

# Capacity Building Workshop on "Non detriment Findings and Review of Significant Trade of Plant Species"

**January 09-11, 2011**

**Kathmandu, Nepal\***

## **PROCEEDING**



Government of Nepal  
Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation  
Department of Forests



CITES Secretariat

---

\* *The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat or the United Nations Environment Programme concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.*

## Table of Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>1. Background</b>                    | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>2. Objectives</b>                    | <b>3</b>  |
| <b>3. Expected Outcomes:</b>            | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>4. Participants:</b>                 | <b>4</b>  |
| <b>5. Management:</b>                   | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>6. Venue:</b>                        | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>7. Methodology:</b>                  | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>8. Materials :</b>                   | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>9. Workshop Program:</b>             | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>9.1 Opening of the workshop:</b>     | <b>5</b>  |
| <b>9.2 Sessions Detail:</b>             | <b>7</b>  |
| <b>10. Financial statement:</b>         | <b>11</b> |
| <b>11. Findings:</b>                    | <b>11</b> |
| <b>12. Recommendations:</b>             | <b>12</b> |
| <b>13. Conclusion:</b>                  | <b>13</b> |
| <b>Annexes</b>                          | <b>14</b> |
| <b>Annex 1 List of Participants</b>     |           |
| <b>Annex 2 Workshop Schedule</b>        |           |
| <b>Annex 3 NDF exercise Findings</b>    |           |
| <b>Annex 4 Country Presentations</b>    |           |
| <b>Annex 5 Statement of Expenditure</b> |           |

## 1. Background

A major challenge for many countries is the difficulty in meeting the requirements for trade in CITES-listed species, ranging from legal sourcing and sustainability requirements, to the effective control of legal trade and deterrence of illegal trade. Mechanisms exist in CITES and in both exporting and importing countries that promote and facilitate compliance. Countries that do not meet CITES requirements may be subject to a range of international compliance measures, including trade suspensions.

While mechanisms for identifying non-compliance and recommending actions to restore compliance are well developed, programs to encourage and assist countries in meeting trade requirements are limited and solutions are hampered by a lack of capacity in many exporting countries, or a lack of current biological or trade information with respect to certain species. The result is reduced levels of trade, which in turn impacts on economic growth and local livelihoods, and reduces options and incentives for conserving and managing wild resources effectively.

The CITES Secretariat is implementing a number of Decisions adopted at the last meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP15, Doha, March 2010) that intend to strengthen the capacities of the national authorities. These are Decision 15.36 on Review of Significant Trade in *Cistanche deserticola*, *Dioscorea deltoidea*, *Nardostachys grandiflora*, *Picrorhiza kurrooa*, *Pterocarpus santalinus*, *Rauvolfia serpentina* and *Taxus wallichiana* and Decisions 15.23 to 15.27 on Non-detriment findings.

In this context, a workshop was organized to build capacity of participants on **Non deterrent Findings and Review of Significant Trade of Plant Species"** and to provide a forum for discussion on the CITES and Non deterrent Finding and Review of Significant Trade of CITES listed Species in the South Asian Region, NDF strategies and interventions while understating the basic concept of sustainable Trade approach and framework models. There were 19 participants from Bangladesh, China, Bhutan, Indonesia, Myanmar, Sri Lanka, India and Nepal. This Proceeding summarizes the outcomes of three days workshop.

## 2. Objectives

The main objective of the workshop was to build capacity of participants on **Non deterrent Findings and Review of Significant Trade of Plant Species"**. The specific objectives were to:

1. identify the difficulties in meeting the requirements for trade in CITES-listed plant species, ranging from the sustainability of the harvest and the formulation of

2. understand effective implementation of CITES mechanisms and the Review of Significant Trade on CITES listed plant species .
3. strengthen the capacity of national authorities to implement effectively a number of Decisions adopted at the last meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP15, Doha, March 2010). These are Decision 15.36 on 'Review of Significant Trade in *Cistanche deserticola*, *Dioscorea deltoidea*, *Nardostachys grandiflora*, *Picrorhiza kurroa*, *Pterocarpus santalinus*, *Rauwolfia serpentina* and *Taxus wallichiana*', and Decisions 15.23 to 15.27 on 'Non-detriment findings'.
4. strengthen the communication among the authorities in the region, the Regional Representatives for Asia, CITES Plants Committee and the CITES Secretariat.

### 3. Expected Outcomes:

- Management and Scientific Authorities from Bangladesh, Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka are familiar with CITES requirements and compliance measures; the Review of Significant Trade is understood and implemented through fluid communication between these countries, the CITES Secretariat, the Plants Committee and the Standing Committee.
- Current guidance on non-detriment findings for plant species tested through case studies relevant to the region. Feedback from participating countries to be presented at the 19th meeting of the Plants Committee (PC19, Geneva, April 2011) and regional PC representatives coordinate with other colleagues from their region, their report to the Committee; improved Asian report submitted at PC19.
- Parties ready to report to the PC in line with Decisions 15.23 and 15.26, the two regional representatives for Asia makes progress on the implementation of Decision 15.24. The CITES Secretariat in a position to report at PC20 on progress made with the implementation of Decisions 15.36, 15.25 and 15.27.

### 4. Participants:

The participants of the workshop were the Management and Scientific Authorities from Bangladesh, Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar, Nepal, and Sri Lanka including one regional representative for Asia of the Plants Committee from Indonesia. Altogether there were 24 participants, among them 14 national authorities from seven Asian countries, and one plant committee member from Indonesia, two facilitators from CITES secretariat, Geneva and seven observers from host country. The workshop missed participation from Pakistan. The list of the workshop participants is given in the [Annex 1](#).

## **5. Management:**

The CITES Secretariat, Geneva provided necessary technical and financial support for the workshop. On behalf of CITES Secretariat, Department of Forests, CITES Management Authority on plant species of Nepal organized logistics and managed the workshop.

## **6. Venue:**

The workshop was organized at the Everest Hotel, New Baneshwor, Kathmandu, Nepal.

