CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Fifty-eighth meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 6-10 July 2009

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Compliance and enforcement

ENFORCEMENT MATTERS

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.

Alerts

- 2. Since the 57th meeting of the Standing Committee (Geneva, July 2008), the Secretariat has issued Alerts on the following subjects:
 - Combating illicit trade in great apes;
 - Illegal trade in falcons; and
 - Illegal trade in caviar to the yachting community.

CITES Enforcement Expert Group

- 3. At its 14th meeting (The Hague, 2007), the Conference of the Parties adopted Decisions 14.31 (*Gathering and analysis of data on illicit trade*), 14.33 (*Enforcement Expert Group*) and 14.72 (*Asian big cats*), which all require work to be conducted by the CITES Enforcement Expert Group. Decisions 14.32 and 14.34 direct the Standing Committee to consider the report of the Secretariat relating to the Group's activities.
- 4. The Secretariat encountered several problems in identifying a venue for the CITES Enforcement Expert Group to meet and this was not resolved until March 2009. The Group will meet at the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Forensics Laboratory but not until early June 2009. It will not, consequently, be possible for the Secretariat to prepare a report on the Group's activities in time to meet the usual deadline for circulation of Standing Committee documents for the present meeting. The Secretariat will therefore either submit a written document after the deadline or an oral report at the meeting.

Controlled Delivery Manual

- 5. The Secretariat has, for many years, encouraged law enforcement authorities that intercept contraband in transit to consider using controlled delivery techniques to help identify those responsible for the smuggling. However, this practice has not been widely followed and it seemed that guidance was required on this subject.
- 6. As a result, the CITES Secretariat and Interpol General Secretariat collaborated on the publication of a manual on controlled deliveries and it was launched by the Secretaries General of both organizations during an environmental crime conference held at Interpol headquarters in October 2008. The Secretariat is grateful for the support provided by the United States Department of Justice and the World Customs Organization's Secretariat, whose staff reviewed the final draft of the manual. The

manual has been posted on the Enforcement Authority Forum on the CITES website and is available in Arabic, Chinese, English, French, Russian and Spanish. The Secretariat wishes to express its appreciation to the CITES authority of Hong Kong S.A.R., China, which funded some translations of the manual.

Designation of enforcement authorities

- 7. Resolution Conf. 11.3 (Rev. CoP14) (*Compliance and enforcement*) recommends that "Parties, as a matter of urgency, inform the Secretariat of contact details of their relevant national law-enforcement agencies responsible for investigating illegal trafficking in wild fauna and flora". At the time of writing (April 2008), 68 Parties had submitted contact details, which is exactly the same number as reported at the 57th meeting of the Committee.
- 8. At its 53rd meeting (Geneva, June-July 2005), the Standing Committee requested regional representatives to report on designation of enforcement authorities at the Committee's 54th meeting (Geneva, October 2006). However, no representative did. At its 57th meeting, the Committee again asked regional representatives to report on this matter at the present meeting.
- 9. The Secretariat believes it is very unfortunate that over a hundred Parties have yet to inform the Secretariat of contact details of their enforcement authorities, especially as officers around the world regularly use the Enforcement Authority information on the CITES website to contact their counterparts in other countries. This often facilitates the rapid exchange of information or quick response to incidents that is so vital in combating illegal trade in wildlife. In contrast, many enforcement officers are individually registering for membership of the Enforcement Authorities Forum and are keen to share in the information that is regularly posted there. It seems, therefore, that CITES Management Authorities are failing to provide support to their enforcement agencies by neglecting to make their contact details available to the wider CITES community.

Egypt

10. The Secretariat continues to liaise with the CITES authorities of Egypt in relation to the recommendations made following its mission to Egypt in November 2007. Egypt has submitted a report on its progress in implementing the recommendations. It is annexed to this document (in English only, the language in which it was submitted).

