

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fourteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties
The Hague (Netherlands), 3-15 June 2007

Summary record of the fourth plenary session

14 June 2007: 14h00-17h00

Chairman: G. Verburg (the Netherlands)
Vice Chairman: A. van de Zande (the Netherlands)
Chairman Committee I: G. Leach (Australia)
Chairman Committee II: C.S. Cheung (China)

Secretariat: W. Wijnstekers
J. Barzdo
M. Jankowska
D. Morgan

Rapporteurs: J. Boddens Hosang
P. De Angelis
W. Jackson
C. McLardy

The Chairman congratulated delegates for their excellent work over the preceding days.

Strategic matters

10. Report of the ministerial meeting

The Chairman noted that the Government of the Netherlands had organized a CITES Ministerial Round Table meeting for the first time, in order to strengthen political will and commitment to CITES. Referring to document CoP14 Doc. 10, she summarized the key themes that were discussed during the meeting, including: CITES's contribution to the biodiversity and sustainable-use agenda; strengthening implementation and enforcement of CITES; and the role of CITES regarding timber and marine species. She expressed the view that the results of the meeting indicated will, vision and leadership to ensure that CITES remains meaningful in the future.

The report of the Ministerial Round Table in document CoP14 Doc. 10 was noted and welcomed.

Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States, congratulated the Minister for the success of the Roundtable, and stressed the importance of cooperation between CITES and other conventions in addressing biodiversity issues related to commercially-exploited resources such as timber and marine species.

Administrative matters

9. Committee elections and appointments

9.1 Standing Committee

The Parties indicated below were reported as the nominated representatives of the regions to serve on the Standing Committee. The newly elected Parties (marked with an asterisk) were duly endorsed:

Regional representative	Alternate
<u>Africa</u>	
Democratic Republic of the Congo*	Mali*
Ghana	Egypt
Kenya	Uganda
Zambia	Botswana
<u>Asia</u>	
China	India
Islamic Republic of Iran*	Kuwait*
Japan	Jordan
<u>Central and South America and Caribbean</u>	
Chile	Colombia
Costa Rica*	Guatemala*
Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	Dominica
<u>Europe</u>	
Bulgaria*	Italy*
United Kingdom*	Czech Republic*
Iceland	Norway*
<u>North America</u>	
Canada*	Mexico*
<u>Oceania</u>	
Australia	Fiji

9.2 Animals Committee

The individuals indicated below were reported as the nominated representatives of the regions to serve on the Animals Committee. The newly elected representatives (marked with an asterisk) were duly endorsed:

Regional representative**Alternate**Africa

Khaled Zahzah (Tunisia) *

Mostafa Ahmed Mahmoud (Egypt)

Richard Kiome Bagine (Kenya)

Moses Maurihungirire (Namibia)

Asia

Mohammad Pourkazemi (Islamic Republic of Iran) *

Nobuo Ishii (Japan) *

Siti Nuramaliati Prijono (Indonesia)

Choo-Hoo Giam (Singapore)

Central and South America and the Caribbean

To be confirmed at a later session.

Europe

Thomas Althaus (Switzerland) *

Colmán Ó Críodáin (Ireland) *

Carlos Ibero Solana (Spain) *

Radu Suciu (Romania) *

North America

Rodrigo A. Medellín (Mexico)

Rosemarie Gnam (United States) *

Oceania

Rod Hay (New Zealand)

John Aruga (Papua New Guinea)

9.3 Plants Committee

The individuals indicated below were reported as the nominated representatives of the regions to serve on the Plants Committee. The newly elected representatives (marked with an asterisk) were duly endorsed:

Regional representative**Alternate**Africa

David Hafashimana (Uganda)

Koffi Akpagana (Togo)

Beatrice Khayota (Kenya)

Quentin Luke (Kenya)

Asia

Tukirin Partomihardjo (Indonesia) *

Mohd Yunus Zakaria (Malaysia) *

Wichar Thitiprasert (Thailand)

M. Sanjappa (India)

Central and South America and the Caribbean

Mariana de Jesús Mites Cadena (Ecuador)

to be received (Colombia)

Dora Ingrid Rivera (Costa Rica)

to be received (Dominican Republic)

Europe

Maurizio Sajeve (Italy)*

Jonas Lüthy (Switzerland)*

Margarita África Clemente Muñoz (Spain)

Nika Debeljak Sabec (Slovenia)

North America

Robert R. Gabel (United States)

Adrienne Sinclair (Canada)

Oceania

Greg Leach (Australia)*

Osia Gideon (Papua New Guinea)*

Strategic matters

11. CITES Strategic Vision: 2008-2013

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the agenda item had been discussed in a working group chaired by Canada. He added that the report from the group, including a draft resolution and two draft decisions, was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 20, and that it had been accepted in the Committee with amendments to the draft resolution recorded in Summary Record Com. II Rep. 15. These were adopted.