## **7. Methodology:**

Methodology adopted for the workshop was based on the principle of “sharing and learning”. More specifically it included presentations, plenary discussions and group exercises, demonstration and display, experience sharing and short briefing following participatory approaches.

## **8. Materials :**

CITES Secretariat Geneva provided necessary NDF training materials and CITES related documents. The other materials provided during the workshop include soft and hard copy of NDF Capacity Building package.

## **9. Workshop Program:**

The workshop was successfully conducted as per the schedule of the programme shown in [Annex 2](#)

### ***9.1 Opening of the workshop:***

Chief Guest Honorable Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation (MFSC), Nepal Mr. Deepak Bohara formally inaugurated the workshop by watering in *Taxus wallichiana* plant. Honorable Minister welcomed participants and delegates and thanked CITES secretariat for providing the opportunity to host the workshop.

He assured that Nepal will take seriously the deliberations on NDF and incorporate them in the national policy. Recently, Nepal has signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with China, on matters related to protection and curbing trans-boundary illegal trades of endangered species and soon similar MoU will be made with India. He also emphasized that the learning of the workshop will be instrumental to fulfill the requirements for legal trade of CITES-listed plant species, help understand the effective implementation of CITES mechanism and consolidate the capacities of national

authorities to implement effectively the number of decisions adopted at the last meeting of the COP held at Doha, on March 2010

*i) Welcome Address:*

Mr. Gopal Kumar Shrestha , Director General, Department of Forests and Management Authority for Plant Species, Nepal, welcomed participants and delegates from CITES Secretariat. He hoped that this workshop, the first of its kind in this region, will be fundamental to build the capacity of national authorities in understanding the NDF and CITES related policies. He also emphasized that the outcomes of this workshop would be taken appropriately by CITES Authorities of this region to fulfill the objectives of the CITES.

*ii) Opening remarks*

1. Ms Marceil Yeater, Chief, Legal Affairs and Trade Policy, CITES Secretariat, Geneva, expressed her remarks on behalf of the secretariat. She appreciated participating countries and highlighted the importance of the workshop to be held in a range State, in order to gain a better understanding of the context in which the regulation of CITES trade of plant species takes place. She also mentioned one of the key purposes of the workshop is to test with participants and to obtain their feedback upon, new guidance material that has been developed for making non-detriment findings – that is, determining whether proposed trade in a particular plant species will be detrimental to its survival in the wild.

Although the workshop's title refers to non-detriment findings and the review of significant trade, she hoped that the countries would also be considering matters such as legal acquisition findings, the setting and management of voluntary export quotas, the issuance of CITES trade documents, inter-agency cooperation, CITES compliance procedures and regionally coordinated activities to improve the management of shared plant species.

2. Mr. Yubaraj Bhusal, Secretary, MFSC, Nepal welcomed delegates and workshop participants in Nepal. He highlighted Nepal's natural features as a country of rich biodiversity and its potential for legal trade in international markets through implementation of CITES mechanism. He affirmed that Nepal is in a process of preparing domestic CITES legislation to ensure her commitment on protecting endangered wild flora and fauna and promote legal trade for species listed in CITES.
3. Dr. Krishna Chandra Paudel, Joint Secretary, MFSC, Nepal as the chair of the opening ceremony overviewed the scope of the workshop. He hoped the participants' commitments and feedback will play an important role in developing framework to conduct NDF and Review of Significant Trade of plant species. Finally, he wished all the successes of the workshop.

*iii) Vote of Thanks:*

Mr. Mohan Prasad Amatya, Officiating Director General, Department of Plant Resources and scientific authority of plant species, Nepal, thanked all the invitees for their participation in opening ceremony emphasizing the CITES secretariat for providing financial and technical support to organize the workshop in Nepal. He thanked Hon. Minister, Secretary and CITES delegate for their opening remarks.

## **9.2 Sessions Detail:**

After formal opening, the different sessions of the workshop were facilitated by Ms Marceil Yeater and Ms Melina Sosa Schmidt as per the scheduled program. On the first day, the facilitators had focused mostly on different subjects and issues in order to make participants familiar with NDF so that participating national authorities would be able to report to the PC in line with Decisions 15.23 and 15.26, the regional representative of Asia informed about the progress on the implementation of Decision 15.24 and to report at PC20 on progress made with the implementation of Decisions 15.36, 15.25 and 15.27. On the second day, country wise group exercise on NDF was carried out and each participating country presented status of NDF findings of which is given in details in [Annex 3](#). On the third day, participants presented as their country presentation about the NDF related findings for one species from their respective countries. See [Annex 4](#) for country presentations. Participants finalized the workshop findings and recommendations before concluding the session. The third day's sessions was chaired by the Director General, Department of Forests, Nepal. All the details of materials and presentations along with picture of different events were written on a DVD and a copy of it was provided to all participants. The table below provides summary of the deliberations for different sessions during the three days of the workshop.

| Days and Date | Topic of the session | Session Deliberation  | Resource person     |
|---------------|----------------------|---|---------------------|
| <b>1</b>      | Plants in CITES      | This session was focused on making participants knowledgeable about definition of 'species', with respect to readily-recognizable parts and derivatives ("...any readily recognizable part or derivative thereof specified in Appendices II and III in relation to the species), definition of 'artificially propagated', Treatment of hybrids, use of phytosanitary certificates and permits for timber species. Participants also came to know about exemptions for seedlings and tissue cultures in vitro, solid or liquid media, transported in sterile containers. | Melina Sosa Schmidt |