Interpol

- 11. The Secretariat was very pleased to be invited to participate in, and address, the 2008 General Assembly of Interpol, which was held in St Petersburg, the Russian Federation.
- 12. The Secretariat is also delighted that the Interpol General Secretariat now has two officers working full-time on wildlife crime matters. It notes, however, that these are not permanent positions but rely upon external funding. One of these positions is devoted to Operation Oasis, a project funded by the Government of Germany, to bring capacity building and other support to countries in Africa.
- 13. As part of Operation Oasis, Interpol has established a training course for senior police officers. This nine-week course, conducted in modules of three weeks each, is designed for the highest ranks of the police throughout Africa. The first module was delivered at Interpol headquarters in December 2008 and involved officers, mainly of Assistant Commissioner and Chief Superintendent rank, from 18 countries. The course received an input on wildlife crime and the CITES Secretariat conducted a practical exercise based upon a controlled delivery operation involving illegal trade in ivory. The input was well-received and evaluated by participants and Interpol's trainers, and it is likely that the CITES Secretariat will be invited to assist in future courses.
- 14. This course is an important opportunity to gain greater attention for wildlife crime among the future leaders of the police in Africa and the CITES Secretariat thanks the General Secretariat of Interpol for facilitating its participation.

Nigeria

15. Nigeria remains the only Party currently affected by a recommendation for a suspension of trade because of enforcement issues. The Secretariat is conscious that the Standing Committee's recommendation that trade to and from Nigeria should be suspended has been in place for almost four years. It has written to Nigeria, encouraging its authorities to work with the Secretariat. The Secretariat hopes, if sufficient time can be found in 2009, to undertake a high-level mission to Nigeria to provide further encouragement and to engage in discussions at high political levels. The Secretariat hopes that regional representatives of Africa might also encourage Nigeria to make progress. For the moment, however, there is no progress to report.

Oceania enforcement workshop

- 16. Decision 14.14 directs the Secretariat to seek funding to convene an enforcement-focused capacity-building workshop and regional meeting for the Oceanian region before the 58th meeting of the Standing Committee, in order to improve regional implementation of the Convention.
- 17. The CITES Management Authority of Australia very kindly took upon itself the funding and organization of such an event. It was held in Brisbane, Australia, from 23 to 26 March 2009. Aside from Australia, the following countries from the region also attended: Fiji, New Zealand, Papua New Guinea, Samoa, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu. Tonga, which is not a party to the Convention, also participated, as did the Secretariats of the Pacific Community and the Pacific Regional Environment Programme.
- 18. Participants discussed a number of enforcement-related matters and received presentations from the CITES Secretariat and wildlife law enforcement experts. The participants were a mixture of CITES and enforcement authority personnel. The workshop also involved presentations from the International Fund for Animal Welfare and TRAFFIC. Participants agreed that further capacity building is required in the region and Australia is to assist in developing an appropriate project proposal.

Saudi Arabia

- 19. Owing to concerns regarding Saudi Arabia's implementation and enforcement of the Convention, the Standing Committee had previously welcomed an invitation from Saudi Arabia for the Secretariat to visit the country. This mission was carried out in November 2008.
- 20. The Secretariat met with the head of the CITES Management Authority of Saudi Arabia and his staff and were impressed by their efforts to improve implementation of CITES. It is clear that substantial progress has been made in recent years. The Government of Saudi Arabia has established a Ranger Force to undertake wildlife law enforcement duties and these officers appear to have established good links with the other law enforcement agencies in the country.
- 21. The Secretariat also visited air and sea ports in Saudi Arabia, including Riyadh, Jeddah and on the causeway between Saudi Arabia and Bahrain. It found that there is an increasing awareness of CITES among Customs officers and several officers have engaged in efforts to train their colleagues in enforcement matters related to the Convention. During the mission, the Secretariat also visited an agarwood market and inspected a recently-established aquaculture operation that is producing caviar.
- 22. The Secretariat subsequently wrote to Saudi Arabia, offering a number of suggestions for further improvement, and these have been welcomed by the CITES Management Authority.
- 23. The Secretariat has now conducted many missions to the Middle East and has noted that English is becoming increasingly widely spoken and understood. However, it is clear that the reading of English is less common. Consequently, many officials who potentially have a role in implementing the Convention have difficulty making use of the materials and documents that are produced in the three working languages of CITES, i.e. English, French and Spanish. The Secretariat is, consequently, very pleased that it is receiving support to make more of its capacity-building materials available in Arabic. It also strives to make enforcement-related material, such as the Controlled Delivery Manual, multilingual.