12. Review of the scientific committees

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the agenda item had been discussed in a working group chaired by Germany. He said the report was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 30, which included a number of draft decisions and amendments to other resolutions. He noted it had been accepted in the Committee with amendments recorded in Summary Record Com. II Rep. 15 and it was adopted.

13. Addis Ababa Principles and Guidelines for the Sustainable Use of Biodiversity

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the Committee had accepted some amendments to Resolution Conf. 13.2, and the final text was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 17. It had been accepted in the Committee and was adopted.

15. National wildlife trade policy reviews

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the four draft decisions in document CoP14 Doc. 15 Annex 1 had been accepted with amendments by the Committee, as shown in document CoP14 Com. II. 1. This was adopted.

16. Capacity building

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the item had been discussed along with draft decisions contained in document CoP14 Doc. 8.4, and that revised decisions had been drafted, which were agreed and were contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 4. He noted that an additional decision on regional organizations and CITES capacity building was also contained in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II. Rep. 15. Uruguay, supported by Kenya and Suriname, requested that discussion on item 8.4 be reopened in order to address outstanding draft decisions directed to the Secretariat and the Standing Committee. It was decided to defer discussion of the agenda item to the next session.

17. Cooperation between Parties and promotion of multilateral measures

The Chairman of Committee II informed delegates that the Committee had considered draft decisions contained in document CoP14 Doc. 17 Annex 2. He reported that some amendments had been agreed. The new text was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 2, which was adopted.

18. Cooperation with other organizations

18.1 Cooperation with the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

The Chairman of Committee II reported that draft decisions directed to the Standing Committee, as contained in document CoP14 Doc. 18.1 had been rejected, but that the draft decisions directed to the Secretariat had been accepted with amendments. He said the final text was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 7, which was adopted.

18.2 Cooperation between CITES and ITTO regarding trade in tropical timber

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the United States had revised their proposal in light of comments, and that the new draft resolution, contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 5, had been approved with a minor editorial amendment in the Spanish text recorded in Summary Record Com. II Rep. 8. This was adopted.

19. Dialogue meetings

19.1 Terms of reference for CITES dialogue meetings

The Chairman of Committee II informed the meeting that the draft resolution in document CoP14 Doc. 19.1 had been approved with amendments, and was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 10. This document was adopted.

The remainder of the plenary session was chaired by the Vice-Chairman.

Administrative matters

7. Financing and budgeting of the Secretariat and of meetings of the Conference of the Parties

7.1 Financial reports for the years 2004 to 2006

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the financial reports for 2004-2006 had been accepted in the Committee and these were adopted.

7.2 Estimated expenditures for 2007

The Chairman of Committee II announced that the report of estimated expenditure for 2007 had been accepted in the Committee, as had been the request of the Secretariat to approve the drawdown of USD 85,670 from the accumulated Trust Fund balance. This was adopted.

7.3 Costed programme of work for the Secretariat for the triennium 2009-2011

The Chairman of Committee II reported that a Budget Working Group had been established, and that their report was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 31. He announced that Parties had voted on the options of increasing the budget by 15 %, 10 % and 3 %, and each of these options had been rejected. As the Committee had been unable to reach agreement, the Chairman had requested that the matter be referred to the plenary session in the hope that a solution could be found with a larger number of Parties being represented. He also noted that the draft resolution in Annex 8 of document CoP14 Com. II. 31 had been agreed as amended, with the exception of the fourth paragraph of the operative part, which indicated the level of the budget. He noted that once the level of the budget was agreed, the Secretariat would produce the tables to accompany it. The text agreed by Committee II was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 32.