|   |   |   |                     |
|---|---|---|---------------------|
| 1 | Compliance with CITES                     | <p>The CITES compliance procedures have their basis in and are applied in a manner consistent with the text of the Convention (e.g. Article XIII), applicable rules and principles of international law, relevant Resolutions and Decisions of the Conference of the Parties (e.g. Resolution Conf. 14.3) the decisions and recommendations of CITES subsidiary bodies and historical practices.</p> <p>The CITES compliance procedures focus on the obligations to designate a Management Authority and a Scientific Authority (Article IX) to ensure that trade only takes place according to the Convention (Articles III-VII and XIV), take appropriate measures to enforce the Convention and prohibit trade in specimens in violation thereof (Article VIII), maintain records of trade and prepare periodic reports on implementation of the Convention (Article VIII) and respond to communications of the Secretariat (related to information that a species in Appendix I or II is being adversely affected by trade or that the provisions of the Convention are not being effectively implemented) (Article XIII)</p> | Marceil Yeater      |
| 1 | Science in CITES and the Plants Committee | <p>In this session discussions were about the importance of science in CITES, need for non-detriment findings as the basis for trade, how pragmatic management can support sustainable utilization and how CITES data can be used to analyse wildlife trade trends</p> <p>Science is what makes CITES achieve conservation results, gives credibility to CITES. The principal requirement of managing wild resources for international trade in the context of CITES is that exports should not be detrimental to the survival of the species in the wild - i.e. it should be sustainable</p> <p>The Plants Committee provide scientific advice and guidance , deal with nomenclatural issues and assist the Secretariat with the implementation of the Resolution on the Identification Manual and Decisions related to it and, upon request of the Secretariat, review proposals to amend the Appendices with regard to possible identification problems</p>  | Melina Sosa Schmidt |

|          |   |   |  |
|----------|---|---|--|
| <b>1</b> | Review of Significant Trade (Plants and Standing Committee)                         | Overview of Significant Trade Review for CITES Appendix II plant species with special reference to the case of <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> was presented and discussed during this session. The result of the Significant Trade Review process generally removes the need for importing countries to apply unilateral stricter domestic measures (such as import bans or externally-imposed export quotas for range States). The process can result in individual exporting countries being assisted to undertake field studies as well as to develop the technical and administrative capacity necessary to implement the requirements of Article IV if these are lacking | Melina Sosa Schmidt                    |
| <b>1</b> | Role of the CITES authorities with emphasis on the role of the Scientific Authority | Roles of CITES national authorities were discussed and tasks of the Scientific Authority is to determine that the export of specimens of species included in Appendices I and II is not detrimental to their survival and responsibilities of the Management Authority with respect to the Scientific Authority is to consult the Scientific Authority and receive positive advice before issuing an export permit ensuring that the Scientific Authority is informed about all relevant CITES issues.  | Marceil Yeater                         |
| <b>1</b> | Non-detrimental findings.   |   | Melina Sosa Schmidt                    |
| <b>2</b> | NDF Exercises   | Country wise group exercise on NDF was carried out on a form for evaluating the availability of information in the making of NDF to assess risk level of a species and each participating country presented findings of the group exercise for one CITES appendix 2 species of their country. Details of the group exercise findings is given in <a href="#">annex 3</a>  | Marceil Yeater and Melina Sosa Schmidt |
| <b>3</b> | Nepal's country presentation on <i>Taxus wallichiana</i>                            | Presented the current trade status of the species. The trade is found to be decreased in the recent years due to the current provision of CITES and also decline in resource base.  | Gopal Kumar Shrestha                   |
|          | China's country presentation on <i>Cistanche deserticola</i>                        | The plant is found in the root of <i>Haloxylon</i> sp. Found in the Desert ecosystem. This is the threatened and kept as an endangered and in the red list. China gives permit is only to the   | Dr. Haining Qin                        |

|   |  |   |                                 |
|---|--|---|---------------------------------|
|   |  | plantation products. Artificial propagation increases after 1980s. The record of 2008 shows the plantation in 900 hectare. The production was 5600 tons in 2010   |                                 |
| Bangladesh's country presentation on <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> |  | This was the exotic plant for Bangladesh. 50-80 ft tall trees. Used mainly for agar wood production. Plantation is in 200 hectare. Businessman buys 8-10 yrs and older trees. 10yrs old trees have 20-30cm girth. Agar oil price is 1000 US\$ per litre. Life span 30-50yrs (natural) artificial 10yrs. He reported that the in-oculation of the Micorhiza with soil from poly bag by making wounds on trees.   | Dr. Tapan Kumar Dey             |
| Bhutan's country presentation on <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i>     |  | No export from Bhutan. Old trees are experimentally used by the institute of medicine. No any research on the chemical component and ingredients. The plant was reported to be used only in religious use both by Hindus and Buddhists. Bhutan has no data on quantity of local consumption   | Sonam Tobgay                    |
| Srilanka's country presentation on <i>Nepenthes distillatoria</i> |  | It is a tropical pitcher plant found in water logged open area. It is distributed on patches. The population status is unknown. There is high demand in Japan, UK as an ornamental plant. Srilanka provides trade permit for cut flowers.   | Ratnayake Hitibandarale Dayawan |
| India's country presentation on <i>Pterocarpus santanalis</i>     |  | India included the plant in CITES Appendix II in 1997. There is no legal trade available in India. The natural habitat was decreased from 20000 to 5000 hectares. Heartwood is used commercially after removal of sapwood. The Capacity building workshop on NDF was conducted. Promotion of cultivation on original habitat, Andhra Pradesh has best wood quality. It is valued for Sanatalin, Dye, wood powder, medicinal value Roots are even used by digging. | Dr. Maheshwar Hegde             |
| Myanmar's country presentation on <i>Rauvolfia serpentina</i>     |  | The species is not protected by legislation in Myanmar. It was difficult to determine NDF. Annual harvest quota is fixed Department of Forests (both the scientific and management authority). No idea of CITES permit.   | Maung Maung Than                |

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| Indonesia's country presentation on <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i> | Field guide book was published. Local management guideline was formulated. Fast growth 5m tall – 5 yrs time. Seed germination 90%. Suspension inoculation to stem. Also called Black Magic Wood by Muslims. Quota calculation 3yrs production national level. No critical problem in Indonesia for management Problems about inoculation as the artificial inoculation produce inferior agarwood. Smell of Agar oil varies from species to species. Attempt to produce artificial oil. | Dr. Tukirin Partomihardjo              |
| Findings and Recommendations.                                    | Participants together evaluated the workshop and come up with the Findings and Recommendations as mentioned in the respective headings of this report.   | Marceil Yeater and Melina Sosa Schmidt |
| Closing of the workshop  | Mr. Gopal Kumar Shrestha, Chairperson of all the sessions on the third day finally closed the workshop with his concluding remarks   | Mr. Gopal Kumar Shrestha               |

## 10. Financial statement:

The total expenditure of the workshop was US\$ 33298.00. The summary of the workshop expenditure is given in [Annex 5](#).