Wildlife law enforcement networks

24. The Secretariat continues to encourage the establishment of regional enforcement networks and notes that political support has been voiced for a South Asia Wildlife Enforcement Network, although it has yet to become operational. The Secretariat has been working closely with the CITES and police authorities in Egypt with a view to establishing such a network for Arabic-speaking countries. It is hoped that a meeting to bring relevant countries together to discuss such a network will take place in Egypt this year.

World Customs Organization

- 25. The Secretariat is very grateful for the initiative taken by the Secretary General of the World Customs Organization, to write to all its member Customs authorities and encourage them to make one day in January 2009 a 'CITES action day'. Over 90 Customs administrations responded, assisted by 11 of the World Customs Organization's Regional Intelligence Liaison Offices. It is estimated that over 10,000 Customs officers worldwide gave special attention to the Convention that day. Several Customs authorities also engaged in awareness-raising initiatives that day and throughout January.
- 26. Twenty-five authorities reported more than 90 seizures. A total of over 4,630 specimens, involving over 80 different species, were seized.
- 27. The Secretariat is aware that several national CITES authorities assisted their Customs colleagues in this initiative and the Secretariat congratulates everyone involved.

Conclusion

28. The Standing Committee is asked to note this report.

First of all we would like to express our sincere gratitude for your kind support and cooperation to CITES Egypt, which really encourages us to do best.

Concerning the recommendations you submitted regarding the improvement of CITES implementation in Egypt, the last six months were actually fruitful as follows:

A. Capacity building & awareness raising program:

- 1.As a proceeding for the plan cited to reach out a level of capacity building suites the recommended convention implementation and compliance in Egypt, Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was signed between the Egyptian CITES management authority (CMA) and IFAW (International Fund for Animal welfare) under the supervision of Mr. Steven Nash, CITES Secretariat Capacity Building Senior and his Excellence the Minister of Agriculture on 25th of October 2008.
- 2. The Ministry of Agriculture sponsored the announcement of MOU launching the training program for the wildlife staff and relevant CITES officers at both ports and land borders (quarantine dept. veterinarians, environment police, Customs, EEAA and tourism personnel).
- 3.According to the protocol of the MOU, seven workshops are going to be held through the year 2008 up to the year 2010 covering the land and sea border governorates, two of which are already took place.
- 4. The first workshop was held in Sharm el-Sheik City on November 2008 and the second in Aswan border City on February 2009 both under the title: Implementation of CITES convention and the illegal trade in endangered species, each workshop was attended by 25 participants from all the previously mentioned relevant agencies concerned with CITES implementation.

- 5.In addition to the previously printed posters on the Egyptian CITES fauna, and Ivory, CITES Egypt is going to distribute illustrated guide for the most common CITES species involved in illegal trade.
- 6.A copy of all printed posters were delivered to the Ministry of Tourism to be distributed their way to the wildlife relevant agents concerned with tourism and deals with tourists.
- 7.Also warning posters about the primates smuggling in ports and land borders are in the way to be distributed.

B. Rescue centers:-

- 1. As we mentioned in our last report, Giza zoo designated area to be a rescue center for great apes and will be ready as soon as possible.
- 2. After a series of arrangements PASA- APES visited Egypt in a committee of Mr. Dough Cress and Miss Anne Olivecrona, the visit was in the period from 10 13 March.
- 3. The committee aimed to visit all the places nominated as rescue centers either governmental or private for the following purposes:
 - To estimate the actual number of primates and apes present in Egypt.
 - To make DNA analysis for the apes in an approach to know their country of origin.
 - The committee visited Giza Zoo, Alexandria Zoo and a wildlife rescue center lies on the Cairo Alexandria road which represents 75% of the places where apes are licensed to present as governmental property.
 - The total number of apes they watched was 18 chimps.
 - As a matter of fact CITES Egypt already began the process of microchip implantation to all the primates present in Egypt, some of them are present in private rescue center under the supervision of CITES scientific committee.
 - In the final meeting with PASA- Apes committee we agreed to make another meeting a month later, the expected time to implant microchips in the rest of the apes and primates, consequently, it will be so hard to introduce any more illegal specimen with out being discovered.