The Secretary-General noted that the following paragraph had been omitted from document CoP14 Com. II. 32 and should be reinstated:

INSTRUCTS the Secretariat to develop a costed programme of work based on the Strategic Vision adopted at CoP14, taking into account available staffing resources and financial means and to submit it for consideration of the Standing Committee at its 57th meeting;

The Netherlands recognized that the Convention was seriously under-funded and was convinced that a significant increase in core budget of at least 20 % would be required in order for the Secretariat to implement essential activities such as training, scientific support and capacity building. They noted that 10 % and 15 % budgetary increases had been supported by 60 % of voting Parties, yet an increase of 3 % had been supported by only 32 %, and requested a further vote on a 15 % increase. Switzerland concurred, noting this level of funding would be required to implement the ambitious activities already agreed at the meeting, and urged Parties to show a spirit of compromise. Their views were echoed by Denmark, Sweden and Germany, who also indicated their support for a 15 % increase, as did the United Kingdom, who announced their intention to support implementation of decisions on livelihoods, compliance and enforcement, and Internet trade (documents CoP14 Doc. 14, Doc. 26 and Doc. 28 respectively) through three specific contributions of GBP 15,000 each.

Zimbabwe, supported by Senegal, supported a 15 % increase, stating that a lower percentage would undermine the Secretariat and compromise its ability to carry out essential activities such as capacity building to assist developing countries to implement the Convention.

Mexico called for increased transparency and accountability and suggested the adoption of creative approaches to finding alternative solutions to the budget crisis such as an analysis of resource savings and pointed to rules such as flying business class that drew on resources. They supported a zero nominal growth option, as did Japan, who requested a vote be carried out for any proposals to increase the budget by more than 3 % since they are not in a position to accept it, and consequently consensus may not be reached. Mexico also noted that detailed budget information had not been available prior to the meeting, and this had hindered progress. They remarked that several Parties that had made calls for an increase in contributions were themselves in arrears. Recognizing that many Asian and Latin American countries would be unable to support an increase greater than 10 %, they recommended that a 'Friends of the Chair' group be established to bridge the difference in views clearly evident. Peru echoed these views and stated that they could only support a maximum 3 % increase.

The United States expressed serious concern with the situation and current impasse, and reflected that a previous decision to deplete the strategic reserve was a factor in the current budget crisis. They also expressed surprise that this problem and its implications had not been clearly identified in the proposed budget, but that instead a budget containing five new positions and representing over a 100 % increase had been presented. The United States endorsed the work of the Secretariat in capacity building, enforcement and scientific support, but stressed that governments could not be expected to react quickly to the shortfall by substantially increasing their contributions, and did not support a 15 % option. They supported convening a 'Friends of the Chair' group to seek a consensus solution.

The Chairman, noting the balance of views, established a Friends of the Chair group to try and reach consensus on a compromise option, appointing the Committee-II Chairman as the group's Chairman.

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Review of Resolutions and Decisions

20. Review of Resolutions

20.1 Resolutions relating to Appendix-I species

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the draft consolidated resolutions presented in Annexes 2 and 4 of document CoP14 Doc. 20.1 had been rejected by the Committee, requiring no further action by the Parties.

20.2 General review

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the proposed amendments to the Resolutions presented in the Annex to document CoP14 Doc. 20.2, as well as a contradiction between two Resolutions pointed out by the Secretariat, had been reviewed. The amendments proposed by the Secretariat had been approved by the Committee, with two exceptions. The exceptions related to Resolution Conf. 8.4 and to the Annexes to Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP12), which Committee II had approved along with additional amendments. In addition, the Committee had agreed on amendments to Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13) to resolve the conflict between this Resolution and Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.). The Committee had also agreed that the operative part of Resolution Conf. 11.6 (Rev. CoP13) should be consolidated into Resolution Conf. 12.3, under section XIV, repealing the earlier Resolution. These changes were summarized in document CoP14 Com. II. 9. Committee II had also approved the draft decision directed to the Standing Committee in paragraph 4 of document CoP14 Doc. 20.2.

The United States, seconded by Mexico, made a motion to re-open the discussion, particularly on Resolution Conf. 10.16 (Rev.), regarding breeding in captivity, and on Resolution Conf. 12.10 (Rev. CoP13), referring to registration of captive-breeding facilities. The motion was opposed by China and Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States. The Chairman called for a vote on the motion to reopen debate. This was defeated with 27 votes in favour, 64 against and 17 abstentions (vote 1).

The amendments and draft decision were adopted.

21. Revision of Resolution Conf. 11.16 on Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II

The Chairman of Committee II reported that a working group had considered the differences regarding this issue. Their report was contained in document Com. II. 24. The Committee had agreed to the draft decision and the proposed revision of Resolution Conf. 11.16 contained in that document. This was adopted.

22. Review of Decisions

The Chairman of Committee II reported that it had agreed to delete only Decision 13.53 of the Decisions that the Secretariat proposed to be deleted in Annex 1 of document CoP14 Doc. 22. Regarding the proposal in Annex 2 of the document, it had been agreed to transfer the text of Decision 9.15 to Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP13). Committee II had also noted that the Secretariat would not include in the list of Decisions after CoP14 any of the Decisions that were not included in Annex 1 of document CoP14 Doc. 22, unless the Conference decided otherwise under other agenda items. This was adopted.