## 11. Findings:

The three days workshop concluded with the following findings:

- NDF about plant species in some of the South Asian Countries is lacking
- Strengthening technical capacity of the Scientific Authority of the country is essential.
- Many countries in the region shared the similar challenges regarding the conservation, management and trade of CITES listed species
- National technical guidelines on methodologies to assess sustainability of harvest on specimens of species in wild and from plantations is lacking
- The workshop was meaningful for sharing experiences and gain learning about management, conservation and trade control of CITES listed plant species in the region
- There is a need to designate scientific and management authority to work independently in each country and both authorities should work in close coordination.

- Information on trade, biology and status of species distribution in wild is lacking
- More effort is needed to ensure that the plants are given the same attention as animals in CITES. This includes activities designed to improve enforcement of the CITES and related national legislation.
- CITES Secretariat should help the range States financially to organize national level workshops for awareness raising and conduct studies on NDF.
- All participants agreed that the workshop was successful and, sharing information should be continued among countries through this kind of activities (e.g. organizing regional workshops)
- Conservation of plant species should be promoted through sustainable use.

## 12. Recommendations:

The workshop participants unanimously agreed on following recommendations

- Conduct and make more awareness program on Non- detriment Findings for all plant species that are listed in CITES
- Create a funding mechanism to conduct surveys and research on related NDF matters
- Carry more capacity building activities for scientific authorities of range States on NDF related issues
- Implement more robust rules on enforcement and monitoring and do this effectively
- Undertake preliminary assessment of the status of the populations of the plant species in the wild; this can allow setting a cautious quota to reconsider the utility and the need to keep the ban in place.
- Strengthen and promote regional cooperation on implementation of CITES mechanism.
- Use the data analysis (RADAR plot diagram) for plant species and, identify national level funding to undertake capacity building activities on NDF
- Encourage bilateral and multilateral collaboration on curbing illegal trade of plants and plant products.
- Establishment of Biodiversity Detection Unit at custom points
- Capacity building to carry out Research and Development for technology transfer and value addition of the goods so that local communities can get more benefits from the CITES listed species which will decrease the pressure on over exploitation from wild
- Workshops should be held alternatively in different countries to give the opportunity to the national authorities to attain effective cooperation and coordination between exporting and importing countries for controlling illegal trade.

- The CITES secretariat should take initiative to strengthen national capacities to formulate National CITES Legislation and, to formulate NDF for plant species
- Develop criteria and indicators for NDF
- Strengthen coordination and cooperation between national, regional and international stakeholders on CITES related matters.

### **13. Conclusion:**

Imposing permanent bans on the export of specimens of particular species may encourage illegal trade. Therefore apart from banning the export of specimens of particular species, the range States may take measures to conserve and ensure sustainable harvest in the wild and increase production from plantations in order to release pressure in nature. Although illegal trade cannot be stopped, it can be controlled and kept to a minimum if Range States are committed to promote and ensure legal, sustainable and traceable CITES trade in plant species. Each participating country benefited from sharing of each other's experiences and the CITES Secretariat presentations. The participants had finally evaluated that they were benefited a lot from this workshop and, agreed that such workshops should be conducted regularly to strengthen the CITES capacities in the region.

It was agreed that all participating countries will now coordinate with the two regional representatives at the Plants Committee in order to submit the results of the NDF exercise in accordance with the Notification 2011/014 [<http://www.cites.org/eng/notif/2011/E004.pdf>] at the next meeting of the Plants Committee (Geneva, April, 2011). The participation of the regional representative for Asia Dr. Tukirin was found highly valuable to enhance the communications within the region and the Plants Committee.

## **Annexes**

***Annex 1 List of Participants***

***Annex 2 Workshop Schedule***

***Annex 3 NDF exercise Findings***

***Annex 4 Country Presentations***

***Annex 5 Statement of Expenditure***

### List of Participants

| S.N | Participants Name                   | Organization  | Two Highest Academic Qualification                 | Professional Experience (Years) | Country    | Authority  | Email  |
|-----|-------------------------------------|---|--|---------------------------------|------------|------------|--|
| 1   | Mr. A. N. Shamsuddin Azad Chowdhury | Joint secretary (admin.) Government of the people's Republic of Bangladesh, Ministry of Environment and Forest  | Post graduate in Management                        | 25 years                        | Bangladesh | Management | jsadmin@moef.gov.bd,<br>chowdhurnasim59@yahoo.com              |
| 2   | Dr. Tapan Kumar Dey                 | Conservator of forests, Wildlife & Nature circle Department of Forest   | Ph.D wildlife Biology, M.sc forestry, M.sc zoology | 25 years                        | Bangladesh | Scientific | deytkcfwild@gmail.com  |
| 3   | Mr. Sonam Tobgay                    | Sr, Forest officer, Head Bio-Diversity Inventory, Data & Management plan section, wildlife Division Department of Forests and Park Services, Ministry of agriculture & Forest   | M.Sc Mountain Forestry                             | 8 years                         | Bhutan     | Scientific | stobgay107@yahoo.com   |
| 4   | Mr. Kinzang Gyeltshen               | Chief forestry officer, Department of Forests and Park Services   | Master in Environmental management.                | 16 years                        | Bhutan     | Management | kingyel@hotmail.com,<br>k_lhazen@yahoo.com, jamkhar @yahoo.com |
| 5   | Mr. Yuan liangchen                  | Division of flora affairs , C+17hina cites management authority/the endangered species import and export management office, P.R China state forestry administration no.18 Hepinigli Dongji, Beijing 100714, P.R.China | Ph.D ( Plant Biology)                              | 4 Years                         | China      | Management | Yuanlch@yahoo.com.cn   |
| 6   | Haining Qin, Ph.D.                  | Specilists Group and red list focal point of china ,IUCN SSC, Research professor, Institute of Botany Academy of Science , Xiangdhan Beijing china 10093  | Research Professor Ph.D                            | 19 years                        | China      | Scientific | hainingqin@ibcas.ac.cn   |
| 7   | Ms. Chandra Rawat                   | Research officer, wildlife Division, Ministry of Environment and Forest, Room no.441 Parayavaran Bhawan , New Delhi   | M.Sc ( Geology )<br>Research Officer               | 12 Years                        | India      | Management | rowlmef@yahoo.co.in  |

