of America	vii)	C	Considered difficult to breed	C1, C2, C3, C4, C5, C6 Please provide evidence for successful captive breeding Confirm how long the species has been bred in your country

Questions to be asked to countries depending on the source code reported for the species selected:

Source code "C"

Question code	Question
C1	How many facilities in your country are breeding specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported? For how long have the facilities been established in your country? How does the breeding facility meet the criteria of a closed environment according to Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> ? Since when do the facilities successfully breed to F1/ F2?
C2	Have all of these facilities been inspected to ensure that the specimens produced comply with Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i> ? Please explain further any regulations or measures currently in place for monitoring facilities which claim to be captive breeding this species, for example whether facilities are required to keep records of the acquisition, maintenance or breeding of animals of this species, and whether authorities verify these records?
C3	Which authority carries out these inspections and how often are they undertaken?
C4	For each facility in question 1, either complete the Data Collection Form (document AC29 Inf. 1 may be of assistance), or provide the information on the form in a different way.
C5	How was it determined that the breeding stock was established in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?
C6	Has the breeding stock received additional specimens from the wild since establishment and if so, how many and when and how was it determined that they were obtained in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?

DATA COLLECTION FORM

GENERAL INFORMATION ON THE FACILITY

Date of inspection: _____	Name of senior inspecting officer: _____
Facility name: _____	

Name and position(s) of all inspecting officer(s) present:

1. _____

2. _____

Type of inspection: Initial Date of last inspection: _____

Routine

Follow-up (*in cases where discrepancies or anomalies, detected during a previous inspection, remain outstanding*)

Facility trading name(s): _____

Facility owner(s): _____

Facility address and contact information: _____

Year the facility was established: _____

How many staff are currently employed at the facility?

 Full time Part time

Name and job title of facility staff accompanying inspecting officer(s):

Does the operation have access to professional veterinary services? Yes No

If yes, what is the name and address of vet? _____

Does this company keep animals at any other location(s)? Yes No

If yes, where? _____

If yes, make arrangements to inspect the location(s) as soon as possible

DATA COLLECTION FORM

SPECIES INFORMATION *(to be completed separately for each species held at the facility)*

Date of inspection: _____	Name of senior inspecting officer: _____
Facility name: _____	Species : _____

*Date species first acquired? _____ Source and life-stage of initial stock? _____

Numbers of initial stock, and sexes, if known _____ Males? Females?

*Have additional animals been obtained since you acquired the initial stock? If so, from where?

Do you **BREED** this species? Yes No

When did you start breeding? _____

litters/clutches per year? _____

offspring/eggs in litter/clutch? _____

produced in the previous year? _____

ADULT BREEDING STOCK	Facility information	Inspector count <i>(where possible)</i>
Number of adults present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Number of males present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Number of females?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
What % of females breed each year?	<input type="text"/>	
What do you feed adult animals? _____		

REARING STOCK (CAPTIVE BRED AND RANCHED COMBINED)	Facility information	Inspector count <i>(where possible)</i>
Number of juveniles present?	<input type="text"/>	<input type="text"/>
Age at sexual maturity (years)?	<input type="text"/>	
Size or mass at sexual maturity (cm or g)?	<input type="text"/>	
Size at sale (cm or g)	<input type="text"/>	
What percentage of juveniles survive beyond 2 weeks? <i>Includes mortalities of eggs that didn't hatch.</i>	<input type="text"/>	
What do you feed rearing and juvenile animals? _____		

Source code “R”

Question code	Question
R1	In relation to all species that have been transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II under the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev CoP15) on <i>Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i> , please provide any missing reports under paragraph 5 a) and the information specified under paragraph 5 b) of that Resolution.
R2	<p>1. In relation to all species that have <u>not</u> been transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II under the provisions of Resolution Conf. 11.16 (Rev CoP15) on <i>Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i>, please provide the following information [from paragraph 5 a) and b) of that Resolution]:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) the status of the wild population concerned established by monitoring at an appropriate frequency and with sufficient precision to allow recognition of changes in population size and structure owing to ranching; ii) the number of specimens (eggs, young or adults) taken annually from the wild and the percentage of this offtake used to supply ranching operations; iii) details of the annual production levels, and product types and quantity produced for export; iv) an estimate of the percentage of the annual wild production of eggs, neonates or other life stages taken for the ranching operation; v) the number of animals released and their survival rates estimated on the basis of surveys and tagging programs, if any; vi) the mortality rate in captivity and causes of such mortality; vii) conservation programs and scientific experiments carried out in relation to the ranching operation or the wild population concerned; and viii) an estimation of the percentage of the distribution area of the species where the ranching is operating
R3	How many facilities in your country are ranching specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported? Have all of these facilities been inspected to ensure that the specimens produced comply with the definition of Ranching in Res. Conf. 12.3 (Rev. COP19) on Permits and Certificates? Please explain further any regulations or measures currently in place for monitoring facilities which claim to be ranching this species, for example whether facilities are required to keep records of the acquisition, maintenance or breeding of animals of this species, and whether authorities verify these records?

Source code “F”

Question code	Question
F1	Why are you reporting this trade under source code F.
F2	Please confirm that non-detriment findings have been made for the export of all specimens of the species concerned with the source code “F” and the way in such findings have been made, particularly for species not native to your country.
F3	How many facilities in your country are producing specimens of the species concerned which are subsequently being exported?
F4	Has the breeding stock received additional specimens from the wild since establishment and if so, how many and when and how was it determined that they were obtained in accordance with the provisions of CITES and relevant national laws and in a manner not detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild?

Further Recommendation from the Working Group to the Animals Committee

The Working Group noted that the use of source code "R" for *Diceros bicornis* used by South Africa and *Loxodonta africana* used by Zimbabwe is not appropriate and requested the Secretariat to remind these Parties accordingly.

In relation to table 7 in Document AC32 doc 15.1 Annex: The working group agreed to refer the contents of the table to the Standing Committee for its consideration.

In relation to table 8 in Document AC32 doc 15.1 Annex: The working group agreed to refer the contents of the table to the Secretariat for further consultation with the Parties concerned and to refer any issues of concern to the Standing Committee. Specific concerns about *Uromastyx acanthinurus* from Mali were raised, noting that Mali is not a range state for this species, but trade has mostly been in source F, and there have been no imports recorded.

In the discussion regarding *Macaca fascicularis*, the working group agreed to request that the Secretariat investigate the issue of legal acquisition of founder stock for captive-breeding facilities for the species in Lao PDR. The Secretariat agreed that it would include the issue in its ongoing compliance discussions with the Party.

In relation to Document AC32 doc 15.2 on spiny tailed lizards (*Ceratophora stoddartii*, *C. aspera* and *Lyriocephalus scutatus*): The working group noted the concerns raised in the document regarding the protection and conservation status of these three endemic species in Sri Lanka. The three species were not recommended for inclusion in the review at this current time as there has been no reported international trade since the species were listed on the Appendices. The Working Group urged Parties to scrutinize legal acquisition & breeding claims when faced with export/ import applications and any shipments presented for import/(re-)export of these species.

The working group noted the concern raised by the Pan African Sanctuary Alliance regarding trade in a number of primate species, including Appendix-I species, great apes, small apes, and endangered species, from Syria under source code C.