Compliance and enforcement issues

23. Guidelines for compliance with the Convention

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the Committee had accepted the recommendation of a working group, chaired by Norway, and reported in document Com. II. 21, to adopt an amended draft resolution and to "take note" of the *Guide to CITES Compliance Procedures*, rather than "adopt" it. The amended draft resolution was adopted.

Japan requested that the five items listed in the footnote to paragraph 30, referring to the specific and explicit basis in the Convention by which the Standing Committee may recommend a trade suspension, be considered as a whole, asserting that the first two items formed the basis for the latter three to be applied, but that the items taken individually were insufficient to provide the specific and explicit basis for a trade suspension. This was noted.

24. National laws for implementation of the Convention

The Chairman of Committee II indicated that the draft decisions in Annex 1 to document CoP14 Doc. 24 had been discussed and approved with amendments, the final text of which was contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 8. This was adopted.

27. Disposal of illegally traded and confiscated specimens of Appendix-II and -III species

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the proposal in document CoP14 Doc. 27 had been withdrawn by Indonesia, requiring no further action by the Parties.

25. Enforcement matters

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the draft decisions directed to the Standing Committee and the Secretariat in document CoP14 Doc. 25 Annex had been approved by Committee II with amendments. The final text as agreed was presented in document Com. II. 27. The Decisions were adopted.

26. Compliance and enforcement

The Chairman of Committee II had requested that Germany consult with interested Parties to revise their proposals with a view to reaching a consensus. Two revised draft decisions and a revised draft of Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP13), provided in document Com. II. 23 had been approved by Committee II. This was adopted.

28. Internet trade in specimens of CITES-listed species

The Chairman of Committee II explained that the proponent had requested the Committee to consider the draft decisions contained in the Secretariat's comments in document CoP14 Doc. 28, rather than those in the Annex to the document. The Committee had approved these draft decisions directed to the Standing Committee and the Secretariat, with amendments as presented in document CoP14 Com. II. 6. The draft decisions were adopted.

29. National reports

The Committee II Chairman indicated that two draft decisions in document CoP14 Doc. 29 Annex 2 had been approved consensually by the Committee. These were adopted.

30. Reporting on trade in artificially propagated plants

The Chairman of Committee II reported that, after introducing this document in Committee II, and hearing alternative views, Switzerland had revised their proposal as presented in document CoP14 Com. II. 14. Three draft decisions contained therein had been approved by the Committee, with minor amendments recorded in summary record CoP14 Com. II Rep. 12. These were adopted.

31. Monitoring of the implementation of the annotations to *Euphorbia* spp. and Orchidaceae spp. included in Appendix II

The Chairman of Committee II indicated that this document had been withdrawn by Switzerland, requiring no further action by the Parties.

32. Incentives for implementation of the Convention

The Chairman of Committee II informed the delegates that the draft decisions directed to the Parties, the Standing Committee and the Secretariat presented in document CoP14 Doc. 32 Annex had been thoroughly discussed by Committee II but there had been no consensus. A vote had resulted in approval of all the draft decisions.

Brazil, seconded by Argentina, motioned to reopen the discussion, stating that Parties had had insufficient time to discuss the document. The motion was opposed by Germany, on behalf of the

European Community and its Member States. The Chairman called for a vote on the motion to reopen debate, which was successful with 36 votes in favour, 62 against and 21 abstentions (vote 2).

Brazil suggested the following amendments to the draft decisions in the Annex to document CoP14 Doc. 32:

a) In the section beginning Directed to the Parties:

- i) under the second paragraph, “urged” be changed to encouraged;
- ii) the heading “Directed to the Standing Committee” would be deleted and the first paragraph thereafter would change as follows:

14.xx The ~~Standing Committee~~ Parties shall consider ~~at its 57th~~ practical ways to enhance stakeholder engagement in the implementation of the Convention, ~~with a particular emphasis on the local communities and the private sector~~ (e.g. promoting good practices and codes of conduct that facilitate the work of CITES authorities, help to reduce time-frames for the completion of CITES procedures and enhance the role of the private sector in intelligence-gathering to identify and prosecute illegal traders).