| S.N   | Participants Name                          | Organization  | Two Highest Academic Qualification                        | Professional Experience (Years) | Country   | Authority  | Email   |
|---|--|---|---|---------------------------------|-----------|------------|---|
| 8   | Dr. Maheshwar Hegde                        | Scientist, Institute of Forest Genetics and Tree Breeding(IFGTB), Coimbatore, India                     | Ph.D. M.Sc ( Agriculture)                                 | 12 Years                        | India     | Scientific | hegdem@icfre.org, mahesh-heg@yahoo.com  |
| 9   | Dr. Tukirin Partomihardjo                  | Research centre for Biology, Indonesian Institute of Science Jajan Raya jakarta                         | Ph. D.  |                                 | Indonesia |            | <a href="mailto:tukirin@indo.net.id">tukirin@indo.net.id</a>  |
| 10  | Mr. Maung Maung Than                       | Director, Training & Research Division, Forest Department, Building 39, Nay Pyi Taw,                    |   |                                 | Myanmar   | Management | nwcdmof@gmail.com, putoo911@hotmail.com   |
| 11  | Mr. Thien Aung                             | Asst. Director, Nature and wildlife conservation Division Department, Ministry of Forestry, Nay pyi Taw | B.Sc. (Vetenary ),  | 28 Years                        | Myanmar   | Scientific | <a href="mailto:nwcdmof@gmail.com">nwcdmof@gmail.com</a>  |
| 12  | Mr. Gopal Kumar Shrestha                   | Director General, Department Of Forest  | M.Sc ( Forestry )   | 34 Years                        | Nepal     | Management | <a href="mailto:dgdf@dof.gov.np">dgdf@dof.gov.np</a> , <a href="mailto:sgko245@gmail.com">sgko245@gmail.com</a> |
| 13  | Mr. Mohan Prasad Amatya                    | Officiating Director General, Department of Plant Resources   | M.Sc. (Pharma. )  | 32 Years                        | Nepal     | Scientific | <a href="mailto:dprdog@ntc.net.np">dprdog@ntc.net.np</a>  |
| 14  | Mr. Harihar Sigdel                         | Deputy Director General, Department of Forests  | M.Sc Forestry, M. Sc. Chemistry                           | 31 years                        | Nepal     | Management | <a href="mailto:hsigdel@gmail.com">hsigdel@gmail.com</a>  |
| 15  | Dr. Sushim Ranjan Baral                    | Under Secretary, Department of Plant Resources  | Ph. D.  |                                 | Nepal     | Scientific |   |
| 16  | Mr. Ratnayake Hitibandarala Dayawan        | Department of wildlife conservation   | M. Ph ( Plant Biology)<br>M.Sc wildlife                   | 22 Years                        | Sri lanka | Management | <a href="mailto:ratnayake2008@yahoo.com">ratnayake2008@yahoo.com</a>  |
| 17  | Mr. Sarathnayake Ratna Bandara Dissanayake | Department of wildlife conservation   | M. Ph ( Birds)  | 27 Years                        | Sri lanka | Scientific | sarathdisa@yahoo.com  |
| 18  | Ms Marceil Yeater                          | Chief, Legal Affairs and Trade Policy CITES Secretariat   | BA Political Science, JD (Juns Doctor)                    | 35 Years                        | Geneva    | Lawyer     | <a href="mailto:marceil.yeater@cites.org">marceil.yeater@cites.org</a>  |
| 19  | Ms Milena Sosa Schmidt                     | Scientific Officer CITES Secretariat  | Biology Plant ( University) Master in Science, Ph.D ( FM) | 13 Years                        | Geneva    | Botanist   | Milena.Schmidt@cites.org  |
| <b>Observers (Organising Committee Members)</b> |  |   |   |                                 |           |            |   |
| 1   | Mr. Prakash Nath Pyakuryal                 | Under Secretary, Planning and Monitoring Division, Department of Forests                                | M.Sc Forestry(USA), Diploma Forestry(India)               | 27years                         | Nepal     | Forester   | <a href="mailto:ppyakuryal@yahoo.com">ppyakuryal@yahoo.com</a>  |

| S.N | Participants Name     | Organization  | Two Highest Academic Qualification                         | Professional Experience (Years) | Country | Authority                                      | Email  |
|-----|-----------------------|---|--|---------------------------------|---------|--|--|
| 2   | Mr. Ram Nandan Sah    | Under Secretary CITES<br>Section National<br>Forest Division Department of<br>Forests             | B.Sc. (Forestry) M.<br>S. (Natural Resource<br>Management) | 25 years                        | Nepal   | Forester and<br>Natural<br>Resource<br>Manager | <a href="mailto:ravisasi2@hotmail.com">ravisasi2@hotmail.com</a>                   |
| 3   | Mr. Hem Aryal         | Under Secretary, National<br>Forest Division, Department of<br>Forests                            | M.Sc Forestry, B.Sc<br>Forestry                            | 21years                         | Nepal   | Forester                                       | <a href="mailto:hemaryal@yahoo.com">hemaryal@yahoo.com</a>                         |
| 4   | Mr. Deepak Acharya    | Assistant Forest Officer,<br>National Forest Division,<br>Department of Forests, CITES<br>Section | M. A. Economics, I.Sc<br>(Forestry)                        | 22 years                        | Nepal   | Forester                                       | <a href="mailto:deepakacharya_2003@hotmail.com">deepakacharya_2003@hotmail.com</a> |
| 5   | Mr. Achyute Tiwari    | Assistant Botanist, Department of<br>Plant Resources  | M.Sc Botany  | 7years                          | Nepal   | Botanist                                       | <a href="mailto:achyut_18@yahoo.com">achyut_18@yahoo.com</a>                       |
| 6   | Mr. Diwakar Chapagain | Coordinator Wildlife Control, WWF-<br>Nepal   | M.Sc Degree,   | 25years                         | Nepal   | Lawyer   | <a href="mailto:diwakar.chapagain@wwfnepal.org">diwakar.chapagain@wwfnepal.org</a> |
| 7   | Mr. Dinesh Satyal     | Office secretary, WS organising<br>Committee  | B.Sc Forestry  | Student                         | Nepal   | Forester                                       | <a href="mailto:dnshtsatyal@gmail.com">dnshtsatyal@gmail.com</a>                   |