C. Compliance and Enforcement:

- Interpol wildlife crime working group:-
- 1. In accordance with CITES secretariat directions, and from point of fact we do believe that convention implementation and compliance both need regional cooperation, CITES Egypt is preparing for the expected meeting to

- sign the MOU for Arabian —wen (enforcement network for Arabic speaking countries) which is going to be sponsored with the Minister of Agriculture where the CITES management authority of Egypt CMA is going to be the focal point of the group.
- 2. Concerning the recent environment law, it is to be noted that the modified environment law is declared at the beginning of February 2009 where the relevant agencies considered with the implementation of the law are going to follow the new regulations just after announcing the guiding rules of the law.
- 3. The modification included elevation of the financial fine of the environmental crime to the maximum of 50000 Egyptian pounds, beside prison for may reach one year according to the severity of the crime.
 - As a regulatory procedure to control export/import through the Egyptian borders Cairo International Airport was assigned to be the only port for CITES specimens traded to enter or leave the country.

• Confiscations:

It is to be noted that all ivory confiscations are reported annually to the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS).

Main confiscated cases in 2008-2009:

No.	Date of confiscation	Species	Place of confiscation	Destination			
Ivory							
1.	17/11/2008	• (one piece of raw Ivory) 4kgs	Cairo International Airport	Agriculture museum			
2.	18/2/2009	• One piece of Raw Ivory 3kgs	Cairo International Airport	Agriculture museum			
3.	20/2/2009	•One piece of worked ivory 0.6 kg	Cairo International Airport	Agriculture museum			
Corals and Sea Horses							
4.	20/1/2008	10 pieces of Coral Reef	Cairo International Airport	Agriculture museum			
5.	14/2/2008	17 pieces of Coral Reef		Agriculture museum			
6.	24/5/2008	8 pieces of Coral Reef		Agriculture museum			

No.	Date of confiscation	Species	Place of confiscation	Destination
7.	26/7/2008	6 pieces Sea shells, 8		Agriculture
		pieces of Coral reefs		museum
8.	18/9/2008	6kgs sea horse		Agriculture
				museum
9.	30/9/2008	37 pieces of Coral reefs		Agriculture
				museum
10.	29/10/2008	24 pieces of sea shells, 12		Agriculture
		pieces of corals		museum
11.	30/10/2008	12 tridacna spp.		Agriculture
				museum
12.	1/1/2009	Corals & 3 bags of sea		
		horse (35kgs)		
13.	20/3/2009	Coral reefs		Agriculture
				museum
14.	22/3/2009	Sea horse		
15.	29/3/2009	Sea horse		
		Tortoises , Lizards& (Others	
16.	24/1/2008	10 bags of crocodile		
		leather		
17.	2/2/2008	9 pieces of crocodile		
		leather, 17 bags of Nile		
		crocodile leather.		
18.	18/5/2008	(1) Taxidermist Egyptian		Agriculture
		fox		museum
19.	25/5/2008	(6) Greece tortoise	Cairo	Giza Zoo
			International	
			Airport	
20.	7/6/2008	600 soft shell Nile		
		turtles		
21.	16/6/2008	• (3) Taxidermist		
		crocodile& live snakes		
22.	2/7/2008	• 1 Nile monitor		
		• 40 Ornate Dabb Lizard		
		• 4Egyptian spinney		
		tailed lizard		
		• 2 desert monitor		

No.	Date of confiscation	Species	Place of confiscation	Destination
23.	28/7/2008	(2) Taxidermist of	Cairo	Agriculture
		Egyptian Gazelle	International	museum
			Airport	
24.	8/1/2009	(2) taxidermist wild Cat	Cairo	Agriculture
			International	museum
			Airport	
25.	1/2/2009	(3) Taxidermist Egyptian	Cairo	Agriculture
		fox	International	museum
			Airport	
26.	11/2/2009	40 pieces of Python	Cairo	Agriculture
		leather	International	museum
			Airport	
27.	14/2/2009	(1) Greece tortoise	Cairo	
			International	
			Airport	
28.	16/2/2009	Taxidermist crocodile	Cairo	Agriculture
			International	museum
			Airport	
29.	17/2/2009	Horns and shoulder	Cairo	Agriculture
		mount of Egyptian	International	museum
		Gazelle	Airport	
30.	19/2/2009	Taxidermist Egyptian	Cairo	Agriculture
		Mongoose	International	museum
			Airport	
31.	4/3/2009	tortoise	Cairo	
			International	
			Airport	
32.	5/3/2009	tortoise	Cairo	
			International	
			Airport	
33.	13/3/2009	Live lion cubs		