- iii) the next two paragraphs would be deleted.

b) In the section beginning Directed to the Secretariat:

- i) in the first paragraph, the words “cost of” would be inserted before “CITES-related” and “in this regard” would be added to the end of the sentence;
- ii) the second paragraph in this section would change as follows:

14.xx Subject to external funding, ~~The the~~ Secretariat shall continue its cooperation with the BioTrade Initiative of UNCTAD under a signed MoU to ensure the conservation of ~~the wild species~~ subject to international trade and, ~~enhance the livelihoods of poor people and~~ promote private sector compliance with CITES requirements and national legislation.

- iii) the next paragraph beginning, “Contingent on the availability of external funding,” would be deleted;
- iv) in the last paragraph in this section, the word “should” would be replaced by “shall” and, “at the 15th meeting of the Conference of the Parties” would be moved to the end of the sentence.

The draft decisions with the above amendments were consensually adopted.

Trade control and marking issues

33. Introduction from the sea

The Chairman of Committee II reported that a draft decision and draft resolution, contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 26, had been agreed by Committee II.

Mexico, referring to the definition of “marine environment not under jurisdiction of any State” which was contained in the operative agreement in the document, said that this was and must be consistent with the United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea, and noted their intended constructive participation in the working group on this topic. The document was adopted.

34. Trade in Appendix-I species

The Chairman of Committee II announced that the document had been noted by Committee II. A proposal to approve a number of draft decisions introduced during the discussion had been rejected on a vote, requiring no further action by the Parties.

35. International expert workshop on non-detriment findings

The Chairman of Committee I reported that three draft decisions in document CoP14 Doc. 35 had been accepted by consensus. The document was adopted.

36. Management of annual export quotas

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the proposals in Annexes 1, 2 and 3 of document CoP14 Doc. 36 had all been accepted by Committee II, with amendments recorded in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II. Rep. 10. The document was adopted.

37. Appendix-I species subject to export quotas

37.1 Leopard export quotas for Mozambique

The Chairman of Committee I announced that the document had been discussed together with the matter on the Ugandan leopard quota which had been referred from Plenary. He reported that a draft amendment to Resolution Conf. 10.14 (Rev. CoP13) on Quotas for leopard hunting trophies and skins for personal use had been accepted by consensus. It would amend the quota for Mozambique and provide for a new quota for Uganda. The revised Resolution was contained in document CoP14 Com. I. 6. The document was adopted.

37.2 Black rhinoceros export quotas for Namibia and South Africa

The Chairman of Committee I reported that the proposal to repeal Resolution Conf. 13.5 on the establishment of export quotas for black rhinoceros hunting trophies had been rejected in Committee I after a vote, and thus required no further action by the Parties.

38. Production systems for specimens of CITES-listed species

The Chairman of Committee I reported that a draft decision, that had been accepted by consensus in the Committee, was contained in document CoP14 Doc. 38. The document was adopted.

39. Purpose-of-transaction codes on CITES permits and certificates

The Chairman of Committee I informed delegates that the work of a working group, coordinated by the United States, had resulted in document CoP14 Com. II. 29, which had been accepted in Committee II with an amendment recorded in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II Rep. 15. The draft decision, thus amended, was adopted.

40. Electronic permitting

40.1 Report of the Secretariat

and

40.2 Report of the Standing Committee's Working Group

The Chairman of Committee II reported that document CoP14 Com. II. 13 was the result of addressing these items together. The document was adopted.

41. Transport of live specimens

The Chairman of Committee I reported that a draft revision of Resolution Conf. 10.21 on Transport of live animals contained in Annex 2 to document CoP14 Doc. 41 (Rev. 1) had been agreed by consensus. Two associated draft decisions, in document CoP14 Com. I. 4, had also been accepted by consensus. The revision and draft decisions were adopted.

42. Physical inspection of timber shipments

The Chairman of Committee II reported that his Committee had approved two draft decisions presented in document CoP14 Com. II. 18 with some amendments, recorded in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II Rep. 13. The amended draft decisions were adopted.

44. Identification Manual

The Chairman of Committee II informed that the report of the Secretariat in document CoP14 Doc. 44 had been accepted. The document was adopted.

Exemptions and special trade provisions

45. Personal and household effects

A working group had been established in Committee II, chaired by China, and produced document CoP14 Com. II. 16. This document had been discussed and amended at the 13th session of Committee II and the result was to be found in document CoP14 Com. II. 34. The Secretary-General expressed his appreciation for the intersessional work carried out by the Chairman of Committee II. The draft resolution and decision in document CoP14 Com. II. 34 were adopted.