| <b>Workshop Schedule</b>   |  |  |
|----------------------------|--|--|
| <b>1st day: 09 January</b> |  |  |
| <b>Time</b>                | <b>Activity</b>  | <b>Facilitation</b>                          |
| 08h00-09h30                | Break fast   |  |
| 09h30-10h45                | <b>Registration and Opening</b>  | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 10h45-11h00                | Break (coffee-tea)   |  |
| 11h00-11h30                | <b>Plants in CITES</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 11h30-12h00                | <b>Compliance with CITES</b>   | <b>Marci</b>                                 |
| 12h00-12h45                | <b>Science in CITES and the Plants Committee</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 12h45-13h30                | <b>Review of Significant Trade (Plants and Standing Committee)</b>                         | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 13h30-14h30                | Lunch  |  |
| 14h30-15h30                | <b>Role of the CITES authorities with emphasis on the role of the Scientific Authority</b> | <b>Marci (MA, 30')-<br/>Milena (SA, 30')</b> |
| 15h30-16h00                | Break (coffee-tea)   |  |
| 16h30-18h00                | <b>Non-detrimental findings</b>  | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 18h30-20h00                | Reception Dinner   |  |
| <b>2nd day: 10 January</b> |  |  |
| 08h00-09h00                | Break fast   |  |
| 09h00-10h30                | <b>Non-detrimental findings (exercise)</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 10h30-11h00                | Break (coffee-tea)   |  |
| 11h00-13h00                | <b>Non-detrimental findings (exercise)</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 13h00-14h00                | Lunch  |  |
| 14h00-15h30                | <b>Non-detrimental findings (exercise)</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |
| 15h30-16h00                | Break (coffee-tea)   |  |
| 16h00-17h30                | <b>Non-detrimental findings (exercise)</b>   | <b>Milena</b>                                |

| <b>3rd day: 11 January</b> |   |               |
|----------------------------|---|---------------|
| 08h00-09h00                | Break fast  |               |
| 09h00-10h30                | <b>Case examples from Bangladesh, Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka</b> | <b>Marci</b>  |
| 10h30-11h00                | Break (coffee-tea)  |               |
| 11h00-13h00                | <b>Case examples from Bangladesh, Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar, Nepal, Pakistan, and Sri Lanka</b> | <b>Marci.</b> |
| 13h00-14h00                | Lunch   |               |
| 14h00-15h30                | <b>Conclusions and recommendations. Closing the workshop</b>  | <b>Milena</b> |
| 15h30-16h00                | Break (coffee-tea)  |               |
| 16h00-17h30                | <b>Conclusions and, recommendations. Closing the workshop</b>                                       | <b>Milena</b> |

| Opening Ceremony |  |   |
|------------------|--|---|
| Time             | Activity                               |   |
| 10:00            | Registration                           | All Invitees  |
|                  | Chairing the Session                   | Dr. Krishna Chandra Paudel, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation        |
|                  |  |   |
|                  |  |   |
| 10:15            | Welcome and objective of the work shop | Mr. Gopal Kumar Shrestha, Director General, Department of Forests                             |
| 10:25            | <b>Inauguration</b>                    | Chief Guest, Honorable Minister Mr. Deepak Bohara , Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation |
|                  | <b>Opening Remarks</b>                 |   |
|                  | Representative Cites Secretariat       | Ms. Marceil Yeater, Chief, Legal Affairs and Trade Policy, CITES Secretariat, Geneva          |
|                  | Guest                                  | Mr. Yubraj Bhusal, Secretary, MFSC  |
|                  | Chief guest                            | Honorable Minister Mr. Deepak Bohara , MFSC   |
|                  | Vote of Thanks                         | Mr. Mohan Prasad Amatya, Officiating Director General, Department of Plant Resources          |
| 10:45            | <b>Closing Remarks</b>                 | Chairperson, Dr. Krishna Chandra Paudel, Joint Secretary, MFSC                                |
| 11:00            | <b>Tea and Snacks</b>                  |   |

**THE AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION IN MAKING OF NDF  
TO ASSESS THE RISK LEVEL OF A SPECIES**

| S. N. | Element   | Indonesia             | Bhutan | Bangladesh |            |
|-------|---|-----------------------|--------|------------|------------|
|       |   | Aquilaria malaccensis |        |            |            |
|       |   | wild                  | wild   | wild       | plantation |
| 1     | 1. Distribution   |                       |        |            |            |
| 2     | 2. Abundance of the population  |                       |        |            |            |
| 3     | 3. Population trend in comparison with historical references  |                       |        |            |            |
| 4     | 4. Age structure of the population  |                       |        |            |            |
| 5     | 5. Biological cycle and reproductive strategy   |                       |        |            |            |
| 6     | 6. Habitat requirements and adaptability (specialist versus generalist)   |                       |        |            |            |
| 7     | 7. Impact of the disappearance of the species on the ecosystem  |                       |        |            |            |
| 8     | 8. Capacity for natural repopulation of areas where it has disappeared  |                       |        |            |            |
| 9     | 9. Is the species migratory?  |                       |        |            |            |
|       | <b>USE</b>  |                       |        |            |            |
| 10    | 10. Quantity of material harvested  |                       |        |            |            |
| 11    | 11. Stage of the biological cycle when the harvest takes place  |                       |        |            |            |
| 12    | 12. Extent and type of area being harvested (usually determined by ease of accessibility)                       |                       |        |            |            |
| 13    | 13. Existence of a regulatory system, in particular limits to harvesting and areas where harvest is prohibited. |                       |        |            |            |
| 14    | 14. Does harvesting destroy the whole specimen?   |                       |        |            |            |
| 15    | 15. Level of demand for the species and value of product(s) in trade  |                       |        |            |            |
| 16    | 16. Is harvesting continuous, regular or other?   |                       |        |            |            |
| 17    | 17. Do the harvesting methods cause side damages?   |                       |        |            |            |

