

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA

Eighth Meeting of the Conference of the Parties

Kyoto (Japan), 2 to 13 March 1992

Interpretation and Implementation of the Convention

TRANSPORT OF LIVE SPECIMENS

This document is submitted by the Chairman of the Working Group on the Transport of Live Specimens (The "Transport Working Group").

Composition of Transport Working Group

1. At the seventh meeting of the Conference of the Parties, the then Chairman of the CITES Working Group on the Transport of Live Specimens invited any Parties or observers who wished to participate in the activities of the Working Group to register their interest. Twenty individuals and organizations expressed an interest in participating in the work of the Group. These represented a wide range of governmental and non-governmental interests, and all were based either in North America or Europe. No exporting countries expressed any interest in joining the Working Group at that stage.

Terms of Reference

2. The CITES Standing Committee has approved the following terms of reference for the Working Group:
 - a) to review recommendations made by previous working groups of the Parties concerning the international transport of live specimens;
 - b) to review the Live Animals Regulations of IATA and make recommendations to the Live Animals Board for changes to meet Convention requirements;
 - c) to co-ordinate international air transportation requirements of live animals between the Live Animals Board and the Standing Committee;
 - d) to prepare proposed international transportation guidelines for consideration of the Parties concerning:
 - i) the terrestrial (road and rail) transportation of live animals;
 - ii) the marine transportation of live animals;
 - iii) the air, terrestrial and marine transportation of live plants;
 - e) to assist Parties, when requested to do so, in the implementation of Conference Resolutions and to negotiate on behalf of the Parties with the IATA Live Animals Board the implementation of Conference Resolutions;
 - f) to report, on a periodic basis as and when required, to the Chairman of the Standing Committee on the activities of the Working Group; and
 - g) to prepare draft resolutions for consideration of the Conference of the Parties.

Meetings of the Working Group

3. Since the seventh meeting of the Conference of the Parties, and following two ad hoc regional meetings in Ottawa and Paris, two formal meetings of the Working Group have been held:
 - a) 27-28 September 1990, London;
 - b) 3-4 July 1991, Brussels.
4. Twenty one people attended the first meeting in September 1990. These included representatives of four CITES Management Authorities, the European Commission and a number of non-governmental organizations. No exporting countries were represented.
5. The second meeting in Brussels was attended by twenty seven people. These included representatives of ten Management Authorities, including four exporting countries, and a wide range of other governmental and non-governmental interests.

Scope of discussions and conclusions reached

6. The discussions in the Working Group have been constructive and wide ranging. It is clear from these that transport of live specimens remains an issue of considerable interest and concern within the CITES community. While the Working Group recognized that some progress had been made in some areas in improving transport conditions, it is clear that a number of problems remain.

Main problems identified

7. In the Transport Working Group discussions, particular concern has been expressed about the following matters:
 - a) Inadequate implementation of CITES Conference Resolutions - The Conference of the Parties has discussed transport of live specimens on a number of occasions, and has issued a substantial amount of guidance and advice to Parties in the form of Conference Resolutions. Some aspects of these Resolutions have been implemented by some (relatively few) Parties, but overall, little appears to have been done to put into practice the recommendations that they contain. In particular, the following Resolutions have not been implemented comprehensively or effectively by more than a handful of Parties:
 - i) Resolution Conf. 3.17 - This recommends the setting up of a reporting system for specimens stressed during transport. Such a system would be helpful in identifying and dealing with particular transport problems, but no system has yet been established.
 - ii) Resolution Conf. 4.20 - This recommends certain amendments to the CITES Guidelines for Transport and Preparation for Shipment of Live Wild Animals and Plants, and the establishment of a dialogue with the IATA Live Animals Board. Liaison with IATA is dealt with in paragraph 9 below. No amendments have been made to the CITES Guidelines, and the Standing Committee has now agreed that while the Guidelines should not be withdrawn, their amendment and updating should not be pursued at present.
 - iii) Resolution Conf. 5.18 - This recommends that steps be taken to seek the amendment of the IATA Live Animals Regulations and the more effective implementation of these regulations - see paragraph 9 below.
 - iv) Resolution Conf. 7.3 - This recommends Parties to indicate on permits for live animals that such documents are only valid if the transport conditions conform with the CITES Guidelines or the IATA Live Animals Regulations. Very few Parties have implemented this recommendation.
 - v) Resolution Conf. 7.13 - This recommends, inter alia, that the issue of export permits and re-export certificates should be conditional on compliance with the IATA Regulations or the CITES Guidelines; that all live animal shipments should be accompanied by a container checklist, and inspected during extended holding periods; that animal holding facilities be provided at ports of entry and exit; and that information on mortalities during transport should be collected and passed to the Chairman of the Transport Working Group. It is apparent from discussions in the Transport Working Group and contacts with the CITES Secretariat that although some Parties have implemented some aspects of this

important Resolution, it has overall not been put into effect in any comprehensive way, and has thus had little impact on transport conditions or on the monitoring of transport problems.