Trade control and marking issues and Exemptions and special trade provisions

43. Effectiveness of the CITES universal crocodylian tagging system

and

46. Trade in some crocodylian specimens

The Chairman of Committee II reported that these agenda items had been discussed together. The proposals in the documents for these items had been combined by the proponents as two draft decisions contained in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II Rep. 12 with amendments agreed in the same session. The final draft decisions were in document CoP14 Com. II. 28 which was adopted.

Exemptions and special trade provisions

47. Applications to register operations that breed Appendix-I animal species in captivity for commercial purposes

The Chairman of Committee I reported that a vote in the Committee had resulted in eight new taxa being added to the Register of operations that breed Appendix-I animal species for commercial purposes, in relation to a facility in the Philippines. These included *Amazona ochrocephala auropalliata*, *A. o. oratrix*, *A. viridigenalis*, *Anodorhynchus hyacinthinus*, *Ara militaris*, *A. rubrogenys*, *Cacatua goffini* and *Propyrrhura maracana*.

Bolivia requested reopening the debate, which was successful with 38 votes in favour, 72 against and three abstentions (vote 3). They opposed the inclusion of *A. rubrogenys* in the list, stating that the species was endemic to their country and that they had not been consulted about the species being included in the Register. They added that the legality of the facility's activities under CITES was questionable, since they could not prove the sources of acquisition or origin of parental stock. Indonesia, where one of the eight listed species was endemic, agreed and seconded Bolivia's request to reopen the debate. Germany, on behalf of the European Community and its Member States,

opposed. New Zealand noted that a smuggler with connections to the breeding facility in the Philippines had recently been apprehended and they offered to submit proof.

A vote resulted in a narrow margin to reject the inclusion of these eight species in the register, with 63 votes in favour, 32 against and 21 abstentions (vote 4).

48. Relationship between *ex situ* production and *in situ* conservation: report of the Standing Committee

The proposal to conduct a study had been rejected in Committee II and this was accepted.

49. Reservations regarding species transferred from one Appendix to another

The draft revision of Resolution Conf. 4.25 in Annex 2 of document CoP14 Doc. 49 had been approved by consensus in Committee II with an amendment indicated in Summary Record CoP14 Com. II Rep. 10. The proposed revision was adopted as amended.

Species trade and conservation issues

50. Great apes

Committee II had agreed that the Secretariat should conduct a mission to Egypt to discuss enforcement-related issues. The Committee had also accepted the report of the Secretariat in document CoP14 Doc. 50. The document was adopted.

51. Cetaceans

The Chairman of Committee I reported that the document had been rejected in Committee I and this was accepted.

52. Asian big cats

Committee II had noted the report in document CoP14 Doc. 52 and discussions had resulted in document CoP14 Com. II. 19. Committee II had accepted the report of the Secretariat and approved a series of draft decisions, contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 33. This document was adopted.

China voiced their dissatisfaction, stating that their country acted responsibly with regard to the conservation of the tiger, and that captive breeding was successful. They did not intend to change the current national policy and stated that the decision taken by the Parties was not based on scientific information.

54. Rhinoceroses

The Chairman of Committee I informed delegates that a revision of Resolution Conf. 9.14 (Rev. CoP13) on Conservation of and trade in African and Asian rhinoceroses and three associated draft decisions had been agreed by consensus. The text of the revised Resolution and the draft decisions was in document CoP14 Com. I. 2 with the replacement of "this Decision" with "these Decisions" in paragraph d) on page 2 of the latter. The amended document was adopted.

55. Tibetan antelope

The report of the Secretariat in document CoP14 Doc. 55 had been accepted by Committee II. The document was adopted.

56. Saiga antelope

The Chairman of Committee I reported that seven draft decisions had been accepted by consensus, and that those could be found in document CoP14 Com. I. 5. The document was adopted.

57. Tortoises and freshwater turtles

Committee I had accepted four draft decisions by consensus and these were in document CoP14 Com. I. 12 and Summary Record Com. I Rep. 13. The draft decisions were adopted.

58. Hawksbill turtle

The Chairman of Committee I reported that the two draft decisions in document CoP14 Com. I. 11 had been accepted by the Committee by consensus. This was adopted.

59. Sharks

59.1 Report of the Animals Committee

and

59.2 Additional conservation measures

The Chairman of Committee I reported that 17 draft decisions, recorded in document CoP14 Com. I. 16, had been agreed with some small amendments, recorded in Summary Record CoP14 Com. I Rep. 15. These were adopted.