| S. N.                | Element   | Indonesia             | Bhutan | Bangladesh |            |
|----------------------|---|-----------------------|--------|------------|------------|
|                      |   | Aquilaria malaccensis |        |            |            |
|                      |   | wild                  | wild   | wild       | plantation |
| 18                   | 18. Does harvesting have conservation purposes for the species?   |                       |        |            |            |
| 19                   | 19. Does the harvesting extend to other species?  |                       |        |            |            |
| <b>OTHER FACTORS</b> |   |                       |        |            |            |
| 20                   | 20. Probable extent of illegal trade  |                       |        |            |            |
| 21                   | 21. Degradation and loss of habitat   |                       |        |            |            |
| 22                   | 22. Effect of pollution   |                       |        |            |            |
| 23                   | 23. Will harvesting in the area covered by the non-detriment finding have consequences for the species in other parts of its range? |                       |        |            |            |
| 24                   | 24. Competition from alien invasive species   |                       |        |            |            |
| 25                   | 25. Diseases, meteorological incidents  |                       |        |            |            |
| 26                   | 26. Risks associated with climate change  |                       |        |            |            |

Filled with one of the colours below according to the availability of information:

| Detailed | Limited | Not available |
|----------|---------|---------------|
|          |         |               |

## THE AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION IN MAKING OF NDF TO ASSESS THE RISK LEVEL OF A SPECIES

| S. N. | Element   | NEPAL                   | INDIA                         | SRILANKA                       | MYANMAR                     | CHINA                        |
|-------|---|-------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|
|       |   | <i>Taxus walichiana</i> | <i>Pterocarpus santalinus</i> | <i>Nepenthes distillatoria</i> | <i>Rauwolfia serpentina</i> | <i>Cistanche deserticola</i> |
|       |   | Wild                    | Wild                          | Wild                           | Wild                        | Wild                         |
| 1     | 1. Distribution   | Green                   | Green                         | Green                          | Yellow                      | Green                        |
| 2     | 2. Abundance of the population  | Yellow                  | Green                         | Green                          | Red                         | Yellow                       |
| 3     | 3. Population trend in comparison with historical references            | Red                     | Green                         | Yellow                         | Yellow                      | Green                        |
| 4     | 4. Age structure of the population                                      | Red                     | Red                           | Yellow                         | Red                         | Green                        |
| 5     | 5. Biological cycle and reproductive strategy                           | Yellow                  | Green                         | Yellow                         | Red                         | Green                        |
| 6     | 6. Habitat requirements and adaptability (specialist versus generalist) | Green                   | Green                         | Green                          | Red                         | Green                        |
| 7     | 7. Impact of the disappearance of the species on the ecosystem          | Green                   | Red                           | Yellow                         | Red                         | Green                        |
| 8     | 8. Capacity for natural repopulation of areas where it has disappeared  | Red                     | Yellow                        | Red                            | Red                         | Green                        |
| 9     | 9. Is the species migratory?  |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
|       | USE   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 10    | 10. Quantity of material harvested                                      | Green                   | Red                           | Green                          | Yellow                      | Green                        |
| 11    | 11. Stage of the biological cycle when the harvest takes place          | Green                   | Green                         |                                | Yellow                      | Green                        |

| S. N. | Element   | NEPAL                   | INDIA                         | SRILANKA                       | MYANMAR                     | CHINA                        |
|-------|---|-------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|
|       |   | <i>Taxus walichiana</i> | <i>Pterocarpus santalinus</i> | <i>Nepenthes distillatoria</i> | <i>Rauwolfia serpentina</i> | <i>Cistanche deserticola</i> |
|       |   | Wild                    | Wild                          | Wild                           | Wild                        | Wild                         |
| 12    | 12. Extent and type of area being harvested (usually determined by ease of accessibility)                       |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 13    | 13. Existence of a regulatory system, in particular limits to harvesting and areas where harvest is prohibited. |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 14    | 14. Does harvesting destroy the whole specimen?   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 15    | 15. Level of demand for the species and value of product(s) in trade  |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 16    | 16. Is harvesting continuous, regular or other?   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 17    | 17. Do the harvesting methods cause side damages?   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 18    | 18. Does harvesting have conservation purposes for the species?   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 19    | 19. Does the harvesting extend to other species?  |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
|       | <b>OTHER FACTORS</b>  |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 20    | 20. Probable extent of illegal trade  |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 21    | 21. Degradation and loss of habitat   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |
| 22    | 22. Effect of pollution   |                         |                               |                                |                             |                              |

| S. N. | Element   | NEPAL                           | INDIA                                 | SRILANKA                               | MYANMAR                             | CHINA                                |
|-------|---|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|
|       |   | <i>Taxus walichiana</i><br>Wild | <i>Pterocarpus santalinus</i><br>Wild | <i>Nepenthes distillatoria</i><br>Wild | <i>Rauwolfia serpentina</i><br>Wild | <i>Cistanche deserticola</i><br>Wild |
| 23    | 23. Will harvesting in the area covered by the non-detriment finding have consequences for the species in other parts of its range? |                                 |                                       |  |                                     |                                      |
| 24    | 24. Competition from alien invasive species   |                                 |                                       |  |                                     |                                      |
| 25    | 25. Diseases, meteorological incidents  |                                 |                                       |  |                                     |                                      |
| 26    | 26. Risks associated with climate change  |                                 |                                       |  |                                     |                                      |

Filled with one of the colours below according to the availability of information:

| Detailed | Limited | Not available |
|----------|---------|---------------|
|          |         |               |