- b) Lack of comprehensive data about the incidence and causes of mortalities during transport - Only two Parties, the US and the UK, have collected mortality data in any systematic way, and the data that is available requires further analysis to determine the exact nature and extent of problems with mortalities
- c) Susceptibility of particular species to high levels of mortality in transport - Death of live specimens during transport may be due to a range of factors other than transport conditions, such as methods of capture and acclimatization to captivity, conditions in animal holding facilities, and disease. It is thus not necessarily or exclusively a transport-related problem. Nevertheless, the Transport Working Group discussions indicated that there was some concern that certain species may not be suitable for transportation. The Group considered that it would be helpful to prepare criteria to assist in the identification of such species. Some members of the Group also considered that it would be appropriate to restrict or prohibit trade in such species. The question of bans on trade in particular species is not within the terms of reference of the Transport Working Group, but should the Parties wish to consider the case for imposing restrictions on the import of species subject to high rates of mortality in transport and/or the immediate post-transport period, they may find the provisional criteria discussed by the Transport Working Group helpful for this purpose. A copy of the draft criteria is attached as Annex.

Liaison with IATA Live Animals Board

- 8. The close and constructive dialogue which the former Chairman of the Transport Working Group established with the IATA Live Animals Board has been maintained. CITES representatives (including the Chairman of the Transport Working Group, the CITES Secretariat and the US Management Authority) have attended meetings of the Live Animals Board, and have been closely involved with the continuing process of revising and updating the Live Animals Regulations.
- 9. It is, in the opinion of the Standing Committee and the Transport Working Group, essential that the liaison with the Live Animals Board should continue. Although considerable progress has been made, some problems remain, and it is important that CITES should continue to work with the Board to ensure that the Live Animals Regulations adequately reflect CITES concerns.
- 10. Particular areas in which it is hoped that further progress will be possible are:
 - a) Implementation by airlines of the Live Animals Regulations - One of the IATA LAB's problems has been that although it can and does exhort member airlines to implement the Live Animals Regulations strictly, it has no powers to compel them to do so. IATA has agreed to raise particular implementation problems with the airlines concerned, and it is important that the LAB and CITES should maintain the pressure on airlines to ensure that the Regulations are adhered to.
 - b) Training of airline staff - CITES has been closely involved in discussions concerning the training of airline personnel in the acceptance and handling procedures for live animals, and will contribute as necessary to the development of further training initiatives.
 - c) Getting the CITES message across - Attendance at ad hoc IATA seminars has been useful in providing an opportunity for the Chairman of the Transport Working Group to speak to representatives of IATA member airlines directly to inform them of CITES' interest in and concern about the transport of live specimens.
- 11. In response to concern about the trade in wild birds, a number of airlines have decided to stop accepting shipments of birds. This development has been discussed by the Live Animals Board and by the Transport Working Group. Some Management Authorities have been concerned that the withdrawal of reputable airlines from the shipping of birds could result in other less reputable airlines, with less concern for the conservation and welfare of the birds, moving in. This it has been argued might result in higher mortality levels, and could have an adverse effect on conservation efforts. The Parties may wish to consider this issue.

Conclusions

- 12. The Parties have adopted a number of Resolutions indicating their concern about transport matters, but have not so far been able to implement them effectively. It is, in the opinion of the Transport Working Group, essential that efforts to improve transport conditions and reduce mortalities should continue, and if they are to be successful, it is clearly

important that Parties should make every effort to put into effect the practical steps outlined in existing Conference Resolutions which are summarised in paragraph 7. a) above.

13. Exporting countries have an important part to play in helping to identify, and develop workable solutions for problems in transporting live animals. Recent studies have highlighted some of the practical difficulties they face through lack of manpower and other resources. It is difficult for the Transport Working Group to achieve its objectives without exporting country participation, and any assistance that Parties can offer to enable exporting country representatives to participate in the Working Group is therefore extremely useful. The United States of America, for example, provided funding for several such representatives to attend the most recent meeting of the Working Group.
14. The Transport Working Group will continue to work with the IATA Live Animals Board to develop and improve the content and operation of the IATA Regulations. It will also continue, in consultation with the CITES Secretariat, Parties and interested non-governmental organizations, with its efforts to identify, analyse, and develop solutions for transport problems. However, much will depend on the extent to which the Parties are able to put into effect existing Conference Resolutions.
15. The Parties are invited to consider and discuss the above report.

Transport Working Group

DISCUSSION OF CRITERIA FOR LISTING BIRD SPECIES
SUFFERING SIGNIFICANT MORTALITIES IN TRANSPORT

The provisional criteria discussed by the Transport Working Group were:

List A - Species that experience significant mortalities in transport and should not be traded for commercial purposes

1. Input from exporting countries

and/or:

2. Species with 10% or higher average mortality on arrival in an importing country, or 15% or higher average mortality during quarantine

and:

data are based on 10 or more shipments and 300 or more specimens, to avoid a single 'bad' shipment skewing the data.

List B - Other species where shipment sizes are to be limited

1. Input from exporting countries
2. Significant qualitative information

and/or:

3. Species with 5-10% average mortality on arrival in an importing country, or 5-10% average mortality during quarantine

and:

data are based on more than 10 shipments and more than 300 specimens, to avoid a single 'bad' shipment skewing the data.