60. Sturgeons and paddlefish

60.1 Report of the Secretariat

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the Committee had accepted the report of the Secretariat in document CoP14 Doc. 60.1. This was noted.

60.2 Amendment of Resolution Conf. 12.7 (Rev. CoP13)

60.2.1 Proposal of the Standing Committee's Working Group on Sturgeons

and

60.2.2 Proposal of the Russian Federation

The Chairman of Committee II reported that a working group, chaired by Germany, had provided a draft amendment to Resolution Conf. 12.7 (Rev. CoP13) and six draft decisions in their report contained in document CoP14 Com. II. 25. During the discussion at its 15th session, Committee II had agreed to two further draft decisions, two amendments to the second draft decision and two corrections to paragraphs in the draft amendment to the Resolution, as recorded in the Summary Record of that session. With these amendments, Committee II had approved all of the proposals in document CoP14 Com. II. 25. These proposals were adopted.

61. Toothfish: report of CCAMLR

The Chairman of Committee II stated that the Committee had noted with appreciation the report of the Convention for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources. No further action by the Parties was required.

62. Sea cucumbers

The Chairman of Committee I reported that three draft decisions in document CoP14 Com. I. 1 had been accepted following a vote. This was adopted.

63. Trade in traditional medicines

The Chairman of Committee II reported that the Committee had approved a draft revision of Resolution Conf. 10.19 (Rev. CoP12), the resulting text being presented in document Com. II. 22. This was adopted.

After some announcements the session was closed at 17h00.

Result of the votes

Key: 0 = did not vote, 1 = yes, 2 = no, 3 = abstain

Parties	Vote 1	Vote 2	Vote 3	Vote 4¹
Afghanistan AF	0	0	0	0
Albania AL	0	0	0	0
Algeria DZ	0	0	0	0
Antigua and Barbuda AG	3	1	2	3
Argentina AR	1	1	1	2
Australia AU	1	1	1	2
Austria AT	2	2	2	1
Azerbaijan AZ	0	1	1	2
Bahamas BS	1	2	2	2
Bangladesh BD	0	0	0	0
Barbados BB	0	0	0	0
Belarus BY	0	0	0	0
Belgium BE	2	2	2	1
Belize BZ	0	0	0	0
Benin BJ	0	0	0	0
Bhutan BT	1	1	1	2
Bolivia BO	0	0	0	0
Botswana BW	2	1	1	1
Brazil BR	1	1	0	1
Brunei Darussalam BN	0	3	2	1
Bulgaria BG	2	2	2	1
Burkina Faso BF	2	3	2	1
Burundi BI	2	2	2	1
Cambodia KH	1	2	2	1
Cameroon CM	2	0	2	1
Canada CA	2	2	2	1
Cape Verde CV	0	0	0	0
Central African Republic CF	0	0	0	0
Chad TD	0	0	0	3
Chile CL	1	1	1	2
China CN	2	1	2	1
Colombia CO	1	1	1	1
Comoros KM	0	0	0	0
Congo CG	0	0	0	0
Costa Rica CR	2	1	2	1
Côte d'Ivoire CI	1	1	1	3
Croatia HR	2	2	1	2
Cuba CU	2	1	1	2
Cyprus CY	2	2	2	1
Czech Republic CZ	2	2	2	1
Democratic Republic of the Congo CD	0	1	2	1
Denmark DK	2	2	2	1

¹ Note from the Secretariat: the voting results indicated here are an exact reflection of the output from the electronic voting system. However some Parties complained about technical problems with their voting cards during vote 4 and their complaints are recorded in Summary Record CoP14 Plen. 6 (Rev. 1).