## Country Presentations

The following Powerpoint presentations are available on request:

| Country    | Species                                      | Size (KB) |
|------------|--|-----------|
| Bangladesh | <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i>                 | 18,281    |
| Bhutan     | <i>Aquilaria malaccensis</i>                 | 58        |
| China      | <i>Cistanche deserticola</i>                 | 2,391     |
| India      | <i>Pterocarpus santalinus</i>                | 6,589     |
| Indonesia  | <i>Aquilaria</i> spp. & <i>Gyrinops</i> spp. | 7,445     |
| Myanmar    | <i>Rauvolfia serpentina</i>                  | 68        |
| Nepal      | <i>Taxus wallichiana</i>                     | 700       |
| Sri Lanka  | <i>Nepenthes distillatoria</i>               | 1,119     |

## Statement of expenditure

| S.N.             | Particular  | Days | No. of Participants | RATE            | Estimated Cost (US\$) | Actual expenditure | Difference     | Remarks   |
|------------------|---|------|---------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|--------------------|----------------|---|
| 1                | <b>Allowances/Accommodation for Participants of the workshop</b>                    |      |                     |                 |                       |                    |                |   |
|                  | Participants (international) daily allowance for pocketmoney 4 days                 | 4    | 16                  | 142             | 3180.80               | 2584.5             | 596.30         | No participation from Pakistan but two additional Nepalese participants |
|                  | Participants (international) DSA 1 day  | 1    | 16                  | 142             | 2272.00               | 1846               | 426.00         |   |
|                  | Accommodation with breakfast in five star hotel for international participants only | 4    | 16                  | 85              | 5440.00               | 5100               | 340.00         | four night extra (two night for Bhutan and two night for China)         |
|                  | <b>Sub Total</b>  |      |                     |                 | <b>10892.80</b>       | <b>9530.5</b>      | <b>1362.30</b> |   |
| 2                | <b>Two way air fare and transportation for participants</b>                         |      |                     |                 |                       |                    |                |   |
|                  | Bangladesh  |      | 2                   | 390             | 780                   | 780                |                |   |
|                  | Bhutan  |      | 2                   | 640             | 1280                  | 1280               |                |   |
|                  | China including one regional representative   |      | 2                   | 860             | 1720                  | 1720               |                |   |
|                  | India   |      | 2                   | 396             | 792                   | 792                |                |   |
|                  | Pakistan  |      | 2                   | 870             | 1740                  | 870                | 870            | one ticketed not refunded   |
|                  | Myanmar   |      | 2                   | 1613            | 3226                  | 3226               |                |   |
|                  | Srilanka  |      | 2                   | 1258            | 2516                  | 2516               |                |   |
|                  | Indonesia (Regional representative)   |      | 1                   | 1250            | 1250                  | 1250               |                |   |
|                  | Airport transfer for international participants                                     | 2    | 18                  | 5               | 180.00                | 180                |                |   |
|                  | transportation cost for all local participants for 3days                            |      | 31                  | 10              | 310.00                | 310                |                |   |
| <b>Sub Total</b> |   |      |                     | <b>13794.00</b> | <b>12924</b>          | <b>870</b>         |                |   |
| 3                | <b>Stationary &amp; Training Materials</b>  |      |                     |                 |                       |                    |                |   |
|                  | Bag packs for participants and observers  |      | 35                  | 40              | 1400                  | 1400               | 0              |   |
|                  | Stationary & Training Materials   |      |                     |                 | 500.00                | 500                | 0              |   |

|                    |   |   |    |      |                 |                 |                 |   |
|--------------------|---|---|----|------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|---|
|                    | Photo copies  |   |    |      | 300.00          | 300             | 0               |   |
|                    | <b>Sub Total</b>  |   |    |      | <b>2200.00</b>  | <b>2200</b>     | <b>0</b>        |   |
| 4                  | <b>Refreshment</b>  |   |    |      |                 |                 |                 |   |
|                    | Break fast for national participants and organising committee members | 3 | 8  | 10   | 240             | 340             | -100            | included 10 more  |
|                    | Tea Coffe cookies for three days during ws                            |   | 82 | 3    | 246             | 372             | -126            | 42 more participated in Inaugural/opening session along with minister and secretary of ministry of Forest and Soil conservation |
|                    | Buffet Lunch for three days   |   | 82 | 10   | 820             | 820             | 0               |   |
|                    | Cocktail Reception Dinner   | 1 | 45 | 15   | 675.00          | 1500            | -825.00         | 27more participated with drinks including invitees and drivers  |
|                    | <b>Sub Total</b>  |   |    |      | <b>1981.00</b>  | <b>3032</b>     | <b>-1051.00</b> |   |
| 5                  | <b>Equipments and publication</b>                                     |   |    |      |                 |                 |                 |   |
|                    | Laptop with printer (purchase)  | 1 |    | 1000 | 1000            | 1000            | 0               |   |
|                    | Editing and Publication of ws Proceeding                              | 1 |    | 1500 | 1500            | 1500            | 0               |   |
|                    | <b>Sub Total</b>  |   |    |      | <b>2500</b>     | <b>2500</b>     |                 |   |
| <b>Total</b>       |   |   |    |      | <b>31367.80</b> | <b>30186.5</b>  | <b>1181.3</b>   |   |
| 6                  | <b>Secretarial Services, Management expenses and Miscellaneous</b>    |   |    |      | <b>3136.78</b>  | <b>3136.58</b>  | 0               |   |
| <b>Grand Total</b> |   |   |    |      | <b>34504.58</b> | <b>33323.08</b> | <b>1181.3</b>   |   |

|   |   |           |
|---|---|-----------|
| <b>List of Participants in the Workshop</b> |   |           |
| 1   | Representative from 8 member countries (2 from each country)          | 16        |
| 2   | Regional representatives  | 1         |
| 3   | Representative from Geneva  | 2         |
| 4   | Observers from hosting country including organising committee members | 13        |
|   | <b>Total no.of mandays during three work shop days</b>                | <b>82</b> |

It varied on different days of ws

Total Estimate           **34504.58**  
Actual Expenditure :   **33323.08**