Parties	Vote 1	Vote 2	Vote 3	Vote 4¹
Djibouti DJ	0	0	0	0
Dominica DM	0	1	1	0
Dominican Republic DO	2	1	2	2
Ecuador EC	0	1	1	2
Egypt EG	0	2	1	0
El Salvador SV	0	0	0	0
Equatorial Guinea GQ	0	0	0	0
Eritrea ER	2	2	2	2
Estonia EE	2	2	2	1
Ethiopia ET	3	3	2	1
Fiji FJ	2	2	1	2
Finland FI	2	2	2	1
France FR	2	2	2	1
Gabon GA	0	0	0	0
Gambia GM	0	0	0	0
Georgia GE	2	2	2	1
Germany DE	0	0	2	1
Ghana GH	0	0	0	0
Greece GR	2	2	2	1
Grenada GD	0	1	1	0
Guatemala GT	1	1	1	3
Guinea GN	3	3	3	2
Guinea-Bissau GW	0	0	0	0
Guyana GY	3	2	1	2
Honduras HN	3	3	2	1
Hungary HU	2	2	2	1
Iceland IS	3	3	1	3
India IN	2	2	2	1
Indonesia ID	1	1	1	2
Iran (Islamic Republic of) IR	0	0	0	0
Ireland IE	2	2	2	1
Israel IL	1	2	1	2
Italy IT	2	2	2	1
Jamaica JM	2	2	3	1
Japan JP	2	2	2	3
Jordan JO	0	0	0	0
Kazakhstan KZ	0	0	0	0
Kenya KE	2	3	2	2
Kuwait KW	1	1	2	3
Lao People's Democratic Republic LA	2	2	2	2
Latvia LV	0	0	0	0
Lesotho LS	0	0	0	0
Liberia LR	1	2	0	0
Libyan Arab Jamahiriya LY	0	0	0	0
Liechtenstein LI	0	0	0	0
Lithuania LT	2	2	2	1
Luxembourg LU	2	2	2	1
Madagascar MG	1	3	1	2
Malawi MW	2	2	2	2
Malaysia MY	2	1	2	1
Mali ML	0	0	0	0
Malta MT	2	2	2	1

Parties	Vote 1	Vote 2	Vote 3	Vote 4¹
Mauritania MR	0	0	0	0
Mauritius MU	1	1	2	1
Mexico MX	1	2	2	1
Monaco MC	0	2	2	2
Mongolia MN	2	2	2	1
Montenegro ME	0	0	0	0
Morocco MA	0	1	2	1
Mozambique MZ	1	1	1	1
Myanmar MM	0	0	0	0
Namibia NA	2	2	1	2
Nepal NP	2	2	2	1
Netherlands NL	2	2	2	1
New Zealand NZ	1	2	1	2
Nicaragua NI	1	1	1	2
Niger NE	0	0	0	0
Nigeria NG	0	0	0	0
Norway NO	1	2	2	2
Pakistan PK	1	3	2	3
Palau PW	1	3	3	3
Panama PA	0	0	0	0
Papua New Guinea PG	0	0	0	0
Paraguay PY	0	0	0	0
Peru PE	1	1	1	3
Philippines PH	0	1	2	1
Poland PL	2	2	2	1
Portugal PT	2	2	2	1
Qatar QA	3	2	2	3
Republic of Korea KR	2	1	2	2
Republic of Moldova MD	2	2	2	1
Romania RO	2	2	2	1
Russian Federation RU	3	3	3	3
Rwanda RW	3	3	1	1
Saint Kitts and Nevis KN	3	3	1	2
Saint Lucia LC	3	1	2	3
Saint Vincent and the Grenadines VC	3	3	2	3
Samoa WS	0	0	0	0
San Marino SM	2	2	2	1
Sao Tome and Principe ST	0	0	0	0
Saudi Arabia SA	0	0	0	0
Senegal SN	2	2	2	1
Serbia RS	3	3	1	3
Seychelles SC	0	0	0	0
Sierra Leone SL	0	0	0	0
Singapore SG	3	3	2	1
Slovakia SK	2	2	2	1
Slovenia SI	2	2	2	1
Solomon Islands SB	0	0	0	0
Somalia SO	0	0	0	0
South Africa ZA	2	3	2	3
Spain ES	2	2	2	1
Sri Lanka LK	0	0	0	0
Sudan SD	0	0	0	0

Parties	Vote 1	Vote 2	Vote 3	Vote 4¹
Suriname SR	3	1	1	2
Swaziland SZ	3	3	1	1
Sweden SE	2	2	2	1
Switzerland CH	2	3	2	1
Syrian Arab Republic SY	2	2	3	3
Thailand TH	2	1	3	3
The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia MK	0	0	0	0
Togo TG	0	2	0	3
Trinidad and Tobago TT	2	1	1	2
Tunisia TN	2	1	1	1
Turkey TR	2	2	2	1
Uganda UG	2	2	1	3
Ukraine UA	1	2	2	1
United Arab Emirates AE	3	3	3	3
United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland GB	2	2	2	0
United Republic of Tanzania TZ	2	2	2	1
United States of America US	1	1	1	2
Uruguay UY	1	0	1	2
Uzbekistan UZ	0	0	0	0
Vanuatu VU	2	3	0	0
Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) VE	2	1	1	2
Viet Nam VN	0	2	0	0
Yemen YE	0	0	0	0
Zambia ZM	0	2	2	1
Zimbabwe ZW	2	2	1	1